12-1-2001

Spanish-English Code Switching In A Bilingual Academic Context

Ruth R. Becker
University of Wisconsin-Parkside

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/reading_horizons

Part of the Education Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Special Education and Literacy Studies at ScholarWorks at WMU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Reading Horizons: A Journal of Literacy and Language Arts by an authorized editor of ScholarWorks at WMU. For more information, please contact maira.bundza@wmich.edu.
Spanish-English Code Switching
In A Bilingual Academic Context

This study investigates the Spanish-English code switching of 60 elementary Mexican-American students in a story retelling activity. The students' story retellings were examined according to Becker's (1997) model of code switching: structural linguistic, internal psycholinguistic, and external social factors. Results suggest there is a positive relationship between code-switched story retelling, oral language usage, and enhanced narrative skills. Implications suggest that teachers explore the use of code switching in a story retelling activity as a practical way to enhance bilingual elementary students' verbal skills and reading development.
CODE SWITCHING, OFTEN DISPARAGED as a mongrel mixture of languages, entails a complex rule-governed use of language (Scotton, 1993) that "offers a unique opportunity for studying some of the more complicated aspects of bilingual speech" (Dearholt & Valdes-Fallis, 1978, p. 411). Although the phenomenon of code switching has been investigated in terms of its linguistic and social dimensions (Aguirre, 1985; Gumperz, 1976; Jacobson, 1990), elementary children’s use of code switching in school settings has been little investigated (Olmedo-Williams, 1981). Furthermore, bilingual children’s code switching for specifically academic purposes has received even less attention (de Mejia, 1998).

Prior research has established a positive relationship between story telling and reading comprehension for bilingual Hispanic adolescents (Goldstein, Harris, & Klein, 1993) and between story construction, language proficiency and academic performance for elementary bilingual students (Jax, 1988). While this research supports the relationship between storytelling and literacy development for Hispanic bilingual students, it has not addressed the role and merits of code switching.

The aim of this study, therefore, was to investigate Mexican-American students’ use of code switching in an academic activity. The guiding question was: What patterns of English-Spanish language alternation did the bilingual speakers exhibit in an academic activity, specifically storytelling? The specific questions were:

1) Do students appear to use code switching as an additive academic strategy in a story retelling activity: in terms of narrative skills to develop colorful dialogue, colorful language/vocabulary, plot, and story structure?

2) Are patterns in the frequency of code switching related to language proficiency, i.e., English language proficiency, Spanish language proficiency, or both English and Spanish language proficiency?

3) Are patterns in the frequency of code switching related to fluency/word usage?
This code-switching study of story retelling may provide data relevant to educational practice. Results suggest that code-switched story retelling may be a practical way to enhance narrative skills and, hence, literacy development.

Theoretical Framework

Code switching is a phenomenon that has linguistic, psycholinguistic, and social-situational dimensions. It manifests itself intrasententially, involving the use of two languages within the same sentence, and intersententially, involving the use of alternate languages across sentences. Rather than focusing on one aspect of code-switching, Becker (1997) has proposed a syncretic model for Spanish/English bilingual code-switching based on Zentella’s (1990) categories. This model calls for examining three factors simultaneously: a) structural linguistic factors, “out of the mouth,” which stipulate that the "bilingual speaker's two monolingual grammars must be structurally compatible in order for code-switching to occur" (p. 4), b) internal psycholinguistic factors, “in the head,” which concern shifting for stylistic meaning and communicative intentions, and c) external social factors, “on the spot,” which involve items such as the respective social roles of the addresser and addressee, their language preferences and competencies, and the setting. Becker's model appears to have considerable robustness and will provide the theoretical perspective for this study.

With respect to code switching, questions about the bilingual speaker’s language proficiency in each of the two monolingual language systems have led to research in this area. Aguirre (1985) questioned balanced bilinguals (speakers with equal proficiency in both Spanish and English), dominant Spanish, and dominant English speakers to determine the acceptability of grammatical and non-grammatical code-switched sentences. He found that balanced bilinguals were more accurate in their acceptability responses for grammatical items than the language-dominant speakers. He concluded that “code alternation is a verbal strategy available only to fairly proficient bilinguals” (p. 75). On the other hand, Shin and Milroy (2000) argue against the value and validity of notions such as the “ideal bilingual” and “balanced bilingualism.” They maintain that “such thinking appears to derive from political and
cultural ideology rather than from linguistic evidence” and “it often develops into full fledged theories which have serious practical consequences” (p. 352). Questions regarding the relative language proficiency of elementary children who code switch in the classroom remain open to investigation.

Two recent classroom studies have addressed code switching and story telling. De Mejia (1998) investigated two Colombian preschool teachers’ use of code switching in storytelling sessions. She found that “dramatic effects can be further heightened by the skillful combining of narrative monologue, character dialogue and interactive teacher-pupil sequences, and change of language, or code switching, in the case of bilingual contexts” (p. 5). Her research suggests that preschool teachers’ code-switched story telling with student interaction can facilitate comprehension and narrative skill development that are critical to school-related activities associated with literacy development.

Shin and Milroy (2000) investigated code switching as a contextual cue in the sequential development of conversational interaction among elementary Korean-English children in classroom activities including story telling. Their research suggests that the students’ use of code switching, frequently misperceived as a deficit, appeared to be an additional resource to achieve particular linguistic goals: to accommodate other participants’ language competencies and preferences, for example, or to organize conversational tasks such as turn-taking, emphasis marking, and clarification.

Additional areas of interest that motivated this study were the relationships of narrative skills and vocabulary skills to literacy development, specifically, reading proficiency. Roth and Speece (1996) found strong support for a correlation between students’ ability to use narrative discourse and early reading; however, only limited research studies met their standards for rigorous research. “With respect to the relation between narrative discourse and reading, the available evidence is convincing but limited. Only three studies were identified, but it may be that our requirement that studies measure a reading variable limited our search” (p. 2). In the area of vocabulary skills and reading, Spanish-English bilingual students’ English reading performance was
significantly related to knowledge of the word in Spanish (Nagy, Garcia, Durgunoglu, Hancin-Bhatt, 1993). Their findings suggest "that Hispanic bilingual, biliterate students can transfer vocabulary knowledge gained in Spanish to their English reading when they know the Spanish word and recognize the English word as a cognate" (p. 254).

This study will explore the merits of elementary bilingual students’ use of code switching in the academic activity of story retelling and the issue of dual language proficiency in code switching.

Method

Participants and Setting

There were 60 Mexican-American participants in this study who were selected from a bilingual program in a year-round elementary school in southeastern Wisconsin. The participants, 24 females and 36 males, ranged in age from 6 to 11. Four groups of 15 students were chosen based on their composite Oral/Reading/Writing fall scores on the English Language Assessment Scales (LAS). The LAS (De Avila & Duncan, 1994) are the standard assessment tools used by the school district to determine language proficiency. The groups were: 1) low English proficiency/1st-2nd graders, 2) intermediate English proficiency/1st-2nd graders, 3) low English proficiency/3rd-5th graders, and 4) intermediate English proficiency/3rd-5th graders.

The participants were enrolled in a transitional bilingual program whose language policy is to encourage students to speak English as quickly as possible. At the beginning of the year, the classroom teachers, who can speak both English and Spanish, provide some instruction in Spanish. As the year progresses most of the instruction is in English. Throughout the year, the Mexican-American bilingual aide provides instruction in Spanish when considered beneficial for the students. Students are permitted to speak Spanish when talking in small groups.

For this study, each student was examined on an individual basis in a small room that was apart from the classroom. Students were encouraged to feel comfortable when providing their responses. The
students were told that they were helping with a project and that there were no right or wrong answers. Generally, the students waved their hands enthusiastically to volunteer to participate in the project when a research assistant came to the classroom. If a student expressed reluctance in participating, he/she was not included in the project.

**Instruments and Procedures**

English and Spanish LAS were administered to the participants during the spring-summer session to determine their current oral English and Spanish language proficiency. The Oral component was administered to all 60 participants, and the Reading and Writing components, intended for students in grades 2nd-5th, were administered to the 2nd-5th grade participants. The English LAS were conducted by Native-English speakers and the Spanish LAS were conducted by bilingual Mexican-American speakers.

The English and Spanish Oral and Reading-Writing LAS were assessed on a 5-point scale by the bilingual evaluator for the school district and by the researcher according to the LAS scoring manual (De Avila & Duncan, 1994). The English and Spanish Oral LAS tests are an index of students' skills in vocabulary, listening comprehension, and story retelling, while the English and Spanish Reading and Writing LAS tests are an index of students' skills in reading comprehension and writing. For this study, the participants' English and Spanish Oral LAS scores will be referred to as their English Language Proficiency (ELP) and Spanish Language Proficiency (SLP). Low scores range from 1-2, intermediate scores range from 3-4, and 5 is a high score.

The major part of the study involved the Story Retellings. The story selected for the retelling is a Mexican folktale in the trickster tradition. A little lamb, the borreguita, tricks the coyote into thinking that cheese is better to eat than lamb. She entices the coyote to a pond where she encourages the coyote to swim to the cheese. The coyote, almost drowning, realizes that the cheese is the reflection of the moon on the water and that the lamb has tricked him. He goes away, leaving the lamb in peace.
Individual participants listened to a taped version of Borreguita and the Coyote (Aardema, 1991) narrated in English and Borreguita y el coyote (Aardema, 1993) narrated in Spanish by the researcher and native-English and bilingual assistants. In both narrations, one of the characters (the lamb or the coyote) spoke in English and one in Spanish. Thus, the tapes modeled the use of language switching. The students looked at the illustrations while listening to the story. Then, the students were given directions in both English and Spanish about story retelling. They were told to retell the story in English, in Spanish, or in both English and Spanish, whatever the student preferred. The students were allowed to turn the pages and look at the illustrations as a visual aid while retelling the story. Each child’s retelling of the Borreguita and the Coyote was recorded.

The story retellings were administered by a bilingual Mexican-American speaker who used English-Spanish code-switched speech while accompanying students to and from the classroom, giving directions for the story retelling, and providing simple prompts during students’ pauses, such as “yes,” “sí,” or “What happened next?” “Y qué más?”

The students’ audiotapes of the story retellings of the Borreguita and the Coyote were transcribed. The story retellings were examined according to Becker’s (1997) categories of structural linguistic, psycholinguistic, and external social factors in Spanish/English bilingual code switching and in terms of narrative elements.

The students’ audiotapes of the story retellings of the Borreguita and the Coyote were analyzed for structural linguistic data according to the number of Switches from language to language, the total number of Words, the number of Spanish Words, and the number of English Words. Data were entered for the students’ grade level, and ELP and SLP as determined by their Oral LAS scores. These measures are indicators of the amount of switches, the student’s grade level, ELP, SLP, the students’ fluency in the retelling, and the language dominance in the retelling.
Additionally, code switching patterns in the story retellings were examined, when applicable, in terms of psycholinguistic factors. Some of the psycholinguistic factors upon which code switching choices may be based include: a) frequency of exposure, that is, some terms are more familiar in a particular language; b) cultural untranslatability, certain expressions have no direct translation; c) emphasis, changing to another language as a "signal issued by the speaker to the hearer to search for additional meaning" (Fina, 1989, 120); d) mode/topic shift, bilingual code switching can be used as a strategy to indicate a shift in discourse modes, for example, from dialogue to description; e) personalization/objectivization, Spanish tends to be the "we" personal code and English the "they" more objective code, thus the speaker may code switch to signal personalization or objectivization of the message.

External social factors, the third component of Becker's model, were also considered as factors in the study design in order to elicit code switching. The following characteristics of the setting and participants contribute to an environment conducive to code switching: the physical characteristics of the addressee, the language proficiency and preference of the addressee, the speaker's role relative to addressee, a sequential response to prior code switching, and an atmosphere where code switching is encouraged (Becker, 1997). Keeping these factors in mind, bilingual Mexican-American research assistants conducted the Spanish LAS and the story retellings because of their physical and linguistic resemblance to the participants. In other words, they spoke a similar Mexican dialect and appeared non-threatening, thus encouraging an informal code-switched interchange with a non-authority figure. Moreover, although the school classrooms had an English-dominant orientation, the small room allocated for this study allowed the student to choose in what language(s) to retell the story.

Because the primary focus of this study was to examine code switching in an academic context, the story retellings were analyzed according to their narrative elements. The narrative elements coding scheme was adapted from story telling coding schemes developed by Goldstein, Harris, and Klein (1993) and Jax (1988). The narrative categories included: Colorful Dialogue, Colorful Language, Plot, Story Structure, and Fluency. The story retellings were coded by the
researcher and a Spanish-speaking authority on code switching according to the five narrative categories along a 4-point scale. (See Table 1)

Table 1. Narrative Elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score Value</th>
<th>Colorful Dialogue</th>
<th>Colorful Language</th>
<th>Plot</th>
<th>Story Structure</th>
<th>Fluency Words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>[CL]</td>
<td></td>
<td>Beginning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Middle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>End</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(BME)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>No quotes</td>
<td>No CL</td>
<td>Trick not explained</td>
<td>No BME</td>
<td>0-100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Quotes both characters/identifies characters</td>
<td>Colorful Adjectives, Verbs—gritar [shout]</td>
<td>Explain trick, water-cheese, give several episodes</td>
<td>B-señor, both characters No Middle Ending</td>
<td>100-172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>“Auuu”, growl Vivid vocabulary in dialogue Interchange @ cheese</td>
<td>Emotions Descriptive phrases</td>
<td>Explain trick: moon substitute for cheese, Build suspense</td>
<td>Set scene-B Middle marker Ending</td>
<td>172-272 (172 is mean number of words)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Drama of characters Use Switch for drama Much colorful dialogue/interchange</td>
<td>Sounds- [of water] Use voice Many descriptive vivid phrases, metaphors</td>
<td>Build suspense toward climax, ending</td>
<td>B, M, E Develop multiple scenes</td>
<td>272+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Colorful Dialogue category ranged from low—no use of quotation and dialogue—to high, where the characters’ dialogue was dramatic, often with characteristic phrasing for each character, lively
interchange between characters developed through the dialogue, and code switching to emphasize a switch between characters. The Colorful Language category ranged from bland phrases or sentences with no use of adjectives or adverbs to vivid phrases, metaphors, and descriptive elements such as sound effects (i.e., water swishing).

The Plot category ranged from not explaining the pivotal motif of the plot, that is, not explaining the lamb’s trick on the coyote, to building suspense toward the climax where the coyote realized he had been tricked and the ending where the coyote went away. In the Story Structure category, the range varied from no beginning, middle, or ending in the retelling to fully developed beginning, middle marker, and ending with multiple scenes. The Fluency category consisted of a low of 0–100 words in the retelling, to a high of 272+ words, with category 3 as the mean level.

Examples

Two story retellings will be presented to illustrate a student’s effective story retelling with multiple code switches and a student’s less effective story retelling with few code switches. Carlos’ effective narrative had 8 language switches which he used to develop colorful dialogue, colorful language, plot, and story structure, see Carlos’ transcript. He is a 2nd grade student who exhibits intermediate ELP 3/SLP 4. His story retelling had 203 words (rated as 3), with 132 Spanish and 71 English words.

Carlos’ retelling of Borreguita and the coyote

Había un farmero que tenía una borreguita and he called it a lamb. He tied him up in a stick y después vino un coyote y dijo “Grrrrr! Borreguita estas bien rica!”
“No me comes! No me comes!” (high voice)
“Por que no?”
“No estoy gordita, debo de comer todo ya. Esta mañana me ves,” (high voice).
“OK. Grrrrr! Mañana te veo.” Hijole como se va a poner gordita esa “Grrrrr!”
Carlos employed language switches as he developed colorful dialogue. He opened the story in Spanish and then switched to English to explain the term “borreguita.” The next switch [to Spanish] appears to be a topic shift where he emphasizes the beginning of the plot—a coyote came up to the lamb and growled at him. In the ensuing dialogue between the lamb and coyote, Carlos adopts a low snarling voice for the coyote and a high squeaky voice for the little lamb.

Carlos next switches to English to emphasize a topic shift and plot development. This section of the story involves the trick where the borreguita is going to entice the coyote to the lake in hopes of eating cheese (which is actually the reflection of the moon on the water). The coyote here questions in English while the borreguita answers in Spanish. The code switches are used for stylistic purposes to develop colorful dialogue. He is using language switches for characterization; the switches are part of the drama.

Carlos again switches to Spanish for stylistic purposes to signal plot development and characterization. The characters are now at the lake and the coyote warns the lamb not to play a trick on him again, “No me hagas un truco esta vez.” Carlos again switches to English to emphasize a key point in the plot: the coyote opens his mouth and instead of
cheese, he has a lot of water. Carlos switches to Spanish to signal the ending of the story.

Carlos used code switching to develop colorful language throughout the narrative. He used the rhythm and phrasing of each language for literary effect. He used parallel construction in Spanish in the following examples, “y nadó y nadó,” and “más y más,” to emphasize the rhythm. His phrase in English, “When the moon is high,” has a melodic cadence. He also used code switching for phrases of cultural untranslatability, for example, “bien rica,” (meaning tasty rather than rich) “hijole,” (a contemporary Mexican phrase). Rather than using code switching as a deficit to retrieve an unknown lexical item, Carlos showed dual language proficiency by switching between English and Spanish vocabulary, for example, “cheese” and “queso,” “borreguita” and “lamb,” “moon” and “la luna.”

Carlos employed code switching as an additive resource in discourse marking, that is, emphasizing the structural organization of the discourse, and narrative construction. The code switching appeared to be a stylistic device that he used to develop characterization in the dialogue, colorful language, plot, and story structure. Overall, Carlos appeared to use code switching to give zest in his retelling, that is, for emphasis and to cue the listener to search for additional nuance (Fina, 1989).

In his less effective story retelling, Kevin code switched infrequently, three switches, and utilized code switching for limited purposes, that is, highlighting the story structure, see Kevin’s transcript. He is a 2nd grade student who exhibits intermediate ELP 4/low SLP 2. His story retelling had 229 words (rated as 3), with 219 Spanish and 10 English words.

Kevin’s retelling of Borreguita and the coyote

Había unos muchachos que tenían una borreguita y vivían en una casa chiquita y luego el muchacho puso la amarraron la borreguita en.

Y luego vino un coyote y dijo, “Y te voy a comer.” Luego la borreguita dijo que, “No me puedes comer todavía. Déjame comer todo
el zacate que hay aquí y luego ya me puedo dejar comer.” Y luego el coyote dijo, “Está bien, regreso cuando estés más gordita.”

Then la borreguita dijo, el coyote dijo que “Ya estás más gorda ya te voy a comer ahora mismo.”

Y luego el coyote se fue, nadó y mordió el queso y le puso agua primero en toda su boca llena y luego se andaba ahogando y luego se fue pa’afuera y luego se secó y luego dijo que la borreguita lo trickó. When he reached it, the little lamb was gone. Y luego el dijo, “Auuuu!”

As can be seen in Kevin’s retelling, his narrative is flat, mainly listing the events in a sequential fashion. The narrative does not develop colorful dialogue or use colorful language. Though he uses code switching sparingly, he does not appear to use it haphazardly. Rather, Kevin appears to use code switching as a discourse element to signal story structure. He opens the story in Spanish, switches to English for one word, and then switches back to Spanish. He introduces the middle part of the narrative with “Then,” emphasizing that this is the point where the coyote comes back to eat the borreguita.

Near the end of the narrative, he switches to English for one sentence, and then switches back to Spanish. He precedes the sentence with trickó, the word stem “trick” in English and the Spanish marker for past tense “ó,” thus, using word play with both languages for emphasis. The code-switched English sentence marks the turning point in the plot where the coyote realizes he has been tricked. The coyote arrives at the shore, and the little lamb has gone.

Data Analysis

Pearson r coefficients were used to determine the relationship between the following variables: 1) the number of Switches from language to language, 2) the Grade level, 3) ELP, 4) SLP, 5) the total number of Words, 6) the number of Spanish Words, 7) the number of English Words, and the Narrative Elements in the story retellings, 8) Colorful Dialogue, 9) Colorful Language, 10) Plot, 11) Story Structure, and 12) Fluency.
Results

The results of the study indicated that code switches (English-Spanish, Spanish-English) in the 60 students' story retellings are positively correlated with variables related to enhanced narrative skills, that is, Colorful Dialogue ($r = .38, p < .01$), Colorful Language ($r = .43, p = < .001$), Plot Development ($r = .35, p < .01$), Story Structure ($r = .43, p = .001$), and Words ($r = .37, p = .01$). These results indicate that the use of language switches was associated with verbal fluency and literary skills.

Code switching did not appear to be related to ELP, SLP, or both the English and Spanish language proficiency of the 60 elementary Mexican-American bilingual participants. Furthermore, code switching did not appear to be related to grade level or by group: low and intermediate English proficiency 1st-2nd graders, low and intermediate English proficiency 3rd-5th graders.

The mean number of switches was 8 and the range was from 0-34. At the low end of the range with 0 switches, a grade 1 male student with ELP 3/SLP 4 produced his story retelling all in English, and a grade 1 female student with ELP 3/SLP 1 produced her story retelling all in Spanish. The high end of the range was 34 switches produced by a grade 4-5 male student with ELP 4/SLP 5. Three students in grade 2 with similar ELP/SLP exhibited different frequencies of switches: a female student with ELP 1/SLP 5 produced 4 switches, a male student ELP 1/SLP 5 produced 33 switches, and a female student ELP 1/SLP 5 produced 14 switches. Overall, there did not appear to be any pattern of bilingual proficiency that related to amount of code switching. Moreover, balanced bilinguals did not produce any particular patterns of code switching.

Conclusion and Discussion

Although prior code-switching studies have examined syntactic processes and communicative functions, this study focused on children's use of code switching for academic purposes. By understanding students' use of code switching in an academic context, we may be able to enhance their linguistic diversity and literacy development. Academic
areas in which this knowledge plays an important role are English-Spanish vocabulary development and reading comprehension (García, 1998; Nagy, García, Durgunoglu, & Hancitt-Bhatt, 1993). Reading comprehension research for second language learners suggests that children who have a large vocabulary possess multiple meanings for a vocabulary item, and when they encounter a word in a context, they are then able to select the appropriate meaning (Qian, 1999). Students, thus, have greater possibility of higher reading comprehension than students who do not have access to multiple word meanings. Using code switching might provide students with strategies to access multiple meanings for lexical items across both languages.

Results from this study suggest that there is a positive relationship between code-switched story retelling, oral language usage, and enhanced narrative skills. The narrative skills that oral story retelling provides are consistent with attributes of written text, discourse structure awareness, characterization, and thematic development. Code-switched story retelling, moreover, provides students the opportunity to gain experience with the linguistic, psycholinguistic, and social-communicative aspects of two languages and to signal meaning by shifts in language. Code-switched story retelling appears to be an untapped resource. Teachers should perhaps consider code switching as a viable academic phenomenon and explore ways for bilingual students to use this activity to enhance verbal skills and reading development.

References


*Ruth R. Becker is a faculty member at the University of Wisconsin-Parkside, Kenosha, Wisconsin.*