Music as an Educational Tool to Reinforce Schoolwork

Barry Steven Rothstein
Western Michigan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/masters_theses
Part of the Educational Psychology Commons, and the Music Education Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/masters_theses/2064
MUSIC AS AN EDUCATIONAL TOOL
TO REINFORCE SCHOOLWORK

by
Barry Steven Rothstein

A Thesis
Submitted to the
Faculty of The Graduate College
in partial fulfillment
of the
Degree of Master of Arts

Western Michigan University
Kalamazoo, Michigan
August 1979
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In completing this thesis, I would like to offer thanks to Professors Jack Michael, Paul Mountjoy, and Wayne Fuqua for their help and constructive criticism. In addition I would like to offer special thanks to Margaret Teruya, Jimmy Wong, Joy Coppel, Hitoshi Matsuo, Susan Fushikoshi, and other members of the Castle High School reading staff who made this project possible and a pleasure to perform. Thanks also to Steve Coppel, whose encouragement and support came in handy. The challenge and diversity of the learning experiences I encountered at Western Michigan will always be with me.

Barry Steven Rothstein
INFORMATION TO USERS

This was produced from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure you of complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark it is an indication that the film inspector noticed either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, or duplicate copy. Unless we meant to delete copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed, you will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed the photographer has followed a definite method in “sectioning” the material. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For any illustrations that cannot be reproduced satisfactorily by xerography, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and tipped into your xerographic copy. Requests can be made to our Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases we have filmed the best available copy.

University Microfilms International
300 N. ZEEB ROAD, ANN ARBOR, MI 48106
18 BEDFORD ROW, LONDON WC1R 4EJ, ENGLAND
ROTHSTEIN, BARRY STEVEN
MUSIC AS AN EDUCATIONAL TOOL TO REINFORCE
SCHOOLWORK.

WESTERN MICHIGAN UNIVERSITY, M.A., 1979

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
PLEASE NOTE:

In all cases this material has been filmed in the best possible way from the available copy. Problems encountered with this document have been identified here with a check mark \(\checkmark\).

1. Glossy photographs ______
2. Colored illustrations ______
3. Photographs with dark background ______
4. Illustrations are poor copy ______
5. Print shows through as there is text on both sides of page ______
6. Indistinct, broken or small print on several pages ______ throughout ______
7. Tightly bound copy with print lost in spine ______
8. Computer printout pages with indistinct print ______
9. Page(s) ______ lacking when material received, and not available from school or author ______
10. Page(s) ______ seem to be missing in numbering only as text follows ______
11. Poor carbon copy ______
12. Not original copy, several pages with blurred type ______
13. Appendix pages are poor copy \(\checkmark\)
14. Original copy with light type ______
15. Curling and wrinkled pages ______
16. Other __________________________
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHODS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjects</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESULTS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISCUSSION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Numerous recent reports have brought attention to failures in the educational system, particularly in the area of reading. While reasonable solutions to the problem are scarce, the blame runs in many directions. Parents blame teachers and decreased levels of school discipline. Teachers blame weak administrators, the lack of affordable quality educational materials, and high student/teacher ratios. School administrators blame inadequate funding and the inconsistencies between values placed on students at school and at home. Everyone blames television.

Regardless of where the blame lies, the students are taking the loss. Almost unilaterally across the United States, students are leaving schools, having graduated or dropped out, with reading abilities years below expected levels, many unable to read newspapers, magazines, or even the instructions or directions for common household goods.

Current approaches to teaching reading are often based on a building block model, which views learning to read as a stepwise accumulation of specific reading skills (Dolch, 1951). Accordingly, the problem reader is often a student who at one stage misses out on learning certain basic skills, is passed over by teachers and passed on to higher grades. Lacking basic skills, this student is unable to succeed with the increasingly difficult material he faces, and fails to attain proficiency in a broad range of secondary reading
skills. Many of these students in high school are characterized by fairly normal verbal ability, but diagnosed as reading between three to six years below expected level.

Problems in reading are common in Hawaii's schools. Due to a diverse multinational culture, the standard form of speech among students and many adults is 'pidgin' English, a language in its own right. It is generally an abbreviated blend of English and Hawaiian (with words added from Japanese, Chinese, Portuguese and other languages), using a shortened sentence structure, often omitting words unneeded in communicating a message. The inconsistencies between common spoken language and standard English often prove difficult to students.

Added problems arise from differing school and family values. Some parents keep their children home to accommodate family needs. In other families public education is not considered especially important. Among these children attendance is sporadic and achievement often very low.

Many children come from homes where no form of English is spoken and little exposure to printed English words is available. These children enter school with almost no English background, as with others who are unable to read or spell their names or any other English characters. While these are not necessarily overpowering disabilities, these students come in with an immediate disadvantage to students whose parents have taught them these basic skills.
Remedial students are often characterized by a history of failure to attain positive consequences for the schoolwork they produce. Their teachers, assigned to the role of differentially reinforcing their schoolwork and behavior, are likely to meet low levels of performance with disapproval.

For many of these students, school is a jail. They find themselves trapped between parents who demand their attendance in school and teachers who must keep them in class attentive or at least non-disruptive. Under such an arrangement the teacher takes on the role of jailor, which weakens the potential of the teacher as a source of positive reinforcement for good work.

Becker (1972) mentions three types of consequences typically available to teachers: social reinforcement, activity reinforcers, and punishment. Social reinforcement refers to the strengthening of a behavior due to the response it draws from other people. Teachers use social reinforcement such as attention, smiles, and praise to strengthen good student work and behavior. Unfortunately from the standpoint of the teacher, social reinforcement is also available from the student's peers, but usually contingent upon unfavorable or disruptive behavior. A teacher's attention and disapproval toward disruptive behaviors might even strengthen these behaviors. In this way students in remedial classes typically develop broad repertoires of disruptive behaviors, for which reinforcement is available at more immediate and higher rates than is available for normal schoolwork.
Punishment is a stimulus which weakens the behavior it follows. However, as Becker points out, people learn to escape from and avoid sources of punishment. While punishment could be ideally effective if it resulted in a student avoiding it by doing better schoolwork, more often punishment teaches a student other effective avoidance behaviors such as lying, hiding, cheating, and truancy.

A third class of consequences commonly available to teachers is activity reinforcers, which are the primary interest of this study. In his classic report Premack (1965) demonstrated that access to a high probability response can reinforce performance of a low probability response. For purposes of the classroom, given an activity a student is likely to engage in, access to that activity can be used to reinforce a less likely (and perhaps more desirable) student behavior.

Osborne (1960) used free time with access to recreational activities to keep a class of eleven-to-thirteen-year-old deaf students seated when their constant moving around proved a problem. Lovitt, Guppy, and Blathner (1969) used a similar incentive to reinforce spelling accuracy in third graders. Schmitt and Ulrich (1969) offered free time and extra gym time to reinforce low classroom noise levels, and Rapport and Bostow (1976) reinforced good performance on daily work activities with daily recreational activities.

A brief discussion should be offered here on the use of extrinsic rewards in the classroom. An intrinsic or natural reward is one whose reinforcing value is derived solely from performing that
behavior. Under most circumstances eating a banana or tossing a frisbee is more intrinsically reinforcing than writing a term paper or working at a job. Extrinsic reward refers to the external reinforcing events which follow a behavior. Upon finishing a paper the student is rewarded with praise (hopefully), a grade, and advancement. From working on a job one receives money which can be exchanged for any number of pleasures. In the classroom the joy a student experiences in learning to read and the knowledge he retains is said to be his intrinsic reward. Other benefits such as positive social reinforcement from teacher and classmates, grades, and activity reinforcers as mentioned above are extrinsic rewards.

Sorenson and Maehr (1976) criticize the use of extrinsic reward in the classroom. In citing their own research and that of Deci (1971), Kruglanski (1971) and others, they assert that the use of extrinsic rewards, especially when the task being rewarded is interesting (intrinsically reinforcing), tends to break down a student's "continuing motivation"--the likelihood that he will continue to pursue that subject later on his own.

A basic point to be derived from this section is that to most students in remedial reading classes, reading is not an especially reinforcing behavior. On the contrary, attempts at reading and associated behaviors have yielded little and mostly uninteresting information, and these attempts have been followed by inadequate positive consequences to maintain reading behavior. Skinner asserts "if the natural reinforcement inherent in the subject matter is not
enough, other reinforcers must be employed.\(^1\) In the pursuit of a successful reading program, this suggestion should not be ignored. Several activities are available to teachers which are rich in intrinsic reinforcement—activities that students are likely to do on their own—and also rich in educational value. Given such activities, access to them during class time could be made contingent upon other desirable school behaviors. Listening and responding to music is one such activity.

\(^1\) Skinner, B.F., *The Technology of Teaching*, p. 34.
METHODS

Setting

The reading program at Castle High School in Kaneohe, Hawaii, operates in the Large Group Learning Center (LGLC). This modern room is rectangular with a high ceiling, carpeted and air conditioned. It has approximately the floor space of four normal classrooms. The remedial reading program accommodates between fifty and one hundred students each of six daily class periods. Seven qualified English teachers are assigned to LGLC over the course of each day, others from one to four periods per day. Three to five teachers are on task in LGLC each class period, the number largely dependent on enrollment.

Each teacher specializes in one or two aspects of the reading program. The areas of specialty are reading, writing, grammar, and programmed materials (i.e., SRA packets). One teacher specializes in state-prepared phonics and comprehension materials which are used for lower level reading students. Each of these subjects is designated to a specific section (station) of the room and a teacher to run that station.

Upon entrance into the reading program, students are given a battery of tests to diagnose specific and general needs and roughly determine their reading levels. They are then assigned to one of four groups, Group A, B, C or D (in ascending order of reading level).
Groups A and B are below 3.0 (third grade) in general reading ability. Group C ranges from 3.0 to 4.5, and Group D from 4.5 to 6.0.

Students in Groups C and D are scheduled to rotate by groups regularly, from Monday through Thursday, so that each student spends one day in each of the four specialty areas. The lower level groups (A and B) spend two days per week with the state-prepared materials, one day in reading, and one day in programmed materials. Friday is used as a make-up day for all students to complete unfinished work.

For example, a student in Group C might go to reading on Monday, programmed materials on Tuesday, writing on Wednesday, and grammar on Thursday. On Friday he could go to any of these stations to complete his work or seek help from teachers. Each of these subjects requires one written assignment per week.

Every student is given a folder in which to keep his work. In each folder is a student contract which illustrates simply with color codes the amounts of work required to attain the various grades. Daily entries are made on the student contracts to indicate completed assignments and the grades on those assignments. Final grade for the course is dependent both on quality and quantity of the work.

Students are allowed to take their work home, but are not allowed to remove reading materials from the classroom, except those available and checked out from the class library.
Subjects

198 students enrolled in remedial reading were studied. All students assigned to Groups C and D were included. Students in groups A and B were sometimes included in the activities involved, but no data were taken for them. Subjects ranged in grade level from ninth through twelfth, a large majority coming from ninth and tenth grades.

Materials

A special set of materials was created for use as an educational tool. It was put together in the hope that it would be entertaining to the students as well as educational. A number of popular music artists were chosen and their songs were recorded in 15 minute segments on cassette tapes, each segment featuring one artist or group. The original recordings range from early Beatles (1963) to Fleetwood Mac (1977). Fifteen artists and twenty-four segments were recorded in all. Each tape was accompanied by a Xeroxed typewritten sheet of the songs' lyrics and a worksheet whose content and questions were based on the lyrics. These worksheets were assembled with the intent of being instructional for students with an approximately third to six grade reading level. See appendix for examples.
Design

This study takes on an A B C A' C design* with each condition lasting between two to three weeks. The independent variable is the condition under which the materials were used. Students are grouped by grade level, class period, and initial reading level. During each week of the study, the number of completed assignments each student turned in was recorded, "completed" defined subjectively as meeting a teacher's requirements.

Procedure

Data were taken for two weeks on the number of assignments turned in by each student before the materials were used (BASELINE 1). Over the next three weeks (INTRODUCTION) the music materials were substituted for regular class materials, such that Group C and D students were exposed to the music materials once weekly in place of one of the regular subjects. Over the following two weeks access to the music materials on Friday (otherwise a make-up day) was voluntary and contingent upon completion of the Monday through Thursday assignments (CONTINGENT 1). Students who qualified were allowed to choose a tape and were given the accompanying papers. If a student who qualified did not wish to listen to music, he could read

* Condition A is similar to A' in that the music related materials were not used. They differ in that during the A' condition, class time on Friday was not available for regular use.
on his own or do other work or nothing. Students who did not qualify had the option of going to whichever station they had not completed their work, but were not allowed to sit with students in the area where music was being played. The tapes were played in a place in the room farthest from the regular stations, but some sound from the tapes could be heard in other parts of the room. No conditions were placed on students for working on or turning in the worksheets that accompanied the tapes. During the next two weeks (BASELINE 2) the materials were not used, but class time on Friday was allotted to other purposes. One Friday was taken up by the May Day celebration. There were no classes that day. On the following Friday all students present in reading were tested on the Gates-McGinity test. For the last three weeks (CONTINGENT 2) access to the music materials on Friday was once again voluntary and contingent upon completion of the weekly assignments.
RESULTS

Table 1 is a summary table, showing a week-by-week breakdown in each class period of: 1) the total number of assignments turned in (T); 2) the number of those assignments which were turned in on Friday (F); and 3) the number of students who completed all of that week's assigned work (C). Averages collapsed over class periods and averages further collapsed between conditions are also given.

Figures 1, 2 and 3 depict similar information in graphic form, with the exception that class periods are collapsed. While broad differences were found between class periods, the trends found between conditions were consistent across class periods. The total amount of work turned in (Figure 1), the amount of the work turned in on Friday (Figure 2), and the number of students who completed all of a week's assignments (Figure 3) are graphed along with histograms of condition means.

A comparison of the CONTINGENT stages to BASELINE 1 and INTRODUCTION stages shows that more assignments were turned in (by a ratio of approximately 7 to 6) and more students were completing their week's work (by a ratio of almost 3 to 2) during the CONTINGENT stages.

The amount of work that came in on Friday is roughly equivalent between BASELINE 1-INTRODUCTION (weeks 1 through 5) and CONTINGENT 1-CONTINGENT 2 (weeks 6-7 and 10-12). In both cases decreased amounts of Friday work came in over time (possibly related to the nearing end
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Per. N</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>Av.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tot 198</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>403</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ave.</td>
<td>cond</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>82.5</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>68.8</td>
<td>68.6</td>
<td>70.7</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>80.6</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>67.6</td>
<td>69.6</td>
<td>70.3</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>30.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F = Turned in on Friday
C = Completed weekly work
T = Total Assignments

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
of the school year). The adoption of the CONTINGENT conditions temporarily raised the amount of Friday work above previous levels, but this was followed by another drop in Friday work over time.

The reinforcement contingency was characterized by significantly more of the Friday work resulting in completion of the weekly assignments. Table 2 illustrates this difference. Of the 116 incidents of students finishing all their weekly work during the non-CONTINGENT stages, 83 of their assignments came in on Friday. Of the 169 incidents of students finishing all their weekly work during CONTINGENT conditions, 166 of their assignments came in on Friday. This difference is most apparent in noting that approximately the same amount of Friday work came in during CONTINGENT and non-CONTINGENT conditions (370 to 357). Twice as much Friday work from CONTINGENT conditions resulted in completion of the weekly assignments.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A) Number of students who completed all work</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B) Number of assignments involved (A x 4)</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C) Number of assignments turned in on Friday</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D) Ratio of C/A by condition</td>
<td>B1</td>
<td>INT</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>B2</td>
<td>C2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E) Ratio of C/A comparing B1-INT to C1-C2</td>
<td>25/44</td>
<td>58/72</td>
<td>81/77</td>
<td>0/18</td>
<td>85/92</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 2  Comparison of Work Turned in on Friday
DISCUSSION

This section will open with a criticism of the procedure used in the study. The procedure was far from experimentally perfect. Some issues to consider are as follows:

There was no control group. The exclusion of one to three classroom periods from use of the music materials could have provided a better base of comparison.

The design would have been stronger with more balanced and longer experimental conditions. The main comparison is between BASELINE 1-INTRODUCTION stages (weeks 1 through 5) and CONTINGENT 1-CONTINGENT 2 stages (weeks 6, 7, 10, 11 and twelve). One explanation of the data could be a simple upward trend in turning in papers.

Data on which of the eligible students chose the music reinforcement are missing. (Due to unavailability of teachers to oversee the reinforcement, such data were incomplete.)

Delivery of reinforcement was imperfect. Lower levels of sound from the tapes could reinforce students for not finishing their work.

Aside from procedural imperfections, criticism might be offered in terms of behavioral inefficiency. First, the objective of this study was to get more students to finish their work by means of effective behavioral contingencies. Proper use of contingency management calls for reinforcing gradual behavior change up to the desired goal. Only full achievement of the goal was reinforced in this case. Also, to make reinforcement effective, it is best to
administer it immediately following the behavior. Reinforcement was offered only once each week after week-long activities.

Despite any criticism, data indicate that the addition of the music tapes for an activity provided the incentive for some positive behavior change. Discussion with reading teachers involved offered several positive informal observations of the project. First, they found the materials to be a strong educational tool. The materials were met with much greater enthusiasm and interest by the students than other reading materials. Students were more on task and less distracted, especially when they were familiar with the music presented. Many students kept the attached lyric sheets.

Second, once a reward was offered for completion of work, the students were more aware of the teachers' intent in that direction. This added emphasis that teachers placed on turning in assignments was undoubtedly coupled with social reinforcement for students who complied.

Probably the most important aspect of the effect of the reinforcement contingency was the way it worked as a rallying point to get students on Friday to finish and turn in their work. Once a few students were off listening to music, teachers could easily encourage more students to hurry up and finish so they could join their classmates.

The difference in assignments turned in between different class periods might best be described as incidental. Some periods were better than others. Sometimes an added incentive was effective and
sometimes not.

The efficacy of an effective reinforcement contingency is supported in three ways by the data. First, more assignments were turned in with the reinforcement contingency in effect. This difference was taken up almost entirely by work turned in Monday through Thursday. Second, with access to music as an incentive, more students were completing their weekly work. Third, students who completed their weekly assignments under the reinforcement contingency turned in more of their work on Friday than did those students who completed their assignments without that contingency. The higher end-of-interval responding found here supports the notion that students who completed their assignments under the reinforcement contingency were responding in accordance with the contingency in effect.

It must be mentioned that other motivational variables favoring the completion of work were in force. One such variable was class grade. Another was the social reinforcement available from teachers and possibly from peers and parents. Another source of reinforcement could have been intrinsic in nature: the satisfaction students found in completing their assignments and the knowledge they obtained. Undoubtedly any or all of these variables are correlated.

The use of music as reinforcement in this study is clearly an example of employing an extrinsic reward to reinforce a desired behavior. While the criticism of extrinsic reinforcement forwarded by Sorensen and Maehr is of interest to this study, in many cases this criticism should be overlooked. Sorensen and Maehr suggest
that a student who is paid or rewarded for performing a task—especially one that is intrinsically reinforcing—will be less likely to return to that task outside of school, where the reward is no longer available.

Behaviorists agree that when reinforcement is withheld from a previously reinforced response, the probability of that response decreases. The effect of decreased continuing motivation reported by Sorensen and Maehr and supported by other studies appears to be due to the switch in the reinforcer controlling the response at the expense of the effectiveness of the former intrinsic reinforcer, an effect which is probably reversible over time. However, here the issue is whether lower levels of reading would ultimately occur with these students with or without the intervention of extrinsic rewards. The natural probability of reading behavior in most remedial reading students is initially very near zero. The interest level of the materials they have been able to read and the extent of failure they have experienced in reading places the intrinsic value of reading very low. In order for reading to take on any intrinsic value, a fair amount of it must be performed and maintained.

The use of music as a reinforcer was also an example of Premack's Principle. Listening to music, a high probability response promoted completing and turning in assignments, an all too low probability response. As an excellent source of stimulation and enjoyment, music is a natural reinforcer. A number of other educational activities might also be found to have as much intrinsic
value to students. Learning skills in arts, building, nature studies, or other areas which employ some reading could promote high interest in some students and might be useful to reinforce desirable low frequency student behaviors.

Probably the best use for the music materials produced for this study was proposed by reading teachers Margaret Teruya and Jimmy Wong. They suggested that consistent work and improvement could be rewarded by inclusion into more privileged groups, which could utilize some of the more interesting materials and options available.

In conclusion, more avenues must be explored toward motivating students who have failed through standard methods. High interest materials are important. Of equal importance are the contingencies that students find placed on their learning. In order to maintain desired learning behaviors, these students need in some tangible way to benefit from the work they produce. Most research and development done today is carried out at the early education level, very fortunately. But at least for a number of years, poor readers will continue to enter and leave school, and for these students ways must be developed toward improved education and perhaps a better chance in life.
REFERENCES


SOARING LIKE
FEELING JUST THE WAY I DO (OVER YOU)

Moaring like a bird I'm flying,
Acting like a child, excited, over you,
Driving in a car, we're cruising,
Searching for a star that's shooting,
Over you,
Blue skies, sunshine,
Every day is filled with good times,
And no more fears of leaving,
And I know it's good for the soul,
Feeling just the way I do,
Going crazy over you,
Magic in the eyes of wisdom,
Going through so many changes over you,
Feeling high when I'm next to you,
I'm the guy that's going places over you,
Every day is filled with good times,
And I know it's good for the soul,
And no more fears of leaving,

SUNFLOWER

If this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the golden hair,
I would know you anywhere.
I could visit you at midnight,
Wouldn't make no difference,
In the darkness you'd shine bright.
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Sunflower makes me sing,
La la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Of the joy you bring,
We could make this world a flower garden,
I will take you in my arms there.
Sunflower I will take you there,
It'll be our garden, be our garden everywhere.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
All the joy, all the joy you bring,
Sunflower, Sunflower makes me sing,
And if this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.

ALL IN LOVE IS FAIR

All is fair in love,
Love's a crazy game,
To people vowed to stay
In love as one, they say,
But all is changed with time,
The future none can see,
The road we leave behind,
Ahead lies mystery.

FRIENDS

It's so nice to see familiar faces
Out in the crowd,
It's so nice to see friends of mine
Enjoying themselves,
And everybody get happy, 'cause we
Can work it out.

APPENDIX

FEELING JUST THE WAY I DO (OVER YOU)

Moaring like a bird I'm flying,
Acting like a child, excited, over you,
Driving in a car, we're cruising,
Searching for a star that's shooting,
Over you,
Blue skies, sunshine,
Every day is filled with good times,
And no more fears of leaving,
And I know it's good for the soul,
Feeling just the way I do,
Going crazy over you,
Magic in the eyes of wisdom,
Going through so many changes over you,
Feeling high when I'm next to you,
I'm the guy that's going places over you,
Every day is filled with good times,
And I know it's good for the soul,
And no more fears of leaving,

SUNFLOWER

If this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the golden hair,
I would know you anywhere.
I could visit you at midnight,
Wouldn't make no difference,
In the darkness you'd shine bright.
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Sunflower makes me sing,
La la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Of the joy you bring,
We could make this world a flower garden,
I will take you in my arms there.
Sunflower I will take you there,
It'll be our garden, be our garden everywhere.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
All the joy, all the joy you bring,
Sunflower, Sunflower makes me sing,
And if this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.

ALL IN LOVE IS FAIR

All is fair in love,
Love's a crazy game,
To people vowed to stay
In love as one, they say,
But all is changed with time,
The future none can see,
The road we leave behind,
Ahead lies mystery.

FRIENDS

It's so nice to see familiar faces
Out in the crowd,
It's so nice to see friends of mine
Enjoying themselves,
And everybody get happy, 'cause we
Can work it out.
We are friends, friends, friends.
We are friends, friends, friends.
We should have never left you.
But all is fair in love,
I toss my coin to say
In love with me you'll stay.
But all is fair in love,
To write the words again,
I could visit you at moonlight,
And your smiling face a flower living,
La la la la la la la la la la la la la... ooh-oh-oh.

ApPENDIX 24

FEELING JUST THE WAY I DO (OVER YOU)

Moaring like a bird I'm flying,
Acting like a child, excited, over you,
Driving in a car, we're cruising,
Searching for a star that's shooting,
Over you,
Blue skies, sunshine,
Every day is filled with good times,
And no more fears of leaving,
And I know it's good for the soul,
Feeling just the way I do,
Going crazy over you,
Magic in the eyes of wisdom,
Going through so many changes over you,
Feeling high when I'm next to you,
I'm the guy that's going places over you,
Every day is filled with good times,
And I know it's good for the soul,
And no more fears of leaving,

SUNFLOWER

If this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the golden hair,
I would know you anywhere.
I could visit you at midnight,
Wouldn't make no difference,
In the darkness you'd shine bright.
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Sunflower makes me sing,
La la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
Of the joy you bring,
We could make this world a flower garden,
I will take you in my arms there.
Sunflower I will take you there,
It'll be our garden, be our garden everywhere.
La la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la la oh oh oh
All the joy, all the joy you bring,
Sunflower, Sunflower makes me sing,
And if this world were a flower garden,
And your smiling face a flower living,
Sunflower with the eyes of blue,
I'd do everything just for you.

ALL IN LOVE IS FAIR

All is fair in love,
Love's a crazy game,
To people vowed to stay
In love as one, they say,
But all is changed with time,
The future none can see,
The road we leave behind,
Ahead lies mystery.

FRIENDS

It's so nice to see familiar faces
Out in the crowd,
It's so nice to see friends of mine
Enjoying themselves,
And everybody get happy, 'cause we
Can work it out.
We are friends, friends, friends.
We are friends, friends, friends.
We should have never left you.
But all is fair in love,
I toss my coin to say
In love with me you'll stay.
But all is fair in love,
To write the words again,
I could visit you at moonlight,
And your smiling face a flower living,
La la la la la la la la la la la la la... ooh-oh-oh.
In "Feeling Just the Way I Do", find a word that rhymes with whole.
In "Sunflower", find a word that rhymes with June night.
In "All in Love Is Fair", find a word that rhymes with crowd.
In "Friends", find a word that rhymes with ease.
In "Sunflower", find the antonym (opposite meaning) of sadness.
In "Feeling Just the Way I Do", find the antonym of empty.
In "All In Fair", find the antonym of past.
In "Friends", find the antonym of weak.

After each lyric, write in the song it's from. Discuss these lyrics in your group and say what you think they mean. Write about any two of them in the spaces below.

1) The road we leave behind, ahead lies mystery.
2) Feelings are getting strong, you feel like you belong.
3) We could make this world a flower garden.
4) And I know it's good for the soul.

EXPRESS YOURSELF!!! If you read something that made you think about something, write it down here.

IF THERE'S ANY TIME LEFT: Two important words in our language are friend and love. If an alien creature were to ask you what these words meant, how would you answer?
BIG YELLOW TAXI

They paved paradise and they put up a parking lot,
With a pink hotel, a boutique, and a swing hot spot.
Don't it always seem to go—
You don't know what you've got 'til it's gone.
They paved paradise and they put up a parking lot,
They paved paradise and they put up a parking lot.

They said, 'Cause you are a rambler,
And a gambler, and a sweet talking lady's man,
And you love your loving like you love your freedom.
Help me, I think I'm falling in love again,
When I get that crazy feeling,
I know I'm in trouble again,
It's LA trouble, 'cause you're a rambler,
And a gambler, and a sweet talking lady's man,
And you love your loving like you love your freedom.
Help me, I think I'm falling in love too fast,
It's got me open for the future.

Shay pave paradise and they put up a tree museum,
And they charge all the people a dollar and a half just to see 'em.
(Chorus)
Hey, farmer, farmer,
Put away that DDT now,
You may spoil some apples,
But leave me the birds and the bees.
(Chorus)

Late last night I heard that screen door slam,
And a big yellow tractor come and pushed around my house, pushed around my land.
(Chorus)
Late last night I heard that screen door slam again,
And a big yellow taxi come and took away my old man again.
(Chorus)

Courty and Spark

Look into my door, with a sleeping roll,
And a madam's soul.

He was playing on the sidewalk,
Looking for a woman to court and spark.

And you wind up cracking,
And you wind up cracking,

The love's still flowing,
If your head says forget it,
But your heart's still flowing,
Call me at the station,
The lines are open.

Help me,
Help me, I think I'm falling in love again,
When I get that crazy feeling,
I know I'm in trouble again,
It's LA trouble, 'cause you're a rambler,
And a gambler, and a sweet talking lady's man,
And you love your loving like you love your freedom.
Help me, I think I'm falling in love too fast,
Fill in the missing words from the songs.

They ___________ paradise and put up a ___________ lot.

__________ in the number who's ___________ to love you.

Help me, I think I'm ___________ in love too ___________.

So he ___________ the coins he made in ___________ Park.

In "Big Yellow Taxi", find a word that has a sound like the y in duty.
In "You Turn Me On", find a word that has a sound like the i in idea.
In "Help Me", find a word that has a sound like the first g in o'clock.
In "Court and Spark", find a word that has a sound like the a in help.

After each lyric, write in the song it's from. Discuss these lyrics in your group and say what you think they mean. Write about any two of them in the spaces below.

1) You don't know what you've got 'till it's gone.
2) I'm a wildflower waving for you.
3) And we love our loving like we love our freedom.
4) He saw me mistrusting and still acting kind.

EXPRESS YOURSELF!!! If you've heard something that made you think about something, write it down here.

IF THERE'S ANY TIME LEFT: You are a radio announcer. Tell the world what's happening today, or any other important message.
Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
In "Ob-la-di Ob-la-di", find a homonym (same sound) of carrot.
In "Rocky Raccoon", find an antonym (opposite meaning) of ice cream parlor.
In "Blackbird", find a synonym (same meaning) of ascend.
In "Revolution 1", find an antonym of terrible or lousy.
Fill in the missing words from the songs.

______ stays at home and does ________ pretty face.
________ Rocky Raccoon ________ into his room only to find ________ Bible.
________ You were only ________ for this moment to be ________.
But when you want ________ for people with minds that ________.

After each lyric, write in the song it's from. Discuss these lyrics in your group and say what you think they mean. Write about any two of them in the spaces below.

1) Desmond says to Molly—girl I like your face—and Molly says this as she takes him by the hand.
2) Well you know we'd all love to see the plan.
3) Take these broken wings and learn to fly.
4) His rival, it seems, had broken his dreams by stealing the girl of his fancy.

EXPRESS YOURSELF!!! If something you heard made you think about something, write it down here.

IF THERE'S ANY TIME LEFT: Write a story or poem that somewhere has the line in it: "Life goes on, brah."