4-1990

Clients' Self-Reports of Counselor Style and Personal Change: A Comparison of Inexperienced and Experienced Counselors

Ronald M. Crafton
Western Michigan University

CLIENTS' SELF-REPORTS OF COUNSELOR STYLE AND PERSONAL CHANGE: A COMPARISON OF INEXPERIENCED AND EXPERIENCED COUNSELORS

by

Ronald M. Crafton

A Dissertation
Submitted to the
Faculty of The Graduate College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Counselor Education
and Counseling Psychology

Western Michigan University
Kalamazoo, Michigan
April 1990

CLIENTS' SELF-REPORTS OF COUNSELOR STYLE AND PERSONAL CHANGE: A COMPARISON OF INEXPERIENCED AND EXPERIENCED COUNSELORS

Ronald M. Crafton, Ed.D.

Western Michigan University, 1990

Research suggests clients' perceptions of counselor style are important factors in successful counseling outcome (Strong, 1968). With the widespread acceptance and emphasis on practica courses in counselor education, it follows that counselor educators and clinical supervisors need empirical indicators of the level of service provided by inexperienced student counselors. Information provided by clients pertaining to specific dimensions of counselor style and personal change is rare, and until now, has been limited to experienced counselors.

When 181 clients of inexperienced counselors were compared with 363 clients of experienced counselors it was found that the inexperienced counselors were percieved similarly on 12 specific dimensions of style as measured by the Counselor Rating Form-Short Version (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983). A factor analysis suggested the dimensions of counselor style found on the CRF-S provides a unidimensional measure of client satisfaction.

An analysis of clients' self-reported responses resulting from counseling with inexperienced counselors, showed improvement on 12 selected personal change variables. In this study, the improvement rates for inexperienced counselors equaled or exceeded the rates for experienced counselors. Using correlation technique, relationships of varying magnitudes were found to exist between dimensions of counselor style and selected personal change variables.

It was also found that clients of inexperienced counselors reported an overall high degree of satisfaction with the services provided within the counselor training center setting as documented by results on the CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionnaire. Clients' perceptions of counselor style, the effective use of learned counseling skills, client and counselor motivational factors, effective management of the counseling training center, limited case loads, and intensive supervision are cited as contributing factors to the positive personal change rates and favorable client satisfaction responses obtained from clients of inexperienced counselors.

Order Number 9024665

Clients' self-reports of counselor style and personal change: A comparison of inexperienced and experienced counselors

Crafton, Ronald M., Ed.D.

Western Michigan University, 1990

U·M·I
300 N. Zeeb Rd.
Ann Arbor, MI 48106

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The support extended during the conceptual phase, planning, implementation, and completion of this dissertation is most appreciated. Dr. Robert Betz has provided tremendous direction and encouragement throughout the project. Dr. Gil Mazer assisted greatly, providing ideas, clarification, and adding many valuable suggestions. Dr. Robert Brashear repeatedly gave unselfishly of his time while assisting in processing statistical data and helping interpret the results.

I also want to thank: Dr. James Bosco and the entire staff of the Merze Tate Research Center, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan, for providing such an effective, and friendly learning environment; Alison Sears, for her interest, assistance, and on-going support throughout this project; my parents and family, who helped cultivate the desire to learn, grow, and appreciate the educational process; Dr. Edo Weits in the area of family because he is like a brother; my many friends, who continue to show caring and interest in my activities; and especially Jill Richardson, whose love, commitment and encouragement, continue to enrich my life.

Ronald M. Crafton

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents--Continued

Chapter

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Practical experience in counseling live clients is an essential component of counselor education and counseling psychology training programs. Supervised practica courses emphasize the direct application of therapy skills. Experiential courses provide students an opportunity to gain initial experience and receive feedback on their performance from the instructor and in some courses, a clinical supervisor. More specifically, practica experiences provide students with many favorable conditions for learning and professional development. These include the opportunity to integrate theory and practice, to interact with colleagues on a professional basis, to build a repertoire of intervention techniques, to develop counseling skills, to further develop a personal counseling style, and to increase self-confidence.

Introductory practica classes are often conducted in counseling laboratory settings with equipment and facilities for audio recording, video taping, and live observation of counseling sessions by colleagues and supervisor, all of which are powerful teaching and learning tools. From a developmental perspective, students can, thus, achieve greater independence as they advance through their educational programs. Because widespread practicum classes are a recent innovation, additional research is needed to provide a clearer understanding of how counselors-in-training are perceived by their clients. As noted by Strong (1968), the perceptions which clients form about therapists during counseling play an important role in therapy outcome.

At times discounted by researchers, Sabourin et al. (1989) indicated that measures of client satisfaction with mental health services are achieving greater status as a

research tool. Research concerning client satisfaction with student counselors provides empirical information about the performance of student counselors in a practicum setting.

Previous research has indicated that the attributes of expertness, attractiveness, and trustworthiness are important in determining counseling effectiveness (Carey, Williams & Wells, 1988; Heppner & Heesacker, 1983; Strong, 1968). The importance of counselor behavior and clients' perceptions are also addressed by Dell and Schmidt (1976), and Kerr and Dell (1976). The authors suggested that the behaviors exhibited by the counselor which enhance social influence may be more important than characteristics such as attire, setting, sex, experience, or race. A primary purpose of this study is to further investigate Strong's (1968) proposal by comparing inexperienced with experienced counselors.

Investigators have written of the need for additional studies in the area of counseling skill development. The skills of the trained therapist are appreciated from a clinical perspective, but have continued to elude dissection and specification of the researcher (Bergin & Strupp, 1970; Strupp, 1989). In a recurring theme, Bergin and Strupp call for greater collaboration and communication between researchers and clinicians. To further elaborate this point, Edelstein and Brasted (1983) discussed issues in graduate clinical training and the importance of establishing outcome criteria. They cited the sheer diversity of training approaches, a lack of knowledge about effective approaches, and a lack of outcome evaluation, as explicit concerns in counselor education.

With these issues in mind, clients' perceptions of counselor style, and the behavior change reported by those clients selecting to receive psychological services from graduate students in a large mid-western university counselor education department were examined. By specifying and assessing elements of client

satisfaction, the present study contributed to the body of research which may increase counseling effectiveness and enhance the graduate training experience of counselors and counseling psychologists.

As indicated above, client satisfaction measures pertaining to counselors in training have both clinical and educational importance. The degree of personal change experienced by clients participating in a counselor and counseling psychology training program is of interest to many individuals including prospective clients, student counselors, their supervisors, center directors, counselor education faculty, and university administrators.

Background of the Problem

From a historical perspective, Bourne (1988) attributed the introduction of widespread formal practica experiences in counselor education to Ralph Bedell. In 1958, passage of the National Defense Education Act (NDEA) by Congress established programs directed at improving school counseling services. Bedell directed the Title IV and V programs from 1958 to 1966. Bourne describes this period as "perhaps one of the most significant periods in the history of guidance and counseling" (p. 136).

Today, state licensure boards, the American Psychological Association (APA), the American Association for Counseling and Development (AACD), and academic accrediting bodies such as the Commission on Accrediting Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) require structured practica and internship experiences. The above professional associations, accrediting organizations, and regulatory bodies emphatically recognize the value of supervised practica. Both practitioners and educators express the need for a high quality training experience for students as part of their professional development.

From a theoretical standpoint, the interest in therapist experience level and counseling effectiveness is not new, and in fact, quality of counseling continues as a concern among respected scholars. As current researcher and theorist Hans Strupp (1989) recently summarized, "experienced therapists are not immune from becoming immersed in bad process, which suggests that typical training programs do not sufficiently emphasize the problem and its potential consequences" (p. 722). In addressing the educational and training experience of therapists, Strupp goes on to indicate many training programs do a poor job of facilitating effective therapist communication and positive therapeutic activities. The end result of which may lead to premature termination and poor results.

As mentioned above, Strupp believes that deficiencies are common even among experienced and respected professional therapists. He states: "specialized training provided to experienced therapists may deepen the therapist's conscious understanding of these phenomena but does not necessarily translate into outcome" (p.722). Strupp's criticism of training programs is relevant to the focus of this research project.

A lack of research in the area of client satisfaction with counselors-in-training is evident. Other investigators have also stated the need for additional studies. During their work on the development of a counselor evaluation model, Blocher and Wolleat (cited in Roffers, Cooper, & Sultanoff, 1988) noted succinctly "We simply have little evidence which indicates that graduate counseling programs do affect movement toward desired training outcomes, and almost none which suggest that attitudes and skills developed during training transfer to the operational environment" (p. 43).

According to recently published reports, the public demand for psychotherapy is increasing steadily (Decker, 1988; Waldholz, 1986). Waldholz, citing government statistics, stated at least 5 million people yearly will consult mental health professionals for relief from emotional distress. It is very likely that a majority of those in need of

treatment will fail to obtain the help they need. The National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH) reported in 1988 that more than 40 million people, including 9.5 million children, suffered from mental illness including anxiety, depression, schizophrenia, and the effects of drug use (cited in Adessa et al. 1989). Some consumers in search of psychological treatment may elect to work with counselors in training if such a program is available within their geographic area. Economics may account for the decision of some individuals to engage in work with a student counselor. Thus, it is important to know the level of service student counselors provide for their clients.

On a national level, the economic considerations of health care, which include psychological health care, are enormous. Waldholz (1986) indicated psychiatric costs are increasing at a rate of 10 to 20% per year. Waldholz also found insurance providers spend more on psychiatric benefits than any other medical benefit. Anderson (1989) reported "Medical costs consume 11% of the gross national product in the United States and spiraling health care costs threaten to undermine the integrity of the entire health care delivery system" (p.82).

Anderson (1989) reported that companies experienced an 18.6% increase in costs to group health care carriers in 1986. Waldholz (1986) and Anderson discussed the extra financial burden experienced by the consumer as a result of increased deductibles, benefit caps, additional co-payments, or being dropped from outpatient mental health care altogether.

Along with economic factors, philosophical and political changes in the public mental health delivery system helped create a new underserved population. Clients which were once served by community mental health centers on an outpatient basis, may now be required to seek alternative sources for treatment because they are not severely enough impaired. Service eligibility in some cases may be at least partially determined by scores on a numerical rating instrument such as the Global Assessment

Scale (Endicott, Spitzer, Fleiss, & Cohen, 1976). A program offering no fee psychological services will likely be attractive to those who may experience hardship receiving such services elsewhere.

The Counselor Education and Counseling Psychology Department at Western Michigan University operates a supervised graduate training and research facility, the Center for Counseling and Psychological Services (CCPS). Prior to the development of the CCPS, practica students recruited clients from friends, other students, or through the help of a professor. Today, through an established referral network, and limited outreach efforts, prospective clients desiring service contact the CCPS. An initial intake appointment is scheduled with an advanced graduate student who explains the program, gathers necessary intake information, and later presents the details of the request for service during a regular disposition meeting chaired by the director. If accepted, the client's request and history is directed to a practicum instructor who reviews the case and assigns a student counselor. In addition to outreach and clinical intake services, the CCPS provides many administrative and supportive functions. These include managing the physical laboratory setting, orienting practicum students, obtaining and maintaining equipment, and providing specialized training in such areas as record keeping, vocational, and psychological assessment.

The CCPS has a three-fold mission of training, research, and service. These are important components of experiential learning in counselor education. Betz and Betz (1986), provide an in-depth account of the developmental history of the Counselor Education and Counseling Psychology department at Western Michigan University and the development of experiential education within that context.

The growth of counselor education departments in the United States has been rapid. Prior to 1930 there were fewer than 10 such programs; while at the time of this

writing their numbers are greater than 400 (Betz & Betz, 1986). The authors indicate that the emergence of Western Michigan as a state university parallels the history of many universities throughout the nation during the post-war growth period of higher education. Along the same line, they report the development of the counselor education and counseling psychology department at Western Michigan University also mirrors the history of many other nationally recognized counselor education programs.

As documented by Betz and Betz, the counselor education and counseling psychology program at Western Michigan University can trace its beginnings back to 1936 when planning began for the first guidance conference and first guidance and counseling course offering. The course was offered only to upper class undergraduates because Western was not yet authorized to offer graduate study. The inaugural conference was held in the spring of 1937 with 150 persons in attendance. The conference was promoted by Registrar John Hoekje, and professors Elmer Wilds, Manley Ellis, and George Hilliard to encourage the development and study of guidance activities in Michigan schools.

Of special historical significance to the present study, was the first offering of a counseling practicum at Western Michigan University. That significant event occurred in 1962. Betz and Betz indicated that in the early 1960s, Professors Kenneth Engle, Arthur Manske, and others, proposed and planned the counselor education laboratory in Sangren Hall. When introduced, the lab was a state of the art training facility in terms of its design and technology. It later became the location for the CCPS at Western Michigan University.

Whether conducted through a counselor education or psychology department laboratory facility, or at sites in the field, practica experiences provide students many benefits. These include the opportunity to integrate theory with practice, receive

supervision, interact with colleagues, develop counseling skills, and increase self-confidence.

Statement of the Problem

The problem addressed in the present study involves an assessment of the performance of inexperienced student counselors working with real clients, and how their performance compares with the work of experienced counselors. Both satisfaction with services, and self-reported personal changes as a result of counseling, are included in the analysis of counselor performance for the experienced and inexperienced groups.

Research Questions

Following are research questions formulated to address the problem for study. First, what are some of the significant demographic variables of the consumers of the Center's services? Second, what is the degree of client satisfaction reported by consumers of the Center's services at Western Michigan University? Third, are counselors-in-training (inexperienced counselors) perceived differently than college counseling center counselors (experienced counselors) on specific therapist dimensions of counselor style? Fourth, what is the relationship between client self-reports of counselor style and self-reported personal change indicators?

Research Hypotheses

Following are the hypotheses under investigation in the present study. They are derived from the research questions previously stated.

Hypothesis 1: There are significant differences in the self-reported perceptions of counselor style when clients of inexperienced counselors are compared with clients of experienced counselors on the following dimensions:

1. Friendly
2. Likeable
3. Sociable
4. Warm
5. Experienced
6. Expert
7. Prepared
8. Skillful
9. Honest
10. Reliable
11. Sincere
12. Trustworthy

Hypothesis 2: There are significant differences in self-reported personal change for emotional concerns when clients of inexperienced counselors are compared with clients of experienced counselors:

1. Feelings of self-worth
2. Excessive sensitivity to the opinions of others
3. Ability to handle feelings of anxiety
4. Ability to handle feelings of depression
5. Ability to handle feelings of anger
6. Satisfaction with eating habits

Hypothesis 3: There are significant differences in self-reported personal change for social concerns when clients of inexperienced counselors are compared with clients of experienced counselors:

1. Ability to handle stress
2. Relationship with friends
3. Relationship with romantic partner
4. Relationship with parents and family
5. Social skills
6. Understanding of self

Hypothesis 4: There is a relationship between client satisfaction and self-reported personal change indicators.

Overview of the study

The purpose of this study was to provide additional information about self-rated client satisfaction, personal change, and counselor style. The research strategy employed obtaining empirical data and comparing the results using a sample of inexperienced counselors and a sample of experienced counselors. Heppner and Heesacker (1983) conducted an earlier investigation into the variables of counselor expertness, attractiveness, and trustworthiness; however, in the Heppner and Heesacker research, the client population consisted primarily of college students. If ratings of client satisfaction, personal change, and client perceptions of counselors-in-training can be ascertained using a non-student client population, the information can be of value to researchers, practitioners, and counselor supervisors. In this way, this study seeks to closely approximate the consumers of many public and private psychological treatment providers.

Western Michigan University's CCPS is a mutually beneficial arrangement between supervisors, student counselors and clients. Clients are referred, or volunteer, and if deemed appropriate, they receive counseling services. At the same time, counselors in training are provided a valuable opportunity for supervised practice with live clients presenting with genuine treatment needs.

The merit of conducting research related to counselor training and practica experience may be discounted by some, especially those working in field settings. As Strupp (1989) indicates, research has sometimes been criticized by practitioners who discount its utility in day-to-day professional practice. This criticism is answered by Strupp, who then goes on to suggest graduate training programs need to focus additional attention on the development of specific therapist skills.

Limitations of the Study

There are several inherent limitations to this type of field study. Unique to this project, was the discrepancy in demographics of the samples surveyed. The experienced counselors at the university counseling center were essentially working with a college age student population, while the CECP sample was primarily non-student adults.

Another limitation which deserves notice was the differences in administration of the survey. At the university counseling center the Client Satisfaction Surveys were mailed to students consenting to participate in the research. Twenty-three percent of terminating clients chose not to have a questionnaire mailed to them and 363 questionnaires were returned for a response rate of 46%. In an effort to increase the response rate, the CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionnaire was administered at the time the client terminated services at the Center.

Furthermore, the measurement of counseling performance is complex and has its own set of limitations and problems. Newman and Scott (1988) discuss these concerns which include: (a) construct definitions, which are needed to reflect the multidimensional nature of counseling; (b) theoretical issues which include a fragmentation of current training theory; (c) substantial variation among assessment instruments; and (d) psychometric issues, of reliability and validity, which have not been adequately researched in many studies related to counselor performance.

This investigation strived to take the above limitations into account yet yield information which contributes to the growing literature concerning client satisfaction. According to Sabourin et al. (1989) client satisfaction research is particularly relevant for several reasons. These include: (a) client satisfaction research provides information on psychological intervention methods; (b) investigations related to client satisfaction can provide data on quality assurance and social validity; (c).client satisfaction is related to treatment outcome; and (d) client satisfaction is a good predictor of the client's compliance with treatment, premature termination, and future help-seeking.

In summary, this project was concerned with initially determining how inexperienced counselors were perceived by their clients, and then comparing those perceptions with how clients viewed experienced counselors. A second aim examined the degree of client personal change reported as a result of receiving services from the inexperienced counselors, and then comparing that data with the personal change data reported by clients of experienced counselors. A third objective was to study the nature and magnitude of the relationship between counselor style variables and personal change. A fourth feature of this study, examined the degree of satisfaction or dissatisfaction of clients as a result of their actual work with student counselors.

Pascoe (1983), reflected on the various conceptualizations of client satisfaction and defined it as "The recipient's reaction to the context, process, and result of his service experience" (p.189). Pascoe's definition is accepted for purposes of this study.

Of special interest was the client's self-ratings of therapist dimensions of counselor style. The client's perceptions of these therapist characteristics are believed to be an important component of effective therapy (Strong, 1968). As introduced above, the theoretical basis for this study is Strong's writings on Social Influence Theory. In their monograph, Corrigan, Dell, Lewis, and Schmidt (1980), regarded Strong's work as a landmark paper. Corrigan et al. provided a detailed account on the history and development of the theory of counseling as a social influence process. One focus of this investigation was to determine if Strong's theory is applicable to inexperienced counselors.

This dissertation is subsequently organized as follows: Chapter II reviews and elaborates on the literature related to the current investigation. Chapter III presents the methods and procedures under which the study was conducted. Chapter IV reports the findings of the study, and Chapter V presents the summary of this project, discussion of results, recommendations for further research and concluding remarks.

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF SELECTED LITERATURE

Introduction

Research pertaining to the teaching of theory-based practica courses has received scant attention in the professional literature. In a recent analysis of the Journal of Mental Health Counseling, Juntunen (1989) reported a downward trend in the number of articles pertaining to counselor training over the last 10 years.

Similarly, Pelsma and Cesari (1989) recently concluded a content analysis of the Journal of Counseling and Development over the last 19 year period. The authors reported, "those areas appearing consistently less in terms of frequency include articles dealing with the selection, training, and evaluation of counselors" (p.276). Many factors may account for the decline of published articles on counselor training. The appearance of more specialized journals may be one such factor. It is, however, an important trend worthy of attention and monitoring.

Counseling Outcome

Over the years, a closely related, popular, and, at times, controversial topic has been research on factors influencing the outcome of psychotherapy. Educators and practitioners are concerned with counseling outcomes, and, therefore, measures of client satisfaction as one factor related to outcome.

Scofield and Yoxtheimer (1983) reported several important functions of research which identifies and isolates counseling competencies related to positive client change.

These research functions include: (a) refining theories and techniques for clinical intervention, (b) designing educational programs and training methods, (c) improving professional credentialing procedures, (d) developing better ways of assessing trainees' readiness to practice, and, (e) investigating the therapeutic relationship between client and practitioner.

There is insufficient evidence to conclude that overall research on training and evaluation of counselors is declining. In fact, empirical data suggests the amount of research on Strong's (1968) model of social influence has increased over the last 22 years (McNeill & Stoltenberg, 1989). Wampold and White (1985) concluded, "the area of social influence in counseling has come to be regarded as a primary recurrent research theme within counseling psychology" (cited in McNeill & Stoltenberg, 1989).

Kendall and Norton-Ford (1982) listed four basic issues often addressed by traditional outcome research. These four areas are: (1) the effectiveness of different types of interventions, (2) a focus on the characteristics of the therapist, (3) client characteristics which may exert an impact on outcome, and (4) matches between intervention, counselor, and client. The above authors suggest the client's interpretation of therapy may be a more important factor in positive outcome than specific therapist intervention methods. This proposition is supportive of Strong's earlier (1968) conceptualizations.

Outcome research has an interesting history dating to approximately 100 years ago. Luborsky, Auerbach, Chandler, Cohen, and Bachrach, (1971), reviewed a number of the significant studies pertaining to psychotherapy outcomes. Historically, Bishop (1986) refers to early discussions by Freud and Breuer in the 1890's as evidence of early interest in the effectiveness of psychotherapy. Since then, the topic has generally stimulated interesting discussion and strong debate.

The landmark study, which is generally credited with initiating the modern-day controversy, was conducted by Hans Eysenck (1952). Smith, Glass, and Miller (1980) provided a detailed account of Eysenck's early work and his published improvement rates which essentially discounted the effectiveness of psychotherapy. In the review of the history of the psychotherapy effectiveness controversy, Bishop (1986) wrote, "The psychotherapy field was stunned by Eysenck's analysis" (p.1). Other prominent researchers quickly refuted Eysenck's conclusions (Luborsky, 1954; Rosenweig, 1954). More recent research using improved statistical procedures has consistently supported the effectiveness of psychotherapy (Bergin & Lambert, 1978; Lambert, 1976).

A further review of the available literature on outcome research also documents some of the numerous variables which have been investigated in the study of psychotherapy outcome. According to Luborsky, et al.(1971), the variables can be categorized into six general areas. These include: (1) patient factors before treatment, (2) patient factors from the treatment, (3) therapist factors before treatment, (4) therapist factors from the treatment, (5) the match between therapist and patient, and (6) treatment factors.

The above review is an indication of the complexity of interaction and multi-dimensional factors found within the psychotherapy process. Of these many factors, therapist level of experience has been one subject of research (Auerbach & Johnson, 1977; Bandura, Lipsher, & Miller, 1960; Holt & Luborsky, 1958).

On the surface, it seems reasonable to conclude that therapist experience is a significant factor in positive counseling outcome. In fact, the positive relationship between level of experience and positive outcome has received ample support in current and historical research literature. For example, in a recent study of client satisfaction with career counseling, Phillips, Friedlander, Kost, Specterman and

Robbins (1988) determined "Clients who were seen by more experienced counselors tended to be more satisfied" (p.172).

In a comparison of client satisfaction between counseling trainees and professionals, DeVito, Beery, Conetta, and Mixson (1982) reported perceived counselor competence was an important determinant of client satisfaction. This study supports Strong's (1968) conception of perceived expertness as an important element of positive counseling outcome. In an earlier investigation, Bergin (1971) also found a positive relationship between the level of therapist experience and positive outcome. In their report, Meltzoff and Kornreich (1970) determined, "The preponderant weight of evidence, nevertheless is that experience does seem to make a difference" (p. 272).

However, closer scrutiny of the research literature specifically related to counselor level of experience and positive client behavior change provided conflicting information. In Luborsky's, et al. (1971) review of 13 studies, eight showed a significant positive relationship between experience and improvement. Four of the studies were insignificant, and one study was not classified because it showed inexperienced therapists performed well, but in limited circumstances. It was not indicated what the specific limited circumstances were.

In referring to the experience issue and outcome, Auerbach and Johnson (1977) suggested that experienced therapists may not necessarily achieve more favorable results than inexperienced therapists. The above researchers found fewer than half the relevant studies they reviewed indicated that experienced counselors achieved superior results. They suggested that possible overlooked factors, such as client motivation and ego strength, may contribute substantially to therapy outcome.

Other examples of confounding variables include type of training, and completion of personal therapy by the therapist, (Parloff, Waskow, & Wolf, 1978). Parloff,

Waskow, and Wolf concluded the relationship between the level of counselor experience and successful therapy is inconclusive.

In subsequent research, Heppner and Heesacker (1982) found experience level did not affect client perceptions of the counselor. Later, Heppner and Heesacker (1983) replicated their earlier study, finding that actual counselor experience level was not related to perceived counselor expertness, attractiveness, or trustworthiness.

Client Change

There are numerous psychological models available for conceptualizing client change in psychotherapy. In a recent article, Northrup (1986) referred to over 250 established types of therapy. Strong's (1968) conceptualization of counseling as an interpersonal influence process is used as the theoretical framework for this study. Strong has described the social influence model as a two-stage process, in which perceptions are formed by the client, and then, counselors maximize their influence to precipitate change.

One significant theoretical difference from many theoretical models is that therapeutic behavior and attitude change is viewed not only as a result of internal client processes but rather from forces generated within the client-therapist interaction.

Strong's (1968) social influence theory sought to integrate social psychology concepts such as attribution theory with communication theory (Corrigan, Dell, Lewis, & Schmidt, 1980). The result has been described by Strong and Claiborn (1982) as a meta-theory. This enables the social influence theory conceptual framework to account for the effectiveness of many therapeutic modalities across several theoretical orientations.

The clients' perceptions that are attributed to the psychotherapist are central features of social influence theory. The characteristics of the communicator, nature of

the presentation, and process of interacting with the therapist provide a healing force that goes beyond individual client resources. As Dorn (1984) summarizes "Research on the persuasiveness of the sender of a message clearly indicates that persuasion is more likely to occur if the sender of the message is perceived by the receiver as an expert who is trustworthy and attractive" (p.20).

In the seminal work, Frank (1961) asserted that the expectations a client brought with him or her to therapy influenced the results of therapy. In addition, Frank provided a fundamental definition of psychotherapy, "Certain types of therapy rely primarily on the healer's ability to mobilize healing forces in the sufferer by psychological means. These forms of treatment may be generically termed psychotherapy" (p.1). This is the definition of psychotherapy used for the purposes of this research with the terms counseling and psychotherapy used synonymously in the study.

Gurman (1977) suggested the perception of the therapist's degree of empathy, warmth, and genuineness has been found to predict therapeutic success or failure in a variety of situations. In a discussion of research on effective treatment, Kendall and Butcher (1982) state, "Clearly, the movement Carl Rogers launched some 40 years ago on the empirical study of what is involved in psycotherapy is alive, well, but hardly complete" (p.29).

LaCrosse (1977) investigated the seemingly close relationship between social influence theory and Client-Centered counseling. Social influence theory research is concerned with the question: does perceived counselor expertness, attractiveness, and trustworthiness increase the therapeutic effectiveness and likelihood of positive outcome in psychotherapy? According to Heppner and Heesacker (1983), LaCrosse (1980) was the first to explicitly study the relationship between perceived counselor characteristics and outcome. LaCrosse (1975) had previously researched and

published in the area of nonverbal behavior and persuasion. Later, in a related study, LaCrosse (1977) reported on comparative perceptions of counselor behavior concluding, "Especially in regard to counselor training, it would seem very important to arrange for feedback between clients and counselors..."(p.470).

Social influence theory provides insight into the importance of client perceptions of the counselor. The degree with which clients perceive the attributes of attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness, in turn, influences the power and effectiveness of the therapist. Enhancing the counselor's social influence will presumably increase the likelihood of client change (Gardner, White, Packard, & Wampold, 1988). Each of these variables associated with counselor style will be briefly examined.

According to Strong (1968), communicator attractiveness is derived from the client's perception of the counselor's liking for the client and perceived similarity of opinion and background. In their discussion of persuasion and counseling, Kerr, Claiborn, and Dixon (1982) reported, "Here, persuasiveness is not due to the counselor's possessing resources as a competent professional, but to the counselor's qualities as a likeable, effective person" (p.139).

Perceived attractiveness and counselor warmth are quite closely related. In fact, warmth is one of the four dimensions of attractiveness found on the Counselor Rating Form-Short Version (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983) which is used in this research.

Greenberg (1969) cites several investigations demonstrating individuals perceived as behaving in a warm manner can effect the behavior and attitudes of others. Truax and Carkhuff (1967) suggested that warmth is an essential component of successful therapy. In Greenberg's psychotherapy analogy study, it was found that counselor warmth more strongly affected subjects' perceptions and evaluations of sessions than did presession information about counselor experience level.

Heppner and Dixon (1981) analyzed the research on counselor attractiveness. They concluded that a variety of factors influence perceptions of attractiveness. For example, nonverbal behaviors include smiles, gestures, eye-contact, body-lean, and shoulder orientation. Verbal behaviors which are positively related to perceptions of counselor attractiveness include self-disclosure and voice tone. While tentative, such factors as physical attractiveness, age, and sex of the counselor may also affect perceptions.

Expertness is defined by Strong (1968) as, "Perception of a communicator as a source of valid assertions" (p. 216). Strong reports expertness is influenced by: (a) evidence of specialized training such as diplomas, certificates, impressive instruments, and titles, (b) behavior such as rational arguments and confidence in presentation, and (c) reputation as an expert. In their summary on expertness, Heppner and Dixon (1981) concluded, "when sources of counselor expertness are combined, clients' perceptions of expertness as well as the counselor's ability to influence clients' opinions is increased" (p.545).

Perceived counselor trustworthiness has been the subject of less research than attractiveness and expertness (Heppner & Dixon, 1981). However, Heppner and Dixon reported one study which found that perceived trustworthiness increased the counselor's ability to alter clients' opinions. According to Strong (1968), perceived trustworthiness is a function of: "(a) the communicator's reputation for honesty; (b) his social role, such as physician; (c) his sincerity and openness; and (d) his perceived lack of motivation for personal gain" (p.218).

Investigations by Heppner and Heesacker (1983) and Barak, Patkin, and Dell (1982) also indicated a considerable amount of research has been conducted based on social influence theory. Earlier, Barak and LaCrosse (1975) found evidence supporting the existence of three specific characteristics of counselor style. These

three areas of counselor style are attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness. In addition, Schmidt and Strong (1970) and Strong and Dixon (1971) determined each dimension exists independently of each other and can be researched as separate variables.

Barak, Patkin, and Dell (1982) indicated that variables which are hypothesized to affect perceptions can be regarded as either counselor qualities or performance variables. Examples of counselor qualities which are not under direct control of the therapist include: age, sex, group membership, title, training, experience, or judged physical attractiveness. The second category of variables are referred to as performance variables. These are under direct control of the therapist. Performance variables place an emphasis on specific counselor behaviors during a session and how the behaviors effect session outcome. Evidence by Corrigan et al. (1980) suggested performance variables are more important in determining client perceptions of expertness than counselor quality variables (cited in Barak, Patkin & Dell, 1982).

Barak and LaCrosse (1977) extended their line of work to include practicum counselor behavior. They pointed out, that in the training setting, in addition to clients' perceptions, the counselor's behavior is also perceived by supervisors and colleagues. In their comparison of client, counselor, and supervisor ratings it was found, "novice counselors perceive themselves as less expert than their clients perceived them" (p.207).

Interestingly, Barak and LaCrosse (1977) reported that supervisors also underestimated the counselors' perceived expertness when compared to the clients' ratings. Sharma (1986) concluded that the effect of experience on the therapist is primarily the development of a belief in diversity and flexibility of therapeutic interventions. The perceived counselor style dimension of expert was one dimension of counselor style under investigation in this study.

The attributes of perceived counselor attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness may represent a client's implicit theory of a counselor's personality and may affect his behavior toward that counselor and the counseling process in general (Barak & LaCrosse, 1975). It is not known how counselors-in-training are perceived on these variables.

At present, studies on the experience level of therapists and outcome provide conflicting information. The literature dealing with client satisfaction and counselors in training is limited. As Ford (1979) reports, "Furthermore, research investigating the effects of different training curricula, curriculum content sequences, and curricular materials is, unfortunately, virtually nonexistent in the counselor training literature" (p.87).

Numerous studies assessing client perceptions of counselor attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness, are available which support the utility of these three counselor dimensions (Atkinson & Wampold, 1982). However, additional investigation is needed to understand how counselors-in-training are perceived, and the relationship, if any, to client satisfaction and behavior change.

Self Reports

The validity and subsequent acceptance of clients' self-reported measures as a tool for psychological assessment has fluctuated over time. Discussion and research has yielded varying conclusions (Osberg, 1989; Osberg & Shrauger, 1986). Historically, DuBois (cited in Laing, 1988), credits the beginning of formal assessment to the Chinese, with the practice of using competitive exams to evaluate government officials as early as 2200 B.C.

Laing (1988) reported the voluminous research that has contrasted the effectiveness and accuracy of client self-reports, interview, and assessment instruments has produced mixed results. Laing concluded:

> one can cite evidence that self-report is as good as, or better than, other existing approaches to information gathering; one can, just as easily cite evidence that self report is unreliable, inaccurate, deceptive, and in general, not to be trusted by the sensible counselor, teacher, or researcher. (p. 60)

Laing (1988) stated reservations about using client self-reports as a single assessment technique. It is, however, strongly recommended that self-reported data be incorporated into an evaluation process. Laing provided four suggestions when considering the accuracy of self-reports. These include: (1) the respondent must clearly understand what information is being requested, (2) the information requested must be available to the respondent, (3) the respondent must be willing to provide the information, and (4) the examiners must be able to interpret the response accurately.

Shrauger and Osberg (1981) concluded that there exists substantial empirical and conceptual support for the accuracy and utility of client self-reports. These authors indicated people can be perceptive observers of their own behavior. They also may have a larger data base than professional assessors, and be more aware of changes affecting behavior. Lastly, they may be more attentive to situational determinants which are of therapeutic value.

In their report, Shrauger and Osberg (1981) suggested several criteria to consider when deciding whether to incorporate client self-reports in assessment. These are: (a) specify the decision to be made, (b) examine relevant data on the accuracy of self- versus other assessments in relation to the particular decision, (c) specify what variables are relevant to the decision to be made, and (d) determine the best source of information about the relevant predictor variable.

Self-rating scales possess unique qualities in contrast to other assessment tools. In a comparative review of instruments, Burisch (1984), consistently found self-rating scales to be of high validity and outperforming more lengthy questionnaires.

Osberg and Shrauger (1986) indicated the traditional model of psychological assessment has relied upon trained evaluators, testing data, historical information, and clinical judgement. However, the authors also document numerous concerns and sources of dissatisfaction with traditional assessment techniques. Osberg and Shrauger suggested that greater attention and use of client self-reported data may increase the accuracy of assessments. Furthermore, they believe client self-report measures are an important and underemphasized component of assessment.

Clients' feedback about their experience in counseling is vital information to counselors, educators and supervisors. The logical place for this input is as one part of a multi-dimensional feedback system and program evaluation effort. Empirical evidence supports the notion of clients' self-reporting and the several advantages it provides.

CHAPTER III

METHOD

In their article on experimental designs in psychotherapy, Gottman and Markman (1978), restated one of the basic goals of psychotherapy research, that is, "What kinds of patients make what kinds of gains with this program?" (p. 31). The authors made an important point in noting the relationship between research concerning psychotherapy process and outcome while not neglecting to include the influence of the program.

Gottman and Markman (1978) continue to describe the interdependent nature of psychotherapy research and program evaluation:

> The enterprise of psychotherapy research becomes an enterprise of program development and program evaluation. Process research becomes formative evaluation in which information about the functioning of the presumed active ingredients of the program feeds back to influence the programs operation. Outcome research becomes summative evaluation which may be used to assess the program's current limitations and possibly to improve its content. Research in psychotherapy thus becomes translated to the enterprises of program development and program evaluation, and these enterprises are interdependent. (p. 31)

Thus, an investigation of client satisfaction and treatment outcome at a counseling training center can be considered, in a general sense, a way of providing valuable feedback to the program as well applied research on the counseling process.

A unique feature of this present study, was its use of actual clients from the community who elected to enter into a counseling relationship with inexperienced counselors. In this regard it differs from many prior studies in which the subjects did not represent subjects under true field conditions.

In accordance with ethical guidelines to protect the rights and confidentiality of the participants, a proposal for this research was submitted and approved by the Human Subjects Institutional Review Board (HSIRB) at Western Michigan University (Appendix A).

Data Collection

The client satisfaction data on the experienced counselors were gathered during 1984 at a large mid-western university counseling center as part of their follow-up questionnaire (Bessai & Joffe, personal communication). A total of 363 follow up questionnaires were returned by clients representing a 46% return rate. Twenty-three percent of terminated clients elected not to have a questionnaire mailed to them.

Administration of the CCPS Client Satisfaction Survey to clients of inexperienced counselors continued until a sample size of 181 subjects was obtained. A file review provided the specific demographic data on the study participants. The demographic information gathered, corresponded to the time frame of the survey administration in order to provide a description of the sample pool participating in counseling at the Center. The sample population for study consisted of 181 participants from a pool of 278 clients for a return rate of 65% for clients who were seen from January through November, 1988. The clients can be generally described as a non-student adult population who requested and participated in the CCPS services. Detailed Demographic information on the subjects is reported in Chapter IV.

The client satisfaction survey was administered at the time of termination of counseling at the CCPS. Clients who were seen for at least three sessions were asked to complete the instrument by the counselor working with the client at the time of termination. In most cases, the questionnaire was confidentially completed on site, usually in the reception area, prior to leaving the physical location of the CCPS. In

some instances, the survey was either taken home for completion or mailed to the client who then returned the completed survey to the Center Director by postage paid return envelope.

Instrumentation

The CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionnaire is a three section instrument, requesting participants to respond to questions concerning: (a) counselor style, (b) personal change, and (c) satisfaction with services. All responses are completely confidential and the respondents do not identify themselves. There is no required identifiable personal information on the instrument, and in order to insure confidentiality and anonymity, no coding system was used to identify respondents in the study.

Part one, headed counselor style, requests information specific to the clients' perceptions of their counselor regarding the three variables of attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness. This is consistent with one of the stated purposes of the study: to obtain a measure of clients' perceptions of inexperienced counselors and then to compare that data with clients' perceptions of experienced counselors.

Part one of the CCPS Client Satisfaction Survey consists of the Counselor Rating Form (CRF-S) developed by Corrigan and Schmidt (1983). The authors developed the CRF-S out of their study of its parent instrument, the Counselor Rating Form (Barak & LaCrosse, 1975). The original CRF was developed by Barak and LaCrosse to measure Strong's (1968) hypothesis regarding the dimensions of counselor attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness in relation to the counselor's influence with the client (cited in Ponterotto & Furlong, 1985).

Corrigan and Schmidt (1983) described the rationale behind the development of the CRF-S stating, "The CRF-S was developed to improve the utility of the CRF

without sacrificing the reliability and validity of the original instrument. Results of this study indicated that the CRF-S attained or exceeded these objectives" (p.72). Rating scales are, by far, the most prevalent instruments used to measure counselor competency (Ponterotto & Furlong, 1985; Scofield & Yoxtheimier, 1983). In their critique, Ponterotto and Furlong also reported that Barak and LaCrosse's CRF is "The most frequently used counselor rating instrument" (p.600).

Ponterotto and Furlong (1985) provided an in depth description and critique of the CRF-S (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983). Briefly, the instrument consists of 12 adjectives presented in a Likert type scale. Four dimensions are developed for each of the three scales and are titled attractiveness, expertness, and trustworthiness. The clients responded on a seven-point Likert scale ranging from "not very" to "very". The authors report reliability coefficients of .91 for attractiveness, .90 for expertness, and, .87 for trustworthiness. Their major concern with the CRF-S is "The needed time for additional empirical scrutiny" (p.603).

Data Analysis

A comparison of results from the study's inexperienced, counselors-in-training, with experienced counselors, tested the significance of differences between means, on the 12 dimensions and three scales of attractiveness, expertness and trustworthiness. Statistical two-tailed t-tests were used to determine significance with a confidence level set at $p=<.05$. The two-tailed test was used because no prediction was made regarding the direction of possible differences, and, because, it provides a more conservative test of the differences between means. The Fisher critical value of t, for samples of this size is 1.96.

The obtained client personal change data were evaluated from the results of a five-point Likert type scale found on the follow-up questionnaires which were

administered to both groups of clients. For this section on personal change, the subjects responded on a Likert scale ranging from "much worse" to "much better". Comparison of the obtained means between the personal change ratings of clients of inexperienced counselors and the change ratings of clients of experienced counselors were made by also incorporating a two-tailed t test. As stated above, the critical value of t for samples of this size is 1.96 at p=<.05 level of significance.

In addition to counselor style, and personal change, a third area of investigation in this study is the relationship between the variables of counselor style and self-reported personal change. A correlational study determined the degree and magnitude, if any, of the relationship between the two sets of data. A factor analysis provided an in depth examination of the significant variables relating to counselor style and behavior change for the sample. The statistical data were analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS-X) on computer hardware available through the Academic Computer Center at Western Michigan University.

CHAPTER IV

RESULTS

Client Demographics

Descriptive statistics provide a partial picture of this study's participants. Demographic information was collected and analyzed for five areas on the CCPS inexperienced counselor sample. Using measures of central tendency and dispersion to report and describe the data, client demographics included: (a) age, (b) duration of treatment, (c) marital status, (d) gender, and (e) referral source. Demographic information was unavailable on the sample that was seen by experienced counselors; however, it is known that they were college students seeking services at a counseling center located at a large Midwestern University.

The mean age of the Center's sample was 28.1 years with a median age of 26.0 years. The age range was from 8 to 65 years. Information gathered on the duration of treatment indicated the mean number of sessions was 9.2 sessions per client and the median number of session, 8.0 sessions per client. The range in number of sessions was from 3 to 37.

Marital status was broken into five categories: (1) 56% of the participants identified themselves as single, (2) 10% identified themselves as divorced, (3) 1% identified themselves as widowed, (4) 3% identified themselves as separated, and (5) 30% identified themselves as married. A review of gender indicates the sample consisted of 66% female and 34% male participants.

Referral source information gathered at the time of intake provided the following data: (a) 44% of the participants were referred by either a friend or family member, (b) 7% were referred by a former client or had been a former client themselves, (c) 5% of the study participants indicated the newspaper as a referral source, (d) 2% reported the center brochure as a referral source, (e) 5% indicated the Help Line as the referral source, and (f) 36% indicated other categories a source of referral. Other categories included school, employer rehabilitation counselor, probation officer, etc.

The nature of concerns were categorized into two general areas, personal concerns or vocational issues. However, presenting problem was not a major factor under investigation in this study and should not be confused with the personal change reported by clients. In the following section the findings on counselor style and personal change of clients in therapy with inexperienced and experienced counselors are compared.

The Null Hypotheses

Several hypotheses were tested in examining the research questions presented in this study, and they are stated in null hypothesis form in this chapter. A null hypothesis examining each dimension of counselor style is presented. The results of the analysis of the null hypotheses are explained which includes the decision to retain or reject the null hypotheses.

Null Hypothesis #1

No difference was observed in the client's self-reported perceptions of counselor style when inexperienced and experienced counselors are compared on the following selected counselor dimensions: (a) friendly, (b) likeable, (c) sociable, (d) warm, (e)

experienced, (f) expert, (g) prepared, (h) skillful, (i) honest, (j) reliable, (k) sincere, (l) trustworthy.

The counselor style section of the survey requires respondents to select from a seven point Likert scale. The scale values range from lowest (1) of "not very", to the highest (7) of "very". Means and standard deviations were calculated for each of the selected dimensions.

Counselor Style

In this section, the data obtained for dimensions of counselor style and results as found on the CRF-S scales are presented. Due to subject non-responses on some individual items, there are small variances between the 181 sample size and the number of responses shown in Table 1.

As shown in Table 1, for every dimension of counselor style, the mean for the inexperienced group equaled or slightly exceeded the mean of the experienced group. A two-tailed t-test was used to test significance of the means between the two groups. The two-tailed test was selected because the direction of difference in means was not predicated in the research hypothesis. The critical value of a two-tailed t-test was found to be 1.96 for samples of this size at the $p = <.05$ level of significance.

In Table 1, the number of subjects in each group, the calculated means, standard deviations, calculated t-score and the statistical decision for the 12 dimensions of counselor style at the $p=<.05$ level of significance are displayed. Additionally, the three composite CRF-S scales of Attractiveness, Experience, and Trustworthiness are included.

Contrasting inexperienced and experienced counselors on the friendly dimension resulted in a mean of 6.4 for the inexperienced group compared to a mean of 5.8 for the experienced counselors. The calculated t-value of 6.67 lead to a rejection of the

null hypothesis. Similarly, the null hypotheses for the counselor dimensions of likeable, sociable, and warm also lead to the rejection of the null hypothesis for the composite scale of Attractiveness.

Table 1

Descriptive Statistics and t Values Reflecting Clients' Perceptions of Counselor Style: Comparing Inexperienced With Experienced Counselors

	Inexperienced			Experienced			
Dimension	N	M	SD	N	M	SD	t
Friendly	173	6.4	.94	363	5.8	1.2	6.67*
Likeable	172	6.5	.94	363	5.9	1.2	6.67*
Sociable	172	6.3	1.00	363	5.6	1.3	6.60*
Warm	172	6.3	1.00	363	5.6	1.4	6.67*
Attractive-ness**	169	6.4	.96	363	5.7	1.3	7.00*
Experienced	166	5.7	1.20	363	5.7	1.2	0.00
Expert	168	5.7	1.20	363	5.5	1.3	1.69
Prepared	171	6.4	.95	363	5.7	1.3	7.00*
Skillful	170	6.0	1.10	363	5.6	1.3	3.64*
Expertness**	169	6.0	1.10	363	5.6	1.3	4.00*
Honest	171	6.5	.92	363	6.1	1.1	4.49*
Reliable	171	6.5	.86	363	5.8	1.3	7.78*
Sincere	169	6.5	1.00	363	6.0	1.2	5.00*
Trustworthy	170	6.5	.97	363	6.1	1.1	4.00*
Trust-worthiness**	170	6.5	.94	363	6.0	1.2	5.60*
Composite (Scales 1-12)	170	6.5	1.00	363	5.8	1.3	7.00*

* p. = <.05; critical value of t= 1.96 (two-tailed test)
**indicates CRF-S scales

The second CRF-S scale, labeled Expertness, is derived from the four counselor style dimensions of experienced, expert, prepared, and skillful. In an examination of

the experienced dimension, it was found there was not a statistically significant difference between the mean of inexperienced counselors and the mean of experienced counselors. Thus, the null hypothesis was retained for the experienced dimension. Likewise, an examination of the mean on the dimensions of expert showed a mean of 5.7 for inexperienced counselors and a mean of 5.5 for experienced counselors. While means for inexperienced counselors were slightly larger, the results on the t-test indicated the difference could be attributed to chance. Thus, the null hypotheses for the counselor style dimension of expert was also retained.

The null hypotheses for the dimensions of prepared and skillful were rejected as indicated in Table 1. Even though the null hypotheses were retained for the dimensions of experienced and expert, that are found within the CRF-S Expertness scale, the null hypothesis is rejected for the Expertness scale.

The Trustworthiness scale is constructed from the four counselor dimensions of honest, reliable, sincere, and trustworthy. The t-tests resulted in rejecting the null hypotheses for each of these four dimensions and also of the overall Trustworthiness scale.

In a composite analysis of all individual dimensions one through twelve, it was found the overall difference in means was significant. This was an important finding because the CRF-S proved to be unidimensional in this study.

A pairwise factor analysis was performed on the 12 dimensions of counselor style. The purpose of this statistical procedure was to examine the relationship, if any, among these 12 dimensions of counselor style. An eigenvalue of 7.78 was obtained for factor one using factor analysis which accounted for 64.9% of the total variation. Factor two recieved an eigenvalue of .99, factor three, .78, and factor 4, .49.

The results of the factor analysis on the counselor style dimensions suggest there are only subtle differences between the 12 dimensions which stimulate client responses regarding counselor style. The factor analysis results, due to its data reduction capabilities, suggest the retainment of one factor from the analysis. A universal term or descriptor (factor) could account for all of the 12 dimensions of counselor style. The present investigation will label this factor: "client satisfaction" as that universal descriptor. Later, these satisfaction scores will be investigated in relationship to selected personal change ratings by clients.

Personal Change as a Result of Counseling

The next area of investigation, examined client's self-reports of 12 selected areas of personal change.

Null Hypothesis #2

No difference was observed in clients' self-reports when inexperienced counselors are compared to experienced counselors on the following personal change variables: (a) stress management, (b) relations with friends, (c) relationship with romantic partner, (d) relations with parents and family, (e) social skills, (f) self understanding, (g) feelings of self-worth (h) excessive sensitivity to opinions of others, (i) feelings of anxiety, (j) feelings of depression, (k) feelings of anger, and (l) satisfaction with eating habits.

Before examining Table 2, it is important to note that in the questionnaire instructions the clients were asked to select the personal changes which he or she experienced, and thinks occurred as a result of counseling. In order to more clearly define, address and present the specific types of concerns that the clients selected, issues associated with personal change were divided into two categories, each

containing six emotional issues and six social issues. The emotional concerns can be thought of as intrapersonal issues, while the social concerns can be considered interpersonal in nature.

Table 2

Frequencies and Percentages Reflecting Clients' Personal Change With Selected Emotional Concerns: Inexperienced Counselors

Not issue		Much Better		Better		Same		Worse		Much Worse	
Raw	%	Raw	%	Raw	%	Raw	%	Raw	%	Raw	%
Self-worth (N=177)											
16	9	53	32.9	70	43.5	31	19.3	5	3.1	2	1.2
Excessive Sensitivity (N=173)											
42	24	30	22.9	45	34.4	50	38.2	4	3.1	2	1.5
Anxiety (N=175)											
27	15	32	21.6	70	47.3	40	27.0	6	4.1	0	0.0
Depression (N=177)											
27	15	37	24.7	69	46.0	35	23.3	8	5.3	1	0.7
Anger (N=174)											
28	16	40	27.4	55	37.7	47	32.2	4	2.7	0	0.0
Eating Habits (N=174)											
78	45	11	11.5	21	21.9	50	52.1	8	8.3	6	6.3

The data obtained which examined clients' personal change that are categorized as emotional concerns are found in Table 2. These data are for the clients of inexperienced counselors only. These six emotional issues include: (1) client self-worth, (2) excessive sensitivity to the opinions of others, (3) the client's ability to handle feelings of anxiety, (4) the client's ability to handle feelings of depression, (5) the client's ability to handle feelings of anger, and (6) the client's satisfaction with eating habits. The respective raw scores, percentages, and breakdown by scale values for personal change on emotional issues are shown.

In Table 2, clients' responses concerning their feelings of self-worth are shown. Of these, 43.5% reported feeling better about their self-worth and 32.9% reported feeling much better for an improvement rate of 76.4%. The 173 responses concerning excessive sensitivity to the opinions of others resulted in ratings of 34.4% feeling better and 22.9% reported feeling much better. This provides a self-reported improvement rate of 57.3%. Regarding 175 client responses concerning anxiety, 47.3% reported feeling better and 21.6% reported feeling much better which resulted in an improvement rate of 68.9%. For the issue regarding depression, 177 client responses were obtained with 46% indicating better and 24.7% indicating much better for an improvement rate of 70.7%. Of the 174 responses concerning anger, 37.7% reported feeling better, 27.4% reported much better for an improvement rate of 65.1% for handling anger. The 174 responses for satisfaction with eating habits show that 21.9% reported feeling better while 11.5% report feeling much better for an improvement rate of 33.4%. It is noted, of that 174 responses, 78 individuals or 45% indicated eating habits were not an issue for them. Because eating disorders may be more closely associated with college age females, this statistic may reflect on the gender, age, and educational demographics of the study participants.

Table 3

Descriptive Statistics and t Values Reflecting Clients' Personal Change With Selected Emotional Concerns: Comparing Inexperienced With Experienced Counselors

	Inexperienced			Experienced			
Concern	N	M	SD	N	M	SD	t
Self-worth	177	4.0	.87	363	3.7	.94	3.75*
Excessive Sensitivity	173	3.7	.90	363	3.5	.82	2.22*
Anxiety	175	3.9	.80	363	3.6	.83	3.75*
Depression	177	3.9	.86	363	3.4	.86	6.25*
Anger	174	3.9	.84	363	3.4	.81	6.25*
Eating Habits	174	3.2	.98	363	3.2	.87	0.00

*p = <.05; critical value of t= 1.96 (two-tailed test)

Table 3, provides additional data on the six identified emotional issues. In Table 3, the means and standard deviations of inexperienced and experienced counselors are compared. Additionally, the t-scores and the null hypotheses decisions are presented.

As shown in Table 3, five of the six specific null hypotheses related to personal change in emotional issues were rejected when client self-reports of inexperienced counselors were compared to experienced counselors. In this analysis, a significant difference was found in the mean self-reported personal change scores between clients of inexperienced and experienced counselors. The difference favoring the inexperienced counselors. The selected six emotional issues are: (1) feelings of self-worth, (2) excessive sensitivity to others, (3) feelings of anxiety, (4) feelings of depression, and (5) feelings of anger. Of the six concerns, only (6), the clients' self-reports of satisfaction with eating habits were not significantly different. As

mentioned above, a difference in satisfaction with eating habits might be expected due to the differences in sample demographics.

Next, the findings on identified social concerns are presented. Clients' self-reports of personal change with six identified social issues include: (1) ability to manage stress, (2) relationships with friends, (3) relationship with a romantic partner, (4) relationships with parents and family, (5) social skills, and (6) self understanding.

In Table 4, the responses of clients of inexperienced counselors reporting personal change on the selected social issues are displayed. Frequencies and percentages for each of the five values ranging from "much worse" to "much better" are shown. Additionally, data on those clients reporting that the concern was "not an issue" are also provided.

For stress management, 48% reported feeling better and 27% reported feeling much better for an overall improvement rate of 75%. Friendship concerns showed a 57% improvement rate with 38% reporting feeling better and 19% reporting much better. Romantic relationship concerns showed 34.4% reported feelings better and 28% much better for a 62.4% improvement rate. In the area of family relationship concerns, 32.6% reported feeling better while 24% reported feeling much better for a 56.6% improvement rate. Improvement in social skills is described as better by 34.6% and much better by 15% for an improvement rate of 49.6%. The greatest improvement was reported in the area of self understanding. In this area, 39.5% reported feeling better while 47% reported feeling much better for an improvement rate of 86.5%. Unique to the reports of self understanding, is that this is the only concern where reports of feeling much better exceeded feeling better.

Table 4

Frequencies and Percentages Reflecting Client's Personal Change with Selected Social Concerns: Inexperienced Counselors

Not issue Raw%	Much Better Raw %	Better Raw %	Same Raw%	Worse Raw %	Much Worse Raw %
Stress-Management (N=174) 12 6.8	43 27.0	78 48.0	39 24.0	1 0.6	1 0.6
Friend-ship (N=177) 25 14.1	29 19.0	59 38.0	60 40.0	3 2.0	1 0.7
Romantic Relation-ships (N=173) 48 27.7	35 28.0	43 34.4	35 28.0	9 7.2	3 2.4
Family Relation-ships (N=174) 30 17.2	34 24.0	47 32.6	60 41.7	2 1.4	1 0.7
Social Skills (N=174) 38 21.8	21 15.0	47 34.6	64 47.0	3 2.2	1 0.6
Self Under-standing (N=175) 5 2.9	79 47.0	66 39.5	66 39.5	3 1.8	0 0.0

In Table 5, self-reports of personal change on the above identified social concerns by clients of inexperienced and experienced counselors are compared.

Table 5

Descriptive Statistics and t Values Reflecting Clients' Personal Change With Selected Social Concerns: Comparing Inexperienced With Experienced Counselors

	Inexperienced			Experienced			
Concern	N	M	SD	N	M	SD	t
Stress Management	162	4.0	0.77	363	3.5	0.88	6.25*
Friendship	152	3.7	0.81	363	3.6	0.83	1.25
Romantic Relationship	125	3.8	1.00	363	3.6	1.05	2.00*
Family Relationships	144	3.8	0.85	363	3.5	0.44	3.75*
Social Skills	136	3.6	0.80	363	3.5	0.81	1.25
Self Understanding	167	4.3	0.75	363	4.0	0.90	4.29*

*p.= <.05; critical value of t= 1.96 (two-tailed test)

In Table 5, means, standard deviations, and obtained t-scores, for each of the six personal change issues defined as a social concern when comparing inexperienced and experienced counselors are presented. A significant difference was found in the means between the two samples for the four issues of: (1) ability to handle stress, (2) romantic relationships, (3) family relations, and (4) self understanding. Of the identified social concerns, the issues of, relationship with friends, and social skills, were concerns where it was found that a significant difference did not exist between clients of inexperienced and experienced counselors.

Null Hypothesis #3

No relationship will be observed between obtained client satisfaction indicators and obtained personal change scores.

In order to investigate the possible relationship between satisfaction and change, a Pearson product-moment correlation procedure was incorporated. The 12 client satisfaction variables and 15 personal change variables for the inexperienced counselor group were analyzed. In Appendix B, the correlation coefficients are presented.

Appendix B displays the obtained correlation coefficients. Each personal change variable is listed on the left and with the columns headed by the specific counselor style dimension. The presentation is made for each of the 15 personal change items in relation to each of the 12 counselor style dimensions found on the Attractiveness scale, Expertness scale and Trustworthiness scale of the CRF-S.

The Relationship Between Counselor Style and Personal Change

Table 6 is an ordering of the correlation coefficients between counselor style and personal change. The counselor style dimensions are ranked from highest to lowest which detail the level(s) of significance for each of the data. The 15 headings are comprised of the personal change variables with the counselor style dimensions and correlation coefficients following underneath.

As can be seen from the correlations, all coefficients are positive indicating the variables of counselor style and personal change are related. However, in some cases the degree of relationship is non-significant. A discussion of these findings and the implications are found in Chapter V.

Table 6

Rankings of Correlations With Personal Change and Counselor Style Variables

**= significant at .01; *= significant at .05

1. Improvement in Career Direction

Expert	.45**
Skillful	.44**
Experienced	.40**
Likeable	.36**
Warm	.35**
Honest	.31**
Prepared	.30**
Sociable	.29**
Sincere	.28**
Friendly	.26**
Trustworthy	.26**
Reliable	.25*

2. Excessive Sensitivity to Opinions of Others

Skillful	.38**
Likeable	.36**
Expert	.32**
Warm	.32**
Sociable	.31**
Experienced	.29**
Sincere	.29**
Reliable	.27**
Honest	.24*
Friendly	.20*
Trustworthy	.19
Prepared	.16

3. Improved Feelings of Self-Worth

Likeable	.37**
Warm	.36**
Skillful	.34**
Sociable	.32**
Expert	.30**
Friendly	.27**
Experienced	.26**
Reliable	.25*
Sincere	.23*
Honest	.22*
Trustworthy	.21*
Prepared	.16

Table 6--Continued

**= significant at .01; *= significant at .05	
4. Improved Adjustment to Life	
Likeable	.36**
Skillful	.36**
Expert	.35**
warm	.32**
Sincere	.31**
Experienced	.26**
Friendly	.26**
Sociable	.26**
Trustworthy	.25*
Honest	.24*
Reliable	.24*
Prepared	.15
5. Improved Ability to Handle Anxiety	
Expert	.36**
Skillful	.34**
Experienced	.33**
Likeable	.33**
Warm	.32**
Reliable	.28**
Sincere	.26**
Friendly	.24*
Trustworthy	.24*
Honest	.23*
Sociable	.20*
Prepared	.19
6. Increased Motivation for Life	
Skillful	.34**
Likeable	.33**
Sincere	.31**
Honest	.29**
Expert	.28**
Friendly	.27**
Sociable	.25*
Warm	.25*
Experienced	.23*
Trustworthy	.21*
Prepared	.12
Reliable	.11

Table 6--Continued

**= significant at .01; *= significant at .05

7. Improved Ability to Handle Anger	
Expert	.34**
Skillful	.33**
Honest	.30**
Likeable	.30**
Warm	.29**
Sincere	.27**
Experienced	.25*
Sociable	.25*
Trustworthy	.22*
Prepared	.20*
reliable	.20*
Friendly	.18
8. Improved Stress Management	
Likeable	.33**
Skillful	.32**
Expert	.31**
Honest	.30**
Experienced	.28**
Warm	.27**
Reliable	.25*
Friendly	.25*
Trustworthy	.24*
Sincere	.23*
Sociable	.18
Prepared	.09
9. Improved Relationships With Parents and Family	
Warm	.33**
Experienced	.27**
Skillful	.27**
Likeable	.27**
Expert	.25*
Friendly	.23*
Prepared	.22*
Sincere	.20*
Trustworthy	.20*
Honest	.19
Sociable	.17
Reliable	.09

Table 6--Continued

**= significant at .01; *= significant at .05.

10. Improved Social Skills

Warm	.33**
Experienced	.27**
Expert	.25*
Likeable	.23*
Skillful	.23*
Honest	.19
Trustworthy	.19
Sincere	.17
Reliable	.15
Sociable	.14
Prepared	.14
Friendly	.12

11. Improved Ability to Handle Depression

Experienced	.31**
Likeable	.31**
Sincere	.30**
Expert	.29**
Honest	.26**
Skillful	.26**
Warm	.26**
Friendly	.24*
Sociable	.23*
Reliable	.22*
Trustworthy	.18
Prepared	.16

12. Improved Relationships With Friends

Skillful	.29**
Experienced	.27**
Expert	.26**
Likeable	.26**
Warm	.25*
Friendly	.23*
Honest	.20*
Sociable	.15
Trustworthy	.12
Sincere	.11
Prepared	.11
Reliable	.07

Table 6--Continued

**= significant at .01; *= significant at .05

13. Improved Understanding of Self

Skillful	.28**
Expert	.28**
sincere	.26**
Trustworthy	.26**
Reliable	.25*
Warm	.25*
Experienced	.21*
Likeable	.20*
Sociable	.20*
Prepared	.15
Friendly	.13
Honest	.11

14. Improved Relationship With Romantic Partner

Honest	.22*
Warm	.19
Skillful	.18
Experienced	.16
Likeable	.12
Sincere	.12
Trustworthy	.12
Expert	.09
Friendly	.08
Prepared	.08
Reliable	.02
Sociable	.01

15. Improved Eating Habits

Expert	.22**
Likeable	.17
Skillful	.15
Warm	.14
Sincere	.13
Sociable	.13
Honest	.12
Experienced	.11
Friendly	.11
Prepared	.09
Reliable	.07
Trustworthy	.08

In this chapter, the findings of this study have been presented including eigenvalues and factor analysis results. The initial set of data reported the CCPS clients' perceptions of inexperienced counselor style as obtained on the CRF-S. Then, a comparison of clients' self-reports between inexperienced and experienced counselors on the 12 dimensions of counselor style were presented. Next, findings of personal change on six emotional issues, including improvement rates were presented and compared for clients of inexperienced and experienced counselors. Similarly, comparison data and improvement rates for personal change on six concerns identified as social issues are found. Also presented, were selected demographic information on the clients of inexperienced counselors at the CCPS. In addition, the correlation coefficients, and their rankings, displaying the type and magnitude of relationship between personal change and counselor style were presented.

CHAPTER V

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

This chapter first presents an overview of the study. Following this summary, is a discussion of the results based on an analysis of the data. Then, recommendations for further research are made, and subsequently, concluding comments.

Summary

A desire to obtain empirical information on the level of service provided by student counselors within a counselor education training center marked the conceptual stage of this investigation. In planning the study, it seemed that among the various approaches which could be taken to achieve the purpose of the study, the inclusion of client feedback was an important and necessary feature. Initial research support relating to client satisfaction and instrumentation was obtained by Dr. Robert Betz from a Western Michigan University College of Education Mini-Grant. The research questions addressed in this study elaborate some of the ideas generated from investigations on client satisfaction, counselor training, and Social Influence Theory (Strong, 1968). Social Influence Theory provided the theoretical underpinnings for this study. The instrument used to obtain measures of counselor style, the Counselor Rating Form-Short Version (CRF-S) (Corrigan & Schmidt, 1983), is a valid, reliable, and frequently used counseling research instrument.

The CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionnaire, which includes the CRF-S, was adapted from a counseling follow-up survey used by the University of Illinois

Counseling Center (Bessai & Joffe, personal communication). The University of Illinois also provided the comparative data on the experienced counselors collected during 1984 which are reported in this investigation. Consistent with the stated research questions of this study, the CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionaire contains three sections pertaining to (1) counselor style, (2) personal change and (3) satisfaction with services.

It was decided that the questionnaire would be administered to subjects by the student working with the subject at the time of termination from the CCPS. More than one counselor may have provided services to a subject. Attendance of at least three counseling sessions was established as the criteria for inclusion in the sample for study. This was done in an effort to include those subjects who had engaged in a counseling relationship prior to terminating, and had sufficient experience at the Center to self-assess their own experience and provide feedback.

A coding booklet was developed to facilitate the manual transfer of raw data from the questionnaires onto mark-sense scanning forms. The data were then entered into the VAX computer by Testing Services at Western Michigan University and data were then analyzed using the SPSS-X Program.

Discussion

The sample's demographic data provided information which indicated, that as a group, the counselors-in-training had access to a diverse range of individuals and counseling issues with which to work. Actual counseling experience with a diverse population and range of concerns can provide distinct training advantages to students within the experiential education format of practica courses. Simulated counseling sessions and role-playing are a necessary, and valuable, teaching technique common in counselor education. However, working with clients who are motivated to seek

help, and the very real issues which they present, under the auspices of the training center, is regarded as a tremendous opportunity for advanced counselor skill development.

This study used The CCPS Client Satisfaction Questionaire to examine selected research topics that previously have not included inexperienced counselors. First, it was found that the sample means on the CRF-S's 12 dimensions of style for the inexperienced counselors, equaled or exceeded the means for experienced counselors.

This similarity of perceptions is an important finding which suggests that the student status of a counselor-in-training is not an obstacle to effective helping. The accruement of supervised experience, can benefit student counselors' skill development, facilitate professional identity, and build total self-confidence.

Unique conditions exist within the counselor training center environment which clients are not likely to encounter in professional settings. These include the audio taping of sessions, possible video taping of sessions, live observation of sessions through one-way glass by supervisors and peers, and finally, working with an inexperienced counselor. Based on this study's sample, despite the above intrusive, and at times, possibly threatening conditions, clients' perceptions of the counselor on 12 selected style dimensions are consistent, whether the counselor is a student or professional.

The proposition of consistency of clients' perceptions, is further supported by the somewhat surprising finding of no difference between inexperienced and experienced counselors on the specific style dimensions of experience and expert as rated on the CRF-S. This lends credence to the notion that Strong's (1968) Social Influence Theory, which emphasizes the importance of clients' perceptions which are attributed to the counselor, is applicable to counselors-in-training as well as experienced counselors.

In another area of investigation, this study found that counselors-in-training facilitated positive counseling outcome. This finding is based on self-reported measures of personal change that subjects attributed to the CCPS counseling experience. When comparisons were made between inexperienced and experienced counselors, clients' ratings on selected personal change issues, either exceeded or equaled the ratings of personal change by clients of experienced counselors.

There are several plausible factors which contributed to the positive client ratings of the inexperienced counselors. These factors may also apply to the perceptions of style discussed above, one of which is the limited case load of the counselors-in-training. Beginning practica students are restricted to working with no more than two on-going clients at a time. This allows both the beginning student and supervisor, the time, and energy to attend to the clinical and educational issues which are consistent with the role of the training center.

Those students selecting advanced practica are limited to a case load of four clients at any one time. This provides additional hours of supervised client contact during the practica for the student. The additional experience benefits not only the supervisee, but also the supervisor, and in turn the supervision process. By observing the student in a variety of counseling situations, and monitoring the counseling process, the supervisor has an opportunity to gain valuable information about the supervisee's developmental skill level. The additional trainee experience then, enables the supervisor to conduct supervision, provide support and make appropriate suggestions which are based on an accumulation of information. That information is derived from the student's work with a variety of clients and differing issues.

It follows, that another important feature of the CCPS training center which contributed to client satisfaction and personal change is the amount, type, and quality

of supervision that is received by the students. Trainees are provided both individual and group supervision on a weekly basis by the instructor. In some classes, a graduate teaching assistant may be also available. The immediacy of the supervision experience is an important feature. Immediacy of supervisory contact is especially true for the beginning practica. For these courses, supervisors are required to be actively available during all counseling sessions. As a result of the supervisor's opportunity for live observation, assistance or feedback can take place during a session if necessary, or as customary, immediately following. Individual and structured group supervision are emphasized weekly at CCPS and peer or self-supervision may take place informally.

The use of media equipment is extensive at the CCPS. This facilitates the supervision process and in turn counselor skill development. All counseling sessions are audio taped, and beginning students make at least one or more video tapes of their sessions. Advanced students are more active in their use of the video taping capabilities of the center. The use of media equipment as learning and supervision tools, contributes to counselor skill development and, thus, to client satisfaction.

In addition to the limited case load, supervision factors, and use of media, a fourth condition which likely contributes to positive outcome is the CCPS disposition procedure. As a result of the CCPS intake, case disposition, and client assignment system, a selection and matching process takes place. It is unlikely a similar process occurs in the settings of more experienced counselors. Due to the demand for service and economic considerations faced in most schools and human service organizations, client assignments are often determined by staff or resource availability. Clearly, with its emphasis on student development, and clinical supervision, the subsequent responsiveness to the client's personal needs are important features contributing to client satisfaction and high ratings of personal change. At the CCPS, this sensitivity

regarding client concerns is exemplified by the referral of clients who are more appropriately served elsewhere. Each request for service and the corresponding intake information is presented and discussed during a weekly disposition meeting attended by the CCPS director and staff. If deemed appropriate, a file is constructed and the information is forwarded to the practicum instructor. The instructor has the option of returning the request for service to the CCPS. When appropriate, a client may be referred to another service or student after initial assignment. In this study, 4% of the subjects reported that referral to another service in order to better meet their needs was the reason for stopping services at the CCPS.

The practica instructors also make a specific assignment of clients to students. It is reasonable to believe that the client assignments by the instructor take into consideration the skill levels or interests of the student. Then, it can be concluded that the selection of clients, and client matching with students, contributed to the enhancement of satisfaction and personal change improvement rates.

Other, implicit factors may also contribute to the personal change rates found in this study. For example, students' motivation to learn, eagerness to help, personal enthusiasm about becoming a professional counselor, and their own satisfaction about career choice and graduate program, could exert a subtle but powerful therapeutic force on counseling outcome. Likewise, systems factors, such as administration, and organization, of the CCPS, including orientation of students to procedures, are additional subtle forces which may be reflected in client satisfaction and positive improvement rates.

In this investigation, Null Hypothesis #3 is concerned with the possible relationship between dimensions of counselor style and personal change. The magnitude and direction of the relationship between the 12 variables of counselor style and 15 personal change variables were determined using the Pearson product-

moment correlation. Koenker (1974) provided a frequently used interpretation scale which can be applied to positive and negative correlation coeficients. An examination of the data revealed, that for each counselor style dimension and personal change pairing, the correlations were above zero, indicating the existence of a relationship. The strength of the correlations in some cases were negligible or chance relationships, and ranged to a high of .45 suggesting a fair degree of relationship. To test significance, the Fisher critical values for a two-tailed test at the .05 level (.195), and at the.01 level (.254) were used.

The number of significant correlations at the .01 and .05 level were totaled for each four dimensions of the Attractiveness, Expertness and Trustworthiness scales. Of the 60 existing possibilities on each scale, Expertness recieved 37 significant correlations, Attractiveness had 35 significant correlations, and Trustworthiness had 21. This finding suggests that each of the three scales on the CRF-S contributes to client satisfaction. An examination of the number of significant correlations, and their relative strength as found on the individual scales, suggests that the counselor style dimensions as found on the Expertness and Attractiveness scales contributed the most to client satisfaction. Trustworthiness dimensions contributed also, but as the least dominant scale. For this study, on both the scales of Expertness and Attractiveness, over half the possible correlations were significant. This supports the unidimensionality finding of the CRF-S as a measure of client satisfaction as indicated by the factor analysis procedure reported on earlier.

A further analysis indicated improvement in career direction was the only personal change variable where the relationship with each style dimension was significant. In addition to obtaining all significant correlations, the greatest strength of correlations were found between the career direction variable and counselor style variables. This may be of significance for those counselors working with clients

presenting with career issues or other specific concerns. It could be, that the dimensions of Expert, Skillful, and Experienced are of special importance to clients who seek assistance on well-defined presenting problems such as career concerns or eating habits. This is in contrast to a more vague concern such as anxiety.

Recommendations For Further Research

The purpose and scope of this study has illuminated the need for further research in several related areas. As discussed above, the number and magitude of the significant correlations on the career direction issue is an interesting finding. Further research is needed to accurately explain this occurrence and determine its significance. Thus, it is recommended, additional client satisfaction investigations focus on the resolution of specific, as opposed to less defined concerns.

Furthermore, not all counselor education departments operate a training center. It would be very interesting to see what differences, if any, exist in terms of client satisfaction, between practica students from non-training center programs, and those practica students serving clients within the auspices of a counseling training center such as the CCPS.

The variables of setting and population can provide further areas of interesting research. Along this line, it would be advantageous to compare clients' satisfaction with inexperienced counselors, to clients' satisfaction measures from a private practice, and then, public mental health providers.

The efficacy of clients' self-ratings has at times been discounted in research and assessment. Recent investigations however, provided empirical reliability and validity data which calls for the inclusion of self-ratings in psychotherapy research and program evaluation efforts. Similarly, in what is an untapped and fertile area of counseling research, client satisfaction measures have also been viewed with

skepticism. This present investigation provided supportive evidence on the utility of client satisfaction measures. These data encourage additional investigations into client satisfaction and self-report as counseling outcome measures.

Additional research is also needed with increased focus and control of possible confounding variables related to counselors-in-training. Due to possible "response bias" (Barlow, Hays, & Nelson, 1984, p.125) and other threats to validity, the findings in favor of the the counselors-in-training should not be interpreted as the inexperienced counselors were necessarily "better" than experienced counselors. A number of factors may be influencing the results. Another validity threat is the the possible existence of a type of "halo effect" (Isaac & Michael, 1981, p.85) which could cloud the results causing clients to be less critical in their feedback. For illustration, the consistently positive feedback could be a type of social repayment for receiving at no fee, a valued service which is unavailable to the participants elsewhere due to the financial costs or unavailability of health care insurance coverage.

Research on the effect of pre-session referral source information, the intake experience itself, the counselor's structuring of the sessions, or even more subtle verbal and non-verbal counselor behaviors which convey competence and self-confidence are called for.

Conclusion

It is speculative, but the lack of an established repertoire of intervention techniques by the inexperienced counselors may in some situations actually be a therapeutic advantage to counseling outcome. If the counselors-in-training emphasize relationship building and empathy skills, the results of this positive working alliance could be reflected in the measures of counselor style, ratings of personal change, and client satisfaction. As alluded to earlier, experienced counselors, due to various

forces may, over time, become less effective. If so, this is an appropriate issue for continued investigation by researchers.and one which counselor educators may want to address in training.

Frank (1982) stated "The most powerful determinants of the success of any therapeutic encounter probably lie in the properties of the patient, the therapist, and particular patient-therapist pair, rather than in the therapeutic procedure" (p. 28). Frank described six common elements shared by all therapeutic modalities: (1) a designated helping person, (2) an emotionally charged, confidential relationship, (3) a therapeutic setting that is physically and emotionally safe, (4) a diagnosis, rationale, or explanation of symptoms, (5) a prescribed course for treatment, and (6) a ritual that requires active participation of both client and therapist. The CCPS setting and counselors-in-training share these six elements with many professionals.

Through additional future research, it could be found that the differences between inexperienced and experienced counselors are fewer than presently thought. Does this diminish the value of a well-trained and seasoned professional? Certainly not. It may be possible for an individual to learn chemistry through books and practice in a basement laboratory. But, it is doubtful, that many individuals would want to take medications formulated and prescribed by that person.

In conclusion, it is evident from the findings of this study, that inexperienced counselors can and do provide effective counseling services within a training center context and structured setting. Overall, client satisfaction with student counselors from the CCPS program was very high. Ninety-five percent of the subjects in this sample would recommend the Center, and 95% also reported an overall satisfactory experience. Ninety percent of the subjects indicated they would return if the need arose in the future.

The counseling training laboratory is in a position to make outstanding and multi-dimensional contributions to counselor education. A successful training center can provide an invaluable learning opportunity for students, a unique and dynamic environment for the teaching of counseling skills by counselor educators, valued service to clients, and serve as an important research setting.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

Human Subjects Institutional Review Board Approval

Human Subjects Institutional Review Board

Kalamazoo, Michigan 49008-3899

WESTERN MICHIGAN UNIVERSITY

Date: June 28, 1989

To: Ron Crafton

From: Mary Anne Bunda, Chair Mary Anne Bunda

This letter will serve as confirmation that your research protocol, "Client Satisfaction and Personal Change When Working with Counselors in Training: Implications for Training", has been approved under the exempt category of review by the HSIRB for a one-round survey with no follow-up mailings. The conditions and duration of this approval are specified in the Policies of Western Michigan University. You may now begin to implement the research as described in the approval application.

The Board wishes you success in the pursuit of your research goals.

xc: R. Betz

Appendix B

Correlation Coefficients for Dimensions of Counselor Style and Personal Change Issues

Correlation Coefficients for Dimensions of Counselor Style and Personal Change

	ATTRACTIVENESS			
	Friendly	Likeable	Sociable	Warm
Motivation	.27	.33	.25	.25
Stress	.25	.33	.18	.27
Career	.26	.36	.29	.35
Friends	.23	.26	.15	.25
Romantic	.08	.12	.01	.19
Family	.23	.27	.17	.33
Social	.12	.23	.14	.33
Self	.13	.20	.20	.25
Self-worth	.27	.37	.32	.36
Sensitivity	.20	.36	.31	.32
Anxiety	.24	.33	.20	.32
Depression	.24	.31	.23	.26
Anger	.18	.30	.25	.29
Eating	.11	.17	.13	.14
Adjustment	.26	.36	.26	.32

	EXPERTNESS			
	Experienced	Expert	Prepared	Skillful
Motivation	.23	.28	.12	.34
Stress	.31	.31	.09	.32
Career	.40	.45	.30	.44
Friends	.27	.26	.11	.29
Romantic	.16	.09	.08	.18
Family	.27	.25	.22	.27
Social	.27	.25	.14	.23
Self	.21	.28	.15	.28
Self-worth	.26	.30	.16	.34
Sensitivity	.29	.32	.16	.38
Anxiety	.33	.36	.19	.34
Depression	.31	.29	.16	.26
Anger	.25	.34	.20	.33
Eating	.11	.22	.09	.15
Adjustment	.26	.35	.15	.36

	TRUSTWORTHINESS			
	Honest	Reliable	Sincere	Trustworthy
Motivation	.29	.11	.31	.21
Stress	.30	.25	.23	.24
Career	.31	.25	.28	.26
Friends	.20	.07	.11	.12
Romantic	.22	.02	.12	.12
Family	.19	.09	.20	.20
Social	.19	.15	.17	.19
Self	.11	.25	.26	.26
Self-worth	.22	.25	.23	.21
Sensitivity	.24	.27	.29	.19
Anxiety	.23	.28	.26	.24
Depression	.26	.22	.30	.18
Anger	.30	.20	.27	.22
Eating	.12	.07	.13	.08
Adjustment	.24	.24	.31	.25

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Adessa, M., Chance, P., Denworth, L., Fishman, B., Horn, P., King, P., & Stark, E. (1989, July). Mental illness in the U. S. Psychology Today, p. 14.

Anderson, P. (1989, June). Insurance health costs: What, me worry? Esquire, p. 82.

Atkinson, D. R., & Wampold, B. E. (1982). A comparison of the counselor rating form and the counselor effectiveness rating scale. Counselor Education and Supervision, 22, 25-36.

Auerbach, A., & Johnson, M. (1977). Research on the therapist's level of experience. In A. S. Gurman & A. M. Razin, (Eds.), Effective psychotherapy (pp. 84-103). New York: Pergamon.

Bandura, A., Lipsher, D. H., & Miller, P. E. (1960). Psychotherapists approach-avoidance reactions to patients' expression of hostility. Journal of Counsulting Psychology, 24, 1-8.

Barak, A., & LaCrosse, M. B. (1975). Multidimensional perception of counselor behavior. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 22, 471-476.

Barak, A., & LaCrosse, M. B. (1977). Comparative perceptions of practicum counselor behavior. Counselor Education and Supervision, 16, 202-208.

Barak, A., Patkin, J., & Dell, D. (1982). Effects of certain counselor behaviors on perceived expertness and attractiveness. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 29, 261-267.

Barlow, D. H., Hays, S. C., & Nelson, R. O. (1984). The scientist practitioner: Research and accountability in clinical and educational settings. New York: Pergamon.

Bergin, A. E. (1971). The evaluation of therapeutic outcomes. In A. E. Bergin & S. L. Garfield (Eds.), Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analysis (pp. 217-271). New York: Wiley.

Bergin, A. E., & Lambert, M. J. (1978). The evaluation of therapeutic outcomes. In A. E. Bergin & S. L. Garfield (Eds.), Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analysis, (2nd ed.) (pp. 217-270). New York: Wiley.

Bergin, A. E., & Strupp, H. H. (1970). New directions in psychotherapy research. Journal of Abnormal Psychology, 76, 13-26.

Betz, R. L., & Betz, D. L. (1986). Emergence of a university department: Fifty years of counselor education and counseling psychology. Kalamazoo: Western Michigan University, College of Education.

Bishop, J. E. (1986, October 22). Treating the mind: Psychotherapy's value becomes a key issue as more people use it. The Wall Street Journal. pp.1, 26.

Bourne, B. (1988). Making ideas work: Ralph Bedell and the NDEA Institutes. Journal of Counseling and Development, 67, 136-142.

Burisch, M. (1984). Approaches to personality inventory construction: A comparison of merits. American Psychologist, 39, 214-227.

Carey, J., Williams, K., & Wells, M. (1988). Relationship between dimensions of supervisors' influence and counselor trainees' performance. Counselor Education and Supervision, 28, 130-139.

Corrigan, J., Dell, D., Lewis, K., & Schmidt, L. (1980). Counseling as a social influence process: A review. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 27, 395-441.

Corrigan, J. D., & Schmidt, L. D. (1983). Development and validation of revisions in the Counselor Rating Form. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 30, 64-75.

Decker, R. J. (1988). Effective psychotherapy: The silent dialogue. New York: Hemisphere.

Dell, D., & Schmidt, L. (1976). Behavioral cues to counselor expertness. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 23, 197-201.

DeVito, A., Beery, R. G., Conetta, M. T., & Mixson, R. T. (1982, April). Correlates of client satisfaction at trainee and professionally staffed counseling centers. Paper submitted to Western Psychological Association. Sacramento, CA.

Dorn, F. (1984). Counseling as applied social psychology. Springfield: Thomas.

Edelstein, B. A. , & Brasted, W. S. (1983). Clinical training. In M. Hersen, A. E. Kazdin, & A. S. Bellack (Eds.), The clinical psychology handbook (pp.51-65). New York: Pergamon.

Endicott, G., Spitzer, R., Fleiss, J., & Cohen, J. (1976). The Global Assessment Scale: A procedure for measuring overall severity of psychiatric disturbance. Archives of General Psychiatry, 33, 766-731.

Eysenck, H. J. (1952). The effects of psychotherapy: An evaluation. Journal of Consulting Psychology, 16, 319-324.

Ford, J. D. (1979). Research on training counselors and clinicians. Review of Educational Research, 49, 87-130.

Frank, J. D. (1961). Persuasion and healing. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins.

Frank, J. D. (1982). Therapeutic components shared by all psychotherapies. In J. H. Harvey & M. M. Parks (Eds.), Psychotherapy research and behavior change (pp. 27-39). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

Gardner, M. K., White, T. B, Packard, T., & Wampold, B. E. (1988). Counselor recall of specific details: Implications for counseling and counselor training. Counselor Education and Supervision, 28, 43-52.

Gottman, J., & Markman, H. (1978). Experimental designs in psychotherapy research. In A. E. Bergin & S. L. Garfield (Eds.), Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analysis (pp. 23-63). New York: Wiley.

Greenberg, R. (1969). Effects of presession information on perception of the therapist in a psychotherapy analogue. Journal of Counseling and Clinical Psychology, 33, 425-429.

Gurman, A. S. (1977). The patient's perception of the therapeutic relationship. In A. S. Gurman, & A. M. Razin (Eds.), Effective psychotherapy: A handbook of research (pp. 503-543). New York: Pergamon.

Heppner, P., & Dixon, D. (1981). A review of the interpersonal influence process in counseling. Personnel and Guidance Journal, 59, 542-550.

Heppner, P.P., & Heesacker, M. (1982). Interpersonal influence process in real life counseling: Investigating client perceptions, counselor experience level, and counselor power and time. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 29, 215-223.

Heppner, P. P., & Heesacker, M. (1983). Perceived counselor characteristics, client expectations, and client satisfaction with counseling. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 30, 31-39.

Holt, R., & Luborsky, L. (1958). Personality patterns of psychiatrists. New York: Basic books.

Isaac, S., & Michael, W. B. (1981). Handbook in research and evaluation. San Diego: Edits.

Juntunen, C. L. (1989). The first ten years: An index and analysis of the Journal of Mental Health Counseling. Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 11, 121-137.

Kendall, P. C., & Butcher, J. N. (Eds.) (1982). Handbook of research methods in classical psychology. New York: Wiley.

Kendall, P. C., & Norton-Ford, J. D. (1982). Therapy outcome research methods. In P. C. Kendall & J. N. Butcher (Eds.), Handbook of research methods in clinical psychology (pp. 429-460). New York: Wiley.

Kerr, B., & Dell, D. (1976). Perceived interviewer expertness and attractiveness: Effectiveness of interviewer behavior and attire and interview setting. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 23, 553-556.

Kerr, B. A., Claiborn, C. D., & Dixon, D. N. (1982). Training counselors in persuasion. Counselor Education and Supervision, 22, 138-148.

Koenker, R. H. (1974). Simplified statistics for students in education and psychology. Totowa, NJ: Littlefield, Adams.

LaCrosse, M. B. (1975). Non verbal behavior and perceived counselor attractiveness and persuasiveness. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 22, 563-566.

LaCrosse, M. B. (1977). Comparative perceptions of counselor behavior: A replication and extension. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 24, 464-471.

LaCrosse, M. B. (1980). Perceived counselor social influence and counseling outcomes: Validity of the counselor rating form. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 27, 320-327.

Laing, J. (1988). Self report: Can it be of value as an assessment technique? Journal of Counseling and Development, 67, 60-61.

Lambert, M. J. (1976). Spontaneous remission in adult neurotic disorders: A revision and summary. Psychological Bulletin, 23, 107-119.

Luborsky, L. (1954). A note on Eysenck's article "The effects of psychotherapy": An evaluation. British Journal of Psychology, 45, 129-131.

Luborsky, L., Auerbach, A., Chandler, M., Cohen, J., & Bachrach, H. M. (1971). Factors influencing the outcome of psychotherapy: A review of quantitative research. Psychological Bulletin, 75, 145-185.

McNeill, B. W., & Stoltenberg, C. D. (1989). Reconceptualizing social influence in counseling: The elaboration likelihood model. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 1, 24-33.

Meltzoff, J., & Kornreich, M. (1970). Research in psychotherapy. Chicago: Aldine.

Newman, J. L., & Scott, T. B. (1988). The construct problem in measuring counseling performance. Counselor Education and Supervision, 28, 71-78.

Northup, B. (1986, October 26). Treating the mind. The Wall Street Journal, p.1.

Osberg, T. M. (1989). Self-report reconsidered: A further look at its advantages as an assessment technique. Journal of Counseling and Development, 68, 111-113.

Osberg, T. M., & Shrauger, S. J. (1986). Self-prediction: Exploring the parameters of accuracy. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 51, 1044-1057.

Parloff, M., Waskow, I., & Wolf, B. (1978). Research on therapist variables in relation to process and outcome. In A. E. Bergin & S. L. Garfield (Eds.), Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analysis. (2nd ed.) (pp. 233-283). New York: Wiley.

Pascoe, G. C. (1983). Patient satisfaction in primary health care: A literature review and analysis. Evaluation and Program Planning, 6, 185-210.

Pelsma, D. M., & Cesari, J. P. (1989). Content analysis of the journal of counseling and development. Volumes 48-66. Journal of Counseling and Development, 67, 275-278.

Phillips, S. D., Friedlander, M. L., Kost, P. P., Specterman, R. V., & Robbins, E. S. (1988). Personal versus vocational focus in career counseling: A retrospective outcome study. Journal of Counseling and Development, 67, 169-173.

Ponterotto, J. C., & Furlong, M. J. (1985). Evaluating counselor effectiveness: A critical review of rating scale instruments. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 32, 597-616.

Roffers, T., Cooper, A. B., & Sultanoff, S. M. (1988). Can counselor trainees apply their skills in actual client interviews. Journal of Counseling and Development, 66, 385-388.

Rosenweig, S. (1954). A transvaluation of psychotherapy: A reply to Hans Eysenck. Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 49, 298-304.

Sabourin, S., Laferriere, N., Sicuro, F., Coallier, J., Cournoyer, L., & Gendreau, P. (1989). Social desirability, psychological distress, and consumer satisfaction with mental health treatment. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 36, 352-356.

Schmidt, L., & Strong, L. (1970). Expertness and influence in counseling. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 17, 81-87.

Scofield, J. E., & Yoxtheimer, L. L. (1983). Psychometric issues in the assessment of clinical competencies. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 30, 413-420.

Sharma, S. L. (1986). The therapeutic dialog. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico.

Shrauger, S. J., & Osberg, T. M. (1981). The relative accuracy of self-predictions and judgements by others in psychological assessment. Psychological Bulletin, 90, 322-351.

Smith, M. L., Glass, G. V., & Miller, T. I. (1980). The benefits of psychotherapy. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins.

Strong, S. R. (1968). Counseling: An interpersonal influence process. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 15, 215-224.

Strong, S. R., & Claiborn, C. D. (1982). Change through interaction. New York: Wiley.

Strong, S. R., & Dixon, D. N. (1971). Expertness, attractiveness, and influence in counseling. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 18, 562-570.

Strupp, H. H. (1989). Can the practitioner learn from the researcher? American Psychologist, 44(4), 717-724.

Truax, C. B., & Carkhuff, R. B. (1967). Toward effective counseling and psychotherapy: Training and practice. Chicago: Aldine.

Wampold, B. E., & White, B. T. (1985). Research themes in counseling psychology: A cluster analysis of citations in the Journal of Counseling Psychology. Journal of Counseling psychology, 32(1), 123-126.

Waldholz, M. (1986, October 20). Treating the mind: Use of psychotherapy surges, and employers blanch at the costs. The Wall Street Journal, pp. 1, 15.