“Smoke over Lake McDonald” by Grant Haynes
The Hilltop Review: A Journal of Western Michigan University Graduate Student Research

Editor:
Adam Waggoner
Department of Philosophy
Gsa-hilltop@wmich.edu

Editorial Board:
C.J. Oswald
Department of Philosophy

Diana Charnley
Department of Counselor Education and Counseling Psychology

Mohammad Majdfaghihi
School of Engineering

Marilyn Markel
Department of Economics

GSA President:
Marcial Amaury Pineda
gsa@wmich.edu

GSA Vice-President:
Craig Morris
gfac-info@wmich.edu
Notes from the Editor

Adam Waggoner

Articles

Is Love a Ladder? Reading Plato with Leonard Bernstein
Joshua T. Parks

Erasure on All Sides: A Public Health Analysis of Mental Health Disparities Experienced by Bisexual Individuals
Kaila K. Graham

China’s Unethical Economic Development Practices
Kimberly A. Madsen

Religious Nonviolence: An Analysis of Mahatma Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Thich Nhat Hanh
Meghan Campbell

Acceptability of Social Media Incentives to Increase Physical Activity
Amanda Devoto and Anthony DeFulio

Theorizing about the Self in Panpsychism and the Extended Mind Using the Dao De Jing (道德經) and Zhuangzi (莊子)
Ryan Lemasters

Royalist Propaganda: Fabrication of Magna Farta
Daniel R. Palthe

Pirates, Merchants, and a Small Battle on the Island of Kythira in the Later Middle Ages
David D. Terry

Creative Writing

‘Art’ They Can’t See; Lines; Anatomy of Decomposing; October on Danford Creek; Wing Bone; Taxidermy
Kailyn J. Dekker

For Jeannie
Kai Harris

Borderland Identity
Sandra D. Espinoza Montes
NOTES FROM THE EDITOR

Dear readers,

I am delighted to present the spring 2019 issue of The Hilltop Review. In keeping with the journal’s interdisciplinary mission, the articles, creative writing, and artwork in this issue reflect many of the diverse projects of Western Michigan University’s graduate students. Congratulations are especially due to the winners of this issue’s awards. David D. Terry will receive $500 for the paper “Pirates, Merchants, and a Small Battle on the Island of Kythira in the Later Middle Ages;” Amanda Devoto and Anthony DeFulio will share $250 for their paper “Acceptability of Social Media Incentives to Increase Physical Activity;” and Kaila K. Graham will receive $150 for “Erasure on All Sides: A Public Health Analysis of Mental Health Disparities Experienced by Bisexual Individuals.” For creative work, Grant Haynes will receive $250 for the photograph “Smoke over Lake McDonald” and Kailyn J. Dekker will receive $250 for a collection of poems and microfiction. We are also pleased to include Meghan Campbell’s “Religious Nonviolence: An Analysis of Mahatma Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Thich Nhat Hanh,” which won the Graduate Humanities Conference award for best paper.

The Hilltop Review is funded by graduate students for their express benefit. At a time when many students in our community are facing acute needs—health care; rampant debt; difficulty in finding employment; fear for personal and familial safety—one might question the value of funding an interdisciplinary graduate student journal. After directing and editing The Hilltop Review for the 2018-19 academic year, I am still not sure how to answer the difficult challenge of how our Graduate Student Association should balance all these competing goods. I am leaving my position, though, confident of two things. First, addressing this challenge well requires an active Graduate Student Association body whose interests and needs reflect the diverse lives of our graduate student community. Second, The Hilltop Review has had and can continue to have a much more profound impact on graduate student life than some additional lines on a few dozen C.V.s and resumes, as each issue of The Hilltop is published online through ScholarWorks at WMU, an online repository available to and accessed by over a million users each year. Thus, with each publication of excellent scholarship from our graduate student body, the name and reputation of our scholarly community grows across the world. And while these effects are often not readily apparent in our daily lives at WMU, I have grown firm in the belief that they do make a difference.

As the director and editor of this journal, I have had a terrific opportunity to experience just how brilliant, supportive, and kind Western Michigan University’s graduate students can be. First, I would like to thank all the editorial board members and peer reviewers I have worked with for volunteering their time and intellectual resources to The Hilltop Review. I am especially grateful to the incoming director and editor of The Hilltop, Alex Hoffman, for his help and patience in cultivating a smooth transition in journal leadership. Finally, I wish to thank the 2018-19 Graduate Student Association executive board for their continued support of our journal’s mission.

Sincerely,

Adam Waggoner
Is Love a Ladder?
Reading Plato with Leonard Bernstein

By Joshua T. Parks

ABSTRACT: This paper reads Leonard Bernstein's Serenade after Plato's "Symposium" as a careful interpretation of and commentary on Plato's text. While a straightforward reading of Diotima's speech in Plato's Symposium suggests that human relationships are merely an instrumental step toward higher loves, Bernstein's music emphasizes the intrinsic goodness of interpersonal love. The connections between the two works have been dismissed as superficial by critics, but Bernstein's piece is actually carefully engaged with the narrative structure of Plato's text. It therefore encourages a re-reading of Plato's dialogue in which its form shapes and complicates its meaning. By depicting in music the interpersonal relationships in both the Symposium and his own life, Bernstein inspires the careful listener to see those relationships as an necessary component of the philosophical life.
Music history is full of adaptations of literature, but music and philosophy meet more rarely, perhaps because the narrative power of music is better suited to stories than syllogisms. The most famous exception is likely Richard Strauss’s *Also sprach Zarathustra*, while Richard Wagner was heavily influenced by Nietzsche. But classical philosophy is especially absent, which makes American composer Leonard Bernstein’s choice to write a piece based on Plato’s *Symposium* a remarkable one. In this paper, I will argue that Bernstein’s *Serenade after Plato’s Symposium* may be understood as a careful adaptation of the Platonic material to present Bernstein’s own view of the nature and purpose of love, a view very different from that of the *Symposium*’s “ascent of love” passage. For Plato, speaking through his characters Socrates and Diotima, reaching the top of the ascent requires the lover to forsake all earthly loves and activities for the sake of intellectual contemplation of the Good. Bernstein’s *Serenade*, however, gives a very different account of love using the same characters and structure as Plato’s dialogue—an account that emphasizes the intrinsic value of interpersonal relationships and social gatherings. But while Bernstein’s adaptation is a philosophical departure from Plato, it engages closely with the dialogue’s form and narrative details and should therefore be read not as a misinformed appropriation of Plato but as a thoughtful response to him.

The core of the *Symposium* (that is, the section most often taught in intro philosophy classes and most commonly identified with Plato’s own view1) is the “ascent of love” passage in Diotima’s speech. Socrates, clearly the wisest participant in the dialogue, credits Diotima with teaching him “the art of love.” After defining “love” as “wanting to possess the good forever,” Diotima goes on to describe the process of education in love. At the bottom of the ascent is the love of beautiful bodies, which soon leads the lover to realize that these bodies have something in common, some immaterial form of bodily beauty that transcends the individual. Next, the lover discovers “that the beauty of people’s souls is more valuable than the beauty of their bodies,” and they eventually make an analogous transition from loving individual souls to loving the kind of beauty which they have in common.3 The lover continues moving from more specific to more universal loves, reaching first customs, then knowledge, and finally the “great sea of beauty” that is the form of the Good itself insofar as it is an object of desire.4 Unlike all of the previous steps on the ascent, this ultimate beauty is eternal and unchangeable, and it is an intrinsic good because it is “itself by itself with itself” rather than

---

1 See Alexander Nehamas and Paul Woodruff, introduction to the *Symposium* (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1989), xixff.


4 Plato, *Symposium*, 210d.
pointing a lover toward something else. The ultimate fulfillment of erotic desire, which appears first as something physical and emotional, “turns out to be a desire for immortality, for wisdom, and for the contemplation of an object which is not in any way bodily or physical.” The human desire for loving relationships with other people is only instrumental, a step on the road toward an appreciation of the true beauty that cannot be found in people. Once the lover reaches this stage, Diotima says, “it won’t occur to [them] to measure beauty by gold or clothing or beautiful boys or youths.” Access to true beauty means that the lover doesn’t even need to recognize the beauty in lesser things anymore, and that includes human interpersonal relationships. Ultimate love is contemplative, abstract, eternal.

This means that Alcibiades’ interruption and the further partying at the end of the dialogue is a distraction, a misunderstanding of love just like the other speeches before Socrates’s, and the real truth is trapped between shadowy falsehoods just as the soul is trapped in the body. The party is a stage for truth-telling, but the truth Diotima speaks through Socrates undermines the purpose and value of the party itself. Reading the “ascent of love” as the core of the dialogue suggests an interpretation that instrumentalizes human relationships in order to reach a solitary, purely intellectual state of eros for ultimate beauty.

While this reading emphasizes a central philosophical argument of the Symposium, Leonard Bernstein, in his Serenade after Plato’s “Symposium,” is much more interested in the dialogue’s literary features. The piece is roughly in the form of a violin concerto, featuring a violin soloist, a string orchestra, and percussion. Each of its five movements represents one or two of the speeches from the Symposium, though most of them follow standard classical forms. “The music, like the dialogue,” the composer writes, “is a series of related statements in praise of love, and generally follows the Platonic form through the succession of speakers at the banquet.” Bernstein completed the piece in 1954, around the same time that he was also working on his two most famous musical dramas—the operetta Candide (1956) and the musical West Side Story (1957). In these compositions, Bernstein acts as a kind of intellectual historian and communicator, giving new life, new forms, and new meanings to old literary works.

Critics and program annotators have often dismissed the Serenade’s Platonic conceit as elitist, unhelpful, and shallow—not to mention inaccurate. In his biography of Bernstein, Humphrey Burton writes that “exactly when the idea to base it on Plato occurred is unknown, but it was possibly not long before the completion of the work, since a glance at Plato reveals obvious discrepancies

---

5 Plato, Symposium, 211b.
6 Nehamas and Woodruff, xxii.
7 Plato, Symposium, 211d.
between Bernstein’s adaptation and the original.” Edward Downes characterizes Bernstein’s descriptions of the piece’s musical form and connections to Plato as “misleading.” However, even the title of the piece suggests that the connection with Plato is not merely arbitrary. The word “serenade” evokes both the “sophisticated entertainment music” of similarly-titled pieces by Tchaikovsky, Dvorak, and Mozart as well as “love songs delivered beneath the balconies of fair ladies.” Depending on the context, a serenade can be either party music or a song of love, and here, just like Plato’s dialogue, it is both. And the fact that Bernstein chose to use the Platonic names and structure to organize his musical statements about love, even if the choice was spontaneous, prompts a careful listener to investigate the relationship between the elements Bernstein borrows from Plato and the meaning with which he imbues them.

Example 1: the love motif as first played by the solo violin (I. m. 1)

The Serenade’s opening movement consists of a slow, canonic introduction representing Phaedrus’s speech and a sonata-form section based on Pausanius’s. Bernstein calls the “Phaedrus” section a “lyrical oration in praise of Eros.” It opens with a long melody played by the violin and then imitated in canon by the first violins and violas. The first eight notes of this melody (see Example 1) are especially important, because they return so frequently and recognizably throughout the rest of this piece. Since this motif becomes the material for much discussion and development throughout the Serenade, I will call it the love motif. The melody begins by spelling out the tonic chord (here G-flat major: G-flat, B-flat, and D-flat) with an ascending and descending third and then an ascending sixth. The next three notes (G-flat, C, and D-flat) are exactly the same as the first three notes of “Maria” from West Side Story: scale degrees 1,

---

10 Edward Downes, review of Isaac Stern’s recording of the Serenade (The Musical Quarterly vol. 43 no. 2), 268.
11 Burton, 239-240.
12 Measure numbers and rehearsal letters are as printed in the Boosey & Hawkes full score: Leonard Bernstein, Serenade - study score, (New York: Boosey & Hawkes, 1954).
13 Bernstein program note.
Though the original 1954 audience of the Serenade would not have been familiar with West Side Story yet, the fact that Bernstein was working on the two compositions simultaneously and that he unambiguously quotes other works of his own later in the Serenade makes this a plausible connection. “Maria” is a song about desire and love for a specific person, and the melody mirrors this as the #4 scale degree longs to resolve upward to 5. The rest of the “Phaedrus” melody is sweet and long-lined, echoing the optimistic view of love expressed in this section of the dialogue, in which “love has no dark side … and [Phaedrus’s] praise of its effects is indiscriminate.”14 After more voices join in with the same melody, a dramatic crescendo helps us transition, like Plato’s narrator Aristodemus, “directly to the speech of Pausanias.”15 (This imitation on the level of stage directions is another hint that Bernstein may have been paying more attention to the formal details of Plato’s dialogue that critics give him credit for.)

Example 2: the fast version of the love motif in the cellos (I. reh. E)

Example 3: the Candide quote as played by the 1st violins (I. reh. G)

Bernstein calls the “Pausanius” section a “classical sonata-allegro” that describes “the duality of the lover and beloved.”16 Actually, the form is missing the central development section that a sonata-allegro would typically have and instead consists of two alternating themes and a coda that combines them. The effect of skipping the development section is to separate the two themes more discreetly—

14 Nehamas and Woodruff, xvi.
15 Plato, Symposium, 180c.
16 Bernstein program note.
they do not mingle until the very end. The first theme, apparently representing the “lover,” opens with a fast, accented version of the love and Maria motifs (see Example 2) and continues with a descending scalar melody that also appears in the duet “O Happy We” from Bernstein’s operetta Candide (see Example 3). “O Happy We” is near the beginning of Candide, and it is the first thing Candide and his lover Cunégonde sing together. The song describes a love based on sharing an unrealistic fairy-tale life, and whether or not Bernstein had conceived the song before composing the Serenade, it is telling that he thought this melody suitable for Candide and Cunégonde’s shallow love.

The second theme, standing for the “lover,” is a playful, coquettish melody lifted straight from a short piano piece Bernstein dedicated to Sandy Gellhorn, adopted son of writer Martha Gellhorn, with whom Bernstein had lived in Mexico for a while in the early 1950s. This piece is one of the Five Anniversaries, written from 1949 to 1951. Using music written to a young man for the “lover” section is consistent with the homosexual love and pederasty that is the subject of the Platonic Pausanius’s speech. And the form of the movement, in which the separate sections alternate and then combine at the very end, is reminiscent of Pausanius’s description of the ideal kind of love: “When an older lover and a young man come together and each obeys the principle appropriate to him ... then and only then, when these two principles combine absolutely is it ever honorable for a young man to accept a lover.” Bernstein’s form implies that he agrees with the rule that love should involve each participant obeying “the principle appropriate to [them],” but the shallowness and playfulness of both sections suggests that those principles do not need to be particularly intellectual or profound. This is a celebration of the winking silliness of love, reminiscent of Pausanius’s claim that men motivated by love may do any number of silly or shameful things “and everyone will immediately say what a charming man he is!” But while Pausanius goes on to say that the behavior-altering effects of love should eventually be directed toward virtue, Bernstein is happy to revel in mere charm, at least for now.

Bernstein shifts the order of the dialogue and puts Aristophanes’s speech next rather than Eryximachus’s. This entire movement is made up of material from two more of the Five Anniversaries: an elegant, dance-like piece dedicated to Elizabeth Rudolf and a more agitated one dedicated to Lukas Foss. Rudolf was the mother of a Tanglewood Institute student whom Bernstein knew, and Foss was a fellow American composer. Bernstein reads Aristophanes’s tale of separated soul-mates as part of the “fairy-tale mythology of love,” rather than any kind of serious

---

17 Burton, 206-207.
18 Plato, Symposium, 184d-e.
19 Plato, Symposium, 183b.
In Plato’s dialogue, Aristophanes’ version of the mythology of love is that humans long ago had their original form cut in two, so that humans now are only half what they used to be. The desire to unite with another person in love is the desire to bring back “the halves of our original nature together,” and love is “the name for our pursuit of wholeness, for our desire to be complete.”

While the opening and closing sections of this movement—the ones based on the piece dedicated to Rudolf—are primarily occupied with conveying a light-hearted mood of “fairy-tale” innocence, the melodic structure of the inner section mirrors Aristophanes’ story. Just as Aristophanes’ lovers are seeking a counterpart with whom to once again form a full person, Bernstein divides melodies between two sections of the orchestra and has them play as counterparts to each other. For example, when this section starts at rehearsal G, the violas and cellos play alternating eighth-note and dotted-quarter figures, each moving while the other section’s note is static (see Example 4). The two sections fill in the gaps in each other’s portion of the melody, just as two lovers in Aristophanes’ tale fill in the gaps created when they were split from each other. Bernstein pulls this same trick several more times in this section, from the alternating pizzicato figures in the strings at rehearsal I to the dialogue between the viola section and the solo violin at rehearsal K. In this movement, Bernstein’s musicians are searching for and finding partners, just as Aristophanes would say they should. And, on a larger scale, in quoting from the Anniversaries, the movement suggests a focus on love for individual people that echoes Aristophanes’ talk of soul-mates.

---

Example 4: Cello/viola alternation in the middle section of Aristophanes (III. reh. G)

---

21 Bernstein program note.
22 Plato, Symposium, 191d, 193a.
The third movement of the Serenade, “Eryximachus,” is an extremely short, face-paced scherzo. Nehamas and Woodruff write that Eryximachus’s speech in the dialogue, “like his manner throughout the Symposium, is extremely pedantic.” Bernstein spins the speaker’s ramblings about the effects of love on medicine and science into a mechanical-sounding frenzy that lacks much of the emotional pull of the piece’s other movements. This is also one of two movements not to include a quote from the Five Anniversaries, and the combination of this and its musical style makes it sound less human-oriented than the rest of the piece. As Bernstein represents it musically, Eryximachus’s contribution to the discussion is complex, impressive, and virtuosic, but only tangentially related to the real topic of discussion—the love motif is less readily apparent here than in any of the other movements. Downes calls this movement “an attractive compound of the spirits of Mendelssohn and Prokofiev,” two composers popularly known more for non-human, fairy-tale playfulness than for deep explorations of human emotion. (Though certainly they were both capable of the latter, they are most well-known for the former—see works like the “Overture to A Midsummer Night’s Dream” and “Peter and the Wolf.”)

![Example 5: the love motif accompaniment and new violin melody (IV. mm. 1-3)](image)

Perhaps the most significant discrepancy between Plato’s and Bernstein’s works is the treatment of Agathon, which makes up the fourth movement of the Serenade. His speech in Plato is mainly a joke, but in Bernstein, at least according to Burton, it becomes the “emotional center of gravity” of the whole narrative. Musically, it features a new aria-like melody played by the violin overtop a string accompaniment directly derived from the love motif (see Example 5). As this motif, which held the leading role in the first movement, descends into the background,

---

23 Nehamas and Woodruff, xvi.
24 Burton, 239.
the piece illustrates one kind of love becoming the basis for another, more moving, more intense kind. And yet the violin’s melody is not wholly separate from the love motif, for it begins with an ascending third and then an ascending sixth, two of the motif’s three intervals. While Agathon’s dialogue in Plato is a cartoonish list of all the absurdly unrealistic things that love can do, we might read Bernstein’s adaptation as insisting that, when one is experiencing love, it really does seem that it “gives peace to men and stillness to the sea, / lays winds to rest, and careworn men to sleep.” In Bernstein’s piece, this is a personal confession, emphasized by the cadenza in which the solo violinist speaks to the audience alone for the first time since Phaedrus’s opening statements about love’s primacy and ancientness. In turning Agathon’s public performance into a private conversation, Bernstein again signals his preference for intimate connection between human beings as the ideal form of love.

Finally, the Serenade’s fifth movement is based on both Socrates’s and Alcibiades’s speeches. While Burton sees the work’s emotional center in Agathon, Bernstein insists that he saved it for Socrates, writing, “this is a slow introduction of greater weight than any of the preceding movements.” That weight comes from more complex harmonies, a slow tempo, and loud dynamics, all of which sounds like the interruption of a somewhat elderly man. After a short dialogue between the violin and cello (perhaps Socrates and Diotima conversing?) we get a variation of the Agathon music again, an indication that perhaps Bernstein’s Socrates agrees with Agathon more than Plato’s does. But instead of getting a long speech full of philosophical content, Socrates is cut short by the interruption of Alcibiades, and the rest of the piece is essentially party music, with rhythms and harmonies borrowed from jazz. One of the new melodies that appears is yet another quote from the Five Anniversaries, this one dedicated to Elizabeth B. Ehrman, the mother of one of Bernstein’s Harvard friends. But this party music is also filled with quotes from the other movements, and the love motif appears everywhere—it is as if the formal speeches have given way to scattered (and perhaps drunken) discussion, but the topic is still love. One of the last melodies to return is the Candide “O Happy We” motif, which implies that it is not even a particularly high or virtuous kind of love that is being celebrated by the end of the party. The sense a listener gets from the entire Serenade is that these high and virtuous kinds of love are not the only kinds that matter, which is very different from the ascent story of our initial reading of Plato.

25 Plato, Symposium, 197d.
26 Bernstein program note.
In a radio talk in 1954, the same year in which Bernstein completed the *Serenade*, he described his own convictions about the importance of human relationships above all else:

I believe in people. I feel, love, need and respect people above all else ... One human figure on the slope of an Alp can make the Alp disappear for me ... I believe in Man’s unconscious, the deep spring from which comes his power to communicate and to love. For me, all art’s a combination of these powers; art is nothing to me if it does not make contact between the creator and the perceiver on an unconscious level.\(^{27}\)

Burton interprets this quote for us: “What Bernstein surely meant for us to understand was that his *Serenade* embodied all his loving feelings toward all his fellow human beings.”\(^{28}\) Later in his life, the work took on an even more specific personal meaning for Bernstein. In 1989, he had fallen in love with Mark Adams Taylor, a 28-year-old novelist and speechwriter and “the last love of [Bernstein’s] life.”\(^{29}\) As Bernstein was driving Taylor somewhere, the *Serenade* began playing on the car radio, and Bernstein asked Taylor if he knew the piece. Taylor replied, “I was never one of your fans,” but added that the piece was “like voices you hear when you’re in love, but alone.” Burton reads this exchange as Bernstein playing the role of Socrates, teaching a young man the arts of life and love.\(^{30}\) In this story, Bernstein is explicitly connecting his *Serenade* with a personal feeling of love toward another human.

But all of this is vastly different from the picture of love we first derived from Diotima’s speech. Is Bernstein simply misrepresenting Plato, making a secular humanist out of an idealist philosopher? Or, perhaps worse, is he merely tacking a philosophical label on the work to give it intellectual “street cred,” ignorant of the fact that his music and ideas are incommensurate with Plato’s? Musicologists, biographers, and reviewers are all over the map on this. I would argue that, while there are drastic differences in tone and content between the dialogue and Bernstein’s adaptation at some points (such as Agathon’s speech), there are enough intricately placed similarities to read the *Serenade* as a careful and thoughtful adaptation rather than an irresponsible or lazy one. When Bernstein departs from Plato, he apparently wants his listeners to notice. In addition, in crafting this piece, Bernstein is consciously picking up and emphasizing aspects

---

27 quoted in Burton, 240.
28 Burton, 240.
29 Burton, 506.
30 Burton, 506
that are already in Plato’s dialogue in order to make his case for a human-oriented description of love. The entire structure of the musical work is based on the same idea (represented by the love motif) appearing in different forms and guises—it is development through dialectic, which is exactly what happens in Plato. Bernstein builds his concept of what love is by referencing stories like Candide and West Side Story as well as his own relationships and friendships with the dedicatees of the Five Anniversaries. This is the same thing Plato does—we gradually learn what love is through discussions between friends and through stories, from Aristophanes’s mythological story to Socrates’s tale of his meeting with Diotima. And Socrates himself, the one who understands and transmits Diotima’s story about the ascent of love, is at this party to begin with, sharing with his friends not only his wisdom but also a drink and a couch. Bernstein’s Serenade is entirely pleasant music—nowhere is there a painful dissonance or the kind of soul-searching pathos that would make us question whether any of the emotions being presented are anything other than good. The party music affirms this—all the speeches, both the silly and the profound, find their fulfillment, not their negation, in the party.

In essence, Bernstein thinks Plato’s category of “true love” is too small. Never in the Serenade is there transcendent music that sounds like the contemplation of pure beauty, and there is no doubt that a composer as talented as Bernstein would have been capable of such a feat. Instead, the beauty of the Serenade is human beauty, and it prompts us to search for—and perhaps find—that same kind of human beauty in the Symposium. If a straightforward reading of Plato leads us to dismiss the friendly gathering as instrumental, Bernstein counters that there is actually something intrinsically good here. Bernstein uses the dialogue’s sociality, physicality, and playfulness to argue that these are all valuable aspects of human love, even though the dialogue’s philosophical arguments leads the reader to dismiss them. Far from being superficial, his adaptation is idiosyncratically personal, intellectually sophisticated, and wickedly clever.
Erasure on All Sides: A Public Health Analysis of Mental Health Disparities Experienced by Bisexual Individuals

By Kaila K. Graham

ABSTRACT: Research has found that bisexuals not only experience poorer mental health outcomes when compared to heterosexuals, but that the same holds true when compared to other members of the LGBTQ community (Feinstein & Dyar, 2017; Mackay, Robinson, Pinder, & Ross, 2017; Persson & Pfau, 2015). From the stigma surrounding mental health and the stresses of non-disclosure up to experiences of discrimination in health care and at times lack of legal protection, the issues faced by bisexual individuals on a daily basis are great (Mackay et al., 2017; Persson & Pfau, 2015). These battles take a toll on the mental health of this population in a way that is quite unique to others. As mental health continues to become a central aspect of the work of public health, there must be more attention paid to the impact of mental health disparities among groups that go largely ignored in broader health discussion. The socioecological model, as described by McLeroy, Bibeau, Steckler, and Glanz (1998), provides public health researchers and practitioners with a framework through which to understand and tackle the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals. Mental health exists on and is impacted by events at every level of this model; to understand the issue at only one level would be incomplete. This paper investigates the mental health disparities among bisexuals and seeks to provide potential explanations as to the cause utilizing the socioecological model. Additionally, recommendations for additional public health interventions aimed at reducing the disparity are provided.
Too often, one’s health is heavily influenced by factors outside of their control. An understanding of health disparities is one way to conceptualize the factors that contribute to health. Health disparities are those “...avoidable, unfair, and unjust differences in health status” (McMorrow, 2018b, p.3) experienced by socially disadvantaged or ignored populations, often as a result of their marginalization (CDC, 2018a). In understanding health disparities and their impact on populations, this paper will be analyzing mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals as compared to their homosexual and heterosexual counterparts.

**Who, What, and Where**

Before a conversation about mental health disparities can be had, an understanding of what constitutes mental health and mental illness is key. The World Health Organization (WHO) defines mental health as “...a state of well-being in which every individual realizes his or her own potential, can cope with the normal stresses of life, can work productively and fruitfully, and is able to make a contribution to her or his community” (WHO, 2014a, p.1). Mental illness or mental disorders then are those conditions that result from an imbalance in that state of well-being or those conditions of emotional or behavioral disorder, such as depression and anxiety (CDC, 2018b; Marhefka, 2017; WHO, 2018).

Mental health issues are a growing concern in the field of public health and for good reason. Mental and substance abuse disorders are the leading causes of disability worldwide, accounting for 23% of all quality of life years lost due to disability (WHO, 2014b, p.2). Mental health is also closely linked with physical health, making the concern twofold from a public health perspective (CDC, 2018b). Additionally, one in five Americans will experience a mental illness in any given year, making mental illness among the most common health conditions in the United States (CDC, 2018b, p.1).

Although mental illness and mental health concerns are increasingly common, the demographics of those who experience these issues are not equal in their distribution. In the United States, bisexual individuals experience poorer mental health outcomes than their heterosexual and homosexual counterparts (Human Rights Campaign, 2017). Unfortunately, there is a distinct lack of data for mental health among bisexuals in health databases. Even the Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System (BRFSS) core questionnaire, which is annually conducted by the Centers for Disease Control (CDC), lacks health data delineated by sexual orientation (Gonzales & Henning-Smith, 2017). However, twenty-seven states (Michigan not being one of them) decided independently to add sexual orientation questions to their applications of the BRFSS questionnaire (Gonzales & Henning-Smith, 2017). Gonzales and Henning-Smith (2017) were then able to
utilize aggregated data from those states to conduct an analysis of mental health data from more than 8,000 lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender (LGBT) identifying adults who had responded to their states’ respective surveys. In that study, bisexual men were found to experience frequent emotional distress at three times the rate of heterosexual men and at about one and a half times the rate of homosexual men (Gonzales & Henning-Smith, 2017). And bisexual women were found to experience frequent emotional distress at more than twice the rate of heterosexual women and about one and a half times the rate of homosexual women (Gonzales & Henning-Smith, 2017). The results from Gonzales and Henning-Smith (2017) support data from other organizations and other studies in that they too found that bisexual men and women experienced significantly higher rates of frequent mental distress and depression than homosexual or heterosexual men and women. Additionally, a meta-analysis and literature review conducted by Salway et al. (2018) found that, when compared to lesbian or gay individuals and heterosexual individuals, those who identified themselves as bisexual had the highest proportion of suicidal ideation or attempt of that group. The data is clear in supporting the notion that there are disparities in mental health, particularly in experiences with depression and suicidal ideation or attempt, in bisexual individuals when compared with their heterosexual and homosexual peers.

Just as there is no single cause of mental illness, there is no single explanation for the mental health disparities experienced by bisexuals. However, there have been several studies conducted to understand some of the reasons why bisexuals experience such adverse mental health as compared to those who identify as heterosexual or homosexual. This paper will delve into some of these explanations utilizing the socioecological model of health promotion as a framework for discussion.

The Socioecological Model and its Function

The socioecological model as defined by McLeroy, Bibeau, Steckler, and Glanz (1998) was a critical work in public health that has since greatly shaped the understanding and application of health promotion strategies and programs (Coreil, 2017d; McMorrow, 2018b). The levels of the socioecological model of health are, from innermost to outermost, individual/intrapersonal, interpersonal, organizational, community, and policy/society (Coreil, 2017d; McLeroy et al., 1998; McMorrow, 2018b). The socioecological model is an important concept in health education and promotion which allows practitioners to understand the interconnectedness of influences on health behavior while also allowing practitioners to craft specific interventions for a health issue (Coreil, 2017d; McMorrow, 2018b). This paper will utilize the five levels of the model as a framework for understanding the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual
individuals. The application of the model will also serve as a point of reference for a proposed public health education intervention to address this health inequity.

**Individual/Intrapersonal level**

The individual or intrapersonal level of the socioecological model evaluates the influences that one’s own beliefs, personal history, and knowledge have on their overall health (Coreil, 2017d; McLeroy et al., 1998; McMorrow, 2018b). This level is at the core of the model for good reason; an individual’s personal belief and ability to engage in a health behavior or to utilize health skills is critical to their general health and well-being. It is at this stage that the individual factors related to mental health disparities for bisexuals are most apparent.

Unfortunately, factors at the individual level may be the result of the internalization of external experiences. For marginalized or misunderstood populations, this too often takes the form of internalized discrimination or experiencing negative emotional side effects of discrimination. For bisexual individuals, this discrimination manifests as biphobia and monosexism. Biphobia is a term that encompasses the “...various forms of bisexual-specific discrimination and prejudice” (MacKay, Robinson, Pinder, & Ross, 2017, p.53). Biphobia takes the form of disbelief concerning the validity of bisexuality as a sexual orientation, the stereotypes that bisexuals are selfish or noncommittal, and general discrimination based on holding a non-heterosexual sexual identity (MacKay et al., 2017; Persson, Pfaus, & Ryder, 2014). This form of prejudice and discrimination can be a burdensome social force but can also cause damage on the individual level if the messaging is internalized. The notion of internalizing negative stereotypes or ideas about one’s identity is not new, having been understood quite well in the case of internalized racism, the acceptance in racist stereotypes or messaging in society that one takes with them in their daily life (Jones, 2000). A similar situation can manifest in any socially disadvantaged community where negative messaging is prevalent. The bisexual community is no exception. As negative stereotypes about bisexuality are spoken in society, reinforced by friends and family, and joked about in the media, the likelihood of these messages being taken to heart increases.

Monosexism is another important piece to discuss here. "Monosexism is a belief system that privileges a homosexual or heterosexual identity over other sexual orientations” (MacKay et al., 2017, p.53). Essentially, it is the belief that an individual can only be attracted to one sex or to one gender and that bisexuality does not truly exist. This also contributes to bisexual erasure, in which the concerns and lived realities of bisexual individuals are not appreciated or acknowledged as legitimate because of a belief that bisexuality is not real (Barker, 2015). Monosexism, in conjunction with biphobia, pushes bisexuality to the fringes of what is considered “normal” or acceptable. Those who identity as homosexual or
heterosexual do not have to confront these unique forms of prejudice. The additional level of discrimination that bisexuals must navigate could contribute to the disparities in mental health between bisexuals and their heterosexual and homosexual counterparts.

The burdens of stigma may also contribute to the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals. Stigma can have multiple layers with this issue, as bisexuals navigate the general social stigma toward mental illness, stigma from “mainstream” society for their non-heterosexual identity, and stigma from within the LGBT community for their non-monosexual identity (Coreil, 2017c; Persson et al., 2014). The pressures of this stigma can wear heavily on the individual resulting in isolation from others and a discomfort in seeking help when needed, all of which can contribute to poor mental health. This is particularly important for considering the disparities in mental health between bisexual individuals and their heterosexual counterparts. Individuals who identify as heterosexual do not have to disclose their sexual identity, as heterosexuality is often assumed and does not hold the stigma that minority sexual identities hold (Persson et al., 2014). The additional burdens of disclosure and stigma contribute greatly to the mental health experiences of bisexual individuals and could contribute to the disparities in mental health seen between bisexual individuals and their heterosexual counterparts.

**Interpersonal level**

Now that the groundwork has been laid for potential explanations of mental health disparities due to intrapersonal influences, the next step in the socioecological model to address is the interpersonal level. Included in the interpersonal level are those influences outside of the individual, but still very close to them on a personal level. These can include an individual’s home, their family, and their peer support group or friends (Coreil 2017d; McLeroy et al., 1998; McMorrow, 2018b). Factors that could contribute to mental health disparities among bisexual individuals at this level are relationships with friends and family members and the existence and help from any peer support groups.

Just as biphobia, monosexism, and discrimination impact the mental health of bisexuals at the individual/intrapersonal level, they also influence their health at the interpersonal level. Discrimination from friends or family has been found to have significant influence on the mental health of bisexual individuals (Feinstein & Dyar, 2017; Friedman et al., 2014). A lack of support from loved ones or even outright hostility are impactful in the experiences of acceptance of identity and comfort in one’s life and decisions (Feinstein & Dyar, 2017; Friedman et al., 2014). As such, the relationships that bisexual individuals have with those closest to them are critical in mental health, particularly for young adult bisexuals, those who have
recently disclosed their identity, or those who have not yet found a bisexual support system outside of close friends or family (Hatzenbuehler, Keyes, & McLaughlin, 2011; MacKay et al., 2017).

Although bisexuals face many common prejudices alongside the larger LGBT community in the form of homophobia and having their sexual identity pathologized, bisexual individuals often report feeling a lack of support from this community (Friedman et al., 2014; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014). Additionally, a lack of bisexual specific support groups has been found to be a significant source of stress for some bisexual individuals and has been found to contribute negatively to mental health (Feinstein & Dyar, 2017; Friedman et al., 2014; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014). While support groups for the LGBT community at large are abundant, peer groups for bisexual individuals specifically can be difficult to find if they exist in an accessible area at all (Friedman et al., 2014; MacKay et al., 2017). And in LGBT support or peer groups, some studies have found that bisexual individuals report feeling unsupported, overlooked, and at times have their experiences minimalized (Feinstein & Dyar, 2017; Friedman et al., 2014; MacKay et al., 2017). All these factors contribute to negative interpersonal experiences and support the evidence for the mental health disparities seen in the bisexual community.

Organizational level

At the organizational level, explanations for disparities in mental health for bisexuals can be found in a variety of settings. A critical setting for bisexual youth is the school. A study conducted by Hatzenbuehler (2011) sought to determine whether the social environment of the school setting contributed to higher rates of suicide attempt while controlling for individual-level factors. The social environment was evaluated based on whether the school had a gay-straight alliance and whether the school had specific anti-bullying or protection policies to support LGBT students, among other things (Hatzenbuehler, 2011). Schools with these features were considered supportive while those that did not were considered unsupportive (Hatzenbuehler, 2011). The study found that LGBT youth were much more likely to attempt suicide in unsupportive social environments than in
supportive ones. In negative environments, 25.47% of LGBT youth attempted suicide at least once as compared with 20.37% in positive environments (Hatzenbuehler, 2011, p. 900). That is a 20% greater likelihood of attempting suicide in negative environments for LGBT youth (Hatzenbuehler, 2011, p. 900). Among heterosexual youth, the risk of suicide attempts was only 9% greater in negative environments (Hatzenbuehler, 2011, p. 900). A supportive school environment with an administration that cares about its bisexual students is critical to the overall mental health of that student population. The additional support necessary for bisexual students cannot go overlooked and a lack of that support could help explain the higher rates of suicidal ideation or attempt in bisexual students when compared to homosexual or heterosexual students.

The workplace is also an important organizational setting for bisexual individuals in which the consequences of disclosure and the realities of identity in a professional setting must be addressed. Disclosure is of particular importance when understanding health disparities experienced by bisexuals as compared to those who identify as heterosexual. Bisexual individuals may anticipate discrimination from their employers or fellow employees should their sexual identity become known, and so may choose not to disclose in the workplace (Arenas & Jones, 2017). While non-disclosure may protect bisexuals from discrimination in the short term, evidence suggests that the burden of non-disclosure contributes to poorer job satisfaction and increases the likelihood that one will leave the organization altogether (Arenas & Jones, 2017). One study conducted by Arenas and Jones (2017) also found that bisexual individuals who had not disclosed experienced worse mental health outcomes, particularly taking the form of increased incidence of anxiety, than bisexual individuals who were “out” in their workplaces. The stress and anxiety brought out by an inability to fully be oneself and the fear of one’s sexual identity being discovered in the workplace may serve as strong influences on the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals as compared with their heterosexual counterparts.

Community level

The next level of the socioecological model addresses influences from the community. In terms of this model, the idea of community can hold a variety of meanings including the primary relationships in one’s life, relationships among organizations, or a group with geographic or political ties (McLeroy et al., 1998). The community level of the socioecological model can also include the influences of culture, social capital, and social class on health (Coreil, 2017d). These are the factors that will be discussed here.

The notion of social capital refers to “…institutions, relationships, and norms that shape the quality and quantity of social interactions…” within a given
community (Coreil, 2017c, p.113). Social capital is influenced by access to goods and services in the present day as well as past relationships with social institutions that may still influence a group’s norms in relation to health and seeking care. Historical interactions with the health care community may also be a factor in the current disparities in mental illness that bisexual individuals face (Coreil, 2017b; MacKay et al., 2017). Medical distrust can be a strong force in this community due to historical mistreatment from the medical community. In the past, non-monosexual and non-heterosexual sexual identities were pathologized in the United States (Coreil, 2017b; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014). Individuals who identified as anything other than heterosexual were seen as mentally unstable or mentally diseased and were treated as such by the medical community (MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014). And ultimately, that past still has a strong hold among the bisexual community, as some studies have found this medical distrust to be connected to a higher instance of unmet health needs (MacKay et al., 2017). The result could be a culture of medical distrust and a lack of faith in mental health care services that may contribute to the disparities in poor mental health for bisexuals.

Income differences between bisexual individuals and their homosexual and heterosexual peers could also explain the mental health disparities among this group (Ross et al., 2016). A study by Ross et al. (2016) found poverty to be strongly associated with experiences of poor mental health and discrimination among bisexuals. Studies that have examined bisexuals independently of other members of the LGBT community have found that bisexuals are more likely to live in poverty than their homosexual counterparts and have lower incomes overall than individuals of other sexual orientations (Ross et al., 2016). It is unclear if this link is the result of the stresses of poverty contributing to poorer mental health or if those who experience poor mental health and also identify as bisexual encounter discrimination and other economic and social barriers that contribute to lower socioeconomic status (Ross et al., 2016). While the causes may be unclear, the data does suggest that poverty and mental health are closely linked for bisexuals (Ross et al., 2016). The influence of socioeconomic status on mental health disparities for bisexuals is an area that requires further research but could help public health professionals understand the causes of mental health disparities for this group.

**Policy/Society level**

The outermost level of the socioecological model is the broadest in scope, encompassing levels of influence such as infrastructure, the economy, education, policy, and even national ethos (Coreil, 2017d; McLeroy et al., 1998). Local, state-level, and federal policy all influence the daily lives of the population in more ways that people may consider. When it comes to the bisexual community, policies related to rights protection and anti-discrimination are of particular interest and
research shows that these policies could influence the mental health experiences of bisexual individuals. A study by Hatzenbuehler, Keyes, and McLaughlin (2011) analyzed the mental health experiences of lesbian, gay, and bisexual adults living in states with very protective anti-discrimination laws as compared to those living in states with less robust laws. The researchers found that LGBT individuals living in states with strong protective anti-discrimination laws for sexual minorities experienced less emotional distress and had fewer instances of depression and anxiety than their counterparts living in states with less protective laws (Hatzenbuehler et al., 2011). This study suggests that policy can be extremely impactful on the mental health of bisexual individuals and, as such, could be instrumental in understanding health differences between bisexual individuals and their heterosexual counterparts. Bisexual individuals benefit from an additional level of policy support that their heterosexual counterparts do not require as the rights for their sexual identity are already guaranteed in the United States (Hatzenbuehler et al., 2011).

Proposed Public Health Interventions

Although much of the literature that investigates mental health disparities among bisexual individuals focuses on the individual or interpersonal levels of the socioecological model, these levels are heavily informed and influenced by the community and organizational levels (MacKay et al., 2017). As such, any interventions aimed at reducing the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals would do best to address factors at these multiple levels.

Working at the individual and interpersonal levels, access to mental health resources and therapies would be beneficial in reducing the mental health disparities experienced by bisexual individuals. As previous studies have found, a lack of access to quality care can be a huge barrier to members of this community who are seeking help for mental health needs (MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014; Persson & Pfaus, 2015). A resource database could be created that tailors to local needs of bisexual individuals. This database would allow such individuals to access and find resources near them, either in person or online, where they could have their mental health needs met. An online forum is also more accessible, providing a better entry point into mental health care than participants may find in their physical communities (Marhefka, 2017). This database could also have a community aspect if it were to include a chat room or other online meeting space for members of the community. Participants could use the site not only to search for resources, but also to discuss the benefits or negative aspects of resources that they have used in the past and share their experiences with others.

Several of the articles discussed in this paper addressed a perceived lack of community support that bisexual individuals may feel at times (Friedman et al.,
214; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson et al., 2014). This could also be addressed with a health promotion program that would provide a space for bisexual individuals to come together and discuss their lived experiences and mental health concerns. In telling their stories, participants may be able to unburden themselves of the negative experiences or sentiments surrounding mental health that they hold, alleviating some internal pressure that could be contributing to poor mental health.

Additionally, a public health intervention that focuses on care providers could have a positive effect on reducing mental health disparities among bisexuals. Several studies found that bisexual individuals had trouble finding competent and validating health care (Eady, Dobinson, & Ross, 2011; Hatzenbuehler et al., 2011; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson & Pfau, 2015; Ross et al., 2016). This served as a significant barrier in accessing adequate mental health care which could contribute to undue mental health concerns for this community and a lack of validating care was even cited as influencing one’s decision as to whether or not they would continue to seek care at all (Eady et al., 2011; MacKay et al., 2017; Persson & Pfau, 2015). The health care system and clinical framework is in desperate need of an overhaul regarding how they interact with and understand bisexual patients. A critical aspect of this intervention would be training health care professional on sexual minority issues as they relate to mental health disparities for bisexuals. An understanding of the history of abuse and continued lack of attention and care paid to the unique health needs and concerns of this community is a critical educational piece for health care providers.

Importantly, cultural competency training, or more appropriately cultural humility training, is more than just gaining information about the health concerns of a community (McMorrow, 2018a; Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998). It is not enough for healthcare professionals to have the data. To best help this community, there must be a deeper critique of the health care delivery system as it relates to mental health care and to the needs of bisexual individuals (Marhefka, 2017). While this training is needed in the case of bisexual mental health, cultural competency for providers is not the ultimate cure for the mental disparities seen in this community. Incorporating cultural competency training is critical in allowing health providers to provide the best care to their bisexual patients, but there must also be more. Bisexual individuals need and deserve spaces in their communities to access quality health care from health care professionals who are not only competent concerning their health needs but who are also validating of their identities and lived experiences.

**Conclusion**

Public health professionals and health providers as a whole have a unique responsibility to address the disparities in mental health experienced by bisexual
individuals. In recent years, health disparities have taken more of a central role in our understanding of how underserved populations experience health (Coreil, 2017a). Public health organizations like the World Health Organization (WHO) have made addressing and reducing health disparities among minority populations main goals for the practice of public health (Coreil, 2017a; WHO 2013). The broad goals are to understand why disparities exist and to translate that knowledge into effective and appropriate programs, policy, or other interventions aimed at reducing or eliminating the disparity (Coreil, 2017a; McMorrow 2018b). And while these are noble and necessary goals, they are not fully being met if the health disparities of bisexual individuals are not included in that work. Improvements in research and health interventions for the mental health disparities impacting bisexual individuals would allow our public health system to better support a community that has been overlooked for far too long.

References


China’s Unethical Economic Development Practices

By Kimberly A. Madsen

ABSTRACT: The purpose of this research paper is to inform the public about some of the unethical economic development practices that China is performing with their citizens and global partners. These activities include escalating the national GDP at the detriment of their citizens through forced relocations in order to build new cities, dividing families with harmful public policies, and the imbalance between their citizens’ annual earnings and housing costs. Also discussed is the environmental pollution of the air, water, and soil, and poorly treating their international constituents when asked to provide consulting services to their nation.
Introduction

The magnitude of China’s economic development movement consists of unprecedented, aggressive economic growth that is larger and faster than any other country has ever created. By 2030, China’s goal is to have the $1 trillion One Belt One Road initiative completed which will create the modern day “Silk Road” throughout 65 countries in Asia, Europe, Middle East, and North Africa and will serve as the main trading/transportation system four continents wide (The Daily Conversation, 2017). By 2050, China plans on creating the world’s largest high-speed rail network, world’s largest airport, world’s largest water transfer project, world’s largest underwater tunnel, world’s largest windfarm, two megacities (Beijing/Tianjin/Heibeii and Hong Kong-Shenzhen/Zhuhai-Macau/Guangzhou), and the world’s largest system of nuclear power plants (The Daily Conversation, 2016).

China’s economic growth has come at a huge sacrifice to their citizens and to its environment. As Liu Zhijun, Minister of Railways from 2003 to 2011 claimed, “To achieve a great leap, a generation must be sacrificed” (The Daily Conversation, 2016). However, hard work requires sacrifice, but must be done legally and ethically. Mr. Zhijun’s unethical managerial practices were exposed and earned him a 10-year jail sentence for corruption (The Daily Conversation, 2016).

Although one can have great respect for China’s amazing economic growth, it is wise to ask ourselves the following question: if economic growth is costing lives, abandoning citizens and making them homeless, using state-of-the-art professionals to gain their intellectual capital and then discarding them once they have their blueprints, and polluting the air quality to the extent where citizens have to wear masks over their mouths when outside, is it truly commendable and respectable? Further review of these unethical issues will be discussed throughout this research.

GDP Growth on Steroids

The motivation behind the massive growth of China’s cities is to increase the country’s gross domestic product (GDP) by investing in infrastructure through building businesses, housing, roads, bridges, universities, museums, hospitals, and financial and shopping districts.

In 2011, SBS Dateline reporter Adrian Brown shared that 10 cities were built per year and there were an estimated 64 million empty apartments throughout China (SBS Dateline - Adrian Brown, 2011). Once the cities are constructed, the government sells the properties. These buildings may or may not have electricity, running water, or HVAC components to allow people to occupy the spaces, as these cities are built to profit and not for people to reside, initially – hence the term “ghost
A “ghost city” can remain in this state for an unknown period until either the government starts building the remaining components of infrastructure or enough businesses occupy the area to attract residents to the area. What seems mysterious to the American culture is widely accepted in the Chinese culture—the citizens of China know that the city will be very prosperous soon which makes them invest in properties during the beginning stages of the city’s development. Hence, media representation of China’s “ghost cities” has not been completely accurate, thus providing some misrepresentation of China’s economic development principles around real estate and urban planning.

**Urban Entrepreneurialism**

China’s economic planning is based on the principle of urban entrepreneurialism in which the government focuses on three different markets: tourism, real estate, and capital (Su, 2015). Currently, China is the top tourism destination in the world, if you include Hong Kong and Macau; otherwise, it is the third top destination in the world preceding France and the United States (Hinsbergh, 2017).

The real estate industry is the most popular in contemporary China, for public power and private capital are tightly intertwined. As China’s urbanization accelerates, the scarcity of land is becoming more and more significant, especially in the major cities. Developers lease land from the government, which sets premiums (leasing fees) for land conversion. After receiving land-use rights, private real estate companies develop the land into residential areas, central business districts, and major shopping districts (Zou, 2014).

Over the last decade, the increasing size and prosperity of Chinese cities has been driven largely by commercial land development. In the last 30 years, two policy changes, labor release and land conversion have been major factors in China’s urbanization. Both have been important in ensuring rapid, long-term
economic growth and a dominant position for mass production. However, these policies have also created problems (Zou, 2014), such as corruption, forced evacuations, collusion, and pollution hazards.

The figure above (Mingye, 2017) provides the system of how China has been able to advance their economic growth so quickly and efficiently. By closely examining the flow of China’s urban entrepreneurialism process, one can see that each entity ties into the other, completely dependent on each part of the process to perform to their capacity to obtain maximum economic growth. This process has led to increased momentum, vitality, and prosperity.

China does not allow cities or companies to file bankruptcy; they simply reallocate the monies between the entities to ensure everyone stays afloat. China has so much capacity in their economic system; they have been able to write off $3 trillion in corporate debt since 1998 without concern of slowing down their economy. The reason they are able to do this is because China’s banking system runs very differently than America’s banking system.

**How Chinese Banks Run Differently**

China keeps a required reserve ratio of 20% in all of their financial institutions. Their banking system does not earn revenue by providing loans; they earn revenue when they receive deposits. China also does not depend on other countries to finance itself. Wade Shepard explains this process in his book, *Ghost Cities of China*:

China's urbanization movement could be touted as the greatest economic stimulus plan in history. With explicit stimulus, such as 2008’s US$586 billion and 2015’s US$1.1 trillion plans, and implicit stimulus in the form of loans to municipalities and subsequent bailouts, the central government is injecting massive amounts of money into urban development. This is especially pertinent when we realize that nearly two dozen of China’s big industries are in a continual state of oversupply, with many surviving off subsidies. China needs something to do with its excess of steel, concrete and coal, and building new infrastructure is currently part of the de facto solution. At this point, sustaining the country politically, economically, and socially means pumping it with cash. China is a world in and of itself, and it has an economy that plays by its own rules” (Shepard, 2015).

China has grown from 69 cities in 1949 to 658 cities in 2015. Over the next 20 years, China will have hundreds of new cities, thousands of new towns and districts, 50,000 new skyscrapers, wipe untold thousands of villages off the map,
and relocate hundreds of millions of people, which will be the quickest and largest economic boom and civilization movement we have ever seen (Shepard, 2015).

Central Business Districts

Since 1990, China has invested a lot of time and attention towards increasing their capital bench strength by adding more than a dozen Central Business Districts (CBDs) in China, consisting of an array of financial institutions, multinational corporations, luxury hotels, upper-end apartment complexes, office space, and embassies and consulates in the larger cities. The CBD establishments help the cities become an economic and political contender and usually have an initial investment price of $1.23 billion on average to construct (Shepard, 2015). To the American, this may seem excessive as the United States only has two CBDs – one in New York City and one in Chicago. However, it is China’s goal to be the largest in everything they accomplish. Their motivations are aggressive, intentional, and preplanned in every stage.

Each initiative the Chinese are currently pursuing is leading to their final goal of surpassing the United States’ GDP by the year 2030 (The Daily Conversation, 2016). Currently, they are recruiting various countries in need of economic revitalization and improved infrastructures. It remains to be seen as to how ethical the Chinese government will behave with their constituents once the initiative is complete and their property resides in these vulnerable countries. Hopefully, the Chinese will remain as committed to being a collaborative entity and not try to commandeer their initiatives by using powerful force as they have performed with their own citizens and international consultants throughout their forceful economic development campaign.

China’s Ghost Cities—Misunderstood and Misrepresented

Wade Shepard’s book, Ghost Cities of China, provides an in-depth summation of the idiosyncrasies of China’s real estate development system, in which the government spends billions on city infrastructure, sells properties to investors and the country’s citizens, and then does not complete various projects in the city to allow complete functionality within the area, thus making the area uninhabitable. Many cities can tell of this repeated scenario – Ordos Kangbashi and Changzhou’s Wujin district – are some examples of the “ghost” cities.

Ordos Kangbashi

Ordos Kangbashi is a “ghost city” located in Inner Mongolia, whose mission was to become a desert oasis and serves as a second city to Ordos
Dongsheng. Ordos Dongsheng started as a boomtown when it was discovered that the earth was rich in coal and natural gas, leading to the nickname “China’s Texas”. Ordos was leading China’s per capita GDP numbers and decided to build a second city, Ordos Kangbashi (Shepard, 2015).

Construction began on Ordos Kangbashi in 2003, in which state-of-the-art architecture and buildings highlighted the landscape. A jelly bean shaped museum, a library that looks like a row of books, an elaborate opera house, and the Ghengis Khan Square populated with 50-foot tall statues of Mongol warriors with their horses are just some of the delights that captivate people when they visit the “ghost city”. From 2003 to 2016, Ordos Kangbashi was a “ghost city”, with approximately 70,000 residents. It has recently matured to a vibrant city and currently occupies two million people. Ordos is still seeking Beijing’s government approval before it can officially become a city and be permanently on the map (Shepard, 2016).

Changzhou’s Wujin District

Changzhou’s Wujin District experienced an increase in housing from 4.36 million units in 2006 to 10.12 million units in 2013, providing the area with an increase of 132% in eight years (Mingye, 2017). This district was labeled a “ghost city” because the aggressive construction of housing stock could not be occupied, as the houses were not ready to be inhabited (Shepard, 2015). Changzhou also has its state-of-the-art architecture as well, including the Wujin Lotus Conference Center that is shaped like a lotus flower. Australian architects designed the building to retrieve its energy from the manmade lake that surrounds the structure. Inside the building is a chandelier shaped like the stamen of the lotus flower (Carmi, 2014).

Both cities are prime examples of how China performs urban development, in which they first build the inner city and wait for industrialization to occur. Although very different from America’s culture, the initiatives have served the Chinese economy very well by increasing their GDP performance to earn second place in global economic status.

Debunking the Myth

China’s new cities and districts follow a pattern. First, the inner city and housing areas are constructed. Then, after an unpredictable period, the cities are uninhabitable until hospitals, schools, universities, public transportation, and highways come to fruition. The cities start slow, and as businesses and people move in to the city, the area begins to boom as a thriving urban district, therefore making the “ghost city” theory a temporary phenomenon (Shepard, 2015). As Wade Shepard traveled the various “ghost cities”, he was told consistently that the
residents were not concerned about whether or not urbanization would occur, they knew it would happen and they were anticipating the urban boom in their respective areas. Many residents purchased properties as the cities were first constructed because they knew that the values would appreciate significantly once the area was thriving (Shepard, 2015). These properties are perceived as blocks of gold, just as the Americans perceive our treasured stock market.

China’s construction is not randomly done throughout the country as people have speculated through the years. China’s urban planning has been a design in the making for approximately 20 years. These “ghost cities” will soon be linked together with high-speed railroads, thus making commuting easier and quicker throughout the country (The Daily Conversation, 2016), which will make them turn into thriving metropolises at record speeds. This quote from Lao Tzu captures the spirit of Chinese urban entrepreneurialism - “Do the difficult things while they are easy and do the great things while they are small. A journey of a thousand miles must begin with a single step” (Meah, 2019).

**Forced Relocation of Citizens**

Although China’s economic growth has been fascinating and invigorating to observe and experience, it has not come without a cost. Forced evictions and demolitions of villages and homes have left many Chinese citizens homeless. A survey completed by the Landesa Rural Development Institute, Renmin University and Michigan State University found that 43% of Chinese villages had land taken from them within the past decade and approximately four million rural Chinese citizens were being relocated each year (Shepard, 2015).

Another report from Tsinghua University found that more than 64 million families had their homes demolished since China’s economic boom began. Approximately 20% of the forced evacuees were uncompensated, leaving them without a home or land (Shepard, 2015). Shepard found in his travels that whenever construction was occurring, an eviction was occurring beforehand. Some citizens were not able to retrieve their belongings before they had their homes destroyed and watched in disbelief as everything they knew turned into rubble (Shepard, 2015).

**Citizens Fight Back to no Avail**

On a daily basis, 20,000 individuals throughout China file formal complaints with government officials, 80% of which involve forced evictions and property requisitions. Of the 180,000 mass social disruptions that occur throughout China annually, 65% are related to land and property issues. China has lost over a
million villages over a ten-year span, numbering approximately 300 per day (Shepard, 2015).

If the citizens were to protest the evacuations, they could lose their employment and educational privileges as well (Shepard, 2015). Unfortunately, there is nothing the Chinese citizens can do about the evictions due to the courts belonging to the government, and the government is the entity that is ordering the demolitions. Some citizens have used social media to vent their frustration, nicknaming their country chai na, meaning, “in the process of demolishing” (Shepard, 2015).

**Affordable Housing for Displaced Citizens**

For the individuals who did not defy the government, there were options for them to consider, such as resettlement housing districts, public housing districts, or lower-end private housing districts (Ying & Zhang, 2017).

Resettlement housing districts were designed for the displaced farmers. The displaced farmers sometimes receive an apartment free of charge, or receive a hukou payment by the government, which is the equivalent to America’s welfare system. Some of the displaced farmers remain unemployed while others seek work in factories, security or cleaning professions (Ying & Zhang, 2017).

Public housing districts provide poor people with lower rent apartments and economically affordable housing districts. These options include low rent housing, public rental, and economically affordable housing. From 2011 to 2015, the central government constructed 36 million blocks of public apartments to help accommodate the vulnerable population, placing this housing area on the outskirts of the cities (Ying & Zhang, 2017).

Lower-end private housing districts provide housing for working-class citizens with low income. These districts were previously controlled by the Chinese central government, but have recently been adopted by real estate developers, which allowed the market mechanism to assist in housing prices and neighborhood offerings. These districts have more public offerings and businesses for the residents to utilize than the other two housing areas (Ying & Zhang, 2017).

**Left-Behind Children**

Although the housing affordability program assists adults with housing, there is a vulnerable population that is often not included in their parents’ pursuit of the “Chinese Dream”: their children. The central government does not allow children free education or healthcare when they relocate with their parents from the village to the city. If the parents are unable to afford these components on their own, their children stay in the village while their parents relocate. Consequently,
approximately 61 million children live with either one of their parents or other relatives. These children have been nicknamed “Left-Behind Children”. The left-behind children have become subject to abuse and neglect and have abandonment and poor self-esteem issues, and some have even committed suicide because they did not want to be a burden to their families (Guibreteau, 2017).

With China’s vast resources and capabilities, why does the government feel inclined to treat the most vulnerable members of their society so bullishly? Their culture as a society is a collectivist culture; however, it seems the government’s behaviors contradict their ancient teachings of Confucianism, which focus on the principles of righteousness (Yi), what society gains as a whole when they work together (Li), and the moral guidelines that the Chinese authority figures establish in their country (Te). One could say the same for our country, where modern day greed has also clouded our founding fathers’ principles of truth, liberty, justice and Christianity.

**Overinflated Housing Prices**

According to a recent article in the Economist, China’s affordability index is disproportionate throughout China as the housing costs surpass the annual income of China’s population. In the figure below, the red line notes the national average, in which the medium and large cities are equivalent to the affordability index (The Economist, 2016).
The megacities, which include Shanghai, Hong Kong/Shenzhen, Tianjin, Guangzhou, and Beijing, are highly disproportionate to the affordability index. Some methods that the Chinese citizens use to pay for their mortgages are through collective sources like China’s Housing Provident Fund and gaolidai programs.

**China’s Housing Provident Fund**

One source that the Chinese citizens utilize to afford living in the megacities is China’s Housing Provident Fund (HPF). This fund is similar to America’s 401(k) program, in which both citizens and their employers contribute monies which are used as an investment mechanism to purchase homes. Consequently, the citizens who participate in the fund are able to purchase higher quality, but smaller sized homes in the megacities (Tang, 2017).

The requirements of the HPF are very specific. To ensure the funds are used by households for their intended use of owner-occupation, the government imposes other regulations on the usage of the funds. These include a maximum on the amount of HPF loans, borrower qualifications, the mortgage interest rate and the term of the loan, as well as a minimum down payment rate for homes that depend on the home's size. In particular, a 20% down payment rate is required when the purchased unit is less than 90 square meters, while 30% is required for house units greater than 90 square meters. Therefore, although the higher return of HPF contributions and lower mortgage interest rates encourage households to use the fund to obtain better housing, other regulations serve the purpose of preventing speculation and minimizing associated default risks. Citizens who receive urban hukou payments are also able to participate in the HPF, they do not have to choose one or the other to help supplement housing costs (Tang, 2017). Shanghai also allows employers to create a supplementary housing fund independent of the HPF that provides tax-free housing benefits (Tang, 2017).

**Gaolidai—Informal Financing**

During the boom in Ordos (2001-2010), the GDP grew fifteen-fold, per capita GDP was more than double the GDP of Beijing or Shanghai, and the citizens celebrated continual double-digit percentage GDP growth annually. The city grew from a GDP of 17.18 billion RMB in 2001 to 365.68 billion RMB in 2013 (Woodworth, 2016).

During this time, the citizens participated in a program called gaolidai, which was high-interest loan/lending used to finance real estate. In 2011, the gaolidai network collapsed due to loan defaults, leading citizens to lose their life savings, businesses to go bankrupt, the high-end property market to crash, and, by 2012, 200,000 people to leave Ordos (Woodworth, 2016). The Ministry of Housing
and Urban-Rural Development recorded that in 2010 and 2011, the volume of non-bank credit in Ordos was estimated to be around 200 billion RMB, which is approximately US$30 billion (Woodworth, 2016).

Once the market crashed, delinquent debtors were harassed, threatened, received acts of violence, and occasional kidnappings from the gaolidai lenders. Mr. Lin, a loan repossession officer, stated that it was necessary to invoke violence. He stated, “this city is hell…everyone is trying to rip off someone here. Gaolidai was always about robbing people at some level. The only way to prevent someone from robbing from you is by teaching him a lesson,” (Woodworth, 2016). Ordos’ citizens went into hiding if they defaulted on their loans to prevent the retribution they would receive if they were found by the officials (Woodworth, 2016). Again, to what cost does the significant economic boom affect China’s citizens? The glamour of a new city with sparkling lights is delightful, but if illegal and unethical methods are being used, the desired outcome is not respectable. Social responsibility needs to be a consideration in economic development to ensure the growth and improved quality of living is sustainable for generations to come.

**Pollution in China**

China’s pollution issues are very severe in nature. There are many areas in the country that are considered poisonous through the air people breathe, the water they use on a daily basis, and soil that is used to grow crops and raise animals. The chart below indicates that healthy levels of air pollution are under 10 micrograms per cubic meter of PM2.5, which measures the daily average particulate pollution levels in urban areas.

![Air Pollution Levels in Perspective: China And The US](chart.png)
This chart also compares the top 10 cities in both China and the United States with the highest levels of pollution, and the data is rather alarming. The Chinese have to wear masks over their nose and mouth to prevent from breathing the poisonous air into their lungs. Over the last two years, China has significantly reduced their coal production, but the pollution from coal, according to Chinese government statistics, have caused 300,000 people to die each year from ambient air pollution, mostly from heart disease and lung cancer. An additional 110,000 die from illnesses related to indoor pollution from poorly ventilated wood and coal stoves and toxic fumes from shoddy construction material. The air pollution death figure is expected to rise from 380,000 in 2010 to 550,000 in 2020. The Chinese government has calculated that if the air quality in 210 medium and large cities were to be improved from “polluted” to “good” levels, then 178,000 lives could be saved (Hays, 2014).

**Greenpeace Investigates**

Greenpeace East Asia completed an investigation on the Lianyungang Chemical Industrial Park in Jiangsu Province, where they identified 226 organic chemicals in the air, soil, and water samples. Of these chemicals, 16 were known carcinogens and three persistent organic pollutants, which are illegal under both Chinese and international law. The industrial park has already received 200 penalties for noncompliance with environmental standards, from both county and municipal level environment authorities (Baxter, 2017).

Water pollution is very high as well. According to Greenpeace’s findings, 14 provinces failed to meet water quality improvements, and as of 2015, 85.3% of water in Shanghai’s rivers were unsuitable for human contact, and 95.1% of Tianjin’s surface water (rivers and lakes) was unsuitable for human contact (Newport, 2017).

In another Greenpeace report, 18 companies were found to fail to report what pollutants they were releasing into China’s air and water. This violated Chinese basic pollution law, which took effect in 2008 and required companies to reveal details of pollution to the public. These companies included such leading global corporations as Royal Dutch Shell, Samsung, Nestle, LG, Kraft, Motorola, Denso, and Bridgestone. According to a report issued by Chinese environmental groups, Nokia, LG, SingTel, Ericsson, and Apple were among the poorest performers in polluting the environment. Apple was rated the worst global corporation polluter in China. In 2013, Apple’s two top suppliers, Foxconn and UniMicron, were alleged to pumping toxic heavy metals into a nearby river in Southern China. Environmental pollution is so severe in China that some large global corporations, such as Coca Cola and Panasonic, have started to provide ‘pollution hazard pay’ to expats working in China (Tian & Slocum, 2016).
Apple, Caterpillar, Louis Vuitton, Jordan and other global corporations are under increasing pressure from the international, national, and local communities to take responsibility to address such problems as gas emission, water pollution, long working hours, work safety, and low wages. Indeed, Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) has become a daunting challenge to global corporations, especially those that have operations in China (Tian & Slocum, 2016).

Additionally, in 2011, Wilson W.S. Liu, from the University of Hong Kong, estimated that over 2 billion tons of construction waste was produced across China, in which only 5% was recycled. Construction refuse creates 30-40% of all waste in China’s cities and often ends up on the cities’ outskirts (Shepard, 2015). Although China is acting very quickly to repair many aspects of their pollution problems, it will take years to ensure that the pollution levels are eradicated at all levels.

Unfair Treatment of Hired Contractors

China’s aggressive economic development initiative is rather suspicious at times. Their strategy is to find the experts in the various initiatives they need for their country, invite them to their country via marketing ploys, play grand host for a while, and then once they have what they need, they tell the consultants, “Thank you for your time, but your services are no longer needed.” Illustrated below are two documented cases of this unprofessional and unethical behavior.

The Ordos 100 project seemed like a great idea to 100 international architects when they received their invitation to visit China and present their most creative and innovative skills to create state-of-the-art villas for Ordos Kangbashi a booming city located in Mongolia. After two trips to Ordos and finished blueprints given to the Chinese government, the renowned architects found themselves no longer needed for the Ordos 100 project. Currently, the project is still not completed, but when the Chinese government is ready to resuscitate, they have all of the blueprints and will complete the project themselves saving a significant amount of money (Bryn Railton Design, 2016).

As stated by Dr. Michael Alexander Ulfstjerne in his fieldwork in Ordos,

The short calculated lifetime of a building doesn’t require top quality material. Nor does it require long-term maintenance. Cost benefit analysis takes place between the phases of conceptual design and practical design. Usually, this means cutting off the architect from the practical design stage in order to minimize construction costs or doubling up the possible rent space of a building by adding an extra level between each floor. A prevailing strategy for developers is building in ways in which a structure can transform into other uses, e.g. from offices or hotel to become residential space, only by making minor alterations.
The vicious circle of construction, demolition, and new construction in China has several effects: first of all, it reflects the conditions for political ambition and promotion. Local officials need to produce to proceed. In order to move upwards in the administrative hierarchy officials are required to ‘show numbers’, usually measured by criteria as real estate prices, five-star hotels, creative industries, luxury shopping malls, cultural centers, science and developments parks, plans for sustainability, and the wide range of ‘model’ city awards including hygienic/civilized/safe/green etc” (Ulfsjterne, 2012).

Another case of China treating its international experts poorly involves the city of China Medical City, which is the hub of medical and pharmaceutical research and production. Just like everything else in China’s economic growth initiative, its grandeur is spectacular. In 2009, an American, David Wilson, was invited to China to create a monoclonal (antibodies) facility, in which the Chinese could not create themselves and needed expertise to bring the initiative to life. In Wade Shepard’s book, Ghost Cities of China, he quotes David Wilson stating:

“I didn’t expect the government, with all that trade surplus money, would renge on their contractual obligations, so everyone, be advised…My advice to those considering working in China is to fully understand the business environment and perspective, because they are very different than in the West, plus always retain your leverage in business relationships. Once they disappear, you are gone” (Shepard, 2015).

It is concerning to know the Chinese government is performing business in this manner, for how can we be sure it won’t happen again to the vulnerable countries that are helping China create their modern day Silk Road? Is China going to change the rules on these countries once their infrastructure is in place throughout their country? Is China being deceptive in their behavior to gain economic and world power?

Fortunately, in recent years, China has tried to develop its own local Corporate Social Responsibility requirements. These include: (1) the China Social Compliance 9000 for Textile and Apparel Industry (CSC9000T) launched by the China National Textile and Apparel Council in collaboration with Social Accountability International; (2) the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences’ CSR reporting guidelines, and (3) other CSR requirements articulated in a variety of laws and regulations by the Chinese government. These Chinese CSR requirements are at an early stage of development and the enforcement of these requirements along with anti-corruption guidelines presents a serious problem in China due to the
guanxi-based (relationship-based) culture in China, as the biggest violators of these standards are the ones who hold high-ranking positions throughout the government (Tian & Slocum, 2016).

**Recommendations**

In what follows, I discuss recommendations that will help both address the problems I have discussed in this paper and improve both the U.S. and Chinese economies. My recommendations are to discuss plans with the Electronic Industry Citizenship Coalition (EICC), China’s Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development, the United States Federal Reserve, and U.S. Housing and Urban Development to improve both China’s and the U.S. economies.

*Electronic Industry Citizenship Coalition*

First, I recommend creating a partnership with the Electronic Industry Citizenship Coalition (EICC) to ensure that China is practicing social responsibility in tandem with their economic growth. The EICC is a global network that consists of 110 electronics, retail, auto and toy companies with combined annual revenue greater than $4.75 trillion, directly employing over 6 million people (Electronic Industry Citizenship Coalition (EICC), 2017). With powerful leverage from some of their largest employers, the Chinese would be motivated to comply with global social responsibility standards established by the ISO 26000 Social Responsibility directive (International Organization for Standardization (ISO), 2017).

*China’s Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development*

Second, I propose a meeting with China’s Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development to create an innovative way to disseminate the construction rubble that surrounds their cities and convert it into recyclable asphalt that they can use to build more roads. The Netherlands is testing self-repairing asphalt that contain steel fibers that help repair the roads from cars travelling on them. The self-healing roads cost 25% more, but have twice the lifespan of normal roads and help reduce dangerous road construction environments (World Economic Forum, 2017).

*The U.S. Federal Reserve and Housing and Urban Development*

Next, the United States Federal Reserve could benefit by studying the practices of the Chinese banking system. By increasing the banks’ required reserve ratios to 20% and earning revenues on deposits instead of loans, our financial
institutions could be more self-sustaining and less dependent on lenders fulfilling their debt obligations and the risks incurred when those debts default.

Finally, I recommend that we share the findings with the U.S. Housing and Urban Development (HUD) around China’s aggressive urban entrepreneurialism initiatives. If each state created one city over the next five years, GDP and job growth would be very significant. China is making astonishing progress in their economic growth, and if the United States wants to sustain their status as a global economic leader, we should keep an open mind and adapt the principles of urban entrepreneurialism, China’s banking philosophy, and the collective practice of the Housing Provident Fund. We no longer live in a world where our countries exist as their own “island”. The United States has offered many generations of goodwill and entrepreneurialism worldwide, and we could benefit by learning from other countries.

Conclusion

In conclusion, China’s initiatives are globally impressive; however, it is imperative and critical for their government to respect their people, their environment, and their global constituents according to their ancient principles of Confucianism if they want to be successful and sustainable in their aggressive economic development initiatives. Social responsibility is not the next corporate buzzword; it is a global ethical principle that each nation needs to honor and respect. This world exists to us as a gift, its people are the treasures, and we need to remember that to build an amazing global enterprise.

References


https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RJckpOkuph4
http://www.economist.com/blogs/graphicdetail/2016/03/daily-chart-6
Religious Nonviolence: An Analysis of Mahatma Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Thich Nhat Hanh

By Meghan Campbell

“History is the long and tragic story of the fact that privileged groups seldom give up their privileges voluntarily…. we know through painful experience that freedom is never voluntarily given by the oppressor; it must be demanded by the oppressed” - Martin Luther King, Letter from Birmingham Jail.

“Under a government that imprisons unjustly, the true place for a just man is also prison” - Henry David Thoreau, Civil Disobedience

“All violence is injustice. Responding to violence with violence is injustice, not only to the other person but also to oneself” - Thich Nhat Hanh, “Compassion as a Response to Violence.”

“It is not non-violence if we love merely those that love us. It is non-violence only when we love those that hate us. I know how difficult it is to follow this grand law of love. But are not all great and good things difficult to do?” - Mahatma Gandhi, Letter to a friend in Selections from Gandhi.
Introduction

In 1849 Henry David Thoreau wrote *Civil Disobedience*. This work was written in response to a government that supported war with Mexico and slavery. He believed that man’s inquiry and action created the government he desired. He said, “Let every man make known what kind of government would command his respect, and that will be one step toward obtaining it.”\(^{31}\) Thoreau was not above breaking the law to make his point. He felt that if a man paid tax dollars to a government that supported atrocities, that man agreed with those atrocities. For example, if a man disagreed with the war and yet continued to pay taxes, he is funding the very war he disagreed with.\(^ {32}\) As Thoreau argues:

If a thousand men were not to pay their tax bills this year, that would not be a violent and bloody measure, as it would be to pay them, and enable the state to commit violence and shed innocent blood. This is, in fact, the definition of a peaceable revolution, if any such is possible.\(^ {33}\)

Thoreau’s rebellion was thus distinct: strategic and non-violent resistance.
Thoreau felt that there was a higher moral law, encapsulated within each man’s conscience, that should be followed rather than any law set by government. Thoreau did not always advocate for nonviolence, and yet his text would be the inspiration for many nonviolent activists.\(^ {34}\) This text was given to Mahatma Gandhi during his first imprisonment in India in the 1920’s. Gandhi adapted those ideals and inspired Martin Luther King Jr.. King would call Gandhi his “guiding light” in his nonviolent movement of the 1960’s. Thich Nhat Hanh was also inspired by Gandhi’s success and adopted his principles in Vietnam in the 1970’s. Although *Civil Disobedience* was not a religious text, it found its way into the hands of three emblematic religious men.

Methodology

This paper will look at the role religion played in shaping the individual movements of Mahatma Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr. and Thich Nhat Hanh. It will illuminate the influence of the individual’s tradition, as well as look at the way the individual interacted with other religious traditions. It will also begin to analyze the process of transmission of these nonviolent ideals from one movement to the

---

\(^{31}\) Henry David Thoreau, *Civil Disobedience*, p. 5.

\(^{32}\) Henry David Thoreau, *Civil Disobedience*, p. 15.

\(^{33}\) Henry David Thoreau, *Civil Disobedience*, p. 21.

next. I will be relying on speeches, letters, interviews, and documentaries that capture the vernacular of each individual. Using their words, I will look for explicit references to their own religious traditions as well as references to other religious traditions and figures. When talking about the history of each man’s nonviolent movement, I will be relying on secondary sources. For the format of the paper, I have organized it by individual. In each section, I will first summarize the nonviolent movement. Next, I will explore the ways the individual expressed his own religion through their non-violent movement. Then, I will look at the ways each man interacted with other religious traditions and spiritual thinkers in their movement. I will end the paper with an analysis, looking at the similarities and differences between each movement and finally answering the question, “what can be said about religious transmission in the three nonviolent movements?”

**Mahatma Gandhi**

_Gandhi’s Nonviolent Movement_

Mohandas Koramchand Gandhi was born in 1869 into a colonized India. India provided Britain many resources, including cheap labor, goods such as silk and gold, and a vast market for exports. Although Gandhi had gone to law school in London, he was still treated as less of a human being by his white counterparts who were also serving as legal counsel to Indian Muslim traders in South Africa. Gandhi began his movement of nonviolent, civil disobedience in South Africa, where he lived and worked for peace on behalf of Indians there for twenty years. He started and lived in ashrams or places of monastic community and hermitage, began the newspaper *Indian Opinion*, was imprisoned, formed first aid groups to care for the other in wars against Britain, was humiliated for his race, and grew intellectually.

Gandhi returned to India in 1915, where Britain had ruled for more than a century. In 1930, with Sir Irwin ruling, Gandhi began his non-violent struggle by challenging the tax on salt. He decided he was going to make his own salt and asked millions of Indians to join him. In Gandhi’s “salt wars” he walked 240 miles to the sea. As he continued to walk the momentum grew, and 78 marchers became thousands by the end. This walk was the catalyst for Gandhi’s movement. He came up with more ways to civilly disobey the British government: he asked Indian government officials to quit their jobs and to not to buy imported cloth. Gandhi was

---

37 Nojeim, *Gandhi and King the Power of Nonviolent Resistance*, p. 79.
38 A Force More Powerful, directed by Steve York, (California, 1999).
finally arrested when he wrote to Irwin about taking control of the salt mill. After Gandhi’s arrest, all of India was mobilized non-violently on his behalf. It culminated when in July, 17,000 resisters filled the jail.\textsuperscript{39} This prompted Irwin to meet with Gandhi. Irwin agreed to remove repressive laws and ordinances and set all the resisters free. Many people felt that Gandhi compromised, but Gandhi said it “awakened the people to their own power.” India became independent 16 years later.\textsuperscript{40}

Gandhi’s nonviolent movement can be characterized by ahimsa and satyagraha. Ahimsa means “no harm or violence,” and satyagraha translates to “holding to truth.”\textsuperscript{41} Gandhi described nonviolence as a discipline: a coordinating of the mind, body and speech. It is not that a person never feels angry, but there is an “intense mental struggle” for peace.\textsuperscript{42}

\textit{Gandhi’s Nonviolence and Hinduism}

Gandhi’s Hinduism was the constant process of self-purification. This purification was necessary in the mental struggle for nonviolence. He called himself an aspirant of Brahmacharya. This meant having complete reign of one’s thoughts, senses, and actions. The Bhagavad Gita was his guide for conduct and decision making. In South Africa, he began living by Aparigraha (non-possession) and Samabhava (equability), which encouraged him to take a vow of poverty. Gandhi began to view his relationships, body, and life as possessions that all should be used for service. The Bhagavad Gita also describes the ideal karma yogi. This is a person who has no sensual pleasures, no jealousy or ego, has dedicated themselves to God, who renounces all fruit of action, is unaffected by others’ opinions, and is always forgiving. Hinduism was the means of self-purification, in order to commit to the struggle of nonviolent action.\textsuperscript{43}

He called his nonviolent movement an “experiment with Truth.” He said, “what I have been striving and pining to achieve these thirty years---is self-realization, to see God face to face, to attain Moksha” The goal of all of his efforts, including his political efforts, was this Truth.\textsuperscript{44}

\textsuperscript{39} A \textit{Force More Powerful}, directed by Steve York.
\textsuperscript{40} A \textit{Force More Powerful}, directed by Steve York.
\textsuperscript{41} A \textit{Force More Powerful}, directed by Steve York.
\textsuperscript{43} Mahatma Gandhi, \textit{The Essential Gandhi}, p. 62.
\textsuperscript{44} Mahatma Gandhi, \textit{The Essential Gandhi}, p. 3.
Gandhi and Other Faith Traditions

Gandhi was influenced by many writers of different faith traditions during his times of imprisonment. Gandhi first read Henry David Thoreau’s *Civil Disobedience* in Johannesburg, South Africa in 1906. This work heavily influenced him. He said, “you have given me a teacher in Thoreau, who furnished me through his essay on ‘The Duty of Civil Disobedience’ scientific confirmation of what I was doing in South Africa.”\(^{45}\) He was also quoted saying that he recommended the study of Thoreau to all of his friends in the nonviolent movement in India. “Why, I actually took the name of my movement from Thoreau’s essay ‘On the Duty of Civil Disobedience’ written about eighty years ago.”\(^{46}\) While in South Africa, Gandhi also read Leo Tolstoy’s *The Kingdom of God is Within You*. Tolstoy was a well-known Christian and even nicknamed the “thirteenth apostle.” Tolstoy saw the nation state as the biggest purveyor of violence. He felt the current system encouraged people to worship nationalism and country over God. This book affirmed Gandhi in his nonviolent movement, and he was “overwhelmed” by Tolstoy’s writings.\(^{47}\) The two even corresponded with letters and Tolstoy encouraged Gandhi in his communal living and nonviolence. When Tolstoy died in 1910, Gandhi’s newspaper published an obituary for him that spoke of him reverently.\(^{48}\) Gandhi in his writing *Experiments* is quoted saying:

> A variety of incidents in my life have conspired to bring me in close contact with people of many creeds and many communities, and my experience with all of them warrants the statement that I have known no distinction between relatives and strangers, countrymen and foreigners, white and colored, Hindus and Indians of other faiths, whether Muslims, Parsis, Christians or Jews.\(^{49}\)

**Martin Luther King Jr.**

**Martin Luther King Jr.’s Nonviolent Movement**

In the 1954 Supreme Court case Brown v. Board of Education, Topeka, Kansas ruled that the separate but not equal clause should not apply to public

---

\(^{45}\) Hendrick, “The Influence of Thoreau’s “Civil Disobedience” on Gandhi’s Satyagraha,” p. 462.

\(^{46}\) George Hendrick, “The Influence of Thoreau’s “Civil Disobedience,”, p. 463


\(^{48}\) Nojeim, *Gandhi and King the Power of Nonviolent Resistance*, p. 81.

schools.\textsuperscript{50} This ruling made possible other rulings that would further desegregate America. The same year as Brown v. Board, Martin Luther King Jr. became the minister at Dexter Avenue Baptist Church in Montgomery, Alabama.\textsuperscript{51}

King’s nonviolent movement involved the combination of acknowledging outward circumstances and purifying the self. He said in any nonviolent campaign there are four basic steps, “(1) Collection of facts to determine whether injustices are alive. (2) Negotiation. (3) Self Purification and (4) Direct Action.”\textsuperscript{52} Once it was determined that there was no negotiation available, direct action would be taken. In nonviolent direct action, the group would create crisis or tension so “that a community that has constantly refused to negotiate is forced to confront the issue. It seeks to dramatize the issue so it can no longer be ignored.”\textsuperscript{53} King felt that this tension would help men rise from the darkness of prejudice and racism to understanding and brotherhood.\textsuperscript{54} While in jail, King spoke about the process of self-purification they took in their actions in Birmingham. They created workshops on nonviolence and practiced scenarios where they repeatedly asked the questions, “Are you able to accept blows without retaliating?” “Are you able to endure the ordeals of jail?”\textsuperscript{55}

King repeated a set of phrases in his many speeches and articles on nonviolence. These phrases are the foundations to his nonviolent movement. First, nonviolence is not a passive movement, it does resist. Second, the point of nonviolence is to win over an enemy, not to humiliate them. Third, a person who wants to be nonviolent must embody agape or unconditional love. Finally, the universe is on the side of justice.\textsuperscript{56}

\textit{King’s Nonviolence and Christianity}

King was especially influenced by two Christian theorists: Walter Rauschenbusch and Reinhold Niebuhr. Walter Rauschenbusch introduced King to the idea of social gospel. This theory saw capitalism as the cause of poverty and conflict. King didn’t agree with everything Rauschenbusch theorized, but he did adapt the practice of applying Jesus’ teachings to contemporary problems. This theory combined Christianity and social activism. Reinhold Niebuhr’s theory

\textsuperscript{50} Nojeim, \textit{Gandhi and King the Power of Nonviolent Resistance}, p. 161.
\textsuperscript{51} Nojeim, \textit{Gandhi and King the Power of Nonviolent Resistance}, p. 163.
\textsuperscript{52} Martin Luther King Jr., \textit{Letter from Birmingham Jail}, p. 2.
\textsuperscript{53} Martin Luther King Jr., \textit{Letter from Birmingham Jail}, p. 4.
\textsuperscript{54} Martin Luther King Jr., \textit{Letter from Birmingham Jail}, p. 4.
\textsuperscript{55} Martin Luther King Jr., \textit{Letter from Birmingham Jail}, p. 3.
\textsuperscript{56} Martin Luther King Jr., \textit{A Testament of Hope}, pp. 12-13.
acknowledged the evilness of man and debunked the idea of inevitable progress. King felt that Niebuhr was too pessimistic, and Rauschenbusch too optimistic. Using Hegelian theory, he combined both ideas, creating a theology realistic about human nature and one that could be directly applied to segregation.

King felt his Christian faith justified nonviolence. He was often quoted saying that the universe is on the side of justice. King’s universe was governed by an all-loving God who chose to be on the side of truth. King also encouraged his followers to model agape love. It is a type of love that seeks nothing in return, “it is the love of God working in the lives of men.” King also relied on many examples from his Christian faith to rationalize his non-violent movement. In his letter from a Birmingham jail, King cites several instances in Christianity where direct nonviolent action was used. King believed that the beginning of civil disobedience was with Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego when they refused to obey the laws of King Nebuchadnezzar. This story demonstrated people following God’s higher laws, versus government laws. He also cited Jesus’ crucifixion as a violent act, but one that came from Jesus’ nonviolent movement. In response to being called an extremist, he says Jesus was an extremist for love, Amos an extremist for justice, and Paul an extremist for the gospel.

King and Other Faith Traditions

King first heard of Gandhi’s nonviolent movement while at Crozer Seminary. After hearing a talk given by Mordechai Johnson who had just returned from India, King went and purchased many of Gandhi’s writings. King said, “It was in this Gandhian emphasis of love and nonviolence that I discovered the method for social reform that I had been seeking.” He would later visit India as a “pilgrim,” crediting Christ for awakening his spirit and Gandhi for giving him the means to act. Gandhi inspired King in the way of nonviolence, and King would continue to study and quote him throughout the entirety of the movement. King also revered Gandhi, in one article referring to him as a saint.

Similar to Gandhi, King also read those of different faith and spiritual traditions while in jail. These writings affirmed and influenced his nonviolent

59 Martin Luther King Jr., *Letter from Birmingham Jail*, p. 9.
64 Martin Luther King Jr., *A Testament of Hope*, p. 17.
movement. King felt that there was a difference between a just law and an unjust law, an idea that has roots in Henry David Thoreau’s *Civil Disobedience*. King read this book during his time at Morehouse College. Just laws are those that uplift the human spirit and personality, while unjust laws degrade the person. In his *Letter from Birmingham Jail* King uses Jewish philosopher Martin Buber who thought that “segregation substitutes an I-it relationship with an I-Thou relationship.” Earlier in this same letter, King later quotes Socrates when he says that created tension can be good. Socrates thought it was helpful to have tension in the mind so that the mind was forced to overcome myths and half-truths.

**Thich Nhat Hanh**

*Thich Nhat Hanh’s Non-Violent Movement*

Thich Nhat Hanh was born in Vietnam in 1926 and became a monk at the age of sixteen. During his initial studies he saw the benefit of learning western philosophy, science, and literature, but his school paid no attention to his perspective. He soon left the monastery and lived in an abandoned building, editing Buddhist publications, writing books, and drawing the plans for the first Vietnamese high school. Nhat Hanh started his school as an alternative to the French system, and with an educational curriculum that was global and holistic. From his success, he was later invited to start the Van Hanh Buddhist University in Saigon. In 1961 he traveled to the United States to study Comparative Religion at Princeton and Columbia. When the Civil War started in Vietnam, Nhat Hanh spoke out against it in a series of talks touring the country. It was during this time in 1966 where he met many people who would become close friends and influential thinkers. These friendships included Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. and Thomas Merton, a prominent Christian monk. After this tour he was exiled for 39 years from his home in Vietnam.

Thich Nhat Hanh’s nonviolent movement begins with the self. He says, “the purpose of resistance, here, is to seek the healing of yourself in order to be able to see clearly.” Once someone is able to return to themselves, they are in right communion with reality. A person must develop right perception before helping

---

66 Martin Luther King Jr., *Letter from Birmingham Jail*, p. 7.
67 Martin Luther King Jr., *Letter from Birmingham Jail*, p. 4.
others. Nhat Hanh believed this practice was “looking deeply.”\(^71\) This meant that a person must constantly bring intention into each interaction, and they must consistently refer back to this practice. Nhat Hanh also believed that nonviolence was never absolute. In an interview with Catherine Ingram, Thich Nhat Hanh said, “nonviolence is a direction, not a separating line.”\(^72\) He felt that it was human tendency to separate the nonviolent from the violent, but in doing so a person created perceived extremes and perceived sides. It becomes us versus them. Because nonviolence can never perfectly be achieved, it is something to set an intention towards not take sides on. Nhat Hanh parallels Gandhi in this sentiment when he says, “why not be a friend of the army in order to help the army commit less violence?”\(^73\)

**Nhat Hanh’s Nonviolence and Buddhism**

Thich Nhat Hanh saw Buddhism as a way to stop the “war within us.”\(^74\) He felt it was necessary to end the conflict within before we address relationships and community nonviolently. Nonviolence is something that a person must first cultivate, when a person seeks to cultivate compassion and understanding, they cultivate nonviolence. Nhat Hanh’s nonviolence is a part of his religious tradition. Specifically, it is a part of the “Fourteen Precepts of Engaged Buddhism” of Thich Nhat Hanh’s order Tiep Hien. Engaged Buddhism is the idea of bringing mindfulness into everyday interactions. By being mindful of every moment, Hanh says that you will notice and be aware of the people around you and what they need. For him, the awareness of the interconnectedness of all beings naturally brings about nonviolence.\(^75\) In Engaged Buddhism the practitioner does acts of charity and helps others as a Buddhist practice. What makes his precepts unique is that they take Buddhist doctrines and apply them to social situations. He says, “practicing Buddhism does not mean you cut yourself off from society. Real Buddhism brings you into a better relationship with society.”\(^76\) Thich Nhat Hanh’s Fourteen Precepts directly address nonviolence. One precept says that a person shouldn’t kill and should encourage others not to as well. Another precept says, “do not cut yourself off from suffering people, because that contact nourishes one’s compassion.”\(^77\)

\(^71\) Catherine Ingram, *In the Footsteps of Gandhi: Conversations with Spiritual Social Activists.* (Berkley, 1990), p. 88.
\(^72\) Ingram, *In the Footsteps of Gandhi*, p. 87.
\(^73\) Ingram, *In the Footsteps of Gandhi*, p. 88.
\(^76\) Marchand, “Cultivating the Flower of Nonviolence: An Interview with Thich Nhat Hanh.”
Thich Nhat Hanh believed the nonviolent principles he was practicing were universal. In the interview “Cultivating the Flower of Nonviolence” he is quoted saying, “Peace begins with myself, and I think that is very Buddhist in essence. That principle, that vision is universal, not only Buddhist, but Christian, Jewish, and also humanist, nonreligious.”

Thich Nhat Hanh’s most well-known relationship was with Martin Luther King Jr. In 1965 Nhat Hanh wrote a letter to King explaining why the monks of Vietnam set themselves on fire. He explained that when a situation like Vietnam is happening, it is difficult to have your voice heard. The monks burned themselves as an act of compassion and love. This act forced the world to see and hear Vietnam’s pain. Nhat Hanh compared this death to Jesus dying on the cross. In 1966 King and Nhat Hanh met in Chicago. They discussed peace, freedom, and community. After their meeting, King came out strongly against the Vietnam war. Later, Martin Luther King Jr. nominated Thich Nhat Hanh for the Nobel Peace Prize. In his letter he said, “I do not personally know of anyone more worthy of this prize than this gentle monk from Vietnam. He is an Apostle of Peace and Nonviolence. His ideas for peace, if applied, would build a monument to ecumenism, to world brotherhood, to humanity.” The last time the two met was at Pacem in Paris, France. In this meeting Nhat Hanh told King that people in Vietnam called King a Bodhisattva for what he was doing in the United States. In his letter to King, and in many of his writings Nhat Hanh used Jesus as an example of nonviolence. Nhat Hanh also had a close relationship with Thomas Merton, a catholic monk who studied Zen Buddhism. The two first met in Kentucky at Trappist Monastery, and after their meeting Merton wrote a letter supporting Thich Nhat Hanh. Merton is quoted saying “Nhat Hanh is more my brother than most of my Catholic monks.” In response to this Thich Nhat Hanh says that “a good Christian manifests the Buddha-nature, and a good Buddhist always manifests the love and compassion of Jesus.”

Marchand, “Cultivating the Flower of Nonviolence: An Interview with Thich Nhat Hanh.”
Thich Nhat Hanh, “Compassion as a Response to Violence,” p. 80.
Marchand, “Cultivating the Flower of Nonviolence: An Interview with Thich Nhat Hanh.”
Similarities in the Movements

Civil Disobedience

Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Thich Nhat Hanh often disobeyed laws in order to follow higher moral laws. We see each man embodying Henry David Thoreau when he said that if an unjust law “requires you to be an agent of injustice to another, then I say, break the law. Let your life be the counter friction to stop the machine.” While Gandhi was in Champaran surveying the local conditions, the government ordered him to leave. He said that by disobeying this order, he was declaring that the British could not order him around in his own country. He chose to follow a higher law: the voice of his conscience. When Martin Luther King Jr. was explaining the philosophy undergirding the Montgomery Bus Boycott, he explained it was a movement of resistance to the forces of injustice. Thoreau did not advocate for nonviolence, but a rebellion or revolution against laws and governments who were unjust. It was when civil disobedience was combined with a search for truth that these three movements became nonviolent.

Self-Purification by Means of Faith Tradition

Each man’s movement begins with transformation of the self. Using their respective faith traditions, each activist advocated for internal purification. For Thich Nhat Hanh, he refers to this as healing the war within. Martin Luther King Jr. listed self-purification as the first step in his process of nonviolence as he trained activists in Birmingham. King also spoke that the inner violence of the spirit must be addressed with love. Gandhi also talked about his movement in this way. He spoke of non-violence as an internal struggle. When giving advice to American black men and women who had visited him, Gandhi said “there is no royal road, except through living the creed in your life.” He continues to say that nonviolence requires multiple lifetimes for its mastery and must be something felt in the heart. Gandhi called his Autobiography The Story of My Experiments with Truth. All the men also saw their movements as interactions with their religious Truth.

84 Thoreau, *Civil Disobedience*, p. 17.
86 Martin Luther King Jr., *A Testament of Hope*, p. 12.
87 Martin Luther King Jr., *A Testament of Hope*, p. 19.
Socially Concerned

Martin Luther King Jr., Gandhi, and Thich Nhat Hanh saw their movements as a way to change social ethics. Each man’s movement resisted what was normative in order to bring social change. To this point, Thich Nhat Hanh created the “Five Wonderful Precepts” for laypeople. In these precepts Nhat Hanh urges people to become aware of suffering caused by the destruction of life, suffering caused by exploitation, suffering caused by sexual misconduct, suffering caused by unmindful speech, and suffering caused by consumption. These precepts were expanded by Nhat Hanh from the Five Precepts of the Buddhist lay person. His additions accommodate for a globally engaged world. The purpose of King’s movement was to create tension within society, so that the community was forced to respond. He saw that racism and segregation were considered normative parts of life, and as a result there was a chronic numbness to injustice. King sought to change the social order of the United States by nonviolent protest.

Gandhi operated with a similar agenda. When Gandhi encouraged Indians to make their own salt, instead of paying Britain’s salt tax and to make their own clothing, it was an attempt to create a self-reliant India. Indians had become so numb to oppression, they continued to cooperate with Britain. By creating an India that was self-sufficient without British influence, it also encouraged them to not hate.

Differences in the Movements

There are many differences between the three movements, but the largest differences are circumstantial and religious. Gandhi’s civil disobedience in practice was very successful because there were simply more Indians in India than British. He said, “one hundred thousand English men need not frighten three hundred million human beings.” The British depended on the Indian’s resignation for oppression. When a majority rose up, there was little the British could do. In Thich Nhat Hanh’s movement the circumstances surrounding his idea did not aid in his success. Nhat Hanh was caught between a war of two major world powers who felt that a victory from one side would bring peace. He did not have the power of majority like Gandhi. King’s movement was different yet. While Gandhi and Thich Nhat Hanh were involved in conflicts of two different countries, Martin Luther King Jr. was involved in a conflict of a single divided country. While Gandhi would be able to use arguments for Indian nationalism, King could not. Nhat Hanh also

90 Martin Luther King Jr., Letter from the Birmingham Jail, p. 4.
92 Mahatma Gandhi, The Essential Gandhi, p. 137.
didn’t have the support of the press in comparison to Gandhi and King. In one instance, he was trying to help Vietnamese refugees sail to Australia and Guam. When the press leaked the information, every refugee was arrested.\footnote{Ingram, \textit{In the Footsteps of Gandhi}, p. 89-90.}

Thich Nhat Hanh and Gandhi practiced religions that are ideologically more open to other traditions. Both men were not tied to a specific definition of truth and are very open to other faith traditions. Specifically, we see this in Hanh’s Fourteen Precepts. In Precept One, it says “do not be idolatrous about or bound to any doctrine, theory, or ideology, even Buddhist ones. Buddhist systems of thought are guiding means; they are not absolute truth.”\footnote{Thich Nhat Hanh, “The Fourteen Precepts of Engaged Buddhism,” \textit{Interbeing: Fourteen Guidelines For Engaged Buddhism}, (California 1993).} Gandhi also was quoted saying “I do not believe in the exclusive divinity of the Vedas,” “Religions are different roads converging to the same point,” and “All religions are more or less true.”\footnote{Mahatma Gandhi, \textit{The Essential Gandhi}, p. 185.} Although Martin Luther King Jr. was very influenced by both men, there is no record of such openness. His speeches contain exclusively Christian references.

\section*{Conclusion}

Can we qualify the movement as successful interfaith dialogue? Did ideas get traded and produce a new idea, embodying religious syncretism? Or, were the relationships of these men the natural products of a religious pluralist society? Each man had many relationships with those of other faith traditions. But, does a close relationship constitute syncretism or pluralism?

\subsection*{Terms}

Diana Eck calls pluralism an “energetic engagement of diversity toward a positive end.”\footnote{Diana Eck, \textit{A New Religious America: The World’s Most Religiously Diverse Nation}. (California, 2001), p. 3.} The Interfaith Youth Core of Chicago identifies three characteristics in a religiously pluralist society “respect for identities, mutually inspiring relationships, and commitment to the common good.”\footnote{Interfaith Youth Core, “Interfaith Cooperation” \textit{Interfaith Youth Core}. https://www.ifyc.org/interfaith, About Section.} The goal of religious pluralism is when people of different religious, secular, and spiritual traditions can “bridge differences and find common values to build a shared life together.”\footnote{Interfaith Youth Core, “Interfaith Cooperation.”} While diversity is a reality, pluralism is the goal. Pluralism can occur
through different mediums: the relationships of people, the transmission of thoughts, the interacting of religious institutions.

Interfaith dialogue or cooperation is a way to achieve pluralism. The goal of an interfaith perspective is to bring people of different religious identities together, form attitudes of respect between personal and interpersonal religious identities and gain appreciative knowledge of religious traditions.\(^{99}\) The definition of interfaith dialogue we will be using for this paper is from the American Academy of Religions “people of differing faiths communicate important elements of their faith experience to others through story and other forms of mutual exploration and sharing.”\(^ {100}\) In interfaith dialogue, an individual brings the entirety of their religious tradition in conversation with the entirety of another’s religious tradition. This is different from syncretism.

Syncretism is the process in which different ideas interact and as a result a new idea is formed. Gerald van der Leeuw relates it to the process of transposition. In this process the essence of the original idea stays intact but gets reinterpreted by different groups.\(^ {101}\) Van der Leeuw argues that every historic religion is not one but several, “of course as being the sum of different forms.”\(^ {102}\) He sees religion as having both a static and dynamic character.

**Analysis**

Arguments could be made for the existence of all three concepts: syncretism, pluralism, and interfaith cooperation. For example, in the case of syncretism we can look at the transmission of nonviolent ideals from Gandhi to Martin Luther King Jr. In Gandhi’s nonviolent movement, it was his experiment with Truth. He would use God interchangeably with the word Truth, and also qualified his movement as truth-seeking. When this ideal came to Martin Luther King Jr., it transformed into an experiment with Love. King used the word love interchangeably with God and felt the purpose of his movement was to embody agape love. King contextualized the movement to fit into his framework of Christian theology. In interfaith cooperation, we see all three men interpreting the nonviolent movement through their faith tradition and sharing it. This is evidenced by the numerous friendships each man made throughout his movement. It can also be argued that the nonviolent movement in America was a result of positive

---


religious pluralism. Because globalization was occurring, and Martin Luther King Jr. was able to see Gandhi’s movement as successful, he was able to learn from it, and adopt civil disobedience. Using Diana Eck’s definition, the nonviolent movement would be a result of the “engagement of diversity towards a positive end.”

We could also argue that religiously, these movements happened separately from one another or that these men were involved in similar political struggles which forged a friendship, but religion was not shared. For Mahatma Gandhi and Thich Nhat Hanh, it’s important to note that they had a much more inclusive faith tradition to begin with. The integration of other faith traditions and worldviews into their own would not be considered necessarily syncretic, but integral to the theology of their current faith tradition. While King showed reverence and respect for Gandhi and Thich Nhat Hanh’s movements, he did not adopt their religious practices. We know that King was inspired by Gandhi’s ideology of nonviolence and adapted it specifically. But, when Thich Nhat Hanh was asked how Gandhi influenced him, he answered that it was Gandhi’s success more than his nonviolent ideals that encouraged him.103

The point of all three of these movements were not religious pluralism or interreligious dialogue. But, out of a necessity for survival these men relied on each other. King wrote in an address to the Fellowship of the Concerned of the Southern Regional Council that there are three ways to respond to oppression. The oppressed can surrender, the oppressed can fight back with violence, or they can respond with nonviolent resistance.104 These men may have simply been doing what they perceived they could, and what was perceivably most successful.

We do know that the nonviolent ideals of Mahatma Gandhi inspired and affirmed the nonviolent movements of America and Vietnam. I believe this exchange was a product of religious pluralism and was successful because of interreligious dialogue. But each of these movements are also evidence of essential characteristics for human survival. Each man adapted civil disobedience out of necessity. They interpreted their individual religious tradition as demanding an extreme response, but they also foresaw nonviolence as a successful means of survival. In the face of oppression, they could mimic their oppressor, or put on their religious ideals towards a path of peace. These movements were successful because they address an inevitable symbiosis of humanity. When you humiliate or hate the oppressor, you are closing the door for collaboration. When often, the solution relies on the oppressor as well as the oppressed. Another key to survival is how one interprets suffering. Each man interpreted his own suffering through his religious narrative, and so was able to transform it for a positive end.

103 Ingram, In the Footsteps of Gandhi, p. 89.
104 Martin Luther King Jr., A Testament of Hope, p. 44-45.
Bibliography

A Force More Powerful, directed by Steve York (Santa Monica Pictures, 1999).
King, Martin Luther Jr. Letter from Birmingham Jail. The Martin Luther King Jr. Research and Education Institute. (Stanford University, 1963).


Acceptability of Social Media Incentives to Increase Physical Activity

By Amanda Devoto
and Anthony DeFulio

ABSTRACT

Background: Contingency management can be effective in promoting physical activity, but the change frequently does not sustain after the intervention is withdrawn. A feasible and sustainable physical activity intervention is needed. Social media may meet the criteria for a sustainable intervention, as it is free to use and enormously popular.

Introduction: The goal of the current study was to assess acceptability of using social media as an incentive for a physical activity intervention.

Materials and Methods: The current study surveyed 102 Mechanical Turk users on their social media use, physical activity habits, and interest in a proposed physical activity intervention.

Results: There was moderate interest in social media as an incentive, with 32.35% of participants indicating initial interest in the intervention and 62.75% of participants interested in a free trial. Interest in increasing physical activity predicted interest in the intervention.

Discussion and Conclusions: Social media can be an acceptable incentive for use in a physical activity intervention.
Introduction

Centers for Disease Control (CDC) guidelines specify that U.S. adults ages 18-64 should engage in moderate intensity physical activity 150 minutes per week, and muscle strengthening twice a week.\(^1\) Currently only about 1 in 5 of U.S. adults meet these recommendations.\(^2\) Failing to meet CDC guidelines for physical activity is associated with increased risk of heart disease, stroke, and some cancers.\(^2\) Because of the low rate of physical activity in the population and the substantial health consequences of inactivity, effective interventions designed to increase physical activity are needed.

One type of intervention that may promote physical activity is contingency management (CM). In CM, some material (often monetary) incentive is delivered contingent upon meeting a goal or engaging in specified behaviors. Conducting a CM intervention requires two things: (1) objective measurement of the target behaviors and (2) a means of delivering consequences based on the occurrence or non-occurrence of the target behaviors. CM has been shown to be effective in promoting drug abstinence across multiple drug classes,\(^3\) increasing medication adherence,\(^4\) and increasing physical activity.\(^5\)

Contingency management interventions designed to increase physical activity typically have used either money or prizes as reinforcement for meeting step goals. For example, a study by Donlin Washington et al.\(^6\) used prize-based reinforcement to promote physical activity. Participants wore a Fitbit every day during the study. Participants were given a daily step goal during the intervention. Every day that they met or exceeded the goal, they were given the opportunity to draw from a prize bowl. Prizes ranged in value from $5 to $120. Eight out of the eleven participants increased their steps from baseline to intervention, but only one participant maintained the elevated physical activity after the intervention was withdrawn. In a similar experiment, Kurti and Dallery\(^7\) used monetary reinforcement to promote steps in sedentary adults. All six participants increased steps from baseline to intervention, but there were no follow-up data, so it is unknown whether this increase was maintained.

Though CM interventions have been successful in promoting physical activity, once the intervention is withdrawn, physical activity typically returns to near baseline levels. For example, in the study by Donlin Washington et al.,\(^6\) only one out of eight participants that increased physical activity maintained that increase during a follow-up period. The follow-up period could be considered entering extinction, in which they complete the target behavior, but the incentive is withheld. Eventually, the behavior stops occurring. A solution to this problem is finding a sustainable incentive. To be sustainable, an incentive must continue to have its effects on behavior over long time periods, and must be practical to use over long time periods. Practicality can be judged by a consideration of the ease
with which the incentive can be delivered immediately upon demonstration of the relevant behavior, along with the cost of the incentive itself. The most practical incentives are those that are very easy to deliver immediately and cost nothing.

Access to social media may meet the criteria for a sustainable incentive. Social media is free to use and is widely available. Social media is also enormously popular. Facebook is used by 79% of online adults, and 76% of Facebook users visit at least daily. Facebook is only one of several social media websites that are freely available. Given that social media is free, widely available, and incredibly popular, it is plausible that gaining access to social media is a sustainable incentive for increasing physical activity.

One study to date has used access to social media as a reward for engaging in physical activity. Larwin and Larwin developed a physical intervention for a 14-year-old girl who reported wanting to increase physical activity and lose weight. Her parents were used as a “coach”, making sure that she was adherent to the program and recording her data correctly. During baseline, she had free access to the treadmill and to internet and cellphone. During phase 1 of the study, the participant could earn one hour of non-school related internet time for walking one mile on the treadmill. During phase 2 of the study, the participant could earn 1.5 hours of phone and/or internet time for 1.5 miles of walking. Each additional half mile walked earned a half hour of phone (but not internet) time. The participant did not use the treadmill at all during the two-week baseline. The participant averaged .98 miles per day during phase one, and 1.8 miles per day during phase two. Although these results are promising, the intervention required considerable involvement of her parents. For this type of intervention to be effective for adult populations, technology is required to withhold reinforcement until the occurrence of the target behavior or outcome is verified. With current technology, it is feasible to create a social media incentive intervention program available via smartphones and computers.

While research using social media as an incentive for physical activity is limited, there have been several studies using access to television as a consequence for engaging in physical activity. One study by Faith et al. investigated the effectiveness of contingent access to TV on physical activity in ten obese children. The investigators used a device called the “Contingent TV”, which consisted of a TV, an exercise bike, and a power controller. The Contingent TV could power the TV based on the rate of pedaling on the exercise bike, and measured RPM, duration of pedaling, and duration of TV watching. A Contingent TV was provided to each participant. The children were randomized either to the contingent TV group or the control group. The control group participants had free access to both the exercise bike and to the television. The contingent TV group had to pedal the bike at a specified rate in order to access the television at either a 1:1 or 1:2 ratio (one minute of pedaling equaled either one or two minutes of television watching). Time spent
pedaling increased for the experimental group from baseline to intervention, but decreased for the control group. The experimental group also lost significantly more body fat than the control group.

While feasible to create a social media incentive program for exercise, interest in such a program is unknown. Thus, the purpose of the present study was to assess the acceptability of incentive-based physical activity interventions, with a special focus on the use of access to social media as an incentive. This study was intended to guide the initial development of an intervention that makes access to social media contingent upon meeting a physical activity goal.

**Method**

**Materials**

A web-based survey was created to investigate opinions on the social media based physical activity intervention. The survey assessed social media use, workout habits, interest in increasing their physical activity, and demographics. Initial interest in the program was measured on a five-point rating scale anchored with *not at all interested* and *extremely interested*. Any participant who indicated that they were not interested or indifferent received a follow-up question regarding whether they would revise their opinion if the program had been clinically demonstrated to be effective. Those that did not revise their opinion were then given a follow-up question regarding reasons that they would not revise their opinion about the program, including that social media was too valuable or not valuable enough, the program was too complicated or hard to use, or that they do not trust the program is secure. A series of questions were asked about possible ways to increase their interest, such as telling them that it is no more complicated to operate than the typical application, includes a tutorial viewable at any time, and the ability to pick which social media websites were blocked as part of the program.

The next series of questions was designed to assess interest in the social media incentive program compared to other kinds of physical activity programs. A brief description was given for an array of programs including deposit contract, competition with friends, competition with anonymous players, goal setting, goal setting with public results (such as posting to Facebook), financial incentive program, and the social media incentive program. Given this list, participants were asked which of these they would consider trying to increase their physical activity level. Participants were then asked to rank order some of the approaches in terms of what they preferred and what they thought would be most effective.

Lastly, participants were asked about their preferences for specific features of the social media incentive program. For instance, participants were asked their
preference between having personalized goals or setting their own goals. The entire survey was designed to take about 15 minutes.

Procedure

Participants were recruited from Amazon Mechanical Turk© (MTurk). MTurk is an online labor market where “Requesters” (researchers or organizations requesting information) can post jobs for “Workers” (the employees). The jobs are called human intelligence tasks (“HITs”), and can be almost anything, including answering surveys, transcribing audio, conducting web searches, and comparing receipts. The survey for the current study was created using Qualtrics© and posted as a HIT on MTurk.

The survey was only visible to those that met inclusion criteria. Participants had to live in the United States, have at least a 95% acceptance rate on MTurk, and have completed at least 500 HITs on MTurk to qualify for this study. All data were collected within 48 hours of initial posting. Participants were paid $2.75 for completing the survey.

Data Analysis

Data was analyzed using Minitab statistics software. Logistical regressions were used to predict interest in the social media incentive program. For the question, “how many hours per day do you typically spend on social media”, for any values over 24 it was assumed that they input minutes instead of hours. The values were changed to equivalent hour values (e.g., 60 changed to 1).

Results

Demographic data for all 102 participants are detailed in Table 1. Participants were primarily white, college educated, social media users in their late twenties to early thirties. 56.86% of participants were either overweight or obese, and 63.73% indicated an interest in increasing their physical activity levels.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Sample (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>61 (59.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>41 (40.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>14 (13.73)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>56 (54.90)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>21 (20.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>2 (1.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>65&lt;</td>
<td>2 (1.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/ethnicity</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>83 (81.37)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>9 (8.82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>American Indian or Alaskan Native</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Native</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMI Category</td>
<td>Underweight</td>
<td>5 (4.90)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Normal</td>
<td>39 (38.24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Overweight</td>
<td>31 (30.39)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Obese</td>
<td>27 (26.47)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Less than high school degree</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High school or equivalent</td>
<td>16 (15.69)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some college</td>
<td>21 (20.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Degree</td>
<td>15 (14.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree</td>
<td>44 (43.14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Master’s Degree</td>
<td>2 (1.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doctorate Degree</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional Degree (JD, MD)</td>
<td>2 (1.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Less than $10,000</td>
<td>2 (1.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$10,000 – $19,999</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$20,000 - $29,999</td>
<td>13 (12.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$30,000 - $39,999</td>
<td>17 (16.67)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$40,000 - $49,999</td>
<td>19 (18.63)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$50,000 - $59,999</td>
<td>15 (14.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$60,000 - $69,999</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$70,000 - $79,999</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$80,000 – $89,999</td>
<td>6 (5.88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income Range</td>
<td>Count (Percentage)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$90,000 - $99,999</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$100,000 – $149,999</td>
<td>7 (6.86)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$150,000 or more</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey Region</th>
<th>Count (Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>23 (22.55)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>20 (19.61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>38 (37.25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>20 (19.61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>1 (.98)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Physical Activity</th>
<th>Count (Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Light</td>
<td>78 (76.47)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>72 (70.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intense</td>
<td>45 (44.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strength Building</td>
<td>36 (35.29)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Media</th>
<th>Count (Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>81 (79.41)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>60 (58.82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snapchat</td>
<td>28 (27.45)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>44 (43.14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reddit</td>
<td>67 (65.69)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumblr</td>
<td>15 (14.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinterest</td>
<td>31 (30.39)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youtube</td>
<td>5 (4.90)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Interest in Intervention**

Of the 102 participants, 33 (32.35%) indicated initial interest in a physical activity program that involved unlocking access to social media (see Figure 1). Of the 69 that were not initially interested, 28 (40.58%) indicated that they would revise their opinion of the program if it had been shown to be clinically effective. Reasons why they would not revise their opinion are shown in Figure 2. Other reasons included concern that it limited personal freedom, that they use social media for their job, they use messenger as a main source of communication, and that they already work out enough or their weight is not an issue. Participants also indicated the possibility of the program helping them increase engagement in physical activity and the ability to set their own goals as attractive features of the program (see Figure 3).
Figure 1. Percent of participants reporting initial interest in the social media incentive program. NI = Not interested, PNI = Probably not interested, SI = Somewhat interested, and EI = Extremely interested.

Figure 2. Percent of participants that chose given potential reasons for disinterest in the program after being told that it has been shown to be clinically effective.
Figure 3. Percent of participants that chose given attractive features.

Over half (62.75%) of participants indicated that they were willing to try a free trial of the program. Figure 4 shows a survival curve for willingness to pay for the program. The median price that they were willing to pay was $5.00.

Figure 4. Survival curve for willingness to pay for the social media incentive program.
To identify potential predictors of interest in the social media incentive program, two logistical regressions were run, one to predict initial interest in the program (Yes/No) and one to predict interest in a free trial (Yes/No). Age, BMI, self-reported daily social media use, whether they engage in physical activity (Yes/No), and interest in increasing physical activity (Yes/No) were used as predictors. Interest in increasing physical activity was the only significant predictor for initial interest in the program, $\chi^2(1, N = 102) = 17.49, p < .001$. Those who were interested in increasing their physical activity were 10.16 times more likely to report initial interest in the social media incentive program than those who were not interested in increasing their physical activity. Interest in increasing physical activity was also the only significant predictor for interest in a free trial, $\chi^2(1, N = 102) = 17.46, p < .001$. Those who were interested in increasing their physical activity were 6.66 times more likely to be interested in a free trial than those who were not interested in increasing their physical activity.

**Intervention and Incentive Preferences**

Preferences for intervention types are shown in Figure 5. Monetary incentive was ranked highest as the most preferred physical activity intervention and the intervention perceived to be most effective. Competition with friends was ranked second, and social media incentive was ranked third for most preferred and fourth for most effective.

*Figure 5.* Percent of participants that ranked each intervention first. The top panel shows rankings for most preferred interventions. The bottom panel shows rankings for interventions that they thought would be most effective.
Preferences for potential program features are detailed in Table 2. There were clear preferences for being able to set goals for specific days of the week, being able to set own activity goals, and having social media as an incentive rather than donating to charity. When asked for additional attractive features to include, common responses were achievements or trophies, posting to social media, competition with friends, and earning money.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Sample (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unlocking Timing</td>
<td>Unlock social media for rest of day after meeting activity goal</td>
<td>46 (45.10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unlock social media for 24 hours after meeting activity goal</td>
<td>25 (24.51)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indifferent</td>
<td>31 (30.39)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting Goal Days</td>
<td>Set specific days that I need to meet my goal (such as Monday, Wednesday, and Friday)</td>
<td>67 (65.69)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Set a number of days in a row that I need to meet my goal (such as the next three days)</td>
<td>17 (16.67)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indifferent</td>
<td>18 (17.65)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting Goals</td>
<td>Personalized goals given to me</td>
<td>26 (25.49)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Set my own goals</td>
<td>57 (55.88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indifferent</td>
<td>19 (18.63)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred Consequence</td>
<td>Access to preferred websites, such as Facebook, Reddit, or Instagram, after meeting my activity goals</td>
<td>63 (61.76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Donate money to charity if I don’t meet my activity goals</td>
<td>22 (21.57)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indifferent</td>
<td>17 (16.67)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

Approximately 30% of participants reported initial interest in the social media program and 63% reported willingness to try it. Interest in increasing physical activity was a significant predictor of interest in the social media incentive program. Taken together, these results indicate that the use of social media as an incentive for physical activity is highly acceptable among people who would have access to and need such an intervention.
Daily social media use was not predictive of interest in the program. This finding could be due to the sample including both those who find social media too valuable to risk as well as those who do not find social media valuable at all. Given that there is some interest in the program, it seems like there is a happy medium of people who use social media, find it valuable, but are also willing to risk it, although more research is needed.

A limitation of the current study was that there was a small sample of approximately 100 people. The sample size was chosen to reduce costs while maintaining an acceptable level of margin of error of 10%. Given that the purpose of the study was to investigate whether there was any interest in the proposed intervention, the margin of error, and thus the sample size, was deemed acceptable as long as over 1% of the participants showed interest. Another limitation was that the efficacy of using social media as an incentive to promote physical activity was not investigated in the current study. An interest in a physical activity program does not necessarily mean that it would be beneficial. The results of Larwin and Larwin (2008) indicate that social media can be used as an incentive to increase physical activity, but more research is certainly needed. Given the reasonable level of interest in this intervention, its development and clinical evaluation is warranted.

In summary, this study demonstrated that social media can be an acceptable incentive for use in a physical activity intervention. Even a low interest in the general population indicates a large pool of potential users. Interest in increasing physical activity predicts interest in the proposed intervention. More research is needed to determine the efficacy of using social media as an incentive to promote physical activity.

References


ABSTRACT: In this paper, I begin by briefly showing how the problem of self has been understood and approached historically in Western philosophy. I follow this by focusing on some of the recent literature in the philosophy of mind that suggests that the self is extended, meaning it is not solely located within the boundaries of the brain (Clark and Chalmers 1998). It will be evident that this is in conflict with the traditional Western understanding of the self. Since it seems to be the case that there are strong arguments for endorsing the view that the self is extended (to some degree), we ought to give the proper philosophical attention to such views, and using Daoist ideas will help to theorize about these unorthodox views. This will be the focus of the remainder of the paper, pulling primarily from the Dao De Jing (道德經) and Zhuangzi (莊子). It will be shown that some of these unorthodox views arising from the philosophy of mind bear a close connection to certain Daoist ideas, therefore making it likely that they share common conceptual resources. I will conclude with some possible objections and responses to those objections. Ultimately, if the self is indeed extended, then this is unfamiliar to the Western mind. However, analyzing these unorthodox views using Daoist ideas may be a suitable tool in progressing our understanding of the self.
Introduction

Recent literature produced in the philosophy of mind has been met with skepticism. Panpsychism and the extended mind thesis are two views that fall into this category. Grasping these theories from the perspective of Western philosophy is difficult because they run counter to traditional Western notions of cognition, consciousness, and the self. However, taking a more Eastern approach and grounding these views in Daoist ideas provides a bridge for theorizing about panpsychism and the extended mind thesis. In this paper, I begin by briefly showing how the problem of self has been understood and approached historically in Western philosophy. I follow this by focusing on some of the recent literature that suggests that the self is extended, meaning it is not solely located within the boundaries of the body. It will be evident that this is in conflict with the traditional Western understanding of the self. Since it seems to be the case that there are strong arguments for endorsing the view that the self is extended, we ought to give the proper philosophical attention to such views, and, as I argue, using Daoist ideas will help us theorize about these unorthodox views. This will be the focus of the remainder of the paper, where I pull primarily from the *Dao De Jing* (道德經) and *Zhuangzi* (莊子). It will be shown that some of these recent, unorthodox views in the philosophy of mind bear a close connection to certain Daoist ideas, suggesting that they share common conceptual resources. I will conclude with some possible objections and responses to those objections. Ultimately, if the self is indeed extended, then this is unfamiliar to the Western mind. However, analyzing these unorthodox views using Daoist ideas may be a suitable tool in progressing our understanding of the self.

**Traditional Western Views of Self**\(^{105}\)

The problem of personal identity is multifaceted in that it concerns metaphysics, biology, and certainly many other areas. I take it to be the case that the most prominent aspect of the problem is the spatiotemporal boundaries of the self. This problem has a long history in the West. It has been pursued by many of the most influential philosophers, such as John Locke, David Hume, Gottfried Leibniz, Joseph Butler, and Thomas Reid\(^{106}\). The philosophical nature to the question of what is a self is familiar to everyone when we reflect on our own experiences. People claim ownership to their physical body because they believe

---

\(^{105}\) "Traditional Western Views" should not be understood as a characterization of (all) Western Philosophy. I am simply using this category to draw out some key features that have been prominent in Western Philosophy regarding the self.

\(^{106}\) An analysis of the historical context of the problem can be found in Harold Noonan’s *Personal Identity* (2003).
that their body is different from the body of another person. People also believe that they are the sole owner of their mind. It belongs to the person and no one else has the ability to occupy his or her mind. Common reflections like these have prompted philosophical inquiry into the relationship between the body and mind. Is it the case that the mind makes up the self, or does the body make up the self? Furthermore, how does the self exist from one point in time to another point in time? This is the problem of persistence.

The persistence question is often taken to ask what it takes for the same person to exist at two different times. The most common formulation is something like this: If a person x exists at one time and a person y exists at another time, under what possible circumstances is it the case that x is y? (Olsen, 2017).

When I see a photograph of myself from when I was two years old, I point to the photo and say, “That is me!” The persistence problem addresses the justification (or lack of) for why two-year-old Ryan is the same person as adult Ryan. Fleshing this out further, the bodies are completely different. The child in the photo is very small and lacks mature physical characteristics compared to the developed adult body exemplified in present-day Ryan. It is a similar story when it comes to the mind. Child Ryan has not developed cognitive processes that are present in adult Ryan. Furthermore, the access to memories is very different because adult Ryan possesses many more. Intuitively, it seems that child Ryan and adult Ryan are of the same self. However, this is not necessarily the case, and many contemporary Western philosophers have developed competing theories with disparate conclusions. Sydney Shoemaker and Richard Swinburne capture the focus of the problem.

There are two philosophical questions about personal identity. The first is: what are the logically necessary and sufficient conditions for a person P2 at a time, t2 being the same person as a person P1 at an earlier time t1, or loosely, what does it mean to say that P2 is the same person as P1? The second is: what evidence of observation and experience can we have that a person P2 at t2 is the same person as a person P1 at t1 (and how are different pieces of evidence to be weighed against each other)? (1984)

I will outline two popular theories that have been used to respond to the problem of persistence: the Simple View and the Complex View.
Simple and Complex View

The influence of Cartesian dualism on the Western academy has been prominent. This paper specifically shows the influence it has had on spatiotemporal boundaries of the self. Monotheistic religions, and also some Eastern religions, hold a metaphysically dualist position. In the context of personal identity, the Simple View takes a similar metaphysical position. This is why many of the defenders of the Simple View hold religious beliefs. “The proponent of the Simple View of personal identity will say that personal identity is an ultimate unanalyzable fact” and “persons are ‘separately existing’ entities, distinct from their brains, bodies, and experiences” (Noonan, 2003, pp. 95-96). Arguments that defend this theory are found in Shoemaker and Swinburne (1984). Ultimately, the self is fundamentally identified as the soul or some immaterial substance. A competing position to the Simple View is the Complex View. This view claims that the self is identifiable by an individual’s brain, body, and experiences.

A proponent of the Complex View will maintain that an informative account of what personal identity consists in is possible, since personal identity is nothing over and above those observable and introspectable facts of physical and psychological continuity which provide the only evidence for it. (Noonan, 2003, pp. 95-96)

Both the Simple View and Complex View are within the scope of Traditional Western Views, because both approaches understand the self as fixed in space and time. From the spatial perspective, the claim is that the self is just one thing, and it can only occupy one space. For the Simple View it is some immaterial substance, and for the Complex View it is some combination of material substances. From the temporal perspective, they claim that the self has a fixed temporal structure. The issue can be understood through the question of whether the self endures or perdures through time.

Endurantism is a theory sometimes referred to as three-dimensionalism. For a self to endure means that a self exists wholly at each time that it exists. In other words, a self does not have any temporal parts. Take the case where person X exists at time t1. X would exist entirely at t1. Then take time t2. If X exists at t2, then X

---

107 Rene Descartes' investigation into what an individual can know for certain is explicated in his Meditations. Though most modern-day philosophers would not agree with his conclusions, the metaphysical questions he raises remain philosophically important. Descartes’ analytic argument explaining the nature of reality supports my claim that Descartes cannot be ignored. He calls into question the idea that matter is all that exists. This is portrayed by his deconstructive methodology. He concludes with the metaphysical position that there are two kinds of stuff: material and non-material, captured by the term Cartesian Dualism.
existed entirely at t1, and then entirely at t2. Perdurantism is the theory that is
sometimes referred to as four-dimensionalism, the fourth dimension referring to
time. To claim that the self perdures means that the self persists through time by a
specific temporal part existing whenever the self exists. In other words, if a self
persists through time it will never exist entirely from time t1 to time t2 because the
amount of temporal parts will be different. It is not the object of this analysis to
settle the issue on which theory is correct. The point I am trying to make is that
temporal structure is a major factor in understanding the self, and from the
description I have provided, it seems to imply that the self has temporal boundaries.
I will conclude this section by reiterating that Traditional Western Views are
committed to the position that the self is fixed in time and space, and that there are
boundaries for what counts as a thing exemplifying a self.

Unorthodox Views

I will now present two contemporary Western ideas of self. I give a brief
overview of each, highlighting key features. I label these contemporary Western
views as the Unorthodox Views because they have been met with much skepticism,
especially from proponents of the Traditional Western View.

It is common to address the idea of self by exploring consciousness.
Consciousness is something that every human is familiar with. We intimately know
it without having a clear understanding of what it actually is. Consciousness is not
something we can forget to have. It is always with us. Even when we think about
times where consciousness is not fully activated, like while dreaming, there is still
some phenomenal experience of what it is like to be in that state. The first
Unorthodox View I will discuss is panpsychism. “The word ‘panpsychism’ literally
means that everything has a mind. However, in contemporary debates it is generally
understood as the view that mentality is fundamental and ubiquitous in the natural
world” (Goff, Seager, & Allen-Hermanson, 2017). There are a variety of theories
that fall into the panpsychism camp. I am using panpsychism as meaning “that
mentality is distributed throughout the natural world—in the sense that all material
objects have parts with mental properties” (Goff et al, 2017). Panpsychists are not
committed to the claim that the Empire State Building, a rock, and chairs are
conscious like humans. It seems that they are committed to the thesis that there is a
fundamental nature to physical things, namely consciousness. The idea is that
everything in the universe has a mental state in which there is something it is like
to be in that state. If panpsychism is right, then physical entities in the universe are
conscious, and that implies “that there is something it is like to be a quark or a
photon or a member of some other fundamental physical type,” even if the degree
of consciousness is minimal (Chalmers, 2017). Though this view is sometimes
dismissed outright as being crazy, this objection alone does not have any merit.
The second Unorthodox View that I will discuss is embodied cognition. The endorsement of embodied cognition has gained momentum in recent literature in the philosophy of mind and in the field of cognitive science. Several contemporary scholars, such as David Chalmers, Andy Clark, Alva Noë, Lawrence Shapiro, Anil Seth, Evan Thompson, and David Vernon, have given attention to this matter, but the seminal work for thinking about embodiment comes from “The Extended Mind” (Clark and Chalmers, 1998).

Clark and Chalmers (1998) argue that cognition extends into the world. To support this claim, they focus on “beliefs embedded in memory,” using the thought experiment Inga and Otto to convince you that “when it comes to belief, there is nothing sacred about skull and skin” (pp. 10-23). Clark and Chalmers thought experiment can be summarized as follows. Inga hears about an event going on at the Museum of Modern Art and wants to attend. She thinks for a moment and remembers that the museum is located on 53rd street. She proceeds to the museum on foot. It is clear that Inga had the belief that the museum is located on 53rd street before she recalled it from her memory. It became an occurrent belief but previously (before she recalled it from memory) it was not. Now consider Otto who suffers from Alzheimer’s disease. It is common for people that suffer from this disease to rely heavily on information in the environment to help bring coherence and structure to their life. Otto is not unique in this respect. He relies on his notebook, which he carries around everywhere, in order to bring structure to his life. When he receives new information, he writes it in his notebook. In fact, this book plays the role of a biological memory. When Otto hears from a friend about an event occurring at the museum, he consults his notebook which indicates that it is located on 53rd street. He proceeds to the museum (1998, pp. 10-23). Clark and Chalmers believe that if the cases for Inga and Otto are analogous, it follows that the mind extends into the environment. However, resistance to this conclusion takes the following forms: the usage of belief in this case is incorrect, information is just in the head, and the access and reliability between Otto and Inga is different. Clark and Chalmers respond to this opposition by arguing that even when differences occur, “these various small differences between Otto’s case and Inga’s case are

---

108 From the analysis of the Traditional Western View, it is clear that cognition is a prominent factor when making sense of the self. For example, scholars that endorse the Complex View may claim that the persistence of the brain is all we need for the persistence of the self. With that said, the recent literature in cognition has shifted away from the thesis that cognition takes place solely inside the skull. David Marr (1982) is partly responsible for this traditional perspective because of the monumental work he did in perception. Marr argues for computationalism, a view that says perception is representational and algorithmic. Although this idea precedes Marr, his work has inspired contemporary progress in the development of artificial intelligence. Ultimately, computationalism reduces human experience to an algorithm that can be uploaded into a machine. This makes strong artificial intelligence plausible. The unsettling conclusions of this view have allowed for alternative theories of cognition to flourish.
shallow differences” (pp. 10-23). At the very least, Clark and Chalmers show that the extended mind thesis should be taken seriously, and it is worth further philosophical attention. If dispositional beliefs are a major factor in our identity as cognitive agents, like Traditional Western Views hold, then the self is extended into the environment. In other words, if we think of the mind as being intimately connected with the self, and we accept Clark and Chalmers’ thesis that the mind is extended, it follows that the self is also extended.

The Traditional Western Views and the Unorthodox Views I have outlined above are so disparate that it is nonsensical to try to understand one using the framework of the other. Because the Traditional Views predate the Unorthodox Views and have elicited so much philosophical attention, the Unorthodox Views, coming later and conflicting with the earlier views, are seen as controversial, and many are skeptical about their plausibility. It will be shown that some of these Unorthodox Views arising from the philosophy of mind bear a close connection to certain Daoist ideas, suggesting that the two share common conceptual resources. In the remainder of this paper, I argue that a focus on certain Daoist ideas may be an appropriate lens to use when analyzing and attempting to further understand the Unorthodox Views.

**Daoist Ideas**

One reason why Traditional Western Views of the self are perhaps not an appropriate lens to use for understanding the Unorthodox Views is because the former requires necessary and sufficient conditions for defining the self, while the conditions remain unclear in the latter views. The Daoist perspective does not make use of these conditions either, which makes it a more suitable framework to use for comparative analysis in order to understand the Unorthodox Views. This becomes evident when understanding Daoist metaphysics and its view on change as fluctuation and alteration as opposed to substantive change. In Daoist texts, the self is described as being vast, extended, transformative, and having the potential to be formless. I will now turn to specific examples within the text and abstract the key features to clarify the Daoist notion of the self.

Transforming occurs in the *Dao De Jing* and the *Zhuangzi*. This should be understood as part of a process. Just as it is the case that Daoists think of change as more of alteration and fluctuation than cause and effect, this idea applies to the idea of the self transforming as well. In many cases it is the result of a meditative practice. Ultimately, transforming supports the importance of meditation practice within Daoism. The *Dao De Jing* and *Zhuangzi* provide “Several passages [that] seem to refer to meditation practice” (Allen, 2014, p. 257). Ames and Hall (2003) goes as far as claiming that the “Daodejing can be read as metaphor for breathing exercises” (p. 90). Breathing exercises are a form of meditation. This practice is important to my investigation of the self because through this practice, according
to Daoist texts, it is possible to transform the self. “Tzû-ch’i of Nan-kuo reclined elbow on armrest, looked up at the sky and exhaled, in a trance as though he had lost the counterpart of himself” (Graham, 2001, p. 48). This example suggests that Tzû-ch’i’s breath provided a transformative experience in which his self was transformed. The use of the word “counterpart” here would seem to suggest that his self is located in two different places, one being the armchair and the other being located in a different space. The possibility of the occurrence of losing a counterpart of one’s self, and not one’s whole self, is evidence that the self is extended in space.

We also find in Daoist texts examples of cognition as being extended. Again, this is possible through meditation. “Allow your ears and eyes to open inward and thereby place yourself beyond your mind’s understanding consciousness” (Ziporyn, p. 27). The term “understanding consciousness” is translated from the Chinese 知 Zhi. The term “means the faculty of cognition in general” and it can also mean “consciousness in the sense of sentience or awareness as such” (Ziporyn, p. 219). Considering this example and understanding the Chinese concept of zhi suggests that Daoism allows for the possibility of cognition to be extended into the world, thereby not only occurring within the brain or skull. Yan Hui tells Confucius in the Zhunagzi (2009) that he sits and forgets. Yan Hui’s description of his experience provides an example of physical transformation worth exploring within our investigation of the self.

‘It’s a dropping away of my limbs and torso, a chasing off of my sensory acuity, which disperses my physical form and outs my understanding until I am the same as the Transforming Openness. This is what I call just sitting and forgetting.’ Confucius said, ‘the same as it? But then you are free of all preference! Transforming? But then you are free of all constancy! You truly are a worthy man! I beg to be accepted as your disciple.’ (p. 49)

Yan Hui undergoes the process of deconstructing himself. He identifies different components of himself by bringing awareness to his body and detaching from it. He continues this process of detachment from his sensory experiences. He ultimately reaches a state where he is outside of form. This idea of the formless is familiar in Daoism.

“One”—there is nothing more encompassing above it, And nothing smaller below it. Boundless, formless! It cannot be names, And returns to the state of no-thing. This is called the formless form. (Henricks, p. 66)
In this context, another word for One is Dao (道). This passage from the Dao De Jing refers to Dao and more specifically Dao-ing. Dao-ing, according to the commentary from Ames and Hall (2003), “will not yield itself up to our most basic categories of location and determination” (p. 97). This means that Dao has no physical boundaries. Therefore, Dao is formless. However, it is also form. This apparent contradiction needs further attention. Daoist metaphysics seeks to justify why this should not be considered a contradiction. To claim that it is difficult to find a consistent metaphysical position within the early Daoist texts is an understatement. Brian Bruya acknowledges that “there are many lacunae with respect to our understanding of explicit and implicit cosmologies of Laozi and Zhuangzi, one thing seems certain: that there is no metaphysical break between human and animal or human and spiritual” (p. 213). Daoist philosophy does not make a distinction between what is artificial and natural or the divine realm and human realm. They believe that everything is natural and a constituent of nature.

The Way gave birth to the One;
The One gave birth to the Two;
The Two gave birth to the Three;
And the Three gave birth to the ten thousand things.
The ten thousand things carry Yin on their backs and wrap their arms around Yang.
Through the blending of ch’i they arrive at a state of harmony. (Henricks, 1989, p. 11)

This chapter represents the oneness of all things. All things in the universe are fundamentally Dao. “Daoism construes oneness and manyness as interdependent ways of looking at the process of experience” (Ames and Hall, p 142). Daoism does not make the distinction between One, Two, or the many as indicated in the Zhuangzi when it says that “Heaven and earth are born together with me, and the ten thousand things and I are one” (Ziporyn, p. 15). This metaphysical position, therefore, nullifies the above apparent contradiction of form and formless. It also provides insight into the plausibility of Yan Hui’s transformation from sitting and forgetting because if everything is One, the detachment from physical components of the body will not destroy the self, thereby suggesting that the self extends beyond the confines of our physical being.

Death

In order to elaborate on the transformative nature of the self in Daoism, it is helpful to think about the experience of death, especially because there is textual insight on this matter. When the flow of life (sheng or 生) perishes, is that the end
of the existence of our self? Within the Daosit perspective, this does not seem to be the case. It has already been explained that Daoist metaphysics consist of one thing and not two, so for a self to perish throughout the transformative experience of death seems inaccurate. To even begin to understand death of the self from the Daoist perspective, it seems that we must release our traditional conception of what it means to die and adopt the view that death is just another transformative experience. It is for this reason that Daoists do not conceive of death as a negative event. Just as it is the case that we are ignorant of our existence before we transformed into our current life, we are also ignorant of the transformation we will undergo in the next. “Having already transformed into some particular being, he takes it as no more than a waiting for the next transformation into the unknown, nothing more” (Ziporyn, p. 47). This conception of death is different from Traditional Western Views, where the problem of persistence focuses on whether or not the same self persists over time. In Daoism, this is a non-issue. It is not relevant to the notion of the self to consider it as persisting over time, but rather how it is identified in this transformative process. It remains unclear if the Unorthodox Views of panpsychism and extended mind need to answer the problem of persistence. This could support my claim that they share a conceptual framework. If this is the case, it would seem that the Daoist perspective is a more appropriate lens than the Traditional Western views for further analyzing the Unorthodox Views.

‘Ugh!’ The maker of things still goes on turning me into this crumpled thing. ‘Do you hate it?’ ‘No, why should I hate it? Little by little he’ll borrow my left arm to transform it into a cock, and it will be why I am listening to a cock-crow at dawn. Little by little he’ll borrow my right arm to transform it into a crossbow, and it will be why I am waiting for a roasted owl for my dinner. (Graham, p. 88)

In this example, Master Yu is explaining to Master Ssu that whatever transformation may come, he will identify that thing as his self. Master Yu makes no value judgment on which form is preferred. He seems to recognize the reality of “the transformation of all things” and this should be understood as including the self (Ziporyn, p.27).

Transcendence

Introducing the Chinese interpretation of transcendence is another way of investigating the concept of the self, especially as it pertains to what happens to the self during death and while taking up multiple perspectives. Because various ideological movements have used disparate concepts of transcendence in their
worldviews, the term has become ambiguous (Barrett, 2011). The Chinese connotation with respect to transcendence takes a naturalist form. In the West, Christianity heavily influences the way people conceive of transcendence. In this context, when a person dies, a self transcends (goes beyond) the human realm to a divine realm. This contrasts with the Chinese understanding, which posits that there is no other realm than the human realm. Therefore, to transcend the self is to go beyond your current self, but it does not mean to transcend nature or Dao. This is consistent with the Daoist view that metaphysics consists of One, not Two. Another way to understand transcendence as it applies to the self is to analyze this idea of the existence of multiple perspectives. In the West, people’s perspective is their own. When someone tries to take up another person’s perspective, they do so from their own perceptive. It is not the case that they completely lose their perspective and adopt an entirely new one. This subtle distinction is important because there are examples in the Daoist texts that seem to imply the possibility of completely adopting a new perspective, and this ultimately supports the notion of the self as being extended, transformative, and vast.

‘This’ is also a ‘that.’ ‘That’ is also a ‘this.’ ‘THAT’ posits a ‘this’ and a ‘that’—a right and a wrong—of its own. But ‘THIS’ also posits a ‘this’ and a ‘that’—a right and wrong—of its own. So is there really any ‘that’ versus ‘this,’ any right versus wrong? Or is there really no ‘that’ versus ‘this’? When ‘this’ and ‘that’—right and wrong—are no longer coupled as opposites—that is called the Course as Axis, the axis of course. (Ziporyn, 2009, p. 12)

Daoism explicitly argues for the existence of multiple perspectives within the universe, which this passage illustrates. People perceive something from their own perspective or their “this,” but with every “this” there is a “that.” There is further textual support when considering multiple perspectives in altered states such as dreams

You temporarily get involved in something or other and proceed to call it myself—but how can we know if what we call ‘self’ has any ‘self’ to it? You dream you are a bird and find yourself soaring in the heavens, you dream you are a fish and find yourself submerged in the depths. I cannot even know if what I’m saying now is a dream or not. (Ziporyn, p.48)

A third example of the idea of multiple perspectives in Daoist text is displayed in Zhuang Zhou’s dream.
Once Zhuang Zhou dreamt he was a butterfly, fluttering about joyfully just as a butterfly would. He followed his whims exactly as he liked and knew nothing about Zhuang Zhou. Suddenly he awoke, and there he was, the startled Zhuang Zhou in the flesh. He did not know if Zhou had been dreaming he was a butterfly, or if a butterfly was now dreaming it was Zhou. Surely, Zhou and a butterfly count as two distinct identities! Such is what we call the transformation of one thin thing into another. (Ziporyn, 2009, p.21)

This example is in partial agreement with some of the ideas described in the Unorthodox Views because it implies that cognition is extended into the environment. However, these examples demonstrate how people can take multiple perspectives a step further by suggesting that it is possible to literally take up the perspective of other creatures. The word perspective has a Latin root that means “look through.” To have a perspective implies that some form of perception is occurring. If perception is occurring, then this is a form of cognition. Therefore, Daoist thought is claiming that cognition is extended into the world. Furthermore, these examples imply just how vast the nature of the self should be understood because of the extension of the self.

**Qi**

The term “qi” can be translated as vital energy, energy, or matter. It is the Daoist belief that qi is the essence of everything in the universe. Daoism takes qi to be everywhere and in all things. It can also be translated as breath or life force.

It was originally taken as one kind of stuff, connected with air and breath, but it eventually became the dominant label for the basic stuff of the world, used to explain all kinds of dynamic processes, from the formation of heaven and earth to the patterns of weather to the processes of the human heart. It was closely connected with life and the generative power of nature. (Perkins, 2016)

Qi is used often in both the ancient literature and contemporary Daoist literature. In many cases it is used in the context of longevity. By circulating qi it “enable[s] us to maximize our potency and invigorate our minds” (Ames, 2003, p. 90). However, some scholars have developed different interpretations of this concept. Brian Bruya (adopted from Jane Geaney) characterizes an early Chinese perspective of qi that is slightly different from the previous description.

A human being receives information about the external world not only through the five senses but also through the perception of the flowing of qi,
Perception deals with information. This example gives an alternative to the idea that information is only accessed through our senses. According to this interpretation, there is an association between qi and information. The Daoist belief is that qi is ubiquitous. If qi can be reduced to information, then information is also ubiquitous. If this is indeed the case, this provides insight for theorizing meaningfully about the Unorthodox Views such as, in a certain context, one form of panpsychism called Integrated Information Theory that is represented in the work of Guilio Tononi (2012). The main point here is not the specifics of Tononi’s view, but an awareness of the fact that some of the Unorthodox Views, such as Tononi’s believe information is essential to understanding consciousness and the self. The accumulation and manipulation of qi might be a way of theorizing about how the structure of information gives rise to consciousness.

**Objections and Replies**

I acknowledge that there could be potential objections to this paper. First, one could say that it is a mistake to conflate the Simple View and Complex View into the Traditional Western Views. I agree that these two views amount to very different positions. However, the main purpose for my categorization was to show that there is contrasting methodological approaches to the notion of the self between the Traditional Western Views and the Unorthodox Views. One major difference in approach lies with the extension of the self. The Traditional Western Views think it is fixed and the Unorthodox Views think it is extended. Therefore, the approach is completely different when considering the spatiotemporal boundaries.

Another objection I foresee is that my conception of qi is misguided. This does not seem to amount to much because the main point of that analysis was to identify the connection between qi and information. Once that connection is made, the ground for philosophical exploration into consciousness becomes fruitful. We see support of this from the possibility of manipulating or combining qi in order to have a different form of consciousness.

Finally, it is a valid criticism to suggest that I am construing panpsychism and the extended mind thesis as more similar than they actually are. I recognize that these two theories have similarities but amount to very different positions. An adequate development of these two theories lies outside the scope of this paper. However, if it is acknowledged that these two views fundamentally contrast the way I characterized the Traditional Western Views, then it is reasonable to suggest that using Daoist ideas is a meaningful way to theorize about these Unorthodox...
Views. Therefore, even if the particular Daoist ideas of the self being vast, extended, and transformative do not apply entirely to panpsychism or the extended mind, these terms can still inform our thinking about these views.

Conclusion

Starting with the analysis of Traditional Western Views, it was shown that the self is conceived of as fixed in time and space. When this is the case, problems such as the persistence of the self occurs. Recent literature in the philosophy of mind and cognitive sciences have called into question traditional views concerning cognition, consciousness, and self. In this paper, I have not tried to resolve all the skepticism towards the Unorthodox Views. I have instead extracted key ideas from the primary texts of Daoism to show that the self can be understood as vast, extended, transformative, and has the potential to be formless, which I claim helps us theorize about Unorthodox Views.

From the Daoist perspective, theories or ideas that are considered in the Unorthodox Views are far from radical or crazy. It may be the case that a Daoist would endorse such views. The Daoist ideas that I have presented in this paper should specifically give structure to theorizing about panpsychism and the extended mind thesis because of the shared conceptual resources. Although my approach uses Daoist ideas to help bridge the conceptual gap between the traditional and the more radical views of self in the West, I see no reason for this approach to be exclusive. We could use the ideas of the Unorthodox Views to theorize about Daoist ideas. Ultimately, if we want to resolve fundamental problems with the self that the Traditional View has been stuck on for centuries, we should consider endorsing the Unorthodox Views. Since theories within the category of Unorthodox Views are in the infant stages, compared to those encompassed by the Traditional View, it is difficult to theorize about them. Therefore, it is difficult to advance these views. Using Daoist ideas, I have provided one such avenue for advancing these Unorthodox Views.

References

Bruya, B. J. (2010). The rehabilitation of spontaneity: a new approach in
Royalist Propaganda: Fabrication of Magna Farta

By Daniel R. Palthe

ABSTRACT: This paper examines the perception and usage of Magna Carta in interregnum England. The central question is whether or not Oliver Cromwell ever referred to this royal document as the "Magna Farta." While one of the most common posthumous charges against him was a disdain for Magna Carta and English rights, accounts of his calling it a "Magna Farta" are questionable. The ways in which the Magna Carta was actually used under Cromwell rather seems to indicate a different opinion. Essentially, this paper compares royalist propaganda with the Commonwealth's accounts.
Lord Protector Oliver Cromwell is often cited by scholars and politicians as referring to Magna Charta as the "Magna Farta." It makes us wonder how exactly a compact between the English people and the monarchy, which the Commonwealth of England abolished, fit into the young republic's policies. In reality, however, Lord Protector Cromwell never said anything against Magna Charta, but respected it as England's first great step towards a constitution. Whether he was the Royalists' tyrant or the Parliamentarians' champion of the people, Lord Protector Cromwell believed he fought under the authority of the Common Law.

One of the places in which Lord Protector Cromwell is accused of saying "Magna Farta" is in Royalist propaganda. With printing easy and not too expensive, seventeenth-century Britain was flooded by pamphlets from supporters both of Parliament and of the Crown. Anyone could have things printed, though not always legally. At the end of the Protectorate, a pamphlet by the name of *The English Devil: or, Cromwel and his Monstrous Witch Discover'd at White-Hall* was published for a man named George Horton. This pamphlet describes Cromwell as a tyrant who murdered the king and stole the throne. On its very first page, it mentions "Magna Farta."

The whole Nation was enchained in a more than Egyptian Bondage: who compelled to submit to this Tyrant Noi, or be cut off by him; nothing but a word and a blow, his Will was his Law; tell him of Magna Charta, he would lay his hand on his sword, and cry Magna Farta.

By this Horton means that Cromwell had enslaved the nation and ruled as he saw fit. If Magna Charta was to be cited in defense against him, he would defy it.

George Horton's pamphlet makes grave accusations but presents no evidence. He gives no time or place for Cromwell's dismissal of Magna Charta, but only says "he would." A lot of pamphlets were printed in 1660, and this is just one of many. We do not even know who George Horton is. He had many pamphlets printed including a Royalist periodical called *The Faithful Post*. Here is an example from an early spring issue from 1653.

The States of Holland are very busie in consulting of an Answer to the Letter sent from the K. of Scots, written with his own hand; wherein he condoles with them their great Defeat at sea, and desires he may have a Squadron of good ships to bear his flag, and that then He would serve in person at sea against the English. This is wel referred by many; and the Royalists give out, That He shall be taken in with all His Titles of Great

---

Brittain, To. In the meantime the Ministers and common people are set on to sail against the present Government in England, crying out, *that they ought to joyn with him against the Parliament*; besides, they fancy him a considerable party among the Highlanders, which will be able to shuffle the Cards with the English in Scotland, whilsts they play the Game at Sea.\(^\text{110}\)

In 1653 the Stuart royal family attempted to take back the English throne by force with Scottish troops, but would ultimately be defeated by the Protectorate. This issue details the attempt of Prince Charles to gain Dutch support to "joyn with him against the Parliament." Evidently Horton was printing Royalist propaganda in London even in the heyday of the Protectorate. He is today, however, an unknown pamphleteer and we have no record of him aside from his name on his pamphlets, so what he has written must be read with scrutiny.

As for the content of the pamphlet, it is a passionate mess of slander. Propaganda is not known to be factual, and the pamphlet says things Horton had no way of knowing for certain. For example, he speaks with authority about Cromwell's motives.

He hated all Learning, and the Learned, because his Crimes were so black and horrid, that they went far beyond the mercy of the Book. He granted a tolleration for all Religions, because his own was to choose; and that he might not offend the Tender Consciences of his pretended Zealots and Favorites, who were true Vassels to the Lust and Villainy of such an Imperious Usurper.\(^\text{111}\)

Horton offers no proof of these accusations, and the only proof one could really have of Cromwell's motives would be the words of Cromwell himself. Propaganda is not a reliable enough source of evidence to say Cromwell indeed said "Magna Farta" at all.

The only reputable account of Cromwell's distaste for the *Magna Charta* comes from volume seven of *The History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England* by Edward Hyde, Earl of Clarendon. Hyde writes that Cromwell acted without regard for the ancient laws and gives the example of a man who was sent to prison by Cromwell because he refused to pay a tax. The man, named 'Cony,' was summoned by Cromwell who tried to persuade him to pay the tax, but the man insisted that the tax is illegal. When he came to trial, the man's defenders brought the common law against his charges.

\(^{110}\) George Horton. "The sum of all Intelligence form the English and Dutch Fleets." *The Faithful Post* 1 Apr. 1653 [London].

\(^{111}\) Horton, *English Devil*, 4-5.
Maynard, who was of council with the prisoner, demanded his liberty with great confidence, both upon the illegality of the commitment, and the illegality of the imposition, as being laid without any lawful authority. The Judges could not maintain or defend either, and enough declared what their sentence would be; and therefore the protector's attorney required a farther day, to answer what had been urged. Before that day, Maynard was committed to the Tower, for presuming to question or make doubt of his authority; and the judges were sent for, and severely reprehended for suffering that licence; when they, with all humility, mentioned the law and magna charta, Cromwell told them, with terms of contempt and derision, "their magna f----- should not control his actions; which he knew were for the safety of the commonwealth."\textsuperscript{112}

Here Hyde clearly tells us that Cromwell did not care what Magna Charta says he can and cannot do, and actually said "magna f----." Hyde's history is considered the most comprehensive contemporary account of the English Civil War, and most historians do not question this account, but that does not mean that it is entirely true.

There are several problems with Edward Hyde's account. First of all, he gives no specific information about the event, such as date or even year. He does not name the tax, or which court session it was questioned in, and only names the accused as 'Cony.' He gives no direct quotation, and could not anyway, because he was not there. If this is a true story, it is not a firsthand account, because Edward Hyde was not even in the country when Cromwell ruled. After the Royalists lost the battle of Torrington in 1646, he fled with Prince Charles to Jersey and did not return to England until the Restoration after Cromwell's death.\textsuperscript{113}

We also must take into account Edward Hyde's bias against Cromwell. Initially, Hyde was a member of Parliament and was angry with Charles I. He was particularly furious about the Earl Marshal's Court, which he found unlawful. It was a court which handled only cases in which the nobility was slandered. He also opposed the Council of the North. Hyde equally defended the king's power to check the rapidly growing power of Long Parliament and opposed the Grand Remonstrance. He hoped to reconcile with the monarchy instead of abolishing it and would eventually become unofficial advisor to the king.\textsuperscript{114}

Hyde continued to mediate between the King and Parliament until it was clear that Charles I had lost, and he was asked to flee with the teenaged Prince


\textsuperscript{114} Miller, 2-8.
Charles. After the death of Charles I, Hyde joined the young heir in France and became his chief advisor. For years he worked in exile to keep the Royalists together by corresponding with Royalists in Britain and by looking for support from other monarchs in Christendom. He was instrumental in the Restoration of Charles II and gained the king support in Parliament.\footnote{Miller, 10-15.} Hyde was closely tied to the royal family and was the most active Royalist during the Interregnum; he and Cromwell were natural enemies. It is likely Hyde that would not scrutinize too deeply correspondence claiming that Cromwell went against Magna Charta.

Hyde’s \textit{History} was also commissioned by Charles II, the same Charles II who had Cromwell exhumed and hanged after the monarchy was restored. To further the Royalist cause, Hyde began writing his account in 1646 on the island of Scilly before even reaching Jersey.

As soon as I found myself alone, I thought the best way to provide myself for new business against the time I should be called to it ... was to look over the faults of the old; and so I resolved ... to write a history of these evil times.\footnote{Edward Hyde, \textit{Clarendon State Papers}, 2:228.}

Hyde intended the \textit{History} to serve as a reminder of the errors that led to the Rebellion and teach how a king should avoid them.

His first volume, called the "prolegomenon," catalogues the mistakes of the Royalists and is not meant to be a scholarly history. It begins in 1625 with the death of James I and notes the king’s mistakes in the use of Parliament. The second volume covers the Scottish wars and notes how the members of Parliament turned against Charles I. The third volume bridges the gap between the second Scots war and the first civil war and analyses the workings of Long Parliament. The fourth volume is full of summarized documents instead of only complete ones and only serves as a justification for the Royalists. To only include full documents would be counterproductive, as the volume would be a many thousand pages longer and not make its point; Hyde’s \textit{History} was not meant to be an infallible document but a warning. It was not until he returned to finish the \textit{History} in the 1670s that he decided it should be a historical work.\footnote{Miller, 25-31, passim.} His \textit{History} does not rely on factual but on descriptive accounts to support its narrative, which is why it should not be accepted as infallible.

It is suspicious that the only accounts of the Lord Protector insulting Magna Charta come from the Royalists. It is unlikely that this event would be overlooked by Cromwell’s supporters in their accounts. It would also be surprising if Cromwell

\begin{footnotes}
\item[115] Miller, 10-15.
\item[117] Miller, 25-31, passim.
\end{footnotes}
said the word 'fart' at all. Cromwell was a Puritan after all, and Puritans strictly avoided swearing and cursing.\textsuperscript{118} Even Edward Hyde censored the word 'farta' in his \textit{History}; a Puritan would consider the word too vulgar for a good Christian. Aside from another Royalist pamphlet which accuses Cromwell of referring to the Petition of Right as the "Petition of Shite," there is no confirmable account of Cromwell swearing or cursing.\textsuperscript{119}

In the government of the English Commonwealth, we do not see Magna Charta being cast aside or criticized. We actually see Magna Charta being used in legal discussions and regarded in a positive light. We have two petitions to Cromwell using Magna Charta to support their arguments. First, we have the petition to Cromwell from 1655 titled \textit{The humble Petition of the Prisoners in the FLEET}, which asks Cromwell to protect the debtors from unlawful imprisonment, as is called for in Magna Charta clause nine.

Neither we nor our bailiffs will seize any land or revenue for any debt, so long as the chattels of the debtor are sufficient to repay the debt; nor shall the sureties of that of that debtor be distrained so long as the chief debtor is himself able to pay the debt. And if the chief debtor, having nothing with which to pay, defaults in payment of the debts, the sureties shall be responsible for the debt; and, if they wish, they shall have the lands and revenues of the debtor until satisfaction is made to them for the debt which they previously paid on his behalf, unless the chief debtor proves that he is quit of such responsibility toward the said sureties.\textsuperscript{120}

This clause prevents debtors from having their land or freedom taken as long as they have the means to repay their debt. This provision had been broken several times during the reigns of the kings, and now that Cromwell was Lord Protector, the petitioners believed he could repeal all laws that went against Magna Charta, such as \textit{Capias Vtlegatum}, which had been used by the king to arrest subjects in civil disputes without due process.

Now if that long Expected yeare of Jubile to the oppressed Captives become, that they may be at last Delivered out of their more then \textit{Ægyptian} slavery and bondage, and restored to their ancient \textit{Lawes}, and precious \textit{Liberty}; wee humbly hope your \textit{Highness} will manifest your Selfe the Vindicator of the ancient \textit{Lawes} and \textit{Liberties} of the people in generall, and Conservator of the \textit{Great Charter}; and will be pleased to Answer all and

\textsuperscript{119} E. D. \textit{A True Relation of the State of the Case Between the ever Honourable Parliament and the Officers of the Army} (London: J. C., 1659), 13.
\textsuperscript{120} Magna Charta, Clause 9.
whatsoever Innovators, with that memorable Negative, of A nolumus mutare Leges Anglie; and restore the ancient Law and proceedings for Recovery of Debts, and take away the Capias in all Civill causes, which will be a most Honourable and just Ordinance, and prejudicall to none; for the Ancient and laudable proceedings were more remediall to Creditors then that barbarous Imprisonment of the Debtor is or can bee; for if the Debtor be worth nothing, it is against the Law of GOD, Nature, and Nations, that he should live all his dayes in the grave of Prison; whereby he is deprived of Friends, and disabled for ever by any Industry in his Calling to attaine to any Estate, wherewith to make satisfaction to his Creditors or prosecute for his owne, but is forced to spend his time most unprofitably in Prison, and waste what ever he hath or can come by for his necessary subsistance (in a very Wofull condition) which is well hoped, will not only be pittied but remedied by the Mercy and Justice of your Highness.\footnote{121 The humble Petition of the Prisoners in the FLEET. N.p.: T. Forcet, 1655.}

The petitioners ask Cromwell to do away with Capias warrants in noncriminal cases and to uphold Magna Charta because it is right in all ancient laws including natural and Biblical laws and he should not let it be changed as the kings have before. They even ask him to respond to "innovators" in the traditional Latin phrase "A nolumus mutare Leges Angliae" ("A nolimus" is likely a misprint as it should be "sic nolimus") meaning, "We do not wish to change the Laws of England."

The more noteworthy petition is the Epistola Medio-Saxonica, or, Middlesex first Letter to his Excellency, The Lord General Cromwell from 1653. His title changed to Lord Protector in 1653, but that was only on the 16th of December so it is not strange that a petition written that year would still refer to him as 'Lord General.' This petition used Magna Charta to argue to Cromwell that the collection of tithes is contrary to Common Law. The clause the petitioners cite in their defense is clause thirty-nine.

\begin{quote}
No freeman shall be captured or imprisoned or disseised of any free tenement or liberties or free customs or outlawed or exiled or in any way destroyed, nor will we go against him or send against him, except by the lawful judgment of his peers or by the law of the land.\footnote{122 Magna Charta, Clause 39.}
\end{quote}

The petitioners argue that tithes are included in "free tenement," and therefore no freeman should be required by law to pay them.
Tithes as well as the rest did belong to every mans Tenement and Free-hold, and so far were the Clergy at the time from claiming any Tithes to be due unto them by any Custom, as that, on the contrary, it is acknowledged at the Councill of Lateran, under Gregory the 10th. Anno 1274. and in the Decretal Epistle sent from Pope Innocent the 3d. to the Arch-Bishop of Canterbury, about the year 1215. that the people of this Nation did by a general Custome till then observed, dispose of their Tithes according to their own free will and pleasure. So that it is very clear at the confirmation of the Magna Charta, no Custome of the Land for Clergy-men to have Tithes out of every Proprietors Estate, but that they were the proper right and inheritance of the owner of the Land.  

The petitioners hold that the tithe is not defended as a right of the clergy and the Church had acknowledged it not long after the signing of Magna Charta. Fortunately, we have a response to this petition in the form of A Treatise of Tithes. It argues for the ancientness of the tithe in England and that it has been confirmed many times by the Church and Parliament. It agrees that before the Lateran Council tithes were freely given, but that was five hundred years earlier so tithes were ancient enough to be common law. The Treatise questions the logic in questioning an institution which has been ordained by a law and has been in existence for centuries and been ratified numerous times in Parliament. It catalogues Acts of Parliament and first notes a Magna Charta clause which defends their position.

We have in the first place granted to God and by this our present charter have confirmed, for us and our heirs forever, that the English Church shall be free and shall have its rights entire and its liberties inviolate.  

Classifying the tithe as one of the rights of the Church, they make the clause that protects it the very first clause of Magna Charta, thereby making the tithe the first thing the Magna Charta protects. The author concludes that it is the petitioner who has gone against Magna Charta.

So that he that penned that Letter is cleerly out, when he denyeth the Right of Ecclesiasticall persons to Tithes at the making of that Statute; and the Arguments used by him against Tithes, because he pretends them to be against Magna Charta, are cleerly against himself, and for the payment of

---

124 Magna Charta, Clause 1.
Tithes; for they were then, and before the Churches Right; and so confirmed by *Magna Charta* cap. I.\(^{125}\)

He ends certain that he is entirely in the right because he believes *Magna Charta* supports him. He tells the reader this was written to clear up anything misleading about what *Magna Charta* says about the tithe and that both Parliament and *Magna Charta* are on his side.

A member of Parliament named August Wingfield responds to this response in *Vindiciae Medio-Saxonicae, or, Tithes totally Routed, by Magna Charta*. He attacks the author of the *Treatise’s* reasoning and use of *Magna Charta* directly twice and insists that the tithe is absolutely against Common Law.

And first for proof thereof he saith *pag. 14*. That by the Common Law of this Land, at the confirmation of *Magna Charta*, Ecclesiastical persons had remedy to recover their Tithes in the Spiritual Court, and then concludes, that the Law gives no remedy but where there is a right: which assertion is very untrue. For *Cook* upon Tithes saith, That by the Common Law Lands are undecimable, and if undecimable, then certainly by that Law there can be no Church rights to Tithes, neither to be recovered by virtue thereof in the Spiritual, or Popes Court, Since the people of *England* were not bound in Law by his Cannons. Neither is *Shelden* so. 291 saith, That Arbitrary disposition of Tithes used by the Laity, as we *de jure*, of right, (as the positive Law then received and practz’d was) as *de facto*, of deed and practise, is that which *Wickess* remembred in his Complaint to the King and Parliament under *R. 2*. The subsance whereof in brief, is, That the proud and pompous Priests did constrain the poor People of *England* (*vix. by Popish Canons*) to pay their Tithes unto them, whereas within a few years before, they paid their Tithes and Offrings at their own free will and pleasure.\(^{126}\)

He cites Sir Edward Coke, the great scholar of *Magna Charta* from the early seventeenth century, that English lands are “indecimable” (unable to be tithed) and that the Common Law cannot be overruled by Spiritual or Canon Law. He also notes that before Richard II, tithes were paid freely, and the legal tithe is not ancient at all.

---

\(^{125}\) *A Treatise if Tithes* (London: S. F., 1653).

But he objecteth and saith, That Tithes are contained in these words, *The Churches Rights, Mag. Char. cap. I.* for further satisfaction whereof, see *Cooks* exposition upon the very same words, where he saith, that Ecclesiastical persons shall enjoy their lawfull jurisdictions, and other rights (but not one word of Tithes) without diminution, and that no new Rights were given unto them hereby, but such as they had before confirmed: Now if no new Rights were given, then not Tithes, since the Author of the said Treatise confesseth *p. 14.* that the Common Right of Tithes due to the Rector of the Parish, is but from the time of K. John, and then, as M. *Selden* (whom he quoteth) *p. 146.* declareth, not so much as in opinion established, whereby it is evident, not onely by *Selden* and his own confession, but also in the judgment of *Cook,* that at the confirmation of *Magna Charta,* Tithes were not at all comprehended in the Rights of the Church.\(^{127}\)

Again Wingfield cites Coke and agrees that the Church shall have all the rights due to them by the law but no new rights.

Whether or not the petitioners were in the right, it is clear that *Magna Charta* still had a place in English law during the Interregnum. It was, after all, Charles I’s overstepping of his legal bounds that eventually led to the English Civil War which created the Commonwealth, just as John I overstepped his legal bounds and created the need for *Magna Charta.* As in 1215, the Petition of Right was drafted in 1628 to curb illegal collection of funds by the Crown. In writing the Petition of Right, the House of Commons falls back upon *Magna Charta* to support the legitimacy of their assertions. Were it not for the authority Parliament took from *Magna Charta,* Charles I might have never been overthrown.

Edward Coke and the House of Commons drafted the Petition of Right as a response to Charles I’s exorbitant spending on the Thirty Years’ War. Parliament had refused many of the extra taxes that Charles I proposed and so he had forced his subjects to give him loans. Both the House of Commons and the House of Lords would not stand for it and put forward the Petition of Right to check Charles I’s infractions.

The Petition of Right refers to the *Statutum de Tallagio non Concedendo* that no king may extract money from his subjects without their consent and argues that the forced loans were contrary to this. It then refers to *Magna Charta* in defense of those arrested by Charles I for refusing to give these forced loans.

And where also, by the statute call the Great Charter of the Liberties of England, it is declared and enacted that no freeman may be taken or imprisoned, or be outlawed or exiled or in any manner destroyed, but by the

\(^{127}\) Wingfield, 3-4.
lawful judgment of his peers or by the law of the land; and in the eight-and-twentieth year of the reign of King Edward III it was declared and enacted by authority of parliament that no man, of what estate or condition that he be, should be put out of his land or tenements, nor taken, nor imprisoned, nor disherited, nor put to death, without being brought to answer by due process of law: nevertheless, against the tenor of the said statutes and other the good laws and statutes of your realm to that end provided, divers of your subjects have of late been imprisoned without any cause showed; and when for their deliverance they were brought before your justices by your majesty's writs of *habeas corpus*, there to undergo and receive as the court should order, and their keepers commanded to certify the causes of their detainer, no cause was certified, but that they were detained by your majesty's special command, signified by the lords of your privy council; and yet were returned back to several prisons, without being charged with anything to which they might make answer according to the law.\(^{128}\)

Charles I's imprisonment of his subjects without trial went against Magna Charta's clause thirty-nine (the same clause cited by the author of *Epistola Medio-Saxonica*). The king cannot legally overrule the judgment of the peers of the accused, but he continued to do so anyway.

Charles I had also been executing prisoners and housing troops in civilian homes as is only allowed during time of martial law.

And whereas of the late great companies of soldiers and mariners have been dispersed into divers counties of the realm, and the inhabitants against their wills have been compelled to receive them into their houses, and there to suffer them to sojourn, against the laws and customs of this realm, and to the great grievance and vexation of the people: and whereas also, by authority of parliament in the five-and-twentieth year of the reign of King Edward III, it is declared and enacted that no man should be forejudged of life or limb against the form of the Great Charter and the law of the land; and, by the said Great Charter and other laws and statutes of this your realm, no man ought to be adjudged to death but by the laws established in this your realm, either by the customs of the same realm or by acts of parliament; and whereas no offender of what kind soever is exempted from the proceedings to be used, and punishments to be inflicted by the laws and statutes of this your realm: nevertheless of late divers commissions under your majesty's great seal have issued forth, by which certain persons have been assigned and appointed commissioners, with power and authority to

\(^{128}\) Petition of Right, 1628.
proceed within the land according to the justice of martial law against such soldiers or mariners or other dissolute persons joining with them, as should commit any murder, robbery, felony, mutiny, or other outrage or misdemeanor whatsoever, and by such summary course and order as is agreeable to martial law and as is used in armies in time of war, to proceed to the trial and condemnation of such offenders, and them to cause to be executed and put to death according to the law martial; by pretext whereof some of your majesty's subjects have been by some of the said commissioners put to death, when and where, if by the laws and statutes of the land they had deserved death, by the same laws and statutes also they might, and by no other ought to have been, adjudged and executed; and also sundry grievous offenders, by colour thereof claiming an exemption, have escaped the punishments due to them by the laws and statutes of this your realm, by reason that divers of your officers and ministers of justice have unjustly refused or forborne to proceed against such offenders according to the same laws and statutes, upon pretence that the said offenders were punishable only by martial law and by authority of such commissions as aforesaid; which commissions and all other of like nature are wholly and directly contrary to the said laws and statutes of this your realm.\(^{129}\)

The Petition of Right here makes it unlawful for the king to quarter troops in the homes of his subjects and to use martial law during times of peace. Although no specific clause of Magna Charta forbids the quartering of troops in civilian homes or the use of martial law in the time of peace, these provisions were necessary to prevent the king from going around the laws of Magna Charta. The Petition of Right would only be the first of many struggles between the House of Commons and Charles I. In 1649 it would be the House of Commons that executed Charles I as a traitor.

Young Oliver Cromwell was actually a member of Parliament in 1628, and at twenty-nine years old delivered his first speech in the House of Commons. From then on, his career was focused on defending the Common Law and the liberties of the people of England. Although he rarely mentioned Magna Charta, he saw it as the first step towards a written constitution. Cromwell mentions Magna Charta in his first speech to Parliament as Lord Protector of England in 1654.

In every government there must be somewhat fundamental, somewhat like a *Magna Charta*, that should be standing and be unalterable. Where there is a stipulation on one part, and that full accepted, as appears by what hath been said, surely a return ought

\(^{129}\) Ibid.
to be: else what does that stipulation signify? If I have upon the terms aforesaid undertaken this great trust, and exercised it, and by it called you, surely it ought to be owned.\textsuperscript{130}

At this point in his speech, the Lord Protector is actually calling for a written constitution. His acknowledgement of Magna Charta shows his respect for the document and its fundamental strength to protect the Common Law.

There was already a written constitution in England by the time of this speech. The Instrument of Government was the first written constitution in English history and had been codified the day before his installation as Lord Protector on the sixteenth of December 1653, but Cromwell did not believe it was adequate. The Instrument of Government was based on proposals for a constitutional agreement with Charles I in 1647 when it was still likely that the king would have been allowed to remain on the throne. The Instrument of Government created the role of Lord Protector to take the place of the king as ruler of England.\textsuperscript{131} It gave Cromwell power, but it did not protect every fundamental that he believed should be protected.

Cromwell continues his speech by describing what should be fundamental in the constitution of the Protectorate.

That Parliaments should not make themselves perpetual is a fundamental. Of what assurance is a law to prevent so great an evil, if it lie in one or the same legislator to unlaw it again? Is this like to be lasting? It will be like a rope of sand; it will give no security, for the same men may unbuild what they have built.\textsuperscript{132}

Here he says Parliaments should end so they do not change the law too often. If members of Parliament had lifetime positions, they would become too powerful. Cromwell was especially wary of the growing power in Parliament.

Is it not Liberty of Conscience in religion a fundamental? So long as there is liberty of conscience for the supreme magistrate to exercise his conscience in erecting what form of church-government he is satisfied he should set up, why should not he give it to others? Liberty of conscience is a natural right; and he that would have it

\textsuperscript{131} Roy Sherwood, Oliver Cromwell: King in all but Name (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997), 1, 2.
\textsuperscript{132} Ibid.
ought to give it, having liberty to settle what he likes for the public.\textsuperscript{133}

He lays freedom of religion here as a fundamental, so long as it is not Catholic or Arminian.

Indeed, that hath been one of the vanities of our contests. Every sect saith, Oh! Give me liberty. But give him it, and to his power he will not yield it to anybody else. Where is our ingenuity? Truly, that's a thing ought to be very reciprocal. The magistrate hath his supremacy, and he may settle religion according to his conscience. And I may say it to you, I can say it: All the money of this nation would not have tempted men to fight upon such an account as they have engaged, if they had not had hopes of liberty, better than they had from Episcopacy, or than would have been afforded them from a Scottish Presbytery, or an English either, if it had made such steps or been as sharp and rigid as it threatened when it was first set up.\textsuperscript{134}

This I say is a fundamental. It ought to be so: it is for us, and the generations to come. And if there be an absoluteness in the imposer, without fitting allowances and exceptions from the rule, we shall have our people driven into wildernesses, as they were when those poor and afflicted people, that forsook their estates and inheritances here, where they lived plentifully and comfortably, for the enjoyment of their liberty, and we necessitated to go into a vast howling wilderness in New England, where they have for liberty sake stript themselves of all their comfort and the full enjoyment they had, embracing rather loss of friends and want, than to be so ensnared and in bondage.\textsuperscript{135}

Because liberty is the fundamental right of all men, they will readily give their lives for it. Whether it be in war or an untamed land, people will risk their lives to protect their liberty.

Another, which I had forgotten, is the Militia; that's judged a fundamental, if anything be so. That it should be well and equally placed, is very necessary. For put the absolute power of the Militia into one without a check, what doth it? I pray you, what doth your check put upon your perpetual Parliaments, if it be wholly stript of this? It is equally placed; and

\textsuperscript{133} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{134} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{135} Ibid.
desires were to have it so, in one Person, and the Parliament, ---sitting, the Parliament. What signifies a provision against perpetuating of Parliaments, if this be solely in them? Whether, without a check, the Parliament have not liberty to alter the frame of government to Aristocracy, to Democracy, to Anarchy, to anything, if this be fully in them, yea, into all confusion, and that without remedy? And if this one thing be placed in one; that one, be it Parliament, be it supreme governor, they or he hath power to make what they please of all the rest.\textsuperscript{136}

A Militia must exist to protect the liberty of the people and to check the power of Parliament. At the same time, Parliament must exist to check the power of the Militia. If Parliament has no check, they might completely change the government to their whims and liberty will not be defended.

Therefore, if you would have a balance at all, and that some fundamentals must stand which may be worthy to be delivered over to posterity, truly I think it is not unreasonably urged, that the Militia should be disposed, as it is laid down in the Government, and that it should be so equally placed, that one person, neither in Parliament, nor out of Parliament, should have the power of ordering it. The Council are the trustees of the Commonwealth, in all intervals of Parliaments, who have as absolute a negative upon the supreme officer in the said intervals, as the Parliament hath whilst it is sitting. It cannot be made use of, a man cannot be raised nor a penny charged upon the people, nothing done without the consent of Parliament; and in the intervals of Parliament, without consent of the Council it is not to be exercised.\textsuperscript{137}

Cromwell sees the constitution as the fundamental base of a good government. For the government to work, he would establish checks and balances. There should be a Lord Protector, a Council, and a Parliament, and nothing shall be passed without the consent of all three. The constitution would serve to hold the three checks together and to protect undeniably the liberties of the people.

The Instrument of Government did protect most of these fundamentals. Article I secures the position of a single ruler in the form of Lord Protector.

That the supreme legislative authority of the Commonwealth of England, Scotland, and Ireland, and the dominions thereunto belonging, shall be and reside in one person, and the people assembled in Parliament; the style of

\textsuperscript{136} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{137} Abbott, 460.
which person shall be the Lord Protector of the Commonwealth of England, Scotland, and Ireland.\textsuperscript{138}

Article II agrees that there ought to be a council to assist the single ruler.

That the exercise of the chief magistracy and the administration of the government over the said countries and dominions, and the people thereof, shall be in the Lord Protector, assisted with a council, the number whereof shall not exceed twenty-one, nor be less than thirteen.\textsuperscript{139}

Article VI validates the authority of Parliament.

That the laws shall not be altered, suspended, abrogated, or repealed, nor any new law made, nor any tax, charge, or imposition laid upon the people, but by common consent in Parliament, save only as is expressed in the thirtieth article.\textsuperscript{140}

Article IV forms a militia that is run jointly by all three branches of government.

That the Lord Protector, the Parliament sitting, shall dispose and order the militia and forces, both by sea and land, for the peace and good of the three nations, by consent of Parliament; and that the Lord Protector, with the advice and consent of the major part of the council, shall dispose and order the militia for the ends aforesaid in the intervals of Parliament.\textsuperscript{141}

Article XXXVII protects freedom of religion with the provision that it is not Catholic or Arminian.

That such as profess faith in God by Jesus Christ (though differing in judgment from the doctrine, worship or discipline publicly held forth) shall not be restrained from, but shall be protected in, the profession of the faith and exercise of their religion; so as they abuse not this liberty to the civil injury of others and to the actual disturbance of the public peace on their parts: provided this liberty be not extended to Popery or Prelacy, nor to such as, under the profession of Christ, hold forth and practise licentiousness.\textsuperscript{142}

\textsuperscript{138} Instrument of Government, 1653.
\textsuperscript{139} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{140} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{141} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{142} Ibid.
The Instrument of Government was very effective in protecting Cromwell's fundamentals. It lasted nearly to the end of the Commonwealth, but it left out one glaring fundamental that concerned the Lord Protector deeply; no article prevented a perpetual Parliament. It was a fundamental to prevent a perpetual Parliament because if a bad Parliament refused to cease, it would be free to challenge the liberties of the people almost unchecked.

In 1657 Parliament presented The Humble Petition and Advice to Cromwell and asked that he be crowned king. The first proposal reversed Article XXXII of the Instrument of Government which made the role of Lord Protector an elected post.

That your Highness will be pleased by and under the name and style of Lord Protector of the Commonwealth [changed from king] of England, Scotland and Ireland, and the dominions and territories thereunto belonging, to hold and exercise the office of Chief Magistrate of these nations, and to govern according to this petition and advice in all things therein contained, and in all other things according to the laws of these nations, and not otherwise: that your Highness will be pleased during your lifetime to appoint and declare the person who shall, immediately after your death, succeed you in the Government of these nations.¹⁴³

In its constitutional form, The Humble Petition and Advice does not use the title of king because Cromwell accepted the petition but not the crown. To Cromwell the title of king would go against everything he had fought for, and after careful consideration he could not accept the crown.¹⁴⁴

Cromwell was also dissatisfied with The Humble Petition and Advice, because although it did not stop defending the fundamentals that were defended by the Instrument of Government it still did not prevent perpetual Parliament. In fact, it protected perpetual Parliament in the third proposal.

That the ancient and undoubted liberties and privileges of Parliament (which are the birthright and inheritance of the people, and wherein every man is interested) be preserved and maintained; and that you will not break or interrupt the same, nor suffer them to be broken or interrupted; and particularly, that those persons who are legally chosen by a free election of the people to serve in Parliament, may not be excluded from sitting in

¹⁴³ The Humble Petition and Advice, 1657.
¹⁴⁴ Sherwood, 167.
Parliament to do their duties, but by judgment and consent of that House whereof they are members.  

Without any way of breaking Parliament, Cromwell was therefore unable to check it. It was apparent to Cromwell that Parliament was becoming far too powerful. Not long after The Humble Petition and Advice in early 1658 Cromwell would dissolve Parliament in favor of a military run government. The Humble Petition and Advice would remain the last written constitution of England, as the Lord Protector would be dead by the end of 1658.

Before his death in 1658, Lord Protector Cromwell's government was able to create two constitutions, the Instrument of Government in 1653 and The Humble Petition and Advice in 1657. The United Kingdom to this day has still been unwilling to create a written constitution in the three and a half centuries since the Restoration. Although he was never satisfied with the two constitutions of the Protectorate, Cromwell made great efforts to defend the Common Law and protect the liberties of the English people. He may at times have found Magna Charta too restrictive on his actions, but Cromwell appreciated it as an early constitutional document and almost certainly never called it "Magna Farta."

References

Epistola Medio-Saxonica, or, Middlesex first Letter to his Excellency, The Lord General Cromwell. London: F. L., 1653. 5.
Horton, George. "The sum of all Intelligence form the English and Dutch Fleets." The Faithful Post 1 Apr. 1653 [London].

145 The Humble Petition and Advice, 1657.

Instrument of Government. 1653.

Magna Charta. Clause 9, 39.


Petition of Right. 1628.


The Humble Petition and Advice. 1657.

*The humble Petition of the Prisoners in the FLEET*. N.p.: T. Forcet, 1655.

ABSTRACT: Merchants in the later medieval Mediterranean crossed boundaries both geographical and moral. In November 1327 two Mallorcan investors complained to the king’s court that their ship, which they had sent to the eastern Mediterranean laden with tradable goods, had been ransacked by the violent natives of Kythera, an Aegean island at that time ruled by Venice. The Venetians, always conscious of maintaining good trade relations, sent representatives to the island and conducted a full investigation. After interviewing the islanders, the duke of the island sent his conclusions back to Venice: the Catalan “merchants” had come ashore on the island and began plundering farm animals and foodstuffs. The islanders took much abuse before finally fighting back, killing several of the pirates and freeing the slaves in their galley. When it came back to the doge of Venice that the Catalans had acted as pirates on Kythera, they offered no compensation to the investors. Using documents from the investigation into this incident, this article examines medieval self-help, the line between merchant and pirate, and the reputation of pirates in a time of violence and economic competition. A complex image emerges in which authorities and everyday people alike struggled to address the problems caused by maritime violence.
On November 25, 1326, bailiff of Mallorca Guillem de Baudela passed a judgment in favor of two plaintiffs, Jaume Cama and Simó Berenguer.146 The two were merchants from Palma de Mallorca and were seeking monetary compensation for the loss of mercantile goods in the eastern Mediterranean months earlier. The previous year they had entered into an investment contract with Jaume’s brother Francesc and a certain Joan Bruni, investing a sum of money in textiles for trade in Greece and Cyprus.147 Upon their return to Mallorca, a third of the profits would have gone to investors Jaume and Simó, but the voyage had not gone as planned. The ship had apparently made a stop at the island of Kythira, a small island of only about a hundred square miles just south of the Greek Peloponnesus, where local residents invaded the ship, stole all of the cargo, and murdered most of the crew. The court at Mallorca held Venice, who had ruled Kythira since the aftermath of the Fourth Crusade in 1204, responsible for their merchants’ loss and asked for compensation and damages; in the meantime, the investors were authorized to enact reprisal on Venetian merchants trading in Mallorca, confiscating Venetian goods in retaliation.148

The Venetians, for their part, responded with diplomatic courtesy and dispatched a judge to Kythira to perform a full investigation.149 After interviewing the islanders involved in the incident, the duke of the island sent his conclusions back to Venice: the Catalan “merchants” had come ashore on the island and began plundering farm animals and foodstuffs. The islanders, who were wary of such piratical raids, took much abuse before finally fighting back. They killed several of the pirates and freed some captured Greek slaves in their ship. When it came back

146 Antoni Rubió i Lluch, Diplomatar de L'Orient Català (1301-1409): Col·lecció de Documents per a la Història de l’Expedició Catalana a Orient i dels Ducats d’Atenes i Neopàtria (Barcelona: Institut d’Estudis Catalans, 1947), no. 143; Riccardo Predelli, I Libri Commemoriali della Repubblica di Venezia: Regesti, vol. II (Venice: A Spese della Società, 1878), no. 96. Parts of this paper were presented at the Mid-America Medieval Association Annual Conference, 17 September 2016, Emporia, Kansas.
147 Diplomatari, no. 143.
149 Diplomatari nos. 145 and 147; Commemoriali II, nos. 162, 165, 166.
to the doge of Venice that the Catalans had acted as pirates on Kythira, the Maritime Republic offered no compensation to the Mallorcan investors.

Incidents of maritime violence such as this were common in the Mediterranean during the later Middle Ages. During this period, intense migration, warfare, and trade brought Muslims, Jews, and Christians of different confessions into day-to-day contact with each other at sea and in the ports. People from various principalities competed for a share of the valuable trade that brought goods over the Asian landmass or across the Indian Ocean to the ports of the Black Sea, Aegean, the Levant, and Egypt. But there was also money to be made through confiscation, extortion, or robbery as these goods made their way to consumers. Some people took to such maritime violence as a career choice; others were merchants who simply took to piracy when no other more lucrative opportunities arose. Piracy could be used as an instrument of war against subjects of an enemy principality, or it could be random acts of violence such as slave raids on unsuspecting towns or islands. In any case, it regularly gained the attention of officials and left the resultant document trail in the archives.

Although the Kythira incident is only one such instance of piracy, it is useful not only for the amount of information it presents on a single event, but also because the documents specifically detail the harrowing experiences of the victims, including their fears related to piracy, their failed attempts to muster the protection of their rulers, and, finally, their direct confrontation with the pirates themselves. The narrative gives further insight into some of the more opaque socio-historical aspects of medieval maritime violence. First, it has been suggested that Catalans had gained a reputation for piracy in the eastern Mediterranean by the later Middle

---


Ages.\textsuperscript{152} Interviews with the residents of Kythira suggest this reputation was indeed present in the early fourteenth century, and that the word “Catalan” had certain implications, at least in the seas around Greece. Secondly, it has long been recognized by historians that the line between merchant and pirate was ambiguously defined in late medieval Mediterranean culture, if not in law as well.\textsuperscript{153} The Catalan merchants involved in this incident seem to have slipped with relative ease from legitimate mercantile activities to piracy and raiding. However, this case emphasizes that there was little ambiguity in the eyes of the victims, and if the witness testimonies are to be believed, the morality of their venture was questioned in the minds of at least one of the pirates as well. And finally, this case is remarkable for putting the voices of everyday people on the record, giving us the opportunity to see medieval life as it was lived by common folk on the peripheries. It shows us the traumatic impact one incident of piracy could have on a community and the lengths to which medieval people went in order to protect themselves and their communities from those who threatened them.

The documents for this case come from the diplomatic correspondences between Mallorca and Venice and the investigation conducted on Kythira on behalf of Venetian officials. They were preserved in the Commemoriali of the Archivio di Stato in Venice and later edited and published by Antoni Rubio i Lluch and Riccardo Predelli.\textsuperscript{154} The story begins from the Mallorcan investors’ perspective, in a document from January of 1329 drawn up by Venetian officials, which included a copy of the sentence pronounced by the bailiff of Mallorca in 1326. According to the Mallorcan investors, “Francesc and Joan went to Greece, and there they evidently sold the cloth in the area of Thebes.”\textsuperscript{155} They then bought Greek slaves, silk, and other mercantile goods and loaded them into the ship of some wine merchants from Barcelona with the intent of sailing to Cyprus to trade there. But after they left, “the fortune of the sea,” a common phrase usually indicating a storm or unfavorable winds, forced the merchants to stop off on the island of Kythira, about ten miles off the southern coast of the Peloponnesus. There, according to the investors’ testimonies, inhabitants of the island attacked the merchants, killing them and looting their ship. The profits from the Mediterranean slave trade were

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{152} Kedar, \textit{Merchants in Crisis} 29-30; Kenneth Setton, \textit{Catalan Domination of Athens, 1311-1388} (Cambridge, Mass.: Medieval Academy of America, 1948), 248, 259.
\item \textsuperscript{154} Diplomatari, nos. 143, 145, 147, and 148; Commemoriali II, nos. 96, 129, 162, 165, 166, 171, 173, and 387.
\item \textsuperscript{155} Diplomatari, no. 143; Commemoriali II, no. 96.
\end{itemize}
apparently worth a lot, in this case “a hundred and fifty *libra* per hundred invested, or more.” The total damages were determined by the assessor to be over eight-hundred Mallorcan *libra*, a very substantial sum. The inhabitants of Kythira were under the rule of the Republic of Venice, and so the bailiff of Mallorca, upon hearing the investors’ story, held Venice financially responsible for the loss.\(^{156}\) In the meantime, he granted the investors the right to reprisal.

It appears to have taken a couple of years for the incident to gain the attention of Venetian officials; part of the reason they reviewed the case in 1329 was that King Jaume III of Mallorca had written the doge of Venice, Francisco Dandolo, asking about it.\(^{157}\) This length of time was typical; medieval justice, especially when it required diplomatic action, was a slow-moving boat. But in May of that year the doge responded to the king: disturbed by the allegations brought against the Kythirans, he promised to order a full investigation. In the meantime, the king should send someone to Venice to procure the damages. He thanked the king and asked him to continue to protect Venetian mercantile activity in his realm.\(^{158}\)

The doge followed up on his promise. Later that month he wrote to the duke of Candia Joan Morosini, whose duchy included the island of Kythira:

[W]e were astonished to think it was just as the letters of the king explained, that so many of our own had committed such a digression. Nevertheless, we answered the king, wishing to provide for the security of our merchants living in his kingdom, that we had not heard of any of this business and that if any of his men came before us or our governors, we would give him the fullness of a favorable ruling.\(^{159}\)

Venice’s mercantile connections with Mallorca were important enough; Palma de Mallorca was a major port and stopping point on the way to ports in North Africa, the Iberian Peninsula, and the Atlantic.\(^{160}\) The doge thus explicitly ordered the

---

\(^{156}\) Venetians had been in control of Kythira since around 1204. In the late 1270’s, the half-Venetian admiral Licario conquered the island from the Venieri in the name of Byzantine Emperor Michael VIII Palaiologos, who then gave the island to the Daimonoyannes family from Monemvasia. However, later a marriage treaty between that family and the Venieri brought the island back into Venetian hands in 1309. The four Venieri brothers who controlled the island later enticed Greek settlers from Venetian Crete by offering exemptions from taxes and service. See: Guillem Miller, *Lati\(n\)s in the Levant: A History of Frankish Greece (1204-1566)* (New York: E.P. Dutton and Company, 1908), 151, 565.

\(^{157}\) *Commemoriali* II, no. 129.

\(^{158}\) *Commemoriali* II, no. 162.

\(^{159}\) *Diplomatari*, no. 145.

colonial lord to launch a full inquisition and see that justice be done, if needed. A
month later the duke of Candia dispatched an unnamed scribe and investigator to
Kythira to perform a formal inquisition into the supposed attack on the Catalan
merchant ship.

The unnamed investigator arrived on Kythira in early July, 1329. On July
13th and 14th he interviewed fourteen people from around the island: a castellan,
some serfs, some artisans, and some rural villagers, all who had something to say
about the incident. The investigation followed the procedure of a late medieval
inquisition, in which a judge-investigator sought out witnesses to an event, placed
them under oath, and recorded their testimonies. These types of documents are
common in the Mediterranean principalities, heavily influenced by the late
medieval revival of Roman Law. What then arose in the investigation was quite
a different story than that given to the Mallorcan bailiff by plaintiffs a few years
earlier, and the testimonies of these poor islanders would nearly threaten to bring
Venice and Mallorca to blows.

The first interview, on the 13th of July, 1329 took place at the “castle of
Kythira,” the island’s administrative capitol at Kapsali; the subject was the former
castellan himself, Blasio Simiteculo. He testified that a few years earlier a ship
full of Catalans came ashore at the port of Avlemonas, a small cove on the eastern
coast of the island. People from a nearby village had come to his castle and told
him that a pirate ship, a lignum piratarum, had come to the island and the pirates
were causing great harm by stealing pigs, cows, and sheep. The castellan, from the
beginning of his own testimony, seemed to have wanted to keep his distance from
the incident. He quoted himself as saying, “why are you telling me these words? I

161 Daniel Lord Smail, The Consumption of Justice: Emotions, Publicity, and Legal Culture in
Marseilles, 1264-1423 (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003), 33, 74; Lindea Fowler-
Magerl, Ordines Judiciarii and Libelli de Ordine Judiciorum (From the Middle of the Twelfth
Through the End of the Fifteenth Century), Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental 63
(Turnhout: Brepols, 1994), 49-50; Marie Kelleher, The Measure of Woman: Law and Female
Identity in the Crown of Aragon (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 34. For an
overview of Roman Law, see Manilo Bellomo, The Common Legal Past of Europe: 1000-1800,
translated by Lydia G. Cochrane (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press,
1995); Jaume A. Brundage, The Medieval Origins of the Legal Profession: Canonists, Civilians,

162 Diplomatari, no. 147 n. 1. Rubio i Lluch says that the “castle of Kythira” was synonymous
with modern Kapsali.

163 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Blasio Simeticulo). Rubio i Lluch suggests that this port was near the
church of St. Nicholas, still in existence on the northern tip of Kythira, because some testimonies
used both names, Sanctus Nicolaus Aulemena, to describe the place. It should be noted that there
is also a very old fishing village and natural cove called Avlemonas far to the southeast of St.
Nicholas.
The people complaining were serfs, villani, and the castellan told them to complain to their steward, who was an abbot. Apparently they did, and a few days later this abbot himself came to the castellan with a few more serfs and further complained about the ship. “They do great damage to us,” the castellan remembered him saying, “they take animals by force on a daily basis; the men from the ship come out armed and run around, plundering things.” The abbot asked the castellan to give him the aid of some of his castle guards so he could confront the Catalans, but the castellan refused: “you know well that I don’t have anything to do with what is beyond this castle. And the guards of this castle have to guard this castle. They cannot leave the castle to go fight with anyone. Thus, in no way do I give you my guards!” This kind of piratical raiding was apparently common on Kythira, as the castellan added, “certainly for one ship of pirates I would not send any guards out of the castle. Do not bother me with this again.” The abbot left, “agitated.” The castellan’s cold demeanor, which he himself described in his own testimony, suggests the distance he wanted to put between him the incident. He knew that a fight had broken out between the islanders and the Catalans and admitted as much to the investigator; when he asked him if anyone had been killed or injured, the castellan responded that “he did not know because he did not want to know anything about it.” Perhaps he knew that the incident, or at least incidents like these, could have larger legal and financial consequences. He remained either recalcitrant or blissfully ignorant about other details in the case.

A later witness would remark that the abbot, too, had at first resisted the idea of responding to the raid. “For one cow, what am I supposed to do?” he is said to have remarked. This abbot had fled the island about a year earlier, for reasons unstated, and would not be available to testify, so the investigator moved on to interviewing the people living around the castle: a potter, a barber, and shoemaker. They all had stories relatively similar to that of the castellan and could recall little else. A castle guard said that he knew nothing other than what had already been said, and “did not care to ask about it, because the act did not pertain to servants of the castle.” The shoemaker Marinus quoted the castellan as saying, “go away! If they take one or two pigs, they will not do any more damage to you.” He also remarked that the Catalans had “continually been capturing visiting ships,” and that

---

164 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Blasio Simeticulo): “quare dicitis mihi hec verba?, ego nichil habeo ad faciendum de hoc.”
165 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Blasio Simeticulo).
166 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Blasio Simeticulo): “interrogatus si scit si aliquis ipsorum fuit interfectus, respondit quod aliud nescit, quia iste dixit ab inde in antea de hoc scire nolubat aliquid.”
167 Diplomatari 147 (Yani Banchari): “pro uno bove, quid debemus facere?”
168 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Johannes de Rena de Venetiis).
a fight had broken out between them and the islanders which caused deaths and injuries, but he did not know the details.

To get more information, the investigator would have to leave the castle and speak to people who were closer to the action, and for the next few days he visited rural villages and interviewed people there. It is at this point that we hear details of the villagers’ defense strategies and learn that the reputation of the Catalans had preceded them. Seven more witnesses had largely corroborating testimonies, though some knew more details than others. After the Catalans had come ashore and began taking animals, the abbot had sent out runners to the various villages and castles on the island asking for help. The castellan had turned down his request for soldiers, so they would have to take to the task themselves and confront the invaders. One witness recounted the words of the crier:

[T]hese Catalans have disembarked and are going throughout the island capturing men in order to take them elsewhere and sell them. Whichever man holds our lords dear should come armed to that ship; if he does not possess arms, he should come tend to the medical needs of those who do.\(^{169}\)

Slave raiding was a typical piratical activity, but there is no mention in any of the testimonies that the Catalans had actually captured any of the islanders for those purposes.\(^{170}\) The crier, knowing only that a ship of Catalans had disembarked on the island, filled in the details.

The general story from the witnesses was that about twenty men responded to the abbot’s muster and gathered at the town of Mitata, near the center of the small island. When they went to confront the raiders, there were somewhere from nine to eleven pirates. The Catalans ran at them screaming, throwing spears and javelins. The islanders retreated, but not before more than ten were injured. Things were looking bad for the villagers as they laid there on the field, “as if mortally wounded;” but then a larger group of islanders, led by the abbot himself, showed up in reserve and gave battle to the Catalans. Most dramatically, while the beaten and wounded Kythirans were fleeing from the Catalans, one witness had the abbot show up with a large number of men saying, “what are you thinking? Upon them!”\(^{171}\) The islanders fought with “bows and sling” while the Catalans fought with “crossbows and javelins,” and “many were wounded.” One islander, a herder named Nikolas Faxe, was killed in the skirmish.

---

\(^{169}\) Diplomatari 147 (Yani Banchari).


\(^{171}\) Diplomatari 147 (Theodoro Castrigo).
The islanders finally changed the tide of the battle and some of the Catalans fled, “but others stood their ground and were killed.” The Kythirans chased the fleeing Catalans back to their ship, where the fighting continued. In the final fracas, most of the Catalans were killed; one or two may have escaped and later fled to the mainland. The Catalans had slaves in their ship, and when the islanders arrived and defeated the raiders, the slaves “saw that the Catalans were killed, took the sail, cut it up, and covered themselves because they were naked and hungry. The ship had no food other than what was stolen.”\(^{172}\) And they too escaped and went on their way. The islanders disbanded, returned home, and the pirates’ ship sat moored in the port until it rotted from neglect and fell apart. No one was apparently willing to do anything with it; the islanders themselves were not interested in committing piracy by stealing someone else’s ship.

The documents record the attitudes of the Kythirans toward piracy: the authorities were apathetic and regarded it as something of a petty crime; the islanders, on the other hand, risked injury and death to ward them off, and at least one person sacrificed his life. Interestingly, even among the pirates themselves there seems to have been a debate over the morality of their endeavor. Five witnesses mention a Venetian man among the Catalan raiders, named Donato. According to witnesses, he had a crisis of conscience when his shipmates decided to stop off on a Venetian-owned island and plunder. One witness claimed that he went and found a local herder in the countryside, and told him “guard yourself against those Catalans. They are bad men. They have a ship full of slaves and they go around plundering islands.”\(^{173}\) The herder, of course, reported this to the abbot. Two witnesses heard differently and had the Venetian coming directly to the abbot and telling him that he should be aware of the Catalans, “because they rush through Venetian islands trapping men; they put them in their ship and then put them up for sale.”\(^{174}\) Another one put it, “if you are not careful, they will take men from the island and sail off with them; that is how they got those other slaves.”\(^{175}\) This Venetian, or at least the islanders who recounted his story, knew the reputation of Catalans in those parts.

The islanders’ accounts of this Venetian raider suggest that a shared identity was present on Kythira which linked the islanders to their Venetian rulers, complicating what would otherwise have been a simple piratical raid. One witness testified that when the pirates arrived on the island, and the Venetian Donato realized it was Kythira, he turned to his Catalan comrades and said, “you are acting wickedly. It is more than enough that you steal their things—do not try to attack

\(^{172}\) Diplomatari 147 (Hemanuel Patrologo).
\(^{173}\) Diplomatari, no. 147 (Theodoro Castrigo).
\(^{174}\) Diplomatari, no. 147 (Paulo Polodondi).
\(^{175}\) Diplomatari, no. 147 (Georgio Cherperioti).
them. This is a Venetian island!" The Catalans called him a “traitor” and tried to kill him, according to that account. It was at this point, according to the witness, that Donato came to the islanders and warned them about his shipmates’ capacity for raiding and capturing slaves. This same witness gave the mostly-Greek inhabitants of Kythira a Venetian identity, inserting at certain points an incredulity that Catalans would attack them. In his version of the story, the abbot wanted to gather a group of men “so that they might go to those Catalans and learn the reason they are robbing Venetian people,” homines Venetorum. When they confronted the raiders, they asked them “why do you plunder us? We are Venetian people!” Another witness also added, “we are Venetians, yet you still killed our cattle!”

The reluctant Venetian pirate apparently survived the skirmish and later took a ship to Crete. Perhaps this is how some of the islanders heard a version of his story.

If the islanders were Venetians, or at least “Venetians’ men,” the invaders in the narrative were squarely identified as Catalans. Medieval discourses often identified people by their ethno-linguistic origins, but this hints at something more, namely, the identification of Catalans with piracy and with the slave trade. Benjamin Kedar, in Merchants in Crisis, remarked on what he considered to be the exceptional brutality of Catalan pirates. For him, the regular back-and-forth competition of the Italian merchant cities was interrupted by the arrival of the indiscriminate Catalans in the late thirteenth century, who pirated so much over the next hundred years that they threatened to destroy the slave trade altogether by the 1380’s. Several decades before Kedar, Kenneth Setton had similarly described the exceptional slaving activities of the Catalans, claiming that the word “Catalan” was still used as an epithet equating to “a giant, monster or vampire” even in the early twentieth century. Indeed, the rapid entrance of Catalans into the mercantile scene in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth century was accompanied by violence, in the conquests of Mallorca and Valencia, wars in Sicily, and eventually the conquests of Athens and Thebes. The warriors originating from the highlands of Catalonia, known as almogàvers, were instrumental in these campaigns and were known for their use of javelins in combat. The testimonies from the Kythirans

---

176 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Theodoro Castrigo): “vos male facitis, quia bene sufficit quod vos accipitis res suas, atamen nolite eos verberare quia ista insula est Venetorum.”
177 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Theodoro Castrigo). Another witness, Hemanuel Patrologo, has them using the same phrase, homines Venetorum.
178 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Theodoro Castrigo). Another witness, Hemanuel Patrologo, has them using the same phrase, homines Venetorum.
179 Diplomatari, no. 147 (Hemanuel Patrologo). “qua de causa derobatis nos, quia sumus homines Venetorum, et etiam interfecistis nostrum pecorarium.”
180 Kedar, Merchants in Crisis, 29-30.
181 Kenneth Setton, Catalan Domination of Athens, 248.
depict an awareness of these violent tropes associated with Catalans, and the islanders seem to have associated them with the slave trade as well.

The investigator concluded his interviews after two days in the countryside and the investigation documents eventually made their way back to Venice. Based on this new report Venetian authorities refused to pay anything to the Mallorcan investors who had begun the case. Pressure seems to have been mounting: only a month later, in August of 1329, king Jaume of Mallorca again wrote to Venice, thanking the doge for ordering an investigation but apparently yet unaware that it had already taken place and turned out poorly for his merchants. After this, no record of the case appears again in the Venetian records until an entry in the *Commemoriali* from July 5, 1336. In the interim the dispute had apparently escalated severely. Venice had obviously offered no restitution because of the investigation’s findings, yet the Mallorcan investigators had continued to push their case and, with help from officials in Mallorca, enacted the reprisal upon Venetian merchants mentioned above. According to the document, many Venetians doing business in Mallorca had faced penalties and seizures because of the case; specifically, eight Venetian galleys had been stopped on their way to Flanders and subjected to a tax. There were protests, and the Venetian government threatened to withdraw its citizens from Mallorca altogether. A group of Mallorcans and a Venetian representative held a deposition to settle the dispute, and they ruled strongly in favor of the Venetians. Officials in Mallorca would cease any further claims on behalf of Jaume Cama and Simó Berenguer; their right to reprisal, as given by the Mallorcan bailiff, was revoked. Mallorcans were to pay back all the taxes and confiscations they had taken from the Venetians, amounting to 2000 Mallorcan *libra*—far more than the investors had initially demanded a decade earlier. The document ends with sworn statements from Mallorcans promising to pay the sum back. It is unknown whether anyone in Mallorca tried to dispute the Venetians’ investigation; it certainly appears that they persisted in their push for compensation long after the investigation had taken place.

In the end it seems that the kingdom of Mallorca, with its larger economic and diplomatic interests in mind, did not wish to pursue the matter any further, and this case demonstrates how a relatively small incident of maritime violence could have far-reaching consequences. The case caught the attention of the leadership of Venice, a dominant Christian naval and mercantile power in the eastern Mediterranean, and Mallorca, a potent merchant-kingdom in its own right; it nearly caused a major disruption in their diplomatic relations. Still more interesting is how the case demonstrates the different ways medieval people saw piracy: as a nuisance, as a serious threat, and as a lucrative adventure. Piracy was so common in places  

---

183 *Commemoriali*, no. 387.
like Kythira that officials on both the local and regional level were reluctant to deal with it, as if it were unenforceable. Both the islanders and the Mallorcan investors demonstrated their capacities for self-help, taking matters into their own hands when official avenues proved unhelpful. As for the raiders themselves, they seemed to cross rather easily between piratical and mercantile activities. But pirate identities are not assumed without consequences.
The following document includes a selection and submission for the Hilltop Review. Within the file the reader will find five (5) poems and one (1) micro fiction piece. The poems are titled ‘Art’ They Can’t See, Lines, Anatomy of Decomposing, October on Danford Creek, and Wing Bone. These poems incorporate darkness, illness, social issues, and a manifestation and exploration of the human condition. The Microfiction text titled Taxidermy, details the interaction between two siblings showcasing the younger sister's mental illness by detailing the delusional and obsessive behavior of this character.

These texts have been workshopped under the instruction of poets, William Olsen & Nancy Eimers and Fiction writer, Thisbe Nissen at Western Michigan University.
‘Art’ They Can’t See

They say,

*I wish I could do that.*

It is the childhood I never had
and I…

Do you hate your reflection?
Your frizzy hair, your up-
turned nose and the dimples
in your thighs?

We hate the villain we became
in our happily-never-fairytale,
when we found pleasure in the scissor edge of pain
under our desks in kindergarten
when we found the pleasure in the razor edge of pain
locked in our rooms, wiping the tears
of our mirrored reflections.

Conceal: our loaded guns, our blood
soaked washcloths, our stash
of Band-Aids, the necessary, not so necessary
narcotics, pain--
The buzzing of some sort of art beneath
our skin, we don’t crow—
our cloaks
because beneath we are scared, scarred, and hurt
it is our attempt at forgiveness—
we are sorr—
but they say,
I wish I could do that.
It is night terrors, screaming at fabricated demons
The ones from your childhood mutated
Into the ones
And I…

Can you find home in tears?
Your face to the tobacco-yellowed ceiling,
Rolling across your temples, Crawling
Like disappearing little spiders in your hair?

If this house is our home, if this body—
it’s not where our heart is.
Lost. Some time
between watching our parents beat each other bloody
(from the closet we locked ourselves in)
and
the day we walked home with blood from our
broken hymens staining our underwear
but we deserved it
because we walked alone.
We wore sweat pants and we deserved it because
under our baggy clothes we were still girls,
Soft peach fuzz hair and he just needs a taste,
we have boobs, puffy pink nipples,
Made to fulfill baby hunger. “ohh, baby”
They say,
I wish I could do that.
It is the raddle of my medicine drawer
full of tablets, capsules, a bag of weed,
no more emotion
and I…

We just smile,
that awkward,
mouth closed,
lips thinned,
curled, half-baked,
thankful,
not so thankful
smile.
Because we’re supposed to
smile when they compliment
our bodies,
(the scars)
our art.
Lines

Somber, the night sings the solitude found swirling between stars
/
I can hear the echoing of black holes forming somewhere out of sight
/
The sun chugs like trucks on empty, choking, gasping, for fuel
/
Every sunflower seed came from a sunflower seed that came from a sunflower seed, back until the first sunflower seed was the first and even when it was the last of something not a sunflower seed
/
She watched as children kicked the heads off of dandelions and whispered to nobody, *it prepares them for the ‘real world’*
/
A child painted the sky, blotting and waving his father’s brushes, cotton candy, against dusk’s canvas.
/
Brush away the bone dust and fuse me together with wire.
/
He kissed my scars and cut me open, planted rage in my bone marrow and watched as this poison painted me pale.
/
I am Hera’s rage, her jealousy and humanity
/
Paralytic is the rage that goes ungnourished
/
Nourish the urge to be—
/
We’ve died a thousand times and continue—
/
The scent of Formaldehyde dripped into lungs, suffocating—
/
Cradle the brains of animals in hands not stained with their blood.
/
Squeeze the vision from my occipital lobe and infuse it with every memory I can no longer see.
/
Spinal cord severed, vertebrae sewn with Elm root.
/
Tendrils around my neck, Morning Glory my noose.
/
Cries bubble from keyholes, drip and stain the carpet
/
They lock their free spirits behind manicured suits and ties
/
She whispered Sarin, like a siren’s song
Anatomy of Decomposing

Meteors drip from the sky
like mist soaked wisteria blooms aching for soil
    hanging heavy, like fruit.
I am a bee,
    knees soaked in honey
    crusted with sweet,
dream caught in the sap
oozing between moss covered bark
coagulated   a scab   an amalgam of decomposing.

And the spider weaves lips shut,
and the wind ceases to blather
mocked by the song echoed down roads before dawn.

I’ve collapsed under the weight of raindrops,
welcomed them to explore my scalp between shafts of hair.
I’ve dug fingertips in mud grasping for something solid.
The worms crawl through my roots
and the earth   unforgiving
    needles the stem of a dahlia through
        my Cerebellum          my Arbor Vitea
to bloom in my mouth;
    petals for plucking,
    teeth for pulling.

You love me not
You love me
October on Danford Creek

The detectives had faces
fashioned like rose quartz. Pounding
with rubber mallet fists
on empty apartment doors.

I watched them, fish lens, through the peep-
hole, shoving a single business card in the frame near the brassy knob
whispering billingsgate, peaking in windows, pressing
soggy leaves into the “welcome” mat with their shiny shoes.

* 
October mornings are shallow clouds grey
and drag their belly’s low. Drains clogged by leaf
patties, wet roads momentarily remember the print
of tires then forgotten by mist glaze.

* 
It never fails, dog sees
squirrel, chipmunk, toad, dog, human
and charges, face first, into a saliva smeared slider.
Vertical blinds like rotting teeth, missing 2, 3, dirty and yellowed.

Every gust scooted leaf is a toad and every scraping
of dry leaves on concrete, a squirrel.
October is a dumb dog, a companion
when the thunder shakes the house.

* 
The pea coats knocked my door with unsatisfied knuckles.
Badges on leashes,
always lunging—
untrained dogs.

I like my neighbors,
murder suspects or not. Neighbors
don’t need fences, just unexpected
cookies and a pseudo-sincere, Hey...
Wing Bone

I tied her scapulae together
by wrapping copper wire around the coracoid process
like the orange spiral around healing stone jewelry.
Acromion tapping acromion
as I tested the metal joint,
like a pen on a desk in a cement room,
a hollowing density.
Forefinger finding comfort in the bloodless veins
of the infraspinous fossa
where my black would be painted
if I were small enough to cocoon myself
in the glenoid cavity—
  fly away a monarch.
**Taxidermy**

The radio was whispering advertisements when I pulled up to the apartment complex. Sis was smoking a cigarette at the weather abused picnic tables. She skipped to the car, her hair skipping out of sync with her, purse flopping about.

“Did you hear?” Her buckteeth protruded out of a smile and before I could even think of what she was referring to she continued, “Jack White finally bought a house in Kalamazoo, its fate, KayDee!”

“Oh yeah?.”

“Do you want to drive by his house? I have the address!”

“Nope…”

“You’re right, I should get him a gift first.” She buckled herself in and took a breath. The kind of breath that in Disney movies meant she was completely in love, head-over-heals in love.

Not too long ago she was in love with Seth MacFarlane. Her phone background was a pixelated headshot of him. She’d talk to him occasionally as if he were on the phone and would discreetly caress his face when she thought I wasn’t looking. After Seth was Kurt Cobain. Her love for him was memorizing his life story and weaving herself into it.

“I have to get him a really good gift or else he won’t go on a date with me.” She jotted notes on the back of a receipt she found in the median of my car.

Her thoughts were an acid trip. They were irrational, scary at times, and to her, always epiphanic, to me they were cacophonous. She used to be the stereotypical good-girl-gone-bad but after meth replaced alcohol she started to display schizophrenic thought processes and they only got worse after she stopped smoking dope and worst after she stopped taking her Adderall. Too afraid they would lock her away, arms crossed over her chest, she never sought help.

She read a list of gift idea aloud as they came to mind and were written down. “A bagpipe…a puppy…a big cross, like the ones on churches…a neon light of the number three…a black and yellow, upholstered, Victorian-looking chair…taxidermy…”

“Stop, you’re hurting my head.”

“I should get him taxidermy! He has an elephant head already.”

I pulled into a café and waited in the car so Sis could get some food and coffee. She’s been living off of unemployment for 5 months collecting as much as I earn working 30 hours a week. Honestly, I was a little envious. 29 and ready to retire but checking out early… sounds so suicidal.

“What do you call those rabbit hybrid things?” she asked while shuffling back into the passenger seat.

“A Jackalope?”

“Where can I find one of those?”
I didn’t say anything, just smiled while she Googled ‘Where do Jackalopes live’. “Why don’t you just kill some squirrels and call it good?”
“Squirrels aren’t special, Jack White has an ELEPHANT HEAD!”
“So kill two and fashion the one with the other one’s skull… Hamlet style.” She looked confused so I continued, “To be or not to be?”
“That is the question” she replied in her deepest voice. “I can put antlers on them!”
For Jeannie

By Kai Harris
For Jeannie

On an otherwise typical day, Jeannie altered course by making plans in her head instead of the usual cursive sprawled on the backs of her hands. The playdate with two girls staggered in age—four and seven, hers three and six—was scheduled for 2:30 PM at the big park by the river. By 3:30 PM they’d return home, and by 4:15 PM her daughters would be drowned in the clean, white tub on the second floor of the big house. It had the makings of a perfect day, for Jeannie.

She wasn’t a bad mom, truly. Only tired, and less excited than before. Once, she was fun. She played keyboard in a band that gigged at dive bars, and sometimes, when she was perfectly drunk—drunk enough to sing with abandon but not enough to forget the words—she dove into crowds of adoring fans who chanted various mispronunciations of her name. Her hair had been auburn, then black, then platinum, then pink, then auburn again in the end. When she married her bandmate, Kevin, it wasn’t for all the reasons girls usually married, which made her proud. She was already happy, already successful and well-liked and whole. Kevin wasn’t a cliché, for Jeannie. Not a half to a whole, or a best friend. No, Jeannie married Kevin simply because on a magical day of music, laughter, and late-night greasy hash and eggs, he’d asked. It was the magic that made the answer yes, which she’d whispered emphatically in his ear, two times, as he twirled her around the tiny loft that was his but became hers too, over time, with the collection of multicolored pillows, one for each country she’d visited, an echo of her careful chaos.

They lived in that loft together for three years before buying the big house on the cul-de-sac, with the sloped red roof and the uneven bushes in front. It was in that house that they became pregnant with Adeline, then Rosie. The first pregnancy, for Jeannie, was a mistake, making the second insanity, the repetition of an action that she knew, inevitably, would yield the same sour result. When Adeline was born, the sun was the brightest it’d ever been, a pale, soft yellow that glowed through the edges of her reminiscence. But each day since it grew dimmer and duller, so that by the time Rosie was born, all Jeannie saw were drizzling, gray clouds.

Kevin still saw the sun, though, when he’d hum in the mornings and flip chocolate chip pancakes high in the air. He made the girls giggle when he scraped his stubbly beard against their cheeks before bed, then they’d lay still in his arms for a book that he’d recite in voices higher and faster and stronger than his own. Usually, though, he was gone. He hadn’t had to quit the band when Jeannie did, because for him, nothing had changed.

For Jeannie, nothing was the same. Days and months and years flew by that felt strangely like fiction yet hardened her to jagged stone. If she smiled, pretended,
it was because someone was watching. But not lately. Now, when Rosie asked for a piggyback ride she’d say no, simply because the pain in her back and neck and legs and fingers and ears drove daggers into her futile, feigned efforts. Before, she’d carry Rosie on her back and Adeline in her arms and race around the house until they’d all collapse in heaps of laughter. But lately, there was only pain and gray. For Jeannie, the girls had become nothing more than a reminder of all that she’d given away. That awful sentiment, which surprised and quickly consumed her, was the first secret she’d kept from Kevin. The bathtub was the second, a riddle she’d repeated in her head endlessly to avoid telling her husband, telling her therapist, telling anyone, in the six days since she’d decided.

After the playdate, which lasted too long in a warm, counterfeit sun, Jeannie and Adeline and Rosie marched home. The park was not far from the big house with the sloped red roof. Rosie rode in a little red wagon that Adeline tugged with two hands. They stopped twice: once, when Adeline found a flower and picked it for Jeannie to display in her auburn curls, then again when Rosie begged to stop and get out and walk on her own. Each of her tiny, clumsy steps reminded Jeannie of all the wrong steps on this perfect, perfect path.

Once they were home, 4:07 PM, Jeannie took the girls upstairs. She ran warm water in the tub; Rosie would complain if it was too hot, Adeline would complain if it was too cold. It took three minutes to run the water, another three to undress their wiggling bodies. Two more minutes. She would start with Adeline because she would be the most difficult, her personality a delicate mixture of Jeannie’s inflexible resolve and Kevin’s interminable trust. When Jeannie forced Adeline’s face beneath the surface of the bath water, they would lock eyes, and for a moment, Adeline would still believe, without a doubt, in her mother’s love. One more minute. Rosie would giggle, unknowing and unsure—Jeannie would have to be fast enough, faster than Rosie’s little brain and little fear—until her lungs too filled with warm liquid, and she would be choked and writhing and wrapped around the big sister who she would follow always, anywhere.

As Jeannie lowered their frail, breathing bodies into the water, 4:15 PM, she peeked out the window at the sprawling oak in the front yard. The tree Adeline loved to climb, the tree that inspired Rosie’s very first word, leaf, pushed through pursed lips. She wondered what would happen if she climbed her daughters’ tree instead, balancing carefully on its long limbs, then flying down, down, into the sunshine below.
Borderland Identity

As I stand in San Diego, I can’t help but to stare at my mother’s flag and speak my ancestor’s tongue. ¿Porque? Why have you discarded me? I stare at the flag for three full moons, pray to an image that was created by my ancestor’s oppressors who raped my great, great, great grandmother, and who lynched my grandfather after being forced to watch his beloved scream in agony. He decorates the sand…red liquid circulating and feeding his cactus. Cactus…how ironic, a living organism that intimidates most, but fools no one. Fooling? Who is this woman I pray to? Or this white guy who enslaves my feminism and constrains my sexuality?

My mother and father get on their knees…raise their hands and yell to the heavens, “why, why have you forsaken her lord!?” No one responds…I fill the silence. Forsaken? No mom, I’m educated. As a female, I have been chained, gagged, tied to an anchor and thrown into the sea. Sharks surround me. Why has my culture betrayed me? I’m unconscious, to only be conscious…laying beneath a white tub, surrounded by white walls, white tiles, white floors…am I in heaven? Heaven? I’m in a tub full of bleach. My skin broils. I become blind, but I can still see a bright, white, light. I try to thicken my spirit as my tongue is getting cut out of my frenum with a hot blade…without anesthetics.

What is my homeland and motherland trying to do to me? I used to fight my reflection, unable to confront who I have become. Pero encontre mi orgullo, mi espirito, which was once taken from me as an infant and sold to society. Now I see…this is me… Mexican, Indian, Spaniard…a Mestiza. I have accepted my identity and created my own culture where I am not defined by others.