

June 1984

## Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare Vol. 11, No. 2 (June 1984)

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw>



Part of the Social Work Commons, and the Sociology Commons

---

### Recommended Citation

(1984) "Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare Vol. 11, No. 2 (June 1984)," *The Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*: Vol. 11: Iss. 2, Article 1.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15453/0191-5096.1649>

Available at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw/vol11/iss2/1>

This Complete Issue is brought to you by the Western Michigan University School of Social Work. For more information, please contact [wmu-scholarworks@wmich.edu](mailto:wmu-scholarworks@wmich.edu).



# Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare



Vol. XI No. 2

June 1984



96

The JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND SOCIAL WELFARE, University of Connecticut, School of Social Work, West Hartford, Connecticut. Copyright 1984, Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare.

Editors: Edward J. Pawlak and Dan H. Thompson. The editorial office is jointly sponsored by the Department of Sociology and the School of Social Work, Western Michigan University.

Book Review Editor: Paul Adams, School of Social Work University of Iowa.

Managing Editor and Publisher: Norman N. Goroff, School of Social Work, University of Connecticut.

Editorial Consultants:

David Joslyn  
Ronald Kramer  
Nathaniel McCaslin

Linda Rouse  
Lewis Walker  
Marion Wijnberg

Associate Editors:

Mimi Abramovitz  
Paul Adams  
Thomas Briggs  
John J. Cardwell  
Ben Carnoil  
Harris Chaiklin  
Susan Chandler  
Pranab Chatterjee  
Mary Jo Deegan  
Alejandro Garcia  
David G. Gil  
Gale Goldberg  
Shimon Gottschalk  
Robert Green  
Charles Guzzetta  
Margaret Hartford  
John Herrick  
David Hollister  
James Hudson  
Joe Hudson  
Elizabeth Huttman  
Charles F. Jones  
Terry Jones  
Larry Jordan  
Frank Kastelic  
Stuart A Kirk

Jordon Kosberg  
Robert Kronick  
Timothy Lause  
Leslie Leighninger  
Philip Lichtenberg  
Murray Meld  
Henry Meyer  
Joe Miller  
Kristine Nelson  
Elaine Norman  
Larry Northwood  
Dennis Peck  
Felice Perlmutter  
Jonathan Rabinowitz  
Dan Rubenstein  
Jennifer Schirmer  
Elfriede Schlesinger  
Ralph Segalman  
Eunice Shatz  
Arthur Shostak  
David R. Simon  
Bruce Thyer  
John E. Tropman  
John Williamson  
James Wolk

The Journal was originated by members of the Division of Sociology and Social Welfare for the Society for the Study of Social Problems but has no official affiliation with that organization.

Cover: Charlotte Goroff

Volume XI

June 1984

No.2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Critical Criminology, Traditional  
Crime, And Public Policy

RONALD C. KRAMER

pp. 252

Behavioral Social Work in  
Community and Organizational  
Settings

JACK ROTHMAN

BRUCE A. THYER

pp. 294

Measuring Ecology in Social Work  
Supervision: The Relationship  
Between Work and Treatment  
Environments and The Quality  
of Supervision in Israeli Public  
Welfare Agencies

RON MAIER

EDNA GUTTMANN

ZVI EISIKOVITS

pp. 327

Get Thee To A Shelter

WILLIAM M. EPSTEIN

pp. 366

Ethnic Minority Leadership:  
A Theoretical Perspective

PALLASSANA R. BALGOPAL

pp. 381



Understanding Gay and Lesbian  
Aging

PHILIP M. KAYAL

pp. 409

The Origins of The Service  
State: On The Ironies of  
Intervention

TIMOTHY W. LUKE

pp. 432

The Welfare Crisis of Central  
America

DAVID STOESZ

pp. 463

The Assimilation of Indochinese  
Refugees: Social Service Issues

MARK W. LUSK

pp. 487

CRITICAL CRIMINOLOGY, TRADITIONAL CRIME,  
AND PUBLIC POLICY

RONALD C. KRAMER  
Western Michigan University

ABSTRACT

Critical criminologists have often ignored the serious problem of traditional or common street crime. As a result, crime prevention policy has been forfeited to the political right or to those who advocate ineffective liberal reforms. This paper argues that critical criminology can make a contribution to the formulation of public policy concerning traditional crime. Recent theoretical developments within the critical perspective on crime, as well as a variety of supporting data, are reviewed and specific policy recommendations to reduce traditional crime are offered. These progressive recommendations constitute an important alternative to the individualistic approaches (liberal or conservative) which now dominate crime prevention policy.

---

Until very recently, most critical criminologists, and the political left in general, have not paid sufficient attention to the problem of traditional crime. There

are a variety of reasons for this neglect as Greenberg (1981) has pointed out. What concerns me here are not the reasons, but the consequences. The most important consequence of this neglect has been the forfeiture of crime prevention policy to conservative forces. To many progressive criminologists this is an unacceptable situation. Traditional street crime is a serious social problem in our society. By whatever measure, there appears to be more of this crime than most of us are willing to tolerate.

A related reason for progressives to be concerned about traditional crime concerns the victims of these offenses. LEAA victimization surveys have found that the highest incidence of violent and property crime is "among the poor and unemployed, specifically, the superexploited sectors of the working class" (Platt, 1978). Thus, the most likely victims of traditional crime are those the political left sees as its primary constituency; the working class, the poor, and minorities. Even if the members of the working class are not victimized directly by street crime, the fear of such crime erodes the quality of life undermining collective solidarity in working class neighborhoods. As Gross (1982) has recently suggested, the left must take seriously popular anxiety about crime and link these anxieties to progressive political positions.

A number of recent works by critical criminologists (Platt, 1978; 1982; Taylor, 1981; 1982; Gross, 1982; Browning, 1982; Bute, 1982; Currie, 1982; Michalowski, 1982) indicate a new willingness to face up to the question of what "causes" traditional criminal acts, and the issue of how best to control or prevent these acts. This development is especially important



given the repeated failures of crime control policy based on individualistic perspectives which attempt to either repress individual offenders of "cure" them.

This paper reviews recent theoretical developments within the critical criminology perspective, along with some supporting empirical evidence, and then suggests specific policy recommendations to reduce traditional crime. Thus, the paper is an attempt to contribute to the ongoing policy debate concerning crime prevention by suggesting some progressive alternatives to current practices.

#### CAPITALISM, CLASS STRUCTURE, AND TRADITIONAL CRIME

The critical criminology perspective is rooted in Marxist social theory. One of the strengths of Marxist theory is its insistence that any social phenomenon must be examined within the context of a historically emergent social totality. Crime, therefore, must be analyzed in the context of its relationship to the structure of society as a whole. Mainstream criminological theory in general does not do this. Instead, mainstream theories focus on the attributes of individuals or the immediate social settings of these individuals. As David Greenberg (1981:17) points out concerning these theories:

The society itself rarely appears. The possibility that its organization - its way of producing and distributing material goods, and of organizing its political and legal institutions, for example - might have major implications for the amount and kinds of crime present in a society, as well

as for the character of its crime control apparatus, is not even considered.

Critical criminology, as a general theoretical principle, asserts that crime is based in class conflict and the structured inequalities of class society. The class divisions and their associated forms of inequality under advanced capitalism, therefore, generate the problem of traditional crime. The critical perspective, however, must not fall into the trap of merely asserting that there is a relationship between the social formation of capitalism, especially its political and economic structure, and traditional crime without specifying what the linkages are between the larger social order and criminal behavior.

This section of the paper reviews theory and research on the concrete ways the political economy of advanced capitalism generates crime. Four specific topics are examined: 1) the surplus population which is produced under the conditions of late capitalism; 2) structured unemployment; 3) income inequality and relative deprivation; and 4) capitalism and the destruction of cooperative social relationships.

### The Surplus Population

From the critical criminology perspective, "An understanding of crime in our society begins with the recognition that the crucial phenomenon to be considered is not crime, per se, but the historical development and operation of capitalist society" (Quinney, 1980:39). An understanding of the emergence and reproduction of class divisions and their associated

forms of inequality are especially important in this regard. To explain traditional crime, in particular, we first need to see how the historical development of capitalism creates a surplus population or economic underclass which commits crime partially as a response to problems of survival and the brutalization of social life.

Marxist social theory provides a starting point for an analysis of the historical development of the political economy of capitalism. Marxism breaks with philosophical idealism and insists that a proper understanding of human action must begin with the existing material conditions and social relationships of people. Marxist theory, thus, starts with an analysis of the forces and social relations of production and moves on to examine the dialectical relationship between the mode of production and the other cultural and social structures of a society. Marxism analyzes society as a social formation, an articulated totality of economy, state, ideology, and so on.

Immanent change is a fundamental characteristic of social formations due to the contradictions which exist within them. These contradictions are both necessary for, and yet destructive of, these formations. The existence of classes and class struggle is the fundamental contradiction of capitalist society. According to Marx, class is not an attribute of an individual or group; it is a social relationship. Classes are constituted by the social relations of production. Under capitalism these class relations are inherently exploitative and unstable. The existence of classes implies class struggle and class struggle implies change. As Quinney (1980:45) notes, "All past history that



involves the development of capitalism is the history of class struggle."

This class struggle is carried on, of course, between workers and owners, proletarians and capitalists. But class divisions are also more complex. In Capital, Marx, (1867) introduced the terms "relative redundant population" and "industrial reserve army" in his analysis of the effect of the growth of capital on the working class. As Greenberg (1981:62) notes:

Marx argued that capitalists respond to the possibility of rising wages by introducing machinery that displaces workers. The ratio of constant capital (machinery, raw materials) to variable capital (wages) thus tends to rise. Workers who lose their jobs in this process, or who are never hired in the first place, constitute the relative redundant, surplus population. Marx goes on to argue that the existence of this population further depresses wages, since employed workers can be replaced by members of the "industrial reserve army" if they demand excessive wages.

Capitalism, therefore, systematically generates a "surplus population", an "unemployed sector of the working class either dependent on fluctuations in the economy or made obsolete by new technology" (Quinney, 1980:55). This surplus population or economic underclass lives under social, economic, and political conditions which can be described as devastating (Time Magazine, 1977, Auletta, 1982). It is here in the marginalized, demoralized, and super exploited sector of the working class that traditional crime often takes root and flourishes.

It has long been noted by criminologists that there is a strong relationship between social class and criminality (as measured in official statistics). Despite the attempt of some American criminologists to prove that this relationship is a myth (Tittle, Villemez, and Smith, 1978), the bulk of the evidence continues to show that lower class people do commit traditional crime at a much higher rate than other classes. As Braithwaite (1981:38) points out, "... it has been demonstrated, with a degree of consistency which is unusual in social science, that lower class people, and people living in lower class areas, have higher official crime rates than other groups."

Critical criminologists argue that predatory crimes, such as burglary, robbery, drug dealing, and hustling, are often pursued by the members of the surplus population out of the need to survive. As Platt (1978:30) notes, "For this population the economic conditions of life are unusually desperate and degrading. The high level of property crime and petty hustlers cannot be separated from the problems of survival."

The surplus population is also heavily involved in intra-class acts of interpersonal violence, as well as increasingly cross-class acts of violence. Rape, assault, child and wife beating, and homicide result from the brutalization and demoralization of life conditions for the surplus population. As Quinney (1980:61) observes, these "...conventional criminal acts ... are pursued by those who are already brutalized by the conditions of capitalism."

While the life conditions of the surplus population under advanced capitalism are undoubtedly related to criminal behavior, there are other, more specific, factors to be considered if we are to deepen our understanding of the relationship between social order and traditional crime.

### Structural Unemployment

One of the most significant of the adverse conditions facing the surplus population is a deep rooted and pervasive level of structural unemployment. Structural unemployment, of course, also increasingly effects millions in the skilled working class and service oriented middle class as well. High levels of unemployment have a very strong relationship to a variety of social problems, including, of course, traditional street crime. As Michalowski (1983:16) notes, "One of the most enduring pieces of data about street crime is that they are overwhelmingly committed by the unemployed and underemployed."

The evidence linking traditional crime to unemployment is impressive. In a series of brilliant studies, M. Harvey Brenner (1975, 1976) has shown that between 1920-1940 and 1947-1973, in the United States, Canada, England, Wales, and Scotland, there has been a significant direct relationship between unemployment and a wide variety of measures of criminal activity.

Brenner's research is not limited to an examination of the relationship between unemployment and crime. He has also demonstrated, in a study of New York mental patients over a period of 127 years, that the only significant factor accounting for



the rise and fall in admissions to mental hospitals is employment (Brenner, 1973). In addition, he has shown that such diverse phenomena as cardiovascular disease, suicide, and child abuse are correlated most highly with unemployment rates. Brenner, however, makes the strongest claims regarding the existence of significant causal impacts of the economy on traditional crime. In a report to the Joint Economic Committee of the U.S. Congress, Brenner (1975) argued that a 1.4% rise in unemployment during 1970 was "directly responsible" for 7,660 state prison admissions and 1,740 homicides. Later in the same study, he concludes that a 1% increase in unemployment sustained over six years would be associated with approximately 3,340 admissions to state prisons.

Other recent studies corroborate Brenner's findings. for example, the U.S. Bureau of Prisons has reported a correlation of .77 between their inmate population and the unemployment rate for 15 months earlier over a 20 year period. The Bureau's report (1975) argues that unemployment can be shown to be an effective predictor (if not cause) of the crime rate. Phillips, Votey, and Maxwell (1972:503) have demonstrated through the methods of econometrics that a "...labor force/not-in-the-labor force formulation has greater explanatory power than the not working formulation, demonstrating the importance of participation rates relative to unemployment rates in explaining crime rates." This is because unemployment rates underestimate the actual number of people out of work. Thus, labor force participation may be a crucial element in "... explaining crime because participation rates capture long-term trends as opposed to cyclical, short-run fluctuations that are more likely to be reflected by unemployment rates"

ployment and traditional crime can also be linked to the notion of a structurally generated "surplus population" by way of "segmented labor market theories." Conventional economics uses a "human capital" theory to explain labor market success and crime (labor market failure). This model, of course, hypothesizes that potential offenders behave like rational economic actors. That is, they choose between legal and illegal options after weighing the costs and benefits of each. This model also argues that labor market success is related to individual differences in productivity. Productive workers, of course, are rewarded with jobs and high wages. Workers become more productive by acquiring a stock of human capital (education, training skills, work experience). In this profoundly individualistic view, workers who fail to "invest" their time acquiring human capital will be forced to settle for low wage jobs or unemployment. Crime, then, is a rational economic decision which can be deterred by increasing the costs (punishment) to the individual.

Segmented labor market theories, on the other hand, argue that the source of structural unemployment and chronic poverty lies in the heavy constraints exerted on individuals by structural economic conditions. As Doeringer and Piore (1975:72) point out, "...the problem of unemployment is rooted less in individual behavior (the failure to acquire human capital) than in the character of institutions and the social patterns that derive from them." Segmented labor market theories see capitalist economies as divided into two distinct markets. The primary market offers jobs with high wages, good working conditions, stability, security, and opportunity for advancement. The secondary

(Thompson, Sviridoff, and McElroy, 1981:52).

How can the empirical relationship between joblessness and crime be explained. First and Foremost, critical criminologists point out that unemployment enhances the attractiveness of crime as a source of income. As Michalowski (1983:16) notes, unemployment "...depresses wages to the level that some prefer crime over seeking out low-paying jobs, while increasing the temptation to commit crime for those who are unemployed or able to find only sporadic or part-time work." Second, Michalowski (1983:17) argues that unemployment:

...tends to isolate individuals from full integration into the society, thus weakening the social bond between the individual and the society. Thus, even where individuals are not in desperate economic situation, their marginalization provides fertile ground for the growth of criminal incentives.

In addition, Michalowski notes that the expectations of unemployment among youth who have not yet sought jobs can produce the same sense of marginalization. Finally, Michalowski (1983:17) points out:

"...the loss of self-worth associated with being without work is often a basis for a generalized anger which can find its expression in crime and violence, when it is not turned inward through such things as depression, addiction, mental illness, and alcoholism."

At the theoretical level, these findings on the relationship between unem-

sector has jobs which are decidedly less attractive. According to Piore (1977:94) "They tend to involve low wages, poor working conditions, considerable variability in employment, harsh and arbitrary discipline, and little opportunity to advance. The poor are confined to the secondary labor market."

It is the existence of dual or segmented labor markets under advanced capitalism that generates the surplus population. The structural unemployment and under-employment of the secondary labor market breeds the social conditions conducive to traditional crime described by Michalowski. Under such a view, crime prevention policies should not be directed toward individuals (increasing the costs of illegal behavior), but instead toward the economic and political structure which generates illegal behavior. As Thompson, Sviridoff, and McElroy (1981:19) point out:

The disagreement between conventional economics and the SLM theories is not so much over whether individual labor market participants, especially the poor, are acting "rationally" in committing crime, but over whether it is necessary to account for an array of structural, institutional, organizational features of the economy in order to arrive at a satisfactory explanation of economic behavior.

### Structured Inequality and Relative Deprivation

Thus far, it has been argued that traditional crime is rooted in the political economy of advanced capitalist society. The class structure and segmented labor market of capitalist society system-

atically generates a surplus population which is faced with structured unemployment and chronic poverty and turns to crime as either a means for survival or as a response to the brutalized social conditions of life it experiences. While this theoretical statement constitutes a strong explanation for traditional crime, it remains incomplete. To this statement we must now add the concepts of structured income inequality and relative deprivation.

There is a growing body of empirical evidence which shows a high correlation between income inequality and official rates of crime. What is especially interesting to note about this research is that it reveals a direct relationship between income inequality and rates of violent crime, as well as rates of property crime. For example, Messner (1980), in a cross-national study, demonstrates a significant effect of income inequality on societal murder rates. As he puts it (1980:193), "The data, in short, indicate that high murder rates tend to accompany high levels of inequality in the distribution of income." Furthermore, when Messner entered a measure of the overall affluence or poverty of the population into the regression equation, the effects of the inequality variable did not disappear. In an earlier, less sophisticated cross-national study, McDonald (1976) also found a positive association between income inequality and the murder rate.

Research on income distribution and crime rates within the United States supports the proposition that income inequality is a significant determinant of serious criminality. Danziger and Wheeler (1975:113) used an econometric model to test the hypothesis that "...shifts toward a greater degree of inequality in the



distribution of income and increases in the absolute level of income when the distribution is constant, are both accompanied by more crime." They analyzed the United States for the period 1949-1970 and found that "...fluctuations in crime rates are generated by changes in the level and distribution of income in the manner predicted by the theory" (1975:113). Loftin and Hill (1974) present evidence to show that economic inequality is the most important predictor of homicide rates when American states are compared. Both Eberts and Schwirian (1968) and Braithwaite (1979) demonstrate that United States Standard Metropolitan Statistical Areas (SMSAs) with a high level of income inequality have high crime rates. In a more recent study, Blau and Blau (1982:121) present data on the 125 largest American SMSAs which show that "...income inequality in a metropolis substantially raises its rate of criminal violence." They conclude (1982:126) "High rates of criminal violence are apparently the price of racial and economic inequalities.

These studies add an important dimension to our understanding of the relationship between economic conditions and crime. It is the distribution of income which appears to be the primary variable which explains this relationship. Poverty, per se, does not explain traditional crime. It is the degree of inequality which is the important factor here, not the size of the poverty population. The crimes of the poor, therefore, may be less a matter of survival than of relative deprivation. As Braithwaite (1979:216-217) notes this is a finding of some theoretical significance:

The finding that the size of the gap between the average income earner and poor families is correlated with

crime, but not the number who are poor, is of considerable theoretical importance. It may be that, when there are only a small number of poor families in a city, these families feel a far more acute sense of missing out on the benefits of the Great Society than do poor families who are in cities where they are surrounded by many other families in exactly the same plight. Policies that reduce the number of poor people should certainly reduce the propensity to crime of those people lifted out of poverty, but do they at the same time create even greater despair, frustration, and criminality amongst those who remain poor?

The importance of the concept of relative deprivation in explanations of the relationship between economic factors and crime was recognized as far back as the time of Quetelet and Guerry (Messner, 1980). Marxian criminologists have made use of the concept too. Bonger (1916:91) pointed out that, "it is not the total amount of wealth, but the manner of its distribution that bears most importantly upon criminality." In summary of Bonger's work, Austin Turk (1969:11) commented: "The potency of economic want as a factor in crime causation is mainly determined by whether or not poverty is experienced as relative deprivation, in a social context (capitalism) wherein people are taught to equate economic advantage with intrinsic superiority and disadvantage with inferiority."

Much of the literature on relative deprivation and crime suggests that this formulation can best be used to explain property crime. And indeed, there is a considerable amount of empirical evidence

to support this proposition (Chester, 1976). However, many of the studies reviewed above demonstrate that there is a strong relationship between income inequality, relative deprivation, and rates of violent crime too. As Blau and Blau (1982:122) point out "...the relative deprivation produced by much inequality rather than the absolute deprivation produced by much poverty provides the most fertile soil for criminal violence." The social process inferred by Blau and Blau is that inequality creates alienation, despair, and pent-up aggression which is often expressed in acts of criminal violence. As they note (1982:119):

Ascriptive socioeconomic inequalities undermine the social integration of a community by creating multiple parallel social differences which widen the separations between ethnic groups and between social classes, and it creates a situation characterized by much social disorganization and prevalent latent animosities. Pronounced ethnic inequality in resources implies that there are great riches within view, but not within reach of many people destined to live in poverty. There is much resentment, frustration, hopelessness, and alienation.

From the critical perspective, these structured inequalities which result in perceptions of relative deprivation are rooted in the political economy of capitalist society. Thus, only radical social structural change can reduce the level of inequality and hence reduce the level of crime. Before this suggestion and other crime prevention policies which flow from a Marxist analysis of crime can be discussed, however, it is important to

examine one final dimension of the perspective's approach to crime causation.

### The Destruction of Cooperative Social Relationships and Community

The structural level forces we have been examining must be the starting point for any analysis of crime, as the critical perspective rightly insists. There are, however, other levels of analysis that must also be considered. Paul Friday (1981:191) argues that theories of crime tend to focus on one of three possible levels: The structural level, the system level, and the individual level. Structural level theories, such as Marxism, attempt to explain crime as a product of forces external to the individual and beyond his or her control. Political economy, structural unemployment, and income inequality are examples of structural level forces. System level theories explain crime as a function of social institutions such as the family, peer groups, community organizations, and schools. As Friday (1981:191) points out: "Each of the system forces are directly related to structural conditions, but the individual has some interaction with a unit of each system, and has some impact on that unit in turn." The final level is the individual level, which consists of theories which focus on the conditions surrounding the act itself.

An adequate theory of crime, and one that will have the greatest policy implications, is one which succeeds in integrating these levels, demonstrating the linkages between them. As Friday (1981:192) notes "Explanations which have been restricted to only one level of analysis have limited utility." The Marxist explanation of crime, therefore, cannot remain forever on

the structural level. The theory must explain how larger political and economic structures impact on systems level institutions and on individuals. While the structural forces discussed above are the centerpiece of a Marxist theory of crime, we need to understand how these forces are mediated through other social institutions and the processes by which these forces differentially shape the conditions surrounding the individual act. For as Friday (1981:194) points out:

The individual act cannot be explained directly by the urban industrial structural conditions. These conditions, none-the-less, contribute indirectly to it by differentially affecting the institutions responsible for developing commitments to conformity: the family, school community groups, and work. Forces affecting the criminal act at the institutional level reflect the fact that all societies have norms and expectations which are learned through socialization in the family, in school, and through voluntary and neighborhood groups in the community.

Critical criminologists, in general, have been slow to address this issue. They are content to remain at the level of the political and economic structure since the social formation as a whole is so often ignored in criminological theory. A few critical criminologists, however, have started to explore the relationships between the larger structures of society and its "soft" institutions, and the implications of these relationships for criminality. For example, Elliott Currie (1982) has noted the relationship between economic conditions, family life, and developmental disturbances. One parent (usually female)



families, according to Currie (1982:22) "...produce a disproportionate amount of aggression and violence in children not because they have one parent or because that parent is a woman, but because they typically lack enough outside resources, human and material, to insure an adequate developmental environment." The developmental disturbances that result in crime, according to Currie, are not attributable to the absence of the father, but to the stresses and lack of support systems that alter family functioning. "The same developmental damage" argues Currie (1982:22) "is equally likely to take place in two parent families plagued by severe internal conflict or abuse."

The family, in other words, is being buffeted and often ripped apart by larger structural conditions such as unemployment, inequality, and alienation. And the impact of such forces is not confined to the family, but affects peer relationships, schools, and community organizations, as well. Under monopoly capitalism, cooperative social relationships within these social institutions are destroyed. As Tony Platt (1978:31) points out:

Monopoly capitalism emiserates increasingly larger portions of the working class and proletarianizes the lower strata of the petty bourgeoisie, degrades workers' skills and competency in the quest for higher productivity, and organizes family and community life on the basis of its most effective exploitability. It consequently makes antagonism rather than reciprocity the norm of social relationships.

Under the political economy of advanced capitalism, Platt (1978:31) goes on to

argue, "...family and peer relationships become even more brutal and attenuated." All individual, family, and social needs become subordinated to the market and reshaped to serve the needs of capital. Capitalist development results in the atomization of social life and human cooperative relationships are increasingly replaced by impersonal market transactions (Braverman, 1974). These conditions exert enormous pressures and strains on the family in particular, and they are profoundly hostile to all feelings of community in general. Delinquency, violence, and other forms of social pathology are the direct result of the material foundations of cooperative social relations in capitalist society. As Michalowski (1983:14) notes:

The frustration, alienation, and sense of competitiveness generated by socially-structured inequality most often turns the less powerful against one another, either in emulation of the predatory, exploitive, and apparently rewarding practices of the more powerful, or in simple expression of impotent fury with their lives. Humans do not generally attack the person or property of those with whom they feel a sense of community. Inequality, however, tends to destroy community, thus making almost anyone fair game to exploit for personal ends ... This propensity is fueled by both ideological and material forces which tend to weaken or even prevent the emergence of any real sense of solidarity with the working class.

Another dimension to this analysis is added by T. R. Young (1978). He argues that the loss of social standing or social significance of individuals under capital-

ism is the key to understanding traditional crime (1978:11):

It is not the poverty of the surplus population which is the interesting dynamic in crime - poor people in Japan and China don't commit crime. The important variable is the loss of social standing (social honor, social significance, social status, Stande or social relationships) which is the central dynamic. One does not rape, rob, or assault those who have social standing in the eyes of the aggressor.

As Young (1978:11) goes on to note:

It is intrinsic to the nature of capitalism that social relationships and community be destroyed in a society. If one has nothing to exchange in a capitalistic society, one is not provided goods and services. Social standing depends upon funds - without cash or credit one is denied standing by virtue of the rule of capitalism: exchange for profit. Community is destroyed as well. In folk society, the surplus value of labor is used to provide community in the form of ceremonies, festivities, games, and other collective endeavor. In capitalism, the surplus value of labor is appropriated to the capitalist or to his/her agent for private use rather than communal use. ...With the loss of social relationship and community; with the individualism of the capitalist mode; with the use of every social good or service as commodity, the self-centered quest for material wealth we call crime proliferates.

As these writings suggest, Marxist or

critical criminologists are beginning to come to grips with the question of how structural forces impact on systems level institutions as part of a complex process of crime causation. The political and economic structures of capitalist society are viewed as undermining cooperative social relationships within the family, peer groups, and the community. These structural forces, thus, differentially affect the ability of these institutions to effectively socialize the young and develop role relationships conducive to non-criminal behavior. It is at this point that mainstream criminological theory might be able to be integrated into a Marxian theory of crime. And it is also at this point, that critical criminologists may be able to develop more specific crime control policies. It is to this issue of crime control policy that we now turn.

#### CRIME PREVENTION POLICY: A CRITICAL PERSPECTIVE

If the social structure is an important constraint on the behavior of individuals and institutions, then there are limits to the change that is possible to induce in individuals or institutions without changing the social structure. Vocational training for prisoners for instance, will not eradicate unemployment or do away with low wage industries. Even when individuals can be helped the larger problem remains. To deal with crime by "treating" individuals is like trying to empty the ocean with a bucket (Greenberg, 1981:18).

The arguments of this paper, thus far, can be briefly summarized. First of all, the question of "law and order", of the

prevention of traditional street crime, is both real and important. For too long, critical criminologists have not addressed themselves seriously to the problem of street crime, and the fears and anxieties it produces for people in their everyday lives. Furthermore, the victims of such crime are disproportionately members of the working classes in late capitalist societies. The victimization and demoralization of working class neighborhoods and popular anxieties about crime within society as a whole must be a major concern of critical criminology.

Second, this paper has argued that most traditional crime control policies and programs, based on individualistic perspectives on crime, are doomed to failure. Approaches to crime prevention which attempt to punish or treat individual actors cannot succeed, in the long run, in reducing criminal behavior. This is because criminal behavior is rooted in the fundamental structural features of a society, especially in the political and economic structure of late capitalist societies.

This point leads to a third element of the paper's argument. There is now developing a critical theory of traditional crime which advances considerably our understanding of this kind of crime. A rough outline of this theory was sketched out above and the empirical research lending support to it (not all of it by critical criminologists to be sure) was reviewed. The question that now needs to be addressed is what implications does such a theory have for crime prevention policy?

Although space limitations prevent an extended discussion, several crime prevention strategies that flow from the critical theory outlined above are presented. Two

distinct levels are addressed. First, a broad societal level which concerns major changes in the political and economic organization of late capitalist societies is discussed. Second, the question of specific policies within existing capitalistic structures is considered.

### The Reconstruction of Socialist Policy

Progressive criminologists generally agree that any resolution to the contemporary problems of crime will necessitate some form of transition to some form of socialism. This view is based on the recognition that both working class varieties of common crime and the more organized and destructive forms of social injury committed by, or in service to, the powerful are grounded in the social conflicts and exploitative relations that characterize life in class society. (Mischalowski, 1983:13)

If traditional crime is indeed rooted in the structural features of capitalist society, one obvious solution to the crime problem would seem to be radical structural change. Many Marxist criminologists have argued that the overthrow of capitalism and its replacement by socialism will leave society crime free. Stripped of its utopian overtones, there is considerable merit to this idea. It can be argued convincingly that there would be far less crime in a more equal, more just, socialist society. As the British criminologist Ian Taylor (1982:xv-xvi) has put it:

So - although it will appear as a dogmatism - we can assert that the essential significance of a very high rate of interpersonal and property

violence in a society is that it expresses the lack of socialism in the personal and social relations of that society. And we can define the absent socialism here, quite conventionally, as a political and social formation which guarantees equality of life-chances and mutual regard between people, irrespective of race, age, and sex. It is the obverse, therefore, of the conditions that exist in an unreformed class society like Britain today.

From this perspective, therefore, the single best crime prevention strategy would be to replace capitalism with socialism. Aside from the fact that this is an exceedingly simplistic idea, there are problems with the notion that socialism will drastically reduce the level of crime in society. As Braithwaite (1979:243) has argued, "...the overthrow of capitalism is not a panacea for crime which knows no limitations. The overthrow of capitalism creates merely the potential for a more equal and less segregated society." Braithwaite goes on to point out that gross inequalities in wealth and power persist in the so-called socialist societies that do exist, and the available evidence suggests that the lower classes in these societies also have the highest rate of crime.

One obvious problem in this kind of discussion is the fact that there are many different conceptions of socialism and many different existing social formations that call themselves socialist. There does appear to be, however, two major traditions of modern socialism, both of which are seriously deficient, according to Alan Hunt (1982:16):

The "revolutionary" tradition looks to

a revolutionary upheaval which has not come and which seems more distant today than it was when the socialist movement was born. The "social democratic" tradition, after long and varied experiences of exercising governmental power in many European nations, has not produced any decisive social, political or economic change that reveals the possibility of a new socialist order. Indeed, in their different ways, both traditions have created political and state systems that are distant from the people and have not released democratic and popular participation in social, economic, and political life. The authoritarianism of the socialism of the East and the paternalism of the socialism of the West have both contributed to an undermining of the popular appeal of socialism.

If the creation of a socialist society is to be a primary way of reducing traditional crime (among many other social problems) then we will have to develop a new socialist tradition, one which will release democratic and popular participation in social, political and economic life. As Taylor (1982) has argued, we need to have a "reconstruction of socialist policy." The argument for socialism once again, has to be made. This time, however, socialists will have to develop a more specific blueprint for a democratic socialist society which offers a positive alternative conception of the Welfare State to replace the "tattered and discredited reality we still defend." (Deacon, 1981:46).

What would a "reconstructed socialist policy" look like? What elements would it contain? Again, space prohibits an extended



discussion, but we can examine some of the arguments Taylor (1981; 1982) has advanced in Law and Order: Arguments for Socialism and elsewhere. First of all, Taylor clearly rejects the anti-statism of a libertarian character which ran through much of the early literature of the radical criminologists (Hunt, 1982). He (1981:100) insists upon "...the recognition of a state form as a necessary element in the administration of complex industrial societies...". Thus, in the current period it is important to enter into the struggle over state policy in all areas. Secondly, Taylor argues the necessity of "social order" and thus of the necessity for some form of criminal justice apparatus. The issue, for him, is to create a "new" social order ("a social order for all", p. 123) and a democratization of the criminal justice process.

The key element in Taylor's socialist strategy is the thoroughgoing democratization of the entire social order. This aspect of social reconstruction must begin at the local level to fulfill immediate, pressing needs. Economic decision-making must be democratized. Production must be organized rationally to fulfill continuing and often unmet social needs for goods, services, and employment. This notion of economic democracy has recently taken hold over the left in the United States. The essence of economic democracy is to transfer economic decision-making from the few to the many; from private groups to public councils; from the corporate elite to workers, consumers, and local communities. Economic democracy, thus, requires, "the shift of investment control from corporate domination to the public; and the reconstruction of economic decision making through democratic worker - and worker/consumer - controlled production"

(Carnoy and Shearer, 1980:4).

The state itself, according to Taylor, will have to be democratized from within. This would include such things as the democratization of policing, of the staffing of correctional centers, and even of the judiciary. Over and over, Taylor stresses the importance of the state in the reconstruction of socialist policy. He is aware of the Dangers of reformism, but he underlines (1982:xviii) "...the importance of creating a set of demands for alternative and socialist arrangements in every area in which the state imposes itself on the citizens of our unequal class society."

The reconstruction of socialist policy as outlined by Taylor is an important source of ideas about what kind of socialist society might replace late capitalism and even welfare state capitalism. These ideas and others must now be worked over, developed, and linked to a viable political strategy if we are serious about creating a new social order in which there will be far less crime (and far fewer social pathologies in general) than we currently experience under the political economy of capitalism. As Taylor (1982:13) points out, however, this will take a lot of hard work to accomplish:

A vast amount of work needs to be done on the reconstruction of orthodox socialist policy. But the required features of any reconstructed social democracy are clear: the fragmented working class will only be mobilized when it sees an economic and social strategy which transparently (and therefore democratically) fulfills its immediate, pressing social needs. The socialism which does this must obviously be clearly distinguishable

from the authoritarian state form or "social deomocracy" of the earlier period, constructed in defense of an allegedly equal partnership of capital and labor. ...A popular desire for such a socialism may emerge out of the process of community dislocation, which is now in full flow in capitalist societies, but it will require socialists working in political parties and engaging openly and publicly in ideological struggles against the Right in order to sustain and advance it.

### Specific Policies to Fight Crime

While the reconstruction of socialist policy in the west is critically important, it is only one level at which work must go on. If we are truly concerned about reducing the amount of traditional crime that plagues our societies and alleviating the victimization of working class neighborhoods, we must formulate and fight for specific policies that will operate right now, within the structure of the existing political economy. These policies will hopefully be, in Taylor's (1982) words, "prefigurative socialist programs," but the criterion by which we should judge them is whether or not they will reduce crime.

The specific recommendations to be presented here, are derived primarily from a recent article by American criminologist Elliot Currie (1982). He lists three key areas of intervention which recent evidence point to as likely to have the greatest effect on crime rates. These areas of intervention are the labor market, the family, and the network of community supports. Each will be discussed in turn.

The first and most important recommendation that can be made to reduce existing capitalist societies is to recommend the adoption of a full employment policy. As Currie (1982:21) notes concerning the situation in the United States, "It's hardly accidental that every advanced society with a lower level of violent crime than ours has also historically had a much more effective and humane employment policy providing better cushions against the disintegrative and degrading effects of 'market' forces." Attaining a full employment economy is not only a major step toward a less crime ridden society, it is, as Michael Harrington (1980:82) has pointed out, the "precondition" of any progressive solution to the problems which confront late capitalist society.

The central importance of a full employment policy in reducing crime appears to be well understood in the west. Yet there is little movement toward such a policy, especially in the United States and Great Britain. The main reason for this is the fact that governments in capitalist societies prefer to rely on the private sector to produce jobs. The private sector, however, as has been well demonstrated (See Harrington, 1980), cannot and will not move us in the direction of full employment. The only way a full employment economy can be reached is through the provision of public jobs and planned social investment. Even the Reagan administration in the U.S. began to get that message, and in early 1983, backed the passage of a public jobs bill (a rather inadequate jobs bill, but a jobs bill nonetheless). More such bills are necessary if we are at all serious about reducing crime.

Still, the provision of jobs alone is not the only issue to be considered from a

crime prevention standpoint. As Currie (1982:21) points out, "The economic context of crime is not just the rate of unemployment itself, but the more general conditions of the secondary labor market." He reviews a RAND study of California "repeaters" which illustrates the strengths of this connection. As Currie (1982:21) notes:

This [study] suggests that job quality and stability are the real issues. Simply forcing the urban unemployed into new variants of low-wage, menial labor as much current [Reagan] administration urban policy proposes, won't begin to come to grips with urban crime. Nor can we expect much help from a strategy of general economic expansion if it doesn't include well-targeted employment and training programs for the kinds of people typically left behind.

A strong jobs policy, therefore, one that deals with the issue of job quality and stability, must be our first order response to the crime problem (especially youth crime). The state must be pressured to pursue this course. Not only is it more effective to create jobs than to build prisons, but it is also less expensive. The left must stay the course on this issue and attempt to counter the resistance of the private sector to public jobs programs.

A second area of intervention to reduce crime, according to Currie is the family. Given the evidence of the fragmentation of families and the developmental disturbances that can occur within them due to the adverse impact of economic factors, it is important to develop comprehensive multi-service programs for high risk families. Currie (1982:22) quotes psychologist E. M.

Hetherington who has said, "it is critical to develop social policies and intervention procedures that will reduce stresses and develop new support systems for single parent families." Currie (1982:22) then comments that "changing the pinched and deeply stressful state of dependent poor families can have an impact on youth crime in fairly short order."

What kind of service programs for dependent poor families would help to reduce crime? Currie cites the Child and Family Resource Programs (CFPR) sponsored by the U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare as an exemplar. These programs provided the following kinds of services to poor families: crisis intervention, education against child abuse, family counseling, Head Start and tutoring programs, meals for children, and pre- and post-natal health counseling. All of these programs were designed to encourage parent involvement in policymaking. The results of these programs, overall, were excellent. Currie (1982:23) cites the conclusions of a U.S. Government Accounting Office evaluation of CFPR in summarizing the impact of family intervention programs on crime rates:

The GAO argued that these early childhood intervention programs would reduce delinquency mainly through improving early parent-child relations and school performance, and both possibilities fit well with what a growing body of research has to say about family and developmental influences on youth and adult crime. We don't know how much crime we could prevent by developing a better range of supports for early child development. We do know that there are very good reasons for expecting the effects to be substantial.

In addition to the family, a third area of intervention for crime reduction is the network of community supports. Although "community" has become a kind of predictable buzzword on both the left and right, and although just about everybody agrees that "community" is important in preventing crime, Currie (1982:23) argues that "...nearly everyone has a different conception of what community means and what might be done to create or restore it." He reviews the variety of community crime prevention programs initiated in the United States in the 1970s by the Law Enforcement Assistance Administration (LEAA). The results of these efforts, he argues, were ambiguous. He sees nothing wrong in principle with such programs as "Neighborhood Watch" or the organization of civilian anti-crime patrols, but he cautions that such programs are "...likely to have limited impact as long as the larger forces ripping apart the community's infrastructure are left intact."

What's most important in community crime prevention, according to Currie (1982:24), are "the broader forces that make for community stability and sustain local social networks." He argues (1984:24) that, "one of the most damaging flaws in liberal thinking about social policy has been its tendency to downplay the importance of social bonds and communal supports in preventing or mitigating social pathology." A number of radical criminologists, in addition to Currie, have recently echoed these sentiments and have begun exploring the issue of community crime prevention (Browning, 1982, Bute, 1982, Gross, 1982).

The most compelling approach to crime prevention on the community level,

according to Currie, is the idea of creating "mediating structures" to prevent various kinds of social pathologies. By "mediating structures" is meant intermediate institutions such as neighborhoods, kinship structures, and ethnic organizations, which lay between individuals and larger bureaucratic structures. One example cited by Currie is Philadelphia's House of Umoja, a community based residential program for black youth gang members. Reviewing the evidence on the crime-preventing role of "mediating structures", Currie (1982:24) concludes:

A large and growing body of research has demonstrated the importance of communal networks of support in mitigating the impact of social and economic stress, with very significant consequences not only for crime, but for physical and mental health as well.

A number of cross-national studies also suggest the significance of community networks of support in preventing crime. Currie (1984:24) points to Japan and Switzerland, and argues that the low crime rates in these two countries can be traced back to the fact that economic development in these nations appears to have taken place "within the bounds of pre-existing ties of kinship and local community." Currie (1982:25) concludes that, "One clear implication of this is that much could be gained, over the long term, through integrating community programs specifically designed for crime prevention with broader strategies of locally based economic development."

**CONCLUSION: THE STATE MUST SERVE AS A  
POSITIVE FORCE FOR CRIME PREVENTION**



Critical criminologists argue that the causes of traditional crime are located in the political and economic structure of capitalist society. A reduction in crime, therefore, depends upon major political and economic changes. The crime prevention strategies recommended in this paper all require positive interventions by the state in the social and economic organization of society. In all Western nations, particularly in the United States and Great Britain, conservatives, both in and out of government, insist that "government" is powerless to do anything about the causes of crime; that the governments' only proper role is to punish offenders and maintain law and order. As Currie (1982:25) points out, however:

In fact, of course, the opposite is true. "Government" in the United States is already deeply implicated in policies that cause families and communities to disintegrate, and in deflecting policies that might help hold them together. "Government," indeed, can fairly be said to have followed a pro-crime policy for years. Government tax and subsidy policies supported the vast uprooting of population through a "modernization" of agriculture closely entwined with the disintegration of the social fabric of the cities. Government spurred the out-migration of industry and jobs that aggravated it further. Government regularly induces unemployment, community decline, and geographic uprooting in the service of the putative fight against inflation. Government helps subsidize the multinationals' cataclysmic reordering of social life in the "developing" world... Under the auspices of the right, "government"

will certainly do so even more, by aligning itself ever more closely with the most disintegrative forces of the private market.

In support of the interests of capital the state promotes policies that bear a large part of the responsibility for the high levels of crime and violence that plague many western nations. But the state is not simply a tool or instrument of capitalistic interests. The state in late capitalism is an autonomous power and an object of class struggle. Critical criminologists and the left in general must enter into the struggle over state policy. It is only through political action and pressure on a variety of fronts that we will be able to achieve significant reforms now and the eventual democratization of the social order as a whole in the future. Not only do we hope to achieve a more equal and just society in this process, but also a significant reduction in the level of traditional crime. While the punishment (even by incarceration) of individuals surely has a place in any future crime control strategy, as does the rehabilitation or treatment of troubled individuals, only the kind of structural changes proposed by critical criminologists will alleviate the victimization of our society by crime.

#### REFERENCES

Auletta, Ken  
1982 The Underclass. New York:  
Vintage Books.

Blau, Judith R. and Peter M.

- 1982 "The Cost of Inequality: Metropolitan Structure and Violent Crime". American Sociological Review, 47 (February): 114-128.
- Bonger, William  
1916 Criminality and Economic Conditions. Boston: Little, Brown.
- Braithwaite, John  
1979 Inequality, Crime, and Public Policy. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Braithwaite, John  
1981 "The Myth of Social Class and Criminality Reconsidered". American Sociological Review, 46 (February): 36-57.
- Braverman, Harry  
1974 Labor and Monopoly Capital. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Brenner, M. Harvey  
1973 Mental Illness and the Economy. Cambridge, Ma.: Harvard University Press.
- Brenner, M. Harvey  
1975 "Estimating the Social Costs of National Economic Policy: Implications for Mental and Physical Health and Criminal Aggression." Prepared for the Joint Economic Committee, Congress of the U.S. Paper No. 5. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office (October).
- Brenner, M. Harvey  
1976 "Effects of the Economy on Criminal Behavior and the Administration of Criminal Just-

ice in the United States, Canada, England and Wales, and Scotland." Prepared for the United Nations Social Defense Research Institute. Economic Crises and Crime. Publication No. 15. Rome: UNSDRI (May).

Browning, Frank  
1982 "Nobody's Soft on Crime Anymore." Mother Jones, 7 (August): 24-31, 40-41.

Bute, Joseph  
1982 "Crime and Community: Strategies for the Left." Crime and Social Justice, 18 (Winter): 34-36.

Carnoy, Martin and Derek Shearer  
1980 Economic Democracy, White Plains, NY: M. E. Sharpe.

Chester, C. Ronald  
1976 "Perceived Relative Deprivation as a Cause of Property Crime." Crime and Delinquency, 22 (January): 17-30.

Currie, Elliott  
1982 "Fighting Crime." Working Papers. 9 (July/August): 16-25.

Danziger, Sheldon and David Wheeler  
1975 "The Economics of Crime: Punishment or Income Redistribution." Review of Social Economy, 33 (October): 113-131.

Deacon, Bob  
1981 "Social Administration, Social Policy and Socialism." Critical Social Policy, 1 (1) (Summer): 43-66.

- Doeringer, Peter B. and Michael J. Piore  
 1971 Internal Labor Markets and Man-  
 power Analysis. Lexington, Ma.:  
 D. C. Heath.
- Eberts, Paul, and Kent P. Schwirian  
 1968 "Metropolitan Crime Rates and  
 Relative Deprivation."  
Criminologica, 5 (February): 43-  
 52.
- Friday, Paul C.  
 1981 "Theoretical Issues in the Study  
 of Deviance and Social Control."  
 Pp. 187-223 in Helmut Kury,  
Perspektiven und Probleme  
 Kriminologischer Forschung.  
 Bonn: Carl Heymanns Verlag K.G.
- Friday, Paul C.  
 1982 "Delinquency Prevention and  
 Social Policy." Pp. 36-51 in A.  
 Morris and H. Giller (eds.),  
Providing Criminal Justice for  
 Children. London: Edward  
 Arnold.
- Greenberg, David F. (ed.)  
 1981 Crime and Capitalism: Readings  
 in Marxist Criminology. Palo  
 Alto, Ca.: Mayfield Publishing  
 Co.
- Gross, Bertram  
 1982 "Some Anticrime Proposals for  
 Progressives." Crime and Social  
 Justice, 17 (Summer): 51-54.
- Harrington, Michael  
 1980 Decade of Decision: The Crisis  
 of the American System. New  
 York: Simon and Schuster.
- Hunt, Alan  
 1982 "Law, Order, and Socialism: A

Response to Ian Taylor." Crime and Social Justice, 18 (Winter): 16-22.

Loftin, Colin and Robert H. Hill  
1974 "Regional Subculture and Homicide: An Examination of the Gastil-Hackney Thesis." American Sociological Review, 39 (October): 714-724.

Marx, Karl  
1867 Capital, Vol. 1. Translated by Samuel Moore and Edward Aveling. New York: International Publishers. Reprinted, 1967.

McDonald, Lynn  
1976 The Sociology of Law and Order. Boulder, Co.: Westview Press.

Messner, Steven F.  
1980 "Income Inequality and Murder Rates: Some Cross-National Findings." Comparative Social Research, 3: 185-198.

Michalowski, Raymond J.  
1983 "Crime Control in the 1980s: A Progressive Agenda." Crime and Social Justice, 19 (Summer): 13-23.

Phillips, Llad, Harold L. Votey, Jr., and Darold Maxwell  
1972 "Crime, Youth, and the Labor Market." Journal of Political Economy, 80 (May/June): 491-503.

Piore, Michael J.  
1977 "The Dual Labor Market: Theory and Implications." In David Gordon (ed.), Problems in Political Economy: An Urban Perspec-

tive. Lexington, Ma.: D. C. Heath.

Platt, Tony

1978 "'Street' Crime: A View from the Left." Crime and Social Justice, 9 (Spring-Summer): 26-34.

Platt, Tony

1982 "Crime and Punishment in the United States: Immediate and Long-term Reforms from a Marxist Perspective." Crime and Social Justice, 18 (Winter): 38-45.

Quinney, Richard

1980 Class, State, and Crime. Second Edition. New York: Longman.

Sutherland, Edwin H. and Donald R. Cressey

1978 Criminology. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Company.

Taylor, Ian

1981 Law and Order: Arguments for Socialism. London: The Macmillan Press.

Taylor, Ian

1982 "Against Crime and For Socialism." Crime and Social Justice, 18 (Winter): 4-15.

Thompson, James W., Michelle Sviridoff and Jerome E. Mcelroy

1981 Employment and Crime: A Review of Theories and Research. Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Justice.

Time Magazine

1977 "The American Underclass." Time, August 29: 14-27.

Tittle, Charles R., Wayne J. villemmez, and  
Douglas A. Smith

1978 "The Myth of Social Class and  
Criminality: An Empirical  
Assessment of the Empirical  
Evidence." American Socio-  
logical Review, 43 (October):  
643-656.

Turk, Austin T

1969 "Introduction." Pp. 3-20 in the  
abridged edition of Willem  
Bonger, Criminality and Economic  
Conditions. Bloomington, In.:  
Indiana University Press.

Young, T. R.

1978 "Crime and Capitalism." Red  
Feather, Co.: The Red Feather  
Institute.



# BEHAVIORAL SOCIAL WORK IN COMMUNITY AND ORGANIZATIONAL SETTINGS

JACK ROTHMAN, Ph.D.  
School of Social Work  
The University of Michigan

BRUCE A. THYER, Ph.D.  
Department of Psychiatry  
The University of Michigan

## ABSTRACT

Principles and methods of behavioral social work have found little application at the community and organizational levels of intervention. It is the contention of the authors that integration of such content would enhance practice at these levels. Components of behavioral community intervention are indicated and illustrated in micro/macro settings, with advantages to practice specified. Ethical Considerations in using this methodology are discussed.

## INTRODUCTION

The addition of procedures derived from the experimental analysis of behavior into the practice procedures of social workers represents a major step towards fulfillment of the field's long-standing commitment to the twin goals of effective service and accountable practice. Despite a few dissenting opinions (Bruck, 1968; Strean, 1973), behavioral social work has come to be recognized as one of the major schools of social work theory (Thomas, 1970; 1973) and is now a significant

component of graduate social work education (Thyer & Bronson, 1981).

A recently published bibliography of behavioral social work found over 350 articles, chapters and textbooks on the subject in print (Thyer, 1981). The magnitude and comprehensiveness of this body of literature is suggestive of the utility which many practitioners and researchers have found in the behavioral perspective. A topical analysis of the references found in the behavioral social work literature reveals an uneven distribution in content, however. Articles devoted to social work intervention at the community level comprised only four percent of the total (n=14), with interpersonal practice at the individual and group levels forming the large majority of the citations (Thyer, 1981). This is unfortunate, since, as Sheldon and Hudson point out, with respect to social work literature in general, ". . . a certain amount of attention is given to the problems and practicalities of running programmes in community and social care settings, but this is woefully insufficient given the magnitude of the problems usually encountered . . . social workers cannot be just therapists, behavioral or otherwise" (1981, p.2).

Despite early suggestions that behavioral methods could contribute to the development of more effective intervention at the community level (Fellin, Rothman & Meyer, 1967), the integration of such principles into the training and practice procedures of social workers in community and organizational settings appears to have lagged behind that of education in micro-level intervention. As an illustration, Weisner and Silver's (1981) recent article on community work and social learning

theory drew more from the psychological than the social work literature, reflecting both the significant impact behavioral methods are having on the related field of community work and social work literature, reflecting both the significant impact behavioral methods are having on the related field of community psychology and the relative neglect of the approach by community - and organizational - level social work practitioners and researchers.

Intervention at the macro level has a number of goals, including coordinating the activities of organizations, encouraging citizen participation and self-help activities, enabling groups to resolve social conflicts, advocacy, direct action and strategic decision making. As recently as a decade ago, Gurikn noted that, "There is as yet no comprehensive theoretical framework for dealing effectively with either the causation of social problems or the evaluation of intervention methods" (1971, p. 1331). If social workers take the view that societal problems are the result of the behavior of individuals, groups, organizations or the society at large, then learning theory is a unifying framework for conceptualizing the nature and causation of social ills, and the methodology of the experimental analysis of behavior is an appropriate tool for the furtherance of macro-level practice.

A number of theoretical analyses of social problems based upon learning theory have been published (Maclean, 1977; DiGiacomo, 1977; Saleebey, 1976; Siddal & Balcerzak, 1978), but of greater importance is the expanding body of experimental research demonstrating the effectiveness of behavioral interventions in fulfilling some of the traditional goals of community and organizational practice. Behavioral

analysis and intervention are effective in improving the job finding skills of the chronically unemployed (Jones & Azrin, 1973; Azrin, Flores & Kaplan, 1975; Pierce & Risley, 1974), improving the nutrition of children (Madsen, Madsen & Thompson, 1974), improving public health (Fawcett, 1977; Reiss, Piotrowski & Bailey, 1976), facilitating racial integration (Hauserman, Walen & Behling, 1973), reducing crime (Schnelle, Kirchner, McNeés & Lawler, 1975), increasing the self-help group activities of welfare recipients (Miller & Miller, 1970), and the problem-solving skills of low income community board members (Briscoe, Hoffman & Bailey, 1975). These studies clearly show that macro-based interventions are susceptible to the experimental analytic methodology found useful at the individual level, and that group, organizational and community behavior may be approached through similar behavioral principles. Although community practice is carried out through the medium of group and organizational structures, macro-level practitioners have been slow in adopting behavioral approaches. There has been a fear that these methods are mechanistic, impositional, or work against the democratic ethos of community organization philosophy (Bruck, 1968). In our opinion, these views have been oversimplified to the detriment of the more effective, and at the same time, ethical practice. We will come back to a discussion of this issue later in the paper.

The social problems mentioned above have long been the focus of social workers in community settings and it would seem to be to the profession's advantage to incorporate any methodology, congruent with the values of social work practice, which afford solutions to such long-standing

difficulties. The present article will describe the basic principles of behavioral intervention, discuss their application at the macro level, and draw from the authors' practice experience and the social work literature to illustrate the practical employment of such procedures.

#### BEHAVIORAL COMMUNITY INTERVENTION: THE APPROACH

A learning theory perspective of behavior at the organizational and community levels assumes that such behavior is a function, like the behavior of individuals, of its environmental contingencies such as consequences (rewarding, aversive or neutral), antecedent stimuli, such as settings and past experience, and vicarious or indirect learning acquired via observation and instruction. It also assumes an empirical, experimental approach to analyzing behavior. A prerequisite to implementing a behavioral model for community practice is the establishment of an operational definition of both the problem and the anticipated goals of intervention. Past experience by community researchers suggests that "when goals are formulated in such global generalizations as 'prompting community self-help,' it is difficult to be responsible for failure or clear about success . . . . We need to say specifically what it is that we are trying to do, and to be held responsible when things do turn out as we had hoped. This kind of rigorous goal definition permits what we have always said is elusive: evaluation. And certainly accountability is important in keeping faith with the people we serve" (Rothman, Erlich & Teresa, 1976, p. 4). The behavioral approach attempts to define the problems and select goals based upon the criteria of measurability and specificity.

As an example, assume that the focus of community-level intervention is the lack of minority participation in local government. Conceptualizing the problem in terms of voter apathy and the goal as increased political awareness contributes little to either measuring the problem or selecting intervention methods. An operational definition of the situation is the number of minority representatives on civic boards. An operational goal is the election of three minority members to the school board in the next election. Concern over minority representation is likely already present before the arrival of the social worker on the scene and concretizing a feasible, immediate objective is a way to meet that concern in practical terms. Similarly, "raising the consciousness" of citizens regarding the high occurrence of sexual assaults is a goal which is quite difficult to measure, however noble the intent. Establishing a night-time companion service to escort single individuals from work or campus safely to their homes has the added virtue, besides nobility of intent, of being quantifiable (i.e., number of escorts per night, or a reduction in the number of reported assaults). If the service is under-utilized, perhaps it should be disbanded. If the frequency of assaults remains unchanged, some new tactic may be implemented. The intelligent determination of such actions on the part of the practitioner is only feasible if the problem and goal have been quantified in some manner and data is available to make such decisions.

The Community Intervention Project, (CIP) at the University of Michigan School of Social Work, is an example of such a behavioral approach to macro-level practice. The project has been described

elsewhere (Rothman, Erlich & Teresa, 1976; Rothman, Teresa & Erlich, 1977; Rothman, Teresa & Erlich, 1978; Rothman, 1980), therefore, a comprehensive description will not be given here. The project took a research utilization-social research and development form. Existing research knowledge was retrieved and synthesized, and generalizations were developed from consensus findings. These were then converted from descriptive to prescriptive form, suggesting interventive strategies and techniques which included, among others: offering or increasing relevant benefits in order to stimulate participation in community groups; partializing an innovative service or program in a segment of a target system; increasing the power of groups favoring a given change; and, altering the structure of influence within an organization as a means of changing the goals of an organization. These techniques were then implemented systematically by agency practitioners in a field test that sought to operationalize the intervention techniques and to evaluate their effectiveness in attaining their intended objectives.

Some interventions were more directly behavioral in concept than others (for example, use of relevant benefits to foster participation), but the overall perspective had distinct behavioral methodological aspects. Let us delineate some of these:

1. Intervention methods were formulated from empirically-based research and theory. A thorough search of the relevant empirical literature was conducted and interventions were designed from findings which had a reasonable level of consensus among different

investigators.

2. Field practitioners were asked to formulate their objectives in clear, behaviorally specific terms. For example, the nature of participation needed to be specified: rate - what extent of increase in participation was being aimed at, either in numbers of participants or proportion of change in participation; form - attendance at meetings, taking committee responsibility, making financial contributions, expressing more verbal statements at meetings; duration - extent of stability or regularity of participation; and recruitment - the number of new members attracted to the organization.
3. Extensive logs were kept and the findings indicated specific actions to be taken, factors which facilitated or limited intervention progress, and aspects of the social psychological environment of implementation.
4. Operationalizing and proceduralizing intervention was based on the empirical realities of field implementation. The intervention techniques and strategies provided a general direction toward achieving given objectives. It was left to practitioners in the field to discover the details of the interventive design. Thus, practitioners had to determine what actual benefits or reinforcements were available to them to offer clients in



typical community work social agency situations, and which ones were effective with particular types of clientele. Through the field work and analysis of logs, four types of benefits were delineated. The first class consisted of instrumental benefits, either material resources such as loans, grants, or information, or anticipatory benefits such as setting up an action structure, or obtaining a verbal commitment as a partial achievement toward the material gain. The second class consisted of expressive benefits, either inter-personal ones such as enjoyable socializing, or symbolic ones such as receiving a community service award. In practice, these approaches were often used in combination; sometimes one was given special emphasis and supplemented by others.

5. Short-term objectives were employed, with each successive step an approximation toward a larger goal. This was stated as follows. "A practitioner should proceed by setting a sequence of goals that are specific, realistic, and proximate -- that is short-run and tangible. A general objective is by approached by moving through incremental stages; the attainment of one stage leads to the de-definition of the goal for the next one" (Rothman, Erlich & Teresa, 1976, pp.3-4). We also characterized this as a "stepping-stone procedure."

6. Practitioners were expected to indicate outcomes in clear, behaviorally specific terms. For example, the number of people participating in meetings at the end of the intervention period, or, to illustrate goal change in an organization, a budget statement indicating the amount of funds shifted over from recreational to educational programming. A panel of raters was used to judge the degree to which intended outcomes were achieved.

The case of the C.I.P. illustrates that behavioral perspectives, including the experimental analysis of behavior, can be applied in community and organizational settings. We will now expand the discussion to include other interventions using macro-level learning theory and demonstrate how these were applied in a variety of community intervention undertakings.

#### COMPONENTS OF BEHAVIORAL COMMUNITY INTERVENTION

Operant learning theory provides a basic framework for analyzing macro-level behavioral intervention. This learning theory model of community and organizational practice assumes that community level behavior is a function of specific ongoing contingencies of reinforcement which need to be detected and possibly altered. Previous social work writers have provided full descriptions of these principles (Fischer Gochros, 1975; Wodarski & Bagarozzi, 1979) which include the functions of positive reinforcement, negative reinforcement, positive, punishment, negative punishment, operant

extinction, shaping and observational learning. Examples will be taken from the behavioral social work literature which illustrate the employment of each of these interventive techniques. Certain limitations inherent in their application will also be presented. The behavioral operations listed above have led to the development of over 40 distinct interventions, each with its own indications and contra-indications for use. It is to those procedures which are transferable in some form to macro-level intervention to which we direct our attention.

### Positive Reinforcement

Positive reinforcement has been defined as "an increase (strengthening) in the probability that a behavior will occur as a result of the presentation of some stimuli (positive reinforcer) following that behavior" (Fischer & Gochros, 1975, p. 484). A specific example can be given from the Community Intervention Project. A housing project citizens committee being organized by a social worker was floundering due to a lack of participation. By providing material benefits to the members of the group, voluntary participation dramatically increased. The "benefits" included, for example, free roach spray, toilet repairs, school advocacy services, and transportation to dental appointments, illustrating how individual needs can be accommodated while employing a single interventive approach. One school/community social worker found that the use of an expressive, symbolic, benefit was more appropriate. The number of community members offering their services to aid the school's programs was quite low. Providing of service awards and publicizing the programs (complete with

pictures of the volunteers) dramatically increased not only the number of volunteers working at the school, but also attendance at the Parent-Teacher Organization meetings when the awards were given out. By holding the School-Community Council election during that same meeting, voter participation was also increased.

Miller and Miller (1970), in an experimental analysis aimed at increasing the self-help group activities of welfare recipients, found that the provision of material reinforcers, client advocacy, and liaison services greatly improved the participation of AFDC clients. Perhaps more importantly, generalization or transfer was observed to occur with related forms of self-help, such as attending other civic meetings where explicit benefits were not contingent upon participation, and by the increased use of academic tutors for the children of group members.

Positive reinforcement, as an intervention, was employed by Wodarski and his colleagues toward a somewhat larger scale social problem, that of excessive energy consumption. In an early successful demonstration project, material benefits were provided contingent upon reductions in electricity use in a single-family dwelling (Wodarski, 1978). Symbolic benefits (recognition through letters and posters) proved more appropriate toward reducing energy consumption within the workplace (Wodarski & Horne, 1981). Using a group contingency plan, small biweekly payments were found to be a cost-effective means for encouraging electricity conservation among residents of large master-metered apartment complexes (Slavin, Wodarski & Blackburn, 1981).

Positive reinforcement, applied above

to increase group participation, self-help activities, community involvement and energy conservation, represents a potent intervention technique. Of course, community workers have always attempted to provide benefits to their clients as a means of influencing behavior. The behavioral approach differs in that reinforcers are provided consciously and deliberately and are contingent upon the occurrence of specific behaviors, thus strengthening them. This precludes the paradox noted by Siddal and Balcerzak (1978) that, "The predictable difficulty with the present welfare system can be traced to poorly programmed reinforcement contingencies . . . reinforcers (financial aid, etc.) are primarily available on a noncontingent basis. When positive reinforcers are presented on a noncontingent basis, behavior incompatible with the intended productive behavior may be increased . . . Thus, behavior incompatible with self-support may be inadvertently maintained" (pp. 243-44).

By definition, positive reinforcement is applicable in any situation wherein it is desirable to increase some behavior. A limitation of this approach consists of the practical realities of the social worker's ability to deliver benefits. To the extent that material resources are unavailable for the practitioner to contingently apply, positive reinforcement may be impractical. In such cases, however, creative substitution of low-cost symbolic-expressive benefits can be applied in the absence of material ones. It is, of course, desirable for the purposes of generalization and maintenance to have symbolic, intrinsic, or naturally occurring benefits ultimately serve as the self-perpetuating contingencies of reinforcement. For example, in the study by

Miller and Miller (1970), it would be hoped that the positive consequences of effective group self-help would eventually be enough of an incentive for the group to sustain itself, following the gradual withdrawal of the material benefit contingencies. This underlines the importance of careful analysis and planning, and effective intervention at the macro-level in order for behavioral techniques to be viable.

### Negative Reinforcement

Negative reinforcement has been defined as, "An increase (strengthening) in the probability that a behavior will occur as a result of withdrawing, or escaping or avoiding, some stimulus (aversive) following that behavior" (Fischer & Gochros, 1975), p. 484). The community worker may be able to make use of naturally occurring events or situations in the natural environment in order to employ the principle of negative reinforcement. This approach was used by Bennett (1971) in his behavioral intervention to prevent eviction of a family with a continuous 20-year history of incurring rent arrears. In one nine-year period, they received 12 eviction notices, eviction being precluded each time by the intervention of a social worker or a temporary reduction in arrears. A final eviction notice was sent by the housing authorities, on which occasion behavioral methodologies were employed for the first time. In order to prevent the family from being evicted, it was necessary for them to both pay their rent on a regular basis and to reduce their indebtedness to the housing authorities. Bennett constructed a colorful graph which vividly depicted the amount of the arrears (an aversive stimulus). The housewife agreed upon a small monthly payment which she could pay over and above the cost of the rent. Each

payday the social worker personally collected the rent, plus the small payment to reduce indebtedness, and ceremoniously recorded this reduction on the graph with the accompaniment of a great deal of enthusiastic praise and attention. Eventually, the social worker stopped collecting the rent personally (this task was carried out by the regular rent collector) but continued the graph reduction ceremony during his weekly visits.

Portraying the arrears in a vivid fashion by means of a colorful graph brought home to his clients their aversive situation (serious indebtedness to the housing authority). By reducing this aversiveness in a symbolic yet understandable manner, contingent upon proper payment, regular rent paying was established and indebtedness eliminated over a 20-week period. While a one family example is provided, the same technique can be applied within a given population. One drawback is that direct negative reinforcement by the practitioner may be difficult to implement in many community work situations and it may run counter to the trust and collaboration required in many areas of practice.

### Positive Punishment

The use of punitive interventive techniques represents a more controversial aspect of behavioral community practice than do reinforcement procedures. In part, and rightly so, some of these reservations stem from ethical considerations. More empirically based cautions have been noted by Wodarski and Bagarozzi (1979) who suggest that "a substantial use of punishment simultaneously may increase the probability that: 1) the worker will lose

reinforcing power; 2) the client will quit; and 3) the client may develop aggressive behavior toward the worker" (p. 43). Some writers in the field of behavioral social work have completely repudiated the employment of punishment procedures (Schwartz & Goldiamond, 1975), while others advocate their use only with highly refractory, severe or life-threatening problems.

One punishment technique involves the behavioral operation of positive punishment, or the "decrease (weakening) in the probability that a behavior will occur as the result of the presentation of an aversive stimulus following that behavior" (Fischer & Gochros, 1975, p. 484). The operation of our legal system comes to mind as an example of behavioral contingencies based primarily upon positive punishment designed to reduce or prevent certain activities.

Lind (1967) describes the use of mild positive punishment procedures within an organizational context, consisting of aversive confrontation and reprimands contingent upon employee tardiness. He suggests that positive punishment procedures are primarily indicated when reinforcers are unavailable to the change agent or are ineffectual. Nevertheless, a useful dictum is "proceed with caution".

### Negative Punishment

Negative punishment is the operation in which "A decrease (weakening) in the probability that a behavior will occur as the result of the removal of a positive



reinforcer following that behavior" (Fischer & Gochros, 1975, p. 484). Examples of this procedure seem somewhat more numerous than those for positive punishment. DeVoge and Downey (1975) describe the operation of a token economy-based community mental health day treatment center. In this approach, de-institutionalized psychiatric patients residing in a half-way house attended the program from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. Points, exchangeable for material and symbolic benefits, could be earned for behaviors conducive to social integration, and ultimately, completely independent living, such as task completion, personal grooming and appropriate verbal expression. The system combined positive reinforcement and negative punishment; points were not only earned for appropriate behavior, but were removed for inappropriate activities (tardiness, unkempt appearance, bizarre verbalizations, etc.). Over the course of the treatment program, the mean number of reinforcing points earned per day increased, whereas the average number of punishment points removed per day declined, indicating the effectiveness of the intervention system at promoting prosocial behavior. In this instance, we are dealing with a therapeutic community rather than a geographic area. However, similar contingency relationships can be found at macro levels. For example, financial grants to agencies are stopped or diminished by the United Way or Community Development Block Grant Program when agency service reports or grant applications do not conform with stated expectations.

### Extinction

The principle of extinction involves attempting to decrease the probability of a response by removing the reinforcements

which serve to maintain that behavior. As such, extinction probably has a limited use of community practice as a whole, but may be applicable in highly specific situations. An example from the C.I.P. (Rothman, et. al., 1976, p. 109) is that one member of a group persisted in offering impractical suggestions and digressions, largely as a means of focusing the attention of others on himself. The suggestion was that the chairperson of the group ignore or only briefly address these undesirable participations in a routine manner, as opposed to giving it his/her usual special attention. By removing the expressive benefits previously contingent upon the inappropriate comments, the frequency of such comments should decline. It would probably facilitate this process to begin presenting the desired attention contingent upon the member offering useful and practical suggestions, thus combining the extinction procedure with positive reinforcement.

### Shaping

One of the useful action guidelines developed in the C.I.P. is a strategy designed to promote the acceptance of innovative services and programs. Specifically, the action guideline stated that "Practitioners wishing to promote adoption of an innovation should attempt to formulate it in such a way that the total innovation can be experienced initially by a limited proportion of the target system" (Rothman et al., 1977, p. 46). In short, this concept advocates approaching terminal goals by means of an incremental, partialized completion of short term goals. A successful implementation in a given population group, shapes acceptance in a next-step larger population group. A diffusion effect is sought after. Although

not specifically derived from a behavioral perspective, this action guideline is markedly congruent with the learning theory concept of shaping, that is, "The process of reinforcing units of behavior that successively approximate some goal . . . in order to achieve the terminal behavior that is desired" (Fischer & Gochros, 1975, p. 485).

Numerous interventions occurred in the C.I.P. which illustrated the practicality of this approach, including such settings as a community mental health center in a semi-rural county, a traditional settlement house serving a largely black population, an urban social welfare employees union, and a multi-county regional planning council (Rothman et al., 1976, p. 28). In each instance, a broadly conceived terminal goal involving a community or organization's adoption of an innovative service or new responsibility was successfully accomplished by the social worker getting the innovation accepted within a subgroup of the target system and only then introducing the successful demonstration in the larger community context, often in several successive waves. The use of short-range intervention goals not only served to facilitate the ultimate achievement of the terminal goal, but also served the secondary but vital function of reinforcing the community worker's activities at more frequent, periodic intervals.

### Social Learning Approaches

Although explicit operant factors may be responsible for the long-term maintenance of certain aspects of group, organizational, or community behavior, it is obvious that many skills are not initially acquired by such a conditioning process. In such cases the new behaviors were

probably learned via some process of social of vicarious learning, such as modeling or learning by imitation, direct or indirect instruction, peer influence and so forth, which are potent mechanisms for the acquisition of complex behavior (Bandura, 1977) and undoubtedly play an important role in many aspects of community and organizational practice. Until recently, formal application of social learning theory to the macro-level practice has been rarely found in the literature. This may be due in part to the fact that the bulk of research in social learning theory has been concerned with the influence of vicarious learning processes upon the behavior of individuals rather than groups.

One early suggestion advocating employing social learning principles within community organization practice is found in Fellin, Rothman and Meyer (1967). In this example, "The practitioner, working with a voluntary association, carries out the role of chairman of the group until a member learns the behaviors appropriate to the position. Group members may also observe the practitioner's representing the group in meetings or contacts with representatives of other groups. This technique may also be employed to develop indigenous leaders, who in turn serve as models for group members. Coaching, which requires a natural 'real life' setting, is still another technique that appears to be particularly adaptable to community organizations, especially where the practitioner works directly with persons in the course of their normal participation in civic affairs" (pp. 82-83).

Wodarski and Bagarozzi (1979, pp. 142-68) have outlined the major components which contribute to the success or failure of observational learning and the approach

has been extensively applied by social workers in recent years teaching individuals and groups a variety of adaptive interpersonal skills (see Thyer, 1981). Examples reflective of the broad application which social learning has for macro-level practice include the acquisition of job finding abilities for teenage mothers (Schinke, Gilchrist, Smith & Wong, 1978), assertiveness skills for low income black parents (Berman & Rickel, 1979), professional women (Brockway, 1976; Numeroff, 1978) and physically abused wives (Jansen & Meyers-Abell, 1981), and conflict resolution skills by children (Edelson, 1981).

A recent report (Schinke, Gilchrist, Smith and Wong, 1979) employed a pretest-post test control group design to demonstrate the effectiveness of social learning principles in helping paraprofessional community social service agency staff members acquire effective interpersonal skills. The procedures included the modeling of desired behavior by the social worker and overt rehearsal by the staff member with concurrent coaching, reinforcement and feedback by both the social worker and group peers. The discussion control group watched a film depicting interpersonal situations and subsequently members discussed their own past or present interpersonal difficulties. The results demonstrated the superior efficacy of the social learning theory approach, when compared to simple discussion and suggestions, which were largely ineffective.

#### DISCUSSION AND SUMMARY

Previous empirical studies have

established that large group behavior in many instances is a function of operations similar to those of individual behavior. The extent of this isomorphism has not yet been fully determined, although the initial indications are promising. A behavioral approach to community practice can contribute to the development of a more effective and accountable level of professional practice, potentially to the same extent behavioral methods have influenced the field of interpersonal practice (Fischer, 1981).

Several advantages for community work stem from developing operational descriptions of treatment goals and employing a technologically based independent variable (intervention) such as those derived from learning theory. If goals are quantified and susceptible of reliable and repeated measurement, the effectiveness of community practice can be assessed by means of interrupted time series research designs. When applied to research on the outcomes of interpersonal practice, interrupted time series designs have been labeled as single-case or single-subject research (Thomas, 1978) but a number of recent publications have suggested how such designs can be applied to macro-level practice as well (Epstein & Tripodi, 1977; Tripodi & Harrington, 1979). Such designs can be used not only for program evaluation, but also for the more sophisticated purpose of experimentation. Evaluation of community practice is vital, not only for establishing professional accountability but for important ethical considerations as well. As Mullen has pointed out "... it is essential that professionals recognize that most of the principles that guide our interventions are unvalidated assumptions, open to question" (1977, p. 39). Some social work

interventions may be ineffectual (Bernard, 1975), while others may even exert a detrimental effect (Galinsky & Schopler, 1977; Blenkner, Bloom & Nielsen, 1971). Segal expresses a strong position regarding this: "Any new program established by an agency is unproven. A control study design seems not only ethical but mandatory . . ." (1972, p. 10). With interrupted time series research designs, the system which is the focus of practitioner effort serves as its own control for purposes of comparing the effects of intervention with those present prior to social work intervention. Since the design does not require the expensive requisites of group experimental research such as comparable control groups, representative sampling and random assignment, these designs place within the grasp of any community worker intervening in a macro-level system the means for systematic outcome research so urgently needed in the field.

A decade ago, Gelfand (1972) suggested that newly graduated B.S.W. and M.S.W. level practitioners in the year 1975 would be prepared to use behavioral methods with regularity. This prediction appears to have been overly optimistic for the practice of social work at the community and organizational levels, yet the potential of the behavioral approach mandates increased efforts for training in such interventions. A behavioral approach to macro-level practice has certain limitations however, in common with other intervention theories. For example, while behavioral procedures can be used to improve group communication skills, learning theory is silent when the issue is one of decision making itself. Similarly, situations involving political choices or value conflict may vary in terms of being amenable to behavioral approaches.

Behavioral methods may present special ethical and moral problems. A community does not present itself to the practitioner in his/her office requesting service. At the community level, within American society, precepts of democracy and self-rule are taken seriously. Some interventions may fall within a democratic framework, others may not. For example, in the case of a settlement house practitioner assigned to work collaboratively with a neighborhood group, it would be inappropriate for the practitioner to decide that integrated housing should be the priority objective and then to give positive punishment (verbal reprimand, let us say) to those members of the group who do not go along with him. On the other hand, a regional representative of a state civil rights commission would be justified in applying legal and regulatory sanctions against individuals or real estate agents who discriminate in the housing market. In the latter case, the individual is implementing a goal that has been established by the democratically elected legislature, as well as procedures that were similarly authorized. Different practitioners may interpret given situations in different ways. In the handbook developed from the C.I.P., the need to exercise individual discernment by the practitioner was recognized and given emphasis:

The reader will have to rely on personal judgement in the application: Does this initiative fit any situation? Am I comfortable with it organizationally? Philosophically? Does it seem as good or better than alternative approaches that come to mind? (Rothman, Teresa & Erlich, 1978, p. 59).



The ethical issue may be viewed in reverse. When an intervention is available which may effectively alleviate problematic conditions or promote social justice, does the practitioner not have an obligation to make use of it? If behavioral techniques can be demonstrated to enhance practice outcomes, a responsible practitioner can hardly ignore them on an a priori philosophical basis.

A way to avoid the impositional factor altogether is for the practitioners to serve as resource persons to established community decision making groups (representative committees, agency boards, and the like), presenting for their consideration behavioral strategies and techniques which might help them attain goals they have selected to pursue. In the C.I.P. case, the board of a community group was concerned over lack of sufficient participation. The practitioner introduced the "benefits" action guideline to the group, and when they expressed interest trained them in its application. The democratically elected board itself became the agent of implementation. This form of utilization could be employed widely.

### CONCLUSION

A substantial body of research in a variety of social science disciplines supports the contention that operant conditioning and observational learning are potent influences upon group, organizational, and community behavior. Experimental approaches to analyzing behavior are widely accepted in the social disciplines and human service professions. Systematic application of such processes, aimed at the alleviation of social problems, can greatly contribute to the development of an effective empirically-

based macro-level social work practice.

#### REFERENCES

- Azrin, N., Flores, T. and Kaplan, S.  
1975 "Job finding club: A group-assisted program for finding employment". Behavior Research and Therapy, 13, 17-27.
- Bandura, A.  
1977 Social Learning Theory. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall.
- Bennet, G.  
1971 "Behavior Intervention to Prevent Eviction". Social Work Today, 1 (11), 11-16.
- Bermon, S and Rickel, A.  
1979 "Assertive Training for Low Income Women". Clinical Social Work Journal, 7, 123-132.
- Bernard, S.  
1975 "Why Service Delivery Programs Fail". Social Work, 20, 206-211.
- Blenkner, M., Bloom, M. and Nielson, M.  
1971 "A Research and Demonstration Project of Protective Services". Social Casework, 52, 483-499.
- Briscoe, R., Hoffman, D. and Bailey, J.  
1975 "Behavioral Community Psychology: Training a Community Board to Problem Solve". Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 8, 157-168.

- Bruck, M.  
1968 "Behavior Modification Theory and Practice: A Critical Review". Social Work, 13(2), 43-56.
- DeVoge, J. and Downey, W.  
1975 "A Token Economy Program in a Community Mental Health Day Care Treatment Center". In W. Gentry (Ed.), Applied Behavior Modification. St Louis, MO.: The C.V. Mosley Co.
- DiGiacomo, R.  
1977 "Behavior Modification: Toward the Understanding and Reform of Welfare Policy". Corrective and Social Psychiatry, 23, 101-110.
- Edleson, J.  
1981 "Teaching Children to Resolve Conflict: A Group Approach". Social Work, 26, 488-493.
- Epstein, I. and Tripodi, T.  
1977 "Interrupted Time Series Designs". In I. Epstein and T. Tripodi (Eds.), Research Techniques for Program Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Fawcett, S.  
1977 "Behavioral Technology and Smallpox Eradication". Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 10, 558.
- Fellin, P., Rothman, J. and Meyer, H.  
1967 "Implications of the Socio-behavioral for Community Organization Practice". In E.

- Thomas (Ed.), The Socio-behavioral Approach and Applications to Social Work. New York: Council on Social Work Education.
- Fischer, J.  
 1978 Effective Casework Practice: An Electric Approach. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Fischer, J.  
 1981 "The Social Work Revolution". Social Work, 26, 199-207.
- Galinsky, M. and Schopler, J.  
 1977 "Warning: Groups May be Dangerous". Social Work, 22, 89-94.
- Gelfand, B.  
 1974 "Emerging Trends in Social Treatment". In R. Klenk and R. Ryan (Eds.), The Practice of Social Work (2nd ed.). Belmont, Ca.: Wadsworth.
- Gurin, A.  
 1973 "Social Planning and Community Organization". In R. Morris (Ed.), Encyclopedia of Social Work (Vol II). Washington, D.C.: National Association of Social Workers.
- Hauserman, N., Walen, S. and Behling, M.  
 1973 "Reinforced Racial Integration in the First Grade: A Study in Generalization". Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 6, 193-200.
- Jansen, M. and Meyers-Abell, J.  
 1981 "Assertive Training for Battered Women: A Pilot Program".

Social Work, 26, 164-165.

Jones, R. and Azrin, N.

- 1973 "An Experimental Replication of a Social Reinforcement Approach to the Problem of Job Finding". Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 6, 345-354.

Lind, R.

- 1967 "Applications of Socio-behavioral Theory to Administrative Practice." In E. Thomas (ED.), The Socio-behavioral Approach and Application to Social Work. New York: Council on Social Work Education.

Maclean, M.

- 1977 "Learning Theory and Chronic Welfare Dependency: A Hypothesis of Etiological and Contingency Relationships." Journal of Behavior Therapy and Experimental Psychiatry, 8, 255-259.

Madsen, C., Madsen, C. and Thompson, F.

- 1974 "Increasing Rural Head Start Children's Consumption of Middle-class Meals." Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 7, 257-262.

Miller, L. and Miller, O.

- 1970 "Reinforcing Self-help Group Activities of Welfare Recipients." Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 3, 57-64.

Mullen, E

- 1977 "Evaluative Research in Social Work." In. R. Jackson (Ed.), Evaluation of Social Work

Services In Community Health and  
Medical Care Programs. DHEW  
Publication No. (HSA) 77-5205.  
Washington, D.C.: U.S.  
Government Printing Office.

Numeroff, R.

1978 "Assertiveness Training for  
Nurses in a General Hospital."  
Health and Social Work, 3, 79-  
102.

Pierce, C. and Risley, T.

1974 "Improving Job Performance of  
Neighborhood Youth Corp Aides in  
an Urban Recreation Program."  
Journal of Applied Behavior  
Analysis, 7, 207-216.

Reiss, M., Piotrowski, W. and Bailey, J.

1976 "Behavioral Community Psycho-  
logy: Encouraging Low Income  
Parents to Seek Dental Care for  
their Children." Journal of  
Applied Behavior Analysis, 9,  
387-398.

Rothman, J.

1980 Social R and D: Research and  
Development in Human Services.  
Englewood Cliffs, N.J.:  
Prentice-Hall.

Rothman, J., Erlich, J.L. and Teresa, J.G.

1976 Promoting Innovation and Change  
in Organizations and  
Communities. New York: John  
Wiley and Sons.

Rothman, J., Teresa, J.G. and Erlich, J.L.

1977 Developing Effective Strategies  
of Social Intervention: A  
Research and Development  
Methodology. Springfield, Va.:  
National Technical Information

## Service.

- Rothman, J., Teresa, J.G. and Erlich, J.L.  
1978 Fostering Participation and Innovation: Handbook for Human Service Professionals. Itasca, Ill.: F.E. Peacock Publishers.
- Saleebey, D.  
1976 "Pigeons, People and Paradise: Skinnerian Technology and the Coming of the Welfare Society." Social Service Review, 50, 388-401.
- Schnell, J., Kirchner, R., McNees, J. and Lawler, J.  
1975 "Social Evaluation Research: The Evaluation of Two Police Patrolling Strategies." Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis, 8, 353-366.
- Schwartz, A. and Goldiamond, I.  
1975 Social Casework: A Behavioral Approach. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Schinke, S., Gilchrist, L., Smith, T. and Wong, S.  
1978 "Improving Teenage Mothers' Ability to Compete for Jobs." Social Work Research and Abstracts, 14 (3), 25-29.
- Schinke, S., Gilchrist, L., Smith, T. and Wong, S.  
1979 "Group Interpersonal Skills Training in a Natural Setting: An Experimental Study." Behavior Research and Therapy, 17, 149-154.
- Segal, S.  
1972 "Research on the Outcome of

Social Work Intervention."  
Journal of Health and Social  
Behavior, 13, 3-17.

Sheldon, B. and Hudson, B.  
1981 Editorial. International Journal  
of Behavioral Social Work and  
Abstracts, 1, 1-2.

Siddal, J. and Balcerzak, W.  
1978 "A Behavioral Model for Welfare  
Reform: The Volunteer Incentive  
System." Behavior Therapy, 2,  
243-247.

Slavin, R., Wodarski, J. and Blackburn, B.  
1981 "A Group Contingency for  
Electricity Consumption in  
Master-metered Apartments."  
Journal of Applied Behavior  
Analysis, 14, 357-363.

Strean, H.  
1973 "Psychoanalytically-oriented  
Casework Versus Behavior  
Therapy." Clinical Social Work  
Journal, 1, 143-160.

Thomas, E.  
1973 "Social Casework and Social  
Group Work: The Behavioral  
Approach." In R. Morris (Ed.),  
Encyclopedia of Social Work  
(Vol. II), New York: National  
Association of Social Workers.

Thomas, E.  
1978 "Research and Service in Single-  
case Experimentation: Conflicts  
and Choices." Social Work  
Research and Abstracts, 14 (4),  
20-31.

Thomas, E.  
1970 "Behavior Modification and



Casework." In R. Roberts and R. Nee (Eds.), Theories of Social Casework. Chicago, Ill.: University of Chicago Press.

Thyer, B.

1981 "Behavioral Social Work: A Bibliography." International Journal of Behavioral Social Work and Abstracts, 1, 229-251.

Thyer, B and Bronson, D.

1981 "Behavioral Training in Social Work Education: An Update and a Program Description." Journal of Behavior Therapy and Experimental Psychiatry, 12, 43-47.

Tripodi, T. and Harrington, J.

1979 "Use of Time-series Designs for Formative Program Evaluation." Journal of Social Service Research, 3, 67-68.

Weisner, S. and Silver, M.

1981 "Community Work and Social Learning Theory." Social Work, 26, 146-150.

Wodarski, J.

1978 "The Modification of Electrical Energy Consumption." The Behavior Therapist, 1 (4), 21-22.

Wodarski, J. and Bagarozzi, D.

1979 Behavioral Social Work. New York: Human Services Press.

Wodarski, J. and Horne, J.

1981 "The Reduction of Energy Consumption in Large Academic Buildings: An Application of Group Incentive, Feedback and Appeal." Behavioral Counseling Quarterly, 1, 69-78.

MEASURING ECOLOGY IN SOCIAL WORK  
SUPERVISION: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN  
WORK AND TREATMENT ENVIRONMENTS AND THE  
QUALITY OF SUPERVISION IN ISRAELI PUBLIC  
WELFARE AGENCIES

DR. RON MAIER  
Lecturer, School of Social Work,  
University of Haifa, Israel.

Received Ph.D. from Washington University,  
1978. Current interests are citizen part-  
icipation, generic social work practice and  
the social ecology of social work agencies.

MS. EDNA GUTTMANN  
Research Associate, School of Social Work,  
University of Haifa, Israel.

Graduate Student, current interests are in  
practice model building and child and youth  
care work.

DR. ZVI EISIKOVITS  
Senior Lecturer, School of Social Work,  
University of Haifa, Israel

Received Ph.D. from the University of  
Minnesota, 1977. Current interests are  
epistemology of practice, professional  
socialization, residential child and youth  
care.

ABSTRACT

This study measures the interaction  
between work and treatment environments in

public welfare agencies and social work supervision. One hundred and twenty-four social work students enrolled in B.S.W. studies at two Israeli universities, who were doing field work in these agencies, were randomly sampled. The work and treatment environments were measured utilizing an adapted version of a scale developed by Rudolf H. Moos. The student's evaluation of supervision was measured using a revised version of Carlton Munson's questionnaire. Supervisory variables such as administrative capability, effective use of time, and relationships were positively correlated with work environment variables such as order and organization, clarity, cohesiveness and support, and with treatment environment variables such as innovation, spontaneity, anger and aggression. Conflicts in the supervisory relationship were correlated with a controlling and unsupportive work environment. The use of technology was perceived as limiting the clients' autonomy. While some logical influences were drawn concerning the direction of these correlations and the possible paths these create, further research is needed in order to address the direction of these correlations. Some practice implications of the findings were discussed briefly.

---

Social work interest in the study of human environments and especially in the person-environment interface has increased dramatically over the last decade (Maluccio, 1979). Germain (1981) contends that concern for the person-in-environment "...is the distinguishing and unifying characteristic of social work."

From its inception, social work considered the agency setting as central to the work and to the therapeutic process (Perlman, 1957; Hollis, 1972; Turner, 1978). This view was at the heart of several theoretical models, but little effort was made to test them empirically. Examples of these models are the application of the general systems theory to social work (Gordon, 1969), the Psychosocial formulation to social treatment (Turner, 1978) and the linking of social work with the concept of social networks (Collins & Pancoast, 1976). The integration of these models led to the development of the ecological approach in social work (Gitterman & Germain, 1976; Germain, 1979; Germain, 1981)

This approach focuses on improving transactions between people and environments in order to strengthen adaptive capacities and improve environments (Germain, 1979; Coulton, 1979a). Ecological social work practice is based on "the natural life processes of adaptation, stress, coping, and the environmental nutrients required for release of adaptive capacities" (Germain, 1981). The objective is to strengthen the individual's autonomy, competence, relatedness and identity through a change effort focused on the individual, the environment or the person-in-environment (Middleman & Goldberg, 1974; Coulton, 1979a; Germain, 1979).

While ecological measurement is at the basis of a wide variety of studies in the social and behavioral sciences which assess environments in industry and business organizations (Pane & Pheysey, 1971; Drexler, 1977; Schneider, 1980), treatment settings (Proshansky & Rivlin, 1970; Willems, 1976; Lemke & Moos, 1981; Rhodes,

1981), other total institutions (Moos, 1974), educational settings (Stern, 1970) and informal group and family contexts (Moos, 1974), it has rarely been applied to primary social work settings. There are several examples of ecologically based research in social work. Seabury (1971) described and compared the physical settings of six social work agencies. Coulton (1979) measured the person-environment fit among users of hospital social services. Maluccio (1979, 1979a) found that clients perceived the social and physical environments of the agency as more critical to the course and outcome of service, than did the social workers. One study was found which measured public welfare agencies from a holistic ecological perspective. It examined the impact of the organizational structure of these agencies on the work and treatment environments (Maier, 1983). These studies clarify the interdependence of the social environments in the treatment organization and the quality of service provided to clients. Hence, the work and treatment environments need to be studied in their interaction in the context of the agency's everyday functioning.

More specifically, the agency's physical surroundings, relationships among workers and the opportunities each worker has for growing and developing, the relationships among clients and workers, their input in the management of care are all interacting and their quality is essential in operationalizing an ecological perspective to social work practice. Measuring these components and their inter-relatedness is one purpose of the present study.

Another essential aspect of social work activities within the environment is the quality of supervision provided. Together

with the work and treatment environments, supervision is believed to impact significantly on the quality of service. The relationship between the work and treatments environments and the quality of supervision is our second and major interest in this study. No empirical studies, or conceptually oriented work, directly aimed at assessing the relationship between the quality of supervision and the quality of work treatment environments, are known.

Social work has always held an implicit assumption concerning the quality of supervision and the agency in which it occurs. This relationship has always been taken for granted rather than empirically measured. The supervisory process is known to include an education, a self-growth and an administrative component (Berl, 1960; Kadushin, 1976; Munson, 1979). Within the administrative component supervision was related to the agency's organizational needs: to keep the quality of the agency's services up to the standards and aspire to improve them (Brackett, 1903; Arndt, 1955; Wax, 1963; Munson, 1979a); to facilitate the internal functioning of the agency (Stiles, 1963; Watson, 1973; Eldridge, 1982); and to socialize workers to their work place (Wax, 1963). Even though it is known that "organizational structure and processes are so powerful that supervisory practice must focus its major attention on them" (Epstein, 1973; p. 6), few studies tried to identify the relation of these processes to supervision. When this was done, primary concern was with bureaucratic elements such as the impact that the worker's social position in the hierarchical structure has on his satisfaction with supervision (Wasserman, 1971; Kadushin, 1974) and the way the organizational structure of the agency influences attitudes toward supervision

(Scott, 1965).

While these studies reveal a variety of important problems which arise from doing professional work in a bureaucratic organization (Barber, 1963; Green, 1966; Finch, 1976) none tried to identify the unique connection between the work and treatment environments of social work agencies and social work supervision. This connection can be found implicitly only in conceptualizations and empirical studies of the relationship between supervision and a) working relationships among professional staff, b) growth opportunities that workers have, and c) work management.

a) Working relationships among Professional Staff

Group supervision enhances mutual social support among workers, and develops their sense of cohesion (Abels, 1970) and hence is the supervisory method used to strengthen the relationship component of the work environment.

b) Growth opportunities

Workers' growth was primarily thought to be the kind and extent of supervision (Scherz, 1958) and extent of autonomy given to workers (Moos; 1974; Munson, 1976). Only more recently Cherniss & Eguatios (1978) presented a typology of supervision, namely didactic consultative, laissez-faire, authoritative, insight oriented and feelings oriented. Satisfaction with supervision was found to vary with the style of supervision used. One can only infer that if professional growth is influence by the supervisory style, and if the style used impacts upon satisfaction from supervision, then more satisfaction may lead to enhanced professional growth.

Autonomy, or independence, is considered an appropriate measure of the opportunities for professional development (Moos, 1974). Findings that workers had little autonomy because of supervisory arrangements (Scott, 1965), raised one of the major dilemmas in social work supervision today: how can social workers do autonomous practice while being supervised? (Epstein, 1973; Munson, 1976). Then, if autonomy is an integral part of self-growth in the work environment, are we saying that supervision in social work works against professional self development? By seeking to understand the relationship between supervision and the work environments of public welfare agencies this study may shed additional light on this question.

#### c) Work management

Work management variables include work pressure, and the clarity and systematic enforcement of the agency's rules. Supervisors who lack competence were found to emphasize their power and to control the social worker's activities (Wasserman, 1970, 1971). The social workers, in return viewed this power and control as the causes for their dissatisfaction with supervision (Kadushin, 1974; Munson, 1980, 1981). While factors in the work environment are directly related to supervision, as shown above, various aspects of the treatment environment such as worker-client relationships, clients' growth and the management of intervention are shown to impact on supervision only to the extent that they influence the work environment.

It is assumed that through the contribution of supervision to workers' cohesiveness, to their self-growth and to their work orientation, improvements in the



treatment environment will occur (Stiles, 1963; Watson, 1973; Kadushin, 1976; Munson, 1980). This assumption can be understood in the light of the manifest purpose of supervision -- to improve social work services through a better professional functioning of the workers.

From the supervisory literature an imaginary path connecting supervision and the quality of work and treatment environments can be inferred. We understand at this point that each component on this path co-constitutes the other but have little knowledge of how and to what extent. It becomes essential then to conceptualize the interrelatedness of these parameters and measure them.

The purpose of this study is to conceptualize and measure ecology in social work supervision. More specifically, it aims to further our understanding and measurement of ecology in social work, and to begin the movement from partial descriptions of the relation between agency variables and supervisory ones, to a holistic conceptualization and measurement of the way that supervision, work and treatment environments in social work agencies interact.

## METHOD

In the present study two measuring instruments were developed: the first which assessed the work and treatment environments of social work field agencies and the second which focused on the evaluation of the supervisory process of social work students and staff. The resulting questionnaire was administered to a sample of social work students who were completing a year's field placement in a

social work agency and who were receiving regular supervision. We wanted to measure the relationship between work and treatment environments and the supervisory experience.

### Study Sample

One hundred and twenty-four social work students enrolled in B.S.W. studies at the University of Haifa and University of Tel Aviv Schools of Social Work were sampled randomly. Undergraduate social work training in Israel consists of a three-year program of full-time studies (40 hours per week) and it is the professional degree in social work. In both the second and third year, students are engaged in a year-long 24 hour/week supervised placement in a field agency. The present sample included 68 (55.3%) students who were completing their second year of study and 52 (42.3%) completing their year. Students were placed either in public welfare offices (51.7%) or in counseling centers (48.3%). In most cases (86.8%) students met with their field supervisor once a week or more for two hours. In the remaining instances the frequency of supervision sessions was once every two weeks or less.

### Measures

The assessment of the work and treatment environments of public welfare offices and learning centers was based on the work of Rudolf H. Moos who developed instruments for measuring the psychosocial environment of psychiatric hospitals (Moos, 1974), community based psychiatric treatment settings (moos & Otto, 1972), correctional institutions (Moos, 1975) and sheltered care settings (Lemke & Moos, 1981).

Treatment environment dimensions, sub-scales and items were adapted from Moos' Ward Atmosphere Scale (Moos, 1974) while work environment items were based on his Work Environment Scale (Moos & Insel, 1974). Specific questions were revised to account for cultural and systemic differences between the American organizational settings, in which Moos' scales were developed, and the Israeli social work agencies in which they were applied in the present study.

Moos suggest that all work and treatment environments encompass three basic dimensions: interpersonal relationship (the kind of interaction between worker and client or worker and worker reinforced by the agency); personal development (the growth and development opportunities offered by the setting to workers and/or clients); and system maintenance and change (the ecology of organizational administration). In the present research the work environment scale was composed of the following subscales: an interpersonal relationship dimension including involvement, cohesion and staff support; a personal development dimension which included independence and task orientation; and a system maintenance and change dimension encompassing work pressure, staff clarity, control and comfort.

The treatment environment scale was composed of sub-scales as follows: an interpersonal relationship dimension measuring support and spontaneity; a personal development dimension including autonomy, practical orientation, personal problem orientation, anger and aggression; and a system maintenance and change dimension including order and organization, clarity in innovation. The work and treatment environment scales, sub-scales and sample

items are described in Tables 1 and 2 respectively.

Table 1  
Social Work Agency Work Environment Scale  
Description of Subscales

---

---

Relationship Dimension	Extent to which workers are involved and tend to support and help each other.
1. Involvement	Measures the extent to which staff are actively involved in the function- ing of the agency.  <u>Workers put quit a lot of effort into what they do.</u>  <u>Few people ever volunteer in this agency.</u>
2. Cohesion	Measures the extent to which staff have close personal relationships with one another.  <u>Workers rarely do things together after work</u>  <u>Workers take a personal interest in each other.</u>
3. Staff Support	Measures the extent to which staff are encour- aged and supported by supervisors and other workers.  <u>Supervisors usually comp-</u>

liment a worker who does something well.

Workers discuss their personal problems with their supervisor.

Personal Development Dimension

Opportunities afforded by the environment for worker growth and development.

4. Independence

Measures the extent to which workers are encouraged to be independent in making decisions regarding their work.

Agency supervisors encourage workers to rely on themselves when a problem arises.

Few Workers in this agency have any real responsibility.

5. Task Orientation

Measures the extent to which staff emphasize getting jobs done quickly and effectively.

Work rarely gets "put off till tomorrow."

People seem to be quite inefficient.

System Maintenance and Change Dimension

Extent to which the environment is well organized, clearly understood

and open to change.

6. Work Pressure Measures the extent to which the agency expects more from the staff than time would reasonably allow.

There is constant pressure in this agency to keep working.

It is very difficult for workers in this agency to keep up with their work load.

7. Staff Clarity Measures the extent to which staff clearly understand the way the agency operates and what is expected of workers.

Policies and procedures in this agency are unclear.

Generally when a job is assigned the worker is given a detailed explanation.

8. Control Measures the extent to which the worker's activities are regulated by agency rules and strict supervision.

Workers in this agency are expected to follow set rules in doing their work.

Supervisors in this agency are always check-

ing up on the workers and  
supervise them very  
closely.

9. Comfort

Measures the extent to which the agency's physical surroundings are attractive and comfortable.

The lighting in agency  
offices is very good.

Work space is awfully  
crowded.

---

Table 2  
Social Work Agency Treatment  
Environment Scale:  
Description of Subscales

---

---

Relationship  
Dimension

Extent to which clients are involved and are supported by other clients and agency staff.

1. Support

Measures the extent to which clients are encouraged and supported by staff and other clients.

Staff go out of their way  
to help clients.

The workers do not expect  
much from the clients.

2. Spontaneity

Measures the extent to

which the agency encourages clients to express themselves openly.

Clients are careful about what they say when staff are around.

People here say what they are thinking.

Personal Development Dimension

Opportunities afforded by the environment for client growth and development in accordance with the treatment program.

3. Autonomy

Measures how self-sufficient and independent clients are encouraged to be in making decisions.

The workers discourage criticism.

Staff encourage clients to suggest changes and give ideas.

4. Practical Orientation

Measures how well the program orients an individual towards training for a new job, looking to the future and setting and working toward concrete goals.

Clients are expected to make detailed specific plans for the future.

There is very little emphasis on what clients



will be doing after they  
stop coming to the  
agency.

5. Personal Problem  
    Orientation

Measures the extent to which the program encourages clients to be concerned with their feelings and personal problems.

Clients rarely speak with  
one another about their  
personal problems.

Staff are mainly inter-  
ested in learning about  
clients feelings.

6. Anger and Ag-  
    gression

Measures the extent to which the agency encourages clients and workers to express anger and frustration.

Staff and clients often  
criticize each other.

Sometimes clients here  
threaten to hit someone.

System Mainte-  
    nance and Change  
Dimension

Extent to which the environment is well organized, clearly understood and open to change.

7. Order and  
    Organization

Measures how well organized the environment is and to what extent the

program is planned.

This is a very well  
organized agency.

Client services are care-  
fully planned.

8. Clarity

Measures the clarity of  
goal expectations and  
agency rules and proced-  
ures.

Clients know what kind of  
services are offered  
here.

There are rarely changes  
in the rules here.

9. Innovation

Measures the environments  
openness to new ideas and  
changes in treatment  
approaches.

New and different ideas  
are always being tried  
out.

Things in this agency  
don't change.

---

The 57 item, 9 sub-scale revised form  
of the original 90 item Work Environment  
Scale and 45 item, 9 sub-scale revised form  
of the original 90 item Ward Atmosphere  
Scale were derived by using the following  
criteria:

1. Items in which more than 80% of the  
respondents answered in one direc-  
tion were deleted to avoid items

characteristic of extreme settings.

2. Each sub-scale should have acceptable internal consistency. Internal consistency coefficients were calculated using Cronbach's alpha and average within program item variances. Table 3 Summarizes these findings and confirms that all 18 sub-scales showed high internal consistency.
3. On each sub-scale the number of items scored true should be approximately the same as scored false to control for acquiescence response set.

---

Table 3  
Internal Consistencies for  
Social Work Agency Work and  
Treatment Environment Subscales

---

---

Subscale	Cronbach's Alpha
<hr/>	
Work Environment:	
Involvement	.742
Cohesion	.768
Staff Support	.759
Independence	.755
Task Orientation	.738
Work Pressure	.789
Staff Clarity	.771
Control	.801
Comfort	.799

Treatment Environment:

Support	.764
Spontaneity	.771
Autonomy	.781
Practical Orientation	.787
Personal Problem Orientation	.774
Anger and Aggression	.775
Order and Organization	.772
Clarity	.783
Innovation	.769

---

The measuring instrument on the process of worker supervision was adapted from the 60 item instrument on field instruction developed by Carlton Munson (1979). In this questionnaire, Munson attempted to develop items which tapped the three major dimensions suggested by Kadushin (1976) of administration, education and self-growth. Certain items were dropped in the present research based on either their inapplicability to the supervisory process of the agency settings studied or to the overall supervisory culture in Israel.

In order to determine the major factors underlying the revised 43 item supervisory scale a factor analytic approach was applied. Rotation to an oblique solution resulted in five factors whose eigenvalues were greater than 1.00. These five factors, their associated eigenvalues and individual scale items whose factor pattern coefficients were greater than .35 are presented in Table 4. Based on interpretation of the factor pattern matrix, these five factors have been characterized as follows: Factor 1 -- supervisor-worker relationship; Factor 2 -- technology and accountability; Factor 3 -- administrative skills; Factor 4 -- appropriate use of time; Factor 5 -- conflict.

---

Table 4  
Scale Items from the Five Supervision  
Factors and their Associated Factor  
Pattern Coefficients\*

Factors and Scale Items	Eigenvalue	Factor Pattern Coefficient
Factor 1 Supervisor-Worker Relationship	14.614	
My supervisor en- courages me to speak freely with him		.470
My supervisor assumes that I know less than I do		.752
If I am able to, I avoid meeting with my supervisor		.501
My supervisor has a tendency not to accept new ideas		.512
My supervisor's approach is "sit and listen to me"		.389
My supervisor enables me to work according to my best personal and prof- essional judgment		-.776
The evaluations given by my supervisor orally or in writing are in accord-		

ance with my own evaluation  
of my work .551

My supervisor tries to treat  
rather than supervise me .716

I think my supervisor is  
fair in the demands he  
makes of me .452

My supervisor respects me  
as a professional and acts  
accordingly .543

My supervisor can be easily  
approached .482

Factor 2  
Technology and  
Accountability 2.294

My supervisor uses tapes  
of my work in supervisory  
sessions .682

My supervisor participates  
in some of my sessions  
with clients in order to  
help me develop profess-  
ional skills .431

My supervisor demands that  
I tape treatment sessions  
for our use in supervisory  
meetings .756

Factor 3  
Administrative Skills 2.113

My supervisor possesses  
extensive knowledge of  
the procedures and oper-  
ating regulations of the

agency	.850
--------	------

My supervisor really knows how to get about in administrative matters	.756
---	------

My supervisor is a good administrator	.558
--	------

Factor 4	
Appropriate Use of Time	1.424

My supervisor tells me about his personal problems instead of giving me supervision	.801
--	------

My supervisor knows how to set priorities in supervision	.378
--	------

During supervisory sessions my supervisor speaks about everyday matters that don't relate to work	.398
--	------

My supervisor organizes his work well	.361
--	------

Factor 5	
Conflict	1.326

My supervisor usually invents things to argue about	-3.88
--	-------

There is no sense in getting into conflicts with my supervisor	-.417
--	-------

My supervisor is a good administrator	.403
--	------

\* Only scale items whose factor pattern coefficients are .350 or greater are included.

Factor score coefficients were calculated for the five main dimensions of supervision from which five factor scores were figured for each respondent. Simple Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated among the work and treatment scales and five main supervision factors in order to analyze the pattern of association between perceptions of social welfare agency work and treatment environments and the nature of the field supervision experience.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Analysis of correlation coefficients between the five supervisory scale factors and work and treatment environment subscales are presented in descending order according to the amount of variation in the supervisory process scale accounted for by each factor. The simple Pearson correlation coefficients between supervision factors and environment scales appear in tables 5 through 9 respectively. The degree of association between each factor and work environment sub-scale is presented first followed by its correlation with treatment environment subscales. Finally correlations between each supervision factor and work and treatment environment subscales are examined together with the intercorrelations evident among the agency environment subscales themselves.

### The Supervisory Relationship and the Agency Environment

The quality of the relationship between



the supervisor and field work student was highly correlated with the extent to which student perceived the agency environment as supportive and encouraging for the staff ( $r = .415$ ). In addition, a supervisor-supervisee relationship characterized by openness, mutual respect, challenge and freedom of expression was positively linked to the perception of high cohesion among agency workers ( $r = .247$ ). It is interesting to note that the Physical environment of the agency, i.e., comfort, was negatively correlated with the supervisory relationship factor ( $r = -.225$ ). This suggests that substandard physical conditions in the agency are associated with stronger supervisory relationships than is the case in improved physical surroundings.

The supervisor-supervisee relationship was also positively correlated with several aspects of the treatment environment in the agency. Most notably, constructive and trusting supervisor-supervisee relationships were related significantly with the agency's encouragement of free expression, i.e., spontaneity, on the part of its clientele ( $r = .364$ ). Similarly, but to a lesser degree, the relationship factor correlated with an agency climate which allowed the client and worker to express anger ( $r = .225$ ). Also, where the field students felt the supervisor treated them as professionals, was easy to approach, encouraged them to act independently and was demanding, but fair, they viewed the agency as open to and encouraging of new ideas and innovation in serving its clients ( $r = .296$ ).

When the supervisory relationship, work environment and treatment environment are taken together, it becomes clear that the positive association between the supervision factor and staff support in the work

environment and spontaneity and innovation in the treatment environment is felt both directly and indirectly. The direct effect has already been described. The potential indirect effect is evident in the high associations between staff support and both spontaneity ( $r = .541$ ) and innovation ( $r = .440$ ) and in the correlation between these latter two treatment subscales ( $r = .473$ ). It seems most plausible that the supervisor-student relationship in supervision works to strengthen the agency's support for its staff which in turn reinforces the openness of the organization to client spontaneity and service innovation.

---

Table 5  
Pearson Correlation Coefficients between  
Supervision Factor 1 (Supervisor-Worker  
Relationship) and Work and Treatment  
Environment Subscales\*

---

	l	Co	St	Cm	Sp	An	In
Factor 1	1.000						
Cohesion	.247	1.000					
Staff Support	.415	.460	1.000				
Comfort	-.225	-.114	-.005	1.000			
Spontaneity	.364	.281	.541	-.103	1.000		
Anger and Aggression	.225	.240	.268	.093	.415	1.000	

## Innovation

.296 .275 .440 .011 .473 .226 1.000

---

\* Only environment subscales which correlated with factor 1 at  $r \geq .220$  were included.

## Technology and Accountability in Supervision and the Agency Environment

The extent to which the supervisor observed the student in meetings with clients and required the supervisee to record client sessions in writing, on tape, or on video was significantly associated with only the autonomy subscale and this association was negative ( $r = -.242$ ). This relationship should be seen as two-directional. On the one hand, where the supervisor stresses observation and accountability regarding worker-client sessions, the independence of the client is limited. On the other, in an agency environment which limits the client's independence of action, the supervisory experience is marked by a great extent of accountability demanded from the workers. It may well be that various technical recording devices were by students as means of control rather than serving any other purpose.

---

Table 6  
Pearson Correlation Coefficients Between  
Supervision Factor 2 (Technology and  
Accountability) and Treatment Environment  
Subscales\*

---

Factor 2	1.000	
Autonomy	-.242	1.000

---

\* Only environmental subscales which correlated with factor 2 at  $\geq .220$  were included.

### The Supervisor's Administrative Skill and the Agency Environment

The students perceived their supervisors as competent in administrative skills in agencies with high degrees of task orientation ( $r = .263$ ). Or to put it differently, when agency supervisors are competent in administrative matters the agency climate presses on the staff to complete tasks quickly and effectively.

In a similar manner, the greater the administrative skills of the supervisor the more the agency encourages organized and planned services ( $r = .237$ ). Also, supervisor's administrative skills were associated with the organization's encouragement of free expression on the part of the client ( $r = .238$ ) and openness to efforts of the staff to be innovative in developing and providing agency services and programs ( $r = .243$ ).

Like in the case of the supervisory relationship factor previously discussed, the link between administrative skill in supervision and the total agency environment is both direct and indirect in nature. The direct positive correlation between the administrative skills in the supervisory experience and task orientation, order and

organization, spontaneity and innovation in the agency environment should be noted. The high positive correlations between task orientation in the work environment and order and organization ( $r = .514$ ) and innovation ( $r = .538$ ) in the treatment environment suggests that the indirect effect could be quite strong. It appears then that strong administrative skills in supervision reinforce and are reinforced by task orientation in the work setting which in turn is associated with emphasis on both planning and organization and change and innovation in client services.

---

Table 7  
Pearson Correlation Coefficients Between  
Supervision Factor 3 (Administrative  
Skills) and Work and Treatment  
Environment Subscales\*

---

	3	Ta	Or	Sp	In
Factor 3	1.000				
Task Orientation	.263	1.000			
Order and Organization	.237	.514	1.000		
Spontaneity	.238	.365	.165	1.000	
Innovation	.243	.538	.308	.473	1.000

---

\* Only environment subscales which correlated with factor 3 at  $r \geq .220$  were

included

### The Appropriate Use of Time in Supervision and the Agency Environment

The student's perception of effective and goal oriented use of time in the supervisory session was positively correlated with clarity concerning procedures, policies, rights and responsibilities of workers in the working environment ( $r = .348$ ). Also, the supervisor's ability to successfully budget time was positively related to the student worker's sense of support and encouragement in the agency's working environment ( $r = .244$ ). Appropriate use of time in supervision was also positively correlated with two factors in the treatment environment, namely, spontaneity ( $r = .264$ ) and anger ( $r = .221$ ). In other words, agencies which emphasize appropriate time budgeting also intend to encourage clients or staff to verbalize their anger and frustration.

The high intercorrelations between staff support in the work environment and spontaneity in the treatment environment ( $r = .541$ ) is a good indicator of possible indirect association between the time factor and features of the organizational environment. It may be that effective utilization of time in supervision is conducive to the staff perceiving the work setting as supportive. The sense of collegiality, togetherness and organizational support contributes in turn to a climate in which client spontaneity and expressions of anger are allowed for.

---

Table 8  
Pearson Correlation Coefficients Between

Supervision Factor 4 (Appropriate Use of  
Time) and Work and Treatment Environment  
Subscales\*

---

	4	St	Cl	Sp	An
Factor 4	1.000				
Staff Support	.244	1.000			
Staff Clarity	.348	.363	1.000		
Spontaneity	.264	.541	.192	1.000	
Anger and Aggression	.221	.268	.252	.415	1.000

---

\* Only environment subscales which correlated with factor 4 at  $r \geq .220$  were included

Conflict in Supervision and the Agency Environment

The way in which conflicts between supervisor and students doing field work are handled was associated with the agency's work environment. Only agencies in which the supervisor encourages conflicts with the supervisee tend to be those where cohesion among staff is low ( $r = -.225$ ). In addition, conflict in supervision is positively correlated with a work environment high in control over workers ( $r = .223$ ). It may be said then that supervisor-supervisee relationships marked by conflict are associated with a

high degree of control in the work environment and with a tendency of low cohesion among the staff.

---

Table 9  
Pearson Correlation Coefficients Between  
Supervision Factor 5 (Conflict) and  
Work Environment Subscales\*

---

	5	Co	Cn
Factor 5	1.000		
Cohesion	-.225	1.000	
Control	.223	-.106	1.000

---

\* Only environment subscales which correlated with factor 5 at  $r \geq .220$  were included

## CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

In concluding let us go back to the imaginary path developed by inference from the literature between supervision, work environment and treatment environment. In this study we attempted to operationalize each one of the three points on the path and develop a puzzle from the correlations between the various components of supervision, work environment and treatment environment. It is also important to note which aspects of work and treatment environments were unrelated to supervision particularly since we hear too often the unwritten expectation that supervision is the cure to all evils in social work.



It seems as if a positive evaluation of supervision in term of administration, role relationship and appropriate use of time correlates with a positive perception of a working environment as a task oriented, well organized, supportive and cohesive place. These in turn are correlated with clients' sense of innovation, spontaneity and free expression of animosity.

It is possible to logically infer that good administrative supervision creates good working environment which in turn is conducive to high quality treatment relations. However, establishing these relationships as an empirical fact requires further inquiry. While from the supervisory literature these logical inferences could be drawn, we attempted to operationalize these three dimensions and show the correlations among them, without attempting to address the direction of the correlations.

No significant correlations have been found between the quality of supervision and the workers' perception of the extent of their involvement in the agency. In the treatment environment variables such as client autonomy, sense of support or practical problem orientation were also unrelated to the quality of supervision.

These correlations as well as their absence have the potential of many practical implications. For example, if we accept that the direction of the above correlations is that the quality of supervision influences the quality of the work environment which in turn impacts on the treatment environment then one can expect to enhance mutual support, cohesion and task orientation by providing highly skilled supervisors in the administrative area who can make effective use of their

time. Such work environment can then account for innovation and spontaneity from the client's part. On the other hand, one should not expect to achieve worker involvement or independence or practical orientation in client-worker relationships through manipulating the content or form of supervision.

It is also helpful to know that conflicts between supervisor and supervisee do not carry over to worker-client relationships, at least as it emerges from our findings.

But in order to actualize the practical implications inherent in these findings and in order to point out the direction of these correlations, further research needs to be done.

#### REFERENCES

- Abels, P.  
1970 "On the Nature of Supervision: The Medium is the Group", Child Welfare, 49, 304-311.
- Arndt, H.C.M.  
1955 "Principles of Supervision in Public Assistance Agencies", Social Casework, 36, 307-313.
- Barber, B.  
1963 "Some Problems in the Sociology of Professions", Daedalus, 92, 669-688.
- Berl, F.  
1960 "An Attempt to Construct a Conceptual Framework for Supervision", Social Casework, 41,

339-346.

- Brackett, J. R.  
1903 Supervision and Education in Charity, New York: MacMillian Co.
- Cherniss, C. & Egnatios, E.  
1978 "Clinical Supervision in Community Mental Health", Social Work, 23, 219-223.
- Colins, A. & Pancoast, D.  
1976 Natural Helping Networks: A Strategy for Prevention, New York: National Association of Social Workers.
- Coulton, C.  
1979a "Developing an Instrument to Measure Person-Environment Fit", Journal of Social Service Research, 3, 159-174.
- Drexler, J.  
1977 "Organizational Climate: Its Homogeneity within Organization", Journal of Applied Psychology, 62, 38-42.
- Eldridge, W. D.  
1982 "Coping with Accountability: Guidelines for Supervisors", Social Casework, 63, 489-496.
- Epstein, L.  
1973 "Is Autonomous Practice Possible?", Social Work, 18, 5-12.
- Finch, W. A.  
1976 "Social Workers Versus Bureaucracy", Social Work, 21, 370-375.
- Germain, C.

- 1979 "Ecology and Social Work", in, Germain C. (ed.) Social Work Practice: People and Environments, New York: Columbia University Press, 1-22.
- Gitterman, A. & Germain, C.  
1976 "Social Work Practice: A Life Model", Social Service Review, 50, 601-610.
- Gordon, W.  
1969 "Basic Constructs for an Integrative and Generative Conception of Social Work", in Hearn, G. (ed.), The General Systems Approach: Contributions Toward A Holistic Conception of Social Work, New York: Council on Social Work Education, 5-11.
- Green, A. D.  
1966 "The Professional Worker in a Bureaucracy", Social Service Review, 40, 71-83.
- Hollis, F.  
1972 Casework--A Psychosocial Therapy New York: Random House.
- Ittelson, W., Proshansky, H. & Rivlin, L.  
1970 "The Environmental Psychology of the Psychiatric Ward", in Ittelson, W., et. al. (eds.) Environmental Psychology--Man and His Physical Setting, New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 419-439.
- Kadushin, A.  
1974 "Supervisor-Supervisee: A Survey", Social Work, 19, 228-297.
- Kadushin, A.  
1976 Supervision in Social Work, New

York: Columbia University Press

Lemke, S. & Moos, R.

1981 "The Supra-Personal Environment of Sheltered Care Settings", Journal of Gerontology, 36, 233-243.

Maluccio, A.

1979 Learning from Clients, New York: The Free Press.

Maluccio, A.

1979a "Perspectives of Social Workers and Clients on Treatment Outcomes", Social Casework, 60, 394-401.

Maier, R.

"The Impact of the Structural Organization of Public Welfare Offices on the Psychosocial Work and Treatment Environments", Journal of Social Service Research, in print.

Middleman, R. & Goldberg, G.

1974 Social Service Delivery: A Structural Approach to Social Work Practice, New York: Columbia University Press.

Moos, R. H.

1974 Evaluating Treatment Environments--A Social Ecological Approach, New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Moos, R. H.

1975 Evaluating Correctional and Community Settings, New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Moos, R. H. & Insel, P.

1974 Work Environment Scale Prelim-

inary Manual, Palo Alto, Ca.:  
Consulting Psychologists Press.

- Moos, R. H. & Otto, J.  
1972 "The Community Oriented Programs  
Environmental Scale: A Method-  
ology for the Facilitation and  
Evaluation of Social Change",  
Community Mental Health Journal,  
8, 28-37.
- Munson, C. E.  
1976 "Professional Autonomy and  
Social Work Supervision",  
Journal of Education for Social  
Work, 12, 95-102.
- Munson, C. E.  
1979 Social Work Supervision, New  
York: The Free Press.
- Munson, C. E.  
1979a "Authority and Social Work  
Supervision: An Emerging Model"  
in Munson, C. E., Social Work  
Supervision, New York: The Free  
Press, 336-346.
- Munson, C. E.  
1980 "Differential Impact of Struc-  
ture and Authority in Super-  
vision", Arete, 6, 3-15.
- Munson, C. E.  
1981 "Style and Structure in Super-  
vision", Journal of Education  
for Social Work, 17, 65-72.
- Pane, R. & Physey, D.  
1971 "G. G. Stern's Organizational  
Climate Index: A Reconceptu-  
alization and Application to  
Business Organizations", Organ-  
izational Behavior & Human Per-  
formance, 6, 77-98.

- Perlman, H.  
1957 Social Casework -- A Problem-Solving Process, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Rhodes, L.  
1981 "Social Climate Perception and Depression of Patients and Staff in a Chronic Hemodialysis Unit", The Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease, 169, 165-175.
- Scherz, F.  
1958 "A Concept of Supervision Based on Definitions of Job Responsibility", Social Casework, 39, 435-443.
- Schneider, B.  
"The Service Organization: Climate is Crucial", Organizational Dynamics, 8, 180, 52-65.
- Scott, W.  
1965 "Reactions to Supervision in a Heteronomous Organization", Administrative Science Quarterly 10, 65-81.
- Seabury, B.  
1971 "Arrangement of Physical Space in Social Work Settings", Social Work, 16, 43-49.
- Stern, G.  
1970 People in Context: Measuring Personal Environment Congruence in Education and Industry, New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Stiles, E.  
1963 "Supervision in Perspective", Social Casework, 44, 19-25.

- Turner, F.  
1978 Psychosocial Therapy, New York:  
Free Press.
- Wasserman, H.  
1970 "Early Careers of Professional  
Social Workers in a Public  
Welfare Agency", Social Work,  
15, 93-101.
- Watson, K. W.  
1973 "Differential Supervision",  
Social Work, 18, 80-88.
- Wax, J.  
1963 "Time Limited Supervision",  
Social Work, 8, 37-43.
- Willems, E.  
1976 "Behavioral Ecology, Health  
Status, and Health Care: Appli-  
cations to the Rehabilitation  
Setting", in Altman, I. &  
Wohlwill, J. (eds.) Human Behav-  
ior and Environment: Advances  
in Theory and Research, New  
York: Plenum Press, 211-263.



## GET THEE TO A SHELTER

WILLIAM M. EPSTEIN, D.S.W  
Assistant Professor  
School of Social Work  
State University of New York at Buffalo  
Allen Hall, Buffalo, New York 14214

### ABSTRACT

Psychotherapy and surrogate care, the two basic strategies for providing services to battered women, are criticized against outcome evidence of their reliability and efficacy. Surrogate care is shown to be the more desirable service approach. Some implications of this conclusion for the helping professions are enumerated.

---

Many personal social services trade-off between two basic strategies of intervention: psychotherapy on the one hand and surrogate care on the other. The psychotherapeutic or "human potential" model of care seeks to reduce dysfunctional behaviors by direct interventions with clients. Whether the goals are expressed as enhanced living, intrapsychic care, stress reduction, motivation for independence or others, psychotherapeutic solutions to social problems usually involve a dialogue between the therapist and the client to change the client's attitudes

and thereby the client's behaviors. In contrast, surrogate care relieves or prevents dysfunctional behaviors by providing more acceptable substitutes for abusive situations.

Psychotherapeutic models emphasize that sustaining causes of dysfunctional behaviors reside in the individual and, therefore, point solutions toward individual behavior directly. Following a structural logic, surrogate solutions assume either that dysfunctional personal behaviors are molded by dysfunctional environments or that dysfunctional behaviors are past remedy; and, therefore, a sense of humanity dictates the provision of homelike environments. Structural solutions, therefore, tend to emphasize surrogate alternatives to the abusive conditions expecting that a more normal, pleasant living arrangement will nurture functional social adaptations. The structural assumptions lead to a series of programs that compensate for the failure of the customary social organizations, most notably the family, to provide adequate socialization, comfort or protection for its members.

While psychotherapeutic services can be distributed through the market place, the provision of surrogate care is most often forced upon society when the private charitable sector fails to make adequate provisions for those who are incapable of commanding sufficient resources for their basic needs. Moreover, the history of surrogate arrangements seems to suggest that the private sector customarily fails to provide sufficient resources. Thus, if a residual caretaking role is not accepted as a social good by the private sector, compensation for familial failures will probably not be provided at acceptable

levels, if at all, by private sources. Indeed, modern social work emerged out of the transition in responsibility for dependency from the private to the public sectors.

As resources become short relative to need, the competition heats up between therapeutic and surrogate intervention. For example, a residential program could emphasize costly psychotherapy for a few clients rather than a more modest surrogate program for a large number of people. Or, it could make the reciprocal decision to provide more comfortable surrogate care but include little, if any, psychotherapy.

Since each approach utilizes different solutions for similar problems, the resource allocation issue between therapeutic or surrogate care rests with an assessment of each strategy's technological efficacy, its ability to achieve preset ends.

This paper argues that a generous surrogate approach at least to the problem of family violence, at comfortable budget levels that may obviate psychotherapeutic interventions, is more effective than psychotherapy alone. Moreover, surrogate services for the battered woman, especially the emergency shelter, may be a necessary condition of successful psychotherapy.

This argument for surrogate care rests upon two pillars. First, the benefits of psychotherapy, that is, its technological efficiency, have not yet been demonstrated, suggesting that more reliable approaches may be more attractive. Secondly, surrogate care is a more critical service; while not as glamorous for practice as the psychiatric or psychological setting, surrogate care is more immediately

protective of most battered women and is now the setting in greatest need of support.

### The Problem

Tending to favor a psychotherapeutic approach, Goodstein and Page (1981), two psychiatrists, recently published a state-of-the-art description of the battered wife syndrome. As they report, wife battering occurs often enough to attract general concern, while surveys suggest that the problem is not centered in any class or ethnic group. Moreover, due to the increases in both the number of reported cases and the number of women who seek aid, the call on resources for shelters is becoming an important item on the public agenda.

Battering is frequently resolved only when the wife seeks assistance, a decision that is dependent upon two interactive conditions: 1) a conscious cost/benefit summary of her relationship with the abuser that informs her desire to leave or stay and 2) the availability and attractiveness of alternatives to the abusing relationship that allows for the desire to be activated. The strength of her desire to leave, that is, the amount of disparity between the benefits and the costs of the relationship, is affected by the severity and type of abuse, and the danger to her children. Further, the costs of leaving the relationship, or reciprocally the benefits of staying, are affected by the quality of alternative homelike environments and her access to them. Access is frequently received through the police or intervention by others outside the family. Therefore, the social decision to make available either psychological help or surrogate environments could determine

the type of resolution that battered wives seek as well as the amount of abuse they absorb before seeking remedy. This, of course, will also determine the number who seek help.

### Psychotherapeutic Solutions

The field of psychotherapy seems to have agreed upon a scientific standard for research studies and to have accepted the burden for proving its efficacy. Any proof of psychotherapeutic efficacy must conform to explicit standards of research: the measures must be valid; outcomes must endure over time; the summary techniques must be objective and replicable; and, most importantly, a study of outcomes is credible only to the extent to which experimental (treated) groups differ significantly from controlled (untreated) groups (Fiske, 1970).

Yet, in spite of many attempts to demonstrate the efficacy of specific psychotherapeutic interventions (Smith, 1980) or to summarize different series of studies (Bergin, 1970, 1971, 1978; Eysenck, 1966; Rachman, 1971; Paul, 1967; Kiesler, 1966), the benefits of psychotherapy remain indeterminate (Epstein, in press). The most ambitious attempt to demonstrate the existence and replicability of positive effects (Smith, 1980) failed either to summarize the evidence appropriately or to avoid several unfortunate experimenter biases. Notwithstanding these problems, this study found only a very modest "effect-size" for psychotherapy; after adjusting for a "placebo effect", the average patient who had gone through psychotherapy was only about 10 per cent better-off than those who did not. Moreover, the tyranny of grouped data forces the conclusion that many who exceed

this average were balanced by the many for whom psychotherapy had little benefit or a negative effect.

The outcome literature is not any more convincing in demonstrating therapeutic benefits for battered women. Moreover, these studies are not in conformity with contemporary research standards, perhaps due in part to the recency of the interest of this problem. Recommendations of psychotherapy for battered women by Rounsaville (1978, 1979), Nichols (1976), Hanks and Rosenbaum (1977), and others (Scott, 1974; Rounsaville and Weissman, 1977) do not adequately establish positive effects that can be generalized beyond their samples or a casual link between the therapy they provide and the putative benefits that they report. Yet, these studies and others, while still not providing more convincing of psychotherapeutic benefits, acknowledge the practical importance of the emergency shelter (Higgins 1978; Hanks and Rosenbaum, 1977; Rounsaville and Weissman, 1977).

Psychotherapy, for this group, as well as most others, has not proved to be reliably effective. No modern comprehensive review of psychotherapeutic interventions has been able to put forth credible testimony to the consistency of psychotherapeutic benefits. No study has convincingly refuted the possibility that some clients deteriorate because of therapy or that recovery, when it occurs, is due either to a "spontaneous" regression to the mean of normalcy or to the client's own motivation to be cured (and thereby not to the efforts of the therapist).

The essence of counselling is a rational process that enables a client to select the best alternatives on the basis of the client's own interest. When choices

are limited, or more frequently, when they are inaccessible, the counselling process is impossible, trivial or meaningless. In short, where shelters for battered women either do not exist or are themselves abusive environments, and when welfare payments, legal services and child care arrangements are unavailable, then the battered woman has little choice but to somehow cope with an insanely damaging home. Therefore, counselling, to the extent that it can ever be successful for battered women, may be limited by the availability and quality of surrogate services.

### Surrogate Care

A surrogate model of service offers an alternative environment to the battered wife, an immediate asylum from abuse for her and her children. It is concerned far less with her psychological reaction to abuse than her safety. Taking a respite from abuse in the shelter, a woman can decide whether to negotiate more favorable terms under which to return to her spouse or to continue on to an independent setting. Therefore, the shelter should provide the necessities of existence (food, clothing, shelter), transitional institutional supports (day care and education for children, referral to welfare) and protection for the women's legal position (referral to police, lawyers and the courts). This model of care defines a non-therapeutic role for the social worker: 1) to provide referral services in support of the woman's decision for independent living; 2) to follow-up her pursuit of these referral resources; 3) to pursue appropriate social and legal responses to the abuser; and 4) to assist, when necessary, in the negotiation of a reconciliation with her abusing spouse. Outside of the shelter,

the social worker's role is to minimize potential client resistance to utilize the shelter by: 1) providing appropriate information to referral sources; 2) minimizing the stigma attached to the utilization of the shelter; 3) identifying and reaching out to abused women; and, most importantly, 4) protecting resources for the shelter in political and social arenas. In summary, the case worker is a supportive and protective surrogate who provides referral, follow-up, outreach, case advocacy and social advocacy. The result is the realization of an abused woman's right to physical safety and some modicum of homelike comfort.

The decision to provide residual, surrogate care is forced by life-threatening and intolerable abuse. In this case, society must make provision, however reluctantly, for those who are orphans on its doorstep. Unfortunately, however, the level of this provisioning is customarily dictated not by the need but probably by some political or social calibration that measures out the most parsimonious allotment of resources relative to the political risks of offering meaner levels of care. Therefore, the efficacy of surrogate services is dependent upon the social will to create safe and caring environments. Still, an adequate surrogate technology is available, independent of the society's decision to use it. In contrast, the technological value of psychotherapeutic intervention is still indeterminate; at any intensity of use, psychotherapeutic efficacy has still not been demonstrated.

### Conclusions

Three service interventions exist for victims of family violence: psychotherapy



alone, surrogate care alone, or a combination of both. While the orthodox safety of the middle ground would dictate an acknowledgement of both, neither the literature nor a cost-effective consideration of the benefits support this position. Where the choice exists, surrogate services are preferable to psychotherapy. Where psychotherapy is indicated, surrogate care may be a necessary condition for its success.

Therefore, until psychotherapy can demonstrate reliable outcomes, the intervention of choice for battered women is the shelter, especially one that encourages their transition to an independent setting through the provision of supportive social services. The role of the social worker in this case is to encourage the abused client to take advantage of existing services while at the same time to secure adequate support for the shelter from public sources.

This is a very old role for social work, a role, moreover, that typically competes for professional attention with the role of therapist. If social need is to dictate the choice, then the provision of surrogate care is by far the more important role. Presently, many forces conspire to produce a large number of people in distress, people for whom surrogate care is required. First, we continue to experience a great number of children and others who are being abandoned, abused and neglected. Second, modern social redefinitions of family responsibility create needs for care (e.g. geriatric services, special educational services and income supports) where once an extended family or homogenous community may have cushioned hardship.

The social worker's advocacy of the rights of dependent populations to decent surrogate care will certainly contribute to the general support for a broad universal entitlement to share in the country's bounty. The political translation of this goal entails the enumeration of a core of publicly underwritten and supervised education, health, employment and surrogate services. The definition of this package of social services depends upon the political resolution of a number of questions. What core of services should constitute the real rights of a citizenship? What claims on resources do people have as security against the inevitable failures of the market place and other social institutions, most notably the family? What system of social and personal welfare services can be sold to the country? Social work has a direct stake in an expansive and generous response to these questions. Moreover, if social casework is to have any role in redressing the problems of its more needy clients, if it is to do more than comfort the worried-well, then it must confront the reluctance of our society to provide adequate surrogate services. This is a political task.

Unfortunately, the current temper of social work lies in precisely the opposite direction. For years, "vendorship status" for social workers has been one of the top legislative priorities of professional social work. Social workers apparently wish to compete with psychologists and psychiatrists for the private fee-for-service patient. However, this kind of practice is in conflict with the interests of traditional social work clients, whose pressing needs are for nonpsychotherapeutic surrogate care. Moreover, the private, fee-for-service practitioner, by sidestepping agency quality control and agency board

direction, defies community priorities and client accountability. The need in social work today, created by a narrowing sense of public responsibility, is for the protection of vulnerable populations through the provision of surrogate services.

Current social work may reflect the unfulfilled promises of psychotherapy and the profession's neglect of surrogate services. Human behavior seems stubbornly resistant to change, especially when the extra-psychic environment reinforces dysfunctional social adaptations. If the profession of social work is to maintain (or perhaps restore) a credible advocacy of its client's rights, then it had best consider the simple justice of providing comfortable and safe alternatives to abusive situations before involving itself in the reconstruction of human behaviors that have typically withstood the onslaught of time and reason. A simple yet monumental fact must somehow be dealt with: in spite of decades and decades of psychotherapeutic assaults on dysfunctional human behavior, no convincing demonstration has yet been made of its efficacy. (1)

A disturbing disjunction with need may be emerging in some counselling agencies. Despite the enormous economic and social strains that are creating evermore social needs, some counselling agencies may be experiencing declining caseloads even after adjusting for their budget-shortened staffs. If these agencies were sensitive to current problems, then it would be reasonable to expect the reverse: caseloads that increase along with the more typical indicators of social and economic stress. Unfortunately, many counselling agencies rigidly elect to serve one particular set set of problems, problems that may involve an office-bound, safe and struc-

tured practice. They tend to ignore the priorities for care in their communities, preferring instead to pursue a rather impractical psychological idealism.

If the growing population of needy people are rejecting social work's counseling role, then these agencies might well dust off the possibility of a community-based social service practice, rooted in the current needs of people in their neighborhoods and based upon the premise that the problems of most people are products of abusing environments. These agencies might look to the immediate problems of their neighborhoods' residents in dealing with existing welfare bureaucracies, in developing self-help arrangements to cope with less money and unemployment, in sustaining mutual neighborhood institutions for recreation, education, crime prevention and with creating more pressure for publicly supported surrogates. In other words, these agencies should be far more committed to creating the rational alternatives toward which they wish to counsel their clients.

If social work is to protect its traditional clients through the political and economic transitions of these coming decades, then the field must seek a core of tax supported substitutes to compensate for the failure of society's private institutions. Psychotherapeutic interventions are neither appropriate for these ends nor reliable even on their own terms.

### Notes

1. The recent evidence in social work doesn't contradict this finding. In spite of Reed and Hanrahan's (1983) claims, little grounds exist for their optimism

(Epstein, 1983).

#### REFERENCES

- Bergin, A. E.  
1971 "The Evaluation of Therapeutic Outcomes", in Bergin and Garfield (eds.), Handbook of Psychotherapy and Behavior Change, p217-270
- Bergin, A. E. and Lambert, M. S.  
1978 "The Evaluation of Therapeutic Outcomes", in Bergin and Garfield (eds.), Handbook of Psychotherapy and Behavior Change.
- Bergin, A. E. and Strupp, H. H.  
1970 "New Directions in Psychotherapy Research", Journal of Abnormal Psychology, No. 75, p. 13-26.
- Epstein, W.  
"Technology and Social Work, Part I: The Effectiveness of Psychotherapy", Journal of Applied Social Science, (in press).
- Epstein, W.  
"Technology and Social Work, Part II: Psychotherapy, Family Therapy, and Implications for Practice", Journal of Applied Social Science, (in press).
- Epstein, W.  
1983 "On Research Bias", (Points and Viewpoints) Social Work, January p. 77-79
- Eysenck, H. J.  
1966 "The Effect of Psychotherapy",

Journal of Psychotherapy, Inter-  
national Science Press.

- Fiske, D. W., et. al.  
1970 "Planning of Research on the  
Effectiveness of Psychotherapy",  
Archives of General Psychiatry,  
January, p. 22-32.
- Goodstein, R. K. and Page, A. W.  
1981 "Battered Wife Syndrome",  
American Journal of Psychiatry,  
138:8, August, p. 1036-1040.
- Hanks, S. E. and Rosenbaum, C. P.  
1977 "Battered Women" American  
Journal of Orthopsychiatry,  
April, p. 291-306.
- Higgins, J. G.  
1978 "Social Services for Abused  
Wives", Social Casework, May, p.  
266-271.
- Kiesler, D. S.  
1966 "Some Myths of Psychotherapy  
Research", Psychological Bull-  
etin, Vol. 65, No. 2. p. 110-  
136.
- Nichols, B. B.  
1976 "The Abused Wife Problem",  
Social Casework, January, p. 27-  
32.
- Paul, G. J.  
1967 "Strategy of Outcome Research in  
Psychotherapy", Journal of  
Consulting Psychology, Vol. 31,  
No. 2, p. 109-118.
- Scott, P. D.  
1974 "Battered Wives", British  
Journal of Psychiatry, No. 125,  
p. 433-441.

- Rachman, S.  
1966 The Effects of Psychotherapy,  
Perogon Press.
- Reid, W. J. and Hanrahan, P.  
1982 "Recent Evaluations of Social  
Work: Grounds for Optimism",  
Social Work, July.
- Rounsaville, B. J.  
1978 "Battered Wives", American  
Journal of Orthopsychiatry,  
48(3), July, p. 187-494.
- Rounsaville, B. J. and Weissman, M. W.  
1977-78 "Battered Women: A Medical  
Problem Requiring Detection",  
International Journal of  
Psychiatry in Medicine, Vol.  
8(2).
- Rounsaville, B. J., et. al.  
1979 "The Natural History of a Psych-  
otherapy Group for Battered  
Women", Psychiatry, Vol 42,  
February, p. 463-478.
- Smith, M. L.  
1980 "The Benefits of Psychotherapy",  
John Hopkins University,  
Baltimore, Md.

# ETHNIC MINORITY LEADERSHIP: A THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE

PALLASSANA R. BALGOPAL, D.S.W.  
Professor of Social Work  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

## ABSTRACT

Although numerous approaches have been utilized to study leadership (focusing on traits, attributes, styles, roles, situations, performance, results, and so on), there is no agreement on the ideal approach. The debate over this issue especially as related to the study of ethnic minority leadership continues. In this paper two major approaches - the "Great Man or Trait" and the "Times or Situational" approaches are examined, and the latter is presented as a viable theoretical framework for studying the ethnic minority leadership.

## INTRODUCTION

The concept of leadership has appealed to the imagination of many theorists and researchers, but attempts to categorize and integrate leadership knowledge systematically have proven disappointing (Stogdill, 1974). Regarding the state of the accumulated literature on leadership, Thibaut and Kelly (1959) comment:



Not much smaller than the huge bibliography on leadership is the diversity of views of the concept. Many studies essentially ask: What do people mean when they speak of a leader? Other studies begin with a conceptual or empirical definition of leadership and then proceed to determine the correlates or consequences of it as defined. Even a cursory review of these studies shows that leadership means different things to different people (p. 9).

It seems that leadership studies, guided by different notions and theories, have not concerned themselves with common phenomena (Janda, 1960). Browne and Cohn (1958) corroborate this viewpoint when they write:

Through all of the history of man's attempts to record human experiences, leadership has been recognized to an increasingly greater extent as one of the significant aspects of human activity. As a result, there is now a great mass of "leadership literature" which, if assembled in one place, would fill many libraries. The great part of the mass, however, would have little organization: it would evidence little in the way of common assumptions and hypotheses, and it would vary widely in theoretical and research approaches. To a great extent, therefore, the leadership literature is a mass of content without any coagulating substances to bring it together or to produce coordination and point out inter-relationships (p. V).

In spite of such ostensible chaos, conventional views of leadership identify a leader as one who exerts the most influence over other's efforts towards achieving group goals. Also, the concept of leadership allows one to see that a (some) member(s) of a group possesses certain characteristics which are different from those of the followers. The way by which a leader exerts influence over others in a group is called leadership role (including dynamics and style) (Carter, 1953), and it is dependent upon many circumstances and peculiarities of the leader and the situation. Obviously, one cannot understand ethnic minority leadership unless it is presented in the context of a theoretical and research frame of reference which takes under consideration some of the previous works on leadership in general and ethnic leadership in particular. This is based on the assumption that the general parameters of leadership are deducible from previous works, and that these parameters apply to all ethnic groups. Therefore, the purposes of this paper are to: 1) describe the nature of the leadership role (dynamics and style); 2) discuss two theoretical approaches which attempt to explain the leadership role; and 3) place the study of ethnic leadership in one of these theoretical approaches.

#### THE NATURE OF THE GENERAL LEADERSHIP ROLE

Three basic sub-concepts provide a framework for describing the dynamics of the leadership role. Influence is on sub-concept, and it can include virtually any psychological or behavioral effect or impact by one party on another in the process of interpersonal interaction. This impact may take the form of emulation,

suggestion, persuasion, or coercion. Emulation denotes one's modeling of another's behavior, while suggestion refers to any attempt to influence another's behavior by advocating a particular course of action. Persuasion involves the use of some inducement in an attempt to evoke a desired response, while coercion involves the use of forcible constraints to achieve a desired response.

The second sub-concept is power, defined as the ability to influence behavior. Power denotes the ability of a person or a group of persons to solicit prescribed behavior from others by means of superior formal or informal position (Bierstedt, 1950). Therefore, power can be understood as the capacity to affect behavior in a predetermined manner.

Another important sub-concept of leadership dynamics is authority, which is defined as the institutionalized right to employ power (Bierstedt, 1950). In a sense, authority represents an artificial power structure. The three basic types of legitimate authority are: rational legal, traditional, and charismatic. Rational legal authority is based on logical expedience, while traditional authority is based on custom and loyalty. Charismatic authority depends upon the qualities of the individual leader and is more illogical and emotionally based, because personal characteristics are more important than position. A charismatic leader is one who attracts followers by means of his/her appealing personality.

These dynamics, when juxtaposed in a certain manner, allow a leader to influence the activities of a group in a certain fashion, and this comprises leadership style. There are four basic types of

leadership styles: dictatorial, autocratic, democratic, and laissez-faire.

## TWO THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO LEADERSHIP IN GENERAL

As a foundation for these notions about the nature of the general leadership role, it is helpful to look at the two classical theoretical approaches which attempt to explain the nature of the leadership role, and which grew out of the thinking of early political philosophers. They are usually referred to as the "great man" and the "times" approaches (Gibb, 1969). In general, the "great man" approach has received the greater amount of attention and support in Western society. The "great man" approach holds that particular individuals are natively endowed with characteristics which cause them to stand out from the many and permit them to guide, direct, and lead the majority (Stogdill, 1948).

Since the variables which support the "times" approach are relatively more difficult to identify than those which support the "great man" approach, attention to it is only of recent vintage (perhaps only during the past three or four decades). The "times" approach views leadership as a function of given social situation. That is, at a particular time, a group of people have certain needs and require the services of an individual (or individuals) to assist them in meeting their needs. Chance determines which individual(s) happen(s) to be at the critical place at the critical time to provide the group with the needed leadership (Morgan, 1973). This does not mean that the particular individual(s) peculiar qualities would thrust him (them)

into a position of leadership in any other situations. It means only that the unique needs of the group are met by the unique qualities of the individual(s) at that time (Lewin, 1938). The "times" approach is somewhat less rigid than the "great man" approach, for while it assumes that humans are all alike and that there are individual differences, it emphasizes that the unique political, economic, and social characteristics of a given time and/or social place are indicative of the leadership needs of a given group.

These two theoretical approaches have provided the background for a large number of studies of leadership and leader behavior by researchers. The "great man" approach is the background for the trait studies of leadership which emphasize the leader's personal characteristics, while the "times" approach has provided the basic assumptions for the situational/interactional studies of leadership.

#### THE (GREAT MAN) TRAIT APPROACH

In the trait approach to studying leadership, extensive attempts have been made to enumerate the personality and special qualities essential for being a leader. Accordingly, some researchers have attempted to ascertain, mainly by experimental methods: 1) what specific innate traits of personality are responsible for the leadership role? 2) what traits are developed during the assumption of the leadership role? and 3) what traits are specifically affected as the leader's tasks are accomplished? (Gibb, 1969).

The notion of cataloguing personality traits of leaders commanded considerable attention during the early period of

leadership inquiry. Bird (1940), for example culled a list of seventy-nine traits of leaders from approximately twenty inquiries which bore some resemblance to controlled investigations. He also focused on the exploration of leadership in terms of what leaders actually did rather than the prevailing notions of leaders. Britt (1941) listed an additional sixty traits which, taken together, "constituted a fair representation of the principal traits of leadership." (p. 277). Krout (1942) added still another twenty-five traits compiled by a psychiatrist from a study of 100 selected leaders. Collectively, this amounted to over 60 personality traits which, singularly or in combination, allegedly accounted for leadership roles.

Stogdill's (1974) herculean task of reviewing studies in over 3,000 books and journal articles on leadership caused him to conclude that:

(Only a few) personality traits have been found to differentiate leaders from followers, successful from unsuccessful leaders, and high level from low level leaders. The traits with the highest overall average correlation with the leadership role are: originality, popularity, sociability, judgement, aggressiveness, desire to excel, humor, cooperativeness, liveliness, and athletic ability, in the approximate order of the magnitude of the average correlation coefficients (p. 91).

Actually, Terman (1904) conducted one of the earliest studies of leadership from the trait perspective. In his study, he sought to identify the qualities leaders possessed which enhanced their roles as

leaders. He also made suggestions as to which areas of leadership might be relevant to researchers, but the significance of his suggestions was not immediately apparent, for his primary aim was to discover the distinguishing attributes of leaders which appealed most to psychology.

This discipline had just begun to devise psychological tests and other means of assessing ability and personality. Also, after World War II, an interest in the impact of group dynamics on interpersonal relations prepared both psychologists and sociologists to apply their insights to the study of leadership. These new efforts were sparked by Stogdill and Gibb. The above-mentioned survey of the literature by Stogdill in 1948 showed that many researchers had sought to isolate the characteristics of leaders and to differentiate them from those of other group members. Individually, these studies were not successful and did not support one another; but by organizing them and placing them in one document, Stogdill debunked the trait approach and offered a strong rationale for the situational/interactional approach to the study of leadership.

Stogdill's (1948) review of the literature allows one to conclude that the qualities, characteristics, and skills required in a leader are determined, to a large extent, by the demands of the situation in which he/she functions as a leader, although a few personality traits are more likely to be found among leaders than among followers. Contrary to Stogdill's original intention, his work moved thinking about leadership away from trait determinants toward an emphasis upon the times or situations as major determinants, for it is quite clear that, subsequent to his study, the view of leadership

shifts toward interactions among members of a group and with the external environment (the situation). Shaw (1971) substantiates this notion by indicating that it is a mistake to think that the relationship between traits and the leadership role is universal, for a trait which is positively related to the leadership role in one situation may be either unrelated or even negatively related in another. This idea has resulted in substantial research which concludes that leadership roles are relative to situations.

#### THE (TIMES) SITUATIONAL/INTERACTIONAL APPROACH

By way of clarifying the situational/interactional approach, reference is made to LaPiere's (1938) definition of the "situation". He states that the "situation" is a set of related events, forces, considerations, and circumstances which constitute the context within which interaction or behavior occurs and within which it must be viewed in order to be understood. It appears that, in the situational/interactional approach to the study of leadership, the term "situation" implies at least five categories of behavioral determinants: 1) the structure of interpersonal relationships between and among leader and followers, 2) the group syntality or the quality of the structure (integration, cohesiveness, solidarity, etc.), 3) characteristics of the larger social context or society in which the group exists and from which the members are drawn, 4) the physical conditions, and 5) the task with which the group is confronted (Gibb, 1954).

In studying leadership from this perspective, emphasis is placed on the relationships among leaders-followers and their



external or social settings. These social settings may be small groups, communities, institutions, political organizations, business organizations, etc. Researchers who have used this approach may be classified as either interactionists or situationists.

### The Interactionists

The interactionists assume personality differences, and outstanding among those who have studied leadership from this perspective are Gibb (1958), Hemphill (1962), Cooper and McGaugh (1963), and Fiedler (1964).

Gibb's (1958) analyses of group dynamics led him to assert that there are four important aspects of group interaction which explain the leadership role: 1) role differentiation (including leadership) is part of a group's movement towards its goal of satisfying individual members needs; 2) leadership is a concept applied to the interaction of two or more persons, and the leader's evaluations control and direct the action of others in accomplishing common goals; 3) the leader's evaluations are products of perception and emotional attachment; and 4) this leads to a set of complex emotional relationships which, in turn, explain the leadership role.

Hemphill (1962), in support yet independent of Gibb's work, studied the characteristics of groups and their importance in determining what behavior is considered by group members to be conducive to successful leadership. His study used members of groups to obtain responses to the following kinds of issues: what a given leader does; the characteristics of the group he/she leads; and the degree of success he/she

achieves as a leader. Some findings from the study suggest that authoritative behavior on the leader's part is most successful in groups which restrict membership, in groups which are described by members who have high status in their groups, and in groups which are described by members who do not feel dependent on their groups.

Cooper and McGaugh (1963), who think that leadership and leaders are indispensable to adaptation and survival, describe the push-pull type of leadership as a function of the dominance-submission relationship among people. Pull may be seen as imprinting, or when one generates in another an enthusiastic desire to follow; while push may be seen when the leader plans or anticipates action, the followers often finding themselves in predicaments where they are dictated to and urged to implement behavior which they very much dislike. A combination of the two may be seen in a leader who both dictates and compromises, or vice versa.

Finally, Fiedler's (1964) areas for selecting and training leaders are interactionist in nature. His findings show that it is much easier to modify one's job or change one's rank and power than it is to change one's personality traits.

### This Situationists

The situationists assume group dynamics and consider external factors as important determinants of an organized group's efforts toward goal setting and goal achievement. Leadership here is directed toward organizing the group and its goals. The minimal social conditions which permit the existence of leadership are: 1) a

group (two or more persons), 2) a common task (goal oriented activities), and 3) differentiation of responsibility (different members have different duties). While there are many more situational factors which influence leadership, these are the minimal ones which will allow for the emergence of leadership. A leader, then, is one who becomes differentiated from others in the group in terms of the amount and quality of influence he/she exerts on the accomplishment of shared goals or activities of the group.

Further explanation of the leadership role in terms of influence is offered by Hollander (1964) who indicates that, since interaction can be evaluated through interpersonal assessments made up of task-related behaviors (measured against some expectation standards), an individual member who adheres to group expectations and conditions of competence over a significant period of time accumulates influence credits which permit innovation in the group. Consequently, this task-competent follower, at one stage of the group's interaction, may emerge as a leader in another stage.

The situationists insist that the group environment is paramount, implying that a good leader in one group may not be a good leader in another. Also, a leader in any group may not be adequate in all instances even in that group. The situationists focus on specialized abilities rather than traits. For a leader to be effective, he/she is only as effective as perceived in his/her group. Given associated factors, interpersonal interactions, and so forth. Situational studies reveal that certain leadership expectations are unique to particular group settings, for instance, Cartwright and Zander's (196) work shows

that while certain minimal abilities are required of all leaders, they are widely distributed among non-leaders as well, and that the optimal leadership abilities for one group may be quite different from those of another in a different setting. This means that just because a leader is suitable for one task, he/she may not be suitable for another (other) tasks, so as tasks change, leadership changes.

As a situationist, Fiedler (1964) developed a contingency model which is most practical for explaining the leadership role. His model maintains that directive leaders are effective under either favorable or unfavorable conditions, whereas non-directive leaders are effective under conditions of moderate favorability. Favorability is defined by the relationships among three situational variables: position power, task structure, and group-leader relations. Fiedler also states that when a situation is most unfavorable, the most effective leader devotes his attention primarily to friendly interpersonal relations.

Sociologists and political scientists who have studied leadership, particularly community power structures, may also be categorized as situationists. The community power structure is the power relations among actors in a community which persist through time, and the major ways sociologists have identified power holders or leaders are by studying community positions, by studying community reputations, and/or by conducting community decision analyses (Dahl, 1961). It seems that the oldest and simplest method of studying community leadership is by studying community positions. It rests on the assumption that leaders perform specified governmental and organizational (formal)

roles. This method does not assume any prior knowledge of the socio-economic structure of the community, although this structure is seen as part of the leadership environment. One simply draws up a list of people who perform the formal roles, and interviews them as community leaders. One difficulty, for the researcher, is that he /she never knows if actual leaders are excluded or if leaders with little or no power are included, for the method assumes that every office holder is influential on some issue(s). So while the method is economical, simple and useful for some purposes, it has dubious validity as a means for the identification of real power holders in a community.

The reputational method attempts to correct this deficiency, for it includes both formal and informal leadership roles. The most significant study of the community power structure which used the reputational method was done by Hunter (1953) in Atlanta. Hunter used a panel to identify most of the influential people in the community wherein he obtained a list of forty leaders whose reputations were studied and described. While the key leaders were from private rather than public sectors, the results from Hunter's study indicated that political and governmental leaders were second to economic leaders (who tended to compromise a small, relatively invisible upper-class group). Parenthetically, it is quite obvious that these findings are at variance with the democratic theory of political accountability.

The decision-analysis method attempts to respond to the critics of the reputational method, for it begins with certain key issues in the community and identifies people who affect their outcomes. Dahl's (1963) classic study (wherein he identified

three basic sets of issues in New Haven-- school issues, urban renewal issues, and political issues) concluded that a leader on one issue is not likely to be influential on another unless he/she is a public official such as the mayor; and leaders on different issues are not homogeneous. Of course this method had been assailed by critics also who are concerned about the arbitrary choice of issues; the fact that focusing on key issues ignores routine decisions; and the fact that the method ignores leadership ideologies. The critics of all three methods highlight the fact that traditional methods are quite crude and a more valid way of looking at leadership is needed for insuring adequate analysis of the leadership role and power structures.

It seems that the identification of power holders and an explanation of the leadership role, particularly on a large urban or societal level, is quite complex, for formal decision makers (those who hold formal offices) may not be the real decision makers in a political system. This was underscored by Mills (1956) who won considerable notoriety with his argument that "power to make decisions of national and international consequence is not so clearly seated in political, military and economic institutions that others areas of society seem off to the side and, on occasion, readily subordinated to these" (p. 16).

Bachrach and Baratz (1970) addressed the problems which face power and leadership identification by highlighting two facets of power which are not considered by leadership theorists and researchers: 1) those who establish public agenda may exercise power to prevent major issues from entering the political system; and 2) the

existence of the private property system, the legitimacy of wealth, and the validity of a social-incentive system are supra-environmental conditions which establish a social policy that requires leadership to be adaptive. This means that there are macro issues which explain the leadership role and power relations and which provide a much broader and more intelligible view when taken under consideration. In this context, it seems that the leadership role becomes an adaptive strategy, and the best way to study it is situationally. However, with the context of environmental issues, it does appear necessary to identify leaders both positionally and/or reputationally.

#### ETHNIC MINORITY LEADERSHIP AS AN ADAPTIVE STRATEGY

Consistent with the foregoing, this section analyzes ethnic leadership as an adaptive strategy. It proceeds on the assumption that ethnic leadership cannot be understood apart from the social context in which it exists. Thus, the nature of that social context and its impact on ethnic leadership will be discussed. Adaptation is a sub-set of coping which refers to any behavior or psychological process occasioned by threat and which serves the purpose of mitigating or eliminating that threat. In other words, "adaptation refers to strategies for dealing with threat" (Lazarus, 1955, p. 151). An understanding of ethnic minority leadership is clearer when it is placed in the context of adaptation, for viewed in this fashion, it is removed from the realm of the unusual and the strange and becomes, appropriately, a manifestation of ethnic population confronting, adjusting to, and mastering their

social environment. This, after all, is the challenge to all human groups, irrespective of ethnicity and race, and it emphasizes the notion that different groups, due to the nature of their environments and conditions in society, tend to deal with their environments differently. This point of view is consistent with Hartman's (1958) concept of adaptation which holds that people seek to fit with their environment and that "the degree of adaptiveness can only be determined with reference to environmental situations" (p. 23).

The importance of the above perspective in illuminating some of the issues involved in the current debate about the nature of ethnic minority leadership and leadership potential among these groups is apparent. Given the nature of the environment which minorities must negotiate, with all of its exclusions, rejections, poverty, and prejudice, it could hardly be expected that their method of negotiation with their environment would be similar to that of whites. This is not to say that ethnic leaders are merely reactors; it indicates that these leaders are both actors and reactors depending on the nature of the situation. McDaniel and Balgopal (1978) in their historical analysis of the patterns of black leadership note that during the Slavery period of 1841-1865 when the race relations policy was subjugation the modal black leadership strategy was oriented toward integration. During the Reconstruction period of 1866-1877 as the race relations policy changed to that of forced tolerance the black leadership also changed to that of integration. In the Post-Reconstruction years between 1877-1920 the race relations policy tended to be de jure segregation and the modal black leadership strategy was oriented toward accommodation.



In the 1920's with increased black migration, the leadership strategy was aimed at separation. During 1930 through 1960 a period characterized by depression and revolution the modal strategy used by black leaders was oriented toward integration and separation. With the emphasis on rapid desegregation during the 1960's Revolution black leaders used differential strategies, including integration, pluralism and separation. In the 1970's a Post-Revolution period as the race relations policy was that of tolerance the black leadership strategy was oriented toward integration. However, in the 1980's as the race relations has not made any dramatic change and continues to be one of tolerance, there is once again emergence of new black leaders who are advocating integration through elected political office. Election of black mayors in most American cities and the emergence of Rev. Jesse Jackson as a viable presidential candidate clearly supports that, for eliminating continued oppression of blacks and other ethnic minorities, it is essential to elect minority leaders to key political offices.

Chestang (1976) identifies three essential elements which aid in describing the black environmental situation: social injustice, societal inconsistency, and personal impotence. This, of course, is a conceptual way of referring to poverty and racism. These three conditions, when combined with adaptive styles, comprise the black experience, and out of this experience, black leadership evolves. It should be clear that ethnic minority leadership is being described as a process rather than a cluster of traits. The rationale is that the trait approach can be very misleading, because it overlooks the fact that "behaviors which are often construed as stable personality traits are,

in reality, highly specific and dependent on the details of evoking situations," (Mischel, 1968, p. 37). Another reason of utmost significance for not listing a cluster of traits to define minority leadership is that such an approach can lead to pejoratively stereotyping these groups in general (e.g., indicating that blacks are affective, blacks are laissez faire, etc.).

Given the nature of the condition for minorities in American society--poverty and racism--and given the fact that in spite of this condition, they are citizens of the country, the prevailing and consistent aspect of their lives which they all share in common is the necessity to live in two cultural arenas -- one minority and one American (a pseudo-pluralistic society). This, then, is a significant part of the ethnic minority situation which gives rise to ethnic leadership, and it grows out of the history and the acculturation of minority in this society. For example, slavery essentially severed the blacks' cultural connections with their homeland, the result being that they were forced to adopt the only culture available, the culture of the dominant white society. At the same time, their participation in white society was circumscribed and conditional. Blacks, in other words, identified with the white society, but the opportunity to derive the benefits of that identification was denied. As a result, their acculturation was dichotomized. Because the gratification of certain sustenance needs (i.e., employment, economic resources, political power, and so forth) were lodged in the white society, blacks necessarily had to interact with whites. However, their needs for nurturance (i.e., family, friends, supportive institutions, and so on) were gratified in the black community.

When ethnic minority leadership is understood as a psycho-social process involving these two interacting systems (each serving to meet specific needs of minority individuals and groups), and when it is understood that this process was set in motion by the limitations placed on their participation in the white society, the nature of the environmental demands on the psycho-social function of the minorities becomes obvious. Limited opportunities for employment, meager economic resources, and circumscribed participation in the political sphere posed serious threats to their physical and social survival. Rampant personal denigration inconsistent responses from the white society, and the threat to physical and emotional well-being menaced their security. Implications of inferiority, denigration of their talents and skills, and insults to their dignity abused their group pride. One of the functions of ethnic minorities leadership, therefore, was (and still is) to mitigate and/or palliate these environmental demands for survival, security, and group pride (and by implication, self-esteem).

As has been said before, it is within the white society that threats to ethnic minorities physical and social survival are found. However, these people, particularly their leaders, must make excursions into the white society if they are to survive, and they do so with the least danger to their integrity by relating only instrumentally to it. By this is meant that their leaders adopt a variety of strategies for obtaining the needed benefits without rendering their people vulnerable. The observation that many minorities perform quite adequately on jobs, but show no investment in the task is one manifestation of a larger leadership strategy. This strategy

was even more commonly used during the period when racial discrimination was more blatant, and blacks of superior competence were consigned to menial tasks. Lack of interest in being a doorman, for example, when one possesses the credentials of a lawyer should be understandable. That some minority individuals used their political position to advance group interest is not surprising. This was (is) true, because the real political power resided (reside) in institutions which had (have) the power to end their careers. Manipulations such as feigned humility and other self-effacing behaviors were (are) also utilized in the course of obtaining survival needs.

The security and the group pride functions of ethnic minority leadership also stem from the constraints placed upon the minority individuals participation in the wider society. In response to those constraints, these groups have been pushed to develop leadership which assures mutually supporting solidarity. Davis (1982) succinctly presents the societal variables which are instrumental in the rise of black leadership: 1) absence of political equity - according to Davis there is a direct correlation between the activity of black leadership, followers, and organizations and the degree to which black citizens have equitable and just access to and control of the political system; 2) absence of adequate economic opportunity - continuation of serious inequities in the economic status among the whites and blacks is a major concern of all black leaders; 3) continued violence against black people and the failure on the part of the society, including government, to put an end to it has been instrumental in the emergence of black leaders in the local level; and 4) the historical absence of access to different public accommo-

dations is still prevalent, especially through institutional racism and racist policies both in the private and public sectors. This solidarity has both social and psychological implications which are interactive and reciprocal. Because the social implications are well known (e.g., the church, sharing resources), it might be well to devote attention to the psychological implications.

The psychological implications of this solidarity provide the genesis of the idea of an "ethnic community". This idea of ethnic community is ultimately an abstraction, for a real, unified monolith called the ethnic community seldom exists. What does exist is the shared feeling of "we-ness" among the ethnics growing out of their shared experiences in relation to the white society. This "we-ness" is facilitated by ethnic leadership, and it serves as a haven against the assaults of the white society. When one refers to the work of leaders in supportive institutions within the ethnic community, such as ministers in the black church, and union and community workers among Chicans farm workers, it is clear that they are able to do their work because of this affinity between and among their people. It is in this sense that one speaks of leadership in the ethnic community.

The abuses to group pride are related to the implications of inferiority, the insults of dignity, and the denigration of talents and skills. Within the ethnic community, leaders serve as role models indicating, to other members, that it is possible to display their talents and skills and receive intrinsic and/or extrinsic rewards. For example, this could be observed more clearly during recent periods of black history, however, the

group pride function of black leadership has always existed. What was once the pride in observing one's parents and friends within the territorial confines of the black community has now been generalized to the activities of one's black fellows, whether in academic, politics, religion, sports or other areas in the larger society.

In addition to the above, the group pride function of ethnic minority leadership can be seen in its provision of a base for identity. The former slave who persevered, outwitting his master and surviving; the depreciated black child who struggled against heavy odds and achieved success; a people beaten down and whose spirits were crushed--all of these are elements of the black identity. These experiences provide a sense of purpose in the lives of many black people. It seems that all groups, in one sense or another, define themselves in terms of how they have mastered their environments. and it is true that every group whose history has been tarnished by oppression has attempted to transform that oppression into an asset. This does not imply that the seeds of good germinate in oppression. It is suggested only that people do what they must to maintain their dignity and pride in the face of oppression. It implies only that the human being adapts (or copes) by using the means available to him/her.

## CONCLUSIONS

Since generally, the issues for ethnic minority leadership have been set by the white majority, it seems that the situational approach is ideal for studying

it (see for example, the thorough works of Thompson (1963), Conyers and Wallace (1976) and Chatterjee (1975)). Such an approach allows the researcher to study the minority leadership role non-pejoratively, and as a function of the dynamic nature of its environment over time and from place to place. It also allows the researcher to narrow down the concept of minority leadership so that it includes only those activities which are, or have been, specifically oriented toward the solution of some problem(s), or the achievement of some goal(s), which is (are) of particular relevance to these ethnic minority groups in the United States.

---

The author expresses his deep appreciation to Professor Clyde O. McDaniel, Jr. for his stimulating ideas and assistance in writing this article.

#### REFERENCES

- Bachrach, P. and Baratz, M.  
1970 Power and Poverty. New York:  
Oxford University Press.
- Bierstedt, R.  
1950 "An Analysis of Social Process"  
American Sociological Review,  
15, December.
- Bird, C  
1940 Social Psychology. New York:  
Appleton Century.
- Britt, S. H.  
1941 Social Psychology of Modern

Life, New York: Rinehart and Company.

- Browne, C. G. and Cohn, T. S.  
1958 The Study of Leadership.  
Danville, Ill.: The Interstate  
Printers and Publishers.
- Carter, L. F.  
1953 "On Defining Leadership", in M.  
Sherif and M. O. Wilson (Eds.),  
Group Relations at the  
Crossroads. New York: Harper  
and Row.
- Cartwright, D. and Zander A. (Eds.)  
1960 Group Dynamics: Research and  
Theory. Evanston, Ill.: Row  
Peterson.
- Chatterjee, P.  
1975 Local Leadership in Black Comm-  
unity. Cleveland, Ohio: Case  
Western Reserve University.
- Chestang, L. W.  
1976 "Environmental Influences on  
Social Functioning: The Black  
Experience," P. Chafferty and L.  
W. Chestang (Eds), Diversity in  
American Society: Implications  
for Social Policy, New York:  
Association Press.
- Conyers, J. E. and Wallace, W. L.  
1976 Black Elected Officials. New  
York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Cooper, G. B. and McGaugh, G. R.  
1963 Leadership Integrating Prin-  
ciples of Social Psychology.  
Cambridge: Schenkman Publishing
- Dahl, R.  
1961 Who Governs. New Haven, Ct.:



Yale University Press.

- Dahl, R.  
1963 Modern Political Analysis.  
Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey:  
Prentice Hall.
- Davis, K. E.  
1982 "The Status of Black Leadership:  
Implications for Black Followers  
in the 1980's", Journal of App-  
lied Behavioral Science, 18:3
- Fiedler, F. E.  
1964 "A Contingency Model of Leader-  
ship Effectiveness", in L.  
Berkowitz, (Ed.), Advances in  
Experimental Social Psychology.  
New York: Academic Press.
- Gibb C. A.  
1954 "Leadership", in G. Lindzey  
(Ed.), Handbook of Social  
Psychology, Cambridge: Addison-  
Wesley Publishing.
- Gibb, C. A.  
1958 "An Interactional View of Emer-  
gence of Leadership", Australian  
Journal of Psychology, 10.
- Gibb, C. A.  
1969 Leadership: Selected Readings.  
Baltimore: Penguin Books.
- Hartman, H.  
1958 Ego Psychology and the Problem  
of Adaptation. New York:  
International Universities  
Press.
- Hemphill, J. K. et.al.  
1962 Administrative Performance and  
Personality: A Study of the  
Principle in a Simulated

Elementary School, New York:  
Teachers College, Columbia Uni-  
versity.

Hollander, E. P.  
1964 Leaders, Groups, and Influence.  
New York: Oxford University  
Press.

Hunter, F.  
1953 Community Power Structure.  
Chapel Hill: University of  
North Carolina.

Janda, K. F.  
1960 "Toward the Explication of the  
Concept of Leadership in Terms  
of the Concept of Power", Human  
Relations, 13:4.

Krout, M. H.  
1942 Introduction to Social Psych-  
ology. New York: Harper.

LaPiere, R. T.  
1938 Collective Behavior. New York:  
McGraw-Hill.

Lazarus, R. S.  
1938 Psychological Stress and the  
Coping Process. New York:  
McGraw-Hill.

Lewin, K.  
1938 "The Conceptual Representation  
and Measurement of Psychological  
Forces", Contributions to Psych-  
ology Theory I.

McDaniel, C. O., Jr. and Balgopal, P. R.  
1978 "Patterns of Black Leadership:  
Implications for Social Work  
Education", Journal of Educa-  
tion for Social Work, 14:1.

- Mills, C. W.  
1970 The Power Elite. New York:  
Oxford University Press.
- Mischel, W.  
1968 Personality and Assessment. New  
York: John Wiley.
- Morgan, J. JR.  
1973 Principles of Administration and  
Supervisory Management. New  
York: Prentice-Hall.
- Stogdill, R. M.  
1948 "Personal Factors Associated  
with Leadership: A Survey of  
the Literature", Journal of  
Psychology, 25.
- Stogdill, R. M.  
1974 Handbook of Leadership: A  
Survey of Theory and Research.  
New York: The Free Press.
- Shaw, M. E.  
1971 Group Dynamics: The Psychology  
of Small Group Behavior. New  
York: McGraw-Hill.
- Terman L. M.  
1904 "Preliminary Study in the  
Psychology and Pedagogy of  
Leadership", Pedagogical Semin-  
ary, 11.
- Thibaut, J. W. and Kelly, H. H.  
1959 The Social Psychology of Groups.  
New York: John Wiley.
- Thompson, D. C.  
1963 The Negro Leadership Class.  
Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey:  
Prentice Hall.

## UNDERSTANDING GAY AND LESBIAN AGING

Philip M. Kayal, Ph.D.  
Seton Hall University

Studying the aging process of "gay men" and "lesbians" is problematic because it assumes that sexual orientation as such is a valid ontological concept and research category. As a master status, sexual orientation by itself is not a particularly useful explanatory variable. Objectivity is further limited by the sexism and homophobia of both the sociological profession and its "in-house" researchers and theoreticians. Perceptions of gay/lesbian aging are particularly colored by the heterosexual emphasis on family life. Arguments are made that institutionalization of the elderly is really the political manifestation of personal and social values which are insensitive to the needs of minorities in general and "same-sexers" in particular.

### SOCIOLOGICAL OBJECTIVITY

Sociological and gerontological research is frequently done from what is now recognized as a "social order" perspective (Horton, 1966; Szymanski, 1970). Gouldner (1963), moreover, argues quite convincingly that social scientists HAVE to act out of some value matrix in order to understand and state their cases. There is a danger, however, that sociologists will emphasize an "order model" to the exclusion of all others. This would color both the perception and understanding of nearly all life cycle events, especially the aging experiences of minorities. Even if minority views are given in the gerontological literature, Adelman (1980:13) tells us that they are typically contrasted against "mainstream" models of American society and behavior. This simply reinforces the normative ideas of the

"in-house researcher" whose beliefs and perceptions then become the unquestioned research concepts of the discipline.

Take, for example, the way social order theorists generally misuse sexuality, sexual orientation, and sexual style as explanatory variables. Plummer (1981) claims that this is quite evident in any social science treatment of "homosexuals" and homosexuality. It appears that when the life-style or life-cycle experiences of "same-sexers" (Vidal, 1981) are studied by outsiders, the complementarity between the questions asked and the social characteristics and beliefs of the researcher go unrecognized. Because of their assumptions about reality, these researchers can only study and reify misconstrued social concepts and biases.

What most often passes as objectivity, then, may really be the biases of a certain class of "established" social science practitioners (Kayal, 1976). As a result, sociological and gerontological literature is often conceptually and empirically redundant (Cf: Gagnon and Simon, 1973). It is most likely written from a sexist, heterosexist, and homophobic point of view (Kayal and San Giovanni, 1984). This paper attempts to show more clearly how heterosexism or the domination of everyday life by the roles, attitudes, values, and "knowledge" of "opposite-sex players" colors and distorts our understanding of the aging process among gays and lesbians.

#### Studying "Homosexuals":

It is the argument of this paper that both theory and practice in the sociology of aging are heterosexist, sexist, stereotypical, and frequently inconsistent because they favor order and assimilationist assumptions about social and sexual behavior. In other words, aging, like all social reality, is generally perceived and studied from the position and perspectives of white, heterosexual, male, urban, educated, and ivory tower academicians

playing traditional and legitimate marital and social roles (Friedrichs, 1970). Even when we have information on the aging process of the disenfranchised (Gelfand and Kutzik, 1979), i.e., ethnics, blacks, gays, etc., the language of analysis and variables utilized, the objectives of the research, and the data derived are generally colored by the academic/professional language employed, the questions investigated, and the values and/or biases of the researchers themselves (Mills, 1940; Becker, 1967).

That the gerontological profession is so prejudiced can be evidenced by a review of its understanding and analysis of gay men and lesbians. It will also be demonstrated that using sexual orientation by itself as an explanatory variable is so fraught with difficulties as to render it meaningless. It will even be argued that studying same-sexers as a distinct sociological and psychological category is in itself both prejudiced and problematic for it assumes that the choice of "love/sex object" indicates something unique about the social, mental, religious, political, and moral fiber of same-sex players. Plummer (1981) has argued that it is unlikely that we can know anything about anyone in terms of whom they have sex with and/or show affection for.

It is inappropriate to see people primarily in terms of their sexual activity. It is quite possible that sexual activity and/or identity itself may actually be nothing more than mere "role taking" (McIntosh, 1967). This is crucial to my argument since same-sex players are considered to be "homosexuals" and are assumed, therefore, to be "real and ontologically" different people. But this notion is only the natural outcome of sexist arrangements wherein the object of affection is thought to determine the personality, identity, and behavior of the actors involved (Kayal, 1976). It is more to the point to note that it is only when the sexual behaviors and roles taken by same-sexers become socio-political problems that sexual activity and identity as such become salient. After sexual

orientation becomes an issue, it becomes internalized as part of private identity. Therefore, gerontologist Marcy Adelman (1981:83) suggests:

. . . future research on homosexuality should be prepared to discard antiquated notions of normal development and should investigate homosexuality and sexual orientation from a non-moralistic standpoint in which sexual identity is viewed as a secondary and not an essential process in human development.

Because the normative and prevailing world-view assumes the naturalness of heterosexuality, however, same-sex activity is seen as "exceptional." The category "homosexual" is thus created and includes anyone who engages in or comes to identify with "same-sexing." Negative attributes with moral overtones are then assigned to all same-sexers who are seen as members of a deviant group. No distinction is made for high or low identification with this behavior, the setting in which it occurs, its permanence, or its meaning for its practitioners. Nor are distinctions made between male and female "same-sexers." Until recently, women were included in the term "homosexual" in the same way that "man" supposedly included women. This is quite common despite the fact that lesbian sexuality is neither different from that of women in general nor similar in form or style to that of men (Kayal and San Giovanni, 1984). Neither does a woman's choice of love object come out of the same constellation of values, experiences, and structural arrangements which characterize male same-sex players. Since lesbians are first and foremost women, what is true for them is true for women generally and vice versa. This same logic applies to straight and gay men as well (Blumstein and Schwartz, 1983).

What I have been describing is heterosexual behavior and research passing as objective, universal, good and natural. This is because it is socially and politically constructed and necessary for the sake of the continued reproduction of the

species. Since sexual behaviors and identities are fragile and precarious in their duration and meanings, even heterosexual behavior has to be reinforced, to be sustained. Thus, the survival seeking socio-cultural environment calls forth and requires a heterosexist emphasis. It is this factor which tends to relegate same-sexers to a morally inferior sub-class of outsiders. As "marginals," they are then seen as having unique origins, personalities, psychologies and needs.

The gerontologist then tries to study the aging patterns of "homosexuals" only as homosexuals rather than as people occupying multiple statuses and playing a diversity of roles. Since these "homosexuals" are thought to be characterized by opposite gender identifications and behaviors, research time and effort are spent either proving or disproving or measuring what are essentially stereotypes. Even the fact that there are "homosexualities" (Weinberg and Bell, 1978) rather than homosexuals (created in and by a heterosexist society) tends to be ignored. There is no single type of male or female same-sex player. What does exist, however, are men and women living in basically homosocial environments. Same-sexers are only acting in terms of the assumptions of a sexist society wherein one would expect homosocial beings to be sexual with one another, especially if their sexual behavior is a political and social issue. Rather than focus on "sexual orientation" as a determining and differentiating factor, it would be more useful to consider "the style of relating," i.e., the nature, purpose, and objective of the sexuality exhibited in movement towards one's partner. This is so because the way people act sexually is a function of sex role assignment and socialization by sex and not sexual orientation as such. Sexual orientation by itself, then, is not justifiable as an analytical category except when same-sexers are institutionalized in heterosexist environments wherein normative conflicts might arise.

Since a sexist environment is the "framework within which we act, relate, make decisions, emote,



create, make judgements, do research, and generally live" (Kayal, 1977:97), it is no surprise that the general sexuality and sexual style developed within and between men and women is different. I am speaking here of the feelings and beliefs people have about their own bodies, those of others, and how, why, and when they should relate to some other person. Not surprisingly, it is the control and organization of sexuality around patriarchy or male prerogatives and needs which causes basic divisions in both styles and motives of relating to be generally attributed to sex itself (Kayal and San Giovanni, 1984). For purposes of this paper, the sexuality developed and generally exhibited by "typical men" will be called "instrumental" or masculinist and that of a "typical woman" "affective" or feminist. Both are the result of segregated role conditioning. The former is based on power, competition, control, conquest, and erotic "tension," while the latter emphasizes affinity, equality, context, and relationship. It will be argued that it is these "styles of relating" which will affect aging outcomes and styles of aging more radically than mere choice of love/sex object since they become personality traits and personal temperament is considered a variable affecting the aging process (Havighurst, 1968).

#### Gay and Lesbian Aging Revisited:

In light of the preceding, "same-sexing" as such can not serve as a general category for comparisons with heterosexual actors. Since it has been shown that male and female same-sexers and opposite-sexers are in fact no different from each other when they age (Laner, 1978), any differences which do appear between people are not due to "affectional choice" but because of life-style, political activity, social consciousness, institutional affiliations, generation, and degree of masculinist and feminist values (Adelman, 1980). Therefore, same sex activity should be seen as an intervening variable with meanings which differ between and among its practitioners and critics. Certainly, same-sex players who are religiously affiliated, professionally employed, married with children,

living in suburbia, and visiting "tea-rooms" (Humphreys, 1970), have to be different from single, urban, same-sexers living in community with one another.

However, since homosexual behavior is generally proscribed in a sexist society, it is possible that same-sex players do have additional problems throughout the life-cycle which may affect aging outcomes (Adelman, 1980). Whether these problems are unique to gays and lesbians is, nevertheless, questionable since they may be true of any minority living in an institutionally biased society. These "problems" might also be mitigated by personal characteristics like relational status, income, education, life-style, adaptation to a stigmatized status, and age at recognition and acceptance of sexuality (Adelman, 1980). Indeed, how, when, and why stigma affects the life course of minorities is an important and valid subject needing attention. Such an approach regarding gays and lesbians, however, would require a redefinition of their status and identity from that of "deviant" to that of a diversified minority group living in a pluralistic rather than assimilationist society.

As it happens now, heterosexist assumptions about reality make it difficult to determine the precise causes of aging variations between "straights" and "gays" or among and between gays and lesbians themselves. Many differences could be due to the overall differences in aging between men and women generally. Being legally single and/or institutionally marginal would probably explain variations in aging outcomes more accurately than mere sexual orientation. Indeed, it is the argument of this paper that aging adjustments and outcomes are more likely determined by personal ideologies like masculinism and feminism, political consciousness and activity, relational status ("lovers," single, married) and by affiliation and identity with a gay/lesbian community than by sexual orientation in and of itself. This is especially so since there is no uniform way of living in the world as a single, married, straight, gay or lesbian person. It is the

stigma of being sexual and single, however, which is especially problematic for gays and lesbians.

Because the choice of love/sex object is acceptable for opposite-sexers, adjustment and support (at least in terms of this issue) are automatically given by society. For a same-sexer, it is, in fact, fraught with difficulty and often becomes the major adjustment crisis (Kimmel, 1978:117). Not only must the gay and lesbian community be discovered, it has to be identified with. Its compensations are minimized, however, by the stigma and status given it by outsiders and which may be internalized by some same-sexers themselves. Apparently, this issue of possible stigmatized identity is so crucial for emerging and confirmed same-sex players that it is, for many, the major life-crisis. It frequently serves to prepare gays and lesbians for the future role/identity crisis of aging itself (Kimmel, 1978).

Equally as important as general life-style and values within the context of a gay/lesbian community is the question of relational status and the quality of life and relationships within that community. Unfortunately, the literature on gay/lesbian life-styles is often written by outsiders and reflects popular and moralistic misconceptions as well as peculiar heterosexist, homophobic, and sexist biases. A review of the gerontological literature on loneliness, attractiveness, and sexual activity in the gay and lesbian communities will substantiate this point.

#### PERCEPTIONS OF GAY/LESBIAN AGING:

Perceptions of aging are generally colored by heterosexist biases favoring family life and life within families. Gubrium (1976) notes that even scholarly literature implies that single people are peculiarly vulnerable to loneliness and abuse simply because they are not married. He found, however, that never-married older people tended to be life-long isolates who were not especially lonely in old age. While it might be reasonable to expect that the

role assigned ALL men is internalized and accepted as natural. It is not a function of sexual orientation as such (Levine, 1982). Among heterosexual players, instrumentality is contained by women's affectivity. . . something which some gay men AS MEN may have difficulty with when they attempt intimacy.

Moreover, there is substantial evidence that gay men, despite their masculine socialization, actually desire and prefer long term personal and loving relationships (Bell, 1971). Even though they are difficult to achieve, they are valued over and above mere genital contact. This "problem" recedes, however, with age and experience. Many men, regardless of their earlier behavior, appear to establish equitable and affective relationships with some significant others later on in the life cycle (Weinberg and Williams, 1974).

Furthermore, since same-sexers are stereotypically seen as defined by their sexual orientation rather than their personal sexual style, they are assumed to be devoid of feelings, intimacy, and continuity in their relationships. Consequently, according to Francher and Henkin (1973:670):

the process of aging for the male homosexual is seen as exceptionally stressful due to a lack of legal supports and sanctions of a binding nature, lack of children as a focal point in middle and old age, and the emphasis on youth and physical attractiveness in the homosexual community.

If and when this is true, it is more likely a consequence of patriarchy and sexism. Instead of marveling at the spontaneity, voluntariness, and durability of so many gay male and lesbian relationships (Blumstein and Schwartz, 1983), the assumption is that the heterosexual family is trouble free and steadfast in its support of the elderly. Looking at institutionalized role relationships and expectations through rose-colored lenses, then, may not reveal the degree or quality of connectedness in any relationship. Unfortunately, the monogamous and

never-married elderly might be isolated and cut off from potential sources of help in old age, Clark and Anderson (1967:256) found that never-marrieds learned very early in life to cope with loneliness and to look after themselves. They were successfully self-reliant and autonomous in later years. Yet, as Weinberg (1969:66) points out, ". . . for the male homosexual, aging is generally conceived to be more problematic precisely because he does not have a family of procreation." He continues:

Homosexual sex, unlike heterosexual sex, carries with it no special commitment to another partner, no clear cut division of roles with legal supports and sanctions which bind a relationship together, and no possibility of children who might provide a focus and continuity for such a partnership.

One wonders whether this would also be true for single and "promiscuous" and masculinist opposite-sex players as well. After all, where is the evidence that the traditional and patriarchal American family is any more supportive of its own elderly? Indeed, in marriage, it is often the woman, and only the woman, who supplies the affectional and bonding dimension of the relationship since involvement and continuity are not an automatic function of either marriage or heterosexuality as such (Cumming, 1963). Having either a family of orientation or procreation may protect some people from the hazards and problems of old age, but it is no guarantee of a trouble-free adult life. As an ideology, however, it basically serves to render single and/or gay life "inauthentic."

Denying the validity of homosocial and homosexual relationships is not only prejudicial, it also reduces homosexual behavior to little more than genital narcissism (Francher and Henkin, 1973:673). Actually, the implication that men cannot have anything but instrumental or superficial relationships with one another is not necessarily or universally true. This is only the case when the sex

romantic emphasis in personal relationships and in family systems makes it impossible to see singles objectively and/or friendships as meaningful family substitutes. Witness, for example, the biases and instrumental perception of sexual relations as stated by Cagnon and Simon (1973) and quoted by Laner (1978:496):

The heterosexual has his children whose careers assure a sense of the future, and he has a wife whose sexual availability cushions the shock of declining sexual attractiveness. In addition, the crisis of aging comes later to the heterosexual, at an age when his sexual powers have declined and expectations concerning the significance of his sexuality are considerably lower. The earliness of the impact of aging in the life-cycle of the homosexual is often out of phase with the other aspects of aging (occupational, familial, etc.).

Laner (1978) goes on to mention that for Gagnon and Simon, the onset of feeling "over the hill" for male homosexuals is as early as the early 30's to as late as the early 40's. "At this time," they hold, "the reduction of life chances produces serious feelings of depression and loneliness akin to those presumably felt by single or divorced heterosexual women." These sexist and stereotypical prejudices are further developed by Slater (1977) who also argues that homosexual men are generally attracted to younger and "more beautiful" people. While such attractions and liaisons do exist (and are harmless in themselves), they are, nonetheless, condemned for socio-political reasons, i.e., they are detrimental to present social structural arrangements. Yet, they in no way characterize the life-style or sexual affectional choices of most gay men. Rather they are true of heterosexual relationships but since these relationships are "institutionalized" or officially established and sanctioned, they are ignored as normal. This heterosexist fear and projection, however, are used to stigmatize and oppress gay men.

Gagnon and Simon go on to suggest that this desire for "youthful beauties" is the basis for male prostitution. One point they miss is that "buying sex from boys" is a complex phenomenon that often involves publically heterosexual role players on leave from their wives, children, and suburban settings. In fact, these players are rarely integrated, active, and informed members of a "gay community" as such.

Nevertheless, themes similar to Gagnon and Simon's are reiterated by Clark and Anderson (1967) when they write: "since they (singles) have never been close to others, they are spared the grief and loneliness of those who, having invested in and been intimate with others, must suffer the loss of a cherished relative, spouse or friend." The composite stereotype of the aging gay male is seen as compounding the issue of being single. For Kelly (1977:329), it consists of the following "facts":

He no longer goes to bars, having lost his physical attractiveness and his sexual appeal to the young men he craves. He is over sexed, but his sex life is very unsatisfactory. He has been unable to form a lasting relationship with a sexual partner, and he is seldom active sexually any more. When he does have sex it is usually in a "tearoom" (public toilet). He has disengaged from the gay world and his acquaintances in it. He is retreating further and further into the "closet"--fearful of disclosure of his "perversion." Most of his associations now are increasingly with heterosexuals. In a bizarre and deviant world centered around age he is labeled "an old queen," as he has become quite effeminate.

Despite its distortions and contradictions, the salience of this view makes homosexual aging appear to be a particularly "pathetic phenomenon" (Kelly, 1977:329). Even though evidence indicates that it is the stigma which causes problems instead of the

"state of being" (Kelly, 1977; Adelman, 1980), the aging homosexual player tends to become distinctly odd. Stern (1961) offers this view in The Sixth Man: ". . . the unaffluent older gay is living in the Bowery, seeking oblivion in handouts and cheap wine," and "regress(ing) to a point where he preys on small children." Problems of loneliness (however operationalized) are considered characteristic of homosexuals (Allen, 1961) rather than the elderly or isolated singles or even the culture and society itself (Slater, 1970).

Because considerable evidence has been gathered which indicates that gay men and lesbians are in fact no more or less lonely than others (Wineberg & Williams, 1974; Kelly, 1977; Siegelman, 1972), it would not be unreasonable to agree with Tripp (1971) that the social science literature on homosexuality is designed to frighten the "gay patient with the image of the aging, lonely homosexual." One thing missing from this heterosexist view of gay aging is an understanding of the role of the gay/lesbian community as a support system (Francher & Henkin, 1973). Another is the presence of informal friendship groups which act as family. In a word, sexism forces us to view relationships and social life from a purely heterosexist perspective.

The same is true of the prevailing understandings of the erotic and sexual. For example, it is normally considered appropriate that only women be seen as erotic objects but never men. That straight men can see or use women instrumentally while gay men are penalized for doing the same to one another is a function of socio-political structural arrangements. While the erotic is personal, it is still politically constructed and the eros celebrated in a male dominated society will always be one based on power, domination, conquest, control, and reward. The point is, however, that it is the masculinist and sexist perspective on beauty and attractiveness which penalizes gays and women and which renders and reduces same-sex players to "single issue people," i.e., sexually preoccupied explorers and exploiters. Gay male sexuality, ironically, is seen in and



through the concepts, needs, and logic of their masculinist and straight critics who are disturbed by the fact that gays are either loving each other or having sex with one another. Gays, then, become the scapegoats necessary to protect the prerogatives, images, and status of masculinist straight men.

This is also evidenced in the fact that gay men are considered sexually preoccupied because they are gay rather than because they are men. They are then singled out for criticism because they do what the whole society encourages everyone to do, i.e., be concerned with beauty, sexual prowess, and personal appearance. Male same-sexers concerned with attractiveness are assumed to be "faggots" because of this "feminine interest" (Sontag, 1972). This is not only sexist but illogical since it is a concern of the whole society. Unfortunately, the gerontological literature also treats the question of "beauty" only in a female or gay context. Actually, beauty and appearance are a male--albeit subtle--concern and for whatever reason perhaps a greater concern for some, younger gay men. Because it is assumed that physical appearance is not a "real" man's concern, we know very little of how men in general react to physical changes and deterioration in their own appearances (Minningerode and Adelman, 1978).

This question is avoided because gerontologists are generally concerned with structural indicators of aging. Thus, for example, the emphasis is on "disengagements" from work roles (retirement) for men and the "empty nest syndrome" for women (Cumming, 1963). These become the primary indicators of "awareness of aging" because they are socially recognizable. The simple fact of looking in a mirror and noticing physical changes in one's body is never even considered a significant issue or indicator of aging--especially for men.

Ignoring personal definitions of when aging commences misses the point in another crucial way. Generally speaking, single people, and males in particular, need to be concerned with attractiveness because it has become the primary motivation for

social/sexual intercourse in our society. It is now the primary source of eroticism for males. Relationships are reduced to sexual activities which are themselves reduced to narcissistic and instrumental purposes requiring "beauty" and hence passion for legitimization and satisfaction. This construction of reality is sexist and heterosexist because it ignores the reality of sexual activity throughout the life cycle. It also ignores the perspectives and experiences of women on the whole question. Studies of the sexual activity of the elderly indicate that they generally disavow instrumental sex regardless of their sexual orientation (Minningerode and Adelman, 1978; Kimmel, 1978). Aging simply refines and redefines the meaning and purpose and style of sexual activity rather than lessens its need (Lobsenz, 1974). Women, moreover, being the victims of the "beauty as erotic" syndrome seem not to be too concerned with attractiveness as the sole basis of relationships at any point in the life-cycle regardless of their sexual orientation. This may in fact help explain the durability and viability of many lesbian relationships.

#### GERIATRIC BIASES AND THE SAME-SEXER:

Similar homophobic and heterosexist biases are evidenced throughout the "geriatric industry." In addition to their class and ethnic prejudices, theoreticians, counselors, policy makers, and institutional settings are normally insensitive to people with alternative life-styles and/or marginalized statuses like gay men and lesbians. It is even assumed that aging itself is a leveler of prior social, economic, and sexual differences (Bengston, 1979). Quite miraculously, what was a legal and moral "problem" throughout the life-cycle of same-sexers suddenly becomes an irrelevant consideration when age becomes the master status. This is predictable from an assimilationist perspective since it assumes that everyone is the same or should be the same for the sake of the social order. Individual and/or group differences, then, have to be discarded or minimized. To disguise homogenization as "equality" and to offer it to

people a few years before their death is insensitive and presumptuous.

Minority Americans are allowed to integrate and be accepted in old age because differences supposedly do not really matter any more. Their age and new identities as "seniors" means they can now melt as such into their proper place in the "Anglo-pot." Thus, minority men and women who survive to old age are granted asylum or relief in stylistically Anglo geriatric settings, i.e., impersonal and bureaucratized "nursing homes." Since these institutional settings are efficient, they are the ones preferred by "culturally-Anglo" practitioners. They not only destroy cultural pluralism, independence, and personal freedom (Gottesman and Bourestom, 1974), but they create a bureaucratically defined and managed cooperative clientele. Because of their own false consciousness and lack of options, the elderly become depersonalized and dispensable victims of bureaucratic indifference.

Not unexpectedly, however, wealth and social class do not disappear with age as determinants of social behavior and interaction, survival potential, or adjustment to aging. If the rich do not age like the poor and if aging outcomes vary by ethnic group (Cantor, 1979) and if medical treatment and social services differ by social class, shouldn't we expect sex, sexuality, politics, life-style, etc., to be equally important influences on aging? It is not unreasonable to assume, for example, that women would create more informal and personal responses to aging problems than assimilated, straight, white males (Adelman, 1980). Indeed, it is not unreasonable to acknowledge the validity of "women's world" and/or the reality of a distinctive gay/lesbian "culture." There is a style of being in the world (complete with its own sensibilities) which is recognized as "gay"--if not by outsiders, then certainly by insiders. It is a product of being single, sexual, marginal, relatively affluent and creative. Having been marginalized from dominant societal institutions and operations throughout their life, it is possible that women and gay men have learned something about

survival, self-help, and mutually and freely given cooperation and support which may in fact keep them out of institutional settings or cause conflicts when institutionalization becomes necessary (Kimmel, 1978).

If institutional arrangements are reflections of life experiences, values, and ideological commitments, they are also political manifestations reflecting the assumptions and biases of those who create and manage them. By definition, then, institutional solutions to aging are anti-feminine, anti-gay/lesbian, anti-ethnic, anti-expressive both sexually and affectionally. They do, however, help to solve the aging problem for isolated nuclear families and very specific types of majority individuals. Consequently, we can not assume that people who have been isolated, closeted, and stigmatized (like women and gays) should and/or even can be assimilated into "nursing home culture" as just other Americans after a lifetime spent in sub-cultural social environments.

While it has been the argument of this paper that sexual orientation in itself is not a particularly fruitful category of analysis, it would be unwise to dismiss it completely as irrelevant. Our social system does in fact make an issue of sexual orientation. There are legal, religious, and institutional limitations on "homosexuals" who are generally and popularly understood to be a unique and separate sub-group of Americans. Same-sexers themselves have responded to their marginality and exclusion by creating their own organizations and social networks. Within this "gay world" the stigma of being sexual, single, and homosexually active is minimized. However, since the gay community is institutionally incomplete, it is the rare same-sexer who can live out the whole of life in a gay context. Consequently, problems arise when gays and lesbians are forced to participate in heterosexist socio-cultural environments and institutions.

Indeed, it would be around the issue of institutional support and inclusion that the question of sexual orientation becomes a significant issue.

For example, how would gay and lesbian seniors be incorporated into traditional geriatric settings and institutions? How would their sexuality be accepted and/or manifested? How would the fear of will-contestation by family members or the need to create private and/or secret burial arrangements affect the well-being of the gay/lesbian elderly? Does not the law grant an indifferent and distant extended family more rights to the body of the deceased than it does to lovers and friends?

In addition to having to manage a "morally" unacceptable behavior throughout the life-course (Plummer, 1975:102), same-sexers have to contend with the management of personal, social and institutional limitations on their freedom to live out their lives as they please. If gay men and/or lesbians are placed in a home/hospital, for example, what would it mean or of what benefit would it be to have visits by "family" or clergy? After being ignored by organized religion throughout their productive life-times, what consolation could clergy bring to the gay/lesbian elderly--especially if they are still sexually active? Since the state doesn't recognize homosexual liaisons as valid relationships, how would their "lovers" fit into the nursing home program? Do these partners have visiting and privacy rights? Do they have the right to demand better treatment for their partners? Can they make decisions affecting their health and welfare? Kimmel (1978) suggests that these are some of the real problems and concerns of the gay and lesbian elderly. Given the survival skills of gays and lesbians, however, it is most likely that many of the difficulties of old age could be resolved by and within the collective ingenuity of the community itself.

#### REFERENCES

- Adelman, M. R.  
1980      Adjustment to Aging and Styles of  
            Being Gay: A Study of Elderly Gay Men  
            and Lesbians. Unpublished Ph.D.  
            dissertation: The Wright Institute.

- Allen, C.  
1961 "The Aging Homosexual." In I. Rubin,  
ed., The Third Sex. New York:  
New Book Co.
- Becker, H.  
1967 "Whose Side Are We On." Social  
Problems 14: (Winter).
- Bell, R. R.  
1971 Social Deviance. Homewood,  
Illinois: Dorsey.
- Bengston, V. L.  
1979 "Ethnicity and Aging: Problems  
and Issues in Current Social Science  
Inquiry." Pp. 9-31 in D. E. Gelfand  
and A. Kutzik, eds., Ethnicity and Aging  
Theory, Research, and Policy. New York:  
Springer.
- Blumstein, P. and P. Schwartz  
1983 American Couples. New York:  
William Morrow & Co.
- Clark, M. and B. Anderson  
1967 Culture and Aging. Springfield: Charles  
C. Thomas.
- Cumming, E.  
1963 "Further Thoughts on the Theory of  
Disengagement." International Social  
Science Journal, 15:377-393.
- Francher, S. J. and J. Henkin  
1973 "The Menopausal Queen: Adjustment to  
Aging and the Male Homosexual."  
American Journal of Orthopsychiatry 43,  
# 4:670-674.
- Friedrichs, R.  
1970 A Sociology of Sociology.  
New York: Free Press.

- Gagnon, J. and W. Simon  
 1973        Sexual Conduct: The Social Sources  
              of Human Sexuality. Chicago: Aldine  
              Press.
- Gelfand, D. E. and A. Kutzik, eds.  
 1979        Ethnicity and Aging: Theory, Research,  
              and Policy. New York: Springer.
- Gottesman, L. E. and N. C. Bourestom  
 1974        "Why Nursing Homes Do What They Do."  
              Gerontologist 14:501-506.
- Gouldner, A.  
 1963        "Anti-Minotaur: The Myth of a Value  
              Free Sociology." In M. Steiner and A.  
              Vidich, eds., Sociology on Trial.  
              New York: Prentice-Hall.
- Gubrium, J. G.  
 1976        "Being Single in Old Age."  
              Social Problems 16, # 2:182-193.
- Havighurst, R. J.  
 1968        "Personality and Patterns of Aging."  
              Gerontologist 8:20-23.
- Horton, John  
 1966        "Order and Conflict Theories of Social  
              Problems as Competing Ideologies."  
              American Journal of Sociology 71 (May).
- Kaplan, Lloyd  
 1970        Teacher Trade: Impersonal Sex in Public  
              Places. Chicago: Aldine.
- Kayal, P.  
 1977        "Homophobia in Sociology." Gai Saber 1,  
              # 2:95-98.
- 1976        "Researching Behavior: Sociological  
              Objectivity and Homosexual Analysis."  
              Corrective and Social Psychiatry and  
              Journal of Behavior Technology Methods  
              and Therapy 22, # 2:25-31.

- Kayal, P. and L. San Giovanni  
 1984 "Objectivity in the Sociology of  
 Sexuality: Gays and Lesbians Revisited."  
 Free Inquiry in Creative Sociology.  
 Vol. 12, # 2 (Nov.).
- Kelly, J.  
 1977 "The Aging Male Homosexual: Myth and  
 Reality." Gerontologist 17, # 4:328-332.
- Kimmel, D. C.  
 1978 "Adult Development and Aging: A Gay  
 Perspective." The Journal of Social  
 Issues 34, # 3:113-130.
- Laner, M. R.  
 1978 "Growing Older Male: Heterosexual and  
 Homosexual." The Gerontologist 18,  
 # 5:496-501.
- Levine, Marty  
 1982 "Fearing Fear Itself: AIDS."  
 Gay Men's Health Crisis Newsletter,  
 New York.
- Lobsenz, N. M.  
 1974 "Sex and the Senior Citizen."  
 New York Times Magazine 20 (January).
- McIntosh, M.  
 1968 "The Homosexual Role."  
 Social Problems 16, # 2:182-193.
- Mills, C. W.  
 1940 "Situation Actions and Vocabularies  
 of Motives." American Sociological  
 Review, 5:904-913 (Dec.).
- Minnigerode, F. and M. Adelman  
 1978 "Elderly Homosexual Women and Men:  
 Report on a Pilot Study." The Family  
 Coordinator, October, 451-456.



- Plummer, K.  
 1981      The Making of the Modern Homosexual.  
           Totowa, New Jersey. Barnes and Noble.
- 1975      Sexual Stigma: An Interactionist  
           Account. London/Boston: Routledge and  
           Kegan Paul, Ltd.
- Siegelman, J.  
 1972      "Adjustment of Male Homosexuals and  
           Heterosexuals." Archives of Sexual  
           Behavior 2:9-25.
- Slater, P.  
 1977      Footholds: Understanding the Shifting  
           Sexual and Family Tensions in Our  
           Culture. New York: Dutton.
- 1970      In Pursuit of Loneliness. Boston:  
           Beacon.
- Sontag, S.  
 1972      "The Double Standard of Aging."  
           Saturday Review of the Society 23:29-38  
           (Sept.).
- Stearn, J.  
 1961      The Sixth Man. New York: Doubleday.
- Tripp, C.  
 1971      "Debate: Can Homosexuals Change with  
           Psychotherapy?" Sexual Behavior  
           42:42-49.
- Vidal, G.  
 1981      "SOME Jews and THE Gays." The Nation.  
           Nov. 4th, 489, 509-517.
- Weinberg, M. S. and A. Bell  
 1978      Homosexualities. New York: Simon and  
           Schuster.

Weinberg, M. S. and C. J. Williams

1974

Male Homosexuals: Their Problems and  
Adaptations. New York: Oxford University  
Press.

THE ORIGINS OF THE SERVICE STATE:  
ON THE IRONIES OF INTERVENTION\*

TIMOTHY W. LUKE  
Department of Political Science  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute  
and State University  
Blacksburg, Va.

ABSTRACT

This essay discusses the growth of the interventionist "service state" in the United States since the 1890s. It indicates how the exhaustion of the national entrepreneurial capitalist model necessitated state management of the economy, society and culture in order to consolidate the emergence of a transnational monopoly capitalist mode of economic growth. These bureaucratic interventions, however, from the 1930s through the 1970s dangerously eroded the continuing reproduction of civil society. Hence, the new social movements of the 1960s and 1970s are discussed as popular efforts to countervail the bureaucratic logic of monopoly capital and the service state. The new social movements' focus on popular participation, community-building and political empowerment, in turn, might provide the organizational basis for creating new democratic economic, political and social alternatives to the over-administered consumer society constructed by the service state and transnational capital during the

20th century.

---

A new sense of irony pervades the leading academic, corporate and government circles in the United States as the current debates of the malaise of advances industrial society have unfolded during the present decade. It now appears, somewhat ironically, that the complex bureaucratic tools of corporate and state intervention, which initially were conceived during the Progressive Era, haphazardly constructed under the New Deal, and then, eventually employed after 1945 to manage economic growth and social development, in the last analysis, dangerously have eroded the most basic psychological and social foundations of industrial life. Ultimately, bureaucratic intervention has become a form of cultural subversion whose corrosive impact now manifests itself in profound social psychological crises: the "cultural contradictions of capitalism," the "fall of public man," and the "culture of narcissism" (Bell, 1976; Sennett, 1976; and Lasch, 1978). My purposes here, then are to illustrate briefly how the emergence of managerial capitalism, the formation of the service state, and the development of consumer society has led to these unexpected outcomes in present-day political affairs. And, in turn, I hope to suggest tentatively how the ensuing cultural crises possibly be mitigated.

## I. Managerial Capitalism and the Service State

Over the course of America's rapid

industrialization from the 1860s through the 1890s, farsighted corporate and managerial leaders began to see the promising light of industrial co-operation and corporate regulation gleaming through the cracks of their competitive entrepreneurial practices. Throughout the Gilded Age, as production became more technology-intensive, as distribution increasingly demanded more elaborate managerial structures, and as consumption began to concentrate rapidly in new urban centers, traditional liberal philosophies espousing individual initiative, market competition and free enterprise seemed to point only down dead-end roads. To find a new formula for economic growth beyond classic liberalism, corporate leaders, such as International Harvester's George W. Perkins, increasingly favored market regulation and corporate concentration "because the end of competition would lead to more efficient industrial practices and the production of cheaper and better goods" (Spring, 1972, 8).

Entrepreneurial capitalism's gradual expansion, which began during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, (Wallerstein, 1974) encountered its practical limits in the late 1880s and early 1890s. Until that time, entrepreneurial capital transformed global economic relations by extending its rationalizing influence through trade and conquest into the comparatively pre-rational societies of the Eastern and Southern hemispheres. Yet, as the ink dried on the Treaty of Berlin in 1885 -- formalizing Europe's subdivision of the last unclaimed regions of the pre-capitalist world -- and as Frederick Jackson Turner called attention to the closing of the great North American Frontiers in the mid-1890s, the world economy was shaken severely by a massive

depression in 1893 whose impact forced the shaky entrepreneurial-capitalistic mode of production to change its operational rules.

To effect these operational innovations the more progressive business, industrial, and intellectual elites of America and Europe recognized the necessity of transforming capital from its traditional mode of extensive expansion via entrepreneurial commerce to a more organized mode of production, namely, centralized corporate concentration based upon intensive means of technical rationalization guided by scientific research. Hence, the transitional strategy from entrepreneurial to monopoly capital demanded greater state intervention, produced in the form of regulatory services, in order to coordinate the rational concentration of capital, the technical re-organization of labor, and the central management of social interaction in labor unions, schools, and the family.

Many leaders of the American corporate community recognized that such a transformation could only be worked out in a partnership with the federal government, which was the only political institution with the powers to unite the diverse regions, classes, and industries of the pluralistic American polity into a cooperative whole. The individuals, in turn, organized groups like the National Civic Federation in 1900, to encourage "some form of government regulation which would allow for the continued existence of the new corporate structures" (Spring, 1972, 10) in addition to collaborating with organized labor. During the Progressive Era, such figures as Herbert Croly in The Promise of American Life (1901) and Woodrow Wilson in The New Freedom (1913), both maintained that Yankee industry, modern science, and governmental authority should be used to place "our

businessmen and producers under the stimulation of a constant necessity to be efficient, economic, and enterprising" (Wilson, 1913, 22). Croly maintained that "in becoming responsible for the subordination of the individual to the demand of a dominant and constructive national purpose, the American state will in effect be making itself responsible for a morally and socially desirable distribution of wealth" (Croly, 1909, 23). Similarly, International Harvester's George W. Perkins nominated Washington as the arena to "which our great business problems could go for final adjustment when they could not be settled otherwise" (Spring, 1972, 9). For Perkins and many corporate leaders, the mechanism for coping successfully with the unprecedented demands of stabilizing corporate industrial capitalism "would seem to lie through the medium of co-operation, with federal supervision" (Spring, 1972, 9).

At this juncture, corporate managers and the leadership of the central government laid the foundations for a service state by assuming "that a democratically elected government, together with a business system dominated by private enterprise, can and should work in consonance to achieve certain economic objectives" (Ulmer, 1969, 4). These "objectives" turned out to be jointly defined, but corporate-provided and government-protected "minimum standards of income, nutrition, health, housing, and education, assured to every citizen as a political right" (Wilensky, 1975). Consequently, the historic task of the service state was to create the new collective social services that managerial capitalism required for its continued rational growth and productivity. Since the inception of the service state idea, then, as Alfred D. Chandler, Jr.

observes, "the government's most significant role has been in shaping markets for the goods and services of modern business enterprise" (1977, p. 494).

Beginning slowly with Theodore Roosevelt's and Woodrow Wilson's administrations, and maturing fully under Franklin D. Roosevelt's New Deal, a new state formation gradually was pieced together from: a) executive departments and federal judiciary of the national government; b) the managerial cadres of the new corporate elite; and, c) the corporate design for a society based on the mass consumption of material goods. Roscoe Pound has identified this political formation as a "service state," or a "state which, instead of preserving peace and order and employing itself with maintaining the general security, takes the whole domain of human welfare for its province and would solve all economic and social ills through its administrative activities" (Pound, 1952, 211). There arises with it "the idea that all public services must and can only be performed by the government -- that politically organized society and that alone is to be looked to for everything, and that there is no limit to the services to humanity which it can perform" (Pound, 1952, 212-213). The service state fully embodies "the idea of regimented cooperation for the general welfare;" and, as it develops, it becomes "par Excellence a bureau state. From the very nature of administration, the bureau state calls for a highly organized official hierarchy" (Pound, 1952, 213). Hence, the ultima ratio of the service state regime flows out of its instrumentally rational administration, typically mediated through the large centralized bureaucracy, whose dominant inclination is to foreclose alternative institutional and political options in



order "to organize the entire society in its interest and image" (Marcuse, 1972, 11).

In doing so, the service state openly supports the operations of the corporate economy and society bureaucratically: a) by intervening in industrial production through manipulation of aggregate demand, the money supply, employment levels, the price structure of commodities, or trade conditions to manage the business cycle; b) by stimulating increased technical innovation and scientific research developments to rationalize the technical means of production; c) by providing on a uniform, mass basis new educational, health, welfare, regulatory, commercial and legal services to improve productivity and expand consumption; d) by generating new markets for new public and private goods ranging from suburban housing, interstate highways or advanced weaponry to expanded leisure time, new consumer goods or mass college education; and, e) by encouraging new forms of social individuality based on clientage in providing "helping" social personal and family services.

Still, the service state could not assume this administrative mission in a vacuum. On the contrary, the impetus behind its administration of social relation came through its close collaboration with the managerial structures of corporate capital. In addition to encouraging state intervention and regulation, many corporate groups altered their internal control structures by expanding the organizational roles played by professional engineers and managers vis-a-vis the owner-entrepreneur within the firm. To assure the survival of corporate industrial production, these new corporate leaders gradually separated the functions of "managing" from "owning" and

"planning" from "producing," which took control of corporate capital away from the owners and control of productive skills away from the workers to entrust it to these new professional administrators and technicians.

Therefore, in 1900, General Electric opened the first corporate industrial laboratory in the United States to apply systematically rational scientific investigation to the business of production. By 1913-1914, Henry Ford installed the continuously moving assembly line in his Highland Park plant, which had been made possible, in part, by Taylor's, Fayol's, Gantt's, and Gilbreth's contributions to "scientific management." (1) By separating "planning" from "doing," or theory from practice, skill from activity, and thought from action, Taylorization began to strip the American working classes of their skills. Because of their alleged command over "the art of bringing ends and means together -- the art of purposeful action" (American Institute of Management, 1974, 23) in the daily management of the large industrial firm, These organizational trends legitimized the growing administrative regime of state bureaucrats and corporate managers.

In turn, the classic entrepreneurial capitalist forms of social exchange, personal identity, individual needs, and ethical beliefs slowly have been redefined in the United States to suit the demands of instrumental rationality, namely, corporate capital's economically-efficient, large-scale, high-volume exploitation of material and social resources. Thus, many large, multidivisional industrial firms such as Westinghouse, DuPont, General Motors, Standard Oil, and General Electric, began after World War I to link closely their

productive capacity with their newly-formed innovative (in-house research and development units) and distributive (intra-company and inter-firm advertising, marketing, financial, and service divisions) capacities to not only produce familiar products for existing markets, but to actually create and, then, administer completely new markets for new kinds of goods and services that would satisfy newly-created and corporate-defined individual needs (Ewen, 1976). As Chandler suggests, "After World War I the most important developments in the history of modern business enterprises in the United States did not come from enterprises involved in carrying out a single basic activity such as transportation, communication, marketing, or finance. Nor did they come from firms that only manufactured. They appeared rather in large industrials that integrated production with distribution. . .by moving into new products for new markets" (Chandler, 1977, 472-473).

These corporate goals, however, necessarily assumed the creation of a new kind of social individuality that no longer counterposed the respective interests of individuals and society, but rather integrated them by subordinating the former to the latter. Theodore Roosevelt, as an exponent of progressivism, called for the United States to develop "a system under which each individual citizen shall be organized with his fellows so that can work efficiently together" (Spring, 1972, 13). Only by fitting exactly the specialized tasks to which corporate capital might fit him -- both as a producer and consumer -- could this individual adequately fulfill his new socialization which "consists primarily in the discipline which he undergoes to fit him both for fruitful

association with his fellows and for his own special work" (Spring, 1972, 18).

Yet, with intense specialization in one area, each individual became incapable of dealing with an increasingly complex existence beyond the scope of his own narrow expertise. This trend, in turn, requires the further "stimulation of infantile cravings by advertising, the usurpation of parental authority by the media and the false promise of personal fulfillment" (Lasch, 1978, 43) to accommodate individuals to the new needs being presented in the consumer-based society of managerial capitalism. And "having surrendered most of his technical skills to the corporation, he can no longer provide for his material needs"; thus, this corporate-designed form of social individuality slowly erodes "everyday competence, in one area after another, and has made the individual dependent on the state, the corporation, and the other bureaucracies" (Lasch, 1978, 10-11).

Despite the central government planning experience of WW I and the expansion of corporate diversification in the 1920s, all of these attempts at macroeconomic organization could not forestall, in turn, the economic and political crises of the Great Depression in the 1930s. Of course, the American service state initially resorted to socially repressive legislation such as accepting the organization of corporate "sociology" departments, beginning prohibition, and pursuing the Palmer raids, as a means of disciplining the populace. However, these direct interventions proved inferior to the gradual construction of "consumption communities" (Boorstin, 1973, 89-166). Instead of state bureaucracies overtly repressing the working classes, the workers as consumers were prompted to discipline themselves

strictly in order to satisfy "their" new needs and gain access to Model T's, the suburbs, Woolworth's and the movies. Still, "the creation of these markets necessitated an abolition of the social memories which militated against consumption" (Ewen and Ewen, 1978, 48). In the process, great deal of the social self-reliance, ethnic uniqueness and personal autonomy that was cultivated under entrepreneurial capitalism was eclipsed by the new needs imposed by mass consumption and government regulation. For the self-sufficient individuals who matured beyond the reach of managerial capitalism, the new service state promoted "the consumption of their traditional relationship to nature, the destruction of skills by which that relationship was carried on, and the exhaustion of the social forms of customary life" as the "primary projects of American mass industrialism" (Ewen and Ewen, 1978, 48).

During Wilson's administrations, a number of programs and policies launched the service state's activities in America. The Federal Reserve Act (1913) and the Federal Trade Commission Act (1914) gave the federal executive and its bureaucracies the rudimentary tools to manipulate corporate activity and expansion through the national money supply and commercial codes. The Underwood Tariff Act (1913) and the Federal Farm Loans Act (1916) enabled the central government to open the hitherto restricted American market to crucial new centers of production and consumption around the world and to begin experiments in financing domestic agricultural production. By the same token, the spirited enforcement of the Sherman Anti-Trust Act (1890) and the passage of the Clayton Act (1914) "hastened the growth of big business in the United States" inasmuch as their

interpretation by the court system "provided a powerful pressure that did not exist elsewhere to force family firms to consolidate their operations into a single, centrally-operated enterprise administered by salaried managers," (Chandler, 1977, 499) and, each of these new policies slowly solidified the bonds between managerial capital and the national service state as they "fulfilled the same purpose of bringing private interests into the interior processes of government" (Lowi, 1969).

Moreover, a whole new wave of new debates and legislation arose as part of the Progressives' visions of the "New Freedom". As part of the on-going effort to discipline each individual to more closely integrate him into the administrative regime of large corporate and state bureaucracies, the Nineteenth Amendment (1920) granted women a greater stake in the system through the formal right to vote. Similarly, the Eighteenth Amendment (1919) empowered state bureaucracies with the task of policing the adult population's leisure time activities through prohibition to make them more "responsible" citizens and workers. And, perhaps more importantly, to finance this new regime of bureaucratic administration, the Sixteenth Amendment (1913) was enacted to rationalize the tax system of the central government. But, in so doing, the service state began to severely limit individual choice in that it gradually took "from the people more and more of their personal property and has determined how it should be distributed" (Moley, 1952, 187).

To illustrate, however, the tremendous expansion of state control over social relations that emerged with managerial capitalism, one need only consider the

revolutionary fiscal, labor and social welfare legislation of the New Deal. With the crisis of the 1930s, the political caution and corporate hesitation that had characterized many of the Progressives' modifications of the classical market formulae disappeared under the federal state's bureaucratically contrived plans for a national industrial recovery. As the national income fell by half from 1929 to 1932, corporate leaders became more willing to cooperate especially as the large multidivisional firms -- such as General Motors and General Electric -- saw themselves operating at twenty-five percent capacity in 1932 (Chandler, 1977, 496). As Gardiner C. Means claims, the New Deal was a "complete turning away from the classical model" in a collective search for "policies consistent both with the changed market structure and with a democratic society" (1964, 42). Consequently, the service state redoubled its interventionist efforts to control the intra-class (divisions among corporate groups, industrial sectors and financial circles) and inter-class (clashes between labor and management, agriculture and industry) conflicts that had abetted the coming of the 1930s Depression.

Here, the service state mobilized a familiar solution, namely, the "delegation of state power to monopolistic private organizations" (Wolfe, 1977, 144) largely based in the corporate sector. Its initial, and most important, moves came in overhauling the monetary system and credit structure. Banking reforms, monetary circulation changes and international banking connections were altered mainly under the Banking Act of 1935 to transfer "power over open market policies from New York to Washington" making the credit supply and monetary management "a practical instrument of government" (Means, 1964, 31). At the

same time, federal fiscal management turned to deficit spending as an instrument of stimulating production and market demand.

Simultaneously, a whole series of bureaucratic agencies charged with the task of encouraging administratively the corporate sector's productivity were organized by the state. The industrial codes of the National Recovery Administration, despite its brief term of operation, successfully launched a general economic recovery during Roosevelt's first administration and accustomed many corporate leaders, in spite of their grave reservations, to the state's activist role in the economy. Similarly, a whole series of diverse agencies were founded to stimulate production, provide jobs, give access to services, and regulate economic activity. Here, the Agricultural Administration, the Reconstruction Finance Corporation, the Works Progress Administration, The Tennessee Valley Authority, The Rural Electrification Administration, and the Civil Works Administration all provided a variety of services by means of the federal state recruiting its personnel from and sharing its power with the corporate or private groups most directly affected by its administrative intervention.

The same principles held true for organized labor. Continuing the theme of corporate collaboration, Samuel Gompers maintained that "the trade union movement is labor's constructive contribution to democratic regulation of large scale production" (Spring, 1972, 7). Although many of labor's leaders shared this perspective, most corporate groups continued to oppose organized labor even after it was granted its "Magna Carta" in the Clayton Act during 1914. Before 1933, most American workers basically remained craft-



oriented in their skills, shopfloor society, and labor organization. Partly broken by the scientific management movement and the assembly line system after 1910, the American working classes were still politically resistive and collectively unorganized up to the 1930s. Only one in ten American workers belonged to a union -- mainly craft unions -- and individual workers, as citizens and consumers, were subjected to the repressive policies of prohibition, political harassment of their ethnic society, and a rigid assimilation myth rooted in WASP conformity (Blackman, 1974, 19-25).

Beginning with the NRA and its Section 7A, however, the American labor movement slowly was integrated into the service state regime to assure that labor militancy would not short circuit the national industrial recovery. The principle of federally mediated collective bargaining was established as a firm precedent and gradually acknowledged by business circles. Passage of the Norris-LaGuardia Act, the National Industrial Recovery Act, the National Labor Relations (Wagner) Act, the Public Contracts (Healy) Act, and the Fair Labor Standards (Wage and Hour) Act all contributed to the halting efforts being made towards the rational administration of labor. In keeping with the logic of the service state, the determination of issues central to the individual's identity, independence and dignity such as minimum hours, wage scales, unionization, hiring, firing, disability compensation, personal welfare and contract bargaining all were reduced to regulated routine procedures by the bureaucratic administration of the federal labor bureaus, the large corporations and the national labor unions. What is more, in being promised some limited say over these material concerns, the union mem-

bership sacrificed job control issues, and subsequently "almost never asked to participate in decisions concerning output, pricing, scheduling and resource allocation" (Chandler, 1977, 494) in corporate decision-making.

All of these varied measures, in turn, were further strengthened during World War II as "the mobilization of the war economy brought corporation managers to Washington to carry out one of the most complex pieces of economic planning in history" (Chandler, 1977, 496). The bureaucratic rationality of the service state continued to unfold in the new wartime administrative offices -- the National War Labor Board, the Office of Price Administration, the War Manpower Commission, etc. The relative success of these measures "lessened ideological anxieties about the government's role in stabilizing the economy. Then the fear of postwar recession and consequent return of mass unemployment brought support for legislation to commit the federal government to maintaining full employment and aggregate demand" (Chandler, 1977, 496). Passage of the Employment Act of 1946 and the Labor Management Relations (Taft-Hartley) Act of 1947 reaffirmed the partnership of the service state and managerial capital to direct bureaucratically the internal processes of mass consumer society by maintaining programmed levels of aggregate output, guaranteed employment, predictable consumer demand and bureaucratically mediated labor conflict.

By 1948, one in three workers belonged to a labor union in the United States, and, even in the 1970s one in four workers remains affiliated with these corporate-modelled and state-monitored unions. Thus, by the 1950s, the American service state and managerial capitalism effectively

dismantled many of the old organic forms of community that had evolved under entrepreneurial capitalism. Clearly, packets of "outsiders" hung on in the South, the West, and in the decaying cores of many of the nations largest cities. Still, with the steadily expanding economy, the federal government also stimulated the revolutionary rearrangement of American urban life by subsidizing purposely corporate groups to expand housing construction in the suburbs, to redesign urban transportation around automotive expressway systems, and to provide relatively cheap automotive transportation and fuel in response to both producer and consumer demands. As a result, the traditional forms of organic community and social organization slowly disappeared into these new community structures of consumer society, while the inevitable contradictions between workers and owners, consumers and producers, labor and capital, citizens and the state became managerial problems to be dealt with by the experts of large administrative bureaucracies in both the "public" and "private" sector.

## II. The Strategy Breaks Down

Meanwhile, internal political or social opposition to the service state and managerial capitalism continually was discouraged and repressed. Groups and individuals preferring to define and satisfy their own needs were encouraged through advertising, public education and social pressure to let their needs be defined by state or corporate bureaucracies and, then, satisfied by government-provided social services and corporate-produced goods. The state-employed professional educator was presented as knowing more and better than the parents; government-certified health

and medical workers were billed as more effective and rational than traditional household hygiene; and, store-bought goods were packaged to appear better than home-made products. Also, subsequent waves of government-sponsored red scares, witch hunts, counter-intelligence activities and McCarthyist purges, beginning in the 1900s extending up to the present, stymied most political opposition movements. Consequently, the service state system, instead of recycling the new ideas and practices of its internal opposition as important innovations, oppressed its opponents in order to manage the popular political process.

But, in having so strictly created the administrative conditions for the advanced rationalization of corporate capital, the service state after 1945 as it continued to grow through the Fair Deal, the New Frontier, and the Great Society -- systematically stifled traditional forms of communicative interaction and individual independence. The purposive-rationality of bureaucratic organization become both less purposive and less rational as it eliminated pre-rational forms of social interaction.

How was this possible? At one level, the corporate and state health delivery systems, for example, can train -- in a very purposive-rational fashion -- more doctors, build more hospitals and encourage more office visits to improve national health care and individual life expectancy. Yet, this same system can function only by relieving individuals of their own health and medical care skills. So as the complex health care system comes on line it continues to expand to the point that capital-intensive hospitals and expensively trained doctors are dealing mainly with

ingrown toenails, common colds and minor medical operations. Despite purposively and rationally building a sophisticated health delivery system, the robbing of health and medical skills from individuals by bureaucracies leaves life expectancy and other health indicators steady or declining.

Similarly, under service state administration, state-supported mass education made possible a tremendous expansion of the schooling system that purposively and rationally kept youth in school longer learning increasingly more sophisticated technical and social skills to better integrate their labor power and personality into the consumer society. However, the construction and operation of these educational administrations have led, at the same time, to rampant undiscipline and the failure to transfer skills. A major implication of taking away skills and responsibilities from most workers doing most jobs has been the falling rate of expectations and skills within education. Functional illiteracy begins in elementary school, considerable substantive ignorance is rife among secondary school students and thousands of college graduates are systematically overtrained and underemployed given the needs of the larger society. Again, the bureaucratic administration of education is neither purposive nor rational.

Eventually, many potential bases for social resistance, personal autonomy, or political opposition gradually were buried in the onslaught of mass marketed commodities, mass public education, and collective benefits of social welfare programs. Tradition succumbed to technique; yet, technique could envince such superiority only against and over tradition. Once

rationalized to suit bureaucratic administration, the communicative interactions of historically evolved communities lose their unique purposes and rationality under "purposive-rational" bureaucracies. Once the purposive-rational mode of action was left only to its own bureaucratic devices, as occurred increasingly during the 1960s, it proved neither purposive nor rational either within its own formal operations or in terms of its efficient delivery of services. Limited intervention, ironically, in the process of rationalizing social activity, turned into comprehensive domination. By doing so, it often destroys the very bases of personality, society and community which it sought merely to regulate. Therefore, and equally ironic, one survival tactic of the service state and managerial capital during the present cirses is a move towards revitalizing new forms of social, political and cultural reason to serve as alternative countervailing powers against the instrumental rationality that guides bureaucratic administration.

Seen in this light, the rise of the New Left, the New Right, and other "counter-cultural" forces might be seen as one outcome of limited decisions made within the corporate and state structures to encourage weak oppositional forces in academia, the arts, the press and the electronic media, which might serve as countervailing goal-setting forces against the service state's administrative regime. In a parallel fashion, one might identify the emergence of professional public interest lobbies, such as Ralph Nader's task forces, Barry Commoner's environmental institute, John Gardner's Common Cause organization, Jerry Falwell's Moral Majority, or Howard J. Phillips' Conservative Caucus, (Guinther, 1976; Lanouette, 1978,

88-92) which strive to bureaucratically mobilize interests against the bureaucratic decision-making of large corporations of the federal bureaucracy, as the new form for political opposition of managerial capitalism. Instead of being repressed, these weak oppositional forces are subsidized, lionized, and encouraged to prod the bureaucratic apparatus to perform more efficiently or humanely. (2) But, these counter-bureaucratic forces do not become powerful enough to disrupt or dismantle the apparatus as it currently functions -- as Nader's failure to get a meaningful consumer protection agency established, or Commoner's inability to gain support for an effective energy conservation bill, or Gardner's frustrations at winning a meaningful electoral reform program, or Falwell's difficulties in resurrected "traditional American values" all further illustrate.

In addition to these professional counter-bureaucratic lobbies, new oppositional mechanisms are being built into the service state itself. Beginning with Nixon's slow sabotage of various Great Society programs and continuing under Reagan's supply-side revolution, a new form of federalism has been developing, which seeks to halt the continuing subordination of state and local governments to central decision-makers. Instead of a single welfare state system operating from Washington, the instruments of revenue sharing, block grants, and community action programs are giving state and local decision-makers back some of the administrative discretion appropriated by the federal bureaucracy since the New Deal. Hence, the welfare state idea has been injected into cities, counties, and states as they too set up their own welfare divisions, community development agencies, and economic inter-

vention bureaus. In doing so, these multiple centers of power and decision-making are checking, countering, and countervailing the organizational dictates of the federal administrative regime.

Similarly, Congress has counterattacked against the Presidency in the early 1970s to contain its "imperial" authority. Most importantly, the Senate Watergate investigations and the House impeachment committees finally challenged the overwhelming power of the President and ended an executive regime that sought to undermine the very democratic structures which made its rule possible. The War Powers Act of 1973, the Budget Act of 1974, and the extensive expansion of the Congressional staff after 1974 all were significant new constraints on the President's ability to make war, to dispose of arbitrarily legally appropriated monies, and to unjustly manipulate information. These important legal developments, in turn are not simply fortuitous reactions to the Watergate affair. Rather they amount to a systematic attempt to revitalize the constitutional contradictions and political conflicts between the executive and legislative branches to keep the federal government more manageable, responsive, and controlled. And, as a result, these newly engendered negative forces have kept three Presidents -- Ford, Carter and Reagan -- well within the weakened scope of the post-imperial Presidency. (3)

A variety of internal reforms have developed to correct other excesses of the service state. A number of bureaucratic insurgency tactics ranging from whistleblowing to public employee unionization to information leaks as well as a series of new anti-bureaucratic legislation, such as sunshine laws, sunset provisions, and zero-



based budgeting policies, have begun to make bureaucratic decision-making more accountable and responsible as the aura of total power and total knowledge are pulled away from bureaucratic practices. Similarly, the service state is encouraging increased citizen participation as part of its standard operating procedures. Under Carter, these practices were fostered as exercises in democratic participatory management, while Reagan has recast them as advances for personal initiative, state's rights and Yankee self-reliance.

To rebuild older cities or to reform the welfare system, the service state is favoring municipal action over federal action, neighborhood action over municipal action, and individual decisions over state decisions. Thus, the revitalization of personal decision-making, as a source of opposition in the consumer society, gradually is being built into the bureaucracy in the form of professional community organizers, citizen committees, community liaison offices, and public hearings to improve the bureaucratic delivery system. Yet, the common thread uniting all of these developments remains their attempt to derail the purposive-rational uniformity of the service state in favor of their self-defined choices and community. These efforts, moreover, emanate from within the bureaucratic administration of the service state, but are directed against the increasing irrationalities of its administrative activity.

### III. Beyond the Service State

As the economic, political and social crises of the late 1960s and early 1970s have illustrated, the state and the corporate social formations have confronted

challenges that their purposive-rational logic no longer seems capable of successfully managing. That is, the current alliance of the service state and managerial capital is gripped by a "rationality crisis" which, in turn, entails an equally threatening "legitimacy crisis." Once the pre-rational communicative interaction of the larger society was submitted to the rational imperatives of purposive-rational management, the instruments of social administration lose their original purpose. Having gone beyond mere intervention in the on-going historical process of economic exchange and social relations, the bureaucratic administration of managerial capitalism and the service state became forms of complete domination. But, in doing so, it destroyed the very forms of organic community and individual autonomy that prompted such administrative intervention.

Consequently, communicative interaction and emancipatory development, which rational administration was to have assisted and advanced, became frozen unnaturally in the purposive-rational control of corporate and state bureaucracies. Furthermore, these breaks in technical control have led to a legitimacy crisis. The service state's essential mechanism of legitimation lies in its administrative effectiveness at providing the collective social "goods" of political stability, economic growth, mass consumption of consumer goods and social welfare services. But, as the service state's "rationality crisis" disrupts its purposive-rational management of the economy, polity, and society, the administrative effectiveness at delivering the system's own self-defined social "goods" is weakened substantially, which severely shakes its "legitimacy" and rational purposes. (4)

Counteracting the ironies of intervention under these conditions, however, means more than simply reconstituting critical intellectual analysis and debate. The essential need for individual participation necessarily demands the re-politicization and renewed education of every individual to cultivate and use his personal choices, political skills, and individual discipline. Here, the activist must do more than merely define and criticize the mass de-politicization of the service state. Instead, the theoretically-informed politicization for free individuals in the organic communities of the family, neighborhood, or urban locality must help individuals escape from the naturalized social behaviors of personal commodity consumption, political apathy, and the passive acceptance of bureaucratic policies and mass culture to create new communities of competence (Luke, 1981).

Political activists and social theorists must elaborate new political forms for realizing a social individuality -- rooted in the organic community of the neighborhood, the family, or the city -- instead of a commodified consumerist personality; for personal political autonomy -- based upon renewed popular interaction and displacement of bureaucratic rule by reviewing individual skills for popular participation -- instead of passive political clientage; and, for individual social judgment -- grounded in the substantive rationality of organic community -- instead of the technical policy sciences of the service state's administration. Such a psychological renaissance, clearly, will demand the rapid revitalization of these autonomous public and private spheres given their past fragmentation by the service state. Nevertheless, these fresh

political spaces seem to be opening with new social movements: the voluntary simplicity movement, radical feminism, the black consciousness movement, alternative technology groups, the new ethnicity, and the ecology movement. These groups, in turn, could serve as the institutional foundations for renewing personally initiated and collectively conciliated communicative interaction.

By imparting skills and values for individual self-definition, self-constitution, and self-determination as a free individual interacting in a collectively constituted public sphere, these new social movements might be guided toward redeveloping personal autonomy. By critically reassessing politics in this fashion, the frozen social relations of consumer society -- the bureaucratic objectification of human behavior, the internalization of personal domination, and the justification of human dependence by reducing social relations to a technocratic elite's "authoritative allocation of values" -- can be attacked to regenerate individual choice and autonomy. At the same time, the passive life of administered commodity consumption must be demonstrated decisively to be degrading, dehumanizing, and inferior to the active praxis of communal creation promised by the participatory alternatives to the service state. (5)

### References Cited

\*Excerpts from this essay initially appeared in Telos 35 (Spring, 1978) and New Political Science 8 (1982).

1. For a well-argued historical treatment of scientific management of labor and

production see Bravermann (1974); Giedion (1948); and Noble (1977).

2. Indeed, these oppositional forces have begun to form entire alternative policy programs. In addition, such institutions as the Brookings Institution, the American Enterprise Institute, the Institute for Policy Studies or World Watch provide systematic policy critiques in their research and publications. Lanouette, (1978, 296-303).
3. Carter's Federal Personnel Management Project continued this de-centralizing tendency. By using a personal incentive system to increase the efficiency of the administrative apparatus and to improve the delivery of state services, Carter sought to abolish the hierarchical command relations of the New Deal bureaucracy. And, Carter was more intent upon reconstituting the apparatus than any of his recent precursors -- Johnson, Nixon, Ford -- who also had many of the same ideas. Still, as Reagan also has learned, it is difficult to administratively deprogram the administrative programmers.
4. See Alvin Gouldner, (1976, 195-273); and, O'Connor (1973).
5. This critical debate already has begun; see Brown (1973); Jacoby, (1975); Lefebvre, (1971); Leiss, (1976); Mueller (1973); and Sennett and Cobb (1972).

#### REFERENCES

American Institute of Management

- 1974 "What is Management." In Patrick E. Conner (ed.) Dimensions in Modern Management. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Bell, Daniel  
1976 The Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism. New York: Basic Books.
- Blackman, Jules  
1974 "Emerging Trends." In Jules Blackman (ed.) Labor, Technology and Productivity in the Seventies. New York: New York University Press.
- Boorstin, Daniel J.  
1973 The Americans: The Democratic Experience. New York: Vintage.
- Braverman, Harry  
1974 Labor and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Brown, Bruce  
1973 Marx, Freud and the Critique of Everyday Life. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Chandler, Alfred D., Jr.  
1977 The Visible Hand: The Managerial Revolution in American Business. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.
- Croly, Herbert  
1909 The Promise of American Life. New York: MacMillan.
- Ewen, Stuart  
1976 Captains of Consciousness: Advertising and the Social Roots

of Consumer Culture. New York:  
McGraw-Hill.

\_\_\_\_\_ and Elizabeth Ewen  
1978 "Americanization and Consump-  
tion." Telos 37:42-51.

Giedion, Siegfried  
1948 Mechanization Takes Command.  
Fairlawn, NJ.: W. W. Norton and  
Co.

Gouldner, Alvin  
1976 The Dialectic of Ideology and  
Technology. New York: Seabury.

Guinther, John  
1976 Moralists and Managers: Public  
Interests Movements in America.  
New York: Anchor Doubleday.

Jacoby, Russell  
1975 Social Amnesia: A Critique of  
Contemporary Psychology from  
Adler to Laing. Boston: Beacon  
Press.

Lanouette, William J.  
1978 "New Right Seeks Conservative  
Consensus." National Journal  
10:88-92.

Lasch, Christopher  
1978 The Culture of Narcissism. New  
York: W. W. Norton and Co.

Lefebvre, Henri  
1971 Everyday Life in the Modern  
World. New York: Harper and  
Row.

Leiss, William  
1976 The Limits to Satisfaction: An  
Essay on the Problem of Needs  
and Commodities. Toronto: Uni-

versity of Toronto Press.

Lowi, Theodore J.

1969 The End of Liberalism. New  
York: W. W. Norton and Co..

Luke, Timothy W.

1981 "Regulating the Haven in the  
Heartless World: The Same and  
Family Under Advanced Capital-  
ism". New Political Science.  
7:51-74.

Marcuse, Herbert

1972 Counter-Revolution and Revolt.  
Boston: Beacon Press.

Means, Gardiner C.

1964 The Corporate Revolution in  
America. New York: Crowell-  
Collier Press.

Moley, Raymond

1952 "What Liberties Are We Losing?"  
In Sheldon Glueck (ed.) The  
Welfare State and National  
Welfare. Cambridge, Mass:  
Addison-Wesley Press.

Mueller, Claus

1973 The Politics of Communication:  
A Study in the Political  
Sociology of Language, Social-  
ization, and Legitimation.  
London: Oxford University  
Press.

Noble, David

1977 America by Design: Science,  
Technology and the Rise of  
Corporate Capitalism. New York:  
Knopf.

O'Connor, James

1973 The Fiscal Crisis of the State.



~~New York: Mac~~. Martin's.

Pound, Roscoe

- 1952 "The Rise of the Service State and Its Consequences." In Sheldon Glueck (ed.) The Welfare State and National Welfare. Cambridge, Mass: Addison-Wesley Press.

Sennet, Richard

- 1976 The Fall of Public Man: On the Social Psychology of Capitalism. New York: Vintage.

\_\_\_\_\_ and Jonathan Cobb

- 1972 The Hidden Injuries of Class. New York: Vintage.

Spring, Joel

- 1972 Education and the Rise of the Corporate State. Boston: Beacon Press.

Ulmer, Melville J.

- 1969 The Welfare State: USA. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Wallerstein, Immanuel

- 1974 The Modern World System. New York: Academic Press.

Wilensky, Harold L.

- 1975 The Welfare State and Equality. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Wilson, Woodrow

- 1913 The New Freedom. New York: Doubleday.

Wolfe, Alan

- 1977 The Limits of Legitimacy: Political Contradictions of Contemporary Capitalism. New York: Free Press.

## THE WELFARE CRISIS OF CENTRAL AMERICA

DAVID STOESZ, D.S.W  
Hood College

### ABSTRACT

The crisis of Central America, fundamentally due to social injustice, is exacerbated as the Reagan administration seeks a "military solution" to political problems of the region. A humane approach to alleviating the devastating poverty of Central America necessitates reconciling two strategies of national development: a techno-economic strategy and a socio-political strategy. Both strategies leave important issues unresolved. The prospect of improving conditions for the people of Central America diminishes as the region is increasingly militarized.

### INTRODUCTION

With the ascendance of a leftist junta in Nicaragua, the protraction of a relentless civil war in El Salvador, and the progressive destabilization of other Central American governments (Neirer, 1983: 35-45), the United States faces a crisis in Latin foreign relations not seen since the Cuban Revolution. The conservative interpretation of these events is that they represent a threat to the security of the United States. As former Secretary of State,

Alexander Haig has characterized these developments,

What is at stake is the radicalization of the Western Hemisphere by foreign powers and by interests that are being manipulated from Moscow through Cuba. Now we face the prospect of having the first Central American totalitarian Marxist regime in Nicaragua and the threat of its expansion into El Salvador, Honduras, Guatemala, and Colombia (1981: 34).

Before becoming chief United States delegate to the United Nations, Jeane Kirkpatrick suggested that the United States offer "money, arms, logistical supplies, and the services of counter-insurgency experts" to frail governments threatened by "the unfamiliar guerrilla violence of revolutionaries linked to Cuba by ideology, training and the need for support, and through Cuba to the Soviet Union: (1981: 34). In search of a "military solution" to the Central American conundrum, the Reagan administration has proposed increasing "security aid" to El Salvador, Honduras, and Guatemala from \$216.8 million for FY 1983 to \$335 million for FY 1984 (Knickerbocker, 1983: 1).

Efforts to forge a military solution have eclipsed those to negotiate a "political solution," a strategy most clearly articulated by the Carter administration. That administration's human rights policy focused on the poor socio-economic conditions of the indigenous populations and government oppression of intellectuals that would speak on their behalf. According to this analysis, Latin difficulties

stem from decades of repression in a social structure in which a small

number of families, protected by a succession of military governments, have controlled the vast bulk of the nation's land and wealth, paying a pittance to peasant workers who have little or no voice in determining their own fates (Meislin, 1983: 54).

Such conditions contribute to violence by excluding the disadvantaged from the political and economic process. Accordingly, liberals argue for reforms, commonly through elections and land reform, to ameliorate social and economic injustice. During the Carter administration, Latin governments unwilling to cooperate by introducing reforms were reprimanded, an important component of the human rights policy.

This transition in the position of the United States position toward Central America has dramatically worsened the already marginal condition of the indigenous populations there. Foreign policy preoccupied with the security of the United States has effectively contributed to an escalation in the number of refugees leaving their native countries. By late 1982, the State Department estimated that between 100,000 and 135,000 refugees had sought haven in another Central American nation, and that between 250,000 and 500,000 Central Americans had entered the United States illegally. These figures do not include the hundreds of thousands who have been forced to resettle within their native country (Riding, 1983: 12). "Over 100,000 have lost their lives in three small and ill-fated countries of Central America: Nicaragua, El Salvador, and Guatemala," wrote Nobel prize author Gabriel Garcia Marquez. "If this had happened in the United States, the corresponding figures would be that of

1,600,000 violent deaths in four years" (1983: 17). Most profoundly, United States foreign policy has been detrimental to the social welfare of millions of Central Americans. By interpreting the instability of Central America as a security issue, rather than a welfare issue, the Reagan administration has pushed the entire region close to the abyss.

The problem of Central America is fundamentally one of national development. As a problem in nation-building the region presents issues that are more complex than simplistic saber-rattling. The purpose of this work is to elaborate some of these issues in the hope that a more informed, and humane, foreign policy may be developed.

#### THE SOLITUDE OF CENTRAL AMERICA (1)

A basic education in the social reality of Central America is provided by descriptive statistics on nations of the region. Typically, the per capita GNP is less than \$1,000; as it is for El Salvador (\$660), Colombia (\$850), and Guatemala (\$910). Yet, economic indicators only tell part of the story. Of these three countries, only Colombia provides enough nutrition for its people. The per capita daily calorie supply as a percent of requirements is 102 for Colombia, 98 for Guatemala, and only 90 for El Salvador (Nossiter, 1980:E3). Yet, even Colombia, well-fed by Central American standards, loses 30,000 children each year to malnutrition (Zeitlin, 1972:13-14).

The great majority of Colombians, whether in rural or urban areas suffer from hunger and malnutrition, and the

pain of infectious diseases. Dysentery is endemic throughout the country, as is anemia, scurvy, pellagra, intestinal parasitism, and other sickness . . . The poor suffer from nearly universal protein deficiency . . . The average life expectancy at birth for the population as a whole is only forty-six years, and is therefore, even less among the most exploited (Blutstein, 1977:105).

In an important analysis of infant mortality, the Pan American Health Organization concluded that malnutrition contributed to 34 percent of infant deaths in Latin America. When deaths related to malnutrition of the mother was included, "well over half" of infant deaths were associated with malnutrition (Newland, 1981:20). When lack of education is introduced into the analysis, Kathy Newland of the Worldwatch Institute, has shown that the infant mortality rate skyrockets.

Child's Probability of Dying Before  
Age Two According to Education,  
Selected Central American Countries,  
1966-70 (2)

<u>Country</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>None</u>	<u>1-3</u>	<u>4-6</u>	<u>7-9</u>	<u>10+</u>
(deaths per thousand live births)						
Colombia	88	126	95	63	42	32
El Salvador	145	158	142	111	58	30
Guatemala	149	169	135	85	58	44

It is the interaction of variables -- poverty, sickness, and ignorance -- and their affect on the vitality of a people over generations that has led Garcia Marquez to write of the solitude of Latin

America, a region whose people traditionally have had but one choice -- resignation to their squallor.

### TECHNO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 3

The initial approach to problems that were beyond the capacity of any one country to solve was to provide foreign aid for the purpose of industrialization. Once an industrial foundation was established, this sector could be taxed in order to provide for the social needs of at-risk populations. Since this strategy was based on infusions of technology and capital into developing nations, it could be called "techno-economic development".

The techno-economic developmental approach suggests that social welfare expands commensurate with industrialization. As Robert Heilbroner has stated, "the economics of development is essentially the economics of capital accumulation" (1963:118). Ideally, capital is formed by exporting raw materials in exchange for technologies allowing the development of a sound industrial sector, which, in turn, provide an adequate tax base for supporting social welfare programs. Necessarily, social welfare programs begin in metropolitan areas containing modern industries. It is assumed that social welfare programs will not reach rural populations until agriculture is modernized, or until the peasants migrate to the cities. The scarcity of resources justifies the restriction of social welfare programs to industrial rather than rural settings. Once industrialization occurs and social welfare programs serve most of the population, the welfare state would be altered through the democratic political process. Proponents of this approach caution that the prolonged transition from

agricultural society to industrial nation-state requires a centralized government authority for planning and national security. The latter is particularly important because of the need to create a stable economy which appeals to investors, at the same time controlling dissident populations who seek immediate benefits. At times political instability so jeopardizes economic development that civilian government succumbs to military rule. Yet, the subordination of the democratic political process to the imperatives of economic development is defended on the grounds that it is a temporary measure.

An example of techno-economic development can be found in Colombia, which modeled its welfare state after the United States. In 1946 the Colombian Social Security Institute was created to provide Health insurance, maternity benefits, family assistance, and disability and old-age pensions to private sector workers in five major metropolitan areas. A separate Office of Social Security provides similar benefits to public employees. In both cases, contributions of the worker, the employer, and the government finance the benefits. These social insurance programs are targeted for industrialized areas where participation is compulsory (Acosta, 1976:228-229). However, agriculture, domestic and temporary workers receive few benefits (Blutstein:195). Even for those entitled, benefits are meager. In 1973, the typical social security payment per child was \$1.61 per month.

In 1968, an Institute for Family Welfare was created to protect children and preserve family stability. By the mid-1970s, this institute administered day care services for 13,500 children of the 5 million children needing day care. The



Institute could provide family planning services to only 20,000 families. Protective services could care for only one out of every seven abandoned children (Acosta:232-234). Like social security benefits, most family services cover metropolitan populations. Many of these programs were financed by the Alliance for Progress, 1960-1974, during which Colombia received \$1.5 billion from the United States. Alliance for Progress programs attempted to reform the agrarian sector, increase the tax base, assist small farmers, reduce illiteracy, and improve health care. By the mid 1970s, aid from the United States was curtailed when few of the Alliance for Progress objectives had been met (Blutstein:207,320-322).

The most recent illustration of the techno-economic development strategy is the Caribbean Basin Initiative, proposed by President Reagan early in 1982. As initially conceived the policy consisted of six elements: (1) exports from the Basin would receive duty-free treatment for twelve years, (2) significant tax incentives would be provided for businesses willing to invest in the area, (3) a \$350 million appropriation for Basins economically hard-hit, (4) provision of "technical assistance and training to assist the private sector" in the Basin countries, (5) coordination of efforts involving Mexico, Canada and Venezuela, and (6) special measures to aid Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin Islands (1982:A12). By 1983, the administration sought an appropriation of \$461 million for the Caribbean Basin Initiative for FY 1984 (Weinraub, 1983:D1).

Techno-economic developmental theory assumes moderated social change through political pluralism under conditions of economic stability and security maintained

by the central government. If benefits and services are inadequate, it is assumed that more resources and technology are necessary, but not that the social structure is at fault. Writing of social welfare in the Third World, S. K. Khinduka has called this developmental approach "a philosophy of gradualism, of modernization without tears. The plea to go slow and to eschew violence to tradition is in essence a plea to uphold the status quo," he observed prophetically. "What the Third World needs most is rapid and radical change in its social structure" (1971:65).

### SOCIO-POLITICAL DEVELOPMENT

The inability of nations to provide for the basic needs of the majority of their population, despite funds from the Alliance for Progress, prompted a critique of the dependence on industrialized capitalist nations, particularly the United States. Dissatisfaction with the primacy of technoeconomic considerations in accelerating development emerged gradually. The generosity of the United States' Alliance for Progress became suspect in light of the fact that almost all of the monies consisted of loans (Blutstein:321), the debt service for which soon began to consume, in the case of Colombia, a fifth or more of the nation's total foreign exchange earnings (Zeitlin:p.31). The teachings of the Brazilian, Paulo Freire, raised profound questions about the influence of development on the masses in Latin America.

It is essential not confuse modernization with development. The former, although it may affect certain groups in the "satellite society," is almost always induced; and it is the

metropolitan society which derives the true benefits therefrom. A society which is merely modernized without developing will continue--even if it takes over some minimal delegated powers of decision--to depend on the outside country (1970:160).

By the 1970s this critique had grown into an intellectual movement in Latin America, leading an analyst from the conservative Hoover Institution to despair that

dependency explanations, which place most of the blame for Latin America's backwardness on U. S. economic interests are no longer confined to academic sanctuaries; they are now the common currency of a growing body of generals, bishops, editors, chiefs of state, even Latin American businessmen (Falcoff, 1980:797).

A bench mark in the evolution of dependency theory is the life of Camilo Torres. A Colombian, Torres received his clerical education in Belgium where he learned that the church can be a socially relevant institution. After his return to Colombia in 1958, he co-founded the sociology Department of the National University of Bogota. In 1965, Torres left the University and the priesthood to join the guerrilla movement, explaining that armed insurrection was a valid method of social change.

The Revolution is the means of obtaining a government that will feed the hungry, clothe the naked, teach the uneducated, perform works of charity, love their neighbors not only in a transitory and occasional way, not just a few but the majority of

their neighbors. For this reason the Revolution is not only permissible but obligatory for Christians who see in it the one effective and complete way to create love for all (Zeitlin: p. 31).

Torres' death in a skirmish with an army patrol galvanized Latin religious leaders to press for structural change (Levine, 1980:26-27).

In 1968, the second General conference of Latin American Bishops was held in Medellin, Colombia, where radicalized clergy argued that overt political activity is legitimate religious activity. They called for a Theology of Liberation to rectify the abuses of an increasingly unjust society. Liberation theology combined Christian morality with Marxism by redefining sin as not a result of personal failure but of "entire social systems whose injustice, oppression, and institutionalized violence . . . imposed social conditions which made a fully moral and decent life impossible" (Levine:24).

Following the lead established by proponents of Liberation Theology, social scientists (Fals-Borda, 1980) and social workers have begun to formulate a normative theory of social change from the critique of techno-economic development provided by dependency theory. The focus of this emerging socio-political developmental strategy is on organizing indigenous populations around self-help programs promoting literacy, health, and productivity, while politically challenging the social structure. Josefina Acosta, Director of Social Work at the National University in Bogota, has applied the tenets of social development theory to social welfare; the result is an emphasis on structural social

change. "For centuries Latin America has been exploited," Acosta contends. "The rich do not have the will to improve the condition of the poor, so the poor have to fight. The only way is to change the social order -- the social structure" (Acosta:1980).

Acosta and here associates assert that techno-economic development functions to keep Central American and other Third World nations in a permanent state of backwardness. According to them, techno-economic developmental theory functions as an ideology that justifies the exploitive practices of oligarchical elites which are dependent on foreign corporations. With the aid of the oligarchy, foreign corporations can take advantage of low wages so that profits usually go to the United States. According to Theotonio dos Santos, "the dominant countries have a technological, commercial, capital resource, and social-political predominance over the dependent countries . . . This permits them to impose conditions of exploitation and to extract part of the domestically produced surplus" (1972:31). This collusion between profiteering corporations and the national oligarchies, claim critics of techno-economic development, make Central American nations "de facto colonies" of industrialized capitalist nations (Johnson:73).

The solution to the problem of dependency, as a consequence of techno-economic development, has been to recast the concept of development entirely, emphasizing socio-political development. Social welfare experts in Latin America reconceptualized social change and anchored it to the social reality of the oppressed masses (Alonso, 1971:31). Notable contributions were made by Rosa Perla Resnick who, following Freire's concept of

"conscientization," suggested that social welfare be "indigenized" so that, "social work would serve as a tool for liberation, for Social development and for social change." (4) Idealism notwithstanding, social workers who accept social development face a quandry because the theory requires action outside of, or against, the social structure. Subversive activity has gained currency as a viable strategy, with some social workers becoming involved in "guerrilla welfare," the provision of necessary goods and services to neglected populations by political insurgents. Explains Acosta, "some social workers have joined the guerrillas, as have some doctors and lawyers. We, as social workers, have to take more radical positions than the traditional political parties. Reality dictates that" (1980).

Proponents of socio-political development characterize life in the Third World as a caldron of violence -- the everyday suffering of the masses interrupted only by incidents of police repression when the poor become politically active. As Bodenheimer observes, the socio-political developmental model "is inherently a conflict model on both the international and domestic levels" (Bodenheimer, p. 39). This theory derives its premise from marxian economics which states the necessity of mature capitalist economies to obtain inexpensive labor and raw materials through a variety of imperialistic tactics (Magdoff:1969). The pervasive social problems of Third World nations, then are correctly attributed to the influence of foreign capital and the intermediary function of a small oligarchical class. A culture of dependence is deliberately maintained because it allows these wealthy "clientele social classes" (Bodenheimer, 34-39) to amass sizeable fortunes while

convincing the impoverished masses of the gradual nature of progress. Government is seen as a legitimizing device at the disposal of the oligarchical elite. Governmental social welfare programs are symbolic gestures to appease the masses; of necessity social welfare benefits are meager and cover only that part of the population which is economically most important. The conspicuous display of military force in all aspects of daily life is a constant reminder of governmental domination. Socio-political developmental theorists use overtly political strategies in their practices, encouraging peasants to inherit not the earth, but the government. Their ultimate objective is the creation of a society where economic democracy and political democracy are joined to make social welfare institutions characteristic of the capitalistic welfare state unnecessary.

#### UNRESOLVED ISSUES

The debate over which of these strategies of national development is best has generated several issues. It is probably the willingness of a party to consider these seriously that is the best antidote for jingoistic policies.

(1) A primary question is whether or not economic loans to Central American nations can be expected to stimulate development. In an empirical analysis of economic assistance to less-developed countries (LDCs), Ehsan Hikbakht concluded that, "capital in the form of external loans has not played its expected role as the 'engine of growth' in the case of borrowing LDCs in the period of 1963 to 1979" (1982:194). The recent Mexican economic crisis suggests that borrowing of

capital can be disruptive to a developing economy.

(2) A related question is whether or not economic assistance from non-capitalistic nations is less dependency inducing than has been alleged about the United States. In 1980, for example, the largest recipient of Soviet foreign aid was Cuba, in an amount "equivalent to about 25 percent of the country's gross domestic product" (N.Y. Times:1983,7). Economic assistance of this magnitude suggest dependency.

(3) If the conventional understanding of development presupposes external aid, raising the risk of dependency, is an alternative paradigm conceivable? The alternative of forgoing industrialization in favor of a less technologically sophisticated, materialistic, and consumption-oriented economy could be a solution to the problem (Stokes:1981). However, advocates of more modest development have difficulty identifying a nation in which a.) the imperialistic tendencies of international capitalism and communism have not distorted the political process, or b.) materialism and technological dependence that accompany industrialism have not deformed the popular culture. "modernization," Peter Berger observes, "operates like a gigantic steel hammer, smashing both traditional institutions and traditional structures of meaning" (Berger:23).

(4) Should LDCs, including Central American nations, agree on a more relevant agenda for development, could the industrialized nations engage in a meaningful dialogue with them? The movement by non-aligned, less industrialized nations, is such an initiative, often referred to as the "North-South dialogue." The Cancun



Summit, however, revealed an unwillingness by industrialized nations, most particularly the United States, to consider significant alterations in the present concentrations of capital and technology (Gardner, 1981:E21). As yet this movement has not produced a replicable model of national development which suits the conditions of the Third World.

(5) Regardless of developmental strategy, is massive violence an expectable consequence of social change efforts? In various Third World nations advocates of structural reform have been decimated. Examples such as the recent nullification of democratic elections by the Bolivian military (Hoge, 1980:E5), the thousands of people who have "disappeared" under the military dictatorship ruling Argentina (Hoeffel:1979), emergence of right-wing murder squads in Guatemala (Riding, 1981:E3), and the murders of four missionaries and two land reform consultants from the United States in El Salvador, suggest that social agitation is extremely hazardous during the struggle to create a just society. One study of Latin Clerics documented the cases of "36 priests killed, 46 tortured, 245 exiled or expelled, and 485 arrested or imprisoned during 1968-1978 (DeYoung, 1981:26-36, 45-48). Casualties among the indigenous population are often under-reported, if they are reported at all.

Answers to these questions in relation to the major orientations for national development -- techno-economic and socio-political -- are apt to result in a more informed and sophisticated appreciation of problems present in Central America.

## CONCLUSION

The problems of Central America are fundamentally problems of social welfare. The intransigence of the current administration in describing the issue as one of national security increases the likelihood of escalating already intolerable levels of violence. As justification for seeking a \$110 million increase in military aid for El Salvador, President Reagan offered this explanation:

The problem is that an aggressive minority has thrown in its lot with the communists, looking to the Soviets and their Cuban henchmen to help them pursue political change through violence. Nicaragua has become their base. These extremists make no secret of their goal. They preach the doctrine of "revolution without frontiers" (1983:A13).

Such statements reflect an inability to grapple with discrete problems of the nations of Central America. In so doing the administration is effectively regionalizing the conflict. Further, the already limited capacity for civilian authorities to solve domestic problems is being sabotaged. These developments increase the likelihood of repeating the mass executions that have periodically ravaged Central America. During a three day period in January 1932, for example, the army of El Salvador murdered 15,000 to 20,000 campesinos, after some of them advocated agrarian reform (White, 1973:100-101). More recently, between 100,000 and 300,000 deaths resulted during rural strife, La violencia, in Colombia during the late 1940s and 1950s (Blutstein:3).

An alternative to this is to develop a foreign policy vis-a-vis the social welfare

needs of Central America in order to fashion a social reality for its people founded on principles of social justice. This necessity has been stated elegantly by Carlos Fuentes, a Mexican novelist and diplomat.

The basic dilemma of our nations, far beyond ideological nit-picking and strategic posturing, is this demand that we choose: between, the respect due to a man's hands, a woman's sex or a child's eyes; or barbarism and the brutality that humiliates, tortures and then murders us all (1981:C.).

#### NOTES

The author expresses appreciation to Josefina Acosta of the National University in Bogota and Rosa Perla Resnick of Hunter College for their assistance in preparing this manuscript.

(1) For an impressionistic account of the social reality of Latin America, see Marquez' classic, One Hundred Years of Solitude (New York: Avon, 1971).

(2) Kathleen Newland, Infant Mortality and the Health of Societies (1981:28). By contrast, the infant mortality rate for the U.S. is 13 deaths per thousand live births.

(3) The terms techno-economic development socio-political development are equivalent to Peter Berger's dichotomy of modernization theory and revolutionary theory, respectively (see esp. Peter Berger, Pyramids of Sacrifice (Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor Books, 1974,) Ch. I.). In an earlier article Susanne Bodenheimer dis-

tinguishes between a developmental model and a dependency model (Susanne Bodenheimer, The Ideology of Developmentalism (Beverly Hills, Calif.: SAGE, 1971). Bodenheimer's thesis that the developmental model induces dependency is followed in this paper. However, what she labels as a dependency model, I have elected to call a socio-political developmental theory to be consistent with conventional usage in the social welfare literature. Socio-political developmental theory is a logical consequence of applying the dependency model to techno-economic developmental theory.

(4) Rosa Perla Resnick, "The Indigenization of Social Work Around the World: The Reconceptualization Movement in Latin America," a paper presented at the 22nd Annual Program Meeting of the Council on Social Work Education, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, February 1976, p. 8. See also, Rosa Perla Resnick, "Conscientization: An Indigenous Approach to International Social Work," International Social Work 19 (1976): 21-29; and Rosa Perla Resnick, "Social Work Education in Latin American and the United States: A Look at the Future," Journal of Education for Social Work 16 (1980).

#### REFERENCES

- Acosta, Josefina  
 1976 "Colombian Elites and the Underdevelopment of the Social Welfare System" in Daniel Thursz and Joseph Vigilante (eds.) Meeting Human Needs. Beverly Hills: SAGE: 228-229.

- Alonso, de Mateo, Lila R.  
 1971 "Commentator", in Social Realities and the Social Work Response. New York: International Association of Schools of Social Work, p. 29.
- Berger, Peter  
 1974 Pyramids of Sacrifice. Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor Books: 23.
- Blutstein, Howard I., et al.  
 1977 Area Handbook for Colombia. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office: 105.
- Bodenheimer, Susanne  
 1971 The Ideology of Developmentalism Beverly Hills: SAGE: 39.
- DeYoung, Karen  
 1981 "White Hand of Terror", Mother Jones 6: 26-36, 45-48.
- Falcoff, Mark  
 1980 "Latin America", in The United States in the 1980s, (eds.) Peter Duignan and Alvin Rabushka. Stanford, CA.: Hoover Institution, P. 797.
- Fals-Borda, Orlando  
 1980 "The Negation of Sociology and Its Promise: Perspectives of Social Science in Latin America Today". Latin American Research Review 15.
- Freire, Paulo  
 1970 Pedagogy of the Oppressed. New York: Seabury Press: 160.
- Fuentes, Carlos  
 1981 "Where Anglos Should Fear to Tread". The Washington Post,

May 3, p. C1.

Gardner, Richard

- 1981 "Beyond Cancun". New York Times  
November 8, E21; and Mike  
Schultheis, "Cancun, A Faltering  
Dialogue". Center Focus. Wash-  
ington, D.C.: Center for  
Concern; December: 5-6.

Haig, Alexander

- 1981 "Interview", U.S. News and World  
Report. December 21: 22-23.

Heilbroner, Robert

- 1963 The Great Ascent. New York:  
Harper & Row: 118.

Hoeffel, Paul Heath and Juan Montaluo

- 1979 "Missing or Dead in Argentina".  
New York Times, October 21.

Hoge, Warren

- 1980 "Bolivia Turns its Back on the  
Andes and Looks South". New  
York Times, August 10: E5.

Johnson, Dale L.

- 1972 "Dependence and the Inter-  
national System", in James D.  
Cockcroft, Andre Gunder Frank,  
and Dale L. Johnson (eds.)  
Dependence and Underdevelopment.  
Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor  
Books,: 73.

Khinduka, S. K.

- 1971 "Social Work in the Third World"  
Social Service Review 45: 65.

Kirkpatrick, Jeane

- 1981 "U.S. Security & Latin America".  
Commentary 71: 34.

Knickerbocker, Brad

- 1983 "U.S. Foreign Aid: Tilt Toward Military". Christian Science Monitor 75, March 1: 1.
- Levine, Daniel H.  
1980 "Religion and Politics, Politics and Religion: An Introduction", in D. H. Levine (ed.) Churches and Politics in Latin America. Beverly Hills: SAGE,: 26-27.
- Magdoff, Harry  
1969 The Age of Imperialism. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Marquez, Gabriel Garcia  
1983 "The Solitude of Latin America". The New York Times, February 6,: E17.
- Meislin, Richard  
1983 "El Salvador: The State of Siege Continues". The New York Times Magazine, February 20,: 54.
- Neier, Aryeh  
1983 "Tropic of Fire". Mother Jones January: 35-45.
- Newland, Kathleen  
1981 Infant Mortality and the Health of Societies. Washington, D.C.: Worldwatch Institute: 20.
- New York Times  
1983 "Third-World Aid Called Drain on Soviet Resources". The New York Times, January 23: 7.
- Nikbakht, Ehsan  
1982 The Level of External Borrowing and Economic Growth of Borrowing LDCs: An Empirical Study (unpublished dissertation),

George Washington University:  
Washington, D.C.,: 194.

Nossiter, Bernard

1980 "New North-South Dialogue is  
Mostly a Pair of Monologues".  
The New York Times, August 31,:  
E3.

Reagan, Ronald

1982 "'Self-Determination, Economic  
Development, Collective Secur-  
ity'". The Washington Post,  
February 25,: A12.

Reagan, Ronald

1983 "'Our Neighbors' Struggle for a  
Better Future Deserves Our  
Help'". The Washington Post,  
March 11,: A13.

Riding, Alan

1980 "Guatemala: Revolution and  
Reaction in Central America".  
New York Times Magazine, August  
24,; see also, Warren Hoge, "In  
Guatemala, A Debilitating and  
Inept War". New York Times, May  
10, 1981: E3

Riding, Alan

1983 "Violence Rules Central America  
Despite Pacts and Plans for  
Peace". The New York Times,  
January 23,: 12.

dos Santos, Theotonio

1972 Quoted in Dale L. Johnson,  
"Dependence and the Internation-  
al System", in James D.  
Cockcroft, Andre Gunder Frank,  
and Dale L. Johnson, (eds.)  
Dependence and Underdevelopment.  
Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor  
Books, p. 31.



Stokes, Bruce

1981 Helping Ourselves: Local Solutions to Global Problems, New York: W. W. Norton.

Weinraub, Bernard

1983 "Salvador' Crisis' Sharpens the Debate Over Policy". The New York Times, March 6,: D1.

White, Alastair

1973 El Salvador. New York: Praeger: 100-101.

Zeitlin, Maurice

1972 "Introduction: Camilo's Colombia", in Father Camilo Torres: Revolutionary Writings, (ed.) Maurice Zeitlin, New York: Harper & Row, pp. 13-14.

## THE ASSIMILATION OF INDOCHINESE REFUGEES: SOCIAL SERVICE ISSUES

Mark W. Lusk  
Utah State University

### ABSTRACT

This paper summarizes the recent history of the Indochinese refugee experience in the United States and factors inhibiting their assimilation. Social service practice and policy issues which have arisen during their settlement are discussed.

America's experience during the past decade with the "boat people" and other refugees from Indochina has reignited longstanding controversies regarding immigration. The exodus of the Indochinese has stimulated national interest in the growing world refugee problem and has revived the discussion regarding this country's historic role as a haven for the dispossessed. Social welfare institutions have been challenged to respond to the practice and policy issues associated with the resettlement, adaptation, and assimilation of international exiles. This paper reviews the assimilation of the refugees from Southeast Asia from a social services perspective. As the nation begins to respond to the current migration of refugees from other regions such as Central America, the experience of their more recent predecessors could lend insight into the design of future social services policies and programs for refugee assistance.

---

This study was made possible by a grant from the National Endowment for the Humanities.

### Background

The "boat people" of Indochina provided a dramatic example of a growing worldwide crisis. Estimates are that about 16 million individuals have fled their country for asylum and it is unlikely that this trend will be reversed (Newland, 1981). During the first five years of communist rule in Vietnam, Cambodia, and Laos over 1.2 million Indochinese escaped from their home country (Wain, 1981). Yet the mass exodus in Indochina is not unique in recent world affairs. Nearly two million people have felt compelled to leave Ethiopia. Another 1.7 million have abandoned Afghanistan to find a new home in Pakistan and Iran (Newland, 1981). The plight of the 1.7 million Palestinians now living in Jordan, Lebanon, and the Gaza Strip has also aroused concern throughout the world.

The massive numbers of sanctuary-seekers and their perilous economic and political position has increasingly come to the attention of the international social work community and the profession is developing strategies of coping with this new clientele (Mayadas, 1983). In the United States, social work professionals have been involved in the administration of relief and resettlement programs and most public welfare workers have had at least some direct contact with refugee families. Given that the United States has had an historic role in refugee relief and that this tradition is likely to remain intact despite the protestations of nativists, it is important that social workers become more familiar with the relevant policy and practice issues in regard to assisting these people.

### Indochinese Refugees in the U.S.

Since the end of World War II approximately 1.6 million refugees have immigrated to the United States (Skinner and Hendricks, 1979). Most numerous among the migrant groups are the Indochinese. At the end of the Second World War, 7 million displaced persons

were scattered throughout Europe. Only 365,233 of them were admitted to the U.S. between 1948 and 1952. Both during and after the War many Americans feared that the nation would be overrun by those seeking sanctuary, particularly European Jews (Dinnerstein, 1982a). The next large scale exile movement to this country followed the Cuban Revolution. Between 1958 and 1963, 215,000 Cubans emigrated to the U.S. (Fagen et al, 1968). The U.S. supported government in Saigon fell in Spring 1975 and by April 50,000 had evacuated to Guam (Montero, Indochinese 1975b). By mid-1975 over 145,000 had arrived in the United States under the provisions of the Indochina Migration and Refugee Assistance Act of that year. Many more relocated throughout Southeast Asia and in resettlement camps of primary asylum (Skinner and Hendricks, 1979). As of 1978 the number admitted to the U.S. had grown to 170,000 and the rate of exodus in Indochina was accelerating (Montero, 1979a). President Carter liberalized U.S. admission quotas in 1979 to 168,000 per year and by 1983 the U.S. had admitted over 625,000 Indochinese (Morin, 1983).

Other nations responded to the exodus as well. By 1980 a half million refugees from Indochina had migrated to countries other than the United States. The People's Republic of China admitted 265,000 and Canada and France each allowed entrance to over 70,000 (Newland, 1981; Wain, 1981; Tepper, 1980). These four countries have borne the greatest resettlement burden outside of Indochina, yet within the region there remain today over 350,000 expatriates and displaced persons. Of these, fully 175,000 live under perilous conditions in Thai camps (Wain, 1982). Despite continuing efforts by the governments Hong Kong, Thailand, Indonesia, and Malaysia to encourage industrial nations to accept more emigrants from the region, American willingness to act as a refuge for the Indochinese appears to be declining and the U.S.

government has moved to restrict the flow of migration (Wain, 1982b).

The Indochinese refugees consist primarily of four distinct ethnic or national groups: Vietnamese, Laotian, Cambodian, and Hmong (pronounced Mung). Within and between the groups there is considerable diversity in background and culture. This is reflected by large differences in educational attainment, class background, religion, occupation, and ethnicity (Skinner, 1980).

The largest group, the Vietnamese, is highly heterogenous. Among the first wave of Vietnamese emigrants were those closely associated with American interests: military officers, highly-placed officials, professionals, and the propertied classes. Early waves of asylum-seekers were those who clearly felt most at risk under a communist government. In addition religious minorities were represented. Nearly half of the first group of Vietnamese who sought sanctuary are Catholic although only ten percent of the Vietnamese population are of that faith (Montero, 1979b). Most are well educated by Vietnamese standards and represent what was the country's elite. A substantial number of them are of Chinese ethnic origin who fled racial persecution under the new Soviet-influenced regime. Fully one fourth of the refugees are of Sino-Vietnamese background (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982).

Subsequent waves of Vietnamese immigrants have represented a broader cross-section of their society than early refugees and include many of the very poor who are fleeing economic hardship as much as persecution. Recent economic crises in Vietnam, poor harvests, and the perception of a liberal immigration policy in the U.S. have encouraged substantial numbers of Indochinese from the lower socioeconomic levels to emigrate as well (Skinner, 1980) (Smith and Davies, 1981). For differing reasons Vietnamese from the various socioeconomic levels have had difficulty

adapting to U.S. society. The upper classes were often unprepared for the sizeable decline in status and occupation they faced. The lower classes had fewer transferable skills and generally entered the labor force at the very lowest levels of the occupational ladder (Stein, 1979).

Many Laotians and Cambodians have escaped for reasons similar to those of the Vietnamese. The excesses of the Cambodian Pol Pot regime encouraged many thousands to take flight. It is estimated that over a million Cambodians were executed during this regime (Garry, 1980). With the Vietnamese domination of Cambodia and Laos there has been a sizeable departure of the upper and middle classes and of religious and political minorities in both countries.

Among the most disquieting examples of refugee persecution, flight, and adjustment is the case of the Hmong. A rural people from the mountains of Laos, the Hmong were a U.S. ally in the Vietnam War, losing 50,000 people in that conflict. Facing cultural and political persecution in Laos, over 51,000 relocated in the United States. They have had the greatest difficulty adjusting of any of the Indochinese groups. A traditional mountain people, they supported themselves by farming with hand tools and water buffalo. Until twenty years ago, they had no written language. Their lifestyle in Laos did not prepare them for autonomy in this country and indeed nearly 75 percent of the Hmong in this country are public assistance beneficiaries. Although ill-suited for life in the U.S. by reason of culture, climate, and occupation, there is no recourse for them to return. It is estimated that 70,000 Laotian Hmong have been killed since the "Secret War" ended in 1975 (Morin, 1983).

The view that there is no recourse for return is widespread among the refugees. The expropriation of ethnic Chinese property in Vietnam, the murder of the Hmong in Laos, and deteriorating economic conditions throughout the region have in effect "burned the

bridges" behind these groups. The majority feel they had no alternative but to seek asylum and are now adrift in the United States, a country with a strong nativist heritage (Liu and Muratta, 1977).

#### The Welcome Mat

Two competing traditions in American immigration history continue to be in evidence with the latest refugees. Until 1924, the nation was a traditional asylum for religious, ethnic, and political exiles despite the presence of nativists, Klansmen, and racists.

Although the country was settled by "foreigners," nativist sentiment has been a perennial feature of the American socio-political landscape. The Scotch-Irish and Germans were selectively taxed during the Colonial Period and in the middle of the nineteenth century the Know-Nothing party mounted an ultimately losing campaign to restrict immigration. Between 1875 and the turn of the century, several restrictive Acts of Congress banned undesirable aliens such as "lunatics," "idiots," and prostitutes. The first effort to exclude an ethnic group was embodied in the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882. It forbade Chinese immigration in part because of a widespread conviction that laborers from the Orient undercut American wages. Most western states subsequently disallowed Chinese land ownership and in 1913 California made it illegal for any "non-American" to own property.

Total immigration peaked between 1901 and 1910 with 8.8 million aliens being admitted. A disproportionate number of the new Americans hailed from southern and eastern Europe. The perception that these Europeans were less desirable was evident in the Dillingham Commission's Report of 1911 which recommended that restrictions based on national quotas be implemented. Xenophobia was heightened during the Red Scare and the First World War. In 1921, during the decade of intolerance which saw the rise of the

second Klan, Congress adopted a policy which restricted immigration on the basis of national origin. The policy was elaborated in 1924 when two bills were passed which set the pattern of immigration for decades. The Johnson-Reed Act tightened national quotas and favored Northern Europeans, while the Oriental Exclusion Act locked the borders to all Asian-born people. Anti-Asian sentiment ultimately contributed to the incarceration of Japanese Americans in 1942 when American prejudice toward minorities was of greatest intensity (Dinnerstein, 1982b). It is in this historical tradition that the latest Asian-Americans must be considered.

At first the U.S. acted quickly to relocate 134,000 refugees who hurriedly left Indochina in the spring of 1975, but the response thereafter never kept pace with the exodus. By the spring of 1978, the total number of those admitted had grown to only 160,000 yet the massive relocation of the Indochinese into camps in Thailand and other first asylum countries had begun. Although the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees accepted nearly all of those who fled Indochina as genuine refugees, the United States carefully categorized them and set limiting quotas. Politically this seemed wise at the time for 54 percent of Americans polled in 1975 opposed Indochinese resettlement in this country (Wain, 1981). By 1980 public

---

<sup>1</sup> The United Nations 1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees defines a refugee as "a person who owing to well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country."



sentiment had not moderated. In one national study the encouragement of local Indochinese settlement was opposed by 79 percent of the sample and 74 percent opposed providing funds to aid Indochinese exiles in America (Starr and Roberts, 1982).

Despite the force of public opinion, the Carter Administration gradually raised the ceiling on refugees. Responding in part to international pressure (particularly from the Association of Southeast Asian Nations) and to humanitarian and human rights concerns, restrictions on their admission became fewer. During his administration Congress passed the Refugee Act of 1980. It clarified policy on asylum procedure and more importantly established the Office of Refugee Resettlement in the Department of Health and Human Services. The Office was authorized to set up employment and language training programs and to make economic and medical assistance available. Although these efforts were designed to encourage a rapid transition to economic self-sufficiency, many Americans resented the instant eligibility of Indochinese refugees for AFDC, Medicaid, Food Stamps and job assistance (Skinner, 1980). In the words of one white American, "They are given everything for nothing. The government makes employers give them jobs other Americans need" (Starr and Roberts, 1982, p. 173).

Historically the greatest opposition to immigration has been from the lower classes, conservatives, and recent arrivals to the country (Dinnerstein, 1982b). It is argued that those who perceive that they have the most to lose under a liberal immigration policy will be its strongest opponents along with those who are politically or culturally xenophobic for reasons of nationalism or racism. In the case of the Indochinese, strongest support for their resettlement has generally been among liberals, those of higher occupational status, and the well-educated. Opposition has been reflective of traditional patterns of prejudice toward Asians and is related to low education, political con-

servatism, fundamentalism, and low occupational status (Starr and Roberts, 1982). Antagonism toward the Indochinese has also been noted among Blacks and among America's most recent large-scale immigrant group, Mexican-Americans (Skinner, 1980).

The aversion to the settling of the Indochinese has been manifested on occasion in violence, boycotts, and harassment. The most infamous of the racial incidents took place at Galveston Bay in Texas where two Vietnamese shrimp boats were burned in a flare up between local shrimpers and Vietnamese refugee fishermen. Faced with stiff competition from rather industrious and successful Vietnamese fisherman, Texan fishermen invited the Ku Klux Klan to make a show of force in the form of rallies, burning crosses, threats, and harassment (Stevens, 1981). The incidents reflected a theme in nativism: lower class, poorly educated whites and ethnics acting not only out of prejudice, but also out of fear of economic dislocation by "outsiders."

The cool reception given to the newcomers has been part of a pattern in American immigration during this century yet each national, ethnic, or religious group to arrive here has responded in a unique way to the challenge of assimilation. The nature of the mutual accommodation between the new Americans and the larger society is determined not only by the cultural and economic climate of the nation but also by the attributes of the arrivals.

#### Indochinese Assimilation

The accommodation of a minority group and a larger culture is in large part a function of linguistic, cultural, occupational, and racial distance. To the extent to which it is perceived that a group is significantly dissimilar, their integration is made more problematic. In addition the circumstances of arrival or "mode of entry" play a part as well as the perceived threat to labor or the cultural status quo. For

these reasons it is no surprise that those groups which have adapted most quickly to an "American way of life" and succeeded economically have been those who are most similar culturally to the dominant group in society. Although the assimilation of the Germans, Scandinavians, Jews, and Eastern Europeans was not without difficulty, it proceeded relatively smoothly as compared to the integration of the Chinese, Japanese, or Mexicans. Obvious religious, physical, cultural, and class differences can impede the integration of groups into the cultural and economic mainstream. An observer of American immigration history would note that laws concerning the admission of aliens have long been linked to preferred national and racial types with priority given to culturally similar Northern and Western Europeans. Bogardus' (1959) classic study of social distance found that Americans ranked these groups above others when asked to consider permissible social contacts with various ethnic and national aggregations. Prejudice toward the Indochinese and their integration may be understood in relation to their perceived social distance; they represent religious minorities (Catholic, Buddhist, animist), speak languages not widely understood in this country (Vietnamese, Chinese), and of course as Asians are racially and culturally distinct.

Economic obstacles to assimilation have been problematic as well. Although the first wave of migrants was better equipped for success than subsequent arrivals they, like most refugees, have not been fully integrated into the economic mainstream. Early entrants were relatively well-educated and disproportionately middle and upper class. At least two-thirds of the group were wealthy urbanites who had some familiarity with Western culture (Montero, 1974). The 1975-76 cohort of Vietnamese immigrants has been less dependent on government assistance and has shown higher labor force participation rates than later cohorts (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982). Nonetheless,

the original migrants have experienced a decline of economic and occupational status (Stein, 1979; Montero, 1979). Subsequent newcomers have been less equipped for occupational assimilation. They have lower educational attainment, fewer work skills, and humbler class origins. Correspondingly their experience has been one of higher unemployment and greater dependency on government assistance (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982).

Indochinese refugees typically have experienced short term unemployment and long term underemployment since resettlement. Stein (1979) found that although initial unemployment is quite high, the rate declines steadily in each successive year after arrival. Unemployment rates for those here fifteen months or longer (14 percent) approach the national average. Underemployment is quite high however. Heads of households are found to be working at a lower occupational level than in their home country in 68 percent of Stein's sample. Among the Vietnamese, those whose adjustment to the labor force was most rapid had completed more schooling prior to immigration and had been employed previously as career soldiers, skilled workers, or professionals. Even though over a quarter of the Vietnamese refugees had received some schooling in America and 70 percent had undergone English language training, economic self-sufficiency still eluded a large minority. Of those sampled in one national survey, 43 percent received some form of government income support (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982).

It is clear that the transition to self sufficiency and economic integration is not yet complete. Because refugees arriving in 1979 and thereafter generally have a lower human capital level than earlier arrivals, it can be anticipated that problems in economic integration will continue. There is considerable room for optimism, however. The Indochinese are widely regarded as industrious and diligent workers with a desire for

self-sufficiency (Chrysler, 1981). They have been able, despite all obstacles, to steadily improve their median earnings (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982). In a national longitudinal survey of Vietnamese workers, Montero (1979) found that over a three year period the percentage of employees earning under \$50 weekly declined from 12.4 percent to 6.2 percent while the percentage of those who make \$100 a week or more grew from 47.6 percent to 77.6 percent. During the same time period he found labor force participation increased from 82 percent to 95 percent. In addition, it has been shown that the need for government income assistance declines each year after entry (Montero and Dieppa, 1982).

It is likely that if the Indochinese are able to continue to achieve greater economic self-sufficiency, their cultural, psychological, and social adaptation will be accelerated. Furthermore their self-sufficiency will tend to mitigate the opposition generated by those who believe that they will be dependent on taxpayers. Representative Burt Talcott of California has said, "we have too many Orientals already...the tax and welfare rolls will get overburdened and we already have our share of illegal aliens" (Starr and Roberts, 1982, p. 170). Representative Sam Hall of Texas has observed, "the U.S. can't serve as a depository for every person in the world who wishes to leave his country. Word must be sent back that America is getting ready to draw the line" (Chrysler, 1981, p. 65). Such perceptions, which are not rare among political leaders, hopefully will diminish as the refugees enter the economic mainstream.

The unfortunate aspect of the economic integration of refugees and minorities is the "Catch-22" or double bind of success. Failure to become economically autonomous is scorned and regarded as evidence of cultural or racial inferiority while success is viewed as the result of preferential treatment or government assistance. On balance, however, the economic

success of an immigrant group tends to mute the voices of nativists (Dinnerstein, 1982b).

### Social Service Issues

Social work has from its beginning in this country been closely tied to the problems of immigrants. The Settlement House Movement (1886-1916), in particular, served a clientele who were making the transition to a new culture, economy, and language. Settlement House workers were confronted with individual problems of adaptation and assimilation among immigrant families and also by institutional and attitudinal barriers to their integration. Faced with a hostile and nativist environment, immigrants had great difficulty achieving economic independence and cultural accommodation. Consequently, the interventive methods of the Movement included social-reform efforts and advocacy in addition to socialization and neighborhood programs (Axinn and Levin, 1975). The experience of today's refugees accentuates the continuing need for workers to address institutional and cultural barriers to adjustment in conjunction with direct interventions on behalf of individuals and families.

Social workers have been found at each stage of resettlement. They are working in camps in Southeast Asia and were found in the now-closed American processing centers. In addition to playing key roles in sponsoring agencies such as the United States Catholic Conference and the Tolstoy Foundation, members of the profession have been involved in employment assistance, public welfare, and mental health programs for refugees under state and federal government.

The first priorities in refugee policy have been economic security and self-sufficiency. Many arrived with only a suitcase, others came with nothing but their clothing (Nhu, 1976). The Refugee Act of 1980 therefore made them immediately eligible for cash assistance, food stamps, and Medicaid. The bill

emphasizes the temporary nature of these benefits by funding "employment training and placement in order to achieve economic self-sufficiency among refugees as quickly as possible" (P.L. 96-212, Sec. 412a).

Despite the best efforts of public and voluntary agencies to protect their economic security many have fallen through the safety net. Vietnamese and Hmong have been found living in desperate poverty with little or no agency contact (Morin, 1983). And although economic autonomy has been a cardinal feature of resettlement policy, as many as 40 percent of the Vietnamese receive some form of government income assistance. Over two-thirds feel that their migration has resulted in a significant deterioration in economic status (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982).

The desire among the Indo-Chinese to become economically independent, however, has been great. They have moved into the labor force quickly. Montero, (1979), for example, found that 95 percent of Vietnamese males are employed in some capacity, usually well below their human capital level. Under-employment has been a chronic problem and is reflected in their desire for advancement.

In a survey of Indo-Chinese perceptions of social service needs in Utah, Moore (1981) found that the first priority for refugees was employment improvement. This was followed by the perceived need for better housing, language training, and cultural understanding. Although widespread mental health problems associated with adjustment have been noted among the group, Moore found that mental health services were seldom listed. The perceptions of social service agency personnel were quite similar. They emphasized English language training, employment counseling, and housing services.

In a national survey of Vietnamese refugees Dunning and Greenbaum (1982) discriminated between requirements upon arrival and long term needs. The respondents reported their immediate necessities as

maintenance of ethnic identity (100 percent), language training (85 percent), and employment (35 percent). Long term needs were more predictable: employment (48 percent), language (23 percent), and acculturation (17 percent). In identifying specific social service insufficiencies most of those surveyed (76 percent) perceived a need for government services such as welfare, followed by job services (53 percent), and housing services (48 percent). Policymakers, practitioners, and refugees appear to generally be consistent in perceiving that the social service system should initially focus on income security, employment counseling, housing assistance, and language training.

For purposes of practice it is useful to differentiate between two phases of refugee adjustment. During the first stage, recent arrivals are functioning under a normative system which is principally Asian (Ishisaka and Takagi, 1982). The perception of their needs is strongly shaped by the exile experience and its trauma: the sense of homelessness, economic insecurity, and the necessity to adapt rapidly to a new culture. Survival and security requirements are paramount and the individual is principally concerned with finding economic assistance, a job, housing, and acquiring functional language skills. The tendency is for anxiety and mental health problems to be repressed as the more immediate concerns are addressed. Once the person has found a home, a job, and become proficient in the basics of American culture and language, the less immediate problems of adjustment emerge. The normative system is no longer solely Asian but rather is in flux.

It is during the second stage of adjustment that the refugee can take inventory of his losses. While initially elated over new found freedom and preoccupied with immediate physical tasks it is possible to overlook the losses and separations: relatives and friends left behind, decline of occupational prestige and status, isolation from one's homeland, and more.



These feelings of loss, when coupled with indifference or rejection by the host culture, can result in depression, anger, chronic anxiety, and amotivational syndrome (Moore, 1981; Kinzie, 1982). Problems of second stage adjustment are often more pronounced among older refugees who may find it easier to withdraw and resist acculturation (Moore, 1983).

In both stages intervention proceeds in a Maslovian fashion from provision of concrete and referral services to socialization and finally, if appropriate, to counseling and treatment. Throughout the interventive process the importance of the informal helping network should be recognized. Most Vietnamese expatriates, for example, secured their first job through a personal contact such as a friend or relative rather than through an employment program (Dunning and Greenbaum, 1982). The informal network is not only important, therefore, in providing a social support system (e.g. Vietnamese Mutual Assistance Associations) but also in providing concrete services.

#### Broader Issues

The Indochinese exiles are but one group among many to be faced with the problems of adapting economically, culturally, and psychologically to the United States. Since the beginning of their influx, the country has also been receiving refugees from Cuba, Haiti, Poland, El Salvador, the Soviet Union, and elsewhere. The groups have in varying degrees confronted the same problems of adaptation: economic self-sufficiency, cultural differences, linguistic barriers, loss of ethnic identity, and nativist rejection. For those who have arrived with few marketable skills such as the Haitians, the process of adaptation has been particularly harsh and difficult. Given the turbulent nature of foreign affairs it is unlikely that the armies of peoples adrift on the seas of displacement will abate. Senator Edward Kennedy has observed:

Refugees have become a worldwide phenomenon of countless men, women, and children forced to leave their homes for as many reasons as there are behind the violence and conflict among people and nations. Yet today, this drama is of greater and more pressing dimensions than any time in recent years. There are more refugees now needing homes in new countries than any time since the worst days after World War II. (1979)

If the country is to continue to play its part as a leader among industrial democratic nations in providing a sanctuary for the dispossessed, it is crucial that the social work profession in this country move to the forefront of national and state refugee policy-making. Given social work's historic commitment to human rights, egalitarianism, and social justice, it is not sufficient for workers to be limited to the professional provision of basic human services to this new clientele. It is incumbent upon social workers to become their advocate in a nation which is increasingly unreceptive not only to the needs the world's abandoned, but also to its own internal exiles. In this era of rediscovered isolationism, the agenda is becoming clear.

At the outset the profession must challenge the pervasive belief that immigrants must at all costs be "Americanized" in order to adjust. This ubiquitous notion cruelly discounts the positive effects of pluralism on American society. It disallows the aspiration of individuals to find their identity in the context of an ethnic history and finally submerges real identity in deference to a presumed ideal type. Linguistic proficiency and the acquisition of human capital do not inherently obviate the preservation of an ethnic identity.

Secondly the profession must directly confront the unremitting tradition of nativism and ethnic bigotry which too often transforms the character of immigration from one of emancipation to one of isolation, rejection,

and fear. This tradition which occasionally explodes into confrontation and violence is more often expressed as silent intolerance. Rooted in unfounded fears of economic threat, in perceived threats to a national identity, and in parochial ignorance and isolationism, this xenophobia interfaces all too readily with dangerous traditions of ethnic intolerance and aggressive nationalism.

It may also be of concern to social workers that while political exiles from communist nations such as Vietnam, Cuba, Poland, and Hungary have been classified as legitimate refugees and thereby entitled to legal status and government assistance, those who have left non-communist countries tend to be viewed officially as "economic" refugees. Over a half million Indochinese have been admitted legally since 1975 and 130,000 Cubans were granted asylum in 1980 alone (Newland, 1981). By way of contrast, in 1983 the Immigration and Naturalization Service has been detaining 1,800 Salvadorans a month along the southern border and about 10,000 citizens of that country are in some phase of the deportation process (Turtle, 1983). In part this discriminatory approach to policy is linked to the provisions of the 1965 amendments to the Immigration and Nationality Act. The bill restricted entry ideologically to aliens who fled communism and geographically to fugitives of the Middle East. These conditions were repealed by the Refugee Act of 1980 which by adopting the United Nations' definition of a refugee provided a legal basis for a non-discriminatory approach to international asylum (Congressional Research Service, 1980). Nonetheless, the current administration contends that Central Americans are requesting asylum for economic reasons. The effect has not been to stop the migration but rather to make it illegal. The Federal Immigration and Naturalization Service estimates the number of Salvadorans in this country at one half million - a figure equal to 10 percent of El Salvador's

total population (Shenon, 1983). We are witnessing the emergence of a new class of undocumented aliens - the "fugitive refugees." While the legal status of this group will have to be addressed, perhaps it is of greater long term significance that refugee policy be the product of human rights considerations as well as of purely geo-political aims. This agenda can be suitably injected by the profession with the most significant humanitarian legacy.

Like the Settlement House workers who worked with immigrants at the turn of the century, contemporary social workers are recognizing their dual obligation to simultaneously provide professional services to individuals and communities while directly confronting the attitudinal, institutional, and legal obstacles to a just society.

### Summary

The worldwide refugee problem is growing and shows no signs of abatement. The international social work community is recognizing the importance of the profession's role in dealing with this new clientele. The experience of this country with its most recent major immigrant influx has enhanced social worker awareness of the problems of refugee assimilation, economic adaptation and social-cultural adjustment.

Indochinese expatriates are a heterogeneous group representing several nationalities, religions, cultures, and class backgrounds. Although their adjustment has been difficult they have moved quickly into the occupational structure toward economic self-sufficiency. Generally the refugee is underemployed and the loss of status, homeland, culture, and relatives has contributed to individual problems of adjustment. The American reception of its newest candidates for citizenship has not, on balance, been a warm one. Nonetheless, the Indochinese have steadily improved their median earnings and the net use of government assistance declines each year after entry.

Policymakers, practitioners, and refugees tend to be consistent in perceiving a hierarchy of needs which initially focuses on income security, employment, housing, and language competence and which subsequently emphasizes cultural, familial, and personal adjustment. Practice with the group recognizes the stages of cultural adjustment and utilizes the natural helping network.

Finally, social work can make an important contribution by working at an institutional, attitudinal, and policy level to dismantle the nationalistic and nativist barriers to a mutual accommodation of refugees and a plural society.

#### REFERENCES

- Adelman, H. (ed.), The Indochinese refugee movement: the Canadian experience, Toronto: Operation Lifeline, 1980.
- Axinn, J., and Levin, H., Social welfare: a history of the American response to need, New York: Dodd, Mead, & Co., 1975.
- Balter, J., Laotian refugees: farm project aids forgotten people, Los Angeles Times, June 26, 1983, A18.
- Bogardus, E. S., Social Distance, Yellow Springs, Ohio: Antioch Press, 1959.
- Congressional Research Service, Review of U.S. refugee resettlement programs and policies: a report. (Committee on the Judiciary, United States Senate). Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1980.
- Conrad, P., Living with refugees, Newsweek, August 13, 1979, 15.
- Dinnerstein, L., America and the survivors of the holocaust, New York: Columbia University Press, 1982a.
- Dinnerstein, L., Ethnic Americans: a history of immigration and assimilation, New York: Harper and Row, 1982b.

- Dunning, B. B., and Greenbaum, J., Survey of the social, psychological, and economic adaptation of Vietnamese refugees in the U.S., Washington, D.C.: Bureau of Social Science Research, Inc., 1982.
- Esterik, P. V., Cultural factors affecting the adjustment of Southeast Asian refugees, In E. L. Tepper (ed.), Southeast Asian exodus: from tradition to resettlement, Ottawa: Canadian Asian Studies Association, 1980.
- Fagen, R. R., et al., Cubans in exile: disaffection and the revolution, Stanford, Ca.: Stanford University Press, 1968.
- Garry, R., Cambodia, In E. L. Tepper (ed.), Southeast Asian exodus: from tradition to resettlement, Ottawa: Canadian Asian Studies Association, 1980.
- Gordon, M. M. Assimilation in American Life. New York: Oxford University Press, 1964.
- Henlin, A. B., and Nguyen, L. T., Between two cultures: the Vietnamese in America, Saratoga, Ca.: Century Twenty One Publishing, 1981.
- Ishisaka, H. A., and Takagi, C. Y., Social work with Asian and Pacific Americans, In J. W. Green (ed.), Cultural awareness in the human services, Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1982.
- Kennedy, E. M., quoted in Newsweek, March 12, 1979.
- Kinzie, J. D., Evaluation and psychotherapy of Indochinese refugee patients, American Journal of Psychotherapy, 1981, 35 (2), 252-261.
- Liu, W. T., and Muratta, A. K., The Vietnamese in America: refugees or immigrants?, Bridge: An Asian American Perspective, 1977, 5 (3), 31-39.
- Mayadas, N. S., Psycho-social welfare and refugees: an expanding service area for social work, International Social Work, 1983, 26 (1), 47-55.

- Montero, D., and Dieppa, I., Resettling Vietnamese refugees: the service agency's role, Social Work, 1982, 27 (1), 74-81.
- Montero, D., Vietnamese-Americans: patterns of resettlement and socioeconomic adaptation in the United States, Boulder, Co.: Westview, 1979a.
- Montero, D., Vietnamese refugees in America: toward a theory of spontaneous international migration, International Migration Review, 1979b, 13 (4), 624-647.
- Moore, T. M., From Indochina to Utah: issues and social service needs in the resettlement of Indochinese refugees in Utah, Unpublished dissertation, University of Utah, 1981.
- Moore, T. M., Interview, Refugee Coordinator, State of Utah, June 1, 1983.
- Morin, S. P., Troubled refugees, Wall Street Journal, February 16, 1983, 1.
- Newland, K., Refugees: the new international politics of displacement, Washington, D.C.: Worldwatch Institute, 1981.
- Nhu, T. T., Vietnamese refugees: The trauma of exile, Civil Rights Digest, 1976, 9, 59-62.
- Rahe, R. H., et al., Psychiatric consultation in a Vietnamese refuge camp, American Journal of Psychiatry, 1978, 135 (2), 185-189.
- Shenon, P., Salvadoran refugees in New York area struggle for asylum, New York Times, July 25, 1983, A1.
- Skinner, K. A., and Hendricks, G. L., The shaping of self-identity among Indochinese refugees, The Journal of Ethnic Studies, 1979, 7 (3), 25-41.
- Skinner, K. A., Vietnamese in America: diversity in adaptation, California Sociologist, 1980, 3 (2), 103-123.
- Smith, P., and Davies, D., The Asian refugee puzzle, World Press Review, September, 1981, 26-28.

- Smyser, W. R., U.S. contribution to refugee relief in Southeast Asia and Pakistan, Department of State Bulletin, 1981, 81 (2051), 48-51.
- Starr, P. D., and Roberts, A. E., Attitudes toward new Americans: perceptions of Indochinese in nine cities, Research in Race and Ethnic Relations, 1982, 3, 165-186.
- Stein, B. N., Occupational adjustment of refugees: the Vietnamese in the United States, International Migration Review, 1979, 3 (1), 25-45.
- Stern, L. M., Response to Vietnamese refugees: surveys of public opinion, Social Work, 1981, 26 (4), 306-312.
- Stevens, W., Klan inflames Gulf fishing fight between whites and Vietnamese, New York Times, April 25, 1981, 1.
- Stone, S., and McGowan, J. E., Wrapped in the wind's shawl: refugees of Southeast Asia and the western world, San Rafael, Ca.: Presidio Press, 1980.
- Suh, M., Psychiatric problems of immigrants and refugees, In E. L. Tepper (ed.), Southeast Asian exodus: from tradition to resettlement, Ottawa: Canadian Asian Studies Association, 1980.
- Turtle, C. M., Church helps Salvadoran refugees find homes, Headline, Tucson, June 24, 1983.
- Wain, B., A proven way to help refugees - brutality, Wall Street Journal, October 1, 1982a, 30.
- Wain, B., The refused: the agony of the Indochinese refugees, New York: Simon and Schuster, 1981.
- Wain, B., Thais look to the U.S. Attorney General for assurances on resettling refugees, Wall Street Journal, October 26, 1982b, 36.



Manuscripts should be sent to:

Edward J. Pawlak and Dan H. Thompson.  
School of Social Work OR Department of Sociology  
Western Michigan University  
Kalamazoo, MI 49008

Please submit three copies. Manuscripts are reviewed anonymously; please omit names and affiliations from the title page and make any internal self-reference in the third person. Manuscripts will not be returned. Reviewing normally takes 45-60 days but can take longer in the case of split recommendations. Authors should feel free to write or call the editor if they feel an undue amount of time has elapsed.

The Journal welcomes a broad range of articles which analyze social welfare institutions, policies, or problems from a sociological perspective or otherwise attempt to bridge the gap between social science theory and social work practice.

Books for review should be sent to:

Paul Adams  
School of Social Work  
University of Iowa  
Iowa City, IA 52242

Subscriptions to the Journal may be obtained by writing to:

Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare  
University of Connecticut  
School of Social Work  
1800 Asylum Avenue  
West Hartford, Ct 06117

Volume XI (1984)	Individual	(North Am.)	\$12
	Individual	(overseas)	16
	Institution	(North Am.)	20
	Institution	(overseas)	25
	Student		10

Individual issues and back issues are available.  
Price on request.

**Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare**

UNIVERSITY OF CONNECTICUT

SCHOOL OF SOCIAL WORK

1800 ASYLUM AVENUE

WEST HARTFORD, CONNECTICUT 06117

RETURN POSTAGE GUARANTEED

NON PROFIT ORG.  
U.S. POSTAGE  
PAID  
HARTFORD, CT  
PERMIT #5050