Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare

Vol. IX No. 1 March 1982

Editorial

BOB LEIGHNINGER

Call for Papers

A Composite Model for Interorganizational Strategies

DONALD E. HAYFOLE

Comparing Employed and Unemployed Welfare Recipients: A Discriminant Analysis

ROCKY L. GLASS

The Utilization of a Performance Based Curriculum Design in Graduate Social Work Education

GUST WILLIAM MITCHELL

Inside and Outside the For-Profit Nursing Home: Some External Determinants of Inside Power Relations

CSMINIC BIRKING

Solving the Effectiveness Dilemma: How Can an Informal Network Create Change?

ROBERT W. COLEMAN

MARK BARTON

Regional Reference Groups in the Spreading of Occupational Licensing Policies Among the States: An Exploratory Study

TIMOTHY W. LAUSE

Rejected Families: Established and Innovative Structures of Service

JOSEPH H. STEINER

Program in Social Work with Groups: A Jungian Perspective

RICHARD BERNER-ZEIG


The Journal originated with the Division of Sociology and Social Welfare of the Society for the Study of Social Problems.
Editorial

BOB LEIGHNINGER

Call For Papers

A Composite Model for Interorganizational Strategies

DONALD E. MAYPOLE

Comparing Employed and Unemployed Welfare Recipients: A Discriminant Analysis

BECKY L. GLASS

The Utilization of a Performance Based Curriculum Design in Graduate Social Work Education

GUST WILLIAM MITCHELL

Inside and Outside the For-profit Nursing Home: Some External Determinants of Inside Power Relations

CEDRIC HERRING

Solving the Effectiveness Dilemma: How Can An Informal Network Create Change?

ROBERT W. COLEMAN

MARK BANTON

Regional Reference Groups in the Spreading of Occupational Licensing Policies Among the States: An Exploratory Study

TIMOTHY W. LAUSE

Rejected Families: Established and Innovative Structures of Service

JOSEPH R. STEINER

Program in Social work with Groups: A Jungian Perspective

HERMAN BORENZWEIG
Community Representation and Empowerment in Long Term Care Settings: The Case of The Nursing Home Patient Ombudsman
ABRAHAM MONK
LENARD W. KAYE

Meaning in Work: Toward a Clinical Approach to Work Dissatisfaction
SHIMSHON M. NEIKRUG

A Qualitative Look at Black Female Social Work Educators
LARRY DAVIS
RAMON CARTWRIGHT
PHYLLIS FREEMAN
LOUIS CARTER

In Judgement of Victims: A Social Context of Rape
JOYCE E. WILLIAMS
KAREN A. HOLMES

Definitional Dilemmas and the Baccalaureate Generalist
FRANK R. BASKIND
EDITORIAL

Those of you who keep an eye on the inside of the front cover have noticed some changes in the Editorial Board. Patricia Ann Brown, John Else, and Len Rutman have asked for relief after long years of service to the Journal. Their efforts as reviewers and their support in establishing the Journal are sincerely appreciated by all of us who work with it and read it.

Newcomers to the Editorial Board include Kristine Nelson of the University of Iowa, Dennis Peck of the University of Alabama, and Jane Pfouts from the University of North Carolina. Their names did not appear during Volume 8, but I can assure you they were hard at work.

You will also notice a new category of names: Editorial Consultants. These are people from the School of Social Work or the Department of Sociology at Western Michigan University who are helping me improve service to authors. When a manuscript or review is lost in the mail or when a third (or fourth) opinion is needed, I can turn to them for a quick but thoughtful review and not waste further time on an exchange or mail. They are not voting members of the Board and their terms of service will expire when mine does. Collectively, their range of interests, training, and experience is comprehensive enough to guarantee me an informed opinion on most any topic that is likely to appear in a manuscript. I'm very pleased to have their support.

Another name that should have appeared on the cover but has not until now is Ed Resch. Ed is the designer of the cover for Vols. 8 & 9. He is working on a new one for Vol. 10. I don't know what he'll come up with, but I'm hoping for some signs in 1983 that American society can break out of the box.

Bob Leighninger
CALL FOR PAPERS

The Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare is planning a special issue on STATE AND REGIONAL POLITICS. Knowledge of reform and policymaking in these arenas is an especially timely concern, given the current revival of traditional views of federalism and social welfare. Yet, it would be mistaken to regard state politics and regionalism as captive themes of regressive ideologies or movements. State and regional dynamics are likely to influence the quality of life and many fields of social services well into the next century, even if current schemes of a "new federalism" prove to be short-lived or superficial. We would be particularly interested in:

1. Studies or major integrative reviews of the literature which contribute to an understanding of policymaking or program innovation at the state level. This category includes articles which focus on aspects neglected in general models of policymaking and features seldom found in the environment of government at other levels.

2. Research and theory-building articles which explore the nature of regional differences or the implications of regionalism for general social change, state-level policy decisions, or social work priorities in one or more fields of social welfare.

3. Analyses of contemporary issues or future studies which explore the role of the states and/or regions in one or more fields of social service or in relation to one or more disadvantaged/oppressed populations.

4. Assessments of political agendas, strategies, and tactics in social work action to influence state policy.

Each category is open to qualitative and quantitative approaches, diverse methodologies, and diverse forms of operationalization.

This is the first issue of any professional journal to focus exclusively on the arenas of public action which lie between the Federal and local governments. We hope it will fill important gaps in social work literature and pose new challenges to social work research, theory, and social action.

Preliminary inquiries are welcome.

Send three copies of manuscripts to: Tim Lause
Department of Sociology & Social Work
Wichita State University
Wichita, KS 67208

Deadline for submission is December 31, 1982.
CALL FOR PAPERS

The Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare is planning a special issue on STATE AND REGIONAL POLITICS. Knowledge of reform and policymaking in these arenas is an especially timely concern, given the current revival of traditional views of federalism and social welfare. Yet, it would be mistaken to regard state politics and regionalism as captive themes of regressive ideologies or movements. State and regional dynamics are likely to influence the quality of life and many fields of social services well into the next century, even if current schemes of a "new federalism" prove to be short-lived or superficial. We would be particularly interested in:

1. Studies or major integrative reviews of the literature which contribute to an understanding of policymaking or program innovation at the state level. This category includes articles which focus on aspects neglected in general models of policymaking and features seldom found in the environment of government at other levels.

2. Research and theory-building articles which explore the nature of regional differences or the implications of regionalism for general social change, state-level policy decisions, or social welfare priorities in one or more fields of social welfare.

3. Analyses of contemporary issues or future studies which explore the role of the states and/or regions in one or more fields of social service or in relation to one or more disadvantaged/oppressed populations.

4. Assessments of political agendas, strategies, and tactics in social work action to influence state policy.

Each category is open to qualitative and quantitative approaches, diverse methodologies, and diverse forms of operationalization.

This is the first issue of any professional journal to focus exclusively on the arenas of public action which lie between the Federal and local governments. We hope it will fill important gaps in social work literature and pose new challenges to social work research, theory, and social action.

Preliminary inquiries are welcome.

Send three copies of manuscripts to: Tim Lause
Department of Sociology & Social Work
Wichita State University
Wichita, KS 67208

Deadline for submission is December 31, 1982.

---

CALL FOR PAPERS:
Preparing Critical Social Workers:
Pedagogy and Substance

The Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare is preparing an issue on teaching methods and curriculum content believed important for developing social workers committed to a humane transformation of American society. The editors are interested in papers treating all components of the curriculum including practice methods, field work, human behavior and the social environment, social welfare policy and services and research. They are also interested in giving as much space to papers on teaching methods as on content areas. Papers may be conceptual or hand-on research.

Please send three (3) copies to either editor.
Deadline for submitting papers is December 31, 1982.

Co-editors: John Longres
School of Social Work
Portland State University
Portland, Oregon

Arthur J. Cox
Dept. of Social Work
East Tennessee State University
P.O. Box 218504
Johnson City, Tennessee 37614
This article integrates general systems, exchange and contingency theories into a process model for determining appropriate interorganizational strategies to achieve goals. The author suggests that the interorganizational power-dependence ratio is one of the frequently overlooked but major determining factors in interorganizational relations and goal attainment.

The need for social workers to have increased theoretical knowledge of interorganizational behavior has become apparent over the last few years. This awareness has been reflected in the professional literature, which has seen slowly increasing attention paid to interorganizational relations, both in theories and research. Writers, such as Specht, Bisno, Cox et al., Hasenfeld and Thompson have studied or described various interorganizational strategies. However, the construction of a composite model which links contingency, general systems and exchange theoretical concepts into an overall, prescriptive process has still been limited. As Young states, "Although little attempt has been made to apply contingency theory to human services agencies, its application has the potential to provide some valuable insights."

Accordingly, the purpose of this paper is to propose a composite interorganizational strategy model, based on the power-dependence contingency model, which could assist social workers in choosing appropriate strategies to meet program maintenance or expansion goals.

When the community is conceptualized as a power-politics arena, it can be surmised that the massive cutbacks in social program funding by the Reagan Administration may create an environment of great uncertainty and competition for funds. The need for social workers to exercise power strategies to maintain client services will continue to increase. The major contribution of this model is to synthesize and integrate several different theoretical formulations into a meaningful whole. The resulting composite model can be used as a process guide by practicing social workers. A brief description of the theories used to construct the model will be followed by a discussion of the model itself.
A recent author, Hall, defined an organization as:

- a collectivity with a relatively identifiable boundary, a normative order, authority ranks, communication systems, and membership coordination systems; this collectivity exists on a relatively continuous basis in an environment and engages in activities that are usually related to a goal or a set of goals.³

Although this definition is somewhat complicated, it acknowledges the importance of the environment and goal-directed behavior to human services organizations. A focus on interactions with the environment is one of the primary features of systems and exchange theories and is the foundation of contingency theory.

THEORETICAL APPROACHES

General Systems

Systems theory regards the system as a natural whole, with interdependent parts, which adapts to internal and external stresses and strains to maintain an inner and outer equilibrium. Formal goals are important, but they must be compatible with organizational survival. Von Bertalanffy formulated the transport of energy equation of inputs, conversion and outputs and the importance of feedback for systems maintenance and modifications.⁴ Jacobs asserted that in order to accomplish its production cycle, the formal organization was dependent on its environment at several points, inputs, outputs and resource acquisition.⁵ The three stage transport equation has been widely applied to social work client, family, group, research and administrative endeavors and is the base for the model under study.⁶ Ashby described cybernetics as an information processing activity, which includes the feedback loop.⁷

Exchange

Joining exchange theory with open systems theory is particularly appropriate in the study of interorganizational relationships. Two of the more noted publications on exchange theory were written by Blau, and Levine and White. Blau, writing on relationships between individuals and groups stated that:

- Social exchange, broadly defined can be considered to underlie relations between groups, as well as between individuals; both differentiation of power and peer group ties; conflicts between opposing forces as well as cooperation.⁸

The exchange had to be reciprocal and to provide benefits to both parties. The units of exchange could be tangible, e.g., money, or intangible, e.g., feelings of gratitude. Parties in the exchange are concerned about receiving the reward dispensed by the others. Although exchanges may be between equals, an inequality may develop, in that one person or group may possess more highly valued resources than the other. The person with the most highly valued resources has potential power in regard to the other, since he/she can make the distribution of resources contingent on compliance by the other. The other person, with less highly valued resources, will be dependent on the other person if he or she needs the resources and can't get them elsewhere.
Levine and White used exchange theory to describe the relationships between work organizations. They defined exchange as "any voluntary activity between two organizations which has consequences, actual or anticipated, for the realization of their respective goal or objectives." For an agency to achieve its own objectives, it had to possess or control three elements—clients, labor services and resources other than labor. Since an agency seldom has all required resources, it must exchange resources with other environmental elements to attain its goals. Within the concept of exchange, the organization will seek to acquire more highly valued resources than it will cede away. This intrinsic drive functions as the cornerstone of the model proposed in this article.

Contingency

Although the theory of contingencies is sometimes interpreted as prescribing that organizations and social workers can do anything they want, in its true meaning, one's (or an organization's) behavior depends on the internal and external factors impinging on the goal attainment process. Decision-making in strategy selection processes will vary among contexts, as a reflection of the fact that the contexts will be different. As a power-politics arena, the community must be viewed as composed of various forces and groups (such as other agencies), which have impacts on the internal operations of human services agencies.

STRATEGY MODEL

Stage 1 of the Strategy Model, concerned with problem definition, is shown in Figure 1.

![Figure 1. Stage 1 processes.](#)
posits a relationship between components of a system, so that a change in one affects others. Since the agencies, funders, regulators and client systems in a given service delivery system are related, changes in any part of the service delivery system could have a positive or negative effect on the other parts.

Problems are usually considered to be questions, unmet needs or sources of complexity. Are there service delivery system deficits, such as no alcoholic half-way house, in a certain community? If federal funding for an agency is cut back, what range of strategies would be available to its board and administrators to accept or offset the reduced funding? In the former case, a human services domain expansion would be sought. In the latter case, a goal of program maintenance or contraction would be sought.

Although it would be idealistic to believe that all facets of a problem could be known, the importance of gathering as much information as possible cannot be overstressed. The compilations and interpretations of "intelligence" data are the foundations for all subsequent goal and strategy selections and implementations. Cost, of course, is a limiting factor.

When the problem dimensions and key aspects of the power-politics community have been identified, it will be necessary for the focal agency to assess its relative power-dependence relationships with the pertinent environmental actors (organizations or groups). To assist in this, it is necessary to define the salient concepts of power and dependence.

1. POWER

Power is an aspect of relationships between two or more social actors. Emerson stated that power resides "implicitly in the other's dependency... A depends upon B if he aspires to goals... whose achievement is facilitated by appropriate actions on B's part. The power to control or influence the other resides in control over the things he values, which may range all the way from oil resources to ego-support..." 14 Although not specifically stated by Schmidt and Kochan, 15 a possible definition could be inferred from their work: power lies in the ability to block resource acquisition and/or goal attainment activities of another. Other writers have emphasized the value and scarcity of resources and the ability of the powerful organization to use resources as rewards.

2. DEPENDENCE

Blau stated that, "If a person regularly renders needed services to another which the other cannot readily obtain elsewhere, the other becomes dependent on and obligated to the first person for his services." 16 Jacobs felt that there were two necessary conditions for the development of a dependent relationship, the essentiality of the item received and the availability of the item from other sources. 17

These definitions make it clear that the dependent agencies lack resources of their own. Their inability to secure resources elsewhere forces them into subordinate, obligated positions to other organizations or groups. Resources may include money, manpower, equipment/supplies, physical plant, information, clients, and political support.
The definitions of power and dependence entail the general hypothesis that power and dependence are inversely related. Both definitions center around the control and allocation of one's resources and the resources of others. Whether the organization's environmental problem-solving activities are imposed or self-initiated in nature, an assessment of power-dependence relationships with each of the pertinent environmental actors (organizations or groups) is very useful.

Agencies have four possible power relationships with others:
1. High, balanced power
2. Low, balanced power
3. Unbalanced power favoring the organization
4. Unbalanced power favoring an environmental organization.

In the first alternative, both agencies have full and equal access to their own resources and are not dependent on each other. In the second, each equally has limited access to its resources and is not dependent on the other. In the state of unbalanced power favoring the focal organization, the focal agency has access to its own resources and the other agency is dependent on it. In the last, the situation is reversed.

In either high or low balanced power situations, Behling and Schriesheim suggest that cooperative strategies be adopted. Either of these strategies will entail communications between the focal organization and other elements, which should serve to reduce uncertainties in the relationships, as well as the anxieties of the involved people. The negotiations might involve some small loss of autonomy, but the mutual meeting of objectives should have payoffs to offset the loss. The situation of unbalanced power, which favors the focal organization, would be optimum. With adequate control over its own resources and with the other organization's being dependent on it, it has the flexibility to adopt any strategy it chooses. But, in the real world, selection of conflict strategies may influence access to resources and cooperation in the future. If the state of unbalanced power favors the other organization, the focal organization is faced with the worst of all possible situations. Its strategy selections will be severely limited.

The above discussion was built around a dyadic relationship between two organizations. Although such relationships are important, generally each agency is involved in a network of vertical and horizontal organizational relationships. This has both positive and negative effects. If the focal organization is attempting to expand its domain, weaker opposing agencies may form a coalition, with a resultant power greater than that of the focal organization, thereby successfully resisting it. If a stronger organization is aggressing against the focal one, the focal one may seek a coalition with others, to enhance its own power.

Goals
Etzioni defined goals as "a desired state of affairs which the organization attempts to realize." Levine and White referred to goals or objectives as "defining the organization's ideal need for . . . consumers, labor services and other resources." Because of scarcity of resources, interorganizational exchanges are mandatory antecedents to goal attainment. The writer synthesizes these into
defining the main agency goal as seeking control over its own resources, which involves both task and survival activities. Accordingly, resource acquisition relates both to continuing the organization and to meeting such manifest agency tasks as serving clients.

As communities are political arenas, so are the agencies in which we work. Gummer has described the competition amongst various coalitions within agencies to control the agency by controlling resources. He asserts that agency goals evolve from power struggles. The goals may be set by outside funders and regulators, boards of directors, administrators, staff, clients, other agencies, or coalitions within or among each. Except for consumer-representative organizations, such as associations for retarded citizens, the clients of agencies have usually had the least voice in setting agency goals, especially in public agencies. Outside funders (such as county boards or United Way boards) and regulators (such as Joint Commission on the Accreditation of Hospitals) may feel less compelled to ensure agency survival than boards, staff or clients. Moreover, the goals of each group or coalition may at times be competitive (and thereby mutually exclusive) and at times complementary. However, at any point in time one coalition's goals are usually dominant.

In contrast to business organizations, in which the goal is clearly to maximize profits, there is no such simplistic goal in public or private human services agencies. Disregarding the latent (and at times, manifest) survival goal, the goal of agencies has generally been viewed as to provide the maximum services at the lowest cost. However, without adequate cost efficiency/effectiveness evaluations, many agencies have had difficulty in showing progress toward this goal.

Strategies follow goals. If the survival goal is threatened by external forces, then a particular strategy might be adopted; if a task goal is paramount, then an entirely different strategy might be adopted. Since maintenance or changes in organization domain and resource acquisition are important to an organization and its clients, specific strategies must be chosen to maximize the probability of their attainment. At the same time, organizations should seek to minimize the possible cost and penalties of conflict and counter-productive use of resources.

The suitability of each of the three main strategies—cooperation, competition and conflict—should be related to the organization's goals, with the one chosen based on the previously discussed power-dependence assessments and their respective probabilities of success.

Strategy Selection and Implementation Processes

With the completion of the goal determination, the strategy selection and implementation processes can be accomplished as shown in Figure 2.

Cooperation. The cooperation strategy chosen would be determined by the high/low power relationships, degree of dependency and compatible/incompatible goals with other organizations. As indicated by Thompson, an organization in a subordinate power position should try to reduce the uncertainties in its relationships with others—(1) through contracts (which would specifically explain the mutual roles, responsibilities and exchanges over a specified period of time), (2) through
Figure 2. Stage 2 planning and implementation strategies.
cooptations (seeking the participation of stronger agency or group personnel on the board of directors of the focal organization or securing their participation in other ways), and (3) by forming coalitions with other agencies to increase their mutual power. Using the cooptation method carries with it a certain amount of peril. From the author's experience, the coopted personnel may exploit their positions of power within the focal organization to interfere with resource acquisition and goal attainment activities.

The stronger organization would probably prefer informal bargaining to achieve its goals, to retain its flexibility and to maximize its gains. If the stronger organization expands its boundaries, the weaker organization would not be able to resist. If the stronger organization adopts competitive or conflictual strategies, resistance in kind would not be indicated, although the weaker organization could seek resources from elsewhere or decrease its dependence on the stronger organization. Over the short range, the weaker organization will probably have to resort to cooperative strategies, such as coalition building, which may entail ceding away some aspect of its domain. Coalition building is a frequently used technique. There is safety in numbers, the risk is diversified, and power is increased.

If the outcome of a cooperative or conflictual strategy appears to be in doubt, or clearly failing, then a strategy of compromise might be indicated. The strategy could be either unilateral or bilateral. If the focal agency decides to lower its aspirations and to salvage what it can from the situation, it is compromising with itself. A bilateral strategy will entail the focal agency's negotiating with the other element to work out a mutual agreement. If possible, both parties to the agreement should reach mutual objectives or receive something of value.

In 1969-70, a community mental health clinic was set up by the county boards in three rural counties in a Midwestern state. No previous mental health agency existed in the counties, except for a custodial care mental hospital in one county. In order to maintain control of the new agency, the administrator of the county hospital and two of the three county social services department directors secured seats on the board of directors. This cooptation maneuver was only partially successful for them. The clinic staff, with only a small budget and no coalitional power, adopted cooperative strategies with all other agencies and groups. The other community agencies culled out the less desirable clients from their caseloads and referred them to the new clinic. In order to secure some interorganizational linkage control, the clinic staff negotiated written working agreements with the staff in the county mental hospital, social services and public health nurse departments in relation to client referrals and services.

In 1970, a community mental health center staffing grant was filed and received. One of the requirements was the development of "continuity of client care" contracts between the affiliates in the center: the clinic, the county mental hospital and a regional medical center in a nearby large city adjacent to the catchment area. Relationships between the medical center and clinic staffs were continuously harmonious, whereas
the relationships between the county mental hospital and clinic staff continued to be acrimonious. In the former case the exchange of funding for services to clients worked well; in the latter case the exchange was only seen as a conduit of funding for the county hospital. The clinic staff's strategy of "buying" the cooperation of the county hospital staff was not successful.

Competition. Litwak's and Hylton's definition of competitive interdependence seems to apply, in that it refers to one agency maximizing its goals at the expense of another.\textsuperscript{23} A lesser focus on goals was shown by Thompson's and McEwen's definition that competition is "that form of rivalry between two or more organizations which is mediated by a third party."\textsuperscript{24} Blau felt that competition "occurs only between like social units that have the same objective and not unlike units with different objectives. Competitive processes reflect endeavors to maximize scarce resources."\textsuperscript{25}

Reflecting the "zero-sum game" assumption, the writer synthesizes these definitions into the following: competition is manifested by attempts to secure scarce resources and thereby task and survival goals, at the expense of another organization. Resources are limited; therefore, those which are allocated to one organization will not be available to others. Task (i.e., the business the organization is in) and survival goal attainment are mandatory for both groups. Competition can be exemplified by two sprinters in track; each seeks the number one position, but neither actively tries to hinder the other.

The basic strategy of competition has two approaches. One is to lessen the focal agency's dependence on other environmental elements and the other is to seek the other element's dependence on it. In formulations similar to Blau's and Emerson's, Behling and Schriesheim listed four ways:

1. increasing the possible sources from which it (the focal organization) can obtain particular things or actions
2. decreasing its need for those things or actions
3. increasing the need of the environmental organization for the things or actions it can supply, and
4. decreasing the alternative sources available to the environmental organization for those things or actions.\textsuperscript{26}

These formulations have considerable importance for human services agencies. Taking into account that all organizations use some of their resources for survival purposes, human services agencies have charters which commit them to helping specific client groups (e.g., welfare clients or the mentally retarded) to meet their needs. Activities to help these groups may well lead the agency staffs into competitive and conflictual situations. Accordingly, the staff of a given agency, e.g., a mental health center or a day care center, should develop short and long-range strategies to lessen their dependence on environmental elements which might control them in ways contrary to their charter to help their client groups.

Securing funding from a wide variety of sources decreases the dependence on any given one. Working out cooperative referral arrangements for clients with a wide
variety of other agencies decreases the dependence on any given one. Diversifying resource inputs decreases risks, environmental uncertainty and vulnerability to manipulation by funders and competing agencies. The goals of one funding source may be somewhat incompatible with others in such ways that the resultant control over the agency is diminished. If the goals of the two sources were completely incompatible, then the wisdom of securing their funding could be questioned.

By giving a broad interpretation to the concept of resources, i.e., money, shared manpower, physical plant, supplies/equipment, clients and information, even agencies which would appear on the surface to be powerless, might have some resources needed by other elements. If one can be found, such as shared manpower, political support, information, or technical expertise, it may be possible to increase the other agencies' dependence on the focal agency, over the course of time. The important inverse relationships between power/dependence and autonomy/dependence and the direct relationships between vulnerability/dependence must always be kept in mind.

In 1972 the staffs of the county hospital, social service departments and county nurses formed a tight coalition. They were seen by the county boards as essential whereas the clinic was not. To develop needed programs for the mentally handicapped and to lessen these agencies' influence on the board of directors, between 1972-74, nine federal grants were secured by the clinic staff to develop state-mandated programs. Grants from the county boards were reduced at the clinic board's request. By 1975, the clinic received funding of varying amounts from around one and one-half dozen sources.

The mental health center was designated as the fixed point of responsibility for mental health care by the state division of mental hygiene in 1974. Neither community agencies nor the courts could make admissions of catchment area residents to inpatient, transitional or outpatient care, without going through the clinic component of the mental health center. This monopoly was met by hostility from the competing community agencies (which were a minority of the overall agencies in the catchment area). The state division of mental hygiene forced the county mental hospital to convert to a nursing home, with only one small mental health ward. The state agency's intent that admission to this ward would be through the clinic was subverted by the county nursing home staff.

Conflict. Schmidt and Kochan stated that perceived goal incompatibility, opportunity and capacity to interfere with another's resource acquisition and goal attainment activities determine conflict. The author suggests that this definition may be fruitful for use. In contrast to competition in track, conflict entails damaging or destroying the opponent, such as in boxing. Since this strategy can place the focal agency in a win no-win position, a careful assessment of the agency's power/dependence relationships with the environmental elements must be made. This theme has been stated several time in this paper. The dangers of a less powerful focal agency attempting to block the resource acquisition and goal attainment activities of a more powerful agency are apparent. The retribution costs may be too high. Such a strategy against an equal or less powerful element, even when it is successful, may have the long run effect of creating a reservoir of hostility. The non-monetary costs of such a strategy should be carefully studied.
Blocking resource and goal attainment may be done by arguing (directly or indirectly) against another agency's annual budget, application for grants, maintenance of existing programs or new program development. A number of political arenas exist for such purposes: the agency's own board, community welfare council, regional planning commission, city council or county board and general public. Since human services resources are static or dwindling, the "politicized" nature of the allocation process will assume greater importance.

Beginning in 1973, staff from the county mental hospital began to contact the clinic's funders, such as the county boards, state division of mental hygiene and National Institute of Alcoholism and Alcohol Abuse to allege misuse of funds, poor coordination with community agencies and poor quality of client care. Similar complaints to the district health planning council prompted it to make an investigation, which showed that none of the allegations was justified. The "leaking" of such charges to the local newspapers was rejected by the newspaper reporters. One of the social service departments and one of the county nurses attempted to support the county hospital in these endeavors.

The county hospital administrator on the clinic board became slowly more critical of the clinic staff at meetings. The hospital representative's requests for clinic efficiency and effectiveness information became more numerous. To meet these demands, the clinic staff developed a computerized management information system.

In 1976, the clinic staff and board decided that no more new programs would be developed. The goal of developing the basic service delivery system mostly had been met. Any further developments would be met with too much resistance.

**Boundary Adjustments**

Once the strategy is implemented, the results are manifested in stage 3.

![Figure 3. Stage 3 processes.](image-url)
Boundary adjustments to an agency's domain may take three forms—expansion, maintenance or contraction. Expansion usually reflects a successful strategy chosen by the focal organization, while contraction shows an unsuccessful active strategy, or reaction to a more powerful environmental element. Agency staffs hope, at least, to maintain their present boundaries (and jobs), if not to expand them. In periods of stable or declining resources for human services, such as at present, an agency board and staff may be quite happy to meet the goals of maintaining its present resource level and boundaries of operations and responsibilities. Accordingly, boundary adjustments reflect the after-the-fact accommodations to agency policies and strategies, in relation to internal values and capacities and external relationships with collateral agencies, funders, regulators and clients.

The total cybernetic model, indicating the informational feedback loop is now shown in Figure 4.

Evaluation
Whether or not a particular strategy is working has to be continually assessed. If it is working, i.e., the goals are being met as expected, then the strategy can be continued. If the goals are not being met, then it may be necessary to implement the strategy selection process again, i.e., problem definition, assessment of the power-dependence relationship, selection of the goals and the strategy and setting of the criteria for evaluating the outcomes of the strategy. The dotted line in the model shows the informational feedback loop, which serves to evaluate the planning and selection processes and outcomes of the activities. Of salient importance in this process is the setting up of information monitoring and feedback systems on a before-the-fact basis. Hopefully, with current information, the focal agency can be in a position to respond appropriately to the strategies of the other environmental organizations.

SUMMARY
The purpose of this article is to propose a composite model, based on the power-dependence ratio, which could assist social workers in choosing strategies to meet goals, within the context of exchange, contingency and systems theories. Rational planning in a politicized environment must be modified by contingent internal and external factors. The conflict model formulated by Schmidt and Kochan was added to the models of Thompson (cooperation) and Emerson (competition). The importance of adequate problem definition and before-the-fact goal determination was highlighted. The value of feedback for evaluation purposes is paramount. The social work profession's commitment to meeting client needs has propelled it into the community arena, since its beginning. Social workers must have a theoretical and practical base to advocate for our profession's and client's aims.

REFERENCES


22. Thompson, op. cit.


COMPARING EMPLOYED AND UNEMPLOYED WELFARE RECIPIENTS:
A DISCRIMINANT ANALYSIS*

Becky L. Glass
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, North Carolina

ABSTRACT

Based on data from the 1973 Minnesota AFDC Characteristic Study, 348 female AFDC recipients were classified according to whether they were employed or unemployed. T-tests and a discriminant analysis were performed to determine which of several demographic and economic variables distinguished the employed group from the unemployed group. The best discriminators were found to be those related to economic condition, such as value of personal and real property, liquid assets, and monthly income. Little difference was found between employed and unemployed women on the demographic variables. The implications of these findings for the argument that personal motivation or individual differences account for unemployment in AFDC recipients are discussed.

In a study of public attitudes toward welfare, Kallen and Miller (1971) found that 75% of their respondents agreed with the following statements: "There are too many people receiving welfare who should be working" and "I don't see any reason why a person able to work should get welfare money." Since two-thirds of

*An earlier draft of this paper was presented at the 1980 meetings of the Southern Sociological Society, Knoxville, Tennessee.

These data were collected by the State of Minnesota's Department of Public Welfare and in cooperation with the University of Minnesota Family Studies Center's training program in Family Impact Analysis. The author expresses appreciation to that department and particularly to its Director of the Office of Evaluation, Webster Martin, for his cooperation and assistance in making this data available.

The author also wishes to thank Gerald McDonald for his helpful comments on earlier drafts of this paper.
the public assistance budget is distributed through the Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) program (Levitan, et al., 1972), generalizations like the above usually are aimed at AFDC parents, most of whom are women.

This push toward employment of welfare recipients is relatively recent. When the U. S. Congress first legislated payments to mothers of young children in 1935, the purpose of the aid was to allow mothers to remain at home and care for their children (Rein and Wishnov, 1971). That is, women receiving Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) were considered "unemployable" as were other welfare recipients—the aged, blind and disabled. Since that time, however, our national values have changed regarding the acceptability of working mothers, as well as our conceptions of who are "deserving" and "non-deserving" poor (Cox, 1971). Accelerating increases in the number of AFDC recipients during the 1960s have also contributed to interest in employment of recipients, as a means of reducing the welfare rolls (Levitan, et al, 1972).

These changing attitudes have caused program emphasis toward mothers receiving public assistance to shift away from simply providing services for them and their children to encouraging, if not expecting, them to be employed outside the home (Warren and Berkowitz, 1969; Morse, 1968). As a reflection of this national concern with making welfare recipients "tax payers rather than tax consumers" by having them "work off the welfare rolls," the U. S. Congress enacted a series of programs designed to enhance the employment potential of the recipients: the 1962 Community Work and Training (CWT) program, the 1964 Work Experience and Training (WET) program, the 1968 Work Incentive (WIN) program.

The scholarly research in social work and related fields also reflects the increasing salience of employment in relation to welfare. A profusion of articles appeared in the late 1960s and early 1970s which dealt with the "employability" and "employment potential" of AFDC recipients (e.g., Burnside, 1971; Carter, 1968; Cox, 1970; Goodwin, 1972; Levinson, 1970; Morse, 1968; Oberheu, 1972; Prescott, 1971; Rein and Wishnov, 1971; Warren and Berkowitz, 1969).

The premise of most of these articles is that structural characteristics rather than personal motivation differentiates between those AFDC recipients who are employed at a given point in time and those who are not. This position is supported by studies which questioned AFDC mothers on their feelings about employment and found them to be as committed to the work ethic as non-welfare mothers (Goodwin, 1972), to desire "a steady job," and to expect to work in the future (Burnside, 1971; Cox, 1970).
The demographic and structural characteristics which are often used in the comparison of employed and unemployed AFDC recipients include: race, age of children, number of children, health of head of household, rural-urbanness of residence, status of "usual occupational group," educational attainment of household head, participation in job training, work history, recency of employment, length of time employed at last job, length of time continuously on AFDC, length of time since most recent opening of AFDC case, number of times family has been on AFDC, sex of household head, and age of household head. Table I summarizes factors that are often associated with employment of AFDC mothers and reports the nature of these associations as found by earlier researchers.

As may be noted in Table I, there are certain inconsistencies in how these independent variables are found to affect employment. Because of the discrepancies between the studies it is difficult to integrate their conclusions about those factors which differentiate employed from unemployed AFDC recipients. This, in turn, makes it difficult for policy makers who are interested in fostering employment among welfare recipients to know what variables contribute to employment.

The present study attempts to distinguish between employed AFDC recipients and unemployed AFDC recipients by using both new and formerly used characterizing variables, and finding the best statistical fit between these variables and employment. It is expected that a configuration of factors will be a more accurate predictor of employment than taking the characteristics individually as has been done previously. This approach also provides a more appropriate reflection of reality in that a given variable is seldom caused by single effects. The statistic which enables one to distinguish between two groups in this manner is discriminant analysis, which is described more fully in a succeeding section.

Data Source

The data to be used in this analysis were drawn from the 1973 AFDC Characteristic Study for Minnesota. The AFDC Characteristic Study is performed biannually in each of the fifty states at the behest of the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. A 2% simple random sample is taken of each state's AFDC population, about whom demographic, economic, and welfare program related information is gathered. To obtain this information, eligibility workers complete questionnaires about the sampled AFDC recipients, with instructions to "answer the items from information in the case record, your own personal knowledge of the case, or the personal knowledge of another agency worker. If necessary, contact the payee to obtain the answers." It is prudent here to offer a precautionary note about the nature of this data base.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$q$</th>
<th>$p$</th>
<th>$o$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total duration of</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDC use</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of time</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using AIDC</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job participation</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having worked</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previously</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having high</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban residence</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being in good</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being at least</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 years old</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Few children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other areas</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Few residents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be white</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being non-white</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Factors Associated With Employment of AIDC Workers in Parler Studies
It can probably be assumed that the caseworkers who provided these data varied in their ability and willingness to seek out and deliver accurate, documented information. To the extent that this causes some of the data to be less reliable than others, caution should be exercised when interpreting and generalizing the findings of this study.

Data were available on 405 families for the 1973 Minnesota study. For purposes of this paper, only female-headed families were analyzed, yielding an N of 348.

**Procedure**

Of the 247 variables tapped by the 1973 survey, the following were selected as probably most relevant to employment, according to previous research:

1. number of months since most recent opening of AFDC case
2. number of children in AFDC family
3. number of children under three years old
4. number of children between three and five years old
5. number of children between six and eight years old
6. number of children between nine and eleven years old
7. number of children over eleven years old
8. race (American Indians, blacks, and "other" are combined into the category of "non-white")
9. whether the mother is registered for the Work Incentive (WIN) program
10. rural/urbanness of the place of residence
11. "usual occupation group" of the mother (responses range from 1 to 12, with 1 being "professional, technical, and kindred workers" and 12 being "private household workers")
12. mother's age
13. dollar value of "real property not used as a home"
14. dollar value of "liquid assets (cash, bank deposits, savings bonds, etc.)"
15. dollar value of "other personal property (motor vehicles, business and farm tools and equipment, cash-in value of life insurance, etc. Excludes only household furnishings)"
16. dollar amount the AFDC family paid for shelter during the study month
17. dollar amount the AFDC family paid for utilities during the study month
18. total amount of monthly income received by the family which is not from public assistance
19. amount of AFDC monthly grant received by the family
20. total monthly income: a computed variable of monthly non-assistance income + amount of AFDC monthly grant
Employment status was determined by an item in the schedule reading "What is the current employment status of the mother?" Full time and part time employed were combined into an "employed" group containing 98 respondents. The 216 respondents in the "unemployed" group include those who were "physically or mentally incapacitated for employment," "needed in the home full time as homemaker," and "not actively seeking work." Finally, there were 34 cases for which the caseworkers had responded "actively seeking work." These 34 cases were excluded from the analysis because it was unclear conceptually in which group they belonged.

First, descriptive statistics were run on the total sample and on the two sub-samples by employment status to provide a profile of these female-headed AFDC families.

Second, the two employment status groups were compared on the twenty independent variables, using t-tests. This preliminary analysis was performed because of a limitation in the SPSS discriminant analysis program which allows only listwise deletion of missing data. That is, if a response is missing for any one variable, the entire case is removed from analysis. This severely reduces the number of cases available for analysis when several of the variables have some missing values (i.e., schedule items were left blank or coded "unknown"). Therefore, t-tests were used to determine which of the twenty variables were most likely to be significant discriminators in order to decrease the number of variables entered into the discriminant analysis, and thereby decrease the numbers of missing values and deleted cases.

Finally, discriminant analysis was used to differentiate between the two employment status groups. Because this type of statistical analysis is less than common in social science research at this time, a description is provided in the next section.

Method of Analysis

Discriminant analysis statistically distinguishes between two or more groups of cases from a collection of "discriminating variables" selected by the researcher. The analysis weights and linearly combines the discriminating variables so that the groups are as statistically distinct as possible (Walters, 1978). This linear combination of variables is called a "discriminant function" and takes this form:

$$D_i = \sum_{j=1}^{p} d_{ij} Z_j$$

where $D_i$ = score on the discriminant function
$d_{ij}$ = weighting coefficients
$Z_j$ = standardized values of the discriminating variables
In analyzing two groups, one discriminant function is developed, although more functions may be used when more than two groups are being differentiated.

In making this linear fit of variables, discriminant analysis is similar to multiple regression analysis, with the difference that the dependent variable in discriminant analysis is categorical, rather than continuously measured. The d.'s or discriminant function coefficients, represent the relative contribution of each variable to the function and are interpreted analogously to multiple regression beta weights.

Independent variables may be entered into the analysis concurrently or in stepwise fashion, with the highly discriminating variables being entered first. The present paper uses the latter option. The statistic chosen to determine the order of entry of the variables in Rao's V, or generalized distance measure, which selects variables that "contribute the largest increase in V when added to the previous variable. This amounts to the greatest overall separation of the group" (Nie, et al. 1975:448).

Findings

The means, medians, and standard deviations of the descriptive variables are given in Table II, for the total sample and for the sub-samples by employment status. Because of the prevalence of stereotypes about AFDC recipients, many of which are backed by quasi-documentation, and because the data in this paper represents AFDC families from only one state, a brief profile of the total sample of female-headed families is provided here.

Racially, the sample is approximately 70% white and 30% non-white which includes blacks and American Indians primarily, with a very small proportion of "others." The families tend to live in a central city area of 100,000 to 250,000 people, or an urban environment. The average age of the mother is 31 years old and her average age at the birth of her first child is 22 years old. There are about 2.6 children per family. The occupational groups which contain the largest numbers of AFDC women are "clerical and kindred workers" (18%), "service workers, except private household" (19%), and a combination of three occupations under the "blue collar" subheading -- "craftsmen and kindred workers," "operatives, except transport," and "laborers, except farm" (12%). While the mean education level is "10th or 11th grade," 45% have graduated from high school and 4% have had "some college, without graduating."

In terms of their financial position, the great majority of these families have no accumulation of cash or belongings — 97%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age of Parents</th>
<th>Mother's Age</th>
<th>Residence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number of Children in Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**APDC Case**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Months Since Most Recent Opening of APDC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2. Statistics of Characteristics and Spread Describing a Sample of APDC Mothers**
### Education

The possible survey responses were: 0) Less than 6th Grade; 1) 6th or 7th Grade; 2) 8th Grade; 3) 9th Grade; 4) High School Graduate; 5) Some College; 6) College Graduate; 7) Some graduate. Therefore, a mean of 5.4 indicates a total of 12th Grade. Did not Graduate?

### Income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Monthly Income</th>
<th>Monthly Earn</th>
<th>Assistance Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$207.65</td>
<td>$171.98</td>
<td>$35.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$235.78</td>
<td>$200.99</td>
<td>$34.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$269.98</td>
<td>$232.00</td>
<td>$37.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$305.90</td>
<td>$266.90</td>
<td>$39.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$331.92</td>
<td>$299.92</td>
<td>$32.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$357.94</td>
<td>$327.94</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$383.96</td>
<td>$357.96</td>
<td>$27.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$409.98</td>
<td>$389.98</td>
<td>$20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$435.00</td>
<td>$405.00</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$460.02</td>
<td>$430.02</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2, continued
have no real property, 74% have no liquid assets such as cash or bank accounts, and 74% have no personal property (excluding household furnishings). The families, with an average size of three to four people (2.6 children plus one adult), receive about $267.00 monthly from public assistance, which may be supplemented by employment, OASDI benefits, veteran's benefits, other pensions, support payments from absent parents, or contributions from "others." Employment provides the largest amount of supplement, with those who are unemployed receiving only about $25.00 a month from other sources. Those who are employed (31% of the sample) increase their income by about $275.00 a month, although it must be remembered that their grant is lowered as a result of their employment, even after some of their extra income is "disregarded" for expenses and "incentive" ($30 plus one-third remaining earned income is disregarded for this purpose).

This sample tends to be atypical from AFDC recipients in other states in terms of racial composition and amount of public assistance received. There is a lower proportion of non-whites in the Minnesota sample than in national AFDC figures. Possibly related to this, education level for Minnesota recipients is slightly higher than the national average (cf, Ross and Sawhill, 1975). Minnesota has a reputation for providing one of the better public assistance programs in the country, and the amounts of its AFDC grants are appreciably higher than in many other states, particularly those in the South (for example, Florida pays less than $150.00 per month as a base grant to AFDC families).

It should be recognized then, that one needs to proceed with caution when generalizing from further analyses to other AFDC populations. However, since the dependent variable of employment status is applicable in all states, findings regarding the differences between employed and unemployed recipients may tentatively suggest similar conditions in other states.

T-tests were performed on the twenty independent variables to determine which ones were significantly different from the employed group to the unemployed group. The nine variables which were significant for at least the .05 alpha level are shown in Table III. These variables were entered into the discriminant analysis, along with "amount paid monthly for shelter" and "amount of monthly AFDC grant." Amount of AFDC grant did not reach statistical significance on the t-test but the differences between its means for the two groups appeared substantively different, nonetheless. Amount paid for shelter was included because it may interact with some of the other economic variables. It should be noted here that the variable of recipient's past work history was not included in this analysis, although certain previous research has shown this to be a potentially
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>F-Value</th>
<th>Probability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of children 1-3 yr.</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>.55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural/urbanness of residence</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>.038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education of mother</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>5.63</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>5.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of real property</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$60.90</td>
<td>23.72</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$8.11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of liquid assets</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$31.22</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$14.49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of personal property</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$1247.63</td>
<td>9509.79</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$33.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount paid for utilities</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$27.85</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$28.50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total monthly income</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$507.82</td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$305.72</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of AFDC grant</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$229.49</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>.830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$280.89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount paid for shelter</td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>$109.23</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>.077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>$109.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
discriminating factor between employed and unemployed welfare recipients (e.g., Burnside, 1971; Warren and Berkowitz, 1969). To the extent that work history is as strong or stronger than the included variables for distinguishing the employed group from the unemployed group, the findings of this study are weakened and any interpretations, conclusions, or generalizations must be undertaken with caution.

In order to include the largest possible number of cases in the discriminant analysis, those variables which had very few cases with missing values were recoded to make the missing values equal to the mean for that variable. This procedure did not substantially alter the distribution or descriptive statistics of these variables and had the advantage of retaining the cases for the discriminant analysis.

The recoding was performed on the following variables: the six missing values (1.7%) of "value of real property" were recoded $22.00; the twenty-one missing values (6%) of "value of liquid assets" were recoded $18.00; the thirteen missing values (3.7%) of "value of personal property" were recoded to $369.00; and the one missing value (.3%) of "amount paid for shelter" was recoded $109.00.

Mother's educational level had sixty-eight, or 19.5%, missing responses. It was felt that this was too large a proportion of unknown data to accurately substitute the mean educational level. Therefore, missing values were declared for the variable "education of mother," which prevented those sixty-eight cases from being included in the discriminant analysis, due to the listwise deletion component of the SPSS program. Thus, the discriminant analysis was performed on 253 cases, with 78 employed respondents and 175 unemployed respondents. The results of the discriminant analysis are presented in Table IV.

The first variable entered in the stepwise analysis is total monthly income, which makes a particularly substantial contribution to distinguishing between the employed and unemployed group (change in Rao's $V = 170.77$). Amount of AFDC grant makes almost as significant a contribution (change in Rao's $V = 165.64$) and is entered second. Rural/urbanbess of residence changes Rao's $V$ by 15.41 and enters the discriminant function equation third. The fourth variable to differentiate between the two groups is "value of personal property" (change in $V$ of 8.69). Amount paid monthly for shelter and amount paid monthly for utilities entered fifth and sixth in the equation, with changes in Rao's $V$ of 4.67 and 5.32, respectively. The remaining four variables to enter the analysis had sufficiently high $F$-values to meet the entry criterion, but individually they did not produce statistically significant changes in Rao's $V$. In order of entry, they are: number of children three
Table 4. Step-wise Discriminant Analysis of Employed and Unemployed AFDC Mothers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step No.</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Rao's V</th>
<th>Change in Rao's V</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Standardized Discriminant Function Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Total income</td>
<td>170.76</td>
<td>170.76</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>AFDC grant</td>
<td>336.46</td>
<td>165.69</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-.743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rural/urbanness</td>
<td>351.87</td>
<td>15.41</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Value of personal property</td>
<td>360.56</td>
<td>8.69</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>.162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Amount for shelter</td>
<td>365.23</td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td>.031</td>
<td>-.166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Amount for utilities</td>
<td>370.56</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>.021</td>
<td>-.120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Children 1-3 years</td>
<td>372.24</td>
<td>1.68</td>
<td>.195</td>
<td>-.060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Value of liquid assets</td>
<td>373.31</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td>.052</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Race</td>
<td>373.40</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.763</td>
<td>.017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mother's education</td>
<td>373.49</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.757</td>
<td>-.017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Canonical correlation = .77

Classification: Group  N of Cases  Predicted Group Membership  Correctly Classified
                     Employed  Unemployed
Employed            78    76.9%    23.1%    87.7% of known cases
Unemployed          175   7.4%    92.0%
years old and under, value of liquid assets, race, and educational level of mother. "Value of real property" did not contribute enough separation power, when taken in consideration with the other ten variables, to enter the analysis.

The standardized discriminant function coefficients indicate that the relative contribution of total monthly income to the discriminant function is very high compared to the other variables in the equation. Amount of monthly AFDC grant is also high compared to the variables which follow it, but its relative contribution is only about half that of total monthly income.

The canonical correlation is a "measure of association between the discriminant function and the set of variables which define group membership" (Nie, et al., 1975). It is analogous to the eta, or correlation ratio, in one-way analysis of variance. The high correlation of .77 obtained in this analysis indicates the ability of the discriminant function to discriminate between the groups.

An additional feature of discriminant analysis which indicates the discriminating ability of the independent variables is its "classification" aspect, or its prediction of group membership based upon the derived discriminant function. The function developed from the ten variables included in this analysis correctly placed 77% of the employed women in the employed group and 92% of the unemployed women in the unemployed group, for a combined total of 88% correctly classified.

Discussion

One of the most notable features of the discriminant analysis is that, of the first six variables entered into the discriminant function, five relate to economic conditions -- total monthly income, amount of AFDC grant, value of personal property, and amount paid for shelter and utilities. As would be expected, total income and value of personal property is greater for the employed group, and amount of AFDC grant is greater for the unemployed group. Surprisingly, for the subsample on which the discriminant analysis was done, the unemployed group paid more for shelter and utilities ($X = $108.03 and $29.13) than the employed group ($X = $105.60 and $28.63).

The sixth variable, rural/urbanness of residence, may also be related, indirectly, to economic conditions, to the extent that the density of population has an effect on the availability of jobs. The unemployed group tends to live in more heavily populated central city areas than the employed group, which may indicate greater difficulty in getting jobs where there are more competing job seekers.
The employed and unemployed groups are differentiated on the remaining four variables as might be expected — the unemployed group tends to have more children three years and under, to be non-white, to have less education, and to have fewer liquid assets than the employed group. These variables, however, contribute relatively little, compared to the first four variables, in differentiating between the groups.

The conclusion which appears appropriate, then, is that individual and demographic characteristics of the AFDC mother and her family, such as age, total number of children, occupational group, race, educational level, preschool-age children, and being registered for the Work Incentive program, make little difference in whether the welfare recipient is employed or not. This tends to contradict the "personal motivation" or "individual differences" explanations which have been advanced by some as reasons for welfare recipients being unemployed. Those characteristics which most readily distinguish between the employed and unemployed groups are those which result from the condition of being employed — monthly income, value of personal property, and, less dramatically, value of liquid assets and real property. The reader should remember, however, that these findings and conclusions are derived from data provided by eligibility workers, rather than from the AFDC recipients themselves. Because the data may contain some inaccuracies on this account, caution is encouraged with regard to interpretations made in this paper.

Some of the contradictory findings among earlier studies in how certain demographic variables are related to employment may be due to the fact, observed in this data, that there is no consistent difference in employment status according to those variables. This observation corroborates empirically some of the theoretical discussions of "work and welfare." Carter (1968) points out that the type of employment market which most welfare recipients fit into is an "irregular" one, with low pay, few or no fringe benefits, no provision for legitimate absences, and high turnover. This irregular economy contributes to a lifestyle pattern represented by the finding that 70 to 80% of AFDC mothers have had previous employment experience, but at a given point in time, only about 25 to 50% of the women on welfare are employed (Rein and Wishnov, 1971; Goodwin, 1972).

Investigations of the welfare history of AFDC recipients show that there is a turnover of more than one-third of AFDC families each year and that the median length of time for continuously receiving public assistance is two years (Cox, 1970; Carter, 1968). Rein and Wishnov (1971) conclude after a review of data on case openings and closings that "there is a small group of 'stable' AFDC..."
families that use public assistance continuously and a large
group that rotates between being on and off." They also find that
a "substantial number" of the rotating cases fall into the category
of "opened and closed for reasons of employment" (1971:9). Others
have also described an intertwining of work and welfare, in that
poverty-level heads of households are found not to participate in
one alternative or the other, but to combine welfare and employment,
simultaneously or serially, in order to support their families
(Reid and Smith, 1972; Goodwin, 1972; Cox 1970; Valentine, 1970).

The need to supplement wages with public assistance funds is
related to Carter's (1968) concept of employment opportunities
being in an irregular market due to lack of education and job train-
ing and that most AFDC heads of households are women (who typically
earn less than men regardless of the job). As Valentine (1970)
says, "under fluctuating and marginal economic conditions the actual
sources of general subsistence and occasional surplus become multi-
ple, varied, and rapidly shifting . . . For most citizens, it is
impossible to receive an adequate income without combining both
wages and welfare or other sources."

Carter (1968) makes a similar observation when she states "In
general, individual and family characteristics are similar for
persons 'on welfare' and persons who happen to be 'off welfare' at
a particular point in time. The differences lie in the immediate
effect on marginal families of external events that upset their
last-straw, make-shift provisions for food and shelter" (1968:2).

This suggests, then, that many or most of the two-thirds of
the present sample who were unemployed at the time of data collec-
tion were temporarily in this situation due to recent events or
chance factors, such as having a new baby or the car breaking down
or not being able to find a job that meets transportation and
schedule constraints. One might expect to find, if the same sample
were surveyed at another time, that of those still on welfare, many
in the unemployed group would have shifted to the employed group
and vice versa.

It should also be noted that the proportion of employed AFDC
mothers in the sample compares favorably with the proportion of
women in the general population who are in the labor force. About
50% of women in the general population are employed. The fact that
30% of these AFDC mothers are employed, who by definition are
single parents and have dependent children, clearly does not por-
tray a group given to labor market idleness (cf., Hasenfeld, 1975).

These conclusions should suggest to policy makers that a more
farsighted approach is necessary for permanently reducing welfare
rolls than simply encouraging employment of the recipients. The key seems to be to attack the structural obstacles which foster the "irregular" job market rather than concentrating on individuals, who after all have both histories and futures of being employed, but who nonetheless continue to require public assistance from time to time to supplement their low wages and fill in between dead-end jobs. Combating the structural obstacles is a deep-reaching process which touches many complex and "close to home" areas, such as re-evaluating educational standards, increasing the amount of public assistance maintenance income to provide the secure base necessary to promote economic independence, and seriously examining the exploitation of the poor by the "secondary," low wage market (cf., Hasenfeld, 1975). However, the long-range benefits for society, nations, and individuals of such an encompassing solution would undeniably be worth the effort.

References

Kallen, David and Dorothy Miller  

Levinson, Perry  
1970  "How Employable are AFDC Women?" Welfare in Review, 8 (July-Aug.):12-16.

Levitan, Sar, et al.  

Morse, Harold  

Nie, N., C. H. Hull, J. Jenkins, K. Steinbrenner, and D. Bent  

Oberheu, Howard  

Prescott, Edward  

Reid, William and Audrey Smith  
1972  "AFDC Mothers View The Work Incentive Program." Social Service Review, 46 (Sept.):347-361

Rein, Mildred and Barbara Wishnov  

Ross, Heather and Isabel Sawhill  

Valentine, Charles  

Walters, Linda Henley  

Warren, Martin and Sheldon Berkowitz  
THE UTILIZATION OF A PERFORMANCE BASED CURRICULUM DESIGN IN GRADUATE SOCIAL WORK EDUCATION

GUST WILLIAM MITCHELL, DSW
UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND BALTIMORE COUNTY SOCIAL WORK DEPARTMENT

ABSTRACT

As a developing profession, social work is increasing its efforts to utilize systematically concepts from the field of education in its professional training. This research examines the use of a performance based curriculum design in the teaching of a graduate social work course. Results of this study support the use of this approach from the perspective of improved student performance.

Interest in the use of performance based objectives in education stems from a concern that material be presented to students in ways that maximize learning opportunities and add precision to the measurement of mastery of knowledge and skills. Placing emphasis on development of a framework for teaching provides a way of reducing ambiguities. The value of clearly stated objectives for learning is demonstrated when learning becomes focused, goal-oriented and students understand what to do and how to do it.

Goals of learning are frequently presented in general terms out of a fear that specifically articulated objectives will lead to preoccupation with trivia. Arkava and Brenner (1976:17) write:

There are dangers inherent in the move toward greater specification of our curriculum objectives. One of the more obvious dangers is that of becoming preoccupied with trivia. Competency-based education programs may lead to focus on innumerable and sometimes irrelevant details.

The alternative, to present goals in very general terms, however, often contributes to difficulty in the teaching-learning process. Failure to specify clear learning objectives creates serious problems in the evaluation process. Without specific objectives, instructors are forced to write global questions which rely heavily upon more subjective evaluations of performance. If learning outcomes are not clearly defined, then the power of these instruments to achieve their purpose becomes severely limited. The degree of confidence in the validity of the measurement instrument is determined by the extent that it reflects achievement of objectives.

In the last decade competency based forms of instruction have come into vogue in social work education. Recognizing that if the goal is to educate social workers who are able to achieve a level of competency that is commensurate with the demands of practice, social work education must establish a structure within which competency
can be measured. Larsen and Hepworth (1978:79) write: "In addition to skill training, competency-based education holds promise as a means of upgrading the quality of social work courses across the curriculum."

Social work education has been criticized for failing to define adequately its theory base and for failing to differentiate the "art" from the "science." Lack of specific objectives in courses of instruction have tended to perpetuate this problem. Without a clear master plan for learning, students are left to fend for themselves in an effort to identify what is relevant. This process is aptly described by Deterline in his observation that it is like trying to learn to play a game but without clear ground rules. Anxieties develop for the student over the prospect of selecting relevant material from an array of learning stimuli presented in the class and through outside readings (Deterline, 1973:3).

Social work practice is changing as the role of the professional is being influenced by innovations in the helping process and by the need to deal effectively with new and developing social problems. There is increased emphasis on development of empirical evidence on the effects of various technologies of practice (Somers, 1969:69-70). This emphasis must begin with the process of teaching and learning in social work education. The use of a performance based model of curriculum would appear to have particular value as this profession refines its skills of both teaching and practice. Armitage and Clark (1975:29) question, "How could anyone conceive of educating for practice without clearly defining the goals and means in behavioral terms?"

There is a limited amount of research on the use of performance based curriculum in social work education. Most notable is the University of Montana project where a practice competency examination for baccalaureate social work students was developed to assure that graduates had the necessary skills for professional practice (Arkava and Brennan, 1976). The University of Calgary implemented a competency-based program at the bachelor's level which included an effort to develop objectives for the teaching of attitudes and values (Armitage and Clark, 1975:25). What has been attempted in this study is to examine the value of performance objectives in terms of their contribution to student mastery of knowledge and skills. While the development of objectives for a course of study could be supported on the clarity that this approach provides for students and the advantages for the evaluation of performance, this investigator thought that a more significant position could be developed. If it could be shown that outcome performance was affected positively through the use of this model, then a strong case could be made for exerting the extra effort required to design curriculum using outcome objectives.

THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

The purpose of the study was to examine the application of a behavioral objectives model of education in a beginning clinical methods course in the graduate program at the University of Maryland, School of Social Work and Community Planning. The question was whether there would be a significant difference in outcome scores for those students who were given, at the beginning of instruction, an instructional package containing statements of objectives and expected terminal behaviors and those students who were given the course outline currently in use. Four groups were established.
The following investigative questions were central to the inquiry:

Was there a significant difference in the achievement scores for students given an instructional package in contrast to those who were given no outcome information beyond the actual course outline?

Was there a significant relationship between the subject characteristics of sex, age, and previous social work experience and achievement scores under the various conditions studied?

Was there a significant relationship between the subject's academic ability and achievement scores?

STUDY DESIGN

An experimental field study was conducted using a four group design with two experimental groups and two control groups. The experimental groups were given, at the beginning of the course, an instructional package containing statement of learning objectives, the learning hierarchy, and the terminal objectives. They were then exposed to a semester of learning. The control groups were given no information beyond the actual learning activities as presented in the course outline in use and exposed to a semester of learning.

The design called for control of the major extraneous variable of the investigator as instructor by including a second instructor. The concern was that this investigator's knowledge of teaching technology and experience in the design of the instructional package would possibly contaminate outcome scores. The second instructor, who had not had this experience, agreed to utilize an instructional package in a second experimental group and taught a second control group.

Following completion of a semester of learning a criterion achievement test was administered to both the experimental and the control groups as a posttest and mean scores were obtained.

RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS

An instructional instrument was developed as a study guide for the experimental groups Xla and Xlb. In addition to including information on general purposes and aims of instruction, this package contained specific statements of what behaviors the student would be expected to perform at the end of the course.

This package included statements of: (1) the terminal objectives of the course, (2) the core concepts and processes to be learned and their supporting theories, (3) the cumulative learning sequence, (4) the learning objectives designed as specific behavior or outcome tasks, (5) the specific reading resources related to each unit of study, and (6) the statements of purpose, of aims, and of organizing principles for the course.

In many respects, the statement of the terminal objectives was the most critical and difficult task to achieve.

This effort began with considerable dialogue among the clinical faculty who served as a validation panel of experts about the general objectives of the introductory course.

Our efforts culminated in a statement of terminal objectives which read as follows:
When requested to do so, you should be able to analyze the dynamic, developmental, and process components of a clinical transaction. Your analysis should reflect both your recognition of the organizing principles of clinical intervention and the implicit philosophical and epistemological aspects of help giving and help receiving. You should be able to construct an organizational system which accounts for the various phenomena that occur in this process.

As a result of the dialogue begun by this investigator with the panel of experts, the core concepts and processes to be learned in this course of study and their supporting theories were identified. Based on this work, this investigator developed twenty-three units of study and validated the units as prerequisites for achieving the terminal objectives by submission to the panel of experts.

Units were organized into a learning sequence from basic knowledge outcomes to more complex levels of comprehension and application. Units were developed as foundations of practice (including units on values, traditions, introduction to systems approach, the social agency), the clinical transaction as a process (including units on relationship, communication, contract, and assessment) and the clinical transaction over time (including units on phases of change: beginnings, middles, and ends). Each unit in the hierarchy was designed to build on the learning of the previous units. Students were cautioned that difficulty with a particular learning objective could affect their mastery of subsequent objectives.

Each unit in the instructional package was organized into a three-part design. The first part included a short statement on the aim of instruction. An example of such a statement is the one in the unit on relationship which states:

The idea of a relationship suggests reciprocal emotional involvement. In the clinical transaction the worker-client relationship serves as a dynamic vehicle for expression of needs, of perceptions and of feelings. It is dynamic in that it is in continual change both at the verbal and nonverbal levels. The aim of this unit is to examine how the professional relationship is affected by worker-client perceptions and stereotypes, by the process that is established and by the worker's style.

The second part in each unit identified the resources for learning, including primary texts and other learning material. The third identified the specific learning objectives. An example of such an objective is, "The notion of transaction suggests a multidimensional interactional system. Your understanding of the clinical transaction should be evident in your ability to differentiate between a transactional view of a problem situation from an interactional view and from a linear view." This design proved to be a useful approach; the students had a ready reference of outcome tasks to be mastered, a statement of the instructional goals, and a list of resources that would facilitate the learning of a particular task.

In developing the specific behavior or outcome tasks, Gagne's (1970) guide on the types of learning that a particular task represents and Bloom, et al (1956)
Taxonomy of Educational Objectives were used to describe what the student would be expected to do when the learning was mastered.

The criterion instrument was developed as a performance test to determine whether the students in the study had acquired the terminal behavior of the learning hierarchy. Gronlund's (1968) book, Constructing Achievement Tests, was used as a guide for the planning and construction of the performance test.

Samples of learning objectives for each unit of study in the instructional package were selected for inclusion in the criterion instrument. The clinical faculty who served as a validation panel of experts assured that the items selected reflected the range of learning outcomes they were supposed to represent.

The learning objectives were developed as specific outcome behaviors which could be designed as objective test questions. For the most part, this process required only minor reworking of the behavioral objectives in the instructional package to conform to this requirement. Content validity was assured by the use of the panel of experts to compare the wording of the test questions and the wording of the learning objectives in the learning hierarchy.

A decision was made to construct a performance test which could be objectively scored and which, at the same time, would allow the demonstration of mastery of more complex learning. A two-part test was devised. The first part could be completed with objective responses to multiple-choice and true-false questions. The second part required the student to view a video tape of a clinical interview segment and to base responses to questions asked on this observation. The video tape was developed specifically for use with this instrument. The tape was previewed by the panel of experts to assure conformity between the taped sequence and the questions asked on the instrument.

Test items were arranged sequentially from simplest tasks to more complex outcome objectives. Fifty-three items were included in the first part of the test. Twelve were included in the second part requiring the viewing of a video tape.

CRITERION INSTRUMENT RELIABILITY

A computerized test scoring package was used for the purpose of scoring and analyzing the examination responses and for obtaining test reliability. The criterion instrument was pretested for reliability on a group of eleven students who were completing a similar course on another campus of the University. The Kuder-Richardson Formula 20 procedure for estimating reliability was applied to pretest scores and to the final outcome scores.

The Kuder-Richardson Formula provides a conservative estimate of reliability. For a teacher-made test, a reliability coefficient of between .60 and .80 is considered acceptable (Gronlund, 1968:96). The reliability coefficient of .75 on the pretest and .69 on the posttest was considered sufficient evidence to support the assumption of reliability of the criterion instrument.

EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURES

The course of instruction occurred over a fifteen week period of time. Students randomly assigned to the experimental and control groups were informed at the beginning of the instructional process that different curriculum outlines would be used.
by the various groups under study. The purpose for this was explained as an effort to evaluate different designs. Contamination between experimental and control groups was a possibility in view of the fact that students knew that different curriculum outlines were in use. The decision was made, however, to assume this risk in deference to the importance of informing subjects that they were a part of a study. Through end of the semester discussions with students about the learning experience we were able to ascertain, however, that little if any contamination actually took place.

All students were told at the beginning of instruction that they would participate in a common final examination. The clinical concentration faculty agreed to adopt this same final examination for the entire first year class. The result of this decision was that it removed the sensitivity of this criterion instrument for these particular groups under study and avoided unnecessary discrimination which might have affected outcome measurement.

With the experimental groups, each instructor, during the first class session, handed out copies of the instructional package to each student. The self-explanatory introductory sections of the package were read and discussed in the first class. Instructors emphasized the importance for students to be able to complete each learning objective before proceeding on to the next unit and that the instructor would be available as a resource should they encounter difficulty with a particular objective. The learning hierarchy for this course of study was presented and discussed. Students were informed that the course of instruction would follow this learning pattern.

The control groups were given, during the first class session, copies of the traditional course outline containing general statements of the instructional activities and the course bibliography.

The instructors in the study held bi-weekly discussions in an effort to maintain consistent standards over presentation of course material. Examinations, during the course of instruction, were jointly prepared and administered to both the experimental and control groups. The sequence and timing of presentation of material was coordinated for all four groups.

The criterion instrument was administered as a final examination during a single time period with plans to offer a make-up for those who would not be present for the initial examination. As it turned out, all students were present during the initial examination and a make-up was not necessary.

STUDY SAMPLE

The population from which the study sample was drawn was 153 first year, first semester social work students enrolled in the beginning clinical methods course prior to going into their field experience.

The advantage of basing the study on this population insured that the learning of clinical concepts presented in this course would not be supplemented through practicum experiences or prior Master's level instruction.

The study sample consisted of sixty-four students who enrolled in and were distributed among four sections of the basic clinical methods course. Two sections, one under each instructor, were randomly assigned as experimental groups identified as groups X1a and X1b and thirty-four composed the control groups identified as
groups $X_{2a}$ and $X_{2b}$. Table I presents the student distribution for the sample under study.

### TABLE I

**STUDENT DISTRIBUTION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instructor</th>
<th>Method of Instruction</th>
<th>$X_1$</th>
<th>$X_2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$X_1 =$ experimental groups  
$X_2 =$ control groups  
A = the investigator as an instructor  
B = the second instructor

### TABLE 2

**COMPARISON OF SAMPLE CHARACTERISTICS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Age $^1$</th>
<th>Previous SW $^1$ Experience</th>
<th>Achievement $^2$ Scores</th>
<th>Undergraduate $^3$ Gr/ Pt Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$X_{1a}$</td>
<td>27.25</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>3.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$X_{1b}$</td>
<td>27.07</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>-0.10</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$X_{2a}$</td>
<td>27.27</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$X_{2b}$</td>
<td>29.31</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>3.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total*</td>
<td>27.72</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* = total for all groups  
1 = by years and fractions thereof  
2 = scores on the Miller Analogy and Graduate Record Examination have been converted to standard scores  
3 = scores on a four point scale
 Seventy-eight percent of the sample were female and 22 percent male. These figures closely approximate the population of the school at the time the study was conducted where 80 percent were female and 20 percent were male.

The mean age of this sample was twenty-seven. The mean number of years of social work experience for the sample was 1.39.

A measure of academic ability was computed for the sample using the Miller Analogy Test scores and Graduate Record Examination scores - these are pre-admission requirements. In computing academic ability based on these tests, scores were converted to standard scores. Undergraduate grade point average for the sample was also computed. The mean undergraduate GPA for the total sample was 3.08. Table 2 presents the means of the demographic characteristics of the group under study.

DATA ANALYSIS & FINDINGS

Hypotheses 1: related to the basic premise under investigation, whether behavioral objectives contribute to a significantly higher score on a posttest. An analysis of variance design was used to test whether there was a significant difference between the two groups and a significant F score was obtained. The mean scores and the standard deviations of the four groups on the posttest are presented in Table 3.
**TABLE 4**

ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE BASED ON GROUPS AND INSTRUCTIONS UNDER STUDY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Variance</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>ss</th>
<th>ms</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Groups:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>829.402</td>
<td>414.701</td>
<td>14.048(^1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1800.777</td>
<td>29.521</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instructors:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>719.123</td>
<td>719.123</td>
<td>23.330(^1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>1911.056</td>
<td>30.823</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) Significant at .01 probability level

To establish direction, a multiple regression analysis was conducted. A significant F (P<.01) was obtained supporting the contention that having behavioral objectives available to students contributes to improved performance scores. (Table 4)

The findings related to hypothesis one are consistent with theoretical expectations. While there is limited empirical research on the effects of the use of behavioral objectives in graduate social work education it would be expected that these findings would be consistent with studies in social work education on competency based curriculum as well as studies conducted in other fields and for other levels of learning.

Hypotheses 2-3: related to the subject characteristics of age, sex, previous social work experience, and academic ability.

A multiple regression analysis was computed using these demographic characteristics as independent variables. The coefficient correlation was obtained on the relationship of each characteristic and the variables of instructor, group and achievement scores. Information on these demographic characteristics was obtained from student records. The variable age was recorded by year and fractions of a year. For the purposes of testing the independent variable of academic ability the Graduate Record Examination scores and the Miller Analogy Test scores on each student under study were used as a measure of ability.

The amount of variance accounted for by these subject characteristics was insufficient to warrant further analysis (Table 5). This finding would broadly imply that the value of performance based curriculum would not be affected by these subject characteristics. The literature does not specifically support the contention that these variables in combination with teaching method would affect achievement scores. However, examination of these characteristics was thought to be important from the perspective of whether certain students would differentially benefit from the type of instruction method used. The results, showing no difference, support the position taken by Gagne that though students of varying
ability levels may begin their learning at different steps in a hierarchy, the conditions of learning apply (Gagne, 1970:28-31).

TABLE 5
MULTIPLE REGRESSION ANALYSIS FOR ALL VARIABLES UNDER STUDY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$R^2$ (increase)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>0.5229</td>
<td>0.2734</td>
<td>0.2734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group</td>
<td>0.5616</td>
<td>0.3153</td>
<td>0.0419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate gr/pt average</td>
<td>0.5779</td>
<td>0.3339</td>
<td>0.0186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRE/MA</td>
<td>0.5864</td>
<td>0.3439</td>
<td>0.0100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous SW Experience</td>
<td>0.5888</td>
<td>0.3467</td>
<td>0.0028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>0.5904</td>
<td>0.3486</td>
<td>0.0019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age1</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Level of tolerance insufficient for computation

DISCUSSION

Analysis of the data from this study suggests that regardless of academic ability, students using an instructional package containing performance objectives score significantly higher on a criterion outcome test than the students in the control groups.

In this study design a second instructor was included to control for instructor variance. The value of this arrangement was proven when analysis of results showed that a significant amount of the variance was accounted for by the effects of instructor ($R^2 = .2734$). The difference between mean scores for this experimenter's two groups was .64 while the difference in scores for the second instructor was 4.89. It appears that as the experimenter, my experience and knowledge in the use of this teaching technology created a halo effect. Since I participated in design and utilization of this instruction model it might be assumed that there was an effect not only on student but also on instructor performance. This assumption would be consistent with established principles of learning. The fact that the second instructor did not participate in the design of the instruction package and was not experienced in this teaching technology possibly contributed to the greater difference in scores, thus, the outcome differences would be more likely a result of the instructional design. The implications of this finding, however, must be carefully interpreted. Since no hypothesis related to instructor was generated, one could question whether the findings may be fortuitous or spurious. Kerlinger (1965:621) cautions about the acceptance of unpredicted findings, "before accepting them, they should be substantiated in independent research in which they are specifically predicted and tested."
As with all field research, contamination of independent variables through uncontrolled environmental variables existed. However, in defense of field research in education Kerlinger (1965:383) writes,

The more realistic the research situation, the stronger the variables. This is one advantage of doing research in educational settings. For the most part, research in school settings is similar to routine educational activities, and thus need not be necessarily viewed as something special and apart from school life.

While total control over ecological factors of instruction was not possible, every effort was taken to control the environment in which the learning process took place. The time of day that classes met and the physical conditions of the classroom are possible extraneous factors affecting outcome scores; the experimental and control groups with the investigator as instructor met at the same time in the morning in the same classroom and the second experimental and control groups met at the same time in the same classroom in the afternoon. Information on student participation in the research project was, to the extent possible, held constant though the risk of students sharing curriculum materials was present.

It appears that when course objectives were stated in behavioral or outcome terms the process of teaching and learning enjoys greater clarity and precision. Students benefit by having available a clear guide for learning and the process of testing and grading can be accomplished with greater accuracy. Accountability is facilitated through the development of standards for learning. Though research on the value of performance objectives for purposes of increasing student learning is far from complete, studies that were reviewed and results of the Maryland Study suggest that this approach may promote improved performance on the part of the learner.

It is hoped that such validation will encourage the use of performance based curriculum designs in different content areas in schools of social work. Writing behavioral objectives for courses of study does involve considerable effort and cooperative planning. Based on our experiences, however, it would appear that the end product justifies the time and study involved.

There are important linkages that can be made between the goals of education and those of the profession of social work. The trend in social work is toward explicit statements of goals and procedures in practice. Additionally, professional accountability is stressed and is predicated on the establishment of clear objectives. The value of this study lies in the suggestion that social work educators can both develop greater precision in the measurement of learning outcomes and increase clarity of instruction while modeling important skills of practice.

REFERENCES

Arkava, Morton and E. Clifford Brennen
Armitage, Andrew and Frank Clark
Bloom, B.S., M.D. Englehart, E.J. Furst, W.H. Hill and D.R. Krathwohl
1956 Taxonomy of Educational Objectives. New York: David McKay.
Deterline, William
Gagne, Robert
Grunlund, Norman
Kerlinger, Fred
Larsen, Joann and Dean Hepworth
Somers, Mary Louise
INSIDE AND OUTSIDE THE FOR-PROFIT NURSING HOME:
SOME EXTERNAL DETERMINANTS OF INSIDE POWER RELATIONS

Cedric Herring
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

ABSTRACT

This paper offers a conceptual model for understanding how and in what ways externally determined factors affect power arrangements within a for-profit nursing home setting. Specifically, this paper links the activities of nursing homes as profit seekers to federal legislation and the activities of strategically structured interests which seek to socialize their costs. Additionally, it shows how social distinctions and other factors which have their origins external to the nursing home setting have consequences for what takes place inside. The model posits that it is those people who are members of society's more privileged groups (professional white males) who will get access to positions of power in part because members must go outside the organization into the greater society to obtain the certification which will allow them to occupy powerful positions. Consequently, those who have power inside the organization (professional white males) are very similar to those who have power in the greater society. Moreover, observational data indicate that those statuses which members of the nursing home enter with are associated with patterns of interaction and levels of control and authority. Finally, there is an attempt to spell out the implications of such findings and an attempt to show how government and community (non)involvement (could) affect relationships internal to the nursing home.

As Jansson (1979:362) suggests, "a crucial policy choice that must be made by public agencies and officials is whether . . . to provide publicly funded services themselves or to utilize nonprofit or profit-oriented organizations in the private sector." More and more often, policy makers are depending on the profit
oriented, private sector to provide social services; however, the costs of providing such social services continue to be met by the state (O'Connor, 1973).

Recently, theorists have attempted to outline the consequences of capitalists' attempts to socialize their production costs and expenses while keeping profits in their own hands (e.g., O'Connor, 1973; Braverman, 1974). For example, Braverman (1974:271) argues that to the extent that capitalists are successful in passing their costs on to the state while reaping profits "the capitalist mode of production takes over the totality of individual, family, social needs, and in subordinating them to the market, also reshapes them to serve the needs of capital." He argues that with the transformation of the society into a giant market which benefits state-subsidized capitalists, the population no longer relies upon social organization in the forms of family, friends, neighbors, community, elders, children, but with few exceptions must go to market and only to market, not only for food, clothing, and shelter, but also for recreation, amusement, security, for the care of the young, the old, the sick, the handicapped (Braverman, 1974:276).

Braverman goes on to argue that "since no care [for the young, the old, the sick, and the handicapped] is forthcoming from the community, and since the family cannot bear all such encumbrances . . . the care of all these layers become institutionalized" (p. 280).

Presumably, because these changes in the care of humans are more often to meet the needs of capital than to benefit those who make use of the services, the care for humans becomes more profit-oriented and more removed from humanistic concerns. The care for the young, the old, the sick, and the handicapped becomes more and more the responsibility of total (care) institutions which seek profit. But to see precisely what consequences this drive for profit has, one must look inside the walls of those total institutions which are profit-oriented.

While he is not specifically concerned with profit-oriented total institutions, Goffman (1961) does look inside the walls of
total institutions. In his works on total institutions—"places of residence and work where a large number of like-situated individuals, cut off from the wider society for an appreciable period of time, together lead an enclosed, formally administered round of life"—Goffman (1961:xiii) discusses the roles that members of these institutions play. He points out that while many of these roles appear to be "natural," they are for the most part based on the ability of the various actors to make their definitions (of what should be done) binding for others. Many of these differences in ability to make binding definitions can be explained in terms of differences in interaction patterns and content of interactions (among inmates, between inmates and staff, and among staff members). However, to understand why these patterns of interaction exist and persist, it is often necessary to look beyond the walls of the total institution in that the total institution's internal structure reflects the dominant values and priorities of the external society (Clegg and Dunkerley, 1977; McNeil, 1978; Salaman, 1978). Moreover, the distribution of resources, privilege, and control inside the organization are related to the distribution of power in the broader society (Alford, 1975; Wolff, 1977; Martin, 1980). However, as Martin (1980) notes, studies of internal organizational structure typically look at groups internal to the organization and ignore linkages between them and others outside the boundaries of the institution. As she notes, such views of organizations are deficient.

In order to understand how a given total institution affects the behaviors and relationships of its members, not only must one look at the interpersonal interactions within that total institution, but s/he must also examine those factors (mostly) external to it which facilitate and reinforce what takes place inside. Such an attempt is made here. This paper examines the nursing home as a privately owned, profit-oriented, but largely state-subsidized total institution. An attempt is made to determine how (and to what extent) externally produced/determined factors (e.g., organization of payments, demographic characteristics of staff members, professional certifications, governmental involvement, etc.) impact relationships within the nursing home. Of special interest are those institutional characteristics which are consequences of the nursing home's
"free-market" profit orientation while receiving state subsidies.

NURSING HOMES AND THE STATE

In the past, shorter life spans made nursing homes and other long-term care institutions virtually unnecessary. Brody (1977) notes that the proportion of elderly people was not very large before this century, and that it has been only in the past 50 years that a rapid increase in this proportion has occurred. She states that "sheer demography, then, was one of the major pressures producing growth of institutional facilities" (Brody, 1977:11).

But demography is not the total answer. As O'Connor (1963:41) points out, "monopoly capital and labor also have favored socializing social consumption expenditures such as medical costs and workers' retirement income." Thus, they have supported programs which have been important to the growth of state-subsidized nursing homes: the Social Security Act in 1935, the Hill-Burton Act in 1946, and Medicare and Medicaid in the mid-1960's. Alford (1975) argues that there have also been strategically structured interests in the health professions which have historically fought for the passage of such legislation in the form that it has eventually passed.

According to Reichert (1975), an important intent of the Social Security Act was to take older people out of the job market during the depression era. He argues that disruptions of the extended family, housing shortages, and new mobility among wage earners all increased the demand for nursing homes. However, because the law prohibited payments to residents of public institutions, people took their relief money and moved into private homes. Typically, these nursing homes were unregulated and often of poor quality. Local and county governments entered the picture by offering financial support to those facilities which agreed to meet certain minimum requirements.

In 1946, the Hill-Burton Act was passed, guaranteeing that those willing to build and operate nursing homes could be assured of financial assistance from the federal government. Needless to say, this gave (potential) owners of nursing homes more incentive to go into business.
In 1965, the Medicare and Medicaid amendments were added to the Social Security Act. Among other things, these amendments provided for coverage of medical payments for the elderly and the indigent in extended care institutions and skilled nursing homes. With the advent of Medicare and Medicaid payments for patients in nursing homes, nursing home expenditures rose more than 500 percent from 1966 to 1975 (Gornick, 1976). For 1977, outlays for nursing home-related costs reached $12.6 billion.

According to the National Center for Health Statistics (1978) there were approximately 18,300 nursing homes in the U.S. as of 1977. Of these, over 70% were for-profit operations. These for-profit homes owned approximately 70% of the 1,383,600 beds in service. Though over 70% of nursing homes are profit-oriented, a major source of funding for them has been and continues to be federal-state cost sharing programs such as Medicaid and Medicare which pay for many of the health care-related expenses of nursing home patients.

In 1977 for example, the average total monthly charge for patients who used Medicare as their primary source of payment for services in a profit-oriented nursing home was more than 75% greater than total charges for patients who used their own money to pay for services in nonprofit and government nursing homes ($754 per month compared to $427 per month).

Clearly then, the state's involvement has facilitated the growth and profitability of the nursing home industry. But the (non)intervention of the state and the greater society also affects other aspects of the nursing home. The remainder of this paper will examine some of those factors which originate outside the boundaries of the nursing home but have consequences for what occurs within the walls of the nursing home. Much of what follows is based on data collected from a case study of a profit-oriented, state-subsidized nursing home.

METHOD

Data related to the interpersonal relationships within profit-oriented nursing homes were collected as part of a case study of Huron View Lodge (HVL) nursing home. The data were collected from October of 1980 to April of 1981 using the
participant-as-observer technique, archival research, and interviews. During the initial stages of the study, the investigator assumed the role of a volunteer worker. Later (in January) he revealed his "researcher identity."

While the participant observation techniques employed in this study have some drawbacks, most notably generalizability, they offered some definite advantages: They allowed the investigator an opportunity to view behaviors of nursing home patients and staff in the social context of the nursing home itself. They provided him the chance to study patterns of interaction in more detail than might have been possible using other methods. This method also facilitated the use of controlled quasi-experiments in which the investigator initiated actions. And finally, participant observation, when combined with the archival data, enabled the investigator to more fully understand the influence of the "social structure" of the nursing home on the nursing home members.

FINDINGS

As mentioned, in order to understand the effects of the institutional setting on behaviors and relationships, one should consider factors both inside and outside the institution. Figure 1 presents a conceptual model of some of those factors which are important to understanding how and in what ways externally determined factors have effects within the institution. Specifically, this model posits that it is those people who are members of society's more privileged groups (professional white males) who will get access to positions of power within the institution. This is true because workers must go outside the organization into the greater society in order to obtain certification, a type of gatekeeping mechanism which allows only the "worthy" to occupy powerful positions. Consequently, those who have power inside the organization (professional white males) are very similar to those who have power in the greater society. For this reason, this model predicts that one's position inside the institution will be a function of his/her status in the society at-large. It is expected that power arrangements and patterns of interaction, therefore, will parallel those found beyond the walls of the institution.

The following four dimensions will be examined in this
section of this paper: (1) the characteristics of the institution, (2) characteristics of members which exist prior to and external to the nursing home setting, (3) types and patterns of interaction which take place within the walls of the nursing home, and (4) the extent to which institutional labels and identities are promoted, facilitated, and reinforced by the state and the general society.

Kart and Manard (1976) concluded that ownership type, size of facility, demographic composition of membership, and professionalism of staff were determinants of the quality of care that nursing home patients would receive. While no inferences about the quality of care will be (explicitly) made here, such information will be presented.

First (and probably foremost), Huron View Lodge (HVL) nursing home is a profit-oriented, but heavily state-subsidized institution. It is a family-owned corporation with two co-owners. Not unlike many businesses, HVL is a member of the local Chamber of Commerce; moreover, it holds certificates of membership to the National Association of Nursing Homes, the Michigan Hospital Association, the Association of Health Care Homes, and the American Health Care Association.

Huron View Lodge, a 71-bed facility, is slightly larger than the average privately owned, profit-oriented nursing home facility which has approximately 63 beds (NCHS, 1978:Table 142). It is a skilled nursing facility which offers speech therapy, physical therapy, occupational therapy, X-ray facilities, and scheduled diversional activities to patients. (In February, 1981) HVL's rate of full-time or equivalent employees (FTE) providing direct health-related services per 100 beds, 59.2 was also higher than the average facility's 45.1. The composition of its staff by professional status, race, and sex is presented in Table 1.

In trying to determine patterns of interaction, dominance, and social control, one is well-advised to remember that members in total institutions "typically have statuses and relationships in the outside that must be taken into consideration," for as Goffman (1961:76, 122) points out, "there will always be . . . some use made of social distinctions already established in the environing society. . . ." With this in mind, it is reasonable to expect that a member's status external to HVL is a determinant of
his/her status inside the nursing home. For this reason, it was hypothesized that the amount of control --ability to make rules which are binding for oneself and other institution members-- one has within the confines of the nursing home is related to factors such as his/her professional status, race and sex which originate external to the nursing home. This hypothesis is consistent with the conceptual model presented in Figure 1 and will act as a (partial) test of this model. Data relevant to testing this hypothesis are presented in Table 2 in terms of percentages of staff members with much control as a function of professional status, race, and sex.

The results from this analysis suggest that externally originating statuses are related to levels of control. For example, at HVL, no black males (0%) have much control, 5% of the black females have much control, 29% of the white males have much control, and 53% of the white females have much control. While it is likely that much of the difference in level of control can be attributed to the proportion of each subpopulation which has professional status (all $X^2$'s are statistically significant at p<.01), it should be noted that the strength of association between levels of control and professional status varies from one subpopulation to the next. For example, for black females, there is a perfect association between professional status and level of control; i.e., the Goodman-Kruskal lambda and Cramer's phi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATUS</th>
<th>RACE</th>
<th>SEX</th>
<th>BLACK</th>
<th>WHITE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NONPRO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0% (n=9)</td>
<td>0% (n=20)</td>
<td>8% (n=13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100% (n=0)</td>
<td>100% (n=1)</td>
<td>100% (n=4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0% (n=9)</td>
<td>5% (n=21)</td>
<td>29% (n=17)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No Measures of Association are possible

- $X^2_{LR} = 8.0$ (df = 1) $X^2_{LR} = 13.5$ (df = 1)
- $\Lambda = 1.0$ $\Lambda = .80$
- $\Phi = 1.0$ $\Phi = .86$
- p-val = .01 p-val = .01

\[
\begin{align*}
\% & = 100% & \% & = 92% & \% & = 47% \\
\% & = 8.0 & \% & = 13.5 & \% & = 7.4 \\
\text{df} & = 1 & \text{df} & = 1 & \text{df} & = 1 \\
\Lambda & = 1.0 & \Lambda & = 0.80 \\
\Phi & = 1.0 & \Phi & = 0.86 \\
p\text{-val} & = .01 & p\text{-val} & = .01 & p\text{-val} & = .01
\end{align*}
\]
measures of association are equal to 1.0. The lambda and phi for status predicting control for white males are .80 and .86 respectively. For status predicting control for white females, lambda = .38 and phi = .45. Because there are no black males at HVL who hold positions with professional status, there are no measures of association between status and control for this subpopulation.

These findings are important to the extent that those with much control can and do define organizational goals and are able to use organizational resources for their personal and professional interests. In the case of HVL, the most powerful determinant of having much control is one's professional status.

As Alford (1975) points, because of licensing practices of the government, such professionals are virtually guaranteed a monopoly on certain kinds of decisions and policies. These professional monopolists . . . are able to provide a symbolic screen of legitimacy while maintaining power in their own hands through various organizational devices. A continuous flow of symbols will reassure the funding of allegedly controlling publics or constituencies about the functions being performed, while the individuals or groups which have a special interest in the income, prestige, or power generated by the agency are benefiting from its allocations of resources (Alford, 1975:194).

In other words, it is from the society external to the nursing home that professionals derive their levels of control on the inside. The same is true of other statuses, but only to a lesser degree. To show just how these externally originating differences are (become) relevant to patterns of interaction in the nursing home, further analysis is provided.

Such findings are also important to understanding the internal structure of HVL in that there is a profound hierarchical division of authority, decision-making, and labor. While such organizational structure is not peculiar to HVL, nor nursing homes in general, in this particular setting it has some rather interesting consequences for patient-staff and staff-staff interactions. Most notably, because of this division of authority and division of labor, and the existence of a "that's not my job"
attitude toward providing services to patients, many of the wants and some of the needs of the patients go unattended.

Unfortunately (at least from the patient's point of view), decision-making on even the seemingly most trivial matters takes hierarchical channels. As Perrow (1972:36) points out, "hierarchy promotes delays and sluggishness; everything must be kicked upstairs for a decision either because the boss insists or because the subordinate does not want to take the risk of making a poor decision." This is bad news for patients in that higher ups, who usually have to give their approval on matters of immediate concern to them, are more or less insulated from patients. Of those whose jobs include interaction with patients, those with the least control have the most contact with patients. As Table 3 shows, of those occupations which include contact with patients as part of the job duties (this excludes maintenance workers), the higher in the HVL hierarchy jobs are located, the more likely are their incumbents to have little contact with patients. Table 3 presents staff member contact with patients in terms of percentages with little contact by stratum in the HVL hierarchy.

Table 3.
Percentage With Little Contact by Stratum in the HVL Hierarchy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stratum</th>
<th>% With Little Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lowest</td>
<td>11% (n=44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>29% (n=17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest</td>
<td>33% (n=6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16% (N=67)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition to the fact that a staff member's contact with patients is inversely related to his/her position in the HVL hierarchy, Gottesman and Bourestom (1974) observed that only about 2 percent of patient contact with staff involved skilled nursing. Moreover, they found that about 10 percent of the patients' time
was spent in contact with any staff member. One could argue that this, at least in part, is also a result of nursing homes' drives for efficiency and a reflection of their for-profit orientation. For example, by using unskilled, low status, and low wage labor to deal with patients, costs are reduced and profits are increased. Moreover, these patterns of interaction can be explained by the power of higher ups to define who should and should not attend to the immediate day-to-day wants and needs of patients.

While higher ups, including the owners, insulate themselves from patients, they, nevertheless, have access to and are accountable to funding sources. In the case of HVL, the major funding source is the state. Figure 2 diagrams the authority hierarchy at HVL. Under the current social organization, patients, who occupy the lowest stratum of the HVL hierarchy, have very little autonomy.

Barney (1974) points out the ineffectiveness of ordinary regulatory mechanisms in dealing with a service such as nursing home care, which has a relatively powerless people for a clientele. She goes on to warn that profit-oriented nursing homes, in seeking maximum efficiency and productivity, may take advantage of patients who cannot defend their rights. From this, it follows that the less powerful a patient is, the more likely is the staff of the nursing home to take advantage of him/her.

At times, the fact (or even the notion) that a patient is "confused" is used to disqualify his/her contentions. For patients at HVL, the process of becoming "confused" is often a labeling process in its most literal sense. Staff members (nurses, nurses' aides, and orderlies) meet weekly to discuss the eating habits, health statuses, moods, and behaviors of patients. In these meetings, staff members recount the behaviors of patients during that week, and patients are diagnosed as being "confused" in much the same manner that one would be diagnosed as being hypertensive. However, this particular diagnosis is more casual though it has more far-reaching consequences for the powerlessness of patients. For example, it often becomes convenient for the staff to deny certain charges and occurrences by simply saying that a patient is "just confused." While this label appears to fit some times, at others, the patient's claims are not just figments of his/her imagination. However, at this point, the
FIGURE 2.
CONCEPTUAL MODEL OF THE AUTHORITY HIERARCHY AT HVL

THE STATE AND OTHER CERTIFYING AGENCIES

OWNERS

MAINTENANCE SUPERVISOR

ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTORS

MAINTENANCE WORKERS

ADMIN. OFFICE PERSONNEL

OTHER HEALTH PROS

VOLUNTEERS

ATTENDANTS

PATIENTS
patient's claim is often a moot question to the extent that the label has been applied. This label in and of itself facilitates the powerlessness of patients, and often offers them no recourse but to accept injustices. So the accuracy or inaccuracy of the label is irrelevant; it is the unchallenged power vested in that staff to define who is or is not confused which is of consequence for patient-staff interactions.

At HVL, the question of patient power becomes even more clear-cut when money is involved: patients have virtually no say in such matters. Even when it comes to money which the patients own, the nursing home controls it. Patients may request their money, but will receive it only with the approval of the financial director or the owners, and only then if the financial director or the owners find the reasons given for the request acceptable. For example, one patient received $50 from his brother. He said that he had had to turn this money over to the financial director. He asked me to go get it for him because he just knew that they would not give it back to him. I told a secretary in the business office of the patient's request. She referred me to the financial director. The financial director told me of all the paperwork involved, asked me why the patient wanted the money, etc. However, she did refer me to one of the owners who happened to be there on that day. The owner told me that there was just too much hassle involved in getting the money to the patient for the reasons given. He tried to convince me that I was showing too much concern about how the patient would react. But finally, he told me that I could go out and buy whatever the patient wanted, and that HVL would reimburse me if I provided receipts. In this instance, the wishes of the patient prevailed, but only with the intervention of an outsider. What happens without such intervention is clear: The requests of the patient are ignored.

Moreover, because the staff can view most patients as nonpaying, incompetent, and/or unable to mobilize the resources necessary to having their claims respected, they (the staff) can ignore the requests of patients. Because the clientele at HVL are rarely immediately responsible for meeting the financial obligations to HVL themselves, the staff need not be very responsive to the complaints, concerns, or wants of the clientele. Moreover, at least some patients have problems with how their way is being paid at HVL, and the organization of payments in general.
For example, one new patient was hesitant to eat a meal that was placed in front of her. She "knew" that the food was not hers because she had not paid for it. After a combination of persuasion, an increase in her hunger, and a few cautious looks at others eating, she ate, but not without continuously voicing her reservations about her inability to pay. In short, because the organization of payments is such that the cash nexus is hidden from patients, few of them assert their consumerism or look into alternatives; few of them feel like consumers or believe that they have viable alternatives to living in the nursing home. Thus, the nursing home staff need not view them as consumers, nor does the staff need be responsive to patient claims.

However, because of its profit orientation, Huron View Lodge is responsive to the complaints of the government and other sources of funding. Thus, it follows that HVL need be responsive to the demands of patients (only) to the extent that they are viewed as a real source of funding. The more patients are viewed as a source of funding, the more powerful they are, and more responsive the nursing home is to their demands. However, because the organization of payments is such that the government, not the patient, is seen as the source of funding, HVL can make profits at the expense of the state by minimally meeting the state's requirements and not necessarily those of patients.

The more direct funding the state gives to the nursing home, the less patients are viewed as a source of funding, and the less powerful patients are vis-à-vis others in the nursing home. In other words, the state facilitates the powerlessness of patients by granting funds directly to the nursing home. Instead of giving patients more power, which would substantially strengthen their position as consumers, the state often strengthens the position of the nursing home by offering it "cost-reimbursement packages" which protect it from risk of losses (Enthoven, 1977).

Figure 3 shows what the hierarchical structure of HVL might look like if the social organization were such that patients were given the following "power subsidies": (1) direct payments to them instead of to the nursing home, (2) the intervention of parties who are sympathetic to patients and who do not have to
FIGURE 3.
Conceptual Model of the HVL Hierarchy with Patient "Power Subsidies"
rely on the nursing home for funding, and (3) the provision of viable alternatives to living in nursing homes.

This diagram suggests a vast redistribution of authority (and thus in autonomy) in favor of patients. Instead of being the most dominated stratum of the hierarchy and being accountable to virtually everyone at HVL, patients would probably be more like real customers. Potentially, they would have more discretion in how their lives are lived. Theoretically, they, with the help of sympathetic allies, would have influence over the owners, to whom other staff members at HVL are accountable. To the extent that patient-staff relations at HVL are organized around money, they would be less subdominant to staff members. Most importantly, if need be, they would be more able to carry out their threats to leave the nursing home to find better living arrangements. The provision of alternatives would add substance to their threats of leaving.

In addition to the government, other groups can (potentially) affect relationships internal to the nursing home. As Barney (1974) points out, community presence is a key to improved conditions for patients. But as Newfield (1978) suggests, the media and the public have a limited span of attention when it comes to nursing homes. Only in the cases of scandal and horror stories is the public concerned. Such attitudes in the general society facilitate the patterns of interaction inside the nursing home. As Newfield (1978) points out, nursing homes become state-financed repositories of the old, the sick, and the handicapped because of lax governmental regulation, family and community noninvolvement, and unscrupulous, profit-seeking nursing home owners.

**SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS**

This research on the nursing home as a privately owned, profit-oriented, but largely state-financed institution was undertaken with the conviction that such research is important but more or less neglected. Most studies of nursing homes have looked at either the quality of care within the nursing home, or have addressed issues such as cost containment almost as if to separate them from what goes on inside nursing homes. For the most part, because of the nature of these studies, and the approaches they
have used, issues dealing with the quality of care and costs have been systematically separated.

However, because of the structural peculiarities of the nursing home industry which stem from the fundamental structure of American society, care of patients and other issues of staff-patient interactions must not be separated from what goes on outside the nursing home. This paper has tried to link the activities of nursing homes as profit seekers to federal legislation and the activities of strategically structured interests which seek to socialize their costs. Additionally, an attempt was made to show how factors which have their origins outside the nursing home have consequences for what takes place inside. Moreover, it was shown that those statuses which members of the nursing home entered with were associated with patterns of interaction and levels of control and authority within it. And finally, there was an attempt to show how government and community (non)involvement could potentially affect relationships internal to the nursing home.

As previously noted, the structural peculiarities of the nursing home industry (a "free-market," profit orientation while receiving funding from the state) have made it difficult to separate issues of cost-efficiency from issues of quality of care within these institutions. But the relationship between "costs" and "quality" are not necessarily as one would expect. Because providers of nursing home care are generally reimbursed for whatever costs they incur rather than on the basis of a standard rate, there is neither reward for cost-efficiency nor penalty for waste. Meanwhile, as profit seekers, there is little incentive for them to provide a quality of service beyond the minimum which will guarantee them a profit. For many other kinds of services, these issues of costs and quality can be resolved in the marketplace: people simply reveal their preferences by how they spend their money. But in the case of the nursing home industry, in which the state pays the costs of services provided, the nursing home is not overly dependent on those who make use of its facilities for its funding. Thus, it is not necessary for nursing homes to view patients as consumers who are to be satisfied. They only need to be responsive to the requirements of the state and have their beds filled in order to secure profits. In short, under the current organization of payments, nursing homes can make
profits at the expense of the state by only minimally meeting the state's requirements (and not necessarily those of patients who make use of these services).

The problem of public policy design is to define the appropriate role for government to achieve desirable social purposes most effectively. If a desired goal is to improve the quality of life for the elderly, the sick, and the handicapped while reducing (or at least containing) costs, and if it is not (necessarily) desirable to increase the profits of nursing home owners, then clearly the strategy currently in use is flawed. To correct this, the government must provide more alternatives (such as community-based adult day care, home health care services, homemaker services, and communal living arrangements) to those who would usually end up in institutions. A threat is only as good as its ability to be carried through; therefore, it is up to those on the outside to make sure that a patient's threat to leave the confines of a nursing home can be acted out if necessary by making provisions for alternatives. Direct payment, as opposed to the current organization of payments, provide the potential for alternatives to those who might seek them. For those who do become institutionalized, the state and others can facilitate their receiving better quality treatment by insuring that nursing homes become not only for-profit, but also for-service-oriented.

NOTES

1 Staff members with little control are those who have no supervisory nor policy-setting duties as part of their jobs; staff members with much control are those who do have supervisory and/or policy-setting capacities as part of their jobs. Because of the research methods employed, all data statistically analyzed are "objective," i.e., coded according to observable (nonattitudinal) criteria.

2 Rather than just detracting from the explanatory powers of Table 2, the existence of zero cells adds substantively to the meaning of the table and gives greater insight into the power relationships in the nursing home; that is, it is shown that there is no such thing as a black male with professional status at HVL.
Moreover, there are no black males at HVL who have much control. Conversely, there are no white males who hold positions with professional status and do not have much control. All professionals, except for some of the white females, have much control in this setting.

A logit analysis of Table 2 (not presented here) indicates that professional status, race, and sex are all related to one's level of control at HVL. There is an interactive effect for professional white females which predicts that they will have lower levels of control than other professionals in the nursing home setting. When one statistically controls the simultaneous effects of these variable, the following coefficients and equation result:

\[
\text{Log Odds (Much Control)} = \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{5}}\right) \times (-2.55 + 1.89 \text{STATUS} + 1.51 \text{RACE} + 0.60 \text{SEX} - 0.98 \text{INTERACTION})
\]

when

- STATUS = 1 Professional
  0 Otherwise
- RACE = 1 White
  0 Otherwise
- SEX = 1 Female
  0 Otherwise
- INTERACTION = 1 White Professional Female
  0 Otherwise
REFERENCES


Solving the Effectiveness Dilemma:
How Can An Informal Network Create Change?

Robert W. Colman
Mark Barton

The Pennsylvania State University
Capitol Campus

ABSTRACT

Interagency networks seem to be good vehicles for informal communication and coordination. However, if they are to be effective in bringing about innovation, networks must develop some of the boundaries and structure of a group and thereby lose their informality. Examination of a case history of a network in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, suggests one alternative: A network can remain informal and operate by consensus but give rise to subgroups which take potentially controversial action in their own names. This possibility is explored and related to the emerging theory of social networks.

Fragmentation of social services, along with tight budgets, had led to increased interest in the development of interorganizational networks as part of the practice of community psychology (Reid and Chandler, 1976; Sarason, Carroll, Maton, Cohen, and Lorentz, 1977; Sarason and Lorentz, 1979). Earlier, similar groupings called welfare councils (Cox and Tropman, 1976) attempted to provide coordination and planning within communities. These councils have existed in the United States for something over 50 years; in the 1960's, they came under attack for being more effective at blocking innovative change than creating it. Indeed, Warren, Rose, and Bergunder (1974:32-33) suggest that health and welfare councils, as examples of what they call Community Decision Organizations, have several latent functions in addition to their manifest one of facilitating coordinated planning. These functions include protecting existent organizations from competition, from challenges, and from new conceptions of problems.

Informal networks, on the other hand, are quite different. They do not necessarily make binding decisions, and they differ from health and welfare councils in both structure and function. Networks are unbounded, open systems of linkages among individual elements (Sarason, et al., 1977). There is no necessary hierarchical structure; and goals, insofar as they can be inferred
from interaction in networks, can be fluid and changing. Much of the value of a network as perceived by its members comes from informal information sharing in a non-threatening social context.

As a result, members of a network face a dilemma when they feel called upon either to develop a more formal structure (for purposes of efficiency) or to take positions on potentially controversial matters (for purposes of effect). To do either is to risk loss of the informal and non-threatening atmosphere which members find attractive; to do neither is to risk being ineffective.

We suggest that it is a common developmental dilemma. This paper will focus on the dilemma, through analysis of a case history of an informal network of human service staff people in central Pennsylvania. We begin with some background material on why such networks might arise in the first place and on some concepts useful in analyzing activities undertaken by networks.

Fragmentation and Service Gaps

The identification of discrete skills in human services, as in medicine and elsewhere, has enabled the development of sophisticated services for meeting human needs. The identification of groups of people with special social service needs also resulted in the appearance of problem-specific agencies, each with a special charge and caseload. The American tradition of voluntary action has facilitated this process by providing a context in which both professionals and volunteers feel free to develop new agencies as soon as they see new needs. The new agencies, however, are seldom well interlocked with existing ones, and fragmentation of services results (McShane, 1979).

Clearly, as human service programs have diversified, it has become increasingly difficult for any one among them to treat all the needs of any one client. Most specialty agencies are not geared to provide for the needs of the whole person (Eriksen, 1977). Instead, they can only do so through effective referral to other specialty agencies. Of course, there is a recognition that, with the sub-division of human needs into particular need categories, corresponding program specialization has rendered caregiving organizations more interdependent. One would assume that this interdependence, if recognized, might give rise to efforts at interagency coordination to offset isolation among the elements in the continuum of care. The sociological literature suggests that matters are not quite so simple (Litwak and Hylton, 1962; Meyer, Litwak, Thomas, and Vinter, 1967). Formal coordination is more likely to occur when there are many (e.g. 100) agencies, when agencies are aware that they are dependent on each other, and when the activities requiring coordination are uniform
and standardized. An example might be coordinated fund raising by a Community Chest (Meyer, et al.: 1967). With fewer agencies, less official awareness of interdependency and highly varied non-standard activities, formal coordination will be unlikely. Instead we would expect to find personal ad hoc contact or perhaps conferences between agency staff. Formal coordination seems unlikely because the social structure of the situation simply does not demand it.

In the present case, a network in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, we have many agencies (the network's 1980 mailing list names 115). However, there is mixed official awareness of interdependence; and interagency activities vary widely and are not uniform. As a result, we would not expect and we do not see widespread formal coordination.

Informal coordination, however, does occur both in Harrisburg and in general. Often it tends to support the status quo (Warren, Rose, and Bergunder, 1974). This support results from a desire shared among agencies to continue with as little interference from other agencies as possible. More precisely, it is in the interest of any one organization to be concerned about its own survival, defined as continued access to clients, labor resources, and other resources like plant and funds (Levine and White, 1961). Since this is true of all agencies in a given area, an interagency "live and let live" norm (Warren, Rose, and Bergunder, 1974) develops, serving the function of reducing the range of possible conflict among agencies.

In the case of an interagency network, the "live and let live" norm would give rise to pressure not to raise controversial issues if any member agency felt that it could be injured by the ensuing conflict. This is one horn of the network's dilemma. Not dealing with the issue is the other horn.

Conflict can also arise from duplication of services. Agencies may avoid duplication by seeking "domain consensus," defined as the degree to which agencies' . . . accept each other's claims to the social . . . problems covered, services offered, and type of recipient served" (Levine, 1974:376). The result of domain consensus is a shared aversion to duplication of services, an aversion which increases the more scarce social service monies become.

As Levine points out, one of the problems in interagency coordination in that there are many levels of authority, both public and private, and that " . . . no single agency is charged with the responsibility of coordinating the activities of other health and welfare organizations" (Levine, 1974:374). In a world of different mandates and unshared masters, it makes some sense for each agency to be concerned about generating "success" primarily in the terms which its funders happen to use. As a result,
fragmentation spawns service gaps.

One possible corrective to fragmentation is the use of informal networks of agency personnel for information sharing, social support, joint planning, and joint action.

Networks

There are two widely available reviews of literature relevant to networks (Sarason, et al., 1977; Mitchell, 1969); the work of these writers will not be repeated here. The term network is widely used in current social science. Networks are generally considered to be unbounded systems of linkages among individual elements. The elements can be persons, or other parties, such as agencies. Linkages vary greatly in content; but, in most network theory, they are seen as having positive and negative value for participants as well as simple connection. Elements can be linked to each other directly or indirectly through intermediate elements.

Human service networks. In the cases under consideration here, the elements are individual people who usually work for a human service agency but who do not necessarily represent the agency within the network.

This is important because it allows involvement in network activities to take place on a relatively informal, even ad hoc basis. Remember that networks are not quite the same as groups; they have a relatively open structure with no clear inside and outside and are less likely to have stable goals or internal hierarchies. As a result, they are more flexible; and we suggest that networks are more able than tightly structured groups to new demands from changing environments.

However, concerted response by a network raises the dilemmas to which this paper refers. Again, informality is attractive: but effective action implies some degree of group structure (Sherif and Sherif, 1956). As we suggested earlier, effectiveness in areas of even mild interagency conflict is likely to threaten some potentially allied agencies. As a result, the network is likely to become less open and more like a group. To the degree that the network becomes engaged in actual conflict, the pressure for the development of group boundaries is likely to become overwhelming (Sherif, 1966).

Clearly, if a network is to take effective action and remain a network, some way to transcend the dilemma must be developed.

One such transcendence can occur through the social support function which networks often serve. Consider people who see a problem within their own agencies and see as well a potential solution—but who are unsure of their ability to effect the solution. Discussion of the situation within a network may provide
clarity of understanding but perhaps more importantly may also provide encouragement from friends, enabling people to act as individuals, effecting solutions.1

Another way to transcend the effectiveness dilemma might be to form sub-committees which could be either ad hoc, "one shot" entities (quasi groups) or actual groups. If the sub-committees do their work outside of the network in their own names, then the network itself can be protected somewhat from the effects of action. This is an important possibility, and we shall examine it further by discussing various kinds of groups and quasi groups.

An action-set is initiated by a person for a particular purpose, with a wide variety of outgoing links (kinship, a shared occupation), but a single kind of incoming link activity—in Mayer's (1966) prototypical case, electoral support in a campaign. Action-sets are bounded (not infinite, like a network) and made up of both direct and indirect links. They are impermanent, lasting only until the initiator's purpose is achieved. They are quasi groups, similar both to networks and to true groups.

In a given network, different action-sets can emerge from different contexts and for different purposes. For instance, in a human service network, action-sets might be called together to provide interagency planning for a given client or to provide criticism of a particular agency's proposal. The purpose of action-sets are relatively clear, short-term, and are usually stated by an individual actor. The action in the action-set can take place under the name of the network or outside of the network per se and under the name of the individual actor. Again, this is important since it is one way a network can have its informal cake and eat it too.

Action groups. In contrast with action sets, we suggest a new term, action group. The term refers to bounded, purposive entities emerging out of networks which differ from action-sets by having hierarchically structured roles including leader roles and by serving collective rather than individual purposes. Action groups are true groups formed for the purpose of task-related social action. Again, the action can take place under the name of the action group rather than the network, allowing action, but protecting the network.

We shall return to this issue after consideration of the history of a particular network. This entity, the Cross Problematic Committee (CPC), has existed in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, since 1975. A study of its development and activities can shed light both on development of network goals and on the conditions under which a network can be effective.

1Dr. Sandra Prince-Embury is thanked for suggesting this possibility.
The Cross Problematic Committee

The City of Harrisburg lies on the Susquehanna River in south central Pennsylvania. It is a manufacturing center, a transportation center, and the State Capital. Dauphin County, within which Harrisburg lies, has a 1980 census of 232,317; and the Harrisburg Standard Metropolitan Statistical Area (Dauphin, Cumberland, and Perry counties) has a population of 446,071 (Scotzin, 1981). A 1980 survey of social agencies, carried out by Direction Services, indicates over 800 such agencies in the metropolitan region. The city is somewhat less than 200 years old and has an ethnically and racially mixed population. Although Harrisburg itself is rather small (53,000 in 1980), it shares some of the urban problems (racial tension, high inner-city unemployment, out migration) of its sister cities in the northeast.

History. The Committee's two founding agencies were Harrisburg's 24-hour ambulatory alcohol detoxification shelter and its emergency mental health/mental retardation (MH/MR) crisis intervention program. The two systems (drug and alcohol and MH/MR) came into contact largely through these two agencies.

The founders of the CPC saw a relationship between the trend toward specialization in human services and the need for the corrective development of intercoordinative machinery.

Programs which provide emergency 24-hour human service seem to be fertile ground for the development of contact networks and for the identification of service gaps in the community. Such agencies must respond to a great range of service needs since they are often the only human service shows in town during hours of darkness (supplemented of course by emergency medical and law enforcement programs) and since they must learn to draw creatively on resources to treat effectively each human service crisis.

The two founding agencies became aware that many people with multiple problems, such as those who were both emotionally distressed and abusive of alcohol, could be justifiably turned away by the MH/MR agency because they were alcohol abusers, but also turned away by drug and alcohol because they needed mental health services. By applying in good faith a rigid set of standards for service eligibility, each agency closed the door on clients in need.

In researching the client records, the two agencies became convinced that, for want of cooperation and flexibility, a large number of seriously disabled persons were being excluded from service caseloads; and it was out of these-specific concerns that the first CPC meeting occurred in September, 1975. From the start, the CPC was an informal human services network for the
sharing of information and the identification of case specific problems.

The early meetings of the CPC included participation from primary providers of service within the drug and alcohol and MH/MR systems. The meetings discussed clients who appeared on the caseloads of both agencies. The hope was that enough cooperation could be engendered in these meetings to permit the development of joint treatment plans. Such plans did indeed result in some cases.

Quite soon, the CPC expanded its membership to other human service organizations. As agencies discussed one another's services, the CPC began to demonstrate merit as a forum for information sharing across human service disciplines; and program representatives began to feel more comfortable with one another.

The CPC quickly identified service gaps affecting clusters of clients. By early 1976, the Committee had begun to consider ways in which service gaps could be brought to the attention of those in positions of power. These service gaps, highlighted through the consideration of case specific problems, became "causes for the Committee.

Through word of mouth within the human service community, the fact became advertised that a forum was evolving through which individual agencies could gain the floor to discuss their work and concerns with professionals and workers from other programs.

Participants in the CPC varied from meeting to meeting, but with each new issue or client additional agencies joined in the process. Meetings not devoted to particular cross problematic people were focused on topics such as shelter for transients or a particular agency's program. As more agencies used the Committee for whatever purpose, its value as an information sharing setting heightened. By the end of the first year, what had originally begun as an interface between two agencies became a project that incorporated 15 human services. It had also evolved from clinical discussion to information sharing and issue evaluation.

Within the first year, one action-set\(^2\) had developed, led by the Committee's convener. This focused on residential treatment

\(^2\) In reviewing Committee records, the following operational distinction was made between an action-set and an action group. If an individual member of the Committee had become interested in an issue and if there were evidence of that individual's activating others about the issue but no evidence of a group forming, with meetings, division of labor, or a name, then an action-set was inferred. If there were evidence of meetings of more than two people, division of labor, and a name, then an action group was inferred. Note that the work of either a set or a group can take place either inside or outside the Committee network itself.
for organically disabled alcohol abusers and succeeded in developing community support for a shelter. Along the way, Committee discussion also generated momentum to a United Way Task Force an action group which developed astutely and facilitated establishment of an eventual YWCA emergency shelter.

During the second full year, 1977, it became clear that the Committee was serving simultaneous functions that were in some ways beginning to compete with one another for time. The Committee, which met bi-weekly, was becoming increasingly absorbed in addressing problem areas and considering ways of bringing about community change while the case-specific discussions, which most interested many of the original members, had taken a second seat. By the end of 1977, 43 people had attended one or more meetings, 33 of them during 1977 itself. Of these 33, 18 joined the group during 1977.

As the group continued to grow and included people from outside the continuum of care for clients, concerns for confidentiality in the discussion of individual cases arose. This was at a time of new and stricter State and Federal guidelines for the sharing of information about clients in treatment.

Problems related to confidentiality eventually proved insurmountable to the Committee, which dropped the case specific function from its repertoire after experimenting briefly with compromise strategies. Records of CPC meetings show that during the third year (1978), it had become almost exclusively information sharing and issue oriented in its agendas. The confidentiality crisis represented the end of the first phase of development for the Committee. Although this change was accompanied by some shifting in core representation, the Committee continued to expand in size and scope.

As discussion of cases decreased, consideration of issues increased. In the second year, 1977, one action-set was formed around Traveler's Assistance, and a group formed seeking support for a halfway house for non-alcoholic drug abusers. The Traveler's Assistance set still (as of 1981) exists and shows promise of giving rise to United Way funding. The halfway house group failed and disbanded.

Although variables other than just the focus of the Committee were probably at play, the core of the network shifted away for organizations with primary case-specific concerns (e.g., alcoholism, children and youth, probation) and toward those with more general planning concerns (e.g., the YWCA and United Way) in the period from 1978 to 1979.
During 1978, one additional action group was formed, tellingly named the Resource and Influence Committee, whose charge it was to seek both for the Committee. By 1980, this sub-committee had developed into a full-blown steering committee. This evolution will be examined further below.

By the Fall of its fourth year, 1979, the CPC was simultaneously pursuing many issues, several of which required the development of sub-committees answering back with recommendations for action. Still, the Committee was informal, unincorporated, and only loosely coordinated.

An emphasis on issues characterized the Committee's second phase.

The Committee approached issues in several ways. Some problems were resolved through the natural process of information sharing through network meetings in which agencies improved communications and thereby offered better service.

Some issues tackled by the Cross Problematic Committee called for more than the process of meeting and discussing, particularly those which cited service deficits that only new programming could correct.

By the end of 1980, an additional group had formed which was clearly based outside the Committee with a constituency and some hope of developing a center for deaf people. Four additional action-sets had also developed centered around interested individual committee members. All still function, up to the time of this writing, the Spring of 1981. One focuses on public relations for the Committee. Another, working on client problems with MH/MR catchment areas, continues with the active involvement of the Steering Committee. The third focuses on tenant-landlord relationships and has scheduled several discussion meetings with landlords and with city low-income housing officials. The fourth focuses on problems of adolescents and works by providing a Committee liaison with interested community leaders.

As time passed, the Committee established and maintained close communication and overlapping membership with the United Way, the coordinative offices of County Human Services and City government. These links enabled the CPC to speak to decision makers about the periodic need for innovation. The Committee was successful in putting its priorities on the "to do" lists of influence wielding organizations, and this made the Committee's role in community issues even more legitimate.

In looking back over the first five years of the CPC, there is much to suggest that something here has worked to bring agencies together to share information, identify problems, serve as a forum for planning, and seek solutions. Participation rose from 15
participating agencies in 1975 to 69 in 1979 with more than 140 agencies having participated in some fashion by December, 1980. One hundred and fifteen agencies or individuals currently receive minutes.

Process. One of the more obvious elements in the success of the Committee is its reliance on a consensus model for decision-making, which allows both informality and enough order to advance solution.

The Committee operates by consensus, meaning that activities and projects of the Committee must first be unanimously approved by those present at meetings. Since no one objects to the development of action sets and groups, the CPC has been able to avoid two common traps: the statement of generalities too broad to pursue, or the development of factions which no longer communicate with each other. Consensus reduces the potential threat to any member while it allows the development of broad policy, which can lead to action.

Of course, adopting the consensus model does delimit the potential range of action possibilities for the larger Committee. Some issues that speak to the very heart of what is wrong in the community cannot be effectively addressed through a consensus forum (one veto and you’re out); but again the trade-off is that the Committee has succeeded in bringing diverse groups together to select problems and strategies.

Another element that accounts for Committee diversity is a matter of style. Under the ongoing leadership of the chairperson, there is an implicit understanding that, "We are all in this together." The question is not, "Who is doing his or her job," but "What can we do together to make the community work more effectively." This makes Committee participation attractive to a wide variety of people: administrators, supervisors, direct service workers, and citizens. Because of this vertical mix, discussions of issues tend not to focus on the territory and culpability of particular agencies but rather on potential interorganizational solutions.

Structure. The discussion of style brings us to the discussion of Committee structure. Once more, the CPC is a vehicle without by-laws and without binding parameters. The chairperson and action-set or action group leaders provide much of the energy. No formal offices exist. The necessary ingredients have been the willingness of agencies to permit representatives to attend and to commit space for meeting locations which shift from agency to agency. One benefactor agency (the local MH/MR program) has released the time of the chairperson between meetings for meeting coordination, phone calls, and preparation and circulation of meeting minutes. The chairperson has acted as such throughout the history of the CPC.
One of the more interesting issues relating to structure within the Committee has come out of discussions about how best the Committee might develop resources with which to gain additional policy-making influence. As was mentioned above, an Influence and Resources sub-committee formed in 1978, charged with exploration of various alternative routes to increased power. After several meetings and much discussion, the sub-committee (by then an action group) recommended that grant proposals be written so as to bring funding for a staff person. This person's job would be to coordinate sub-committee (action-set or action group) activities and do necessary research and followup of Committee decisions.

At a meeting in the Fall of 1979, the Committee rejected this recommendation for two reasons. First, there was fear that obtaining funding would threaten member agencies, who would become concerned about possible conflicts over policy issues with a high-profile Committee. Second, network members felt that a staff person, if hired, would tend to solidify his or her position by locating issues or problems which demanded staff time, whether or not the Committee would otherwise feel that action was called for. Members expressed liking for the informality of the Committee and for the fact that it was able to drop issues which seemed unimportant to the membership.

After considerable further sub-committee discussion, the leader of the Influence and Resources sub-committee suggested that it might appropriately transform itself into a steering committee to be made up of leaders of action-sets or action groups and other interested individuals. This suggestion was accepted at a Committee meeting in early October, 1980. The Steering Committee continues to meet between Committee meetings with coordination of action and strategy as its primary agenda. It recommends policy to the full Committee but does not act on its own.

Discussion

The decision not to hire staff is particularly interesting since it provides one way to avoid the goal displacement to which the development of vested staff interests would tend to give rise (Selznick, 1943; Hudson, 1978).

At the same time, the development of a Steering Committee provides a mechanism for necessary internal division of labor and coordination of effort. The Steering Committee becomes, in effect, an action group with the Committee as a whole as its field. With the maintenance of a consensus decision-making norm, the Committee can remain informal and non-threatening to its membership.

However, in order to carry out Committee decisions and have effect on people external to the Committee, additional sub-sets
of people capable of carrying out action seem to be necessary. What the Committee has hit upon is a widely varying array of subcommittees ranging from single people who activate others (action-sets) of full-blown possibly externally based groups which can act in their own names (action groups). Since action on social issues involves conflict and conflict gives rise to groups (Sherif, 1966), action groups seem most likely to form where controversy is present. The history of the Committee suggests that action groups are most likely to form either when new resources are needed to fill service gaps or when policy changes are necessary at a systems level in order to correct policy. In other cases, either informal coordination or action by interested individuals seems sufficient to correct fragmentation or the filling of service gaps through reallocation of resources. Figure 1 outlines these relationships.

### Figure 1

Relationships Between Human Service Problems, Solutions, and Degree of Appropriate Group Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Solution (Goals)</th>
<th>Degree of Structure of Entity Achieving Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fragmentation</td>
<td>Informal Coordination</td>
<td>Low: Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Gap</td>
<td>1. Plan reallocation of existent resources</td>
<td>1. Medium: Action-Set</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Plan development of new resources</td>
<td>2. High: Action-Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systemic Cause of Human Hardship</td>
<td>Campaign for social change</td>
<td>High: Action-Group</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An example might clarify the relationships further. At the same time, it can illustrate the possible evolutionary development from network to action-set to action group.

**An Example: Fuel Costs.** In the least structured of network settings, a news-sharing session among workers from various agencies, a variety of concerns can arise. For example, as winter nears and oil prices rise, methods for handling emergency requests for fuel or fuel monies are likely to be discussed. At the very least, agencies will learn of each other's plans (or the lack of them). Individual agency staff or agency representatives might
go on record as being willing to allocate staff time or monies to fuel-related concerns. Sometimes an open commitment of this form can be useful in itself when publicized through network minutes.

On the other hand, it may be that what surfaces in an information sharing session is that there are no adequate plans to handle an impending fuel crisis. Federal monies may not have been appropriated, state disbursement systems may not be in place, or other snags might occur. In this case, a network has a number of alternatives for action.

It might, for instance, form a sub-group (an action-set) focused around an interested network member, which would write a letter, contact appropriate officials, or otherwise make action-set concerns known to those in power. This is a short-lived sort of activity, the mildest form of administrative lobbying. Agitation for planning has emerged out of information sharing. There has been a small, incremental shift in an ad hoc goal. With this shift, there has also been a change in network structure. The action-set is an identifiable sub-grouping: and, should it continue functioning longer than the time necessary to send off a letter, it is likely to develop its own internal structure of roles and statuses.

In some cases, there will be conflict within the network over the appropriateness of this sort of administrative lobbying. The development of an action-set allows a consensus against lobbying to continue within the network as a whole, while at the same time allowing others to take action in their own names.

In some cases, network meetings might, through the simple fact of interpersonal nurturance, embolden members to take action within their own agencies, forming action-sets of which the network itself is not aware. Indeed, it often may be that it is in this fashion that networks lead to social action: by strengthening individuals rather than by forming action-sets or groups directly.

However, one’s home agency is not always fertile ground for action, and action-sets are not always effective.

Another strategy, which seems particularly effective filling service gaps, is resource bartering. Sarason (Sarason and Lorentz, 1979; Sarason, et al., 1977) has been a particular champion of bartering as a solution to the problem of diminishing resources. The essential idea is that people with various skills and other resources can be brought together, sometimes outside of their professional roles, and set to work on a problem with as little flow of dollars or development of group structure as possible.

A grouping like this has aspects of both action-sets and action groups. It is ad hoc and task focused but dependent on leadership (Sarason and Lorentz, 1979), and therefore partially structured. It is an action-set which has changed through continued existence over time. In the fuel example we are using here,
a bartering group might pool all available agency resources and set up an emergency fuel center with some monies and supplies but with more people acting in general helping roles.

What if the action-set should still be ineffective? To carry the energy example forward, what if fuel prices continue to rise, funding is not forthcoming to low-income people in need of fuel, and resource bartering cannot meet the need? A variety of possible goals, strategies, and tactics is available.

One strategy is simply to reiterate action-set activity attempting to bring about social planning through attempts at persuasion. Another would be to locate potential allies and begin to pressure state level administrators and legislators. To do so is to move into Rothman's (1970) realm of social action which is an inherently more hard-edged kind of activity based upon conflict.

Clearly, it would be difficult and unlikely for a network of human service workers to enter into contest with, among others, their funders and employers. Network consensus would collapse with the introduction of such a goal. On the other hand, it might be possible for a sub-set of relatively invulnerable workers to come together, informed by network meetings, but acting without specific network authorization. Even with such independence, network linkages could be used, along with others. Such a sub-set, we suggest, is likely to become an action group by engaging in conflict and thereby developing internal structure and in-group boundaries. Eventually, the action group might transform itself into either a citizen's interest group or part of a larger coalition of such groups.

The network has spawned an action group, which then exists independent of the network. By doing so, the network maintains its own goals, while not inhibiting the development of new activity (Hudson, 1978).

**Summary**

The history of the Cross Problematic Committee illustrates one way for an informal network to remain informal but also take social action and be effective.

An emphasis on consensus reduces the threat of unwanted policy decisions for any given member. At the same time, the development of "one-shot" action sets or their more formal brethren, action groups, allows sub-sets of the network members to take action on issues. If the members all agree, such action can take place in the name of the network itself. If not, however, action groups or action-sets can act in their own names, energized by network discussion, but acting independently. It is clear that such informal mechanisms for social action will become increasingly
important as fragmentation of social services persists, and budget cuts reduce services and force innovative solutions.

References

Cox, F. and Tropman J.

Erikson, K.

Hudson, J.

Levine, S.

Levine, S. and White, P.E.

Litwak, E. and Hylton, L.

Mayer, A.C.

McShane, C.

Meyer, H., Litwak, E., Thomas E. and Vinter, R.

Mitchell, J.C.

Reid, T.A., and Chandler, G.E.
Rothman, J.

Sarason, S.B., Carroll, C.F., Maton, K., Cohen, S. and Lorentz, E.

Sarason, S.B. and Lorentz, E.

Scotzin, J.

Selznick, P.

Sherif, M.

Sherif, M. and Sherif, C.W.

Warren, R. L., Rose, S.M. and Bergunder, A.F.
Regional Reference Groups in the Spreading of Occupational Licensing Policies Among the States: An Exploratory Study

Timothy W. Lause, Ph.D.
Wichita State University

Abstract

This study explores the diffusion of state licensing policies, particularly the role of regional cue-taking in the adoption of new policies. Five such networks are suggested, along with the states most likely to serve as models for those reference groups. Findings have several implications for social work lobbying efforts.

Social workers have participated in state policy debates throughout professional history. However, the organization for coordinated involvement is quite new. It emerged in the mid-seventies with an expanding record of legislative action by the state chapters of the National Association of Social Workers (Lause, 1979). These associations enable the profession to pursue various social reforms at the state level and that capacity is most timely in its development. The nineteen eighties have begun with an empowerment of designs for social welfare which seem archaic and hostile to an extent unprecedented in modern history. Certainly, the first "state of the union" address of the Reagan administration calls for significant shifts in the roles of federal and state governments in the amelioration and solution of many social problems. In form and content, the "reforms" of the first part of this decade pose strong challenges to social work action in the fifty statehouses as well as in the national congress. Given the historic stability of our federal system, however, the statehouses will continue to be major arenas for policy development even when a national administration asserts again a progressive agenda for social welfare. This study of regional diffusion in the spreading of policy innovations is designed to suggest ways that social work might improve its effectiveness in legislative action in both the worst and best of times. Moreover, it illustrates the need to develop an understanding of policymaking in the states which is at least partially distinguishable from the bases of knowledge used for professional action in local or national arenas.

Several models of policy innovation are well suited to decisionmaking in the states. First, the diffusion model holds that change results typically from the borrowing of ideas rather than from independent invention and that those patterns of exchange are patterned, not random (Rogers, 1962). Second, the organizational model directs attention to legislative norms or informal rules which guide state deliberations and decisions (Lindblom, 1959; Wildavsky, 1974). Third, the regional model looks to underlying similarities in state economics, culture, and political organization as explanations for their policy decisions (Sharkansky,
1968, 1970; Garreau, 1981). These three models combine to suggest scenarios for the adoption of reforms by individual states and for the overall spreading of policy innovations among them.

The cornerstone of the scenario for individual states is a tendency of officials to view the policy innovations of nearby states as potential guides or models for their own decisions (Walker, 1973: 1187). In contrast, distant states are likely to be discounted as appropriate models if they are seen as operating under different cultural, political, or economic circumstances. The perceptions of shared histories and current conditions may be expressed as legislative norms which lie somewhat hidden in established patterns of consultation and cuetaking between states. For example, officials in Louisiana may look to Texas or Arkansas as potential models but not even consider seriously Michigan or California in such a role.

From a nationwide perspective, the same models suggest another related scenario for the overall spreading of new policies among the states. First, a relatively few may gain nationwide reputations as pioneers or originators of bold reforms. However, that same reputation may make them too different from most states to serve widely as direct models in cuetaking. Instead, regional models and reference groups seem to structure cuetaking for most states (Walker, 1969: 892). In brief, innovation tends to begin with adoptions by one or more national pioneers, followed by enactments in other states which then serve as regional models for the remaining states.

State policy diffusion research, therefore, has two types of applications in social work's approach to legislative action. The first involves action in individual states, based upon knowledge of which neighbors tend to be viewed as comparable and reasonable guides for policy innovation. The second application involves strategies for promoting rapid nationwide adoptions of preferred policies. In this case, both national pioneers and regional models would be targeted as priorities in lobbying efforts. While knowledge of reference patterns between states in no way ensures success in these efforts, it would serve as a definite aid in overcoming inertia and uncertainty about policy reform in the states.

Evidence of Cuetaking Between States

State officials have taken note of policy developments in other states since the first days of constitutional ratification. Today, a great variety of special organizations promote exchanges of information about new policies. They include organizations of state officials, such as the National Legislative Conference which encourages cuetaking through written reports, regional meetings, and national assemblies (Ross and Millsap, 1966: 40). In addition, the state funded Council of State Governments serves as an interstate clearinghouse on the performance of policy innovations. The regional offices of many federal departments are also active in the dissemination of information among state agencies which, in turn, may model their legislative proposals on policies adopted by other states. Finally, special interest groups may promote cuetaking between states in subtle ways. Their lobbying may be intensified as policy decisions in other states demonstrate the feasibility of success in their own efforts, particularly when those models are neighboring states. All the above organizations provide the states...
with ample opportunity for taking cues from each other in the adoption of new policies.

A number of studies provide direct evidence of interstate cuetaking. Over 90 percent of the heads of 67 state agencies in four southern states reported that they had consulted with counterparts in other states for ideas on how policy issues might be approached in their own state (Sharkansky, 1968: 103). Three quarters of these contacts involved southern states. Nationwide surveys add documentation of the practice of cuetaking (Light, 1978; Wright and Peddicord, 1974). Officials view other states as more useful sources of new ideas than the federal government, even when their agency depends heavily on federal funds (Light, 1978: 151-152). Case studies in Missouri (Masters and Salisbury, 1964) and in Illinois (Anton, 1966) also found cuetaking between states in the deliberations of legislative bodies. However, they seemed to view only certain other states as reasonable comparisons and useful models for their own decisions.

Evidence of regional cuetaking is not limited to surveys and field studies. Walker (1969: 894) concludes that a number of regional networks influence the spreading of policy innovations, based on a Q factor analysis of relations between states in the timing of their policy enactments. He suggested that such networks operate in the south, mountain-northwest, Great Lakes, Middle Atlantic, border, and New England areas (Walker, 1969: 884). New York, Massachusetts, California, and New Jersey are identified as likely national pioneers in the adoption of new policies (Walker, 1969: 884). Unlike the other nationwide studies, Walker (1969) proposes boundaries for the various regional networks of states. This study shares that objective and it adopts the same methodology. However, its focus is limited to diffusion within one field of state policy rather than diffusion patterns which might apply to all fields of innovation.

**General vs. Selective Diffusion Networks**

There is some indication that state officials may adjust their regional orientations when proposed innovations involve different fields of policy. New ideas are usually borrowed from others when conditions related to a change are similar. What happens when the strength of similarities which underlie a particular regional orientation vary as different types of similarities are being considered? Missouri officials, for example, might identify with their southern and western neighbors for cuetaking in the field of education because of similarities in tax bases and public opinion. In terms of cuetaking in the field of energy or natural resources, however, these similarities are less relevant than they are for education innovations. Indeed, differences in climate, fuel reserves, and economic organization may lead Missouri officials to discount their southern and western neighbors as reasonable models for their own energy policies. Those types of characteristics might prompt a northern or eastern orientation in energy related policies. This variable or dynamic view of regionalism is supported by Sharkansky's (1970) analysis. He found that different variants of regional boundaries are most useful for predicting different sets of social, political, economic, and state policy variables (Sharkansky, 1970: 33-37). This study focuses on a single field in order to avoid the problematic assumption that regionalism is a mono-
lithic phenomenon which supports, in turn, use of the same regional orientations regardless of field distinction. Sharkansky's (1970) research is far more convincing than the implications of a long series of earlier studies which adopted preconceived boundaries for the areas of their studies (Donnelly, 1940; Fenton, 1957; Jones, 1961; Key, 1949, 1961; Lockhard, 1955). In addition to Sharkansky's (1970) work, the uneven currents of modernizations support a less simplified view of regionalism and regional cuetaking. While this study does not test the importance of field distinctions, its findings may be compared tentatively with Walker's (1969) conclusions about the likely boundaries of general diffusion networks.

The selection of the occupational regulation field, per se, has no special theoretical importance. Study of diffusion in the field of transportation would serve the same function vis-à-vis the literature and reforms in such fields as housing or income security have greater impact on the quality of life than occupational licensing. It is a practical consideration which prompts this particular focus. Social work licensing has been a more common legislative priority of state professional associations than any other single issue (Lause, 1979: 272). No drastic change in those priorities would be required for use of research conclusions given the selection of this field.

**Research Design and Methodology**

This study draws its conclusions from analyses of the timing of policy adoption by the 48 continental states. A purposive sample of 33 state licensing policies ranges across a wide variety of occupations. The dates of adoption were gathered from the statute collections of the individual states, housed at St. Louis University. Each adoption was then scored according to the speed of enactment relative to the total period involved in the spreading of a given policy. A total of 1,584 of these standard measurements provided the data base for this study.

Alaska and Hawaii were excluded from this study because of their distance from any other state, given the focus on regional cuetaking. Similarly, five policy innovations were dropped from an earlier sample because they had been enacted in only several states. Given the focus on patterns in the spreading of new policies, there was little value in the inclusion of novel policies or those which had not yet been adopted by a substantial number. Figure 1 lists the sample of policies which had been adopted by at least five states. Two-thirds of the policies had been adopted by over half of the states.

**Figure 1.**

**Subjects of Selected Licensing Policies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Architect</th>
<th>Engineer</th>
<th>Physician</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attorney</td>
<td>Funeral Director</td>
<td>Pharmacist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>Insurance Agent</td>
<td>Practical Nurse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barber</td>
<td>Librarian</td>
<td>Real Estate Agent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
State Policy Innovation Scores

The most important measurement in this study is the policy innovation score. As developed by Walker (1969), they are standard measures of the speed of enactment relative to the percentile of the total diffusion period which had elapsed. A score of .5, for example, means that half of the period had elapsed by the time of a particular adoption. Enactments during the first year of a policy's appearance on the national scene were scored at 1.0 and those enactments during the final year of enactment by any state were scored at 0.0. When one or more states had not yet adopted a reform, 1975 was used as the terminal point for the diffusion period and those states were scored at 0.0. The state means for the 33 scores, page 12, provide comparable measurements of the timing of state policy reforms and the sample of individual scores permits an inductive analysis of relations between states in the timing of those policy adoptions.

Analytic and Statistical Techniques

Conclusions about likely model states and the boundaries of regional reference groups are drawn from two types of analysis. As suggested, the comparison of state means represents a straightforward indication of which states tend to initiate new policies or adopt them rapidly and which states tend to lag in the occupational regulation field. A more complex form of analysis is needed to infer regional cuetaking from a matrix of data which correlates the scores of each state to those of all other states. Since regional models cannot be suggested before reaching conclusions about the composition or boundaries of these networks, the less familiar statistical results appear before state means are presented.

As in Walker's (1969) study, regional networks are suggested by the results of a Q-type factor analysis. This approach avoids dependence upon preconceived notions of regional boundaries and permits a nationwide scope but it has its own limitations. Unlike the more popular forms of factor analysis, the Q-type simplifies a matrix of correlations between states in terms of their respective innovation scores for the 33 policies. Rather than analyzing the data to indicate sources of common variance among policy innovations, this factor method suggests possible sources of relations among states in the timing of their policy adoptions in this field. When bordering states have substantial loadings on the same independent factor, regional cuetaking is inferred as that source of common variance for those states. While such inferences flow from the grouping of states across the factor results and are supported generally by the literature on state politics,
these conclusions are presented tentatively. As indicated, their sole empirical basis is the relations between states in the timing of their policy adoptions.

Introduction to Factor Results

Four factors combine to account for about 81 percent of the common variance in the matrix of correlations between states in the timing of their policy adoptions. The factors described in Table 1 are limited to those having eigenvalues greater than 1.0. This "Kaiser's criterion" is most reliable, given the 48 state variables included in the analysis (Child, 1970: 43). It halts the extraction of factors at a point when additional factors might account for only inconsequential proportions of the common variance in the relations between the states. Beyond this point the factors consist of secondary state loadings. The four common factors of this study are interpreted by the groups of states which are correlated to each at the level of .40 or above. Since the varimax calculation of factors makes the interpretation of state loadings identical to parametric correlations, aloading of .40 indicates that as much as sixteen percent of a given state's correlations with others might be attributed to an hypothesized source. Although moderate, this standard is somewhat more rigorous than the recommended .30 criterion (Child, 1970: 45).

The data analysis was programmed to extract factor variance, beginning with the largest and followed by independent factors which accounted for shares of the remaining common variance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor Number</th>
<th>Eigenvalues</th>
<th>Percentage of Variance</th>
<th>Cumulative Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>24.4</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>70.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>76.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>80.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings and Conclusions

The factor results do include some regional groupings from which cuetaking networks may be inferred. Five networks are suggested by the state loadings listed in Table 2. Twenty five states belong to groups in the plains, New England, mountain, Great Lakes, and north central regions. Eleven states have primary loading on one of these factors but do not share boundaries with the regional cluster formed by the other states. The remaining states either had very low loadings on a number of factors or formed a unique factor below the 1.0 Kaiser criterion. This section begins with the interpretation of the first four factor
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
<th>Factor 3</th>
<th>Factor 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>West Virginia</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\( n = 33 \)

Occupational regulation policies

Type Varimax Factor Analysis of Relations Between 48 States in Adoption of

Table 2
results and the suggested cue-taking networks, mapped in Figure 2. It concludes with a comparison of state mean innovation scores to suggest the likely national pioneers and regional models for this field of policy.

Two distant regional clusters are formed by the states of the first factor. Of these thirteen states, only two fell outside New England and a plains group. Six create a line from Oklahoma in the south to North Dakota, while five form a tight group in the core area of New England. (See code 1, Figure 2.) Since the first factor had been programmed to be the one which might account for the greatest possible variation in the relations between states, the appearance of two regional groups is not too surprising. Dual groups are present in Walker's (1969) results as well. Nonetheless, the suggested boundaries of these plains and New England groups are offered tentatively.

A group of mountain states are grouped on the second factor. However, the indicated boundaries are irregular, given substantial loadings by Colorado, Utah, Montana, Idaho, and Washington. Nearly half of the first factor states are scattered across the map. Therefore, tentativeness marks conclusions about the boundaries of this mountain network. (Code 2, Figure 2)

Figure 2.
Map of Regional Groups in Factor Results
for a Field of Occupational Regulation Policies
(N = 33)

Notes. Numbers designate factor order. National models are marked with circles and regional models with an "X." The grouped states have common factor loading at the .40 level or above.
The third factor includes the smallest of the suggested networks. (See code 3.) Strictly speaking, a "western" Great Lakes label is more accurate than the above designation, given the Illinois, Wisconsin, Michigan, and Indiana cluster. Finally, a fifth group in the north central region appears in the state loadings for the fourth factor. (See code 4.) Iowa and Minnesota are loaded exclusively on this factor, while Missouri and the two Dakotas have complex loadings. They are clustered with Iowa and Minnesota in the north central group but they have slightly higher loadings on the first factor with the plains group. There are several possible interpretations of this overlap between the plains and north central groups. One interpretation might involve the historical process of either consolidation or disintegration of a larger midwestern network which encompasses both the plains and the north central regions. Another interpretation of this overlap is simply that a small group of states serves as a bridge between the two suggested networks and that Missouri and the two Dakotas do not limit their regional orientations to either one of the groups.

The mean policy innovation scores for the individual states are presented in Table 3, along with their ranks. The means range from .23 for Alabama to .57 for California. The likely national models for the occupational regulation field include California, New York, Pennsylvania, New Jersey, Ohio, Illinois, and Wisconsin. These states tend to adopt policy innovations in this field more rapidly than the mass of states. Therefore, they are in the best position to serve as models for reform beyond their immediate regions. The 25 states grouped within one of the five suggested regions, however, did not seem to model their decisions directly after these national pioneers. It is more likely that they took cues from states within their respective regional orientations which tended to adopt innovations first within the region. In some cases these probable regional models are laggards from a nationwide perspective while the lead in their own areas. The suggested regional models are marked by an "x" in Figure 2. They include Iowa for the north central group; Colorado for the mountain; Oklahoma for the plains; Illinois or Wisconsin for the western Great Lakes; and Connecticut or Rhode Island for the suggested New England network. In the latter two regions, two states are identified as likely models since the differences in mean scores are quite marginal.

The above findings refer exclusively to diffusion in the occupational regulation field. In contrast, Walker's (1969) study focuses on regional networks and model states which apply to cuetaking between states regardless of distinctions among policy fields. Therefore, a comparison of the conclusions of these two studies provides some indication of the possible importance of field distinctions in the cuetaking orientations of the states. The field of policy innovation, for example, does seem relevant to the regional orientations of plains and north central states. These regions are suggested networks for the occupational regulation field but no counterparts for them are reported in Walker's (1969) study of general diffusion networks. In the latter study policies are included from twelve policy fields. Three additional networks are reported in this earlier study but absent in the results reported here. They include suggested networks in the south, the mid-Atlantic, and border areas. It seems that states in these areas may take cues from each other in some fields of policy but are not in-
Table 3.
Mean Innovation Scores of 48 States and Their Ranks*
(N = 33)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Mean Rank</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>Mean Rank</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>Mean Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>ME</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>MD</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AK</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>MC</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>MN</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>MO</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>MT</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FL</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>NB</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>NV</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ID</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>NH</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IL</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>NJ</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>NY</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KS</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>NC</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KT</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>ND</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ranks are based on three digit innovation scores in some cases.

While contrasts in the above regions are marked, somewhat similar regional groups are indicated in other regions. In each of these regions, however, the networks suggested for the occupational regulation field appear smaller or less inclusive than the networks which Walker (1969) characterizes as general or multi-field regional orientations. The mountain group suggested in this study, for example, did not include the two Dakotas or Oregon. Instead, the Dakotas are grouped with plains and north central groups in this study. Similarly, the Great Lakes groups for the field studied here does not include Ohio, New York, or Pennsylvania. The latter two states, along with Maine, are also absent from the New England network suggested in this study but included in Walker's (1969) general networks.

In general, these comparisons indicate that those regional orientations which seem to influence the borrowing of policy innovations in one field do not necessarily apply to cue-taking in other fields. The possible importance of field distinctions is also suggested by a comparison of the states which are identified as probable national pioneers or models in the above studies. Iowa, Virginia, Maryland, Louisiana, and Oregon, for example, rank in the top quarter of states in the rapid adoption of occupational regulation policies. They lack such a high rank in Walker's (1969) multi-field composite scores. On the other hand, it
seems that a few states may serve as rather general national models in the adoption of new policies. Such states as California, New York, and New Jersey have high ranks in both this study and Walker's (1969). Because of the noted differences in the suggested regional groups for those two studies, regional models cannot be compared in a systematic fashion. Where comparable regional networks are suggested, the likely models differ in some cases and repeat themselves in others.

Research and Professional Practice Implications

The findings of this study indicate that regional orientations do have some influence upon the spreading of policy innovations in the occupational regulation field. Twenty-five of the 48 states are included in the five regional networks suggested by this analysis. The boundaries of these networks do not fit such popular designations as the "sunbelt," midwest, or northeast. Therefore, future researchers are cautioned against use of preconceived regional boundaries in their approaches to state policy diffusion.

The contrasts noted between the findings of this study of diffusion in the occupational regulation field and Walker's (1969) general study of state policy diffusion imply that officials may adjust their regional orientations toward cue-taking when different fields of policy innovations are involved. Therefore, future studies should be designed to accommodate the possible influence distinctions even if their impact is not the prime research focus. Where future studies do focus upon field distinctions as a factor in regional cuetaking, field studies would seem to be the most appropriate methodology. Such an approach would also offer opportunities to explore other contingencies which may shape the diffusion of policies among states. Given the protracted campaign of the state chapters of the National Association of Social Workers for social work licensing, such field studies might be combined with their participation in legislative debates.

As suggested in the introduction of this article there are two types of uses of diffusion research in social work lobbying at the state level. From a nationwide perspective, both national and regional models should be targeted as priorities for legislative action. Many of the states which seem to fill the role of models have not yet adopted social work licensing and this fact may have retarded the spreading of this innovation after a number of early successes in other states during the mid-seventies. Of the national models suggested by this study, only California has adopted multi-level licensing. This leaves New York, New Jersey, and Ohio as recommended target states. Suggested regional models include Oklahoma, Illinois, Colorado, Connecticut, and Iowa. Therefore, lobbying efforts within the mountain group of states might be strengthened by the presentation of supporting evidence from the suggested model, Colorado, which has adopted social work licensing. States within the plains, north central, New England, and Great Lakes groups may be approached with evidence of the feasibility and desirability of social work licensing from other network members, even when those states are not normally regarded as innovators within their regions. In this sense, knowledge of regional orientations may be used in lobbying for licensing even when the sug-
gested regional models have not adopted a preferred policy. The findings of this study, therefore, may be applied in social work lobbying in at least the 25 states identified as members of one of the suggested regional networks. In the remaining states, social workers who are active in the legislative process may explore cuetaking patterns as participant-observers. As state chapters expand their legislative agendas beyond social work licensing, the relevance of particular regional orientations will need to be reassessed.

This study, as a whole, illustrates the need to adjust conceptual frameworks to the special circumstances of policymaking at the state level. While the familiarity of social workers with various perspectives of policymaking at the local or national levels has general relevance to intervention in state politics, those perspectives do not direct attention to such dynamics as interstate consultations and regional cuetaking. Unless work begins to develop a special knowledge base for social work participation in state legislation, it seems likely that such a phenomenon as regionalism will be neglected and the effectiveness of lobbying efforts limited accordingly. It has been noted that regional coalitions of state chapters have become important power centers in the delegate assemblies of the National Association of Social Workers (Alexander, 1981). However, consciousness of regional differences need not threaten a common professional identity. Instead, those same coalitions might explore the potential advantage of developing regional strategies to advance shared positions in state policy debates. Optimal use of diffusion research would include that capacity. Perhaps the initiatives and "reforms" of the Reagan administration will inadvertently direct social work attention to the pervasive importance of state policy decisions and to the need for basic research to complement practice in these legislative arenas. Despite the tentativeness of the conclusions reached in this study, they represent one beginning point for such a professional knowledge base.

REFERENCES

Donnelly, T. 1940 Rocky Mountain politics. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
Jones, F.  
1961  
Western politics. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.

Key, V.  
1949  
Southern politics in the state and nation. New York: Knopf.

Key, V.  
1961  
Public opinion and American democracy. New York: Knopf.

Laase, T.  
1979  

Light, A.  
1978  
Intergovernmental sources of innovation in state administration. American Politics Quarterly 6:147-166.

Lindblom, C.  
1959  

Lockard, D.  
1955  

Masters, N. and Salisbury, R.  
1964  
State politics and public schools. New York: Knopf.

Rogers, E.  
1962  

Ross, R. and Millsap, K.  
1966  

Rummel, R.J.  
1970  

Sharkansky, I.  
1968  

Sharkansky, I.  
1970  

Walker, J.  
1969  
The diffusion of innovations among the American states. American Political Science Review 63:880-889

Walker, J.  
1973  

Wildavsky, A.  
1974  

Wright, D. and Peddicord, T.  
1973  
REJECTED FAMILIES: ESTABLISHED AND INNOVATIVE STRUCTURES OF SERVICE

Joseph R. Steiner, Ph.D.
Professor
Syracuse University
School of Social Work

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this paper is to encourage social workers in family settings to consider alternative structures of services to families, especially those families who are rejected from meaningful extra-familial relationships. Rejected families, the established structure of family service and some innovative modifications to this structure are described. Special attention is given to one type of innovative family-service structure, an experimental family residential center, which was successful in reducing rates of child abuse in Holland. Innovative family-service structures, including residential centers, could help many families which do not benefit from the existing structure of family services.

In America, as in Western Europe, social workers are relying more upon family-focused methods to deal with problems which were once dealt with by seeing specific individuals. The established structure of family services is useful for many families, and yet, existing services in numerous communities do not adequately respond to the needs of "rejected families." In the first part of the paper, rejected families and the established structure of family-focused service will be defined. In the second part of the paper, specific attention is given to one type of innovative service structure, a family residential center, which was developed in Holland, and findings of families discharged over eighteen months will be reviewed. This center, De Triangel, accepted only multi-problem families in which children had been abused. Admitted families were motivated to change but had not benefited from receiving established services. Centers similar to this and other innovative services could close a significant family-service gap which now exists in many American communities.

1. Rejected Families and Family-Focused Services

Rejected Families

The term "rejected families" refers to families that are excluded from meaningful interaction with extra-familial structures. Such structures include a variety of systems that generally interact with families, such as educational, religious, and recreational organizations, friendship and extended family networks, and systems providing employment and financial resources. Rejected families generally have multiple problems and are likely to have both intrapersonal and interpersonal problems within the family. What distinguishes rejected families from others needing professional services is the degree to which their interactions with extra-familial structures have not developed or been maintained. (Leichter and Schulman, 1974.)
Physical abuse and emotional neglect of family members are common symptoms in rejected families and common causes of rejection by extra-familial structures. Child abuse, more than most symptoms, puts a family in a scape-goated position as the family responds to the indignation, contempt, and aggression of others informed of the abuse. The sense of guilt, impotence, and unworthiness experienced by abusing parents is often reinforced as schools, judicial bodies, and social agencies respond to the label, "child-abusing family."

Rejected families, unlike many other families requiring services, seem so depleted of positive extra-familial contact that they have little energy for making changes within the family to improve the welfare of individuals. Members also feel powerless to successfully engage themselves beyond the family because they perceive the family, their primary identification, as being discriminated against. This precipitates a destructive family career unless drastic means are instituted to alter this perception and environmental-situational (ecosystem) factors which maintain it (Keeney, 1979).

The established structure of family-focused services is not sufficient for many rejected families (Barnes, et al., 1974 and Tierney, 1976). Regardless of the intention, style, or skill of the family worker(s), this structure may not enable rejected families to avoid becoming the target of others, to improve communication with others in extra-familiar social networks or to give up the negative image of themselves as a family unit. The desirability of aggressively reaching out to hold these families in treatment is questionable since such actions may reinforce a family's scapegoated identity.

Established Structure of Family Service: Worker, Family, Place, and Time

The established structure of family-focused service (i.e., worker, family, place, and time) has been heavily influenced by the traditions, methods, and values associated with direct-practice, rehabilitative settings. This structure is also utilized by agencies providing material or monetary aid to families. Established structure refers to one or two workers meeting with a family or family sub-unit in an office or home for relatively brief sessions (i.e., generally less than one-and-one-half hours per session). The total number of sessions may be open-ended or time-limited. The theoretical perspectives adopted, problems identified, and intervention styles used within this structure reveal wide diversity and creativity. Yet, few family workers deviate from it.

The established structure of service has been reinforced by many assumptions developed by Ackerman (1966), Haley (1963), Minuchin (1974), Satir (1974), and others who realize that intrafamily phenomena influence the development or elimination of personal problems (Spiegel, 1974). The greatest effort has been made to develop service structures that enable workers to directly assess and intervene in a family's intrapersonal and interpersonal problems. Less attention has been given to structuring family services so workers could directly assess and intervene in deficient interactions between family members, or the family as a unit, and extra-familial structures which influence family functioning (Keeney, 1979).
The established structure of service to families is generally valued by persons providing services and those receiving services (Beck and Jones, 1973) and yet, this structure is not adequate for rejected families. Too often, the explanations given for lack of progress focus upon the family, or its members, rather than the established structure of service. The issue of whether the established structure of service fails to achieve the purposes for which it was designed has not been given sufficient attention. There are beginning signs of change as innovative modifications to the established family service structure have appeared in recent literature.

**Innovative Modifications of the Established Structure**

Innovative modifications of the established service structure include alteration of any or all of the following: number of workers, families, meeting places, and/or duration of meetings for the purpose of providing better family services. Many innovative modifications are attempts to improve the relationship between a family and its extra-familial structure. These modified structures increase the range, intensity and/or duration of relationships between a family and extra-familial systems more than would the established structure of service. These increases are often necessary when a family's problems developed primarily because of the family's isolation from meaningful extra-familial structures.

Laqueur (1972) describes an "intersystem conference," a modification of the number of workers, in which a family with multiple problems meets with representatives from all social agencies serving the family. The group selects a chairperson and then decides on specifics, such as goals and meeting times, in regard to the conference. This method involves a different use of workers than an on-going interdisciplinary team (Barnes, et al., 1974) whose members work with a specific family. Different still is a social work team approach which focuses on the family unit, but in which each member is assigned his/her own worker for individual therapy (Mostwin, 1974). Each of these authors value his/her modifications for improving the interaction between families and the structure of service.

Laqueur and others (Laqueur 1969, 1972, 1973; Davis, et al., 1966) helped develop "multiple family therapy" which is a modification in regard to the number of families seen at one time. Laqueur (1972) describes one style of family therapy as a "life boat community" in which four or five families are brought together and after the first session given the following options: return for more talking, return and just listen, or not return. In addition, he also describes the "greyhound bus model" style of therapy in which a family is interviewed by a therapist and possibly a family member in front of as many as seventeen families. The observing families may then go up by "the driver's seat" and be interviewed. Laqueur believes, "Families with battered child problems do better in multi-family sessions" (1972, p. 635). Lansky (et al., 1978) found multiple family groups helpful in working with post-hospitalized psychiatric patients.

Spark (1974) describes intergenerational family therapy in which persons from different generations in an extended family are brought together to facilitate structural and symptomatic changes in the family. Speck and Attneave (1973) extend this idea further to also include persons who are not relatives. These networks, which have included forty-to-sixty persons, are designed to mobilize
good will and other resources to aid in the resolution of family crisis. Leichter and Schulman (1974) have also developed a modification in regard to the number of families seen. They describe this intervention as “multi-family group therapy,” in which three or four families are seen at the same time. They have used marathon sessions as well as long and short-term multi-family groups. Leichter and Schulman conclude that multi-family group therapy is preferable for the

... isolated family or the family whose system is circulating or rigidified ... Another type of family for whom multi-family group therapy is helpful is the family with a missing parent—usually the father (1974, p. 97).

Little has been written about meeting with families for extended periods of time or in places other than an office or home. Hansen (1968) described a modification in which a home visit was extended to one week after ten conjoint family sessions had failed; this extended visit resulted in positive changes within the family.

Aponte (1976) describes a ”family-school interview,” which a worker arranged with family members and school personnel at the school. Following brief intervention, family, school and the initially disruptive child appeared to function better.

Residential programs for single mothers and their infants are rather numerous but it is questionable whether some of these programs have a family-focused perspective. Generally, the mother and child are considered to be equals as clients. Mothers are trained to improve their skills as parents and may be encouraged to complete vocational preparation programs. Infants are cared for and given developmental opportunities (Benas, 1975). Fontana and Robison (1976) extend the opportunities for family residential care to one-parent families in which a mother abuses a child. This therapeutic approach is clearly family-focused and it stresses residential care for mother and child, modification of behavior through corrective child-care experiences, personality modifications through individual and group therapy, and environmental and social changes. They report that all children showed growth and developmental gains which in many cases paralleled the mother’s increasing emotional stability (Fontana and Robison, 1976)

The above modifications of established service structures were helpful to various families who were isolated from meaningful extra-familiar relationships. Some rejected families, however, need more extensive ecosystem intervention to supplement intra-family changes (Keeney, 1979) than is currently available. This realization was present in Amsterdam, Netherlands during the early 70's when Dutch social workers helped develop a residential family care center for "multi problem, child-abusing families" who had not succeeded with established individual and family services.
II. A Residential Family-Care Center  
(De TriAngel, Amsterdam, Netherlands) *

Background

Many of the same factors that led to an increased reliance upon family-focused methods in the United States supported the development of De TriAngel in Amsterdam, which had previously existed as a children's institution. The realization that some children (and families) could not benefit from individualized treatment was a major motivating force, as was the realization that much behavior which appears to be pathological is really an extension of extra-familial influences upon the family unit.

De TriAngel opened in January, 1972, after a period of intensive planning, inservice training, and testing of application procedures. This center was the first of its kind in the Netherlands. Leaving a 'child-thinking approach' to adopt a "family-centered approach" was not easy.

In the first year our institute still took some individual (problem) children, without their families. In retrospect, this was an intermediate form between the principles of a residential school and the fundamental different admission for family members (Oudendijk, Rees, and Spanje, 1976, p. 1).

Since then, a more consistent, but not rigid, family-centered ecosystem program has evolved.

Physical Description

De TriAngel is located in the central part of Amsterdam, close to public transportation, providing easy access to employment, educational, recreational and cultural resources. The architecture of the building blends in with other buildings and rowhouses in the neighborhood, such that strangers could not differentiate De TriAngel from family residences if they did not see its small identifying sign.

Internally, the building is divided into a number of group living units, each consisting of sleeping apartments, a spacious living room, and small kitchenette. Meals are prepared in a central kitchen and transported to each living unit, where three or four families and the social worker(s) who reside there are encouraged to eat together. Persons in each unit are expected to keep the living area clean and to take responsibility for doing their own dishes and laundry. There are common recreational areas available to persons in any group living unit but the physical facilities, by design, tend to limit interaction between TriAngel residents in different units. In addition, small offices and seminar-like rooms are available for private study, individual, group, or family therapy, or other uses. Most social work services, however, occur in the group living units or with specific TriAngel residents in the community.

*The research for this section was done during the 1976-77 school year when the author taught social work courses in Amsterdam, Netherlands and studied a broad range of Dutch social services.
Admission Criteria

Application for a family's admission may be made by any social worker or social agency in the Amsterdam area, and, in some cases by the families themselves. Only families who have not benefited, using a variety of social services while living in their own homes, are considered for admission. Additional factors are also considered in admissions proceedings. Does admission to such an institute hold the prospect of improved family functioning? Does admission of the family threaten the survival of the family as such? If admission occurs, can important improvements be expected within a reasonable short time (six months, maximum)? Is there a positive intention, demonstrated by a willingness to cooperate, of most family members? Does treatment in De Triangel complement proceeding, continuous, and follow-up services supplied by other agencies?

The admission into the Triangel can be (and often is) a part of a long-term plan of support. For example, the Triangel may form a basis for or bend a development in the desired direction. The planning agency then continues. Concrete elements also play an important part. If re-housing of a family seems necessary in the process of socio-therapeutic assistance, it is important that this be realized during the stay of the family in the Triangel . . . A return of the family to the home it has left, for instance because of bad relations with a neighborhood, means a strong undermining of the results of the admission (Oudendijk, Rees, and Spanje, 1976, p. 4).

Admission decisions are made by a group made up of Triangel staff, persons from the applying agency, a representative of the governmental agency which finances De Triangel, and when possible, other professionals who have worked with or anticipate working with family members.

Program and Services

Admission to De Triangel emphasizes the maintainence and development of numerous extra-familial relationships. Employed residents are expected to go to their jobs, students are expected to go to school, and family members are encouraged to develop meaningful relationships with friends and relatives as well as a variety of organizations (such as recreational, day care, or religious organizations). In addition, some families continue to receive social services supplied by another agency if a meaningful relationship with the family was established prior to admission. Other families, once admitted, begin working with a social worker from another agency to plan discharge and follow-up services. Admission to De Triangel is designed to develop extra-familial relationships rather than to prohibit them as admission to some institutions would.

Social workers spend much time working with family members to improve their effectiveness with extra-familial systems. This frequently involves going with parents to creatively confront school personnel, the housing authority, or other key institutions family members feel hesitant to approach. It also involved the reorganization or development of extended family and/or neighborhood networks from which the target family has been rejected or has avoided. "Modeling" the establishment and improvement of extra-familial relationships is thought to be a more powerful interaction tool than simply talking about these extra-familial relationships.
The in-house services most characteristic of De Triangel occur in the group-living units, where social workers trained in group methods are on duty twenty-four hours a day. Families being considered for admission are routinely brought into the group living units for several hours, including a meal, before making a final decision about whether they want to be admitted. Social workers spend most of their time in the living units, when they are not going with residents or families as a whole to establish organizational or community ties. Families, like social workers, spend little time in the solitude of a private office. Yet, privacy is provided for families, especially when they have visitors whom they do not prefer to meet in the group-living units.

Following admission, social workers make a concerted effort to relieve parents of much of the care and supervision of children. It is believed that many newly admitted parents need a temporary rest or reprieve from parenting responsibilities. In addition, seeing social workers "model" parenting behaviors is thought to be a powerful and positive force for changing the behavior of parents (and children).

Parents whose marital or extra-familial relationships are deteriorating often attribute such problems to the time and energy they spend in parenting. Relieving them of parenting responsibility early in their stay at De Triangel brings parents face-to-face with the realization that their children should not be blamed for their marital or extra-familial relationship problems. For example, one couple with sexual problems claimed "you cannot have good sex with children around." This was acknowledged and they were then encouraged to leave their children at De Triangel for the night and go to a hotel to "work on improving their relationship." After finding various excuses for not spending the night together, the couple was supportively confronted by others in the group-living unit, and the children were no longer blamed for their parents' sexual problem.

The group living unit, by design, increases interaction between families. There may be little interaction during the day, since most residents are gone, but the evening meal, followed by clean-up, and preparation of the children for bedtime, is the time when the most intensive and prolonged intra and inter-family interaction takes place. This is such an important period that two social workers work with the three or four families in each group living unit during this time.

Wide variation exists as to the style of leadership, theoretical frameworks, goals, and intervention techniques used by social workers at De Triangel. And yet, a degree of uniformity does exist between group living units in terms of recurring processes which take place. Social workers typically work three day shifts, twenty-four hours per day and maintain identification with specific living units and the people in them. Family members who over react or under react are frequently confronted and supported by others with similar problems; feelings of being isolated, rejected, and scapegoated, individually and as a family, subside; and the realization is enhanced that family members can work together and with others to increase their well-being. Social workers describe the evening interactions as intense, personal, tiring, but very meaningful.
The services provided to families at De Triangel are expensive when compared to other types of less intensive family services. De Triangel staff, however, were quick to point out that these services are inexpensive compared to the "costs" of not providing adequate services to "multiproblem, child-abusing families."

Findings of Families Discharged over Eighteen Months

In 1976, evaluative research was undertaken by De Triangel staff in cooperation with the Institute for Social Pedagogies of the University of Utrecht to assess the functioning of all families (N=17) who had left De Triangel at least eighteen months before. Child abuse was characteristic of all these families prior to admission. Each family was visited twice for the purpose of finding out how the family experienced its present situation and how the family regarded the period in De Triangel.

Each family was classified as functioning "well," "moderately" or "badly" based upon whether the following criteria were clearly present, present in a more limited way, or not present: "good relations between parents, if both parents were present" characterized by mutual support, confidence and openness, "good relations between parent(s) and children" characterized by affection, understanding and motivation to teach and learn, and a "good child life" (i.e., child feels safe and has needs met as a matter of course). Findings revealed that nine families were functioning "well," five were functioning "moderately," and three were functioning "badly."

Child abuse and fear of its occurrence disappeared as a symptom in nearly all of the families. Five of the nine families with the "functioning well" classification spoke openly of how disturbed relationships within and beyond the family contributed to child abuse. In the five families functioning "moderately," all of which happened to be one-parent families, the relationship between parent and child(ren) was considerably more strained than those in the previous category but the child(ren) was not thought to be in danger. The amount of child abuse or its likelihood in the three families classified as "functioning badly" was not reported (Rees, 1976).

This evaluative study had many methodological shortcomings and limitations in terms of its scope. It does not reveal how extra-familial relationships and networks were functioning, nor how the targeted families' identity had changed in the eyes of persons in the community who had contact with these families. It did not focus upon what follow-up social services were used by these families and the success or failure of these services. Longer term results are not known. Yet, one finding does seem to be worthy of further consideration: a majority of these "child-abusing, multi-problem families," who had not previously benefited from services in which one or two workers met with the family in an office or home, for relatively brief periods did seemingly benefit from group-living residential care at De Triangel.

In Summation

Family-focused services within established and innovative structures are developing rapidly in the United States, yet the existing structures of family-
focused services have not been sufficiently responsive to a number of families, especially rejected families. These families have not benefited from an array of existing individual and family services, and explanations for this failure usually emphasize shortcomings in a family rather than limitations of the service structure. Innovative structures of service, of which residential care is one, have been especially helpful to families in which child abuse is a problem. This paper encourages family workers to use innovative structures of service to improve relationships with extra-familial systems, especially when families feel rejected and scapegoated.
References


In their text Social Group Work Practice, published in 1949 and affectionately called, "The Green Bible," by many social workers trained within its tradition, Wilson and Ryland portray program as, "the use of activities for attaining and maintaining mental health." By deemphasizing recreational modalities, social group workers have sacrificed their holistic practice, allowing other professionals to fill this vacuum. Recently, for example, "Sing your way back to health," is a "new" therapy in Los Angeles. Also, many Gestalt therapy exercises owe a debt to J.L. Moreno's psychodrama. Singing, drama, are but two of the many program tools taught as practice skills for social work with groups by Wilson and Ryland.

Jungian psychology can explain to social workers how their utilization of program can help clients achieve more individuated and holistic self integration. The balance of the paper highlights the aforementioned point via an analysis of Jung's concepts: the self, shadow, personality types; his perspective about symbols of the self.

Jung's psychology emphasizing the self has to be contrasted with Wilson and Ryland's ego psychology emphasis for social work with groups. When asked what he thought about group psychotherapy Jung commented that there are groups in which one can find oneself and that there are groups in which one can lose oneself. Like Freud in his, "Group Psychology and the Analysis of the Ego," Jung was concerned about one's giving up one's individuation by yielding one's ego either to a charismatic leader or to the group. Jung liked to refer to this phenomenon by using Levi-Strauss's term "participation mystique." He views the oneness of the child with the mother as the "participation mystique" of mother and child during early infancy. In the literature about group, Peck coins the abbreviation I.G.P.I. to stand for individual group psychological isomorphism. Peck theorizes an isomorphism between mother and group. Our anxiety about our acceptance in entering a group, says Peck, relates to whether the mother, now concretized as the group, will accept
or reject us. This is probably why in the formative stage of group development setting basic trust in the group parallels Erikson's basic trust of the oral stage of an individual's development.

Within a Freudian or ego psychological perspective the group can be utilized to center ego consciousness. According to Neuman, the separation from symbiosis with the Great Mother archetype, projected in part in the real mother, requires a surrender to group consciousness per se. Neuman calls this stage the magic phallic stage of ego consciousness. He writes about this stage as follows:

This psychic act of magical ritual is the expression not of a desire, but of the establishment of the human ego which as group ego and individual ego set itself at the center of a world that was to be dominated. Originally magic was always group magic, and anthropocentrism refers to the central position of the human group of which the individual was only a part. Similarly, hunting was at first almost always a common action of the group with which the individual with his independent activity was integrated. The magical security of the individual ego, on which the success of the group was largely dependent, was based on the evocation of the group-self, on an actualization of the higher unity of the group, which embraced and directed the individual and operated as a kind of "outside Self" incarnated in the leader of the group-be he medicine man or chief-who was traditionally related to a transpersonal being, an ancestor or spirit.

It is my contention that ego centeredness found both within and through the group is at once the blessing and the pitfall of most current use of group modalities. The group admirably serves the process of developing that aspect of ego consciousness requiring conformity to the collective. The pitfall may be the absorption of the individual into the "participation mystique" of the group to the detriment of the individuation process. The
group as a whole and the individuals constituting the group may become fixated at the phallic magic stage of development. This is probably what Jung meant about one's losing oneself in a group. A more profound pitfall, a corollary to the potential superordinate role of developing ego consciousness through social work with groups at the expense of self development. This ego-self difference requires explanation.

Hillman, as a Jungian, criticizes most current approaches to psychotherapy because they cater to the "heroic ego" rather than to the self. It is as if "homo faber" the maker and technical expert, is the center of the universe. Ego psychology, the name itself inflates the ego to a position of predominance.

According to Jung, the self is a priori to the ego; the oak tree is implicit in the acorn. The ego is a derivative of the self and has the potential to become conscious of the self. Plato implies the notion of an a priori self, a concept which reemerges in Jung's theory, through the following comment:

And if it is true that we acquired our knowledge before our birth but afterward by the exercise of our senses upon sensible objects recover the knowledge which we had one before, I suppose that what we call learning will be the recovery of our own knowledge.

A Hebrew myth parallels Plato's conception of the a priori self. According to this myth, before birth each of us is taken before God. All knowledge is shared with us. Just before we descend to our mortal existence God commands an angel to brand our lips and cause an amnesia to our omniscience. The indentation above our upper lip marks the spot where our lips were sealed.

It is my contention that updating Wilson and Ryland requires adding an emphasis upon the self to what, in my view, as its current ego emphasis. Where ego consciousness remains the developmental task, Wilson and Ryland's approach is most commendable. Usually developing the heroic ego is the task of the first half of life. Throughout life however many persons are concerned with problems of meaning and whether or not our current life endeavors are helping us get closer to our core, to our essential selves.
We can only know the self through its symbols. The very title of his book, "Man and His Symbols" illustrates Jung's view that we never know the self directly but that it expresses itself in myth, drama, art, music, literature, dreams, and so forth. Herein lies an addition to the Wilson and Ryland use of program. In addition to developing the strengths of the ego, program media can reflect archetypal aspects of the self in symbolic form. Program media can add to our development of ego mastery to a greater discovery of our essential selves.

In a brilliant text, Von Franz writes about the archetypal symbolism of number. Number has quality as well as quantity. In his approach to the interpretation of dreams Jung would count everything because of its symbolic relationship to the self of the dreamer. Briefly, oneness refers to the oneness of the world, the unus mundus; twoness can represent content still unconscious but about to emerge into consciousness; threeness can represent dynamically working on a problem; fourness can represent completion, and so forth. Blue can represent a wish for invisibility; green can represent growth; red, the color of blood, can represent life, and so forth. Color and number symbolism are areas too vast to cover in this paper and so I refer the reader to texts about these subjects. Color, based upon wave lengths of light of numerical magnitude, musical notes, based upon vibrations per second producing wave lengths of sound, also symbolize archetypal aspects of the persons engaged in painting and music. Discovery of the self through its archetypal symbols can be found in Wilson and Ryland but needs added consciousness of this to make the self aspect of its implications for group work equal to its ego aspects.

In addition a Jungian perspective for social workers can help them to help their clients as participants of groups each achieve greater wholeness of self. Each of us, says Jung, achieves wholeness by integrating our persona and our shadow. The persona is our mask to the world: how we choose to appear to others and how we choose to integrate ourselves into society via our social roles. Ego oriented group approaches help us to develop our persona.

In contrast to the persona, the shadow contains aspects of our disowned selves: aspects of ourselves that Sullivan would call the "not me." Bly's imagery about it can assist our understanding of the shadow:
We come into the world with three hundred sixty degrees of personality, a full circle. Then imagine a little black bag next to you where you place all the aspects of yourself that your parents, teachers, and other significant persons train you to disown. If you are a man you may put your appropriate rage, your tenderness into the black bag. If you're a woman you may put your aggressive scientific propensities into the black bag. Before long the man's personality can be represented by a piece of circle so big $\Delta$; the woman's personality can be represented by a piece of circle so big $\triangle$. Essential aspects of both their personalities are placed into the black bag, are lost in the shadow. Most of us spend eighteen years of our lives burying parts of ourselves into the shadow and spend the next fifty years trying to recover them. In the process of each spouse rediscovering his or her shadow, a marital pair may spend hundreds of hours finding out who they really are and if they really belong together.

Wholeness of self requires that we integrate the persona and the shadow. Jung builds upon Freud's view of the id as a sewer of sickness by saying that it is only when we live out the shadow that we get into difficulty with ourselves and with society. Viewing one's shadow nonpejoratively as an unconscious undeveloped part of oneself is subtly yet significantly different than disowning the shadow as a sick part of oneself. When we counteract the depletion of our energy required to guard against our erroneous fears of the energy, of the shadow, when we incorporate the energy available from the shadow into our self system, we rediscover our naturally curious, lustful, vital selves and become free to explore, love, and creatively engage our world. Robert Bly\textsuperscript{20} describes his incorporation of his shadow:

\begin{quote}
I am fifty years old and I feel more alive now than when I was younger. When you accept your shadow when you no longer guard against its energy your depression lifts.
\end{quote}

Bly goes on to describe Jung's capacity to laugh from the depths of his being, an examplar of what occurs when one no longer
fears but accepts his own shadow.

Freud's concept of the id sounds similar to Jung's concept of the shadow. The subtle difference between the two are profound. To repeat for emphasis, to Freud the shadow equivalent of the id was to be defended against through suppression, isolation, repression, denial, and other mechanisms of defense. Freud's concept of sublimation, the capacity of the ego to incorporate id impulses and divert them into higher social acts comes closest to Jung's view about the shadow. Adler sums up the major difference in Freud and Jung's major emphases. Adler speaks of Freud's thrust as causative—reductive vs. Jung's thrust as synthetic creative. Freud interpreted many aspects of psychological phenomena as being "nothing but" something that could be reduced to a lower level phenomena. Freud reduced much of dysfunctional psychological phenomena to the negative id which he viewed as the sewer of our sexual and aggressive drives. In contrast Jung views the unconscious, inclusive of its shadow development as an a priori source of our essence, of our life's task and our creative energy. A cursory understanding of Jungian theory may have already alerted the reader to the practice implications of a theory where the major thrust is to understand what a client's communications tell us about his past.

One Jungian addition to Wilson and Ryland then consists in utilizing the group to help clients achieve an integration of self by their becoming familiar with and incorporating the shadow through program. This emphasis moves the present utilization of the group for ego development to self development.

Jung's theory of personality types offers another source for achieving wholeness of self. The theory of personality types has the potential to offer us another method for assessing therapist client compatibility. In addition personality type theory has the potential to assist us in the understanding of marital incompatibility and marital compatibility.

Jung hypothesizes that the ego, the "little light" which helps us adapt to our environment attempts this adaptation by means of four basic forms of psychic activity or major functions. Von Franz succinctly describes these as follows:

1. The sensation function which consciously registers inner and outer facts, irrationally;
2. the thinking function by means of which our conscious ego establishes a rational (that is in accord with reason in general), logical order among objects;

3. the feeling function, which rationally, establishes or, alternatively "selects" hierarchies of value (this is more pleasant more important, etc. than that);

4. the intuitive function which like sensation is irrational, which appears to be a kind of perception via the unconscious and which seems to be mainly concerned with the future possibilities of what is at hand. (Intuition is not identical with fantasy which Jung regard as a human capacity independent of the functions, just as will is.)

Jung also hypothesizes that each of us in our development cultivates and differentiates one function more than the other and tends to overdevelop this function for his adaptation. Undergirding the four functions is Jung's more basic dichotomy of introversion--extraversion. These can be defined in short hand manner by using David Riesman's terms inner and outer directedness, respectively. The underdeveloped functions Jung calls our inferior functions. This is not to say for example that sensation is inferior to thinking or to say that extraversion is more desirable than introversion. In fact we often project both our needs and deficits upon other persons. Opposites may attract and marry or may not be able to endure one another. A client will often project his poorly developed functions upon the therapist, a source of transference. The fit between client and social worker the attraction and repulsion, or both of marital partners can be explained by Jung's personality typology.

Again helping clients achieve their wholeness and ipso facto more adequate social adaptations may require that we be alert to their undeveloped functions.

It is of interest how Jungian theory was put into practice in the settlement house movement without recognizing it as such. Much of social work with groups described by Wilson and Ryland can be reconceptualized as utilizing program (e.g. drama, dances crafts, games) as methods for helping clients get in touch with and develop both their superior and inferior functions. Part
of the therapeutic impact of group work in the settlement house movement may have been albeit it unconsciously, to assist clients to become aware of and integrate their shadows. As we change partners in a square dance each of our partners become the mirror of a projected shadow or personality type aspect of ourselves.

To summarize, Jung's concept of wholeness honors social work's commitment to the client's strengths rather than weaknesses. The shadow and undeveloped aspects of one's personality require development rather than renunciation.

Coming to the end of this paper, its intent was to help us see perhaps in a new light through Jungian theory, how the Wilson and Ryland approach integrated both the left and the right brain and thereby was a holistic approach to social work with groups. The new ethic, says Neuman, requires an integration of both the individual and the collective shadow. It is only an integrated individuated self that can truly make its contribution to the collective. Wilson and Ryland with its ego building base can utilize Jungian approaches and shift to an increased self building perspective as elaborated throughout this paper. The shift encompasses building upon the task of the first stage of life to develop a persona requiring some conformity to the collective, to finding one's individuated self with its potential for making a creative contribution to the collective. Based upon all the foregoing I believe the Jungian theory can help us reinterpret, revise, revitalize, and refurbish Wilson and Ryland's tried, and, in my opinion, proven approach to social work with groups.
FOOTNOTES


2. I wish to thank Dr. Helen Northen of the University of Southern California, School of Social Work for bringing this point to my attention.


7. Ibid., p. 88.


10. Ibid., pp. 155-156, Italics mine.


17. Ibid.


20. Ibid.


22. Ibid.


COMMUNITY REPRESENTATION AND EMPOWERMENT IN LONG TERM CARE SETTINGS:  
THE CASE OF THE NURSING HOME PATIENT OMBUDSMAN

Abraham Monk  
Brookdale Professor of Gerontology  
Columbia University School of Social Work  
New York, New York

Lenard W. Kaye  
Research Associate  
Columbia University School of Social Work  
New York, New York

Introduction

It is widely recognized that regulatory efforts outside of the nursing home have had relatively limited success in monitoring patient care complaints (New York State Moreland Act Commission, 1975; Weatherby, 1975). As a result, the public at large and an increasing number of policy analysts have aggressively called for the initiation of alternative long term care monitoring strategies (Regan, 1977; Linnane, 1977; Vladeck, 1980). One such recently developed administrative ameliorative, with direct ties to the local community, is the nursing home patient ombudsman. The ombudsman program, when serving as a complaint redress mechanism for the institutionalized aged, is believed to operate in a dynamic interaction between nursing home residents, their families and friends, facility personnel, community and government. Such programs have stressed the importance of the citizen volunteer, and the development of communication networks between residential facilities and the larger community.

Legislation supportive of this type of program remains, however, vague, allowing for considerable variation in implementation from state to state. Furthermore, there is a conspicuous absence of systematic research assessing the structure and function as well as the efficacy of the ombudsman concept in long term care. There are those who have argued for the potential effectiveness of ombudsman programs (Katz, 1973; Broderick, 1973) while others are considerably more pessimistic concerning the idea of "community as ombudsman" (Hazard, 1968; Cloward, 1967; Eckert, 1976). Regardless of the final verdict as to the efficacy of ombudsmanship in long-stay institutions, the fact that there is at present minimal legislative authority provided such programs makes it especially important to examine the ways in which nonstatutory community empowerment strategies may substitute for more aggressive long term care regulatory policy.

The research reported here represents an attempt to examine the extent and manner in which the communication gaps between institutions and the larger community may be reduced. It reports on a strategy to increase meaningful community participation in institution services through the utilization of available community resources.

This research was supported by a grant from the Andrus Foundation of the National Retired Teachers Association - American Association of Retired Persons.
Research Design

A 1979-80 survey study examining the experience of the New York City Nursing Home Patient Ombudsman Program collected data which illuminate the extent to which the involvement of concerned community residents can serve to reduce the isolation, vulnerability and powerlessness of the frail elderly residing in nursing homes. Structured interviews were carried out in 22 skilled nursing and health-related facilities with long term care staff (N = 61), volunteer ombudsmen (N = 25), community advisory board members (N = 24) and actual residents of long stay institutions (N = 210). Secondary analysis of program records supplement these sources of data as well as semistructured interviews with various respondents situated in the study program's interorganizational support network. The study, by necessity, followed an ex post facto design, as no pretest measures had been administered at the point of program inception.

Components of Community Empowerment

The importance of community-wide involvement is explicit in program objectives identified by the New York City Nursing Home Patient Ombudsman Program. To what extent, then, has the program worked? In what ways has the program succeeded in building an interorganizational constituency which may reinforce its organizational core and participate in joint efforts at upgrading the quality of long term care? The focus here is on several dimensions of community empowerment: 1) the status of the program's advisory boards; 2) the quality of interorganizational relations and coalitions throughout the secondary support network; 3) the efficacy of program efforts; 4) the role behaviors and power resource needs of community ombudsmen; and 5) factors limiting effective community intervention.

The Program Advisory Board

A primary mechanism through which the Ombudsman Program has sought to relate the institution to the public has been the community advisory board. The indigenous community advisory board is composed of representatives of local health and social service organizations, long term care facilities, the general public and volunteer ombudsmen themselves. Data were collected on the functions advisory members perceived themselves to have performed in the past for the Ombudsman Program. Responses were differentially weighted and summed due to the ranked nature of these data. They indicated that members placed greatest weight on three indirect service functions (serving as program consultants, involvement in defining overall program objectives, and monitoring program activities) and one direct service function (negotiating access to nursing homes). These four functions were distinctly separated from the remaining five tasks or roles (providing technical assistance, performing public relations, negotiating working relationships between program and community, determining day-to-day objectives and participating in volunteer recruitment). These latter functions tended to be more closely associated with direct, day-to-day service activities from which the advisory boards obviously dissassociated themselves.
Comparative analysis between "actual" committee function and "desired" committee function was considered. Advisory respondents were in substantial agreement that their primary function should be the setting of program policy and goals. Two additional functions assigned considerable importance were the monitoring/evaluation of program performance and the performance of a public relations function. Membership was in large part less enthusiastic about being "access negotiators," "educators" concerning the needs of patients and "legitimators" of overall program effort. Comparisons between these findings and those reported earlier suggest only partial congruence between respondents' perceptions of actual and desired committee function. Thus members saw themselves as continuing to function as program policy setters and monitors of program effort. On the other hand, members did not want to serve as nursing home access negotiators to the extent that they had in the past. Moreover, they wanted to assume more of a public relations function in the future than they have had in the past.

While continuation of the community advisory board was assigned high priority by members, there was considerable evidence to suggest that its representation needed to be modified. The majority were not fully convinced that the current "mix" or representation of its members was the most appropriate to insure proper performance. They felt that membership on such a committee ought to be dominated by members who express a willingness to actively participate. Key actors included human service professionals from community agencies, nursing home staff and finally institutionalized residents and their relatives.

Interorganizational Relations and Coalitions

The quality of interactions between the Ombudsman Program and other organizational entities was measured from several perspectives: the advisory board, the volunteer ombudsmen, the secondary sponsors or program support network, and salaried program staff. When program advisors were asked to identify those organizations with which the Program had encountered major difficulties, voluntary grass roots groups were cited twice as often as the next leading organizational entity--nursing homes themselves. Far less frequently cited were the local Area Agency on Aging and the Department of Social Services. Furthermore, only 3 in 10 advisory members (29.2%) were fully convinced that the Ombudsman Program had worked closely enough with voluntary associations of friends and relations in the communities in which the participating long term care facilities are located. Of those advisory board respondents who expressed an opinion, a clear majority considered it most important that the Program's staff work closely in the future with local voluntary community advocacy and social action organizations. Significantly less importance was assigned to working more closely with other organizations such as social service agencies, labor unions and nursing home associations. Thus the value of coalition-building between groups having similar patient representation structures was emphasized.

Where dissatisfaction was voiced concerning interagency relations, both by salaried Ombudsman Program staff and network representatives, it more often than not revolved around the issue of perceived lack of reciprocity. That is, one or the other party was of the opinion that their counterpart did not always respond
with equal measures of information, expertise and effort when a particular issue was being addressed.

The lack of standardized methods of information flow may well have served to promote such perceptions. For example, the Ombudsman Program staff frequently perceived laxness on the part of certain network agencies in resolving a nursing home grievance. The network agencies, for their part, were often critical concerning the lack of information they received about ombudsmen activities.

The other organizations generally did not perceive the Ombudsman Program as duplicating their own efforts. Indeed, no one agency viewed their own efforts to be adequate nor sufficiently effective in addressing the issue of quality care in long-stay institutions. Several network respondents suggested that independent or individualistic functioning by various organizations in the field was not an appropriate strategy in light of the severity and persistence of long term care issues. Nevertheless, few individuals were able to more than verbally support the idea of increased interagency efforts, citing the scarcity of organizational resources that could be redirected toward coordination activities between programs.

The Efficacy of Program Efforts

To evaluate ombudsman performance, responses were obtained on several measures of program effectiveness from the perspective of the community service provider (volunteer ombudsmen), the service observer (long term care staff) and the potential service beneficiary (long term care residents). Providers and observers were questioned as to the degree of success the ombudsman had realized in addressing 10 program-related effectiveness issues (score metrics: 1 = not successful at all to 5 = extremely successful). Two indices measuring aspects of policy/planning and relationship/social interactive effectiveness were also employed. They were composed of a subset of items within the larger index. Finally, a composite measure of "experienced" effectiveness was developed and administered to actual users of the ombudsman service (i.e., program beneficiaries). This 5-item index allowed aged residents the opportunity to assess whether they agreed or not that the ombudsman they spoke to was sensitive, respectful, interested in their problem, competent to deal with their problem and accountable (i.e., able to keep them informed of results) (summary score metrics: 5 = strongly agree to 25 = strongly disagree). Table 1 summarizes scale item and reliability information for the four indices.

There was considerable agreement on the extent of program efficacy across provider and observer groups (see Table 2). Staff means for perceived effectiveness indicated ombudsman program effort to have been viewed as only "slightly successful." Volunteer ombudsmen were found to be in close accord with facility staff concerning perceptions of general program effectiveness ($F = 67; df = 3; p = .570$).

Among patients who had presented grievances to a volunteer ombudsman, 43.5 percent believed that the problems were solved, 39.1 percent believed they were not and 14.4 percent were not sure. When patients were asked to assess their personal experiences with the ombudsman (using the 5-item experienced effectiveness scale), they reported a relatively high level of satisfaction (mean = 10.18; s.d. = 3.29). Analysis of individual scale items indicates that volunteers were more likely to
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectiveness Index</th>
<th>Number of Index Items</th>
<th>Identity of Index Items</th>
<th>Alpha Coefficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Experienced Effectiveness Index</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>EE1-EE5*</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived Effectiveness Index</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>PE1-PE10**</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy/Planning Effectiveness Index</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>PE3</td>
<td>.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship/Social Interactive Effectiveness Index</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>PE5</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* EE1 = Sensitivity to concerns
EE2 = Respectfulness
EE3 = Interest in problem
EE4 = Competency dealing with problems
EE5 = Accountability/Informing of Results.

** PE1 = Assist in protecting rights
PE2 = Establish a speedy complaint resolution mechanism
PE3 = Propose changes in policy/regulations
PE4 = Increase communication between staff/residents
PE5 = Establish better community/nursing home relations
PE6 = Improve day-to-day life of residents
PE7 = Provide information for legislators
PE8 = Prevent recurrence of deficiencies
PE9 = Alert staff to patient needs
PE10 = Support changes in policies/regulations
Table 2

Descriptive Statistics for Summary and Individual Effectiveness Indices by Respondent Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent Group</th>
<th>Experienced Effectiveness (a)</th>
<th>Perceived Effectiveness (b)</th>
<th>Policy/Planning Effectiveness (c)</th>
<th>Relationship/ Social Interactive Effectiveness (c)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer Ombudsmen</td>
<td>Mean 23.77, S.D. 5.93</td>
<td>1.62, .65</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Home Administrators</td>
<td>Mean 24.62, S.D. 9.07</td>
<td>1.83, .83</td>
<td>2.31</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directors of Nursing</td>
<td>Mean 22.33, S.D. 10.21</td>
<td>2.10, .96</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directors of Social Services</td>
<td>Mean 19.50, S.D. 8.31</td>
<td>1.44, .56</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residents/ Patients</td>
<td>Mean 10.18, S.D. 3.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F Value  .67, Probability .570  1.10, .360  2.38, .079

(a) Scale Range: 5-25; where a lower score indicates greater effectiveness
(b) Scale Range: 10-50; where a higher score indicates greater effectiveness
(c) Scale Range: 1-5; where a higher score indicates greater effectiveness
be seen as sensitive (mean = 1.83; s.d. = 0.58), respectful (mean = 1.56; s.d. = 0.59) and interested (mean = 1.65; s.d. = 0.65) than competent (mean = 2.56; s.d. = 0.90) or accountable (mean = 2.59; s.d. = 1.14).

As noted above, the perceived effectiveness scale included two separate dimensions of program success. The "policy/planning" effectiveness dimension tapped the degree to which ombudsmen initiated change more likely to have collective or systemic rather than individual consequences for long term institutional care. A "relationship/social interactive" effectiveness dimension reflected interpersonal or socializing consequences of ombudsman activity.

The perceptions of external agents (volunteer ombudsmen) approached significant divergence from those of long term care staff for only one dimension—relationship/social interactive (F = 2.38; df = 3; p = 0.079). Interestingly, each long term care staff category believed that the ombudsman program has been measurably more effective along this dimension (i.e., establishing better community/nursing home relations) than the volunteers themselves. Correlated t-tests performed on the pair of validated effectiveness dimensions did not reveal significantly different levels of goal attainment accorded by either the external agents or long term care staff.

It is worthy of note that 3 of the original 10 effectiveness items with strong but less than significant tendencies (as judged by an expert panel) toward inclusion in a hypothesized "organizational/programmatic dimension," were accorded considerably higher levels of attainment than the validated dimensions discussed above. This was the case for both external agents and long term care staff. These program effectiveness issues—1) alerting staff to patient needs; 2) assisting in the protection of residents' rights; and 3) establishing a speedy complaint resolution mechanism—achieved relatively high group means by all respondents. These data indicate that the ombudsman program was considerably more successful in establishing specific operating procedures and processes in the facilities than in bringing about systemic change in long term care, or improved social relationships between individuals and groups in long term care.

Role Behaviors of Community Ombudsmen

Ombudsman role perception scales were constructed especially for this study, determined to be statistically reliable and validated by an expert panel composed of university professors throughout New York State with acknowledged expertise in the field of social welfare. It was found that both external agents (volunteer ombudsmen and advisors) and facility representatives (administrators, nurses and social workers) accorded highest accuracy to the therapeutic support dimension of ombudsmanship (e.g., providing emotional support, easing conditions) and lowest accuracy to volunteers functioning as advocates or adversaries (e.g., arguing the cause of the patient, acting as a watchdog or reformer of nursing home conditions). The mediator role (e.g., serving as a middleman, an explainer of decisions), most closely associated with the classical definition of the ombudsman, was seen as a moderately accurate description for the volunteer's efforts. Data further indicated that persons directly associated with the program had a more clear and definitive sense of what the ombudsman role was all about. Long term care staff, on the other hand, had a more diffused or
blurred notion of what the ombudsmen were actually doing in their facilities. This conclusion was based on the emergence of significantly less accurate scores assigned to each of the 3 potential program functions by facility respondents.

It is noteworthy that facility personnel all but ruled out the need for advocative ombudsman stances when they were asked to indicate their views of desired ombudsman behavior, suggesting relative congruence between their perceptions of actual and desired role performance. They also assigned almost equal significance to mediative and therapeutic functions, perceiving them to be more critical modes of potential ombudsman intervention. On the other hand, ombudsmen and their community advisors did not rule out the need for aggressive approaches to the provision of service. Ideally, then, they included selective use of classical, nonpartisan approaches and authoritative stances depending on the particular needs of the aged resident.

Needed Program Powers

Survey respondents were asked whether the Ombudsman Program needed additional power or authority to function effectively. In order to measure this variable, a composite measure of "needed" program power was developed. This five item index, which was determined to be internally consistent ($\alpha = .86$), contained 4 specific measures of needed power (i.e., the importance of having the authority: a) to change nursing home decisions; b) to enforce nursing home decisions; c) to mandate access to nursing homes; and d) to mandate access to patient records). The fifth scale item considered the importance of gaining more legislative/legal authority.

Statistical analysis of these data provided further evidence of significantly divergent role perceptions subscribed to by external agents as compared to long term care staff. Ombudsmen expressed the greatest need for additional program powers. Their views were quite similar to those of their advisory board members who indicated only a slightly reduced need for more program powers. In sharp contrast with these views, the 3 categories of long term care staff were in close agreement as to the limited importance of giving the ombudsman program more authority. The minimal concern voiced by long term care staff for program power acquisition is consistent with their disregard for a potential ombudsman advocate role. It is noteworthy that when long term care staff were disaggregated by institutional auspice, proprietary staff indicated that significantly less program power was needed than staff working in voluntary facilities.

An interesting relationship emerged as well between power acquisition and the three potential ombudsman program roles for both the external agents and long term care staff. A positive correlation was found to exist between perceived need for power acquisition and importance assigned to the advocate role. This correlation reached a level of significance in the case of the external agents ($p < .05$) and approached significance in the case of long term care staff ($p = .06$). For long term care staff the need for program power tended to be negatively correlated with the mediator role and the therapeutic role though these findings were not statistically significant. A negative correlation between power acquisition and both the mediator and the therapeutic support roles did not appear to any degree in the case of the volunteer ombudsmen. It would seem
that the volunteers did not rule out the need for additional power merely because they subscribed to less political, nonpartisan ombudsman roles. Indeed, acquiring more power may have been considered beneficial in their efforts at performing a range of interventive tasks.

**Factors Impinging On Effective Intervention**

Volunteers and advisory board members were asked to assess the importance of a series of factors in making the job of the ombudsman more difficult. External agents agreed on the top limiting factors—resistance by nursing home administrators and resistance by other nursing home staff. At that point advisory board members assign only slightly less importance to 3 "program specific" issues—

a) inadequate program funding; b) incomplete training of volunteers; and c) inadequacies in program administration/supervision. In the opinion of the ombudsmen these 3 issues were viewed as considerably less important. The lack of legal authority, the voluntary nature of the ombudsman role and the status of the user population, while still considered to be mildly important factors, tend to be given lesser weight by both groups.

An additional perspective on factors effecting program performance was gained by identifying those nursing home problems most resistant to resolution. Over 90 percent of ombudsmen interviewed were convinced that certain patient complaints were more apt to be resistant to amelioration. It was found that ombudsmen believed issues of food and nutrition to be the number one ranking problem. Indeed, this problem category was separated out from other problems in terms of resistance to resolution. Issues of health care and problematic interpersonal relations between residents and staff were also frequently cited as well as issues of patients' rights and administrative difficulty. It is worthy of note that while all long term care staff had views of problems similar to those of the ombudsmen, directors of social services tended to be in closest accord with the volunteers.

**Volunteer Ombudsman Commitment**

The volunteer community ombudsman's commitment to the program could be expected to influence program performance. Advisory board members were asked to indicate what, in fact, were the three major strengths and weaknesses in using volunteers to perform the ombudsman function. Data revealed advisory board members were convinced that the volunteers' enthusiasm and motivation represented the primary benefit in utilizing their services. The second highest valued strength was the volunteers' objectivity and independence. Less often voiced benefits included the cost efficiency of volunteers and the diversity of their backgrounds and past experiences. The two most often mentioned and highly ranked shortcomings in using volunteers were: a) the resulting variability in their time commitment to the job and b) the frequent inadequacy in the level of technical skills or expertise they brought to the position. Lack of enthusiasm found among a select few volunteers was assigned lesser weight as were some volunteers' poor record-keeping practices.
Volunteer ombudsmen's perceptions reinforce the above findings. They overwhelmingly pointed out that the most encouraging aspect of giving service had been the opportunity to display in concrete terms their altruistic impulses. A lesser number cited their sense of accomplishment as influencing their decision to remain with the program. Most prominent among the discouraging aspects of service that were cited was the feeling that their efforts lacked impact/effect and the perceived insensitivity and lack of concern among long term care staff. Other disheartening aspects included the poor conditions in which the institutionalized aged lived and the amount of paperwork the volunteers were required to complete. The above data suggest that community volunteers experienced conflict between their powerful benevolent impulses and the rewards derived from a sense of accomplishment on the one hand, with a more frequent sense of relative impotency when working within what appears to them as the insensitive and rigid world of institutional life on the other.

Summary and Recommendations

Both the patient representative and the advisory board represent primary mechanisms through which the Ombudsman Program has sought to increase community consciousness of issues in long term institutional care. The development and maintenance of interorganizational coalitions are, however, largely the result of the efforts of the advisory bodies and the aggressiveness of the Ombudsman Program's salaried professional staff. Volunteers have had, as a matter of policy, minimal exposure to groups both inside and outside their assigned facility.

The quality of relations with the larger support network can best be described as unceremoniously collaborative. Casual, unofficial communications take place most commonly when issues of mutual concern are identified by one party or the other. The lack of as yet substantially formalized organizational interactions may give rise on occasion to perceptions of imbalanced or unilateral resource exchanges. Even so, there is little evidence to suggest that the Ombudsman Program is seen to be unnecessarily duplicating the efforts of previously established organizations. All members of the Ombudsman Program support network sympathize with the idea of coordinated interagency activities but at the same time cite pervasive shortages of human resources as being a hindrance to such initiatives.

Nursing home ombudsmen subscribe to a somewhat different stance than that which is implicit in the 1978 Amendments to the Older Americans Act. The absence of as yet substantial program authority may have promoted the ombudsman's acquisition of a therapeutically supportive, community counselor orientation. This does not, however, rule out the need for more confrontational stances, depending on the severity of the nursing home grievance under consideration.

Based on the disparity between the views of external agents and facility representatives concerning the need for additional program power as well as the less than optimal levels of program efficacy, several policy and program recommendations are offered. They are believed to have relevance beyond the specific program in question to citizen representation efforts generally.

1) Legislation should give greater recognition to the broad range of role
behaviors that are actually practiced in the delivery of nursing home patient representation services including the therapeutic, mediate and advocate approaches. Statutory guides to program development need to better merge ombudsman theory and practice. The prescriptions derived from the literature on classical ombudsman behavior are not fully applicable in the context of institutional life.

2) Volunteer community ombudsman programs can most profitably exhibit a generalist orientation with focused expertise/specialization in selected problem situations. Such programs need to capitalize on the humanitarian perspective of the volunteer yet maintain the capacity to sequentially order role behaviors depending on the point at which the ombudsman is at in the grievance resolution process.

3) There is a need for a long term care quality assurance group. This coordinating body would be composed of representatives from both public and voluntary organizations in the continuum of institutional care redress mechanisms. These individuals would meet regularly, share information, identify issues for joint action and plan appropriate inter-agency action steps.

4) Attention should be given by long term care ombudsman and other patient representative programs to potential overlap with the responsibilities of long term care facility staff. Dysfunctional and potentially duplicative efforts by ombudsmen and social service staff in institutions should be carefully monitored.

5) Finally, balanced representation should be assured on ombudsman program advisory boards. Membership must consist of active, contributing individuals committed to the ombudsman idea. Adequate representation by long term care administrators and other facility personnel, community agency professionals, the interested but unaffiliated general public, residents and their families need to be considered as well.

REFERENCES


**REFERENCE NOTES**

This paper deals with issues relating to the meaning of work for the worker and clinical implications for the social worker intervening in the field of industrial and occupational social work. The problems of work dissatisfaction and alienation in work are analyzed. The author presents two concepts, work as play and logotherapy, as being useful in the clinical intervention in work related problems. It is concluded that the absence of work dissatisfaction need not be the goal of intervention, rather the clinical encounter can strive for meaningfulness, growth, and self-discovery.

There is a growing interest in social work intervention aimed at the working person. This is evidenced by a growing body of literature dealing with social services in the workplace and increased numbers of social workers finding employment in industry and other work settings (Weissman, 1975; Skidmore et al., 1974; Neyman, 1971; Carter, 1977). In Israel the rapid growth of this field is a source of particular interest (Neikrug and Katan, 1980). However, it is mistaken to view social work in the world of work as a radical innovation in the profession. Issues relating to work cut across numerous fields of social work practice. Social work with the aged requires an understanding of the meaning of retirement. Work with the mentally and physically handicapped requires dealing with the problem of work rehabilitation. Working in welfare requires understanding how the limited resource of adequate employment is distributed in the population. Traditionally social workers have intervened at the various points of entrance into and exit from the world of work. Regardless whether the particular issues under consideration are problems of aging, family, mental health, illness, rehabilitation, poverty, etc., the theme of homo farber, man as worker, cuts through all issues of human behavior.

In this paper we will deal with the various issues around the meaning of work for the worker and the clinical implications inherent in the psychology of work. We will review some of the pertinent literature regarding work in modern society, satisfaction and dissatisfaction in work, leisure, and play, and attempt to relate this literature to the issues faced by social workers intervening in the world of work.
Freud touched briefly on the topic of work in several contexts. He believed that the ability to engage successfully in work and the ability to give and receive love are the twin hallmarks of the healthy individual (Erikson, 1950, p.265). Freud seems to have felt that the carrying out of certain types of work activities can be a narcissistically satisfying experience (Freud, 1938). While this may be true for some people, it is apparent that in complex technological societies work can be a highly dissatisfying experience for a great many workers.

It is not clear just how many workers are dissatisfied with their jobs. Different measures and sampling techniques render different results, however, in general, the figures on dissatisfaction are extremely high. Sheppard and Herrick report one study of blue collar workers in which less than half of the subjects reported predominant satisfaction in their jobs (Sheppard and Herrick, 1972). Another study indicates that only 43% of white collar workers and 24% of blue collar workers would choose the same kind of work, were they given a second chance. These statistics cannot be ignored. They demand a more detailed understanding of the phenomenon of work dissatisfaction and its relation to the critical issues of mental health and social adjustment of the worker, productivity in the plant, and even, the very future of work in technological societies.

It is not always clear how the various studies define the concept of dissatisfaction. Certainly in one sense it is not a negative factor. An amount of dissatisfaction is surely a positive thing and necessary to motivate the worker toward advancement and self improvement. Only the most orthodox disciple of Taylor's scientific management would see the "happy robot" as a desirable worker (Taylor, 1911). Most modern students of management are concerned with such problems as initiative, creativity, spontaneity within the context of competent handling of complex tasks. These work behaviors are not compatible with massive job dissatisfaction.

It is generally understood that there is a close relationship between job satisfaction and work motivation. However, it is not clear whether high satisfaction causes high productivity, whether successful work performance causes high satisfaction, or whether intervening variables effect both satisfaction and performance (Schwab and Cummings, 1970). What is certain is that the relationship between these variables is complex indeed, and that simplistic formulae are at best half truths. Brayfield and Crockett develop one of the more interesting theories (1955). They argue that high job satisfaction occurs concurrently with high performance when the worker perceives productivity as a means to achieving important individual goals. This demands that we consider what are seen as important goals by the worker.

It is generally agreed, today, that money alone is not the primary motivation for work. Morse and Weiss found that 80% of workers sampled would continue to work even if they were to inherit sufficient funds to meet all of their needs (1955). Even among disadvantaged workers, money and other extrinsic rewards were
found to be less valued than the intrinsic rewards from a job well done and satisfactions of the work itself (Champagne and King, 1967). Thus it seems that even though workers report that they are predominantly dissatisfied with their jobs, they prefer work to idleness and seek intrinsic reward in their labor (Herzberg, Mausner, and Synderman, 1959).

While both middle and lower class workers may value intrinsic factors over extrinsic factors, it is clear that neither intrinsic nor extrinsic factors are distributed equally in society. Various studies have shown that jobs that offer intrinsic rewards are distributed according to the occupational hierarchy. Morse found, for example, that 41% of workers doing repetitive clerical work had low intrinsic satisfaction as compared to only 7% of the high technical level group (Morse, 1953). In general, the literature indicates that workers wish to use their skills more fully, to develop their work abilities; to make decisions and be responsible for their work, but a great many blue collar and low level white collar jobs deny such opportunity.

Argyris states the problem as a conflict between the needs of the individual and the needs of the work organization. He argues that in this culture the individual strives to move toward adulthood along seven lines of development: 1. from passivity to action; 2. from dependence to independence; 3. from limited behavior alternatives to many; 4. from short term, erratic, interests to long term coherent commitments; 5. from disconnected activities to major challenges; 6. from impulsive self awareness to integrity and self worth; and from the low status of childhood to ever increasing status and worth. On the other hand, Argyris states that needs of the organization for specialization, rationalization, supervision, etc., place an arbitrary ceiling on the amount of growth possible along the various lines. Growth is choked off and persons appear dependent, passive and subordinate. What is more, the incongruity between human potential for growth and the arbitrary limits of the organization increases; 1. as the worker is more mature; 2. as the organization is striving for efficiency; 3. as you go down the hierarchy; and 4. as jobs become more mechanized (Argyris, 1954).

Good work which is intrinsically satisfying and allows for individual growth seems to be an extremely limited commodity and reserved for a small number of high level workers. The great majority must accept working in conditions which deny intrinsic rewards and limit human potential. While the idea of a guaranteed income is considered by many to be the right of every citizen in a progressive society, it is not also recognized that people have the right to equal access to jobs that allow growth and satisfaction. On the contrary, there is a general belief that since work organizations as we know them, are necessary to the society, workers must adapt to the demands of the system. Extrinsic compensations may appease the worker for surrendering his individual satisfaction and relinquishing his adulthood but can society compensate itself for this loss of potential and can it tolerate alienation of large numbers of workers?
Alienation in Work

Marx postulated that in work man can achieve self realization, but in capitalist societies; private ownership of the means of production, the division of labor and the process by which labor becomes a market commodity so alter the nature of work that it becomes not self-realizing but alienating (Burns, 1969). Israel has shown that this idea has its precursors in the writings of Rousseau, Hegel, and others (Israel, 1971). Hegel saw the machine as the great potential threat to satisfying work. Before the machine, work was the process of transforming nature's materials into man satisfying objects. Work was the medium for man's enlarging his subjective universe, but the machine created work conditions which result in boredom, monotony, and coercion. The mechanical process results in labor or toil, not work.

Hegel's theories are developed further in the writings of Jacque Ellul. Ellul argues that technology or "technique" may have begun with the machine, but today technique is applied to every area of human activity (Ellul, 1976). Technique in economics controls labor and other resources in the production process. The technique of organization is used to administer and control large masses of people. Human technique (in which category he includes education, social work, medicine, etc.) applies technique to the very nature of man. Technique, according to Ellul, is a way of thinking and acting which eliminates all non-technical activity. Its major victim is spontaneous interaction between man and man and between man and nature.

For Marx it was capitalism, for Argyris the large organization, for Hegel the machine, for Ellul the rise of technique; each identified a major force in the social system that robs work of its creative essence. This approach is questioned by Blauner in his study on alienation (Blauner, 1964). He argues that alienation is the product of the intimate involvement with the specific work situation and not a characteristic of industrial work per se. Depending on the nature of the specific job, some work is more satisfying and some is more alienating. Blauner attempts to prove this theory through empirical research and he uses four of the five dimensions of Seeman's theory of alienation: powerlessness, meaninglessness, isolation, and self estrangement (Seeman, 1961). Blauner argued that different industries differ in terms of: the technologies used, the nature of the division of labor, the social organization of the workplace, and the conditions of their markets. These differences result in different amounts of alienation. Indeed he finds that while most industrial work may have generally alienation tendencies, in specific industries these conditions are modified producing more positive results for the worker.

Lastly we refer to the results of Goldthorpe's study of automotive workers (1966). He develops the hypothesis that workers do not necessarily become alienated as a result of their work and indicates that the reverse may be true.
He found that alienated individuals sought work that did not demand investment of self nor promise psychological satisfaction in return. To the extent we accept Goldthorpe's findings, we must realize the importance of Ellul's thesis. The most frightening aspect of Ellul's construct is that technology tends to force people to serve its own needs and eventually people neither demand nor expect any human rewards. Indeed, Goldthorpe's findings show the basic paradox of alienation: technique devalues and rejects the belief in human rewards and therefore the worker accepts employment based on its extrinsic rewards only to suffer, thereafter, the effects of labor without intrinsic value.

Alienation is not only a function of the world of work. Work is perhaps only one aspect of society that often encourages alienation and limits meaningful growth. A full discussion of alienation should include other institutions such as: education, government, family, and even leisure. Leisure in particular is of interest to our topic. Various students of work suggest that the developmental role of work (to provide an arena for developing human potential) has been supplanted by other central life interests, particularly leisure. Indeed social status today may be as greatly influenced by what one does in his non-work activities as by what he does in work. More and more of societies resources are being spent in the development of leisure activities. Free time itself is increasing. Kreps and Spengler indicate that the average worker has gained 1220 hours of non-working time annually since 1890 (1973). But leisure is not a quantitative problem. The real issue today is the productive utilization of non-work time rather than the increasing of free time per se as it was during the early period of unionization. Scientists and creative writers alike indicate the coming of a second industrial revolution. While the first industrial revolution instituted the machine in place of hand production, the second revolution is making the monotonous tedious task of machine-tending itself unnecessary. Cybernetics, feed-back loops and the computer are pushing us into a new era of industrialization wherein machine tends machine and the worker is superfluous. Many doubt if the leisure of the future can compensate man for the ever increasing devaluation of his work role.

Ellul warns that it is pure idealism to expect that man will be able to use increasing leisure time for the cultivation of self in a spontaneous relationship with environment. He argues that technological society has so limited his creative powers by forcing workers to conform to the postulates of technique that spontaneity is impossible in any life area (1976,401-402).

Leisure often becomes amusement and diversion rather than active cultural pursuit. Ellul points out that amusement seeks to distract the victim of technology from his "phantom", from an awareness of his dehumanization. Diversion, such as in the cinema, obviates the need to hope that things will ever be different. "On the strip of film what ought to change has already changed. And the flight of

---

1 For example, see Kurt Vonnegut's novel Player Piano.
cinematic dreams has nothing to do with the inner life; it concerns mere externals. When people leave the movie theater they are full of the possibilities they experienced in the shadows; they have received their dose of the inner life." (1976: 375-382).

Bell also presents little hope for the future of leisure. He suggests that industrial society has set up a myth of joy in leisure as a mechanism of social control. The worker works to satisfy his desire to participate in the "consumption society" at the price of a mortgaged future (Bell, 1960: 227-272). It is as though workers will continue to endure unsatisfying work wherein they produce the playthings of a leisure oriented society so as to earn the resources to consume those same toys.

Work as a Game

Concepts such as free time, leisure, relaxation, and play should not be used interchangeably (Bell, 1960: 258). Free time and relaxation are interruptions in the ongoing cycle of work and are part of that cycle. Leisure relates to Ellul's concept of time spent in the cultivation of the spirit and the arts. Play, however, is a different issue. Play is the process of investing energy and resources in developing the art of living. In play we find many of the same functions that we find in work. In both work and play man tests his prowess against his fellowmen and against his environment. In both cases he engaged in a process of self-discovery and self-testing. He grows through competition, through the process of struggle, success or failure, and trying again.

The major difference between work and play situations is to be found in different subjective realities experienced in both activities. The sense that it is "just a game" is absent from work situations. In play, regardless how great the investment and how important it is to win, there persists an awareness that the consequences of failure are not catastrophic. In this awareness there is freedom. In work situations we are struck by the predominance of the fear of failure and belief that work is a deadly serious business. This perception often encourages the development of a conservative stance which dictates that one should never risk too much, that minimal success is adequate and failure must be avoided at all costs. Because the worker receives so few intrinsic rewards from his work he is too poor in resources to tolerate risk, and takes refuge in conservation.

We see a parallel between the conservative stance on the part of the worker and Thompson's view of innovation in organizations (Thompson, 1972). He shows that the common element among innovative organizations is the existence of "slack" (i.e. uncommitted resources of personnel, finance, material, etc.). He points out that, just as the rich gambler can afford to lose, the "rich" organization can tolerate a riskier game for higher stakes and this leads to innovation. Perhaps, in the same way, the individual worker who has developed "slack" (i.e. a resource bank of psychological, social and economic resources) can afford to play in work. The fear
of risking limited resources results in the inhibition of energetic investment of self and precludes the experience of joy in both work and play.

It is instructive to consider the worker who invests little in his job, thereby risking little and minimizing both gains and losses. Katz and Kahn argue that workers tend to perform at minimally acceptable levels when "legal compliance" is the primary motivational pattern employed at the workplace (1966: 347). Legal compliance is defined as a system of management wherein norms, rules and sanctions indicate and enforce worker behavior. These may encourage minimal compliance but offer no reason for excelling. As they point out, one can either follow or not follow a rule but one cannot follow a rule exceptionally well.

While this may be true it is mistaken to blame rules and norms for dissatisfaction in work. Legal compliance is as much a fact of play as it is of work. All organized play is based upon rules. Clearly these rules are not enforced by time clocks or conveyor belts and other devices which are beyond the control of the individual but they are rules nevertheless. In play the norms, rules, and sanctions are often no more flexible than in work, but the player complies to the legal structure because he wants to play the game.

The conservative stance not only restricts output, its major effect is to limit input. The worker who wants, above all, to protect his gains from loss; believes deeply that his work is no game and desires a condition wherein there is neither reward for success nor consequence for failure. He desires, instead, compensation for his loyal service. Like his Victorian counterpart who worked in domestic service, he derives his status from his master and not from his accomplishments. His master, be it government agency, major corporation, large university, etc. rarely requires more than minimally acceptable performance. So the worker maintains a low profile, invests little of himself and has little expectation of intrinsic reward. Since his status is attached to his position rather than his accomplishment, he often attributes an inflated value to the importance of his job. This is another major difference between work and play. In play, in order to risk, one often debunks the value of both game and result. This allows the individual to increase his input of limited resources, play for higher stakes and reach for greater rewards.

To play in work it is essential to overcome self importance. One has to "see through" the austere seriousness of work and find that it is just a game before it can be played. This is true for the gray flannel suited "yes man" as well as for the hostile bolt-tightener on the conveyor belt.

Yet what game can be played on the production line? Repetitive work is hell, not fun. Indeed in Greek mythology, the regions of the damned are plagued by meaningless, repetitive work. The daughters of Danaus draw water in a sieve and Sisyphus pushes his stone endlessly uphill. To play, one needs to develop a particular mind set to one's activity. Sisyphus is condemned to his condition, but
in play one has to be free to define one's own condition. The nature of this freedom and the ways in which it can be developed are areas of central importance for social workers who deal with the problems of meaningfulness in work and life.

The nature of this mind set is well described in the Oriental proverb: "In times of famine when many are starving some are able to fast." To fast is not the same as to starve. To fast is to be active in the definition of one's own condition. To fast is to accept the limitations of reality as well as the responsibility of finding an avenue of individual activity within that reality. One does not play at fasting, rather fasting is one way of playing the reality. Fasting is the expression of an active stance to life without denying the basic nature of reality. The active stance demands of the individual that he define his reality. Once he has done so, he can play his own game. Such a player knows that the only ultimate meaning to be found in his work is the realization that it is he who is the actor and that his value is separate and distinct from his productivity. He can now take his game very seriously and concentrate on it the maximum of his energies and abilities. During his play he will experience the thrill of victory and the pain of defeat and through it all he will know that it is he who bestows meaning and value on his activity and not the other way around.

Logotherapy in the Work Place

It seems that regardless of whether we approach the problems facing man in work from sociology, psychology or philosophy we continually return to the question of meaning in work. Indeed it may well be that in the search for meaning we find the link between the theoretical-philosophical approach and the therapeutic approach to the human condition.

Much has been made of the destructive qualities of automation, mass-production, and work in a capitalist market economy as sources of alienation. While there is some validity to this direction it is clear that were industrialization to give way to a return to craftsmanship and were the worker to regain control of his work from the machine, the existential questions would remain. We have seen storekeepers describe the tyranny of the retail trade and tell how the shop can be a cruel taskmaster. Would it help them to know that "being one's own boss" is the great fantasy of millions of workers? We have seen small farmers and craftsmen of obsolescent skills struggle on the edge of poverty. Would they find comfort in the fact that they are coveted by their fellowmen on the assembly line for having whole and meaningful work and not just turning endless screws into anonymous parts of some unseen product? Beyond the psychological and sociological meanings of work is the existential level of meaning. No work is good until it is meaningful and no work is so vile that no meaning can be found in it.

This is not to argue that there is no value in interventions aimed at changing the conditions of the workplace. Such is far from the case. Social workers operating on the "macro" level can make a great impact on the development of manpower policy, especially in the case of vulnerable workers (i.e. minorities, older workers, women,
disabled, etc.). Social workers in places of employment offer a growing range of services which modify many of the negative forces that we have identified. As pointed out by Blauner, the nature of the work organization is not a given function. Management can be worked with to alter the division of labor, supervisory styles, work rhythms, etc. in the light of a greater appreciation of human needs. Rather than minimize the importance of such interventions, if space allowed, we should like to develop them even further. However, it is clear to us that in the most ideal of work conditions, as in the most hostile of conditions, man's phantom follows after him. Every now and then, because he is human, man will turn and face his phantom. What does the social worker have to offer in that confrontation?

A large and rich practice literature has developed dealing with man's search for meaning. We refer to Victor Frankl's logotherapy. Frankl has succeeded in reifying existential philosophy to a practical therapy with both a cogent theory and specific techniques. To attempt to summarize Frankl's school of psychiatry would only be to do it a disservice, especially since a considerable amount of Frankl's work is now available to English readers.

What has become clear to us, as an outgrowth of this literature, is that the individual who suffers and exhibits clinical symptoms is often experiencing a noogenic neurosis (to use Frankl's concept); a neurosis of meaninglessness. He is experiencing not the conflict of diverse and opposing intrapsychic drives, but the conflict of diverse and opposing values. This is a spiritual, philosophical dilemma.

Applied to the problems of man and his work, "illness" is a very poor term. Considering the dehumanizing pressures operating in the work place, it is absurd to view as pathological the conflicts of an individual striving to find meaning and value. The absence of this conflict, the succumbing to unperturbed stability seems far more pathological.

The struggle to find meaning and value in the human condition and the role of the therapist in that process is different from the role of the therapist who is dealing with illness. Frankl points out that logotherapy is less introspective and retrospective than analytical therapies. In logotherapy the therapist emphasizes the future. The therapist is a guide who leads his client to face the meaning of his life and directs him toward that confrontation. While the therapist may have access to certain techniques his task is not technical. Frankl's psychology is based on the concept that the person can define himself. In defining himself the person sets his path and his fate. Herein is the major difference between this approach and the analytical psychotherapies. Here the emphasis is not on what has made the person, but rather on what the person can do to make himself.

Meaninglessness in general and lack of meaning in work in specific are only infrequently used to explain the etiology of clinical symptoms, yet it is possible that this is more due to the diagnostic process used by the therapist and less an
indication of where the client hurts. Indeed diagnostic manuals often have no category for existential suffering. This situation forces the therapist to lump this problem together with the psychoneuroses (emphasizing the role of anxiety) or to include it with the situational adjustment reactions (emphasizing individual environmental maladjustment). Neither diagnostic compromise is adequate.

Social workers who have a broader view of etiology are nevertheless guilty of a similar bias. They often are sensitive to the disruptive ramifications of existential distress as it is played out in the family, the marriage etc. Yet to see it as a "family problem" or a "marital problem" is to widely miss the mark. The problem presented here is not of diagnostic nomenclature per se, but of a mindset predominant among psychotherapists which views clinical symptomatology as expression of intrapsychic conflict or environmental stress and does not often entertain the prospect of existential conflict.

Perhaps the main problem relates to the therapists' discomfort with the role of "doctor-to-the-soul." Indeed, the therapist may feel that such concepts as soul, values, purpose, and meaning are within the realm of the clergyman or philosopher and may argue that therapeutic competence is based on science and not on theology or philosophy. However, the potency of the problem as described above makes such a claim irrelevant. Like it or not, therapist is clergyman to a secular congregation. Through him his client seeks comfort of spirit. True, his message is not the revelation of Divine purpose, but this is not what is being asked of him. He is being asked if there is meaning in life and he will hear the question ever more often as he becomes sensitive to it. The clinician must realize that this question is deeply tied to the performance of the work role and he must be prepared to relate to the question. If this is a source of role-strain for the therapist then he must be prepared to deal with that too and to raise the question of his own frustration and doubt.

Conclusion.

The helping professions have been criticized for concentrating on the minimizing of pathology rather than maximizing health. To a great extent this is due to the fact that our very conceptual base relates to illness and positive health is only poorly understood. In this paper we have attempted to deal with psychological health in the workplace as more than the absence of pathology. The concept of play-in-work, albeit rudimentally developed, suggests that absence of work dissatisfaction is not the necessary end goal of clinical intervention. Play-in-work suggests that absence of dissatisfaction is the zero point from which positive growth can develop. The crux of this growth lies in the problem of meaning. The active stance toward work, described above, is predicated on the individual's knowledge that his ultimate value is not dependent upon the product of his labor. The contrary is true. When the person is aware of his ultimate value he can define the meaning of his reality freely and genuinely. It is then that his play-work becomes
the expression of his psychological freedom and his essential value. As the therapist becomes more adept in dealing with issues of existential meaning and suffering, the clinical arena will become the locus for this aspect of human growth and self-discovery.

References.

Argyris, C.

Bell, D.

Brayfield, A.H. and W.H. Crockett

Burns, T.

Carter, L.
1977 "Social work in industry: A history and a viewpoint." Social Thought 3.

Champagne, J.E. and D.C. King

Ellul, J.

Erikson, E.

Frankl, V.

Freud S.
Goldthorpe, J.H.  
1966 "Attitudes and behavior of car assembly workers: a deviant case and a theoretical critique." British Journal of Sociology 17: 227-244.

Herzberg, F., B. Mausner, and B. Synderman  

Heyman, M.  

Israel, J.  

Katz, D. and R.L. Kahn,  

Kreps, J. and J. Spengler  

Morse, N.C.  

Morse, N.C. and R.S. Weiss  

Neikrug, S. and J. Katan  

Schwab, D.P. and L.L. Cummings  

Seeman, M.  

Sheppard, H. and N. Herrick  

Skidmore, R. et al.,  

Taylor, F.W.  
A Qualitative Look At
Black Female Social Work Educators

By

Larry Davis, - George Warren Brown School of Social Work
Ramon Cartwright - George Warren Brown School of Social Work
Phyllis Freeman - Columbia School of Social Work
Louis Carter - University of Pennsylvania School of Social Work

ABSTRACT

This article reports the finding of a research effort which attempted to assess the qualitative experience of black female faculty in schools of social work. The data reported is part of a larger data set collected on social work faculty as a whole. The authors report some basic demographics on black females, but focus mainly on the roles that these women perform in schools of social work and how satisfied they are in these positions. It appears that significant numbers of black female faculty members are on "soft money" with fewer teaching Social Policy and Administration courses than might be expected. As a group these females are less satisfied with their academic positions than are their black male counterparts. However, when "degree held" is controlled for, it is black females without the doctorate who are significantly less satisfied than men. No such relationship was found to exist for males. Finally, the authors attempted, via a regression model, to assess which group of relevant others, faculty, administrators or students, as a function of their interactions, contributed most significantly to the satisfaction levels of black female faculty. Results from these analyses suggest that with respect to interpersonal interactions, white faculty have the greatest affect on the reported job satisfaction levels of black females.

Researchers have recently begun to pay attention to the difficulties which female faculty experience in academia. Most of this attention has addressed itself to the differentials in salaries and promotions between males and females in these schools. In contrast, slight attention has been given to the qualitative nature of this professional experience. Indeed very little attention has been given to the qualitative experiences of black female faculty. Despite the Council on Social Work Education's mandate 1234 A, which pertains to minority issues and 1234 B, which pertains to

The authors wish to thank Professor David Gillespie for his help in the preparation of this manuscript.
women's issues, little is known about the status of black female faculty other than mere descriptives, e.g., numbers and rank. Perhaps as a reaction to the council's mandate there has been, and continues to be, some concern with the recruitment and hiring of minority faculty, but once hired little mention is made of their experiences.

Due to the fact that the concerns of black faculty in general and black female faculty in particular are so rarely given specific attention, we have selected, in this article, to focus on black female faculty, and, to a much lesser extent, on black male faculty. Hence the purpose of this study is to examine a series of dimensions which affect the black female faculty member in academia: the areas in which she works, the tasks she performs, the professional rank and status she occupies, the quality of her relationships with significant others in this workplace, and in general, her satisfaction with academia. It was a principal hope of the researchers that information derived from this study would be of interest and utility to all who are committed to the advancement, retention, and professional growth, of black females as social work educators.

The Sample

The data reported here are part of a larger data set collected on both white and black faculty members. The sample was selected from the Council on Social Work Education's (CSWE) 1977 roster of accredited Social Work Schools. The researchers believed that substantive qualitative differences might exist between predominantly white and predominantly black schools of social work; subsequently only black and white faculty members who were listed as working in predominantly white schools of social work were selected. Three hundred and fifty black faculty were identified and included in the total sample from which we received 133 (38%) completed questionnaires, 71 (53%) of whom were female. Although the return rate was low, our sample closely approximates the total population of black social work faculty. For example, other researchers, notably Rubin and Whitcomb (1978) report that, in 1977, there were 489 black faculty members in graduate schools of social work. Of this number, 55% (268) were female. Our sample contained 53% (71) females. With regard to teaching status, Rubin and Whitcomb found that 78% of the black faculty were full time. The sample reported here is composed of 90% full time personnel. With regard to highest degree obtained, Rubin and Whitcomb reported 69.1% of the total population possessed MA's or MSW's with 30.9% holding DSW's or Ph.D.'s. The present sample is composed of 63% MA's or MSW's and 37% holding DSW's or Ph.D.'s. These findings suggest that the present sample is representative of the overall population of black faculty members in schools of social work.

Instrumentation

The survey instrument consisted of a 41 item questionnaire. Twenty-five of the items assessed either demographic or occupational
characteristics of the respondent, and the remaining 16 items were either direct or indirect assessments of the respondents' level of job satisfaction. On the questions of job satisfaction, respondents were required to make a response on a five-point Likert scale—five representing the highest level of a positive response.

The questionnaire was pre-tested on a small group of black faculty members who were not included in the final sample. While this method was employed to test the wording and format of the questionnaire, no tests were performed to examine specific types of validity or reliability of the questionnaire items. However, given our experience with the questionnaire's pre-test, it is believed that face validity of the items was achieved in the construction of the instrument. The questionnaire along with a return envelope and a cover letter describing the project was mailed to all potential respondents.

Findings and Discussion

Several demographic attributes of black females were assessed. These included age, status on faculty, academic rank and tenure status. The mean age was 44 years with the modal age group being 37-48 years. The majority of female faculty (51%) were assistant professors with slightly over 30% at the associate level or above. With respect to tenure status, 37% of all black female faculty were not on a tenure track despite the fact that 90% were full time faculty. Although Gould's data were collected from the 1972 CSWE Roster, our findings seem consistent with hers', indicating that approximately 35% of black faculty are on "soft money." Gould suggests, and we agree, that the employment situation for black female faculty is tenuous. Indeed the uncertainty of future or continued employment may be of significantly greater concern for the black female than for the black male as approximately twice as many women (37%) as men (19%) reported being on a non-tenure track.

With regard to work roles, 48% of the black female faculty reported a combination of both classroom teaching and field work as their primary areas of responsibility, with 28% and 10% respectively reporting class or fieldwork only. However, of those black female faculty who reported teaching, the majority (60%) teach practice methods. In contrast only 30% of the black males teach practice courses. Also, noteworthy is the fact that even greater teaching disparities exist between females and males in the macro areas of Social Policy and Administration, with only 9% of the females as compared to 35% of the males teaching such courses. Thus it appears that black female faculty as a group are teaching in what has been considered "traditionally female" areas, namely methods case work, group work, and family treatment. Some research has indicated that disproportionately greater numbers of men than women at the masters level take administration and policy courses. It appears that this division in focus continues to manifest itself even at the university teaching level. Finally, only 6% of black female faculty teach research courses.
Third, we assessed level of job satisfaction for black female faculty. Job satisfaction was assessed by measuring two aspects: An absolute and a relative measure of satisfaction. Individuals were asked:

1) Overall, how satisfied are you with your position in the University College? (an absolute measure) and,

2) In comparison with other faculty members in your department who hold similar positions to your own, what is your level of satisfaction with your position in the university or college? (a relative measure).

The respondents were asked to make a response to these items on a five-point scale with 5 denoting a high degree of satisfaction and 1 denoting a low degree of satisfaction. These two measures summarized the basic dimensions of job satisfaction. Thus, job satisfaction here is the sum of the individual's perceived degree of overall and comparative contentment with their present faculty position.

Using these measures of job satisfaction, we found that on a five-point Likert scale that females reported a mean of 2.87; an average or moderate level of overall job satisfaction. Similarly, on the comparative measure of job satisfaction, women reported a mean of 2.98, again an average or moderate level of job satisfaction. These measures of job satisfaction are in contrast with mean satisfaction levels of black male social work faculty. They reported an overall mean satisfaction level of 3.40 and a comparative mean satisfaction level of 3.53 for job satisfaction. Both of these male satisfaction means were significantly higher than those of women (p <.01) and (p <.01) respectively. Thus, on both the absolute and relative measures of job satisfaction, the black female appears to be less satisfied than the black male.

Given that other research has found the presence or absence of a doctorate degree to be a significant factor in academic retention and promotion, we hypothesized that it might also affect job satisfaction. Thus we decided to measure faculty levels of job satisfaction while controlling for the highest academic degree obtained. This is especially appropriate for our sample in light of the fact that only 26% of the black female faculty hold doctorates compared to 70% of the black males. The results from this analysis suggest that the level of attained degree, master's or doctorate, significantly affects the satisfaction level for black female faculty. That is, significant differences exist between males and females at the M.S.W. level with black females having lower levels of reported overall and comparative job satisfaction than black males, (p .05), and (p<.001) respectively. However, black females with doctorates do not differ significantly from black males with doctorates in their reported levels of overall and comparative job satisfaction. Thus, with respect to level of job satisfaction, black female faculty who are without doctorates are at a distinct disadvantage. There appears to be no association between attained academic degree and job satisfaction for black female faculty. In other words, unlike black male faculty, the presence or absence of the
doctoral degree appears to significantly influence the satisfaction levels of black female faculty.

It also occurred to us that an individual’s level of job satisfaction might in part be a function of how well they perceive themselves as "getting along" with significant others in the work environment. We hypothesized that perceptions of degree of respect from and rapport with others should contribute significantly to how well one feels they "get along" with others. In short, one would expect those persons who perceived themselves as having the best interpersonal relationships with professionally relevant others would also have the highest levels of job satisfaction. In this sense, reported faculty perceptions of respect and rapport were thought to be important determinants of the quality of interpersonal relationships.

Using Likert measures similar to those used to measure overall and comparative satisfaction levels, we asked black faculty to rate on five point scales, with five being the highest, the degree of respect which they perceived themselves as receiving from others, i.e., black and white faculty, administrators, and students. Similarly they were also asked to rate the degree of rapport which they perceived themselves as having with these persons.

In an effort to assess the contributions of each of these groups to the reported job satisfaction levels of black female faculty, a linear regression model was utilized. The two measures of job satisfaction (overall and comparative), were combined into one score as were the two measures of interpersonal interactions. Thus, in the regression equation, job satisfaction (overall and comparative) was the dependent variable, and the independent variable the respondents perceived degree of interpersonal interaction (respect and rapport) with black and white faculty, administrators, and students.

For the black female faculty members, the multiple correlation produced by the six independent interpersonal variables of black and white faculty, administrators and students was .63. This multiple correlation value was found to be significant at the .05 level (F = 5.85 with 6 and 54 degrees of freedom). Therefore, approximately 39% of a black female's degree of job satisfaction can be explained or predicted by her perceptions of the quality of interpersonal interactions or how well she perceived herself as "getting along" with these six groups of significant others. Of the six independent variables included in the regression equation, we concentrated on the three most powerful as predictors of job satisfaction since these variables account for the majority of the variance in the dependent variable.

The findings indicate that the quality of interpersonal interaction (perceived respect and rapport) with white faculty members was the most powerful predictor of job satisfaction among black female faculty members. The standardized regression coefficient for this independent variable was .35.
The second most powerful predictor of job satisfaction among black female faculty members was the quality of their interpersonal interactions with white administrators. The standardized regression coefficient for this predictor was .22.

Lastly, the third best predictor of job satisfaction among black female faculty members was the quality of their interpersonal interactions with black faculty members. The standardized regression coefficient for this predictor was .17.

Intuitively, it might have been expected that the quality of interpersonal interactions with black faculty administrators and students would have been the most significant determiners of job satisfaction for black female faculty. However, it must be remembered that these data were compiled from black females employed in predominately white schools of social work. Indeed, their minority status suggests at least two reasons why white faculty and administrators and not black faculty and administrators should contribute most significantly to the job satisfaction level of these black faculty members: 1) The greater number of white faculty and administrators with whom they must interact, and 2) the greater positions of power and influence which whites possess in these institutions.

In view of the fact that the majority of respondents reported classroom teaching as their primary task, it may seem surprising that students were not powerful predictors of their job satisfaction. However, given the large numbers of black females who were non-tenured and the fact that students do not generally play an important role in retention and promotion process, their lack of greater student influence is understandable.

Summary and Conclusion

The researchers conducted these analyses for the purpose of specifically examining the quality of the work experience of black female faculty in schools of social work. This study was different in focus from what has sometimes been researched in the past, e.g. salary, promotion. The foremost intention here was to gain greater insights into the qualitative nature of the black female's professional experience by assessing her obtained level of job satisfaction and the quality of her interpersonal interactions with relevant others. There are a number of points highlighted by this investigation which we feel are instructive for those who are concerned with the enhancement of this group of faculty members.

First, it appears that a third of all black female faculty are in non-tenure track positions. As a consequence, it would seem reasonable to assume that the vast majority of those in non-tenure track positions are also probably on "soft money", thereby making their employment situations precarious, especially in light of the existing economic and political
currents. This cogent factor must undoubtedly contribute to a sense of anxiety among black female faculty. Surely departmental efforts to increase the number of those on "hard money" would diminish the uncertainty about future employment which this group of faculty must experience. In addition, it seems reasonable to expect that such steps would also increase the degree of personal investiture and commitment these women would be willing to make to their schools.

Second, black females, as a group, appear to be overrepresented in those teaching areas which are sometimes viewed as "traditionally female," i.e., methods courses, and are starkly under-represented in the teaching of macro and research courses. Hence, in an effort to be consistent with the Council on Social Work Education's mandate that, "special efforts shall be made to encourage women to consider these areas of professional practice in which women have been under-represented," schools of social work, and indeed the profession, should begin to put forth greater efforts to recruit, graduate, and employ more women who have substantive interests in these areas.

Thirdly, the level of academic degree attained appears to be a critical factor affecting job satisfaction for black female faculty. However, no such relationship appears to exist for black males. This suggests that it is possible to be "satisfied" in academia without the doctorate. Hence factors other than degree are apparently influential in affecting how satisfied one can feel in a given academic position. Consequently, efforts to increase job satisfaction of female faculty should not begin and conclude with the insistence that females without doctorates obtain more advanced degrees, since their male counterparts appear to fare well without them.

Fourth, interpersonal interactions, i.e., perceptions of perceived respect and felt rapport with others were intuitively assumed to be important contributors to job satisfaction. Given the large numbers of white faculty and the frequent positions of power they hold as faculty and administrators, it is not surprising, perhaps, to find that job satisfaction among black female faculty members appears to be significantly influenced by their perceived quality of interpersonal interactions with other of faculty.

In conclusion, it was the purpose of this study to obtain insights into the qualitative work experience of a group of female faculty who are also black. It was our hope that the findings of this investigation will be of interest not only to black females who have an inherent investment in this topic, but to other educators who also believe that this group of faculty; by their unique status as female and black bring a valuable and much needed perspective to the educational process. The findings from this study suggest that a viable approach to enhancing the experience for black female faculty should include the promotion of academic environments which increase professional security, broaden professional utilization, and bolster and propagate positive interpersonal relations between black female academics and their colleagues.
FOOTNOTES


IN JUDGMENT OF VICTIMS: THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF RAPE

Joyce E. Williams, Texas Woman's University
Karen A. Holmes, University of Houston

ABSTRACT

This study examines some of the linkages between the rape victims' experience and community attitudes about rape, focusing on differences among three racial-ethnic groups. Public attitude data were collected from a stratified sample of 1,011 respondents; personal interviews were conducted with 335 Anglos, 336 Blacks and 340 Mexican Americans. Victim data were collected from in depth interviews with 61 female rape victims: 32 Anglos, 11 Blacks and 18 Mexican Americans. While the victim data suggest some degree of negative impact resulting from the rape experience for all victims, significant differences were found among the three racial-ethnic groups. Public attitude data suggest that public responses to rape are differentiated by certain age, sex and race-related categoric risks as well as certain attitudinal variations about sex roles. These findings are discussed in terms of how public attitudes may work to mitigate or exacerbate the negative effects of the rape experience for victims. Subsequently, an attempt is made to reconceptualize rape as an integrated composite of the public (extrinsic) and personal (intrinsic) experience of the victim.

INTRODUCTION

The way that victims react to the experience of rape and the manner in which they cope is determined in no small part by the responses of significant and generalized others. In fact, it can be argued that these reactions are an integral part of the rape experience. This work examines the empirical reality of victim and community responses to rape among three racial-ethnic groups. The broad research question is whether any linkages can be identified between victim-impact and community attitudes; more specifically, can the victims' experiences and the public's perception of rape be empirically linked and, if so, do these linkages differ among Anglos, Blacks and Mexican Americans?

This work is based on a theory of racial-sexual stratification. The underlying assumption is that the social world is sex and race stratified and, consequently, life chances are influenced by our designations as male or female and as Anglo, Black or Mexican American. In a social system which is characterized (historically

* This research was supported by a grant from the National Institute of Mental Health, National Center for the Control and Prevention of Rape (RO1MH27928).
and in terms of the status quo) by racial-sexual inequality, rape risks become predictable manifestations of power. Several forms of rape risks exist for males: rape (by legal definition) is almost exclusively a male crime; it is males who are the accused or convicted rapists; for some males, rape may represent the loss of exclusive sexual privilege and/or control over a woman; and rape "costs" other males (as husbands, lovers, brothers, or friends) when significant others fall victim. There are also certain emotional costs for women who know other women as victims, or for those who know men accused of rape. No doubt, however, the overwhelming rape risk for women is victimization or potential victimization.

The system of racial-sexual stratification has also produced minority and dominant group differences in sex roles and in male-female sexuality. Such differences have their roots in the oppression of slavery and colonialism and are maintained and perpetuated today by economic as well as racial-sexual inequality. Different rape risks and attitudes reflecting intra and intergroup sex-role stratification are further compounded by racial stratification and one consequence may be manifested in attitudes about rape. Rape is the ultimate proof of male power over females, and it is the final breach of barriers erected by society between certain racial and/or ethnic groups. These background assumptions with regard to the existing system of racial-sexual stratification suggest three hypotheses which are examined here: (1) The impact of the rape experience on victims will differ significantly reflecting variations in racial-ethnic community attitudes about rape and sex roles/sexuality. (2) Attitudes about rape will differ significantly among Anglos, Blacks and Mexican Americans. (3) Attitudes about male-female sex roles and sexuality will differ significantly among Anglos, Blacks and Mexican Americans and will be associated with significantly different attitudes about rape.

METHODOLOGY

Samples

The victim data are derived from in depth interviews conducted with 61 female rape victims: 32 Anglos, 11 Blacks and 18 Mexican Americans. These victims constitute an accidental sample of persons seen (with permission) through two rape crisis programs in a major metropolitan area in the Southwest. The time lapse between the assault and the research interview ranged from four weeks to over two years. The victims had a median age of 23 years (range=15-67) and a median education of just over 12 years. This sample was obtained on the basis of locatability and willingness to be interviewed, and on these criteria alone, our findings may not generalize to all rape victims. However, because of a failure to report rape (either to police or to rape crisis centers), the universe of victims is unknown; consequently, there is no sound basis for assuming that any victim sample is, or is not, representative.

The public attitude data are derived from a stratified random sample of 1,011 residents of a major metropolitan city in the Southwest. Personal interviews were completed with 335 Anglos, 336 Blacks and 340 Mexican Americans; respondents in each of the three groups were almost equally divided by sex. Using the median as a measure of central tendency, the samples are characterized as follows: Anglos - 34 years of age, 14 years of education, family income $14,400, predominantly Protestant in religion; Blacks - 40 years of age, 11.8 years of education, family income $7,250, overwhelmingly Protestant in religion; Mexican Americans - 43 years of age, 7.8 years
of education, family income $5,460, and overwhelmingly Catholic in religion. While the samples cannot be assumed to be representative of these racial or ethnic populations across the country, they can be cautiously viewed as representative of the Southwest. Specifically, comparisons between sample data and census data for the city where the research was conducted indicate that the two minority samples are representative of those populations in the city while the Anglo sample appears to be somewhat more middle class; that is, they are slightly higher in education, occupation and income than Anglos as a whole.

Measuring Victim Impact

As used here, "impact" is a generic term referring to the effects of the rape experience on victims. Seven independent and four dependent variables were used to assess the impact of rape. With one exception, the independent variables (age-at-assault; time-since-assault; victim race-ethnicity; institutional support systems; personal support systems; inter versus intragroup rape; stereotypic versus non-stereotypic rape) were developed in response to the literature which suggests that rape is a crisis or that it produces a crisis for the victim (Fox and Scherl, 1972; Burgess and Holmstrom, 1974; Mcombie, 1976). Unlike the other variables, however, victim race-ethnicity was not derived from the rape-as-crisis literature; in fact, it appears to be a variable that has essentially been ignored in previous victim research. Its inclusion here stems from two sources: (1) the theoretical framework of stratification; and (2) the authors' contacts with rape victims which suggested that response variations might be related to victim race-ethnicity.

The four dependent variables - crisis response, feelings about men, health concerns, and general functioning - were developed as impact measures and each was examined in terms of the seven independent variables. (1) Crisis response: Since most of the victim-related literature treats rape as a crisis, a paper and pencil measure consisting of 60 personal statements was used to measure victims' crisis responses (Halpern, 1973:342-49). High Crisis Scores (range=0-240) presumably indicate a greater degree of crisis response; however, because the scale elicits continuous rather than discrete data, an absolute conclusion regarding the existence of a crisis response cannot be made. Clearly, one can only conclude that a comparatively greater or lesser degree of crisis exists at a given time and caution should be exercised since it is impossible to isolate the rape experience as the single causative factor. (2) Feelings about men: A series of questions was developed in an attempt to determine how the rape experience might have affected victims' feelings about men in five interpersonal dimensions: communication, trust, non-sexual affection, general comfort, and sexual attraction-interest. High FAM (Feelings About Men) Scores (range=5-15) indicate that victims feel better about men now; low scores indicate that their feelings are not as good now as before the assault. (3) Health concerns: Some of the victim-related literature suggests that victims have a variety of health problems after being assaulted (Burgess and Holmstrom, 1974; Peters, Meyer and Carroll, 1976). The Health Concern Score is the actual number of problems experienced by victims (following the assault) which they themselves felt were directly related to the rape; scores could range from zero to 15. (4) General functioning: This impact variable was a second (but untested) measure of crisis which is theoretically consistent with the conceptualization of crisis as an inability to cope effectively and disruption of one's usual pattern of functioning.
Functioning Scores could range from -4 to +4; low scores indicate a passive or withdrawn style of functioning characterized by decreased interest or concern with routine activities, while high scores indicate increased activity with regard to involvement in routine activities.

Measuring Public Attitudes

Attitudes about rape. Responses to a series of nine rape vignettes were operationalized as attitudes about rape. These vignettes included two stereotypic street rapes, two bar pickups, two hitchhikers, a date-rape, a husband-wife assault and the rape of a prostitute. The vignettes did not use the word rape in describing what happened and the nine were varied in terms of theoretically important assault variables: reputation and activity of the victim, use of a weapon, injury, and relationship between victim and assailant (Jones and Aronson, 1973; Klemmack and Klemmack, 1976; Feild, 1978). With the exception of the husband-wife assault, each vignette described rape as legally defined in the state where the research was conducted. After reading each vignette, participants responded on a four-point scale (strongly agree to strongly disagree) to the following: (1) Was this a rape? (2) Should the man involved be arrested and taken to court? and, (on a three-point scale), (3) Was the female involved very much at fault, somewhat at fault, or not at all at fault? Responses were conceptualized as a feminist-nonfeminist continuum where the most feminist responses were strong agreement that this was a rape, that the man involved should be prosecuted, and that the victim was not at fault. Thus, on any one vignette, scores could range from a low of 3 (most feminist) to a high of 11 (most nonfeminist). The three responses to the nine vignettes were subsequently combined into Rape Scores (range=27-99) and were operationalized as a general, undifferentiated attitude about rape. In effect, this measure "averages" responses to different kinds of rape (i.e., not only to those deemed "real" by the public, but also those which may be perceived as questionable) and takes into account some judgment of both victim and assailant as responsible and/or accountable. Therefore, Rape Scores were used as a measure of community attitudes about rape among Anglos, Blacks and Mexican Americans.

The social context of rape: independent variables. Fourteen independent variables - grouped into four general categories - were included in the data analysis. (1) Demographic characteristics: sex, religion, education, family income and age. (2) Sex-role attitudes (SR): Factor analysis of 25 items dealing with attitudes about traditional sex roles and with women's liberation produced three factors for each sample. These factors represent ethnic-specific attitudes which describe some degree of sex-role traditionality or liberation; high factor scores suggest non-traditionality or liberation in sex roles. (3) Attitudes about male-female sexuality (M-F): Factor analysis of 13 items dealing with the nature of male-female sexuality and the dynamics of male-female interaction vis-a-vis rape produced three factors for each sample. These factors represent ethnic-specific attitudes about male-female sexuality; high scores suggest that a greater degree of the attitude represented by the factor is present. Labels used in Table 3 and in subsequent discussion were derived from factor loadings and from the direction of responses. (4) Race/ethnic-related attitudes: Three diverse but conceptually relevant measures were used to tap attitudes related to the minority experience and/or minority-dominant relations. Victimization Scores represent the respondent's experience with rape/sexual assault and/or other violent crime. Since statistics indicate that minorities are
disproportionately victimized by crime, this measure was treated as a race/ethnic-related variable. Discrimination Scores are a measure of how Black and Mexican American rape victims are perceived as being treated (by police and other public officials) compared to Anglo victims, and whether Black and Mexican American males are perceived as being unfairly accused of raping white females. Intergroup is a dichotomized variable indicating whether respondents perceive rape as primarily inter (e.g., black-white, Anglo-Mexican American) or intragroup (e.g., black-black, white-white) or other (group identification was seen as irrelevant). Since the statistics on known rapes clearly show that the majority are intragroup (Curtis, 1975:69, 83), this variable was operationalized as a crude measure of racism vis-à-vis rape.

Reliability-validity of measures. There are inherent problems of reliability and validity in research which includes cross-cultural instrumentation and measurement. Every effort was made to minimize cultural bias in the collection of data by careful pretesting of the interview schedule with all three groups, using a Spanish translation of the schedule, and utilizing interviewers of the same race/ethnicity and sex as that of the respondent. The most likely source of bias is in the sex-role and sexuality items given that they assume a certain common frame of reference which may not exist; however, these measures were strengthened by using a separate factor analysis procedure for each of the three samples. While measurement bias must be acknowledged, it must also be recognized that this work is the first of its kind to measure attitudes about rape and sex roles across these three groups.

Statistical Procedures

Crosstabulations, one-way analysis of variance and bivariate regression are used in the analysis of the victim data. Multiple regression analysis is the primary statistical technique used in the analysis of the public attitude data. The Rape Scores were regressed on the fourteen independent variables in hierarchical order as determined by zero-order correlation coefficients. Betas (standardized measures testing the strength of association) and F ratios testing the significance of the Betas are used, as well as the F ratios for the overall regression. In addition, basic descriptive statistics are used as appropriate for both sets of data.

FINDINGS

Victim Impact

Of the seven independent variables, only victim race-ethnicity was significantly associated with the impact measures; one-way analyses of variance indicated significant differences in Crisis, FAM, and General Functioning Scores. Means, standard deviations and related score data for each group are shown in Table 1. Of particular interest is the consistent pattern of findings for each of the three racial-ethnic groups. Specifically, as a group, Mexican American victims appear to be the most adversely affected by the rape experience as measured here. Mexican American victims evidenced: (1) the greatest degree of crisis response by having the highest mean Crisis Scores; (2) the most negative changes in their feelings about men by having the lowest mean FAM Scores; and (3) the greatest tendency to withdraw from routine activities by having the lowest mean General Functioning Scores. Finally, although the association in not statistically significant, Mexican American victims
TABLE 1
Means, Standard Deviations and Ranges of Impact Scores by Victim Race-Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crisis Score*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>113.4</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>40-141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>49-114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican American</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>125.7</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>83-153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Groups</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>114.3</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>40-153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM Score**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>5-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>5-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican American</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>5-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Groups</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>5-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Score***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican American</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Groups</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>0-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functioning Score†</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>-4 - +2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>-0.6</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>-4 - +1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican American</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>-4 - 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Groups</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>-4 - +2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: *Possible range=0-240; the higher the score, the greater the degree of crisis.  F=5.87, df=2/58, p<.005.

**Possible range=5-15; the higher the score, the better victims were feeling about men.  F=5.27, df=2/58, p<.008.

***Possible range=0-15 with scores reflecting the number of health concerns experienced as a result of the assault.  Differences were not significant.

†Possible range= -4 - +4; low scores indicate a change toward a more passive, withdrawn style of functioning after the assault.  F=3.32, df=2/53, p<.04.
reported the highest average number of Health Concerns related to the assault. In contrast, the opposite pattern emerged for Black victims on three of the four impact measures: they evidenced the least severe degree of crisis, the least withdrawn style of functioning, and the fewest average number of health concerns. They did not, however, report the least negative feelings about men; Anglo victims held the middle position between Black and Mexican American victims across all impact measures except for feelings about men. On this measure, Anglos were the least negatively affected which represents a position reversal with Black victims.

While these findings indicate specific variations in how Anglo, Black and Mexican American victims were affected by the rape experience, it is obvious that virtually all victims suffered some adverse effects. The data seem to suggest that the differences found among the three victim groups are differences of degree rather than of kind. That is, it cannot simply be concluded that Mexican American victims suffered adverse effects while Black and/or Anglo victims did not. What can be said is that all victims were left with behavioral and emotional disruption in their lives, but the degree of that disruption differed when Mexican American, Black and Anglo victims were compared with each other as groups. That victim race-ethnicity was the only variable (among seven) significantly associated with the impact measures may reflect the relative uniqueness of the three groups; in particular, this finding may indicate that Anglo, Black and Mexican American women each bring a history of different life experiences and, consequently, a different style of coping to the rape experience.

Public Attitude Data

Table 2 shows the means, standard deviations and number of valid cases for each of the three samples on the attitudes about rape measure. The mean scores provide some quantification of attitudes about rape conceptualized on a feminist-nonfeminist continuum. Comparatively, Mexican Americans demonstrate the most nonfeminist attitudes about rape, Anglos the least, and Blacks are about midway between the two; all group means differ significantly. Anglos have the most dispersion of scores in relation to the mean and also a wider range than either of the two minority groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anglos</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>46.03</td>
<td>8.15</td>
<td>27-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blacks</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>49.42</td>
<td>7.25</td>
<td>27-75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexican Americans</td>
<td>340</td>
<td>51.60</td>
<td>6.92</td>
<td>30-77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Low scores suggest feminist attitudes about rape. Scores had a possible range of 27-99.

Based on oneway analysis of variance, p<.001 for all samples.
In Table 3 the results of the regression of Rape Scores on the fourteen independent variables are presented. Those variables which survived the regression are shown in order of their explanatory power in association with Rape Scores. The explained variance for each of the three samples ranges from a low of 17 percent for Mexican Americans to a high of 25 percent for Anglos. If public attitude data can be taken as a measure of community support (or lack of) for victims of rape, what do these findings suggest in relation to each of the three samples and the variations in victim impact? Since Mexican American victims evidenced the most adverse impact from the rape experience and the Mexican American sample has the highest mean Rape Scores, these data are examined first.

**TABLE 3**

Regression of Selected Demographic and Sex-Race Related Variables on Rape Scores for Three Samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>ANGLOS</th>
<th>BLACKS</th>
<th>MEXICAN AMERICANS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female Responsibility (M-F 3)</td>
<td>-.229</td>
<td>.218</td>
<td>-.303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepticism (M-F 2)</td>
<td>-.166</td>
<td>-.220</td>
<td>-.076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>.206</td>
<td>-.100</td>
<td>-1.118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male-Female Sexuality (M-F 1)</td>
<td>-.119</td>
<td>-.132</td>
<td>-.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex-Role Liberation (SR 1)</td>
<td>-.100</td>
<td>.100</td>
<td>.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex-Role Freedom-Equality (SR 2)</td>
<td>-.090</td>
<td>.132</td>
<td>-.132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergroup</td>
<td>.100</td>
<td>.100</td>
<td>.093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victimization</td>
<td>-.090</td>
<td>.093</td>
<td>.093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypic Sex-Role Attributes (SR 3)</td>
<td>-.090</td>
<td>.093</td>
<td>.093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall F = 11.45</strong>* (df=9/316)**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall F = 10.71</strong>* (df=7/281)**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The explained variance for each of the three samples ranges from a low of 17 percent for Mexican Americans to a high of 25 percent for Anglos. If public attitude data can be taken as a measure of community support (or lack of) for victims of rape, what do these findings suggest in relation to each of the three samples and the variations in victim impact? Since Mexican American victims evidenced the most adverse impact from the rape experience and the Mexican American sample has the highest mean Rape Scores, these data are examined first.
Mexican Americans. As shown in Table 3, six variables are significant predictors of Rape Scores for Mexican Americans. The most powerful predictor of nonfeminist attitudes about rape is a strong belief in the traditional sex role for women (SR 3). The belief that men who rape are sick, emotionally disturbed woman-haters (M-F 3) is significantly linked with feminist attitudes about rape. However, such a belief may, in fact, amount to a lack of support for victims; while not judging the victim negatively, those who see rapists as sick may “excuse” the behavior and discourage legal recourse. Two findings related to racial-ethnic relations suggest that the issue of rape is clouded with ambivalence because of concern for minority males as accused rapists as well as for females as victims. Perception of rape as primarily an intergroup phenomenon is associated with nonfeminist rape attitudes and may reflect defensive support for Mexican American males accused of raping Anglo women. High perceived discrimination (toward minority victims and accused offenders) is linked with feminist attitudes. This finding may simply reflect the congruence of an awareness of racism and sexism converging in rape – a dual concern for minority males as accused rapists and for females as victims.

The two demographic variables significantly associated with attitudes about rape for Mexican Americans are age and sex. As might be expected, females hold more feminist attitudes than males and older persons are more feminist than younger ones. While the latter finding may be unexpected, it is consistent with our initial assumptions about rape risks. Younger persons (especially minorities) are more at-risk (males as accused rapists, females as victims); older persons further removed from the threat – can "afford" to be more tolerant and understanding in their judgments about rape.

These findings from the Mexican American community indicate diverse sources of nonfeminist attitudes about rape, stemming from those who hold a strong belief in the traditional role for women, and from males and younger persons. Those attitudes associated with feminist attitudes about rape seem to represent a general “liberal” or humanitarian concern for "sick" rapists, and for minorities – both victims and assailants.
Blacks. While Black victims evidenced the least negative impact, Rape Scores (Table 2) from the Black sample were not the most feminist. The Black community appears to be more feminist than the Mexican American community in judgments about rape, but less so than Anglos. Four variables are significant predictors of Rape Scores for Blacks (see Table 3). The most powerful predictor of nonfeminist attitudes is a tendency to define rape (as real or nonreal) in terms of the victim's reputation (M-F 3). An almost equally powerful predictor of feminist attitudes is a cluster of attitudes relating largely to women's liberation but intermingled with traces of sex-role traditionality (SR 2). A rejection of stereotypic male-female sex roles (SR 1) is also significantly associated with feminist attitudes about rape. The only demographic variable significantly linked with attitudes about rape is age where older persons are more feminist than younger ones, presumably for the same reasons suggested with regard to Mexican Americans - the reduced rape risk which comes with age.

The importance of defining rape in terms of the victim's reputation suggests that, to some degree, the Black community sees rape as a function of who the victim is - no doubt a concession to the abuse Black males have historically suffered when the charge of interracial rape was used as a tactic of racial oppression (Brownmiller. 1975:220-82). Given the history of rape vis-a-vis the Black community, it is understandable that before passing judgment on an alleged rape, the victim is subjected to scrutiny and this is what Victim-Defined Rape (M-F 3) seems to indicate. However, in the Black community, there are other themes associated with feminist attitudes about rape: nontraditionality in sex roles and a modified version of women's liberation. These indicate that nonrestrictive sex roles are identifiably linked with judgments about rape and they may be potential sources of support for the victim.

Anglos. Based on the public attitude data, Anglos hold the most feminist attitudes about rape; yet Anglo victims were not the least negatively affected by the rape experience. While Anglos may generally be more feminist in their attitudes than the two minority samples, the data from the Anglo sample suggest almost unilateral anti-feminist attitudes (about sex roles/sexuality) associated with nonfeminist judgments about rape. Four variables predict Rape Scores for Anglos (Table 3). The most powerful predictor of nonfeminist attitudes is a tendency to hold females responsible for rape by their failure to fight or resist an assailant and/or because their behavior or appearance is seen as provoking the attack (M-F 3). A general skepticism (M-F 2) or doubt that women can be raped unless they want to be or unless a weapon is used is also significantly linked with nonfeminist attitudes about rape, as is the belief that the dynamics of male-female interaction (M-F 1) are such that rape is integral to sexuality itself. Expressed in the vernacular of the area, these three findings seem to reflect the attitude that women (consciously or unconsciously) "ask for it" and "men will be men."

The only demographic variable significantly linked with attitudes about rape is sex where males are more feminist in their beliefs than females. This finding is contrary to that of both Blacks and Mexican Americans (see Table 3) where females were more feminist in their attitudes about rape than their male counterparts. Again, however, the data are consistent with our initial assumptions about rape risks. In a system of racial-sexual stratification, white males exercise the most control over the system in which they live and over the events of their daily lives. Of all the
groups surveyed, they are the least threatened by rape risks, especially the most direct rape risk for a male being formally charged with rape. As shown in the 1980 Uniform Crime Report, 47.7 percent of all persons arrested for rape were Black, more than four times the Black representation in the population at large. Since our Anglo sample was largely middle class, the threat of knowing a rape victim or of being charged with rape is less than for minorities or persons of lower socio-economic groups who are, in general, more familiar with crime.

Taken together, the variables which best predict nonfeminist attitudes about rape for Anglos depict a community of nonsupport for victims and the theme is very consistent. Rape is not clearly differentiated from the dynamics of normal male-female sexuality; there is skepticism that a woman can really be raped and if she is there is a tendency to blame her for her own victimization; and, females were more likely to hold these attitudes than were males.

ANALYSIS

Since this is the first attempt to study both victim impact and attitudes about rape across these three racial-ethnic groups, the findings should be cautiously interpreted in light of the following methodological limitations: (1) the two sets of data were collected in different ways and for different purposes; (2) the instrumentation of concepts across three racial-ethnic groups may have resulted in the measurement of different phenomena; (3) the victim sample, because of size and selection, may not generalize to the racial-ethnic groups represented. Despite these limitations, however, the findings provide some basis for a tentative reconceptualization of the rape experience. For example, while the crisis-related victim literature treats victim impact as an individual response (or set of responses) to a single event (the rape), structural variables such as race-ethnicity are overlooked. Also disregarded is the wider social environment which predetermines certain rape risks and which the individual has to some degree internalized as the social context where the reality of everyday life is experienced. The following analysis is an effort to reconceptualize rape as comprised of the interaction of both intrinsic and extrinsic, meaning, where victim impact can either be mitigated or exacerbated by the presence or absence of community support. From this perspective, the predictors of public attitudes about rape—the most powerful of which are sex role/sexuality and minority-role related—may be viewed as loci of support (feminist attitudes) or nonsupport (nonfeminist attitudes).

There are six loci of support/nonsupport for rape victims in the Mexican American community, the most important of which is related to sex roles; another relates to attitudes about male-female sexuality; two other loci are categoric and two are related to race-ethnicity. The empirical linkages suggest that attitudinal support for a traditional female role, the belief that rape is an intergroup phenomenon, and the categoric risks of being young and male represent cross-pressures in the community; consequently, they are potential sources of nonsupport for victims. Two other empirical linkages—high perceived minority discrimination (particularly against males) and perceptions of rapists as mentally ill—combined with feminist attitudes about rape indicate potential support for victims. However, the tendency to "psychologize" about the rapist and to verbalize discrimination, despite their linkage with feminist judgments about rape, may simply represent a congruence of liberal-
humanitarian social consciousness where concern for rape victims is only one thread of a tapestry of concern for all victims in the minority community. Such attitudes may not provide adequate support for rape victims in terms of mitigating the trouble which emanates from other attitudes and categoric risks.

There are four loci of nonsupport in the Anglo community, three of which are clearly interrelated, evolving from attitudes about male-female sexuality: the belief that responsibility for rape rests with the female; skepticism about the reality of rape; and the belief that rape is simply an extension of normal male-female sexuality. The one other locus of nonsupport for rape victims is the sex category in that females are more nonfeminist than males. Viewed another way, males are a potential source of support because they tend to be more feminist in their attitudes about rape than females, presumably because they are comparatively free (in comparison with minority males and all females) of rape risks. There are two loci of nonsupport for rape victims in the Black community: the tendency to define rape via the victim’s reputation, and the younger age group. There are, on the other hand, two sources of support which surface to yield feminist judgments about rape: liberation and nontraditionality in sex roles.

Thus far, some linkages have been established between the victim and public attitude findings. Where Mexican American victims suffered the most severe degree of impact among the three groups, it appears that public attitudes about rape in the Mexican American community may represent an integral part of the victim’s experience. Not only are the loci of nonsupport more diverse than those found among Anglos and Blacks creating cross-pressures which emanate from attitudes and categoric risks - but there are few mitigating or even balancing loci of support. To a great extent, Anglo victims are in the same kind of community atmosphere. There are several loci of nonsupport, but only one potential locus of support - the comparatively more feminist attitudes of Anglo males - to mitigate the impact of the rape experience. The Anglo and Mexican American communities differ, however, in that the Anglo loci are interrelated, representing different nuances of a similar anti-feminist theme with regard to male-female sexuality. In effect, the Anglo public attitude findings represent compounded anti-feminist sentiments. Thus, Anglo rape victims face a community of nonsupport similar to that faced by Mexican Americans, the only difference being that the sources of nonsupport are more unidimensional and are not compounded by minority vulnerability and risk factors. While Black victims manifested the least negative impact from the rape experience as compared with Anglo and Mexican American victims, their limited number in our sample makes definitive conclusions risky. However, the predictors of attitudes about rape in the Black community differ in substance from those of the other two communities, and there are more identifiable loci of support present. Thus, attitudes in the Black community appear to be at least potentially supportive of rape victims.

SUMMARY

Three hypotheses were examined in this work. First, significant differences were found in the severity of impact experienced by victims; when compared as groups, Mexican American victims suffered the greatest degree of negative impact, followed by Anglo, then Black victims. These variations appear to support a linkage between victim responses (impact) and community attitudes about rape. Second, public attitudes
about rape were found to differ significantly among the Anglo, Black and Mexican American samples. Specifically, attitudes are differentiated by certain age, sex, and race-related categoric risks, some of which apparently interact to produce compounded threats. (1) Among both Blacks and Mexican Americans, the old are apparently less threatened (as evidenced by more feminist attitudes) by rape than the young. (2) Minority males perceive more threat in relation to rape (as accused rapists) than do minority females. (3) Anglo males make comparatively feminist judgments about rape, presumably because they are relatively secure from any threat of rape. In addition, perceived minority discrimination vis-a-vis rape is apparently a factor in shaping attitudes about rape among Mexican Americans and Blacks as evidenced by: (1) the significance among Mexican Americans of perceived discriminatory treatment of minorities as rape victims and as accused intergroup rapists; (2) the significance of rape perceived as an intergroup phenomenon by Mexican Americans; (3) the tendency of Blacks to define rape in terms of the reputation of the victim, an attitude which appears to be more race than sex-related.

With respect to the third hypothesis, it is clear that public attitudes about rape are shaped to a significant degree by expectations related to sex-role behavior and/or beliefs about the dynamics of male-female sexuality. While these attitudes differ among the racial-ethnic groups, it can generally be stated that: (1) some beliefs about sexuality make rape an integral part of the dynamics of male-female interaction; (2) where blame or responsibility for rape is fixed, it is likely to be with the female because of her nature or sex-role behavior and with the male only if he is seen as mentally ill or emotionally disturbed; (3) feminist judgments about rape are associated with liberation and/or nontraditionality in sex roles.

In view of these findings, there is initial evidence to support the reconceptualization of rape as an experience comprised of far more than a victim's personal trouble. The victim's response - the degree of behavioral and emotional disruption that she experiences - can certainly be viewed as the intrinsic component of rape, yet it seems clear that community attitudes can also play a role, either in mitigating or contributing to the negative impact of her experience. It has been argued here that community responses to rape not only play a role, but, in fact, become a part of the rape experience. In a total sense, rape is seen as comprised of both the victim's experience in terms of its intrinsic meaning, and of community attitudes in terms of extrinsic meaning, attitudes which can serve as the foundation of either support or nonsupport for victims. Based on the findings presented here, further research should consider the proposition that while rape may precipitate a crisis for the victim, this is a compounded crisis of an extrinsic as well as intrinsic nature where the social context of rape cannot be ignored.

NOTES

1. The racial-ethnic identity terms used in this article are those used by a majority of the respondents in each of the three samples; as such, they may not coincide with identity labels used in other parts of the country.
2. For a detailed review of the victim methodology, see Holmes and Williams, 1979.
3. Since the initial preparation of this article, we have learned of some similar work done in Hawaii at about the same time as our research. Ruch and Chandler compared the impact of rape on Caucasian, Asian-American, and Hawaiian victims. Impact
was defined in terms of level (the degree to which the victim's life was affected) and type (the kinds of problems encountered as a result of the rape). Although no tests of statistical significance were reported, the authors conclude that both impact measures were found to differ for women from the different ethnic groups. As in our research, other variables did not systematically differentiate rape impact. While neither the ethnic-racial groups nor the impact measures are comparable with this work, the Ruch and Chandler research does tend to support our findings on the significance of race-ethnicity.

4. Crisis response was conceptualized to include three interrelated factors: (1) a hazardous event which poses some threat to the individual; (2) an inability to respond with adequate coping mechanisms; and (3) a resultant upset in the individual's usual pattern of functioning. This conceptualization is derived primarily from the work of Gerald Caplan and Lydia Rapoport.

5. The scale is comprised of ten groups of statements, each group reflecting one aspect of a crisis reaction. Victims were asked to rate each of the 60 statements as being more or less valid as descriptions of their current feelings/behavior compared with their feelings/behavior before the assault. Response categories were scored as: 0=much less true; 1=less true; 2=same as before or does not apply; 3=more true; 4=much more true. Presumably, the higher the Crisis Score (the sum of all item scores), the greater the degree of crisis. Examples of items are: My life is worthwhile; I like working; I worry a lot.

6. Victims were asked to respond by comparing their present feelings about men with their feelings about men before the assault. Response categories were scored as: 3=bad; 2=about the same; 1=not as good. Scores from all five items were summed to yield a Feelings About Men (FAM) Score.

7. Victims were given a list of 11 health concerns and were asked to check each one that they had actually experienced since the assault. They were subsequently asked on an item-by-item basis whether they felt each concern they checked was specifically related to the rape. Victims were also allowed to add three concerns to the list and, where applicable, an earlier item related to alcohol use was included in scoring.

8. Only items which were applicable to nearly all respondents could be included in this measure; these were activities such as household cleaning, cooking, shopping or running errands, and visiting with friends or neighbors. Response categories were scored as: (+1)=more concerned; (0)=equally concerned; (-1)=less concerned with these activities now compared with before the rape. Or, on the item related to visiting, categories were: more time, about the same amount of time, less time spent engaged in this activity now compared with before the assault.

9. These variables were selectively included based on zero-order correlation coefficients. Age, family income, and years of education completed were coded to the nearest year or dollar. Both sex and religion were dummy-coded as dichotomous variables with religion treated simply as Catholic-other.

10. Included were two modified versions of sex-role indices developed by Kammeyer and two women's liberation indices developed by Williams. Responses were made on a four point (strongly agree to strongly disagree) Likert-type scale. Some representative items were: Women should have as much sexual freedom as men; In marriage, the husband should make the major decisions; Women are more emotional than men; Women should receive equal pay (with men) for equal work.

11. Responses were made on a four-point scale (strongly agree to strongly disagree)
to such items as: Most rapes could be avoided if women did not provoke them; Given the right situation, most men are capable of committing rape.

12. The Victimization Scores had a possible range of 0-3 based on a sum of experience with: (1) being a rape/sexual assault victim; (2) having a close friend or family member who was a victim of rape/sexual assault; and (3) being a victim of some other violent crime.

13. Discrimination Scores had a possible range of 4-16 based on strongly agree to strongly disagree responses to four items dealing with minority rape victims and minority males as accused rapists.

14. Interviewer feedback raised the question of content validity of the sex-roles and male-female sexuality items; they reported that many Mexican Americans, particularly females, had difficulty relating to these items. Cronbach's Standardized Alpha Reliability Coefficients for the sex roles items indicated only moderately high reliability: .66 for Anglos, .75 for Blacks, and a low of .57 for Mexican Americans. Coefficients for the sexuality items were slightly higher, but still moderately correlated for all groups. The problem of reliability-validity was controlled to some extent by factor analyzing the sex-role and sexuality items for each sample, then using those factors (rather than the indices comprised of all items) in subsequent statistical analyses.

15. Parameters for the regression were set as: n=14; F=2.0; T=.30.

16. Where the F-test was significant, an additional statistical procedure (a priori contrasts, a t-test option) was used to determine which groups accounted for the association. On Crisis Scores, Anglos and Blacks differed significantly (t=2.2, df=58, p<.04) as did Blacks and Mexican Americans (t=3.4, df=58, p<.001); on FAM Scores, only Anglos and Mexican Americans differed significantly (t=3.7, df=58, p<.001); and on the General Functioning Scores, both Anglo-Mexican American (t=2.2, df=53, p<.03) and Black-Mexican American (t=2.5, df=53, p<.02) contrasts were significant.

17. This interpretation is supported by the fact that Discrimination Scores, when examined by composition, were largely the result of perceived discrimination against minority males accused of raping white women.

REFERENCES

Brownmiller, Susan

Burgess, Ann Wolbert and Lynda Lytle Holmstrom

Caplan, Gerald

Curtis, Lynn A.

Feild, Hubert S.

Fox, Sandra Sutherland and Donald J. Scherl
Halpern, Howard A.  

Holmes, Karen A. and Joyce E. Williams  

Jones, Cathaleen and Elliot Aronson  

Kammeyer, Kenneth  

Klemmack, Susan H. and David L. Klemmack  

McCombie, Sharon L.  

Peters, Joseph J., L.C. Meyer, and N.E. Carroll  
1976 *The Philadelphia Assault Victim Study*. Final Report from the National Center for the Prevention and Control of Rape, National Institute of Mental Health: R01MH2134, Washington, D.C.

Rapoport, Lydia  


Ruch, Libby O., and Susan M. Chandler  

United States Department of Justice  

Williams, Joyce E.  

Williams, Joyce E., and Karen A. Holmes  
1979 *Rape: The Public View - The Personal Experience*. Final Project Report from the National Center for the Prevention and Control of Rape, National Institute of Mental Health: R01MH27928, Washington, D.C.

DEFINITIONAL DILEMMAS AND THE BACCALAUREATE GENERALIST

Frank R. Baskind, Ph.D.
The University of Tennessee, Knoxville

ABSTRACT

This paper serves as a guide to understanding the rationale for present day baccalaureate practice and those factors which may contribute to the difficulty in defining the term "generalist". It reviews the significant actions taken by our professional organizations and the curriculum building activities which led to the current view of the BSW as a generalist practitioner. The definitional dilemma is related to the situational qualities of BSW practice which stem from the nature of who is involved in the defining process. This dilemma seems to be a symptom of a larger professional concern, the need to differentiate between practice behaviors for the BSW and MSW education levels.

Generalist social work practice requires a social worker to be skilled in order to perform a range of social work roles instead of specializing in only one role. Although this approach to practice has been common in the profession for the past fifty years, it was during the 1960s that it became used as a way to describe practice for the human service worker, the college graduate without formal educational preparation in social work, who was hired to fill professional personnel shortages. It provided an alternative to the specialized practice of master social workers in the 1960s.

Within the last decade generalist social work practice has become associated with the baccalaureate social worker, a graduate of an accredited undergraduate professional program. Because accreditation of undergraduate social work education did not take place until 1974, few studies are reported in the literature which consider the BSW as a subject of investigation. The BSW's acceptance as a generalist by the practice community has not been wholly favorable. Most social work practitioners cited in the literature suggest limited professional activities for the BSW. These restrictions appear to be the outgrowth of two factors: differing views between the supporters of undergraduate social work education and graduate educators regarding the practice competencies required for each level of professional practice; and a lack of clarity or agreement about the term "generalist". In order to strengthen the ties between social work educators and practitioners within and across education levels, this article reviews the significant actions taken by our professional organizations and the related research activities which contributed to the preparation of the baccalaureate social worker as a generalist. This paper will serve as a guide to understanding the rationale for present day baccalaureate practice and those factors which may contribute to the difficulty in defining the generalist.
By identifying the differences in the purposes and the data gathering techniques used in the projects which attempted to define the nature of baccalaureate social work practice, this paper also sheds light on the emerging public issue about the need to clearly articulate practice differences between social workers from undergraduate and graduate education programs.

**GENERALIST PRACTICE**

The focus on present day generalist practice as a basis for the educational preparation of the baccalaureate social worker stems from the Syracuse University Undergraduate Curriculum Building Study which reviewed field investigations which identified the functions and abilities of human services workers who were inducted into the profession through agency staff training. Conducted during the period 1962 to 1970, these efforts considered the feasibility of using human service workers to fill the existing and predicted shortages of master level social work professionals. They did not address questions about academic preparation for individuals in undergraduate social work programs. However, the original investigators, several years after they completed their work, were requested to review their raw data and extract information which might be useful for the preparation of baccalaureate social workers. The data were forwarded to members of a manpower task force who were preparing a model for a graduate of a baccalaureate social work education program. From these post hoc findings, likened to public opinion surveys, a model for the baccalaureate social worker emerged. The model stated:

The graduate of the ideal undergraduate social work program is prepared to function in direct service on his own initiative, not merely as an auxiliary, associate, or technician. He is capable of assuming complete and ultimate responsibility for his own working behavior. His competence is not limited to a single field for which he has been specifically prepared but is transferable either in an established social service delivery system or in the development of new systems of needed services... In practice the BSW will be working with people directly, in the field and in the agency; with individuals, families, groups of task-oriented community representatives. He will work in the community reaching out to the client group as well as working directly with other agency and community representatives in community efforts toward social system change.

The model for the baccalaureate social worker identified a range and diversity of practice behaviors which were once the domain of the master level practitioner. The model was recommended for use in undergraduate social work curriculum building and manpower utilization by social work agency directors. However, in offering this model to social work educators and agency directors, the compilers of the research studies cautioned that agency directors had the ultimate responsibility to determine work assignments for the social work staff.

During this same period, efforts by the Southern Regional Educational Board (SREB) produced a framework for the study of social worker roles. Supported by a grant from the Social and Rehabilitative Service, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, SREB sought to upgrade the utilization...
and training of human service workers in the South. Their primary objective was to define the social work practice behaviors expected of the human service worker.

SREB task force members, educators, practitioners, and consumers of social services, recognized two trends in the delivery of social work services. These were the use of human service workers as assistants or "sub-specialists" to MSWs, and an approach to practice which focused on one method of intervention - either social casework, social groupwork, or community organization. The limitation to the one method approach is best illustrated by Kaplan's "law of the instrument". He stated:

Give a small boy a hammer, and he will find that everything he encounters needs pounding. It comes as no particular surprise to discover that a scientist formulates problems in a way which requires for their solution just those techniques in which he himself is especially skilled.

SREB suggested that specialization in one method of intervention limited the practitioner's range of helping. They focused on developing a unique purpose for the human service worker. With consultation from Dr. Sidney Fine, a specialist in job analysis with the W. E. Upjohn Institute on Employment Research, SREB selected a problems approach to manpower development. This approach required the worker to: examine the basic human needs and problems of individuals, families, and communities; identify the obstacles and constraints which prevent the client's optimal social functioning; and select the tasks required to help the client population meet their needs.

This problem approach, which came to be known as the generalist framework, presents a holistic perspective of the client, their needs, and the obstacles to personal growth. It requires the social worker to identify those variables which contribute to the problem situation and suggests use of alternative activities for intervention. The generalist worker shapes practice activities, rather than rely on one method of practice which may try to "force a problem into the method". The generalist practitioner was characterized as follows:

The single personal agent . . . plays whatever roles and does whatever activities are necessary for the person or family when the person or family needs them. His concern is the person in need -- not specific tasks or techniques or professional perogatives. He is an aide to the individual or family -- not an aide to an agency or to a profession.

The following twelve roles formed the foundation for SREB's generalist social work practice: outreach worker, broker, advocate, evaluator, mobilizer, teacher, behavior changer, consultant, community planner, data manager, administrator, and care giver. These are the activities which the human service worker uses to develop helping strategies.

SREB's generalist concept of worker roles became the practice behaviors identified for the human service worker and was recommended for use in undergraduate social work curriculum development. The concept was neither tested by field observations nor by validation of agency directors in the field, but the twelve roles appeared to be reflective of the total range of
activities that may occur in any agency setting. Educators today use this concept to prepare students for practice because it serves as an alternative to the specialization associated with graduate education and offers a temporary solution to the difficult task of differentiating between the BSW and MSW levels of practice.

ORGANIZATION CONTRIBUTIONS

Several actions by social work organizations provided the impetus for identifying the practice behaviors appropriate for BSW level practice. The National Association of Social Workers and the Council on Social Work Education responded to the increase of social work practice by college graduates without professional social work preparation. In 1969, NASW changed its eligibility requirements for regular membership and recommended for membership persons with baccalaureate degrees from CSWE approved undergraduate social work programs. A membership referendum in 1970 ratified this recommendation. The action was labelled "revolutionary" because NASW traditionally was associated with supporting master social work education as the entry for professional practice. At the same time, CSWE developed criteria for constituent membership in its organization. Undergraduate programs which included, as a curriculum objective, the preparation of students for social work practice were eligible for membership.

In 1973, CSWE established two task forces; one on the structure and quality of social work education and another task force on the relationship between social work education and practice. Each was charged with making recommendations for future social work education and practice. The initial task force reports issued in 1974 recommended the following: the baccalaureate degree in social work should represent the basic practitioner in the profession and graduate social work education should focus on specialization and build upon the generalist content of the undergraduate level.

Another action by CSWE served to reinforce their previous activities and those of NASW. In July, 1974, CSWE was sanctioned by the U.S. Office of Education and the National Accrediting Commission to accredit undergraduate social work education programs. CSWE accreditation standards established criteria for professional undergraduate social work education. Criteria were set for program objectives and administrative auspices; student advisement and student rights; and faculty resources. According to the standards, the primary educational objective had to be preparation for beginning professional social work practice. The educational program also "needed to provide a breadth of learning opportunities designed to familiarize the student with a variety of interventive modes." This indicated a generalist practice focus and provided for baccalaureate educators another rationale for preparing a generalist practitioner. CSWE accreditation legitimated the baccalaureate degree as the entry level for professional practice and appears to have strengthened the belief that they should be prepared for a career as a generalist practitioner.

CURRICULUM BUILDING ACTIVITIES

During this same period there were several workshops, a colloquium, and field studies which identified the practice behaviors expected of the BSW. A
brief review of the findings from the Allenberry Colloquium, the Social Work Education Planning Project, the Undergraduate Social Work Curriculum Development Project, and the New England Survey will serve to strengthen the rationale for preparing the BSW for generalist practice and provide a comparative presentation of the different types of practice behaviors identified for the BSW.

**ALLENBERRY COLLOQUIUM.** Differences about what the BSW was expected to do were articulated shortly after the model for the baccalaureate social worker was identified in the findings of the Syracuse University Undergraduate Curriculum Building Study in 1971. In May, 1971, the Council on Social Work Education convened a group of fifteen prominent educators in Allenberry, Pennsylvania. Their task was to consider the baccalaureate social worker as a professional and determine the subject matter required for BSW entry into practice.

The educators believed that the baccalaureate degree should represent the first level of professional practice, but had difficulty agreeing on the practice behaviors expected of the BSW. For a minimal recommendation, they were able to agree on the tasks identified in the Syracuse Study on the BSW. These include the ability to:

1. Establish a rapport with clients from various cultures, with varying needs, dispositions, levels of emotional stability, and intellectual levels.
2. Communicate with people in a way that will enable them to begin to identify their needs and alternatives of behavior available to them.
3. Facilitate clients and community groups to mobilize their own resources.
4. Impart information and instruct in certain areas, especially those having to do with the provision of concrete services, use of resources and means of negotiating complicated systems.

The participants at the Allenberry Colloquium added to the Syracuse recommendations the expectations for a BSW to be able to use advocacy techniques and create change in community institutions. All of these tasks suggest a problem solving approach and require the baccalaureate social worker to be educationally prepared to perform the roles of behavior changer, mobilizer, teacher and advocate.

**SOCIAL WORK EDUCATION PLANNING PROJECT.** Michael Austin and Philip Smith, co-directors of the Social Work Education Project, sponsored by the Florida Board of Regents, developed a paradigm for manpower planning and staff utilization. They introduced the model of an educational continuum which included the worker levels of: aide, a high school graduate; technician, a two-year community college graduate; the baccalaureate social worker; the master social worker; and the Ph.D. social worker. Upon this continuum, Austin and Smith clustered social work roles according to different levels of education. They postulated that workers at each of these levels would be required to learn all twelve social work roles identified by SREB, but would need to become competent in only a cluster of roles. Role clusters represented the job functions for each
level of worker. Role overlap represented the similar knowledge and skill base. The social work aide was expected to perform the roles of caregiver and outreach worker. The social work technician was to perform as a broker and behavior changer. The baccalaureate social worker was to be primarily a mobilizer, advocate, evaluator, and data manager, while overlapping the roles performed by the social work aide and social work technician. The master social worker was to act as an administrator, community planner, teacher, and consultant while possessing the knowledge and skill base of the roles played by lower level workers. The authors recognized that the paradigm was an initial attempt to identify how roles may be clustered according to educational level. The model identified specific BSW roles and reinforced generalist expectations for the baccalaureate social worker.

THE UNDERGRADUATE SOCIAL WORK CURRICULUM PROJECT. This project was conducted during the period July 1975 to July 1977, and relied on consultation with leading social work educators and special workshops with educators, practitioners, and agency representatives. Existing research and curriculum studies were reviewed and the project participants developed materials which were used to test new objectives and curriculum content for undergraduate social work education. From these efforts ten general competencies necessary for the beginning baccalaureate professional were identified for validation in practice. They are:

1. Identify and assess situations where the relationship between people and social institutions need to be initiated, enhanced, restored, protected, or terminated.
2. Develop and implement a plan for improving the well-being of people based on problem assessment and the exploration of obtainable goals and available options.
3. Enhance the problem-solving, coping, and developmental capacities of people.
4. Link people with systems that provide them with resources, services, and opportunities.
5. Intervene effectively on behalf of populations most vulnerable and discriminated against.
6. Promote the effective and humane operation of the systems that provide people with services, resources, and opportunities.
7. Actively participate with others to increase new, modified, or improved service, resource, and opportunity systems that are more equitable, just and responsive to consumers of services, and work with others to eliminate those systems that are unjust.
8. Evaluate the extent to which the objectives of the intervention plan were achieved.
9. Continually evaluate one's own professional growth and development through assessment of practice behaviors and skills.
10. Contribute to the improvement of service delivery by adding to the knowledge base of the profession as appropriate and by supporting and upholding the standards of ethics of the profession.

The presentation of each competency was followed by a description of specific competencies required to reach the general competency. The ten general competencies and their related specific competencies represent the social work
roles of behavior changer, broker, advocate, data manager, community planner, outreach, care-giver, and evaluator and suggest generalist practice for the BSW. Today undergraduate social work educators use these competencies as the educational outcomes of their programs and as criteria for the selection of program objectives, content, and the development of learning frameworks and evaluation.

THE NEW ENGLAND SURVEY. This survey identified the social work roles which agency directors in six New England states expect the BSW to perform in their agency settings. It also attempted to determine if variables such as the nature of the agency setting, the agency director's educational background, the community, and the presence of a BSW in an agency influence the agency director's role expectations of the BSW and therefore, their view of generalist social work practice. A total of 480 agency directors were forwarded the data gathering instrument, the Baccalaureate Social Work Competency Questionnaire. There were 314 usable responses.

The roles which clearly defined generalist social work practice for the BSW in New England were advocate, broker, care-giver, community planner, data manager, and counselor. Statistical analysis of the data on the survey instrument found that several variables influenced the directors' role expectations and their view of generalist social work practice. For example, the variables of agency setting and educational background each had a significant influence on the directors' responses to the role of administrator. Non-MSW agency directors in primary and host settings had higher expectations for the BSW to perform administrative behaviors than MSW agency directors. BSWs were also more likely to perform the role of administrator in host agency settings. Several variables influenced agency directors' responses to the role of advocate, care-giver, community planner, and counselor. Non-MSW agency directors were more inclined to expect the BSW to perform these roles than MSW agency directors. The presence of a BSW in a non-MSW director's agency positively influenced the director's expectations for additional BSWs to perform the roles of care-giver, community planner, and counselor. These findings were more evident when the variable urban community was considered.

DEFINITIONAL DIFFICULTY

Findings and recommendations from a national curriculum building project, a colloquium, a review of field studies, and a regional survey have identified a range and diversity of behaviors suggestive of generalist practice for the beginning professional social worker, the BSW. Figure 1 summarizes the practice activities expected of the BSW according to the curriculum building activities that were reviewed.

The figure reveals one source of difficulty to finding a common definition for the term "generalist". Six curriculum building activities which attempted to define baccalaureate level practice recommended different practice expectations for the BSW. These expectations reflect differences in the purpose and the manner in which each curriculum related activity was created, as well as differences in the orientation of the individuals who participated in the activities. All of these differences need to be discussed in more detail in
order to identify those factors which may influence BSW practice expectations and to further explain the reasons for the situational quality which is characteristic of generlist practice.

Figure 1. EXPECTATIONS FOR BSW PRACTICE TRANSLATED INTO SOCIAL WORK ROLES. The length of the vertical bar represents the roles recommended for the BSW by the activities indicated.
The Syracuse University Undergraduate Social Work Curriculum Building Project was conducted as a result of the lack of trained personnel available to respond to the influx of federal funds during the Kennedy–Johnson era. The following comments at a 1967 NASW workshop on manpower attest to the need for personnel:

We have reached a strange paradox in social welfare: "Too much money and not enough people." The painful realities of personnel shortages have now reached every section of our welfare system. It is not uncommon to meet an agency administrator whose main complaint is not that of obtaining adequate financing but where to find the staff to make use of the program money he has.²¹

Social service manpower utilization studies were conducted during this period in an effort to respond to personnel shortages. Most of these investigations considered the feasibility of using college graduates who did not possess formal educational preparation in social work, to fill the existing and projected shortages of master level social work professionals. These studies suggested that professional social work could be practiced by non-master level social workers. For example, some studies focused on demonstration projects in Veterans Administration settings which employed college graduates to receive on-the-job training and become assistants to master social workers.²² Several functions appropriate for the social work assistant were identified. These included performing psychosocial histories, planning patient discharges, and follow-up social services. As a result of these findings, a new job category, social work assistant, was established in 1965 for the Veterans Administration health care system. Employment as a social work assistant did not require formal educational preparation in social work.

A more widely published manpower utilization study conducted by the National Association of Social Workers identified additional beginning professional responsibilities for human service workers.²³ The purpose of this investigation was to find more efficient ways of using personnel to increase the quality and quantity of social services and to respond to personnel shortages in the mental health field. This work had several components: an extensive literature review, a survey of over 200 social work departments in mental hospitals; a task analysis of social work responsibilities at one state psychiatric hospital; and a field demonstration project at another state psychiatric hospital. The field project sought to determine the impact of in-service staff training on the differential deployment of human service workers. The major findings of their total investigation determined that master social workers and human service workers were used interchangeably. The human service worker performed adequately a range of tasks once identified exclusively for the master social worker. They were perceived as relieving manpower shortages while simultaneously increasing client services. These studies and others have demonstrated a range of significant responsibilities for non-master social workers.²⁴ These efforts, however, never were intended to be used in curriculum development activities related to the articulation of practice expectations for the BSW. Several graduate social work educators associated with the Syracuse Study reviewed the findings from the available human services manpower studies in an attempt to extract data to hypothesize a model for undergraduate social work education. There was no mandate from
the practice community regarding these expectations and, as a result, the profession as a whole never participated in the foundational work for the BSW.

The Allenberry Colloquium was sponsored by the Council on Social Work Education and directed by graduate educators. The work at Allenberry might be described as an "armchair attempt" to identify BSW practice expectations. Although the recommendations did not move significantly beyond those from the Syracuse Study, CSWE's intent, to bring prominent educators together to create a forum for the exchange of ideas about a new practice degree, was achieved. The major topics of concern focused on the nature of the core content, similarities and differences in programs, and the liberal arts base. The lack of input by practitioners and the fact that no BSWs (graduates of accredited programs) were in existence during the early 1970s made it difficult to predict with accuracy what the BSW ought to be able to do. These factors, as well as the reality that the forecasting was made by senior graduate educators who were unable to agree on many practice expectations, contributed to limited expectations for the future BSW. A trend towards increased practice expectations developed when agency practitioners and administrators had an opportunity to contribute ideas. This is seen in the following four works.

The purpose of the Southern Regional Education Board's Social Welfare Manpower Project was to identify the appropriate roles of the beginning social worker in order to improve the quality and use of undergraduate workers in Kentucky, Maryland, Tennessee, Texas, Virginia and West Virginia. Through data gathered by reviews of the literature, conferences, consultations, reactions to monographs, and meetings between project staff, a core group of educators, consumers and practitioners, twelve social work roles were identified. The term "generalist" was presented to describe a problems approach to practice, as opposed to the specialist's reliance on a methods approach. As a result of SREB's publications on this work in the early 1970s, undergraduate social work educators had a much needed framework to use to plan the BSW curriculum. The manpower needs of the southern region, and the participation of consumers and practitioners in the definitional process, contributed to an expanded view of BSW practice.

The Social Work Education Project also was conducted prior to the formal recognition of the undergraduate social work degree by CSWE in 1974. It included participation by educators, practitioners, administrators, and planners from a variety of social service settings throughout Florida; the project focused on improving service delivery by specifying the skills of future employees to educators. The BSW practice activities were developed through information developed in small group workshops, conferences, and in a field placement experiment in which a small group of students, from a two-year community college human service program, a four year baccalaureate social welfare program, and a two-year graduate social work program, participated as a team in creating a delinquency prevention program. The project's focus on the delivery of services and the active participation by community personnel appears to have contributed to a wider range of practice expectations.

The work of the Undergraduate Social Work Curriculum Development Project was under the leadership of two undergraduate social work educators and aimed to identify the objectives and basic content for beginning social work practice. It used a curriculum development strategy which placed primary emphasis on input from practitioners. Special workshops were held with each of the following:
BSW practitioners from each of the ten HEW regions; members of the American Public Welfare Association, who represented all the practice levels within the public welfare sector; representatives of NASW, national voluntary and federal agencies, and educators who were in leadership positions at CSWE. The data which developed from the suggestions and reactions of the 125 participants resulted in the articulation of ten practice competence areas for the BSW.

The findings of the New England Survey support the recommendations for multiple competency preparation by identifying six complex social work roles which agency directors in six New England states expect the BSW to be prepared to perform. The purpose of this study was to validate the generalist concept of social work practice as a basis for the educational preparation of the BSW. A data gathering instrument, the Baccalaureate Social Work Competency Questionnaire (BSWCQ), was developed by the principal investigator, who was an undergraduate social work educator, to identify the social work roles which agency directors expect the BSW to perform in their agency. The population from which the final sample was randomly selected consisted of directors of agency settings in Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont, and stratified according to the type of agency setting (primary or host) and the community (rural or urban). A total of 480 agency directors were forwarded the BSWCQ and an explanatory letter.

The data from 314 directors on the final BSWCQ were evaluated by a principal components factor analysis with an orthogonal rotation. Seven social work roles were identified. Their alpha internal consistency reliabilities ranged from .66 to .84 with a mean reliability rating of .74. The roles were administrator, advocate, broker, care-giver, community planner, counselor, and data manager. The mean scores for each of the roles reflected a range of behaviors which agency directors expect the BSW to perform. Agency directors' responses then were subjected to a four-way analysis of variance. The independent variables were: the type of agency setting (primary or host), the educational background of the agency director (MSW or non-MSW), community (rural or urban), and the presence or absence of a BSW in an agency. The dependent variables were the mean scale scores for each of the roles identified on the BSWCQ. The range and intensity of BSW practice expectations identified by agency directors in this study support the trend for practitioners to have greater expectations than educators; it also suggests that MSWs have lower practice expectations than non-MSWs.

IMPLICATIONS

This comparative review of the curriculum building works identified in figure 1 indicates there are discrepancies between the education and practice communities and between professional social workers and other helping individuals regarding BSW practice expectations. The lack of meaningful participation by practitioners with educators may be one reason for the discrepancy in our profession. Educators' and MSW agency directors' knowledge about, and "practice wisdom" regarding, the sophisticated nature of the complexity of the tasks associated with social work practice may explain their limited recommendations. A lack of practice understanding, therefore, may explain why some non-MSW agency directors would use BSWs in administrative roles and have stronger expectations...
to engage them in counselor, care-giver, and community planner activities. For example, in the New England Survey, the practice behaviors which comprised the BSWCQ required a high level of skill and knowledge. To "change behaviors in a small group member", to "mobilize community resources", and to "perform family counseling" are examples of items which appeared on the questionnaire and are skills which traditionally have been associated with senior MSW practitioners and educators. In this work, as well as in the Syracuse Study and Allenberry Colloquium, social work practitioners or educators appear cautious, most likely because of their recognition of the level of expertise required to become successful in the use of these practice skills.

Regional differences, in the form of the rural and urban influence on directors' expectations on the BSWCQ, imply that the BSW will be expected to perform more social work behaviors when employed in an urban environment. This seems realistic when one considers that the definition of "rural" and "urban" in the New England Survey was based on the criteria for a standard metropolitan statistical area identified by the U.S. Bureau of the Census. An urban community consisted of a town, or group of towns, containing at least one town having 50,000 or more citizens, plus neighboring towns which are metropolitan in character and economically and socially integrated with the central city. A rural community was a town or village, non-metropolitan in character and not identified as located in a SMSA. Lower expectations for the rural BSW may result from the less complex character of the community and/or citizen's reliance on informal networks for helping services, which is reflective of the interdependence of rural people and their community. It is also interesting to note that the items which comprised the roles of advocate, community planner, and counselor on the BSWCQ may not be as relevant for the needs of rural citizens. Most of the social work educators and practitioners on the panel which validated the content of the items that comprised the BSWCQ represented urban areas. If there were items on this survey instrument which pertained to rural practice, such as "working with natural helping networks," then one may expect higher expectations for the BSW in rural communities.

A range of practice activities are expected of the BSW, yet the BSW's practice as a generalist may be defined differently. The BSW is in the middle of two struggles: they are between the curriculum expectations identified by the education and practice communities, as well as between the practice expectations identified by MSW and non-MSW agency directors. The review of curriculum defining activities which contributed to the development of contemporary professional baccalaureate practice, and the analysis of the New England Survey which attempted to delineate this practice, still indicate that the BSW is expected to function as a generalist. However, a definitional dilemma exists because generalist practice is situational and related to who does the defining, the reason why the defining is taking place, and the manner in which this task is accomplished.

Although the dilemma contributes to the uncertainty about the utilization of BSWs in practice, it should encourage social work educators and practitioners to respond. Educators can strengthen their problem solving practice focus in practice classes and ensure that it becomes a salient feature of the undergraduate curriculum. Preparing future BSWs in all phases of a problem solving
practice model may serve as one response to the definitional difficulty because this practitioner would have a set of knowledge and skills which cut across practice roles and behaviors. Social work educators also might design community needs assessment instruments to collect data which will permit them to improve their curriculums by keeping the subject matter and skills congruent with the demands and realities of practice. They also may develop ongoing formal means of feedback from program graduates in order to determine if they are expected to perform practice behaviors for which they have not been prepared. The recognition of the situational characteristics of generalist practice also places responsibilities on agency administrators to provide continuing education opportunities for BSWs, either through separate settings or agency consortium arrangements. Regardless of its form, the primary response ought to be a partnership in preparing the baccalaureate social worker.

Attempts to strengthen the preparation of the BSW to make more certain that they can respond to the unknown demands of practice do not fully address the potential practice abuse of BSWs and their clients, which the New England Survey indicates may develop as a result of the practice expectations of non-MSW agency directors. Outreach and information to non-MSW agency directors appears to be essential. Non-MSW agency directors are hiring BSWs and expect the BSW to perform many social work functions. However, they have not been expected to participate in curriculum development. A working draft of CSWE Standards for Accreditation responds to this limitation. It recommends "an ongoing relationship between practice community and the social work program" and "the student... to be helped to see professional identity and competence as resulting from a continuous interchange with others, including a wide range of professionals and members of other diverse groups."27 The proposed standards and the findings of the New England Survey require the undergraduate curriculum to be congruent with both the MSW and the non-MSW demands of practice.

All of these responses still fail to take into consideration a larger professional issue, one which appears to be at the core of the definitional dilemma. The BSW practice expectations identified through curriculum building projects, workshops, and national studies are the same practice behaviors which have been, and continue to be, practiced by MSWs. The issues associated with differentiating between MSW and BSW education and practice levels, although vital for the survival and growth of the profession, were not addressed when the non-specialist focus for the BSW was being developed. This oversight strengthened the argument that the BSW should be prepared as a generalist while avoiding the fact that generalist practice also exists at the master's level. Today the symptoms of avoiding this task appear to be the added confusion about the meaning of the term generalist and the on-going schism between and within educational and practice communities. Only recently formal efforts to find ways to confront the task have begun, with the formation of the Committee on Articulation of Graduate and Undergraduate Social Work Education, composed of four graduate deans who each have responsibility for an undergraduate program.28

The activities which contributed to the emergence of the present day baccalaureate generalist and those factors which contribute to the definitional dilemma indicate that any attempt by the profession to articulate practice for the two levels must consider both the situational qualities and variables which are part of the definitional task. Conjoint and local research, by graduate and undergraduate program faculty and community practitioners, which differentiate social work activities across practice and education levels, may be one way to resolve a major dilemma associated with social work practice and the growth of
the profession. Finally, the review of the curriculum projects suggest that it is time to go beyond attempting to identify what BSWs ought to be prepared to do, and begin to identify what they are capable of and are now doing in practice. Practitioners would have to play a significant role in this process.

REFERENCES


3. Ibid., p. 16.

4. Ibid., p. 103 and p. 105.


20. Agency directors' responses to the items which comprised SREB social work roles were analyzed by a factor analysis statistical procedure to identify how well the items clustered together to form a role. As a result, items for the role of community planner related to the role of mobilizer; items association with the roles of teacher and counselor are represented in the role of behavior changer.


Manuscripts for the Journal should be submitted to:

Robert Leightinger  
Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare  
Western Michigan University  
School of Social Work  
Kalamazoo, Michigan 49008

Please submit three copies of the manuscript. The Journal welcomes a broad range of articles concerned with empirical research on social welfare, analysis of problems in social welfare, "think pieces" and others.

**Subscriptions**

Subscriptions to the Journal may be obtained by writing to:

Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare  
University of Connecticut  
School of Social Work  
1800 Asylum Avenue  
West Hartford, Connecticut 06117

**Volume - 8 & 9**

- Students - $10
- Individuals - $12
- Institutions or Libraries, U.S. - $20
- Institutions or Libraries, overseas - $25

**Back Issues**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students:</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 1 - 3</td>
<td>$8.00</td>
<td>per 2 Volumes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 4</td>
<td>$6.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 5 - 7</td>
<td>$8.00</td>
<td>per Volume</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individuals:</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 1 - 3</td>
<td>$7.00</td>
<td>per Volume</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 4</td>
<td>$9.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 5 - 7</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>per Volume</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutions or Libraries:</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 1 - 3</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>per Volume</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 4</td>
<td>$13.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vol. 5 - 7</td>
<td>$15.00</td>
<td>per Volume</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Individual issues of the Journal may be purchased at $2.50 per issue. Please include check with order.