



**WESTERN
MICHIGAN**
UNIVERSITY

The Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare

Volume 34

Issue 2 June - Special Issue on Globalization,
Social Justice & Social Welfare

Article 24

2007

*Pharmaceutical Reason: Knowledge and Value in Global
Psychiatry.* Andrew Lakoff.

Peter Manoleas

University of California at Berkeley

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw>



Part of the Social Work Commons

Recommended Citation

Manoleas, Peter (2007) "*Pharmaceutical Reason: Knowledge and Value in Global Psychiatry.* Andrew Lakoff.," *The Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*: Vol. 34 : Iss. 2 , Article 24.

Available at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw/vol34/iss2/24>

This Book Note is brought to you by the Western Michigan University School of Social Work. For more information, please contact wmu-scholarworks@wmich.edu.



Andrew Lakoff, *Pharmaceutical Reason: Knowledge and Value in Global Psychiatry*. Cambridge University Press, 2006. \$75.00 hardcover, \$29.99 papercover.

Psychiatry has often been referred to as a stepchild among medical specialties. Lower in status and financial reward than the others, it straddles the worlds of biomedicine and social science. Sigmund Freud, the presumptive grandfather of the field, revealed his training as a neurologist when he introduced his topographic model of the mind. Somehow, it has proven easier to localize the amygdala and hippocampus than the id, ego, or superego. The resultant confusion and illegitimate interchangeability of mind and brain have long outlived Freud, and form the core of ongoing controversy in the field of psychiatry. Add to this the interesting dilemmas that Eurocentric psychiatry presents in the developing world, and we have the background for Lakoff's current effort.

Using an ethnographic methodology common to anthropological fieldwork, Lakoff interviews psychiatrists, patients, pharmaceutical representatives, and intellectuals in an attempt to delineate what he sees as the two major trends in Argentine psychiatry. Biomedical psychiatry is described as targeted, scientifically verifiable, and increasingly specific as DNA is collected for genomic databases. In opposition to this, Lakoff places the Argentine tradition of Lacanian psychoanalysis. This powerful institution found its way into the country in the early 1960s at a crucial moment in the formation of the Argentine psychiatric identity. Lakoff's respondents represent this *Lacanismo* as progressive and reflective of human and individualistic values; utilizing language and the subjective as opposed to the presumed "animal" nature of biological markers. These respondents cite as evidence of their progressiveness the fact that they were repressed by the Argentine military junta during the "dirty war" of 1976-83, and were forced into clandestine meetings of their study groups. They see themselves as part of an advocacy, social, and therefore somewhat indigenous Argentine movement. Using a center-periphery paradigm, Lakoff focuses on the globalization of pharmaceutical markets and refers to the Argentine adoption of the DSM as a North American import. Indeed, there are ways in which

adoption of the DSM is a necessary precursor for expanding drug markets. Psychostimulants such as Adderall (dextroamphetamine), for example, once considered to involve too many risks to justify medical benefit, have enjoyed renewed medical legitimacy with the "discovery" of adult ADHD. While this is certainly of interest, the book does not, in any similar fashion, utilize the center-periphery paradigm for the psychoanalytic tradition imported from the capitals of Europe. This may be the book's major shortcoming.

Lakoff makes comparisons on many occasions with North American psychiatry, but fails to examine one of the more important contributions of the U.S. mental health system, namely, the consumer's movement. Such socio-political activity is dependent upon a high degree of congruence between the self-described identities of consumers and the description of them by mental health professionals. The absence of a comparable movement in Argentina may be due, in part, to the fact that a narrow Lacanian view does not afford such congruence, especially among the Indians and *mestizos* who live in large numbers outside of Buenos Aires. On balance, Lakoff's book is much more than another narrative about globalization and its discontents, and is worthwhile reading for anyone interested in psychiatry, Latino mental health, mental health policy, or the impact of globalization on national identities.

Peter Manoleas, University of California at Berkeley

Dan Zuberi, *Differences that Matter: Social Policy and the Working Poor in the United States and Canada*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2006. \$ 49.95 hardcover, \$ 18.95 papercover.

Although welfare to work has been widely claimed as a highly successful social policy innovation, most former welfare recipients have joined the ranks of working poor and the belief that they are well on the way to self-sufficiency and success has been challenged. Many scholars believe that wider social policy interventions that address the problems of low-wage work are urgently needed. Although this interesting book is not primarily concerned with welfare to work, its comparative