Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw

Part of the Social Work Commons, and the Sociology Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw/vol25/iss4/1

This Complete Issue is brought to you for free and open access by the Social Work at ScholarWorks at WMU. For more information, please contact maira.bundza@wmich.edu.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ORGANIZATIONAL POSITION: INFLUENCES ON PERCEIVED ORGANIZATIONAL PROPERTIES</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moshe Sherer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANNING FOR COMMUNITY CRISIS: A MARKETING APPROACH</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amnon Boehm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMOTIONAL AND EMBODIED KNOWLEDGE: IMPLICATIONS FOR CRITICAL PRACTICE</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colin Peile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TERMINATION: EXTENDING THE CONCEPT FOR MACRO SOCIAL WORK PRACTICE</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marcia P. Harrigan, David P. Fauri, and F. Ellen Netting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE DEFINITION OF FATHERHOOD: IN THE WORDS OF NEVER-MARRIED AFRICAN AMERICAN CUSTODIAL MOTHERS AND THE NON-CUSTODIAL FATHERS OF THEIR CHILDREN</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer F. Hamer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOCIAL SUPPORT'S CONTRIBUTION TO REDUCED WELFARE DEPENDENCY: PROGRAM OUTCOMES OF LONG TERM WELFARE RECIPIENTS</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank A. Sansone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTITUTIONAL ETHNOGRAPHY: STUDYING INSTITUTIONS FROM THE MARGINS</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brian J. O'Neill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A FEW CONTRIBUTIONS OF ECONOMIC THEORY TO SOCIAL WELFARE POLICY ANALYSIS</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael A. Lewis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A QUALITATIVE CUM QUANTITATIVE APPROACH TO CONSTRUCT DEFINITION IN A MINORITY POPULATION: REASONS FOR DIVORCE AMONG ISRAELI ARAB WOMEN

Rivka Savaya and Orna Cohenn

BOOK REVIEWS


BOOK NOTES

Enterprise and the Welfare State. Martin Rein and Eskil Wadensjo


Welfare in America: How Social Science Fails the Poor. William Epstein

Organizational Position: Influences on Perceived Organizational Properties

MOSHE SHERER
Tel Aviv University
Bob Shapell School of Social Work

People perceive and interpret their work place in different ways that may be related to their hierarchical position in the organization. Workers' attitudes toward their organization can exert a negative effect on their own and other people's feelings and behavior, and have detrimental consequences for the achievements of the organization. The purpose of this study is to examine the perceptions of organizational characteristics maintained by three levels of human service organization employees: Managers, supervisors or instructors, and line workers. Respondents in the present sample (n = 135) indicated their perceptions about seven organizational properties. Results reveal that the higher the organizational position of the subject, the more positive are the subject's perceptions concerning the organization, and the importance attached to various organizational properties. Results are interpreted in terms of the potential problems resulting from the different views of employees toward their organization, and the possible implications this holds for the staff of human service organizations.

The positions, roles, perceptions and behaviors of staff are of particular importance in human service organizations built of people, and their core activities consist of relations between staff and clients (Hasenfeld, 1983). However just as people shape organizations, so do organizations shape employees in assigning positions, roles and functions to them, and causing them to interact with other people (Lauffer, 1984). Employees are trying to make sense of everything that is happening in the organization (Hutri, 1995), their perceptions are important since they determine to some extent employees' self-esteem, job satisfaction, and production levels (Finlay, Martin, Roman, & Blum, 1995; Ferris &
While being subjective, perceived reality is as important as the reality itself in determining people's behavior (Lewin, 1936). These perceptions are a result of different variables that may be categorized as organizational (size, technology), personal (gender, personal experience), and environmental job influences (attitudes of other employees) (Ferris & Kacmar, 1992; Ferris, Russ & Fandt, 1989; Lorsch & Morse, 1974; Wiley & Crittenden, 1992). A considerable influence on workers' attitudes toward the organization is exerted by the behavior patterns of management and other employees (Parker, Dipboy, & Jackson, 1995). The purpose of the present study was to discover whether there are differences in the perceptions of human service organizational properties related to hierarchical position in the organization.

Since so much importance is attached to organizations in our society, the views people hold regarding their organizations are highly significant. Our perceptions moreover have a strong impact on our descriptions, diagnoses, and subsequent behavior. Examining the factors that affect it is therefore important. However, employees' perceptions of their organization are not unidirectional; employees hold different views for objective reasons (different sources of information) and subjective ones (their views regarding benefits they receive) (Kahn, Wolf, Quinn, & Snoek, 1964). The importance of behaviors in an organization and whether these are beneficial or harmful to it may depend more on how the behaviors are perceived than their reality (Parker, Dipboy, & Jackson, 1995).

James and James (1989) stress the importance of defining the environment in terms of perceived attributes. Negative perception may lead to a decrease in work motivation and an absence of extra-role effort on the individual's part (Ferris, Russ, & Fandt, 1989; Parker, Dipboy, & Jackson, 1995). Moreover Aldrich (1979) shows that occupational groups may interpret the same regulations and objectives differently, and interpersonal differences based on ethnicity, gender, age, and socioeconomic origins influence workers' interpretations of the same organizational situation.

Research has revealed differences of perceptions among employees at different levels of the organization. Gordon (1991)
claims that managers and their subordinates, coworkers, or supervisors often see and describe the same situation differently. Packard (1993) studied actual and ideal levels of participation in decision making, and found differences between line workers, and their supervisors and administrators as to line workers’ actual level of participation, and perceptions of line workers’ capabilities in this area. Line workers believed they had less power than the other two groups attributed to them.

Perceptual differences influence group and intergroup interactions, the particular role of an individual and the group to which he or she belongs influence these perceptions (Lieberman, 1956; Gordon, 1991). Just as individual perceptions influence people’s views of their own roles and statuses compared with others (Kahn, Wolf, Quinn & Snoek, 1964), so can they influence people’s perceptions and attributions of various organizational characteristics as well. We follow Burrel and Morgan (1979) in leaning toward the deterministic perspective. People typically react according to their role and position in the organization, regardless of the specific setting. All line workers share notions regarding the need to improve the organization, doing so to a greater extent than supervisors and top management.

Within the human service organization, in which professionals hold managerial, supervision, and line workers position, there is sometimes the tendency to prefer professional rules over organizational ones (Hasenfeld, 1983; Sherer, 1986). This may influence differences of perception and importance attached to different organizational properties.

Thus, many variables shape employees’ reactions to their organization. There is however the possibility that organizational position is one of the more influential factors in this process. The purpose of this study was to reveal if such differences exist among three levels of organizational hierarchies. Accordingly we hypothesized the following:

1. Differences in perception of organizational properties will be found among the three subgroups of organizational hierarchies: The higher the rank the more positive the perceptions of organizational properties.

2. Differences of opinion about the importance of organizational properties for the organization will emerge among the three
hierarchical levels: The higher the rank, the more important the perceived properties of the organization.

Method

Sample: The sample was randomly selected by 47 M.S.W. students participating in an introductory course on human service organization. Most of the students worked in various human service organizations (43 in all), and were asked to choose randomly one employee from each of three hierarchical positions in their organization: Top management; supervisory or instructional (supervisors); and line workers. In the rare instances in which two students came from the same organization, they were asked to coordinate their random sampling. Of the expected 144 questionnaires, 135 valid ones (92%) were returned.

Questionnaire: The questionnaire included two parts. The first part consisted of five demographic questions regarding position, professional and job tenure, years of education, and gender. The second part of the questionnaire consisted of 35 questions regarding perceptions of organizational properties. The questionnaire was a modification of the Management Appraisal Guide (MAG) of Knighton and Heidelman (1983). It was originally devised for evaluating organizational properties in seven areas (General Agency Information; Policies and Procedures; Personnel; Communication; Problem Solving; Monitoring and Evaluation; Financial Planning and Management). Managers were to use the questionnaire to study and evaluate the reality of their organization, as they perceived it at the time, compared with their ideal vision of where the agency ought to be (Knighton & Heidelman, 1983).

To learn about employees' attributions of these same properties and the importance that the different organizational properties had for various levels of personnel, the questionnaire was revised to include answers on two scales. For each question that dealt with an aspect of organization property, the respondent was asked to indicate on one Likert-type scale (ranging from 1 = "very little" to 5 = "to a very high degree") the level of existence of the property in the organization, and to indicate on another Likert-type scale (ranging from 1 = "not important" to 5 = "very important") the importance of the property to the organization. Thus for
the question "does the agency have a stated mission?" the subject indicated on one scale the level of existence of this property in the organization, and on the other scale, its importance to the organization. We have used the questionnaire for several years for class assignments. The students delivered the questionnaires to the three hierarchical levels of top management, supervisors and line workers, anonymity was granted. The questionnaires were then analyzed and used in class for educational purposes. Results were systematic and called for thorough analysis.

The current version retains the original seven areas of organizational properties but contains only 35 of the original 70 questions. The contents are as follows: "General Agency Information" (e.g., Do agency staff members understand the social problems its programs are designed to alleviate?)—Includes the original questions 1,2,4,6,7; "Policies and Procedures" (e.g., Does the agency have policy and procedure manuals?)—includes questions 1,2,3,5; "Personnel" (e.g., Does the agency have written job descriptions and specifications for each staff member?)—includes questions 1,2,3,4,9; "Communications" (e.g., Does the agency have a formal communication system?)—includes questions 1,3,5,6,8,9; "Problem Solving" (e.g., Does the agency have a formal process for the management of problem situations?)—includes questions 1,2,3,4,8; "Monitoring and Evaluation" (e.g., Does the agency conduct program monitoring and evaluation on a regular basis?)—includes questions 3,6,8,9,10; "Financial Planning and Management" (e.g., Does the agency have an adequate budget to accomplish its mission, goals, and objectives?) includes questions 1,3,4,5,8 (see Knighton & Heidelman, 1983). The choice of questions is based on clarity, relevance and reliability tests of the original 70 questions determined by results gathered during three years of study (see Tables 2 & 3 for current study reliability scores).

Results

Our sample consisted of 48 line workers, 38 supervisors and 49 managers. The lower figure for supervisors probably results from the fact that some came from outside the organization, and were therefore difficult to reach. (See Table 1 for sample characteristics).
The finding of higher years of education and professional tenure among higher ranks may confound the results regarding the effect of hierarchical position on actual and importance of perceived organizational properties. However, a correlation test revealed only few significant low correlations (the highest $r = .24$) among these variables and the perception of actual and importance levels of organizational properties variables. The explanation of differences among our employees should be explained on other grounds.

To examine the data for possible differences among the three hierarchical levels for professional characteristics, we employed a MANOVA test on years of education, professional tenure, tenure on the job by position (manager, supervisor, line worker) and gender (male & female). Also, post hoc analyses were used to decide specific differences that contributed to overall effects.

The MANOVA test showed a significant main effect of position: Wilks $= .68$, $F(6,254) = 8.75$, $p < .001$. Univariate differences showed up on years of education ($F(2,129) = 6.15$, $p < .003$),
Organizational Properties

and professional tenure \( (F(2,129) = 23.15, p < .001) \). Scheffe post hoc analysis revealed that managers and supervisors had higher mean scores for educational years than did line workers. On professional tenure, managers had higher mean scores than either supervisors or line workers, and the supervisors had higher mean scores than line workers (See Table 1). No significant differences were indicated for gender or for the interaction of position and gender.

In examining the data for possible differences among the three groups of subjects and gender regarding their organizational attributes, we employed a 3 x 2 MANOVA test (position: manager, supervisor and line worker x gender: male or female) for each of the seven principal categories of organizational properties of the actual properties and on the importance of the properties. Additionally, individual ANOVAs were carried out to decide specific differences. Also, post hoc analyses were used to decide specific differences that contributed to the overall effects. What follows, then, is an account of the results of the MANOVA tests.

Regarding actual organizational properties, the MANOVA test showed a significant main effect of position: Wilks = .81, \( F(14,246) = 1.90, p < .026 \). Univariate differences showed up on Policies and Procedures: \( F(2,129) = 6.41, p < .002 \); Personnel: \( F(2,129) = 8.51, p < .001 \); and an approaching significant result on Problem Solving: \( F(2,129) = 2.48 p < .087 \). Scheffe post hoc analysis revealed that managers had higher mean scores than line workers on Policy and Procedures; managers and supervisors had higher mean scores on Personnel than did line workers; again the ANOVA revealed an approaching significance result for the Problem Solving, Duncan post hoc analysis showed that managers had a higher mean score than supervisors and line workers (See Table 2). No significant differences were indicated for gender or for the interaction of position and gender.

Regarding the importance of organizational properties, the MANOVA test showed a significant main effect of position: Wilks = .80, \( F(14,244) = 2.01, p < .018 \). Univariate differences showed up on Policies and Procedures: \( F(2,128) = 4.21, p < .017 \); Personnel: \( F(2,128) = 7.86, p < .001 \); Communication: \( F(2,128) = 3.55, p < .031 \); Problem Solving: \( F(2,128) = 5.53, p < .005 \); and an approaching significance result on Financial Planning and Management:
Table 2
Means and Standard Deviations of Actual Organizational Properties by Function

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables:</th>
<th>Line Workers (N = 48)</th>
<th>Supervisors (N = 38)</th>
<th>Managers (N = 49)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. General Agency Information</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>3.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .77)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Policies and Procedures</td>
<td>3.17*</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>3.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .68)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Personnel</td>
<td>2.68*</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>3.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .72)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Communication</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>3.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .56)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Problem Solving</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td>3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .83)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .78)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Financial Planning</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>2.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n = 5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(a = .65)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p < .05

a Number of items in each scale
b Reliability coefficient Alpha

\[ F(2,128) = 3.02; p < .052. \] Scheffe post hoc analysis revealed that on Policies and Procedures, managers had higher mean scores than the supervisors and the line workers. The managers had higher mean scores than did line workers on Personnel; Communication; Problem Solving; Financial Planning and Management (See Table 3). Again, no significant differences were indicated for gender or for the interaction of position and gender.

Our hypotheses were largely supported. Differences of perceived organizational properties and the perceived importance of these properties emerged among the three organizational hierarchies; and the higher the rank, the higher were the mean scores.
**Organizational Properties**

**Table 3**

*Means and Standard Deviations of Importance of Organizational Properties by Function*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables:</th>
<th>Position in the Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Line Workers (N = 48)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. General Agency Information (n = 5)</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(α = .78)</td>
<td>4.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Policies and Procedures (n = 4)</td>
<td>4.03*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(α = .78)</td>
<td>3.78*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Personnel (n = 5)</td>
<td>4.03*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(α = .80)</td>
<td>3.68*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Problem Solving (n = 5)</td>
<td>4.38**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(α = .84)</td>
<td>3.92*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*p < .05  
**p < .052

*a* Number of items in each scale  
*b* Reliability coefficient Alpha

**Discussion**

The most interesting finding of this study is that linear differences in terms of the perception of actual organizational properties and the importance of central properties of human service organizations exist among organizational hierarchies. The higher the rank, the more positive are some basic organizational properties perceived and the more important are organizational properties regarded. Gender had no effect. Assuming that the organizational properties studied were well known to the
employees, the differences we found may reflect different expectations regarding organizational properties, or an inherent distortion of organizational reality linked to organizational hierarchical position. The design of this study does not enable answering the interesting question of who is right, who distorts the truth. Is it the managers, supervisors or line workers? However, the implications raised by these questions will be considered here.

As for actual organizational properties, we found significant differences on two out of seven organizational properties, and one result approaching significance. In all three cases the managers had the highest mean scores, and line workers the lowest; supervisors were between. Two explanations are in order for these results. The first is that they reflect the true state of the organizations, as perceived by workers in different positions of the organizational hierarchy. This is a logical explanation since managers, supervisors, and line workers draw information about their organization from different sources. Accordingly we can expect results that reflect the true state of the organization as perceived by employees with different positions in the authority structure and thus having different sources of information on organizational properties.

However, the fact that we dealt with simple, well-known properties to all members of the organization, and that we found consistent results, meaning that managers hold more positive views about organizational properties than line workers are interesting, and calls for another explanation. Moreover, the fact that consistent differences regarding the importance of organizational properties were found among the three hierarchical levels would suggest that there are differences of opinion among them. This strengthens the expectation of finding differences of opinions regarding the state of actual properties as well. The second possibility therefore is that organizational positions and roles determine to some extent perception of reality. The latter seem to us to be the more plausible case. This line of reasoning is consequently the one that we will follow.

Conflict theory proposes that organizations are in constant conflict (Hall, 1991). Organizational lives call for competition for professional and promotional reasons. A gap between workers and administrators is to be expected; and too often a "we-they" stance is adopted by direct line workers and administrators
Organizational Properties (Weissman, Epstein, & Savage, 1983), these attitudes may shape reactions of employees toward their organization. Moreover, the expectations employees have of others in the organization are partly explicable in terms of the organizational position that they hold (Kahn, Wolf, Quinn, & Snoek, 1964). We can thus assume that the higher the rank of an employee, the greater will be the satisfaction and the more positive the perceptions about the state of the organization.

Drawing from another, but related field of study, a positive relationship was found between job satisfaction and hierarchical organizational level, the higher the position on the hierarchy, the higher the job satisfaction (Carlopio & Gardner, 1995). This satisfaction is probably related to the characteristics of the job, which are more demanding from lower hierarchical employees (Carlopio & Gardner, 1995). On this ground, we can expect differences of opinion regarding organizational characteristics as well. However, we assume that workers' attitudes are being shaped by a broader array than the organization. They are influenced by cultural and professional expectations regarding what should be the level of accepted organizational characteristics, and thus can be regarded as “objective,” once judging the organization.

The lower mean scores of line workers on the importance of organizational properties are probably related to a lack of appreciation for the organizational and administrative parts of the organization (Weissman, Epstein, & Savage, 1983). Such an explanation is supported by the tendency of professionals to emphasize the importance of professional activities (i.e., treatment) over organizational ones (Maluccio, 1979). The managers' attention and responsibility lies within the administrative sphere. We may expect them to be much more oriented toward the importance of organizational properties to organizational survival than the line workers.

The results show that line workers tend to hold fewer positive perceptions regarding the organization. Since people tend to share their judgements with peers, and they receive feedback that shape their believes (Ferris & Kacmar, 1992; Wittenbaum & Stasser, 1995), it is reasonable to assume that line workers influence each other (Wilder, 1990). This would be the case as well with managers, who tend to stick with their reference group
Such a behavior may lead employees at all levels to make decisions based on incorrect perceptions of other workers, which might have harmful results. Moreover, role theory predicts that people's behavior is determined in part by the expectations of certain significant others in related positions (Kahn, Wolf, Quinn, & Snoek, 1964). If this is true, then prior expectations play an important role in the attribution process (Wittenbaum & Stasser, 1995), and organizational properties are interpreted accordingly.

Another probable explanation in this regard relates to position and responsibility. Managers reflect the highest position in the organizations we have studied, and they therefore maintain the highest responsibility for their functioning. On the other hand, the lower one's rank, the less responsible one can feel and the more critical one can be. This line of reasoning is supported by the finding that self-serving attributes arise from the need of people to maintain and defend a positive self-image (Brown & Rogers, 1991; Wiley & Crittenden, 1992). Moreover, we found that the higher the rank the higher the tenure and years of education. This may lead to justification and rationalization based on past decisions and behaviors (Van Dyne, Graham, & Dienesch, 1994).

We argue that perception of the organization relates to the commitment one has toward the organization. It will be heightened by positive perceptions and vice versa (Marsden, Kalleberg & Cook, 1993). However, the negative side effect of holding more positive, and probably unreal perceptions regarding some basic organizational properties might lead toward improper decision making.

The higher mean scores for the attributions made by the managers would suggest these to be defensive attributions ("a desire on the part of the perceivers to make whatever attributions will best reduce the threat posed by the situation." Shaver, 1975, p. 55). This being the case, the higher mean scores can be explained by the threat felt by managers in accepting the organizational situation in real terms, since they bear the greater responsibility for its functioning. Moreover, as indicated by Van Dyne, Graham and Dienesch (1994), we may expect higher level employees to have affective attachment to the organization and thus "go the extra mile" in describing its' properties. On the other hand, the
lower mean scores of line workers may reflect their disagreement with some organizational properties.

The supervisors' results are interesting. Supervisors usually find themselves caught between their position as administrators and their role as educators and supporters; the later role includes their relationship with their supervisee in this case the line workers (Kadushin, 1976; Middelman & Rhodes, 1985). If our reasoning is correct, then the attributions made by supervisors are again indicative of people interpreting and shaping their organizational attributions according to their position and the expectations of their peer groups.

Gender differences are probably quite modest and shaped by the kind of jobs they hold, this is probably why we found no significant gender difference. Thus attachment to the organization has little to do with gender than with attributes of position (Marsden, Kalleberg & Cook, 1993).

The limitations of the study derive from the fact that we studied only human service organization, so generalizations can be made concerning this sector alone. Though we have dealt with a broad array of organizational properties, we have not considered many others. Future research should use instruments that can determine whether our findings are valid for other types of organizations and for other organizational properties as well. More independent variables, such as the size of the organization, should be used. It is possible that more variables contribute to the relationships we have found, and these should be explored. An intriguing possibility is to examine these relationships by studying one organization at a time as the unit of analysis. Such an approach would strengthen the results and might sharpen them as well. We need also ask how conscious managers and supervisors are of the perceptions of the line workers and vice versa; and what are the most effective ways of dealing with these gaps of perceptions?

Some preliminary suggestions may be derived from these findings. All employees, whatever their rank, should learn that their perceptions of organizational properties are influenced, to some extent, by their position in the organization. Assuming that perceptions influence behavior, discussions should be held between managers, supervisors, and line workers regarding their
perceptions of organizational properties to clarify expectations or misconceptions. This should lead toward the study of the organization in valid ways to analyze the situation, clarify misconceptions and finding the proper ways to improve the problematic organizational properties. Being part of the organization milieu, all employees—despite their organizational position, should be more open to criticism. They should be ready to face the fact organizational reality is probably not as they expect it is; other workers may have different views, and their perceptions are important for the survival and efficiency of the organization. This means that employees must find ways to discover the true state of the organization, and be receptive to ideas and points of view from people in other ranks performing functions different from their own.

References


Organizational Properties


Planning for Community Crisis:  
A Marketing Approach

AMNON BOEHM  
University of Haifa  
School of Social Work

The article is based on an examination of a nominal group procedure of two welfare agencies located on the confrontation line between Lebanon and Israel, which implemented a marketing approach in planning intervention for the population for times of community crisis. The agencies are located at a place that was attacked and suffered personal and property loss particularly by short range missiles.

In the nominal group procedure, five elements of the marketing approach (target market, service mix, place and distribution, price, and promotion) were implemented, for four phases of community crisis (warning, shock, organizing, and changing). The results show that the implementation of the marketing approach demands different marketing patterns for each phase of the community crisis. These patterns, based on previous experience of the agencies, are described and discussed.

Events and situations defined as community crisis, particularly in situations of real threat to life, require intensive efforts and unique responses by individuals, groups, and organizations usually at short notice, to cope with the new situation (Granot, 1994). Frequently, however, people respond passively or over-reactively, ways that are unsuitable and ineffective for managing the crisis (Mery, 1990). Most literature on this theme indicates that the critical elements and phases of crisis can be predicted in advance, so early planning and preparations may be helpful to improve the responses of individuals, groups and organizations at such times (Dash, 1997; Lang & Lang, 1976). The study reported here examined the potential of the marketing approach as containing key elements suitable as a planning and managing tool of welfare agencies for developing and supplying services to the population at times of community crisis.
Marketing is a process of planning and executing a set of activities aimed at facilitating and expanding exchange between the organization and its public. From this general point of view, marketing represents a synthesis of ideas and writings of many individuals. While these authors do not always agree, common elements nevertheless run through their writings. The essential elements of marketing are familiar as the four p's: product mix (or service mix); pricing; place and distribution; and promotion (mass and direct communication). The basis for planning these four elements, according to the marketing approach, is the target market and market segmentation (Dibb et al., 1996; Kotler & Roberto, 1989).

In this context, the marketing approach offers a comprehensive strategic framework to cover many aspects of community crisis, as well as the strengths and weaknesses of the agency. Studies on community crisis suggest the implementation of the marketing elements in planning intervention. For example, they call for identification and better understanding of the needs of the various segments of the target market in times of crisis; adaptation and development of the service mix—ideas, practices, and tangible products—for the target market; to understand and develop more effective vertical and horizontal distribution systems for supplying the service mix; and construction of an optimal mix of direct and indirect communication, and in so doing to better promote the service mix for the populations in need (Dash, 1997; Granot, 1994; Labardi, 1997; Lahad & Ayalon, 1995).

The Marketing Elements

The description of the critical elements in the marketing approach highlights their application to the human services.

Target Market and Market Segmentation

To operationalize the notion that the key to achieving organizational goals lies in determining the needs and wants of the target market (Hannagn, 1992), implementation of the marketing approach begins with segmentation. This means that the target market of an organization is divided into subgroups so that each group, or segment, responds relatively differently to the provided service.
By segmenting the target market, the organization can develop specific services tailored to the needs of different segments, thus better satisfying them (Crompton & Lamb, 1986). Many descriptors can be used to segment a heterogeneous population into relatively homogeneous segments. However, three major categories distinguish the needs of the target market more than others: geographic, demographic, and behavioral.

Market segmentation leads to three critical strategies: first, an undifferentiated strategy in which a single service is offered to the entire community, where the assumption is that most of the population will respond similarly to the service; second, a differentiated strategy in which several segments are identified and a range of services are developed, each tailored to a particular segment; and third, a concentrated strategy in which efforts are focused on only one or two segments.

Note also that the customers who benefit directly from the service are not the only target markets of an agency. Lauffer (1994) suggests the term “publics,” as the fifth “p,” to describe stakeholders—individuals, groups, and organizations on which an agency is dependent or with which it is interdependent, such as resource suppliers and volunteers.

The Product/Service Mix

A product, or service in human service organizations, is everything that the target market receives in exchange. The service mix is a composite selection of ideas, social practices, and tangibles that an organization makes available to its target market (Kotler & Roberto, 1989). Ideas may take the form of beliefs (perceptions held about factual matters), attitudes (positive or negative evaluations of people, objects, or events), or values (overall ideas of what is right or wrong). Social practices refer to single acts or the establishment of an altered pattern of behavior. Tangible objects are physical products that may accompany ideas and practices, but do not usually constitute the principal product in human service organizations.

Place and Distribution

Place and distribution divisions are aimed at the provision of information and convenient services to the target market at
a reasonable cost (Dearling et al., 1995). The key decisions an organization makes in this regard are the selection of vertical and horizontal distribution channels. A vertical channel is the route through which a service passes from manufacture to consumption. It may comprise several units that participate in and control the provision of the service, for example, states → counties → cities → neighborhoods → customers. Vertical distribution is generally described according to channel length—short, intermediate or long—depending on the number of units in the channel design.

A horizontal channel refers to a direct or an outreach provision of services. Direct provision of services is when the customer is expected to reach the organization, which, in turn assumes comprehensive responsibility for planning, organizing, and distributing. Outreach provision is when the organization reaches out and assists through personal contacts with those citizens who have difficulties, or are unaware of or unreceptive to the program (Crompton & Lamb, 1986).

An additional decision is the intensity of distribution, namely the degree of market coverage which the producer deems necessary to successfully serve the population. There are three common levels of intensity. The first is intensive distribution, when the organization is asked to represent the service with many units available to the customer. The idea is that the program should be readily accessible to the customer. The second level is selective distribution. Here the organization uses more than one unit, but the customer is expected to travel some distance. Thus, the organization tries to achieve efficiency in market coverage as well as control of the service. The third level is exclusive distribution, when only one unit has the right to provide the service in the target market area. Exclusive distribution allows maximum control and saving of resources (Sheaff, 1991). Finally, distribution also encompasses the question of scheduling—the best time, the duration, and the frequency at which the service will be provided.

**Pricing**

Price is defined as the value placed on what is exchanged between the supplier of a service and the target market (Dibb et al., 1996). The price may be paid by the direct users; however, in human services it is oftentimes paid by other stakeholders.
The process of pricing a service begins with calculating its costs. Costing a facility-based service (with the focus on location and equipment) is usually approached differently from costing peripatetic staff (with the focus on profession, grade, and staff hours) (Kelly & Bebbington, 1993). After calculating the total and unit costs, the agency must choose a method to determine the price—the measure of recovering the cost, by institutions or individuals, outside the department. There are several critical methods: (1) Break-even analysis is undertaken to determine the point at which the agency’s revenues equal its total fixed and variable costs. (Variable costs vary with outcome and disappear the moment that ceases, whereas fixed costs arise no matter how many outcomes are produced.) (2) Variable-cost analysis is a method whereby the cost to be recovered is fixed on the basis of variable costs only. (3) Marginal-cost analysis calculates the revenue sufficient to cover the addition to total cost resulting from the last unit of output. (4) The no-cost approach holds that all the costs (fixed and variable) are covered by the agency itself.

Promotion Mix

Using personal and mass communication, promotion enables the service to inform the target market about the service features, to create awareness of the service, and to establish, reinforce, or change attitudes and behaviors towards the service (Palmer, 1995). The promotion activity, or the “promotion mix,” has four components: (1) Personal selling is a form of communication based on face-to-face contact and characterized by mutual communication, immediate feedback, and use of both verbal and non-verbal communication. (2) Advertising is an activity which is directed to passing messages via the media (TV; radio, newspapers, periodicals, billboards, and direct mailing). The source of the advertising is the agency, not the media, which also bears responsibility for the message. The advertising is directed to a wide and heterogeneous audience, and usually the cost is high. (3) Public relations consists of a set of communication activities such as assemblies, press conferences, exhibitions, and lectures aimed at improving the image of the agency, the service, or the staff. Public relations activities also utilize the media, but by inserting the message of the service into ongoing productions, the
news, or other reports. In this case, the cost and the responsibility for the message are assumed by the media. (4) Sales promotion refers to direct inducements that offer extra value to encourage participation in a given service. Incentives are offered to target markets which are otherwise insufficiently motivated or indifferent to that particular service.

The Life Cycle of Community Crisis and the Rationale of the Study

In their attempts to put some order and meaning into the ambiguous complex of events, actions, feelings, and responses that characterize community crises, researchers have broken down the history of the crisis into sequential phases (American Red Cross, 1993; Dodds & Nuering, 1996; Masson, 1975; Merry, 1990; Omer & Nahaman, 1994; Reznick, 1989). The marketing approach, therefore, cannot be implemented for community crisis as one continuous sequence. The phases of the sequence must be understood and consider. Although the sequence may be represented with different emphases, usually it includes four critical phases: warning, shock, organizing, and changing.

Warning takes place before the concrete danger erupts, namely signs that something may happen. Even though the population gets feedback that danger is ahead, many people tend not to hear, not to see, and not to speak. A common response to warning is disbelief. While some correctly interpret and understand the new situation, it is very common to behave routinely. Disagreement is common within the leadership, which is usually not prepared for the new stage. Economic activity continues as usual, the situation being treated as a temporary change.

Shock (or impact stage) occurs with the eruption of the event itself. Many people may be in a state of anxiety and panic. Individuals and organizations are threatened by the new reality and call for clear directions to act. Although some people react constructively with responsiveness and coping, others withdraw, attempt to escape, and experience a loss of meaning. During this phase, the leadership and management of organizations concentrate their efforts on the disaster, but it is difficult to react efficiently when the system is operating under such uncertain conditions.
Organizing begins when the “storm” of the attack is either finished or still in progress. With the perception and understanding of the danger, people invest efforts to prevent further deterioration and to get the situation under control. In their attempts to assess what has happened and “to make some sense of it,” as a result of the destruction and loss people typically experience feelings of anger, blame, sorrow, grief, mourning, helplessness, and depression. Nevertheless, they try to act together supportively to find solutions. Commonly they seek both external and internal resources, such as experts and leaders, to cope with the mental and material damage.

Changing (rebuilding) takes place after the constant threat of danger and the impact of the experience have passed, even though new dangers may lurk. While certain groups, like those who have lost family members, have to cope with ongoing crisis, people generally become more optimistic, and their sense of safety and meaning is restored. In contrast to the focus in the organizing phase on preventing further deterioration and controlling over the situation, the changing phase is directed towards renewal and creation of a new life course.

Several common characteristics apparently make a difference in the phases of community crisis, such as responses of the population, relationships among members of the community, policies of the leadership, and plans to cope with the conditions. We also see, as was described in the review of the marketing approach, that each element of marketing (target market, service, place and distribution, pricing, and promotion) includes a choice among several categories in the planning process. For example, segmentation of the target market may be identified by geographic, demographic, or behavioral descriptors. Likewise, promotion may be adjusted by a different mix of selling, advertising, public relations, and sales promotion. This study attempts to explore how to manage the best fit of the elements of marketing for times of community crisis. More specifically, the study questions are:

(1) Does the planning of the intervention by welfare agencies for community crisis, in relation to the marketing approach, require one uniform generalized marketing strategy for all the crisis phases, or does it require different marketing strategies for different phases? In other words, are the categories of each marketing
element chosen by the agencies identical or different with regard to the different phases of the community crisis? (2) What is the best-fitting marketing strategy or strategies for intervention at times of community crisis? (3) What is the explanation for this fit?

Method

This study, based on controlled registration of decisions and non-participant observations of nominal groups, investigated a pilot project that implemented the marketing approach in planning intervention by two welfare agencies at times of community crisis. The pilot project was initiated by the management of the welfare administration in the north of Israel, aimed to cope with the personal and social results of attacks of short-range missile and incursions Lebanon to Israel. The criterion for the selection of four agencies for the pilot project (two that were investigated and two others) was the workers’ experience with previous attacks and their prior training in crisis intervention. The area of the agencies has sustained missile attacks, some of which resulted in death and injury.

The study included three groups. Two groups consisted of all the workers in two welfare agencies of local councils at the confrontation line in the north of Israel. One of these agencies was in a rural area (18 workers) and one in an urban area (21 workers). On the border, there were nine welfare agencies in the rural area and three in the urban area. The third group included eight supervisors from the welfare administration who work at the regional district level and were assigned by the welfare administration to support the welfare agencies in community crisis intervention.

The majority of the workers (N = 47) were female (38–81%). All of them had academic training in social work education, and the majority had completed courses in crisis intervention (42–89%). Work experience was distributed over a large number of years (1–25), and the majority had experienced at least one prior professional intervention in community crisis (32–68%).

The project included a series of seven meetings, one every two weeks. The first two meetings were dedicated to presentation and discussion of the marketing strategy, emphasizing
implementation by the welfare agency, as well as the model of the four stages of community crisis. Each of the following five meetings was devoted to one of the five elements of the marketing approach (target market and segmentation, service mix, place and distribution, pricing, and promotion) in planning intervention by the welfare agency for times of community crisis. To enrich the discussions, the members of all three groups preferred to be mixed together.

According to nominal group procedure, which encourages active participation of all the members and allows the free raising of ideas (York & Adar, 1988), these five meetings included the following steps: (1) Presentation and explanation of the marketing element. After the categories of the element were discussed, they were written on a board. (2) Individual choices by the workers out of the categories (of the marketing element) according to best fit with the four phases of community crisis. The workers were also asked to write short explanations for their choices. (3) Division into groups (six groups of seven or eight members) and collection of the individual choices and explanations. All choices and explanations were written and displayed on large sheets of paper. (4) A short and focused discussion to support or oppose the choices and explanations of the workers. At the end of the discussion, which was managed by the leaders of the groups, the workers were asked to suggest categories or a mix of categories for each phase of community crisis. (5) Selection of priorities by each group out of the workers' suggestions. The groups' decisions were written and displayed on a large sheet of paper. (6) General conclusion, with all participants: (a) The groups' decisions were displayed on a large sheet of paper. (b) A short and focused discussion was conducted to support or oppose the choices. (c) Decision was made by the workers to select the preferred priority. The number of votes in each marketing category for each phase of crisis was registered. The categories that got the majority of votes were marked.

To describe and analyze the data, the percentage of workers who supported the selected marketing categories for each phase of the community crisis was calculated. The percentage was based on the registration in step 6 of the nominal group procedure. The percentages reflect the results of each category
as one block of priority. The results at step 6, as mentioned, relate to the chosen blocks of priorities that were consolidated previous stages. Almost all the workers took part in the nominal group procedure, probably on account of a specific instruction by the welfare administration that they do so, and the fact that it took place during working hours.

Registration as part of content analysis is often criticized, as it is not specifically relevant to the objectives of the study. In this pilot study, however, registration was intended to supply appropriate information for the purpose of the study. In addition, in order to expand knowledge about the workers' responses, non-participant observation by three observers, who were specially trained for the task, was arranged. The observers were present throughout the project, namely, at all meetings with the participants, and they circulated among the small group discussions. The observers were asked to focus on three aspects: (1) Workers' responses supporting or opposing each category of the marketing element discussed. (2) Workers' responses supporting and opposing to the fitness of each category in planning for times of community crisis; (3) Workers' explanations for their attitudes and choices.

Results

The results refer to the categories of each of the five marketing elements as chosen by the agencies (all participants at step 6 of the nominal group procedure), with regard to the four phases of community crisis. Workers' explanations for their choices are described as well.

Target Market and Market Segmentation—Implementation in Community Crisis

In the discussions of this element in the nominal group, the workers added a descriptor, "groups in danger", as a category of segmentation (as noted above, there are three common descriptors: geographic, demographic, and behavioral). As Table 1 shows in the warning phase the descriptor "groups in danger" was found to be the first priority. The workers explained that before the attack erupts, they have to make preparations for their regular client groups such as the elderly and single parents. However,
Table 1

Agencies' Choices in Implementing the Target-Market Element in Planning Their Intervention (N = 43)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Crisis phase: Category</th>
<th>Warning</th>
<th>Shock</th>
<th>Organizing</th>
<th>Changing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Geographic (88.37%)</td>
<td>2. Groups in danger (86.05%)</td>
<td>2. Groups in danger (93.02%)</td>
<td>2. Groups in danger (90.70%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy of Segmentation</td>
<td>Differentiated</td>
<td>1. Concentrated</td>
<td>1. Differentiated</td>
<td>Differentiated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(86.05%)</td>
<td>2. Differentiated (81.39%)</td>
<td>2. Concentrated (86.04%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Specialists</td>
<td>2. Volunteers</td>
<td>2. Specialists</td>
<td>2. Sources suppliers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Executives</td>
<td>5. Resources suppliers</td>
<td>5. Political supporters</td>
<td>5. Volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(88.37%)</td>
<td>(81.40%)</td>
<td>(86.05%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
because at crisis times their responsibility is to the whole community (in contrast to routine times), they chose the differentiated strategy (rather than the concentrated one).

When the attack erupts, in the shock phase, they chose the geographic descriptor and the concentrated strategy as the first priority. Now, the workers explained, they have to provide intensive support for the people at the heart of the danger in the attacked areas. A similar rationale guided the workers in the organizing phase, when the geographic descriptor was also given first priority. However, at this phase, they again preferred the differentiation strategy, keeping the concentration strategy only as the second priority. As more time passes following the attack, the workers' responsibility incrementally returns back to the whole community. In the changing phase too they chose the differentiation strategy, but now with the demographic descriptor as the first preference. In this phase, the geographic descriptor loses its importance, and the community becomes more identified with specific functions, particularly in accordance with age groups. In all the phases, the behavioral descriptor and the undifferentiated strategy were not chosen.

Several differences were found with regard to the publics of the agencies. True, the clients received priority in all phases, but the priority of other publics changed according to the phase. The contribution of specialists was found to be more important in the warning and the organizing phases. Although the workers had previous experience, they explained that they needed unique intervention tools for times of crisis. In the shock phase too, specialists received high priority, but expectations of an overloaded need for intervention led first to the recruitment of volunteers. (The workers added that although in this phase the necessity for volunteers is higher than in all the other phases, it is usually easier to recruit all the required volunteers.) The role of resource suppliers and executives became more important in the changing phase, when rebuilding required more material resources and coordination efforts. Political supporters not found to be the primary preference at any phase, but they were more in demand when the workers were free of the direct overloaded intervention in the warning and changing phases. Here, they needed more moral and social support, as the resources
that have to be invested in their interventions may be more questionable.

Service Mix—Implementation in Community Crisis

Table 2 shows that in the warning phase, the agencies' first preference was ideas (e.g., expression of feelings and thoughts, easy flow of information, and legitimization of fear). The workers explained that although several practices were unnecessary, many ideas must be absorbed at this phase as preparation for subsequent phases.

In all the subsequent phases—shock, organizing, and changing—practices were found to be the first priority since consequent to workers' intervention the population is expected to take immediate action (e.g., playing, group conversation, management activities). Several workers said that tangibles (e.g., games, crisis equipment) were not the business of welfare agencies; nevertheless, the general view was to relate tangibles to ideas and practices in all the phases.

Place and Distribution—Implementation in Community Crisis

Table 3 shows that with regard to the vertical distribution the agencies chose a long channel for the warning and the changing phases (long channel includes all the levels—state, county, city, neighborhood, and client). In these phases, the workers emphasized the necessity involvement by the state and the regional district in policy making, including delineating goals, tasks, and functions for crisis intervention.

Table 2

| Agencies' Choices in Implementing the Service-Mix Element in Planning Their Intervention (N = 45) |
|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| Crisis phase:                                   | Warning                                         | Shock                                           | Organizing                                      | Changing                                        |
| (88.89%)                                        | (80.00%)                                        | (66.67%)                                        |                                                | (91.11%)                                        |
Table 3

_Agencies' Choices in Implementing the Place and Distribution Element in Planning Their Intervention (n = 44)_

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Crisis phase:</th>
<th>Warning</th>
<th>Shock</th>
<th>Organizing</th>
<th>Changing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>distribution</td>
<td>Long channel</td>
<td>Short channel</td>
<td>Intermediate channel</td>
<td>Long channel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(81.82%)</td>
<td>(88.64%)</td>
<td>(88.64%)</td>
<td>(84.10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>(90.90%)</td>
<td>(95.45%)</td>
<td>(93.18%)</td>
<td>(90.90%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intensity of</td>
<td>Exclusive</td>
<td>Intensive</td>
<td>Selective</td>
<td>Exclusive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>(88.64%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>(75.00%)</td>
<td>(95.45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule</td>
<td>Regular+</td>
<td>Shifts</td>
<td>Regular+</td>
<td>Regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emergency</td>
<td>24 hours</td>
<td>emergency</td>
<td>(79.55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(93.18%)</td>
<td>(93.18%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The agencies chose a short channel for the shock phase and an intermediate channel for the organizing phase (intermediate channel includes city, neighborhood, and client; short channel includes only neighborhood and client). Such choices reflect motivation to be more efficient in supplying immediate answers to the clients and the need for accessibility and availability in these phases.

These factors were also critical in motivating the agencies in other choices—of horizontal distribution, intensity of distribution and schedule—in the shock and the organizing phases. They chose outreach service (for both phases), intensive service (for the shock phase), selective service (for the organizing phase) and schedule of shifts (for the shock phase), or regular and emergency service (for the organizing phase). The workers called for making the service suitable, expedient, immediate, utilitarian, and easy for the clients, thereby empowering the neighborhood units in particular.

In the warning and the changing phases, the choices were different: direct and exclusive service (for both phases), and regular
and emergency service (for the warning phase) or regular and emergency service (for the changing phase). These choices were influenced by the goal of centralization in order to exchange knowledge, to pool efforts for collaborative planning, and to coordinate more easily with resource suppliers and executives in other units at the local government level and in relevant external systems.

Pricing—Implementation in Community Crisis

Table 4 shows that the agencies found the facility-based method for pricing to be suitable in all the phases. All the phases, in different measure, demanded expenditures for the central structure of the organization. The agencies added the peripatetic methods at both the shock and the organizing phases in order to calculate the distribution channels at these phases that demand mobility.

We also see that in the warning phase, variable-cost analysis was chosen as the method to determine the price. Except for several minimal expenditures, the agencies continued to base price on the regular costing, and this method helps to mark the difference between routine costs and the direct expenses for community crisis intervention. Several workers considered using the marginal-cost method, but because this necessitates calculation of

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agencies' Choices in Implementating the Pricing Element in Planning Their Intervention (N = 43)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Crisis phase:</strong> Warning  Shock  Organizing  Changing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category</strong>                  Facility-based  Facility-based  Facility-based  Facility-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facility-based versus        (90.70%)  (76.74%)  (81.41%)  (88.37%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peripatetic Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calculate Recovery of the cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable-cost                (69.80%)  (93.02%)  (95.35%)  (93.02%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the addition to total cost resulting from the last unit of output, they found it too complex. In all the other crisis phases—shock, organizing, and changing, the agencies chose the break-even method. This was found to be suitable and fair in recovering the agency's expenditures. It was also found to be a useful tool in proving the agency's investment in negotiations with external institutions.

Promotion Mix—Implementation in Community Crisis

Table 5 shows that in the warning and the changing phases, advertising was chosen as the principal tool of promotion, and selling was chosen in the shock and the organizing phases. The main reason for these choices was also the linkage to the distribution approach. For a long channel and direct (and central) service in the warning and the changing phases, mass communication was found to be more important. For short or intermediate channels and reaching out in the shock and the organizing phases, direct communication was deemed more efficient.

In the shock and the organizing phases, public relations was preferred over advertising since the media are more available at such times to cover crisis issues. Finally, since the warning phase is characterized by the need to motivate the target market to act, it is the only phase where selling promotion, which includes incentives, was found to be an effective tool.

Discussion and Conclusions

In the last twenty years, the marketing approach has been examined and implemented intensively in human service

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agencies' Choices in Implementing the Promotion Element in Planning Their Intervention (N = 44)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crisis Phase:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Public relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(93.18%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
organizations (Keye, 1994; Lauffer, 1984). No attention has been paid, however, to the implementation of the marketing approach in planning intervention by human service organizations for times of community crisis. The information presented in this article, based on the experience of welfare agencies in Israel, described and explained how the marketing approach can be implemented in the four common phases of community crisis—warning, shock, organizing, and changing, with adjustment for changing and specific needs of the target market. The marketing approach was shown to offer a way of making the job of the welfare agency in times of community crisis clearer and more legitimate. The marketing approach also was shown as a way to negotiate better with the relevant institutions in order to obtain the necessary resources.

The findings support the general approach on which the study was based. Planning intervention for times of community crisis, with linkage to the five elements of the marketing approach (target market and segmentation, service mix, place and distribution, pricing, and promotion), requires various adjustments for the different phases of the community crisis sequence listed above. As revealed by the experience of the workers in the welfare agencies, the differences can be explained by the varying conditions that characterize each phase of the community crisis. For example, differences in the measure of danger and feelings of people—at different phases—lead to different marketing strategies with regard to the target market, length of distribution, and method of communication.

The findings also indicate that with regard to several categories of the marketing approach, similar adjustments are required for the shock and the organizing phases, and other similar adjustments for the warning and the changing phases. This similarity may be explained by the feeling of immediate danger in the shock and the organizing phases, and the relative distance in the warning and the changing phases. However, even in these phases, as the findings show, several nuances of adjustment are needed.

As noted earlier, although the literature commonly emphasizes the different conditions at different phases of community crisis, several previous studies on planning intervention did not consider the distinct characteristics of each phase of the
community crisis sequence. The findings of this study indicate that failure to respond differentially to each phase may lead to widespread dissatisfaction and lack of fitness of the potential contribution of the welfare agencies to its environment. In some cases, the demands of the various phases may be widely different or even conflict. For example, the demand for distribution in the warning and the changing phases is exclusive, and in the shock and the organizing phases it is intensive. For planning to be effective, it is essential to think in terms of differences rather than similarities, and to make distinctions rather than standardize.

In this context, two possible mistakes may be made. The first is the attempt to gear the entire marketing strategy to the needs of one phase (such as the current phase or whatever is considered to be the important phase), at the price of ignoring the other phases. The second is the attempt to choose a marketing strategy that assumes a common denominator among all the phases. In fact, phases may have very little in common and the strategy may not suit to any of them. The cardinal reason for the interest in a distinctive approach among welfare agencies is their responsibility to provide comprehensive and effective service in all the phases of a community crisis.

Criticism for this distinctive approach may raise claims of cost. However, it may be more expensive to make the adjustments at the time of the crisis, or even impossible, not only because the agency may not find the time to plan, but because in times of crisis the system tends to lose flexibility. By planning a distinctive approach, with a pre-planned marketing mix fitted to each phase of the crisis, agencies can better facilitate proactive responses to specific expected situations of the crisis, and may even be able to influence the specific outcome of the crisis.

Further criticism may concern the possibility of generalizing the model. Therefore, it is important to note the following points: (1) It is not necessary that the crisis will always develop in the same sequence. For example, the community may skip the warning phase and go immediately into the shock phase. (2) The length of the phases may differ from crisis to crisis. Sometimes it is even difficult to know in what phase the crisis is in at a given point in time. (3) The characteristics of the phases may be somewhat different according to different crises and different communities.
Although the workers' explanations for the adjustment of the marketing approach were usually general with regard to the usual phases of community crisis, and conclusions may therefore be extended to other situations, further research with other groups may be warranted to replicate the results in: (1) other areas with expected community crisis; (2) other types of crisis, such as ecological damage, earthquake, or flood; (3) other groups of human service organizations, such as education, health, and mental health agencies; (4) joint intervention of several human service organizations.

References

American Red Cross (1993). *Disaster services regulations and procedures*, ARC 3077 1A.


Emotional and Embodied Knowledge: Implications for Critical Practice

COLIN PEILE
The University of Queensland
Department of Social Work and Social Policy

Within the practice orientation of the Critical Social Work tradition there has been a dominance of conceptual and rational processes. This has lead to a failure to acknowledge the importance of bodily and emotive knowledge for practice theory. This paper offers a rudimentary and tentative epistemology which recognizes the importance of the body, emotions, ideas and their context. These ideas invite a reconsideration of critical theories of change.

This paper explores the problems that emerge for social work practice because of the neglect of bodily and emotional knowledge (with a particular focus on critical theory) and provides a tentative theory of how bodily and emotional knowledge can be understood in relation to conceptual knowledge. This will provide a possible direction for reformulating critical theory and critical approaches to social work practice. To begin it is necessary to first explore the place of rational knowledge.

It is a common view that to achieve enlightenment requires rationality and as a consequence the subjugation of our bodies and emotions which are associated with irrationality and desire. Turner (1984) suggests this is in part a reflection of the western Christian tradition which sees the body as the location of corrupting appetite, of sinful desire and of private irrationality. The body needs to be controlled to maintain the social order. This is also consistent with the influence of Cartesian thought where it is the mind which defines humans as social beings (Shilling, 1993). In this context, knowledge is associated with ideas and thinking. We develop knowledge about bodies and emotions, they have no knowledge of their own. This paper will seek to demonstrate that the body and emotions are a way of knowing which need to be valued equally along side conceptual knowing.
Interestingly, the neglect of the body and emotions is not only epistemological. Turner (1984) and Shilling (1993) have both highlighted the neglect of the body in sociological theory. This is also the case in psychology (Golman, 1996) and so not surprisingly, the dominance of rationality is assumed in the social work literature with few exceptions (Kondrat, 1992). Critical social work practice is no exception (Healy, 1996).

**Critical Theory and Rationality**

Critical theory grew up within the enlightenment tradition which claimed a rational process of developing knowledge could enable us to gain control over our social and physical environment. This tradition grew in tandem with the rapid development of technology and capitalist societies and it gave rise to a class of experts that could guide industry and governments to further the goals of capitalism. In this context deterministic, biological views of the body and emotions dominated, encouraging an understanding that the body and emotions needed to be controlled to enable a civil society and efficient production. This control became the goal of the social sciences with positivist embracement of a detached objectivity the main epistemology (Fay, 1975; Ife, 1997).

The critical tradition positioned itself in opposition to the private ownership of capital and the domination of the wealthy. This domination was seen to lead the powerless to a false understanding of their own situation in which they conformed to the ideas of the ruling class. Enlightenment thinking however generated the notion that the oppressed by becoming rationally aware of their circumstances could break this false consciousness and then act to achieve the development of a non-oppressive society and process of government (Fay, 1987).

The critical tradition also challenged positivist epistemology. Marx and other critical theorists drew on Hegel’s concept of the dialectic. Hegel used this notion to understand the process of developing knowledge, describing a dialectical progression through four stages. He begins firstly with *sense certainty* which is a belief that we can know the world directly through our sense experience and that such experience offers an objective truth. This however, is challenged by the second stage of *perception* which highlights that
observation is actually language dependent and so perceptions do not arise from the object specifically but are universals which we bring to the experience. Perception however is also limited as all perceptions require a perception not only of the object but also of the opposite of the object, (that is, all the things it is not). This requires understanding the relationship between perceptions. The stage of understanding however also fails and leads to his final stage of self-consciousness. In self-consciousness we realize we are not separate from the object of our observation but are actively involved in manipulating and changing that object. That is, reality is a product of our actions and so can only be properly understood by recognizing, in a self-conscious way, our own part in this process of transformation (Hegel, 1910; Marcova, 1982). For Hegel the truth could only be uncovered through an active involvement in reality not from a detached objective position.

Marx adopted a similar position (Bologh, 1979) but in contrast to Hegel’s conservatism he saw the need for a revolutionary consciousness. This involved a recognition by the oppressed of the ways in which this oppression has occurred along with an understanding of how such oppression could be resisted. Knowledge only has validity by attempting to transform reality (Fay, 1975; Mao-tse-tung, 1967). This Hegelian/ Marxist epistemology is in stark contrast to the positivist underpinnings of capitalism but the dominance of rationality is still not challenged as the rational conceptual process of consciousness raising is a precondition for radical action to change society. Implied in this position is that bodies and emotions are socially constructed rather than biologically fixed, but nevertheless, rationality is still dominant and is still the vehicle for achieving change to our bodies and emotions.

The notion of dialectics allowed a social theory which made conflict, contradiction and transformation unavoidable aspects of social life. This gave impetus and legitimacy to the development of social movements and processes of social change. Broadly within the enactment of the critical tradition, two styles of practice can be identified and perhaps seen on a continuum. On one end we have a dogmatic approach which legitimated a vanguard acting on behalf of the oppressed group and which tried to educate or raise the consciousness of the oppressed in a didactic way. At the other end activists engaged in a process of
asking strategic or critical questions (Fook, 1993; Mullaly, 1993) to help an oppressed group recognize for themselves their own false consciousness and to formulate their own revolutionary consciousness. Armed with an analysis that their problems are not their fault it is assumed that this oppressed group will then be in a position to challenge their oppressors and to transform their reality (Fay, 1975, 1987; Fook, 1993; Mullaly, 1993). Freire calls this the process of conscientization (Freire, 1972). Critical social work in the main has been attracted to this second Freireian tradition (Leonard, 1984; Ife, 1997).

The critical objective of consciousness raising and conscious action assumes that knowledge resides in peoples' minds: an 'idealistic theory of behaviour which assumes that people's behavioural, perceptual, and emotive dispositions are solely the result of mental, essentially discursive processes' (Fay, 1987, p. 149). The extent of the domination of the rational is given a clear illustration in Ife's (1997) embracement of the image of critical social workers as 'street level intellectuals'. This rationality is not only a character of radical or critical practice however, it is in accord with most styles of social work practice (see Howe, 1987; Payne, 1991) which seek via a process of 'talk' to enable clients to gain new insights and understandings.

This intellectual elitism assumes there is a vacant territory that is waiting to be colonialised by rationality, but it will be argued here that the territory is full, and ready to sometimes resist and challenge rational forms of knowing. Fay (1987) points out that while the exploited may adopt a radical consciousness, their bodies may continue to behave in ways that reinforce their oppression. Our bodies have learnt to survive and move in the world in particular ways. A rational decision to behave differently does not mean our bodies will follow or that anyone else's body will follow.

Limits of Rationality

Critical theory over the last hundred years has waxed and waned in popularity principally in relation to the strength of conservative positions. Recently however challenges to critical theory have emerged from the non-conservative postmodern and
feminist postmodern directions. Postmodernism has challenged the very idea of rationality, the possibility of self conscious actors and the desirability of any positions claiming truth or universal applicability (Leonard, 1997; Peile, 1997). This has lead to what Grosz (1993) calls a 'crisis of reason' and to the disappearance of the epistemological certainty on which critical praxis has relied (Leonard, 1997). A consequence of this has been for the movement of many critical theorists to a more postmodern framework or for attempts to redevelop critical theory in relation to postmodern insights (Healy, 1996; Leonard, 1997). This epistemological uncertainty has opened up an interest in more marginal ways of knowing such as to do with feelings and intuition (Ife, 1997). In addition feminists have long challenged the dominance of positivist epistemologies, advocating a more open epistemology (Harding, 1986) and the relevance of bodily and emotional knowing (Jagger & Bordo, 1989; Grosz, 1993, 1995). Thus, both Postmodernism and Feminism have lifted up the importance of the body (and emotions) for social theory (Healy, 1996; Tayson, 1998; Tennant, 1998). While drawing inspiration from both traditions, my own theorizing does not neatly fit with either, as I have reservations about the way the body is treated in both. It needs to be acknowledged that both areas are experiencing rapid theoretical development with a huge variety of different positions within each, so I do not want to close off the potential for engagement with either in the future. However, in the context of this paper I think it will be useful to situate myself in relation to these traditions at least in a very general and crude way.

The postmodernists talk about the body as a site or text upon which various discourses are inscribed (Leonard, 1997). For some the body is pictured as 'docile', while for others as a potential site for resistance (Tayson, 1998), but in both cases the materiality of the body is neglected (Shilling, 1993). At best its fleshy reality is relativised as just one possible discourse about the body. Radical poststructural feminists recognize the body as a site for alternative knowledge building and action (Healy, 1996). They suggest male and female bodies have different capacities which arise from different lived experience but that these capacities are not just inscribed in our consciousness they are inscribed on the body (Healy, 1996). For postmodern feminists, knowledge can
not be disembodied but rather, 'the inclusion of embodied experience is argued to be central to, and indistinguishable from, the knowledge making process' (Tayson, 1998). Knowledge is thus relativised as a consequence of the different embodied experience of different people.

While the relativism of postmodernism and postmodern feminism provides a useful orientation from which to develop a critique, it is not very useful to the development of constructive actions (Peile, 1997) something that is essential to a constructive critical tradition. My own orientation has arisen more from the work of Fay (1987), Polanyi (1958, 1966) and Schon (1983) and has a more grand theorizing quality. I take seriously the criticisms of feminists and postmodernists about the totalitarian qualities of modernist grand narratives but suggest that the problem is not with their grand character but rather arises because of their determinist cosmology (Peile, 1994; Zimmerman 1989). The totalitarian quality comes from their belief in the very possibility of control (Bateson, 1972) based on a deterministic world view, not from their attempt to make sense of the whole. It is through attempting to make sense of the whole that one can gain a respect for the parts. The interdependence of things, which has similarities to the critical concept of over-determination and totality (Bologh, 1979; Resnick and Wolff, 1987) encourages motivation for constructive action, as people recognize 'we are all in this together'. The postmodern position however can tend to an ethical relativism which mitigates against action and in a sense adopts a new form of determinism 'discourse determinism'. I see both 'reality determinism' and 'discourse determinism' (Leonard, 1997, p. 11) as problematic. Attempting to make sense of the whole, without assuming certainty, I think is a better platform for social work practice.

Having situated myself in relation to Feminism and Postmodernism I want to now return to the neglect of the body and emotions and to explain something of what I mean by bodily and emotion knowledge before further theorising about them.

Body and Emotional Knowledge

Fay (1987) suggests there are real limits to the process of consciousness raising because of the privilege it affords rationality.
He points out that knowledge not only exists in our minds but is also enfolded in peoples' muscles and skeletons and the existence of this knowledge calls into question the privileged place given to conceptual knowledge. Much of our everyday life is reliant on this bodily knowledge. Some basic forms of knowledge are to do with movement: walking, running, jumping, standing and so on. Our knowledge of how to do these things is primarily unconscious and involves no rational thought, the knowledge is contained in our bodies. The body has its own form of knowing and can learn directly through 'bodily discourse: through images which tell us what clothes, body shape, facial expression, movements, and behaviour is required' (Bordo, 1989, p. 17).

Further, it becomes apparent that rational knowledge in some situations, is an inferior form of understanding. It has been estimated that a written manual sufficient to accurately describe all the muscular movements and choices necessary to ride a bicycle would be over a hundred pages long. However if a rider tried to consciously implement such rules the calculations would be too difficult and slow to avoid falling. Rationally, it is a very complex behaviour and yet our bodies can learn to ride without this conscious understanding. This body memory is clearly evident when contexts change and we continue to behave in the same way even though such behaviour is now unproductive or even dangerous such as when motoring in a country which drives on the opposite side of the road. Phobias and eating disorders provide other examples.

As Schon puts it 'it seems right to say that our knowing is in our actions' (1983, p. 49). Kondrat (1992) suggests that knowledge embodied in the act is the most readily useable practical knowledge. This 'knowing-in-action' as Schon (1983) describes it, refers to a skilful action which does not arise from an intellectual operation and may have been learnt without a conscious rational process. Polanyi (1966) adds to our appreciation of these issues through his notion of tacit knowledge: the knowledge which informs our actions and yet can not necessarily be consciously recalled. He demonstrates how all observation and so all science is dependent on this type of knowledge and so with it the personal elements that are enfolded in this subsiderary or tacit awareness.

For Jaggar (1989) reason is seen in opposition to emotion. Rea-
son has been over time associated with the male, while emotion is devalued in its connection with the female and with irrationality. Indeed, the enlightenment sought to replace emotion with reason. Jaggar seeks to reverse such valuations by recognizing the importance of emotion in the process of inquiry. Our emotions represent habituated responses to certain events that resonate with other similar experiences. They represent our emotional evaluations of different situations and so are essential to our processes of observation and understanding. We feel sad for others when they have suffered a loss; angry when we see others dominated or exploited. Such feelings can provoke us to action, to support or to challenge. This store of attitudes and evaluations forms our actions and can be seen as a store of knowledge. ‘Emotions prompt us to act appropriately, to approach some people and situations and to avoid others, to caress and cuddle, fight or flee’ (Jaggar, 1989, p. 155).

Healy (1996) gives attention to the gendered body knowledge in practice. She suggests that female workers tend to have a bodily knowledge in the form of unconscious communication processes which seek to minimise status differences and which emphasise their connectedness to the other. This knowledge is consistent with the egalitarian objectives of critical practice but at the same time made women vulnerable to questioning of their competence. She claims that activist literature has tended to assume the powerfulness of the worker but missed this more contradictory and complicated understanding of the power of female activists, an analysis made possible by attention to the bodily knowledges involved.

In social work, bodily and emotive knowing is sometimes implied in discussions of the nature of practice wisdom, however such wisdom is still generally spoken about in a conceptual way where it refers to: the accumulation of various pieces of information, assumptions and judgements (DeRoos, 1990); or implicit cognitive schemata (Scott, 1990). The rational is still privileged. The revalorizing of bodily and emotive knowledges will require a different perspective and new understandings. To begin to move in this direction we need to consider: the relationship of body and emotional knowledge to conceptual knowledge; their rela-
tionship to the context; and how both develop, that is the process of bodily and emotive learning. Each area will be looked at in turn.

Mind, Body and Emotion

In the forms of bodily knowledge already discussed cognition can have varying degrees of possible involvement. We can consciously decide to alter our habitual movements, for example to be patient with our children rather than to physically discipline them. While this is initially difficult, our bodies can gradually learn or accommodate this cognitive instruction. In this way the body is formed by the mind. Alternately, our bodies appear to learn directly without any conscious involvement. It is a debatable issue as to how much our bodies are preprogramed from conception, but it would seem evident that how we breathe, our physical characteristics, and our desires for food and physical comfort are built in. Given that all these things impact and constrain what and how we think, we can see that the body also forms the mind. It often appears that our emotions are a direct follow on from certain thoughts or actions. Yet at other points emotions seem to be the initiator of thoughts and actions. Depression will lead to negative thoughts and a passive slumped body. Anger and frustration can lead to the physical abuse of those in dependent relationships.

This suggests that the mind, body and emotion all inform each other in a mutual process. However, the relationship is more complicated than this. At one level mind, body and emotion are inseparably enfolded in each other, but at another level they can appear as separate realms which resist the influence of each other or alternately one can appear to dominate the others.

The inseparable connection—Cognitive knowledge is inescapably ‘reinforced by particular bodily and behavioural dispositions’ (Fay, 1987, p. 149) and emotional states. For example, while language acquisition is a conceptual task, it is also a bodily one which requires the correct movements of one’s mouth and other muscles. According to Polanyi all thought has bodily roots (1966, p. 15). Similarly along side any thought or bodily movement in a particular context there will be an associated emotional state (Jagger, 1989). Simply, thought, emotion and behaviour are inseparable, they occur simultaneously and are in constant
interaction. It is impossible not to think, feel and act. We may focus on one but the other two are always implicitly or explicitly present.

Inseparable but autonomous—Now this inseparability implies that a change in the one area of thought, feeling or behaviour will inevitably lead to changes in the other areas. However this is clearly not always the case. For example, a person with a phobia can come to have a conscious understanding of the irrationality and dangers of their actions yet their emotions and bodies continue to respond in similar ways. An abusive father may have told himself that hitting was not a good thing and yet in certain situations he continues to act in these ways. A further example is the great disparity that can exist between the espoused theories of professionals (their ideas) and their ‘theories in use’ (behaviour) and the absence of any awareness of this disparity (Argyris & Schon, 1977).

So while inseparably enfolded or connected, it is clear that the knowledges of the body, emotion and mind can be in contradiction or resist each other. The knowledge contained in each is of a very different order. In the mind, knowledge is stored as concepts, ideas, words and images. Muscular knowledge is stored in patterns of muscular co-ordination, and in the very structure of our muscular development and as physical reflexes. Emotional knowledge is stored as feelings which resonate or contrast with other feeling states in us and in others. So while each one can’t exist without the other two, each realm has a certain autonomy. To properly understand this we need to add another dimension to our discussion, that of the context.

The Context

Bodies and the external environment—From a humanist and idealist perspective we can see ourselves in a position of attempting to master our physical and social environment, and new learning occurs as we try to use our bodies to reshape our environment. The opposite perspective (more common in poststructural and critical thought) is that we are formed by those environments, that ‘our bodies are trained, shaped, and impressed with the stamp of prevailing historical forms of selfhood, desire, masculinity, femininity’ (Bordo, 1989, p. 14). ‘Civilization carves meanings onto and
out of bodies' (Grosz, 1993, p. 197). The architecture of buildings affects who we relate to. Manual labour in the service of employers leads to particular muscular and fine motor development. To fit in with our society requires 'in part becoming a certain sort of body' (Fay, 1987, p. 148) and adopting certain sorts of emotions.

Both perspectives are partial views which need to be considered together in an interactional way. Bodies and their material or physical environment (including the bodies of others) are in a process of continuous mutual formation. At various points we may give emphasis to the way in which we form our environment and at other times to how the environment is forming us but the reality is both processes are continuous and inescapable. Nurturing a child involves in some way shaping that child through the acts of feeding, cuddling and play. The parent however is shaped by the very same acts. However, as was suggested about the relationship between mind, body and emotions, the relationship between the body and its physical context is also a complex one in which each realm, while inseparable may resist the other, so that changes in one are not immediately or necessarily transmitted to the other. We have then at the same time connected but autonomous and potentially rebellious bodies or contexts.

Knowledge talked about in this way leads to an appreciation of non-conceptual forms of knowledge held in feelings, actions and behaviours rather than the mind. This recognition can be extended to see the potential for knowledge to be contained not just within people but within the social and material context as well. Contexts can be seen to have a 'memory' of what has previously occurred which persists through time and can be recovered in the sense that it will lead to the shaping of other bodies in a similar way. Lecture theatres organise the bodies of teachers and students into particular positions where all eye contact is between the teacher and the student with little eye contact possible between students. This sort of architectural arrangement invokes and reinforces certain relationships of power and other expectations which leads students and staff to behave in habitual and historically structured ways. Any attempt to develop a different set of relationships and expectations will actually be resisted by the architecture. The lecture theatre contains a knowledge about
these social arrangements that over the years it impresses on successive groups of students and staff.

Similarly the standard detached three bedroom home in suburbia carries a memory of the appropriateness of a nuclear family structure acting to reinforce and affirm beliefs in this sort of family structure. Thus both the body and the context are sites where knowledge is stored. Bodily knowledge is stored externally in the bricks, cement, and spatial shapes that surround us and internally within our muscles, bones and patterns of movement: knowledge that is transferred from one site to the other without any conscious awareness being required.

Emotions and the context—A common sense conception of emotions is that they are an internal, private, individual experience that leads people to respond to their context in particular ways. However, like the body, emotions only exist within a particular social, discursive and material context and so are simultaneously an individual and social experience. We are trained within our families and by our broader culture to adopt and suppress different emotional responses in certain situations. Our emotional knowledge is thus formed by the emotional context around us. Further, our feelings resonate with the experience of others. When some one is sad we can appreciate this indirectly through our previous experience of sadness. This emotional resonance is not just limited to the experiences of others; it can occur with pets and even inanimate objects. For example emotions can be enfolded in and can be unfolded from works of art, literature and music. Thus emotional knowledge is stored internally as memories of feelings and externally in the feeling states of others and in various forms of material culture which can reinvoke these states.

Emotional knowledge reciprocally forms and is formed by the social context. Again, however, resistance is possible. Children may often feel they are to blame for how they are treated by adults, feeling guilty for their own abuse. However, a child may also get angry and challenge adult control. When resistant emotions are shared with others in similar oppressive situations, people gain greater confidence in their own emotional evaluations. The sharing of similar emotional evaluations can be described as an emotional paradigm in much the same way as we talk about
intellectual paradigms. We could further consider the competition between different emotional paradigms. Body knowledge could also potentially be classified into different paradigms, reflecting different competing bodily knowledges.

**The epistemology of bodily and emotive knowing**

Having established these distinctions and the relationships between different areas, we are now in a position to consider how learning takes place in each site. Learning takes place when there is some difference generated in the interaction between the knowledges of the body, mind or emotion and their context. The difference leads to a transmission of the knowledge from one site to the other.

One way of understanding this learning process is via the concept of co-ordination. To catch a ball requires co-ordination of ones body in relation to the movement of the ball through a particular physical terrain. Errors in catching will lead to refinements and the development of bodily knowledge. Where co-ordination is unsuccessful, frustration develops which may result in a withdrawal from the activity or further learning attempts. Once coordination is achieved, bodily learning ceases until the task varies in some way. This discussion can be seen as a metaphor for the basic principle of learning.

The existence of dis-coordinate knowledge between emotions, bodies, minds and the context will encourage a knowledge change in at least one realm. If an abusive father believes (conceptually) hitting is a bad thing but his body knowledge continues to lash out, learning will lead to either the modification of his ideas or his body. Learning involves the transfer of knowledge from one site to another. The direction of this transfer does not necessarily correspond to its truthfulness or benefit. So in valuing body and emotive knowledge we need also to be aware of its potential capacity to be exploitive in just the same way as conceptual knowledge can be.

Further, both bodily and emotive knowledge are historical and situational. Versions of each could be relevant to the current context and time, while completely out of co-ordination at a different time and situation. Thus, body and emotional knowledge
is not essentially correct or incorrect, rather it can be either co-ordinated with the material, emotional and social context or can be out of step. (By implication cognitive knowledge is in exactly the same position). Use of the strap for discipline in our time is seen as abuse but in earlier history was equated with good parenting.

Being out of step creates the potential for learning (for a new co-ordination), but it also creates the possibility of forced learning (the attempted imposition of knowledge from one area over another). Bodies which are out of step can create tensions, leading to attempts to bring them back into line; to regulate bodies (Grosz, 1995). Domination can occur in mental, physical and emotional ways, while at the same time resistance is possible. This domination can be explained in terms of a network of co-ordinated knowledges which act to reinforce its own legitimacy but then challenges, resists or rejects any marginal rebellious knowledge. For example in the current climate where rationality is valued, any promotion of emotive or bodily knowledge will be resisted. This political process can also be applied within an individual. A small, rogue, sad emotion will be unlikely to have an impact on someone's general happy emotional state. The persistence of dis-co-ordinate knowledge however highlights the potential of the marginal to resist the dominance of this network of co-ordinate knowledge, perhaps even shattering the network (White, 1995).

So while the difference creates the potential for learning, learning is not essential. Huge disjunctures can exist between areas without any learning being attempted. As mentioned, Argyris and Schon (1977) have pointed out the very great differences that can exist between professionals espoused theory and their theory in use. While clearly a limit to our potential learning, it is actually fortunate that we can cope with such disjunctures so there is some limit to the demands upon us to continually learn and change. Given the huge contradictions that exist between our ideas, actions, feelings and those of others, if the differences between them required an immediate direct effect we would have no time to rest, being forced to continuously deal with all the incongruities. We would be left in a constant chaotic state of turmoil and change. A sense of identity relies on holding to some
conceptual, bodily or emotional knowledge despite the discord that exists. Thus the capacity to hold inconsistent knowledges in different realms is essential. It then allows time for parts of the discord to be worked on at a more acceptable pace.

Much work needs to be done to further explore the fuller picture of the process of knowledge development and its implications for different disciplines. At this point it may be useful to tentatively highlight some of the significant implications in the area of critical social work practice so as to encourage further exploration of bodily and emotive knowledge in this area.

Implications for Critical Social Work

Missing in critical theories of change, is the importance of bodily and emotive knowledge in developing an understanding the processes of domination and resistance. Believing change can occur simply through a self conscious action is to miss a very large component of the problem being tackled. While the oppressed can gain a new critical insight or consciousness (which is intended to encourage new behaviour) this may actually have little behavioural impact if their old bodily and emotional knowledge continues to implicitly govern their actions. A parent may have decided conceptually to never hit their child again but his body seems to continue to strike out in certain situations. Workers may decide to challenge their employer's harassment, but emotionally can not find the courage to initiate the action.

How then can we alter people's bodies and emotions to challenge the processes of domination? Initially three possible directions seem relevant but, as will be explained, are also limited. Firstly, the limits of consciousness raising could be used to support a more dogmatic orientation which seeks to legitimate the imposition of critical theory by force. This could involve military or physical intimidation and control of educational content. However, such an approach fails to take account of the bodily and emotional knowledge that would be learnt by the population through such processes. While people may be educated to believe they have been liberated or empowered, their bodies would have actually learnt greater subservience, an outcome which would be opposite to that actually desired by critical theory.
A second direction given some support by Fay (1987) has a more individual focus and involves various body therapies which use physical manipulation as a way of resolving various problems (Bradford, 1996). The suggestion is that perhaps critical practice may need to incorporate such approaches to assist people in achieving the sort of bodies and emotions necessary for critical practice. Caution is required however, because while many of these approaches recognize bodily and emotive forms of knowing, they are often taken to be the 'truth', missing the contextual and historical specificity of bodily and emotional knowledge emphasised in this paper. These approaches can valorize knowledge of the body over that of the conceptual, a reversal of what is privileged, which simply substitutes one form of dogma with an other.

Third, it could be argued that all that is required is a greater conscious awareness of body and emotional processes. This, however, just reasserts the privileged position of the rational. It limits our understanding of these processes to that which can be conceptually defined, and in so doing transform bodily and emotional knowledge into a conceptual form.

What is required is a new way of extending our awareness, not just conceptually but in an embodied and emotive form. Along side a critical self consciousness, we need a critical bodily awareness and a critical emotional awareness. Just as we seek to develop a greater conceptual analysis of our society, we also need to develop our emotional sensitivity to the emotional processes of domination, and to the dominant and resistant forms of emotional knowledge. We also need a bodily and physical awareness of the material or bodily processes of domination and the resistant and dominant bodily knowledge experienced. This could all be termed as the development of a critical awareness and will involve not only becoming more aware of the knowledge of mind, body and emotion it will also involve an awareness of contradictions between each realm, and the contradictions between these realms and the knowledge of the conceptual, physical and emotional context. This affirms a materialist orientation, but it is a fleshy, emotional materialism rather than a cold, deterministic one.

A critical process of change will not just involve consciousness raising but rather a more holistic process of conceptual, bodily and
emotional development. Holistic in this sense means that each should be seen together (without valorizing one) so that each realm of knowledge can learn from the other. Holistic also means that body, emotional and conceptual knowledge is recognized as enfolded in the various levels of oneself, the other, and the broader conceptual, physical and emotional context. Constructive change will require change at all levels. Such a view opens up the potential for recognizing new opportunities for change as well as perhaps unacknowledged processes of resistance and change already occurring.

New possibilities may take the form of nondiscursive action which challenge and change the bodily and emotive knowledge of one's self, others and the societal context. This could involve for example experiments with altering and developing a non-oppressive architecture of homes, industry, schools, waiting rooms and so on, or perhaps encouraging and using different forms of art and music to build a less oppressive emotional context. It may involve adaptations of body therapies to assist people in embracing less subservient and conforming behaviours and more confident, optimistic and courageous emotions. Such action should always be done with an attempt to explain the purpose and rationale of such actions, even though such explanations will be limited and the understanding of such actions can only properly be understood through direct emotional and bodily experience.

Before experimenting with new forms of activist practice, however, it would seem wise to explore the more everyday bodily and emotive practices that are already a part of what we would normally consider good practice, but which have been unacknowledged because of the dominance of rational conceptual approaches. Some recent research by Tennant (1998) and Healy (1996) point to the very important process and relationship activities of women in community work and activist practice which are not recognized and even denigrated as they are based on bodily and emotional knowledges. Further research on the bodily and emotive knowledge of successful activists could reveal a wealth of knowledge for strengthening activist practice.

In a similar way it will also be of enormous value to pay attention to how people in situations of oppression successfully
resist dominatory forces in bodily and emotive ways. Perhaps many current behaviours which are seen as consequences of our oppressive systems could actually be redefined as forms of resistance; mental illness, homelessness, stress leave, voluntary unemployment could be reframed as active forms of bodily and emotional resistance. Jaggar (1989) talks about ‘rebellious emotions’ and clearly our society requires such actions to be limited and controlled, highlighting the threat they present to the established order. This recognition would not seek to minimize the enormous suffering felt by people involved but it could open up the potential to more actively support and give legitimacy to such acts. This could help to soften the harsh negative nature of the experience and enable recognition perhaps of the ways their bodies have actually taken some action to resist an oppressive context (albeit often in contradiction to their own conceptual wishes).

Interestingly the strong, invulnerable, courageous model of an activist perhaps also blinds activists to the value of timidity and weakness. Radicals may well in effect serve and support the interest of the powerful in labeling these activities as a system failure and in their own actions which provide a bodily and emotional message, that strength, control and power is good. It confirms an achievement, success and ambitious ethic and so at a bodily and emotional level the activist may be reinforcing an emotional context valued by the rulers of capital. The capitalist may challenge the unemployed to get out and find jobs while in perhaps a similar way emotionally the activist implores the unemployed to become committed activists. Both adopt a powerful identity which dialectically relies on others assuming a powerless identity. Recognition of this leads to an exploration of the potential resistance and challenge enfolded in the actions of non-ambitious, fearful, anxious people. Perhaps such attitudes could have a liberatory potential in some sense, which could undermine the emotional character required for capitalist production and competition.

Thus in short I am arguing for greater attention to the bodily and emotive technologies that already are in implicit operation in activist practice and everyday action, before turning to new bodily and emotive action strategies. Once we have a good under-
standing of current bodily and emotive processes it will be clearer as to what new direction is required. The above discussion has not sought to offer a definitive direction but rather simply seeks to open up some possibilities for further exploration.

Conclusion

It is perhaps fitting to end this paper with an acknowledgment of the paradox and contradiction in trying to theorise and write about this topic when it can only really be understood through a bodily and emotive resonance with the examples discussed. Hopefully however the paper has demonstrated the great importance of bodily and emotive knowledge and the need for further understanding in this area. Acknowledgment of the dominance of rational conceptual processes and the suppression of bodily and emotive knowing in critical social theory and the general social work literature opens up and demands a radically new appreciation of social work practice and theories of change. At the same time much of what is said here will not be controversial or unfamiliar to many practitioners. An old piece of social work wisdom is that it is a good idea in any interaction to have touched how the other is thinking, feeling and acting in relation to the issue at hand. This very simple advice has an obvious almost trite ring about it, but when considered in relation to the issues discussed in this paper it takes on a revolutionary quality. It recognizes emotions (feelings) and the body (action) as equally legitimate realms for exploration along side the conceptual (thinking).

Current poststructural conceptions have challenge critical theory and have highlighted the separateness that exists between us at conceptual levels and so doing has encouraged: a more fragmentary view of social life: a greater uncertainty about goals; and a pessimism about the possibilities of change. However, 'while words and concepts distinguish and divide, bodiliness unites and forms the ground of an empathetic, even universal understanding' (Jackson, 1983, p. 341) and so a new base to overcome division. Bodily and emotional knowledge directs us to a new more fleshy and emotive materialism which could provide new understandings, new directions and new possibilities for seeking change to oppressive systems.
References

*I want to acknowledge and thank Maria Tennant for encouraging my interest in these ideas through her Master’s research. Her soon to be completed Master’s thesis will make a very valuable and embodied contribution to our awareness of this whole area.


This article identifies the ways in which macro practitioners manage and respond to termination issues in organization and community arenas. To conceptualize and partialize problems related to termination, the authors developed a typology in which the purposes, roles, and tasks related to macro termination situations are identified and grouped by three levels of practice: The Technical; The Managerial; and The Institutional. Within each part of the typology the needs are articulated, objectives of the macro practitioner identified, and the role of the practitioner explicated. Several exemplars and an integrating vignette illustrate termination concerns, dilemmas, and the complexity of macro practice with the intent of recognizing the opportunities and constraints presented by issues of termination within macro practice.

Introduction
Macro practitioners face multiple termination issues with groups, organizations and communities. Planned change requires careful attention to termination so that change is "institutionalized" or "stabilized". Little attention is paid in the literature, however, to the role of the macro practitioner in overseeing the micro practice use of termination. Finally, there are serious voids in the literature about the application of knowledge and skills of termination to professional staff dynamics and the empowerment of groups and communities. The primary purpose of this article is to identify the many ways in which macro practitioners are responsible for responding to termination issues in organization and community arenas. We contend that the macro practitioner

61
must take a proactive stance to address termination issues at multiple levels within an organization.

**Background**

The concept of termination is well developed in micro social work practice as a term either to understand human behavior or to use as a phase of the intervention process. In human behavior termination relates to attachment and separation, and/or grief and loss, constructs essential to client assessment and intervention (Woods & Hollis, 1990). As a phase of intervention, termination is a concluding step between client and worker. It includes specific objectives and tasks for both social worker and client(s) and is typically planned for during the initial phase of intervention as essential to the working contract (Hepworth, Rooney & Larsen, 1997). Recently the micro practice and generalist practice literature has presented termination as needing differential application to reflect variations in interventive problems/goals, modality, and length of intervention (Compton & Galaway, 1989).

Yet, in comparison to the micro practice literature, in macro practice termination as an interventive phase has been overlooked or merely underdeveloped. For example, the most recent *Encyclopedia of Social Work* (NASW, 1995) and the immediately preceding edition (1987) contain articles on “Termination In Direct Practice” but do not mention it in either macro or generalist practice. While Tolson, Reid and Garvin (1994) discuss termination for generalist task centered practice across a range of client system sizes, their cursory discussion for communities and organizations (in contrast to individuals, families and groups) is striking. In the group practice literature Toseland and Rivas (1995) indicate that endings vary depending on whether the group’s purpose is treatment or task. Task groups involve feelings at a lower level of intensity, and task group literature focuses on ending specific meetings rather than ending the group experience. Only one recent author was found who discusses termination at every level of generalist practice, using a problem solving framework (McMahon, 1994). While McMahon’s discussion of termination as an interventive phase is applied to individuals, families, groups, communities, and organizations, the vast majority of examples focus on work with individuals, families, and groups. Consequently, a differential emphasis prevails, perhaps leaving the reader to imagine
Termination in Macro Practice

more comprehensive applications in macro practice or to believe that this phase is less applicable when compared to micro practice.

Termination: A Macro Typology

In order to conceptualize the complexity of termination in macro practice, we have developed a typology based on James Thompson’s (1967) concept of organizational levels. The purposes, roles, and tasks related to macro termination situations are identified and grouped by the level of practice at which macro practice occurs: The Technical Level; The Managerial Level; and The Institutional Level (see Table 1). In each level the focus varies: for the technical level it is to ensure that agency workers are able to fully address termination issues with their clients; for the managerial level the focus is the organization employee; and for the institutional level the focus is ensuring lasting change within the community and/or organization. In the following discussion, each section of this typology is introduced by a review of selected micro and/or macro literature followed by the identification of related objectives of the macro practitioner and the explication of the role of the practitioner. Exemplars illustrate termination concerns and dilemmas, with the intent of recognizing opportunities and balancing constraints presented by termination aspects of macro practice. A final vignette that integrates each part of the typology concludes our discussion.

The Technical Level

The first category of the typology focuses on the facilitation and oversight of employees in a social service organization’s technical core use of termination, assurance of resources, protection of the client in the face of unexpected project/service reduction or close down, and quality assurance. Facilitation of the technical core level requires the macro practitioner to understand the micro practice knowledge base and skills that relate to termination in the helping process. Examples of the macro role are used to illustrate this.

Facilitation and oversight of technical core use of termination. Netting, Kettner and McMurtry define macro practice as “professionally directed intervention designed to bring about planned change in organizations and communities... [which includes]...
Table 1

**Typology for Termination in Macro Social Work Practice**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Practice Example Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technical</td>
<td>Facilitation &amp; oversight of technical core use of termination</td>
<td>Agency; organization unit</td>
<td>Contracting with clients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ensuring resources for appropriate services</td>
<td>Agency; organization unit</td>
<td>Program planning for length of intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Protecting client in face of unexpected project/service close down</td>
<td>Agency: community</td>
<td>Planned referrals; case reassessment; time share loss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality Assurance; MIS; caseload monitoring</td>
<td>Agency; organization unit</td>
<td>Case status/statistical reporting; utilization review; accreditation/certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial</td>
<td>Ensuring orderly &amp; humane employee transitions</td>
<td>Agency; human resource system</td>
<td>Resignations; staff/program reductions; retirement/promotion; gain/loss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Managing task groups; teams</td>
<td>Agency; the loosely coupled organization</td>
<td>Creating, rewarding &amp; ending task groups or teams</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*continued*
Table 1  
Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Practice Example Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supervising diverse employees</td>
<td>Agency; the loosely coupled organization</td>
<td>Recognizing and valuing diversity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attending to employee motivation &amp; morale maintenance</td>
<td>Agency; the loosely coupled organization</td>
<td>Group decision making; beginnings &amp; endings; replacement of leaders and key people</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional</td>
<td>Change stabilization; refreezing change situation; transfer power and authority; ensuring continuity. Empowering clients: Preparing for transitions &amp; self-governance; promoting growth and development</td>
<td>Community; organization; group</td>
<td>Ritual/ceremony; formal minutes and reports; informal rituals; replace personnel; embracing a vision statement, charters, by-laws; securing on-going funding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
social work product and process and ensure professional practice that reflects this knowledge.

Hess and Hess (1989) refer to organizational influences on termination by stating:

... termination ... is shaped by the organization context within which social work intervention occurs. The organizational mission delineates boundaries both for the nature of the client problems addressed and the typical or preferred treatment modalities utilized. Intra-organizational and inter-organizational factors may also affect the timing and process of termination (pp. 653-54).

These organizational factors must be identified and influenced by the macro practitioner. Attention to the use of contracting with clients is one example.

Contracting typically addresses termination for the first time when the expected length of service is established between social worker and client (Hepworth, Rooney & Larsen, 1997; Northen, 1994; Toseland and Rivas, 1995; Woods & Hollis, 1990). Organizational recognition, promotion, and support of contracting as both process and product is necessary. As process, establishment and oversight of practice standards ensures that termination occurs within a specified time frame. As product, the development and use of forms (contractual agreement form) and other record keeping items (checklists; closing summary outline) facilitate effective micro practice.

Ensuring Resources. Termination necessitates the use of agency resources. Perhaps the most obvious resource is the micro practitioner’s time to provide service to a manageable size caseload, which ultimately translates into costs per unit of service. If agency services become more limited due to cutbacks or downsizing, attention to termination rituals and tasks may need to be rethought as workers consider the limited service hours available for each client. When third party reimbursement for service is exhausted, social workers may not have time to recognize termination processes and may feel pressured more by administrative and economic imperatives than by practice wisdom or empirical evidence. An example may elucidate this.

A micro practice social worker in a community mental health agency suddenly terminated employment. Concerned that
agency revenues were less than forecasted, the agency administrator directed the receptionist to tell the former worker's clients that a new worker would contact them within a few weeks, so as to allow planning time and not disrupt other services. This response failed to consider the immediate impact of a worker's sudden and unexplained departure on clients. When this directive was overheard by a micro social worker, it was challenged as unsound clinical practice related to termination (Hepworth, Rooney & Larsen, 1997). An alternative was implemented that resulted in incoming calls from these clients being dispersed among the clinical staff in order to assess each client's response to the sudden departure of the social worker and then to develop individualized plans. However, this approach altered caseload reassignment policies and necessitated worker time that was not always reimbursable. When the macro practitioner later reviewed revenue short-falls with the Board of Director's Finance Committee, the underlying negative circumstances were turned into a positive justification to increase funding from outside sources in order to protect clients from being harmed by such staffing crises. Finally, the macro practitioner provided leadership to develop new agency policy in the face of any future situations involving the sudden departure of a social worker that may lead to an unsound and unethical practice response.

*Unexpected project/service close down.* With the increasing unpredictability in funding, macro practitioners must respond to the sudden loss of micro practice positions or even entire service programs. Regardless of the level of practice, the values and ethics represented in the NASW Code of Ethics (1996) place client interests as primary. Abruptly withdrawing services violates this basic principle, leaving the macro practitioner with an onerous task. Strong advocacy for client needs, perhaps even couched in terms of legal rights, may be used to influence a funding source to delay withdrawal of funds in order to ensure completion of termination tasks. Contingency planning for abrupt termination also is essential. For example, maintenance of an up-to-date community resource file of related services facilitates enactment of an emergency plan for case referral or transfer in the face of a service shut-down or worker termination. Referral and transfer in lieu of
termination of services helps to address the crises and helplessness felt by workers and clients in the face of the unexpected (Hepworth, Rooney & Larsen, 1997).

Quality assurance; MIS; caseload monitoring. Another responsibility of the macro practitioner is the collection, analysis and use of client data for fiscal accountability, for ensuring quality services, and for administrative and program planning (Netting, Kettner & McMurtry, 1998). With pressures for greater accountability there is increased attention to the evaluation of client outcomes and the need for empirically based practice (Bloom & Fisher, 1995). Macro practitioners must link this push for accountability with the needs and goals of the micro practice social worker who may feel increasingly burdened to produce more (seeing more clients with more complex problems while documenting greater client outcomes) with less (decreased number of reimbursable client contacts and fewer available hours due to larger caseloads). In order to meet these needs, the right questions must be asked to collect data efficiently. This requires that the macro practitioner express needs, expectations, and demands "of one system in the terms and concepts of another system" to make what Havassy describes as a "cross-system translation" (1990).

Evaluation of outcome is particularly important at the termination phase. In fact, outcome data may signal the need to commence the termination process either due to lack of progress or due to the attainment of client goals (Bloom & Fisher, 1995; Hepworth, Rooney & Larsen, 1997; Jordan & Franklin, 1995; Nurius & Hudson, 1993). The following example illustrates the use of client outcome data related to termination as well as the use of a MIS for monitoring to improve direct practice services.

In a public family services agency a quality service standard required that no more than a two week waiting period occur between an initial client contact and the intake appointment. As referrals increased and resources did not, caseload size for all micro practitioners increased. Unable to manage an increased number of clients, one social worker failed to close cases to which no services were being delivered or for which no progress was noted. While the intentions of the worker were good, i.e. to deliver quality service, underdeveloped skills in assessment of client outcome
and poor caseload monitoring created workload inequity and ultimately discontent among professional staff. More importantly, alternatives existed to assist the social worker in managing a larger caseload. Due to a management information system which yielded data to compare caseload size and activities among workers and units, this problem was identified during administrative review and addressed. In response, the social worker was provided with case management training which included the use of tools to assess client outcomes and track client progress efficiently and ultimately to terminate appropriately. In turn, other workers participated in similar training leading to better client outcome assessment, better termination planning and implementation, and greater worker satisfaction.

The Managerial Level

The second category of the typology focuses on the managerial level. Macro practitioners are charged with conducting orderly and humane employee transitions; managing task groups and teams; supervising diverse employees; and helping employee with motivation and the maintenance of morale. All require attention to termination issues. We will address each of these areas, again using exemplars to illustrate major points.

Ensuring Orderly/Humane Transitions. In today's world of rapid organizational change, individual longevity in organizations seems fleeting as workers assume new positions, move to new locations, witness downsizing, and brace themselves for unprecedented change. Past expectations about tenure in one job or with the same human service organization are dashed as political climates dictate rapid-fire work force reductions and organizational restructuring. While there have always been transitions as people enter and leave specific jobs, it is unlikely that there has ever been a more volatile time when occupants of jobs in all sectors of the economy have experienced such a rapid and untimely potential for job displacement. Smallen (1995) addresses this concern: "Job displacement, which resulted in the unemployment of 4.3 million people from 1985 through 1989 has a particularly devastating effect on the disenfranchised populations typically served by social work" (p. 533). She indicates that social work intervention has been tied to plant closings and unemployment, and
identifies ways in which social workers can assist those persons laid off, terminated or coerced into termination. With increasing displacement comes conflicts in the perception of social timing, particularly among cohorts of older workers who have made assumptions about projected career paths. “Today’s older workers may have their self doubts about their once comfortable work-role identifications” (p. 535) and one’s sense of life coherence and continuity in terms of both work and self identity may be sorely disrupted.

Within this increasingly complex environment there is rarely time to grieve what was or to even acknowledge the loss of that group, organization or community from which one has terminated. Social workers, perhaps in contrast to other disciplines, are positioned by their knowledge and skills in termination to maximize positive transitions.

Social workers themselves are subject to rapid and sweeping cutbacks and change and can face many of the same issues identified by Smallen. A growing literature on privatization and the divesting of government commitments points out the “accompanying trend [in] the reduction of professional social work services in favor of managed care provisions . . . creating an environment in which social workers have reported a higher level of burnout and lowered morale in general” (Motenko et al, 1995, p. 457). Social workers are being asked to document more, generate more fees, are losing peer relationships so important for consultation, and are being assigned unrealistically high caseloads. The macro social worker can not lose sight of what constitutes a humane response. Any action taken must reflect values of worth, dignity, and the primacy of the client and not merely respond to short-sighted external pressures.

In host settings where there are multiple professionals interacting, fears of termination can become all-consuming. For example, hospital social work departments are being disbanded in order to place individual practitioners with cost centers such as pediatrics and oncology. In turn, social workers are grieving over the loss of departmental identities and former managers of those departments (also social workers) are faced with uncertainty over what their roles will be. Over the course of a year, one such manager unexpectedly went from being the Director of Social Services
to being in three different lower level positions as the hospital structure was repeatedly reorganized. This treatment, resulted in lower morale which negatively impacted work productivity. A simple but more humane alternative may have been to include the department head in decision making as new organizational imperatives arose.

Within this milieu, a major challenge for the macro practitioner is to try to establish a climate in which orderly and humane employee transitions can occur even though these changes may be precipitated by factors beyond both the employee’s and the supervisor’s control. For changes such as routine resignations, retirements and promotions there are typically established rituals involving gifts and farewell events. Organizations have norms and appropriate ceremonies for these partings. However, in the event of staff and program reductions, there are not always norms, precedents, and established rituals so that developing creative alternatives becomes imperative.

Not all termination situations are the result of employees tossed in a sea of political turbulence. There are situations in which employees can not, or do not, perform their jobs in an acceptable manner, and it is up to the supervisor to carefully assess what is happening. “When workers fall short of performance goals, an all-too-frequent response of some supervisors is to assume the worst about the intentions, motivation, and character of the ‘offender’” (Lee & Cayer, 1994, p. 221). There are established procedures for dealing with persons who do not meet minimum performance standards. Typical steps include: informal talking or counseling, oral warning, written reprimand, suspension, demotion and reduction in salary, and termination (Lee & Cayer, 1994, p. 230). Macro practitioners must deal with employee disciplinary action and possible termination and assure that employees have access to these policies.

Managing Task Groups/Teams. The macro practitioner is often responsible for the creation, oversight, and participation of various task groups and teams. Fatout and Rose (1995) identify various types of task groups including focus groups, administrative groups, committees, delegate councils, teams, treatment conferences, and social action groups. Task groups and teams may
be interdisciplinary and project-based, changing as the needs of clients and the agency change.

Sensitivity to group needs requires the macro practitioner to anticipate termination issues concerning group purpose and time commitment. For example, in an ad hoc team members expect to complete their tasks and then terminate. On the other hand, a team formed to oversee a long-term project will develop its own group identity and subculture, requiring a termination phase when the project is complete. It is important for the manager or supervisor to recognize when a group is having a difficult time with termination. In a changing work environment employees may indeed want to hold onto group experiences that have been positive and supportive. Fatout and Rose (1995) indicate that the ending of team meetings can be a positive experience in that a task has been accomplished, a report or series of reports have been issued and disseminated, and that there is a normal feeling of closure on a project. They also say that “team members should be informed about the decision to terminate or end and be involved in termination decisions related to both substantive and symbolic issues” (p. 60) all of which needs to be ensured by the macro practitioner.

Supervising Diverse Employees. In today’s work force, it is critical to recognize the increasing diversity among employees including race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, disability, age, religion, and profession (Cox, 1994). The meaning of work, work longevity, and work place identity have cultural determinants to be considered when the macro practitioner identifies and responds to employees facing termination. It takes skill and insight on the part of the macro practitioner when facing both tough termination issues and unique individual and cultural differences.

Thomas (1991) has written about race and gender diversity in the work place. For example, a female employee may perceive termination handled by a male supervisor as inappropriate if he does not communicate in a gender sensitive manner. By attempting to be highly “professional” and “to the point”, he may explain that she has been laid off without entertaining her need to verbally process how this feels. The different lenses each person brings to the situation can lead to mis-communication in
the face of an already difficult situation. He may assume that she
would be embarrassed to state her feelings and thus provides an
opportunity for her to leave quickly. She may see him as unfeeling
and devaluing of women. As work place diversity continues to
increase, it is imperative that the macro practitioner continually
expand a culturally specific knowledge base in order to respond
to termination issues with cultural competence.

Attending to Employee Motivation & Morale. Attending to em-
ployee motivation and morale is an ongoing process for the macro
practitioner. As employees increasingly encounter organizational
downsizing and out placement, they are subjected to loss at sev-
eral levels. For example, team spirit and work place friendships
are lost when employees are terminated, and for those who re-
main, a sense of job insecurity may arise. The macro practitioner
recognizes and responds to these losses not only because it is
the humane thing to do but also because, if left unattended, they
can lead to decreased productivity and effectiveness. In addition,
macro social workers must recognize and deal with their own
feelings about changes in their work settings.

An example of a large public welfare agency, which experi-
enced rapid change when a new governor assumed office, points
out management level termination issues. The social work man-
ger heading a social services unit was aware that many of the
persons in leadership positions had been appointed by a previous
administration and would be subject to dismissal as the new
governor placed his appointees in strategic positions. There were
widespread comments that "things would change" and rumors
were circulating in the hallways. The culture of the organization
was changing in that employees who had previously worked with
their doors open, were closing them, and conversations among
staff were whispered and seemed strained. The social work man-
ger proactively used every opportunity to inform staff about
what was going on in the agency. Even when decisions had not
been made, information was presented in staff meetings so that
staff would know why they had not heard of anticipated results
of decisions. The manager also worked with the human resources
and employee assistance unit to see what options employees
would have in the event of rapid downsizing, a topic widely
discussed in the media as part of the governor's approach to reducing the state budget. At the request of the social work manager, a support group of key staff was developed so that several units within the agency could benefit from the cooperation of various managers in the event of unexpected changes. The major thrust was to recognize how disconcerting it is when employees work in a climate in which they do not feel secure or valued as well as advocate for employee's rights.

The Institutional Level

The macro change process has roots in the 1950s work of Lippitt, Watson and Westley (1958) who used a systems approach to focus on the dynamics of planned change. It is noteworthy that their phases of planned change included two final ones: change being generalized and stabilized; and the helping relationship being ended or redefined (p. 123).

Major application of change process and social systems knowledge was made by Warren (1963) in work on community change. He adapted the social systems approach, applying it to community analysis, recognizing the subsystem categorization of a client system and a change agent system. While not necessarily intended solely for social work practice, this approach was tremendously important to the developing social work method of community organization and has continued to be reflected in macro practice.

Pincus and Minahan (1973) furthered the social work use of the change process from a social systems perspective in their text on generalist practice. In the 1980s the systems approach to change was further developed as the basis for the popular planned change text by Kettner, Daley and Nichols (1985) who in the final chapter specifically addressed the stabilization of change. More recently, a systems approach to change is reflected in the 1998 text by Netting, Kettner and McMurtry, but since this work was not intended to address the change process beyond the problem analysis and strategy selection stages, it does not address termination or change stabilization.

Change Stabilization. The concept of "change stabilization" found in macro practice literature is associated with "the termination process," being the phase of the change process in which the
macro practitioner ends the change effort. This is not commonly referred to as termination, but it involves ending the helping relationship while preserving the gains which were made. It is also referred to as "institutionalizing" the change.

The change stabilization process allows for closure of the change effort while the change agent or worker "terminates" from the change process, leaving the targeted organization or community in an improved condition. Associated with this purpose is the need for the practitioner to step out of the change setting so that the organization or community may fully own and integrate the change. Alternatively, a decision may be reached not to continue the change process because costs and benefits are out of balance or there are insufficient resources for continuation.

Ending the change effort involves tasks that ensure that the change is stable, accepted and institutionalized. The practitioner examines means of giving up the change agent role and completely separating from the change setting. Alternatively, if the practitioner is an on-going member of the organization or community in which the change took place, future activity must be restricted to an on-going, established role and responsibility to ensure that change is fixed with some other individual, position, group, or unit. This is a major factor in change theory—part of the "refreezing" (Lewin, 1951) of the system in the new state as the change continues without the change agent's presence.

In completing termination the practitioner reassesses the changes that have taken place to determine: (1) if the changes are those planned for; (2) if there are any unintended changes or consequences of the change effort that should be dealt with before the practitioner steps out; and (3) if the change is permanent by evaluating the level of acceptance of the changes to see if further work is needed. The ultimate question is: Should and can the change be permanent—that is, do benefits outweigh costs and are sufficient resources present to maintain the change? The possibility of non-continuance of the change is recognized as one alternative, and a decision not to continue, when it is the best course of action, is not necessarily seen as negative.

Empowering groups and communities. Empowerment is a traditional goal or component of macro practice, particularly in
community organization. In recent years empowering clients has gained new attention as a major theme for social work, although as Simon (1994) points out, it dates in social work to the Progressive Era. Lee's (1994) recent work, for example, incorporates and identifies in a single model an “empowerment approach” for meeting oppression which includes work with individuals, families, specific populations, and groups as well as political and community practice.

Institutional level practice may include developing organization or community ability to make decisions based on a representational system, gaining and maintaining political power, and ensuring the decisions are implemented for the benefit of the organization or community. The very process of decision making and implementation leads to further increases in competency, self-direction, and representational influence in community political processes.

The macro practitioner recognizes both instrumental and affective elements in termination, especially when it comes to empowerment. Members of communities and organizations want to gain and use power to bring about a better life for themselves, and they also want to acquire and hold feelings of empowerment—to be part of the community and society, to be heard, and to have ability to influence public processes (Mondtosa & Wilson, 1994). Termination provides the opportunity to review completed work, its stabilization and reinforcement of empowerment, and its institutionalization in organizations and community bodies.

Conclusion: Termination on All Fronts

In conclusion, we offer the following vignette and then summarize the levels in the typology we have presented as they appear in the vignette.

An innovative project is funded by a foundation grant to target frail elderly who live alone. It integrates case managers with primary care physician community-based practices. The project physicians, originally solo and small group practitioners, have just been hired by a large health care system. The project manager, a social worker, is aware that the grant is for a three year period and that the program becoming economically self-sufficient is a requirement of the grant.
Careful plans are made to assure that case managers alert clients to the fact that this is a time-limited grant and that there is the possibility that service may not continue after three years unless other resources are located.

As the grant nears the end of the second year, the health care organization in which the project is housed undergoes tremendous change and 100 employees are laid off. Administrators change and the commitment to continue the project is lost. The project manager knows that the physicians have become very pleased with the work of the case managers and that clients express great satisfaction, but the new administrator says that “keeping people happy is nice, but I see no evidence that this intervention has decreased hospital utilization.” The case managers begin job hunting, stating that “the handwriting is on the wall.” Clients are expressing concern over rumors that the program will not continue, and finally the health care system administrator decides to return the third year of funding because the project does not fit with re-engineered goals. The macro practitioner has to face issues related to personal job loss; premature termination with a funding source; termination of case managers; and ensure proper client termination from case managers and physicians.

Applying our typology of termination for macro practice provides a way to conceptualize and partialize the problems in order to formulate plans for intervention, illustrating the importance of the termination concept in macro practice. At the technical level, micro practice termination issues are known to the macro practitioner when this case scenario begins. This is a three year grant, and there is always the possibility that at grant’s end the project will not be self-sufficient or that what was learned during the grant period will change the intervention. Therefore, the practitioner ensures through agency policy that staff possess the knowledge and skills to inform clients that the contract is short-term and that their relationship may not continue after three years. Further, as time progresses and as new clients are enrolled in the project, decisions must be made in terms of when to cease enrollment. Aggregate client data for cases in which there was optimal outcome could be used to identify enrollment time parameters. These decisions require that the manager be as sensitive as the micro practitioners to client contracting and termination issues.
At the managerial level of the typology, the macro practitioner is enmeshed in multiple termination issues as the grant nears the end of its second year. Physicians have been pleased with case management services but evidence of decreased utilization is undocumented. How does the practitioner communicate with physicians so that they are aware of the problems inherent in continuing the program without damaging established relationships? How does the practitioner deal with staff who are feeling insecure in their jobs? Opening communication channels and focusing issues so physicians and case managers each can communicate their concerns with project administrators are management level strategies for helping people confront issues and remain committed. Another strategy involves working with the case management team to determine how to make changes in project monitoring so that outcomes acceptable to key decision-makers are highlighted. It is the responsibility of the macro social worker to provide the leadership and structure for this to occur as well as model the requisite communication skills.

Last, institutional level change is the very essence of this case example. The hope is that enough adjustments can be made so that case management will become part of this health care system's culture. The macro practitioner must apprise health care administrators about both the subtle, quality of life changes in individual client's lives and the potential benefits to the larger health care system. Preventing termination of the project may literally be dependent upon the practitioner's ability to advocate and negotiate with persons from other disciplines and reframe institutional level approaches to the change process.

Recognizing that termination is as much a part of macro practice as it is of micro practice provides a rich opportunity to draw on and extend what social workers already know about termination. Skill in addressing the socio-emotional realities faced by workers in the midst of these issues is essential to contemporary practice.

References

Termination in Macro Practice


The Definition of Fatherhood:
In the Words of Never-Married African American Custodial Mothers and the Noncustodial Fathers of Their Children

JENNIFER F. HAMER
Southern Illinois University-Edwardsville
Department of Sociology

This qualitative study explores the meaning of fatherhood from the perspective of never-married parents. Specifically, the study describes: how African American custodial mothers perceive the roles and responsibilities of their children's fathers; the extent to which these mothers' perceptions and definitions of noncustodial fatherhood are consistent with those of noncustodial fathers and the dominant cultural "ideal"; and what mothers do to enhance men's paternal participation. A convenience sample of 25 never-married, former couples was drawn from the predominantly African American population of a mid-sized Midwestern city. Data was collected via in-depth interviews with each individual respondent. The findings suggest that African American custodial mothers' expressed definition of "ideal" fatherhood tends to reflect traditional Western standards, which emphasize the paternal economic role. However, in practice, mothers, like fathers, emphasize the social and emotional aspects of paternal responsibilities. Overall, it appears that while these mothers really want financial support, they are willing to forego economic support in lieu of the social and emotional support fathers provide.

Introduction

How do African American single-parenting mothers define fatherhood? What role do these women want noncustodial fathers to play in their children's daily lives? These questions are timely given recent dramatic changes in family welfare policy that demand fathers be more accountable and responsible for their children's care. In our society, paternal accountability and
responsibility have traditionally been defined financially (Tripp-Reismann and Wilson 1990; Blankhorn 1995). State mandates and family policies continue to define the noncustodial paternal role in primarily economic terms. Consequently, states have developed stringent policies to diligently pursue noncustodial fathers for formal payment of child support. Yet, policies developed in this regard are destined to fail until they reflect the reality of life for African American families. As Geiger (1995) points out, not all custodial mothers benefit equally from current policies. African American single mothers are less likely than other demographic groups to formally identify their children’s father, which subsequently impedes the state’s ability to acquire paternal economic support. Furthermore, the life circumstances of many African American men make securing child support from noncustodial fathers an arduous if not almost impossible task. Indeed, approximately 60 percent of all 16- to 24-year-old African American men have no work experience at all (U.S. Department of Labor 1990). The jobless rate for African American men is more than double that of whites. Approximately 16 percent of African American men are unemployed—not including those who have essentially given up searching for work (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1992a). High levels of unemployment, underemployment and low wages, coupled with relatively low levels of education and high rates of incarceration, mean that these fathers are often unable to fulfill the traditional Western paternal economic provider role.

Specifically, we need an improved understanding of how African American men and women define and perceive paternal parenting roles for themselves. Similar to men, African American women have historically had social, cultural and economic experiences that differ markedly from other demographic population groups. African American mothers are more likely than other demographic groups to give birth out of wedlock and to have never married (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1992b). Those that do marry are more likely to divorce and less likely to remarry following divorce (Glick 1997). Additionally, these mothers are more likely to be employed outside the home and make substantial, if not the sole, contributions to household earnings (Glick 1997). Thus, they are less likely than other women to be economically dependent on
men. Since slavery, African American women and men have had to adapt to the reality that for many African American fathers, the means to provide a consistent level of economic support for their children's basic needs has often been tenuous. As a result, state-defined and -mandated roles and responsibilities may not correspond to African American women's or men's "ideal" of fatherhood. Policies based on state assumptions may not adequately address the experiences of African American fatherless families.

**Purpose of This Study**

This study intends to explore how adult African American never-married fatherless families define and perceive noncustodial fatherhood for themselves, given the historical and contemporary social and economic contexts of their lives. Specifically, this study will do the following:

1) describe how African American parents perceive the roles and responsibilities of noncustodial fathers;
2) describe the extent to which custodial mothers' perceptions and definitions of noncustodial fatherhood are consistent with those of noncustodial fathers and the dominant cultural "ideal" of fatherhood and;
3) describe what mothers do to enhance men's paternal responsibilities as they define them.

**Limitations of Past Research on African American Fatherless Families**

Past research provides valuable insight into the role of the father, and the general attitudes and behaviors of single-parenting mothers and noncustodial fathers. It is, nevertheless, limited. Social, political and legal efforts to improve the social and economic well-being of African American fatherless children are confounded by a lack of sensitivity to the reality of African American family life for "fatherless" families. Past studies tend to focus on either custodial mothers or divorced noncustodial fathers. Furthermore, studies on the attitudes of single mothers tend to focus primarily on divorced white women. In addition, past studies of noncustodial fathers have generally focused on the experiences of mostly white divorced fathers. Still other studies tended to focus on African American teenage mothers and/or fathers whose
parenting experiences and perceptions were subject to stressors and conditions unique to adolescence (Allen and Doherty 1996).

Overall, past findings do not adequately address the attitudes and experiences specific to African American never-married custodial mothers and the noncustodial adult fathers of their children. Current evidence provides little insight into how adult African American mothers perceive the roles and responsibilities of noncustodial fathers. We know even less about how African American never-married parents perceive the role of the father as it relates to providing socially, emotionally and economically for their shared offspring.

The broad, long-term aim of the study is to provide the knowledge and comprehension necessary to enable policy makers to create social policies that reflect the social and economic experiences of African American fatherless families. Additionally, the study will provide a foundation to help researchers and practitioners develop and institute social programs that effectively improve the health and well-being of African American children.

What We Know About the Definition, Roles, and Responsibilities of African American Noncustodial Fatherhood

There does not appear to exist a clear, concise definition of the roles and responsibilities of African American noncustodial fatherhood. In general, what African American single-parenting mothers expect from noncustodial fathers, as yet, is ambiguous and ill-defined. We know that social policies attempt to combat the negative conditions of single-parenting families primarily by pursuing noncustodial fathers for formal payment of child support, and by implementing various changes in welfare policy. Yet, many African American single mothers have found that social policies attempting to address the economic well-being of their children have, to date, been largely ineffective. As Geiger (1995) argues, all mothers and children do not benefit equally from legislated child support. Only one-third of all African American mothers and their children are granted child support payments compared to two-thirds of whites and 41 percent of Hispanics (Geiger 1995). The probability of obtaining child support also varies with marital status. According to Hill (1997), in 1989 77 percent of divorced mothers were granted child support compared
to just 24 percent of those who had never married. Moreover, many noncustodial fathers tend to pay inconsistently or not at all (Arendell 1986; Furstenberg and Cherlin 1986). In addition, while most African American births are to unwed parents, many African American unwed mothers do not officially name the father of their child. Thus, there is no named father to pursue for any form of child support. Moreover, high levels of unemployment, underemployment, and low wages make securing sufficient child support from African American fathers through legislated means largely ineffective (Geiger 1995).

In general, the concerns of many single-parenting mothers seem to be consistent with some of the elements social policy attempts to address. A study focusing on divorced white mothers found many were dissatisfied primarily with fathers' participation in the lives of their children, particularly in terms of the economic support noncustodial fathers appear to provide (Arendell 1986). Additionally, many white divorced mothers and adolescent mothers say that noncustodial fathers do not spend enough time with their children and that they would like for their children's fathers to participate more in the lives of their offspring (Arendell 1986). Still, we know very little about the attitudes and perceptions never-married adult African American single mothers have of the fathers of their children, or how they expect for them to behave in their paternal role.

Stack's (1974) study of a Midwestern African American community provides some insight into how African American fatherless families perceive and define the fatherhood role. Her findings suggested that a single-parenting African American mother generally regards her children's father as a friend of the family whom she relies upon for assistance of varying forms. In a more recent study Stack (1986) found that 70% of fathers of 1000 children on welfare acknowledged their children and provided them with kinship affiliation. However, only 12% of those acknowledging paternity provided their children with economic support.

Overall, it seems noncustodial fathers and custodial mothers, in general, may not always agree on noncustodial fatherhood roles and functions. An earlier part of this study found that African American fathers placed emphasis on the socio-emotional elements of fatherhood (Hamer 1997). Additionally,
the findings of other researchers (Allen and Doherty 1996) indicate that African American noncustodial fathers tend to place emphasis on both their economic and social roles. Nonetheless, it seems that when noncustodial fathers do play a role it tends to be recreational and social rather than instrumental (Furstenberg and Nord 1985).

Efforts to secure adequate social, emotional, and economic support for children from African American fathers is impeded not only by a continued lack of understanding and information on how fathers perceive these aspects of parenting, but also by an inadequate knowledge of how African American single mothers interpret these fathers' attitudes, roles, functions, behaviors, and how they interact with fathers in regards to the care of their children.

Methods

This study used personal in-depth interviews as the primary means of data collection. The interview consisted of several close-ended questions to obtain basic demographic information about respondents, their children, and custodial mothers' and noncustodial fathers' respective relationships with one another. The majority of the interview consisted of open-ended questions designed to explore the attitudes and ideals custodial African American women and the fathers of their children have with regard to roles and responsibilities of these fathers.

The open-ended format permitted women and men to explain, in their own words, their attitudes, definitions, and parenting experiences. Collecting data via personal open-ended interviews is consistent with the descriptive nature of this study. Personal interviews are also necessary because respondents will be asked for personal information that they may not provide unless the researcher develops trust through personal contact. This methodology is appropriate for this project because of the nature of the research. African American single mothers have rarely been the focus of qualitative research studies that attempt to comprehend the relationship between single mothers and noncustodial fathers. Additionally, it is rare that such studies are conducted by a researcher indigenous to the population.
This exploratory qualitative research will enable the discovery of in-depth meanings, understandings, subjective experiences, and qualitative attributes of fatherless families (Leininger 1994). While qualitative methodology does not claim predictive value, it can furnish the dimensions of time, history, and cultural context to the study of social life and lifeworld patterns (Orum et al. 1991). Overall, this research will obtain respondents’ interpretations of fatherhood in their own words, and position these accounts in their broader ecological social context.

Sample

The respondents were a convenience sample of 25 never married, former couples drawn from the population of a Midwestern city. The city’s population is approximately 66,000. Forty-four percent of the population live at or below the poverty line. Sixty-six percent of the households are headed by single-parenting African American women. The primary criteria used in selecting participants were race/ethnicity. African American adult single-parenting females and the adult fathers of their children were the only respondents selected for participation. Additionally, only those who had children (aged 2 to 18 years of age) at the time they were contacted for possible study participation were selected for interview. Each respondent was interviewed separately.

The Findings

The Definition of Fatherhood

These couples were asked to discuss noncustodial fatherhood. Specifically, they were asked to define their conception of the “ideal” father. Mothers’ definitions tended to reflect the ideals often espoused in Western society, and tended to emphasize fathers’ economic role. This seemed to be the emphasis regardless of the amount of economic support mothers received from fathers. Fathers, on the other hand, tended to emphasize the importance of social and emotional roles. And, in fact, they rarely mentioned child support or economic provisions unless prompted by the interviewer. These couples express attitudes similar to most study respondents:
Mother

A father is first biological. He takes care of the child he helped bring into this world . . . By that I mean he sees to it that his children have what they need to stay healthy. For example, enough food to eat and a roof over their heads. He provides for their everyday needs.

Father

A good father is one who understands when don't nobody understand. One to be the backbone for them to lean on . . . A guide they can call on.

*****

Mother

He makes sure that his kids are well fed, have decent clothes and a good way of life . . . The father should be someone that the mother can count on to help with the children's medical, food, school, discipline and everything.

Father

A good father puts his family first, above all else. He's a role model to his daughters and his sons. He's the strong shoulder for them to cry on. Now, he loves them unconditionally but he disciplines them when the mother ain't strong enough to do it.

*****

Mother

He should love his children. Take care of them by seeing to it that they want for little or nothing. He should see to their financial needs and help the mother with raising them, especially if he has sons. Then he should spend a lot of time with his sons.

Father

The father is the one who provides provisions but more importantly he shows them the way . . . He's somewhat or should be somewhat the leader. He handles situations and keeps the family safe and together . . .

*****
Fatherhood

Mother

The ideal father makes enough money to take care of his child and himself and is educationally prepared to handle that . . . He spends time with the child, too.

Father

He provides security for his children. They can count on him when there’s trouble or if they’re going through something. He’s a source of strength. Like my kids know they can always turn to me when they’re having difficulties with their mother. I’m here for them.

Mothers defined fathers as those whose primary responsibility was to meet the economic needs of their children. This included payment of medical bills, providing for shelter, food, clothing, and other essentials. Fathers, on the other hand, defined fatherhood in terms of providing protection and security, and serving as a role model to offspring. While the two definitions are not contradictory, they do suggest that mothers and fathers have different expectations of what men are supposed to do as fathers.

Initial Expectations

Prior to the birth of their child, mothers generally expected that noncustodial fathers would provide economic, social and emotional support to them and to their children. Yet, more often than not the paternal behavior mothers initially expected was not fully realized after the birth of the child. Three couples shared their experiences:

Mother

Before the baby was even born, we sat down and had long talks about what we were going to do for our child. I felt good about our talks but I also had a feeling that it was just talk. Especially, because during the later part of my pregnancy he started messin’ with another woman. At that point, I did not want anything to do with him. All I wanted was for him to pay child support, which to this day, has not happened. However, that is all I wanted and expected from him.

Father

She wants me to help take care of my son. Before Damien was born we made plans, partially fantasy but partially I wanted things to
work out between us... for the baby... How things turned out the way they did is she decided to kick me to the curb. So then there wasn't much I could do. I did wrong. I admit that. And when I did wrong we just stopped communicating like we had been... I expected that she would eventually let me see my boy and she did. How that happened was I just kept calling to check on her and our son, broke her down. So that's what I do. I spend time with him when I can, send things over. That's somewhat different from what she really wants from me.

*****

**Mother**

We never really talked about what he was supposed to do. In a way, I told him. See, I would tell him I need diapers; I need for you to take her to the doctor; I need for you to watch her, I need money, that sort of thing. Because I expected him to be part of her life even though he didn't live in the house. I expected him to be a mother and a father to her just like I was... I expected financial help.

**Father**

She expected me to be a father and help her out as much as possible. I go above and beyond the call of duty when it comes to my daughter. I know I do more for her than many men out here. The only thing I knew about being a parent was from watching my mother and my uncle a little. The result was that, basically, I learned one day at a time once my daughter was born. I didn't know nothing about getting the milk warm, burping, changing diapers. But her mother expected me to help her with all that. So that's what I did at first and I continue today to do help take care of her.

*****

**Mother**

I expected him to be there for me and the baby. To love us unconditionally. To help with the finances, the doctor bills, the diapers, the formula, everything. I expected him to be a good father. In my last trimester I told him no more sex. Well, of course, that did it. Things cooled off real quick like and he went and found him some somewhere else. That devastated me when I found out, because he always told me he loved me and that he wanted us to be a family... Even then though, I still thought he'd be there for the baby. But he never has been really.
Fatherhood

Father

We had a falling out about this and that otherwise I think we would have eventually got married. She's the marrying type. When she told me she was pregnant I was real angry and upset. I tried to talk her into having an abortion because I knew I wasn't ready to be a father. I couldn't afford to take care of child. But she wasn't having none of that and I talked to my mother about it a little. After awhile I started to get excited about being a daddy. We made plans, where we was going to live, me finishing school, getting married. I was into it one-hundred percent. But, like I said, we had a falling out and I figured she just didn't want me around her or the baby. It got to the point that every time I would try to talk to her she would be yelling at me. Telling me to go to hell and shit! I figured that was a clear message to keep away. So I just make arrangements with her mother to visit my daughter or bring her toys and clothes... I do this every now and then.

Overall, mothers and fathers felt that there was no "understanding" or general agreement between them with regard to men's paternal roles and responsibilities. Women tended to make demands of fathers, while fathers seemed to remove themselves from the situation—placing the blame for their actions on the shoulders of mothers. These men felt they were being pushed away from their children. In contrast, mothers felt they and their children were being abandoned.

Roles and Responsibilities as Parents

While mothers and fathers were asked to describe the "ideal" father and their initial expectations of parenthood, they were also asked to discuss the actual roles that each played in providing for the well-being of their shared offspring. What it is exactly they do as a mother or as a father. They were also asked to describe the role of the other parent. The following examples reflects the responses provided by most couples:

Mother

What I do is primarily to make sure he [son] has what he needs like clothes, pay the rent for a place to stay, food, the basics. I take care of him on the day-to-day basis, everyday. When he's sick I'm his nurse. When he has a problem I talk to him and ask his daddy or my brother to. It's my job to spank him when he needs to be taught
a lesson. His father, on the other hand, does very little. I have never received child support... Though there has been a few occasions when he gave me ten or twenty dollars to get clothes or boots or whatever... What he does do is he will buy him birthday presents, take him over to his mother's on the holidays especially, take him to the movies on occasion if it's something he wants to see... he sees him a couple of times a month at least but that's about all.

**Father**

My role is to basically be their to support my son's mother. She pretty much provides for his everyday needs. I'm their to support her getting him the extra things he needs and help to get some essentials. Then too, I also try to spend time with him and this is most important because in this way I stay in touch with what's going on in their lives and they know I'm there for them... So my role is to do what his mother can't or won't do... I take them to the show, spend time with him, get him extra things to make his life better... Then see, my biggest role too, is teaching him how to be a man, a black man... because that's something that his mother definitely cannot teach him... how to defend himself, how to act out here in the world, how to associate.

*****

**Mother**

With my kids I am the primary caretaker. I see to their health needs, make sure they get to the doctor, to school, pay all the bills so that we have a roof over our heads, help them with their homework as much as I can. It's rough but that's my role as a mother. I'm their mother and a black single mother and I do for my kids what my mother did for me... Their father, he provides some things... I would say the role he plays is an important one because the kids love him. He talks to them on the phone a lot. He takes them to McDonald's every now and then. He does not have financial role as far as the kids are concerned.

**Father**

My attitude about my role is this, I do what I can. I try to do the very best that I can for my kids. That means I make sure that when I have money I do for my kids. I buy them something or take them somewhere, to the museum or zoo. I talk to my kids, I'd say, about
Fatherhood

every day I'm on the phone checking on them, asking them how's school. Now, their mother all she wants me to do is give her money, which I do when I can. But I think it's more important that I spend time with them and if they need something and she can't get it then I'll try my best to see to it that they somehow get it... As far as her role is concerned, she would tell you that she does everything. That's not true and she knows it. She is a good mother, though. She makes sure they have breakfast, lunch and dinner and other material things. She makes sure they have a quality place to stay.

******

Mother

I take care of my son and my daughter. I make sure that they are healthy, dressed appropriately and all that. I make sure that they eat properly. I buy the right kind of food. I make sure that they can participate in sports and school activities no matter how much it costs because it's important that they are exposed to many different things. My son wanted to play the trumpet so I made sure that he got a trumpet. We used to have a little apartment when they were younger but it was cheaper for me to come live with my mother... This way the kids can go outside more. I got a swing set for them a few Christmases ago... My role is to take care of my kids in all ways. Now, my son's father really does not spend any time with him and really contributes nothing to raising him... He has been in and out of jail twice... So I recognize that it's difficult to pay child support when you're in jail. I will give him credit, though, because he asks his family to help me out... so I think he does what he can. My hope is that now that he's out of jail that he will stay out, stay off the streets and try to do right by his son, spend time with him. Get a job and help me with expenses. My daughter's father was killed when she was three so he has no role but she knows his family. They are very much a part of her life and they have always been helpful towards me.

Father of Son

Well, my role is limited by my occupational hazards, you could say. I haven't had much of a role because as I've told you, I've been in jail, prison. As a way to be a father that's not the best way... I try to make sure he's [my son's] safe. I have my brothers and sisters keep up with him and make sure he stays on the straight and narrow. I
call him, let him know I'm thinking about him. I did this even when I was locked up, I made it a point ... Since I'm out I'd like to spend time with him more but his mother wants me to be straight first ... Get my act together ... Really, his mother does for all his needs, she is really like a mother and a father in the role that she plays. You name it. She does it. That's all there is to it.

Overall, the actual roles and responsibilities fathers perform do not seem to correspond with mothers' definitions of "ideal" paternal behavior. Few of these fathers offered economic assistance on any consistent bases. Rather, the roles they played were consistent with their own definition of fatherhood, which emphasized socio-emotional parental support. Yet, even in this arena fathers fell short of their own and mothers' goals. Both men and women felt fathers were not doing as much as they possibly could for their children.

**Encouraging Fathers' Paternal Responsibility**

Mothers expressed a general frustration with fathers. Nevertheless, they felt they should do their best to encourage fathers' economic and social participation in the lives of their children. These mothers discussed their methods of encouraging men's paternal behaviors:

Mostly, I just try to get him to spend time with her. Show her that he loves her ... I ask him to help out [financially] but only when I know it's something Jewel [daughter] really needs. That way I know he'll give it to me. Any other time he sees me as hounding him for money.

If I ask him for money and he says "I don't have it," then I try not to make a huge deal of it. Otherwise, we start arguing and shouting and the result will be what? He won't even come around to see Marcus (son) anymore ... I try to keep things even and stable so when I tell him he should pick up Marcus, there won't be no hassle about it.

See men will come around when they want something. And you know what they usually want. But then as soon as you ask them for something, they're gone. Ask them for money and you'll see they forget your name, their child's name, your phone number. So you have to let them think they're in control. Let them give you things
when they feel like it. Ask them for things at just the right time. Otherwise, you ain't going to get anything from them.

I let him be part of the family. For the kids' sake. Even though sometimes he helps with the payments and sometimes he doesn't.

Mothers generally felt that without their verbal encouragement and/or their employment of various subtle strategies, fathers would pay little or no attention to their offspring. However, some fathers interpreted this "encouragement" as an effort to control their behavior and curb their freedom. Two fathers explained:

Most times, when I call, she's pissed off at me because I called late, or I changed my mind about something, or didn't return her phone call. That's usually it—that I didn't return her phone call right away. I say, "We ain't married! We ain't in a relationship! I don't answer to you!" The only reason I tolerate her is for my son. Other than for him we probably wouldn't associate. She has yet to comprehend that she can't tell me what to do. She makes it hard for me to be a father sometimes.

She tries to get me to do right by her and my children. She makes me take on my responsibilities with them. She does her best at that . . . I pick them up from school, make sure they always safe, cook, put them to bed . . . I don't think I'd be a good father if Shandra didn't force me from the start . . . She's a good mother . . . The problem is this, though, when we argue, it's usually because she thinks I'm disrespecting her by my lady friends. But I never bring women around my children, never. I don't smoke or drink around them either . . . But, you see, at the same time I can't let her try to control my life . . . not just because we have children together . . .

Overall, fathers expressed a general fear of being "tied down" to family. While mothers conducted the day-to-day activities of parenthood, fathers tended to value the freedom that accompanied a noncustodial parenting status. For men, this liberty took precedence over women's expressed desire for them to be more accountable and attentive to their children. Mothers often found themselves "putting up" with poor paternal behavior in an effort to maintain some bond between fathers and children. They felt they valued the father-child bond more than the fathers
themselves. Mothers often expressed frustration and resentment for the fathers they described.

Improving Paternal Participation

In this section, both mothers and fathers agree men could do much more to meet their paternal obligations and improve participation in the daily lives of their children. Mothers tended to feel that fathers could, if they so wanted, "focus more on their responsibilities," "spend less time satisfying their own needs" and "make more of an effort" to meet the needs of their children. Fathers generally agreed that they could do more for their children, but cited many external barriers that hindered their ability to do so. Mothers, too, recognized barriers to men's paternal behavior but generally felt that these could be overcome "if fathers put forth a sincere effort." Two couples talked about what fathers could do better:

Mother

The first thing he could do better is to get out of jail and stay out of jail. This certainly would make a difference in my eyes as far as his children are concerned. I understand the world is not kind to black men. However, at some point these men need to decide what's best for their children. Jail is not the answer. In Keith's case, he had choices. He chose the wrong way and now me and our child are suffering because of it.

Father

I do my best for my child given my life circumstances and situations I've gotten myself into. I've had hard times all my life and I just went the way of my father, ended up in jail a couple of times. I think that if my father had been around more for me then I would have been a better man to Freda and a better father to Jellissa. People are the product of their environment and I'm no different. Right now I'm trying to do better by them. All I ask is for them to have a little patience with me.

*****

Mother

I would like for him to spend more time looking for a better job. More time playing with his son and seeing to his needs. I've told
him that . . . He'd rather be out hanging out with his boys, going to
the clubs, having different women. If he wanted to he could give
me a little money every week or month and just be around his son
on a consistent basis. But he doesn't want to. No, he ain't got time
for that. I told him he's going to regret it because one day his son's
not gonna want to have anything to do with him.

Father

I think I do pretty good as fathers go but there's always room for
improvement. That's how I look at it. It's hard to be a father when
you don't live in the same household as your child. Then what I
have would be his, automatically . . . I think if I lived in the same
household then I wouldn't have to go out of my way to spend
time with him because I'd be around, part of the furniture. As it
is, though, that's not the case. Now, to see my boy I have to arrange
it around his mother's schedule or my schedule. So if you look at
it from that angle, then you might say I do pretty good as a father,
given the circumstances of living apart. I can do better only if the
circumstances change themselves.

*****

Mother

Understand that I think he does a good job as a father, especially
compared to other men out there. But black men today always have
excuses. Even if they don't live with their children that doesn't mean
they have to be a part-time daddy. They keep blaming everyone
else for them not doing what they're supposed to do. Black men are
always complaining about the white man keeping them down, they
can't find a good job, they can't get no good education, they can't buy
a car. All that may be true, but what's stopping them from getting a
second job, or taking night classes. Black men can do better if they
want to and my daughter's father is no different. Women are tired
of their sorry excuses for not being a daddy all of the time. Excuses
don't pay the bills or help a child feel better when her daddy forgets
to call.

Father

Yeah, I think I can improve, definitely. Me and her have talked about
it some . . . what I can do better and what she can do better. She's
understanding of my situation and my habits, that's why she'll
always be my lady. My daughter, she thinks the world of me. She is the joy of my life. She’s the reason I decided to change some of my habits, stop hanging with the wrong crowd so much. So things are changing that will help me be a better father to her.

From mothers’ perspectives fathers seem to invariably have excuses for not providing optimal care for their children. Even though fathers admit they could do better, they also say that there are internal and external factors such as work schedules, bad habits, jail time, etc., that prohibit them from doing so. These mothers state they understand the hardships that these fathers, as well as many black men, experience. Yet, they also express a weariness with the justifications men regularly provide to defend their decision not to be better parents. For many mothers, being a good father is largely a matter of choice, which few external barriers can control.

Economic Support

Given their consistent emphasis on the importance of fathers’ economic provider role, mothers were asked whether or not they formally pursued fathers for formal payment of child support. In general, most mothers expressed a reluctance with regard to seeking legal assistance. Yet, five mothers had attempted to obtain consistent child support payments through the courts or state collection agencies. These women explained why they chose such formal means:

I knew he could afford to take care of his child. That’s what he’s supposed to do. I knew he wasn’t going to pay just because I told him to, or because his momma told him to; all those avenues had been tried . . . He’s too selfish. So I took him to court.

He was taking care of his other children and I knew he could afford to take care of this one. I talked to him a lot. I warned him about what I would do. I told him I’d sue his ass! He didn’t believe I’d go to an attorney . . . but that was the only way . . . I didn’t really want it to be that way because I knew once I made the decision, he would essentially be out of our lives.

I felt like I should give him a chance to be a good father. He kept telling me that once he got another job he would help out. I was very, very patient with him. I did not want to take him to court for the money. I think, mostly, I was afraid of losing him . . . But, after
awhile, I felt like this was the only way I could be sure I was going to get help. I really needed the support . . .

While these few mothers chose a legal option to obtain child support, all perceived this as a final resort. And, generally they only utilized the option after months of informal negotiating and communication with fathers proved unsuccessful. However, most mothers chose not to pursue child support through the legal system. Several mothers explained:

Black people, we handle things on our own. We don’t need lawyers or judges. The first thing they’re going to do is throw the man in jail. Then what? I still don’t have money coming in. And worse, now baby really ain’t got a daddy.

Well, I didn’t see a need for all the trouble. He does what he can. Nobody can make him give more than what he has.

At first, I thought he was going to be there for us . . . that he’d do his best. I didn’t think it was necessary to get a lawyer. I didn’t even think about it . . . Now, I just don’t think it’s worth it because there are too many bad outcomes possible. One, they could arrest him. Two, my daughter won’t have the opportunity to get to know him better. Three, he will truly, truly resent it and then I won’t get any help . . .

These and most other mothers felt that even if they sought legal action, little would result. Many felt it would be a “waste of time.” Given their work and family commitments, “time” was an element these women felt they could not spare. They understood that formally seeking child support would require numerous meetings with attorneys and several court dates, all of which would necessitate their missing work and losing wages. Additionally, they expressed a fear of alienating the father by forcing him into a public forum. Further, a few mothers feared the father would be taken into legal custody for nonpayment and subsequently cut the father-child bond. For most mothers then, these “costs” outweighed any potential benefit they might receive from an award of child support, particularly since they also tended to believe that little if any child support would result from court actions. For many mothers, the best and most reliable options to secure any form of paternal support involved informal communication and persuasive approaches. “At least this way,” said one mother, “I know he will at least come and visit his son.”
Conclusion

These mothers' specific definitions of "ideal" fatherhood tended to reflect the traditional Western standards. However, their definitions contrasted sharply with those expressed by fathers. Similar to white divorced mothers (Arendall 1986), these African American never-married custodial mothers tended to define a "good father" primarily in economic terms. For them, a good father was one who provided adequate financial support for his children's care and well-being. However, unlike white divorced mothers of past studies, these mothers expressed a reluctance to use legal channels to pursue fathers for formal payment of child support. In fact, the majority chose not to do so at all, for fear of causing legal difficulties for noncustodial fathers or jeopardizing the paternal-child relationship.

These mothers distinguished between their ideal image of fatherhood and its reality in their own lives and communities. They generally felt noncustodial fathers rarely met their standards. Mothers generally acknowledged the existence of hardships and disadvantages for African American men in the labor market. Yet, they simultaneously expressed a frustration with men whom they felt did not work hard enough to overcome the various obstacles confronting them, particularly given fathers' financial responsibilities to their children. Mothers were also frustrated because they felt they themselves faced many obstacles and hardships; and yet were not deterred from meeting the needs of their children.

Fathers, on the other hand, tended to define fatherhood primarily in terms of their expressive roles. Consistent with the findings of an earlier study (Hamer 1997), these fathers discussed the importance of being a role model, a guide, and source of social and emotional support for their children. In terms of providing economic support or child support, these fathers perceived their function as one intended to support their children's mother in her role as primary caretaker. In this regard, many provided toys, and purchased clothing and miscellaneous items for children on an "as need" rather than consistent basis. These fathers correctly perceived that while they emphasized social and emotional paternal roles, money was what custodial mothers wanted them to provide
most. Many fathers admitted shortcomings in their paternal behavior and felt they could improve. However, contrary to most mothers, who equated paternal improvement with consistent economic support, noncustodial fathers equated it with spending more time with children and various other social elements. Those acknowledging paternal shortcomings perceived them as consequences of past or current circumstances and "situations" which they often felt were beyond their control. Despite explaining their paternal inadequacies on external terms, these men generally felt that given their circumstances, they were performing "better than most men" with regard to fatherhood.

Overall, it appears that African American, never-married, custodial mothers really want financial support from noncustodial fathers. Yet, they also value the social and emotional roles fathers play in their children's lives. The problem, as they see it, is that they often receive neither on a consistent basis. The problem for policy makers and social work practitioners who primarily emphasize paternal economic responsibilities is that mothers are willing to forego economic support in lieu of the social and emotional support fathers provide. These findings suggest that while mothers express an interest similar to the state with regard to child support, they simultaneously "understand" that fathers are not likely to provide child support monies regularly. Furthermore, they are generally quite reluctant to pursue any legal recourse to obtain such support for fear of jeopardizing the paternal-child bond, the fathers' freedom from the criminal justice system, or their own relationship with the father. Indeed, evidence indicates that low-income fathers are more likely than those with higher incomes to be arrested for nonpayment of child support (Hill 1997). And having low income or being in poverty are conditions African American men experience disproportionately. Thus, mothers tend to settle for what they can get from noncustodial fathers and generally do not make adamant economic demands of them. Rather, they attempt to encourage fathers to play a social role with their children, and call upon them for economic support only when they are fairly certain it will be received.

While well-intended "efforts have been aimed at showing how U.S. social welfare philosophy and policy have affected people of color, rarely—if ever—are the cultural values or worldview
of people of color used as a conceptual foundation to describe how social welfare philosophy and policy should look... [Schiele, p. 23, 1997]. Neither mothers' nor fathers' attitudes, definitions, or behaviors with regard to paternal roles and responsibilities are completely compatible with the goals of the state. In the eyes of many African American women and men, what is best for their children often has little to do with economics. Rather, the presence of fathers, and the social and emotional bond that develops within a father-child relationship are integral to the well-being of fatherless children. And it is a support fathers can provide independent of their economic circumstances. Federal and state policy-makers have the power to work with African American families to foster and strengthen the father-child relationship by redefining fatherhood and implementing policies that emphasize its social and emotional elements. As Hartman (1995) states:

> Public policy reflects prevailing beliefs and values. Further, public policy is not only descriptive—it is also prescriptive. It not only reflects values... it also creates and recreates them through its enormous power to reward and punish, to encourage and prohibit, to shape behavior and exert control. [p. 183]

The continued punitive pursuit of non-paying noncustodial fathers may compel many African American fathers to turn away from their children and thwart African American mothers' attempts to maintain paternal involvement. Moreover, the demand for adequate and consistent child support payments seems almost ludicrous given the state's unwillingness to do what is necessary to insure that African American men have fair and equal access to permanent full employment, and pay sufficient to meet the daily needs of themselves and their families. Noncustodial fathers are more likely to pay child support when they earn adequate incomes (Meyer 1992).

Given the reluctance on the part of governments to guarantee living wages and adequate benefits, it is in the best interest of the children and African American families for states to develop and support programs and policies that will encourage men's social paternal responsibilities regardless of their ability to provide consistent financial support. Programs such as those offered by "The Fathers' Center" in East St. Louis, Illinois, and Charles
Ballard's Centers in Ohio and Washington D.C. specifically address the economic and social experiences of African American men, promote responsible paternal behavior and attitudes, and encourage mothers and fathers to work together to provide for their children. These centers and others are examples of what should be incorporated into programs of states' family service agencies. States must also offer incentives to companies to encourage fathers of all occupational and income levels to attend parent-teacher meetings and children's extracurricular functions, and to discourage employers from penalizing men for attending to the needs of their children (Tift 1995). Until the state emphasizes the expressive aspects of paternal responsibilities and provides for the full-employment of African American men, it is likely that custodial mothers will continue to meet the needs of their children by any means necessary, despite the assumptions, policies, and well-intended goals of current policy.

References


This study was partially funded by the Office of Research and Projects, Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville. The author also wishes to express appreciation to Clarence Lang and Steve Hansen for their assistance in the preparation of this manuscript.
Social Support's Contribution to Reduced Welfare Dependency: Program Outcomes of Long Term Welfare Recipients

FRANK A. SANSONE
University of West Florida
Department of Social Work

Long term welfare recipients participated in a state job training and welfare reform demonstration which provided education, job training, and supportive services via intensive case management. Social support research has focused on stress and physical and psychological health outcomes not welfare job training and education outcomes. Job training and welfare to work policies and programs have not emphasized providing social supports but the supportive services of transportation and child care. Program outcomes at follow-up included: education and job training certificates, including GEDs with some still studying; jobs; and a 50% reduction in welfare receipt. Results of hierarchical regression analysis suggest a participant's social support made a significant and meaningful contribution to reduced welfare dependency for “hard to serve” long term welfare recipients. Social support was more important than the length of time receiving welfare. Implications for social support theory, welfare to work policy and programs, job training, evaluation, and case management are discussed.

Following the passage of the Family Support Act of 1988, the state funded an education and job training reform demonstration for long term welfare recipients to the agencies responsible for the Job Opportunities and Basic Skills program (JOBS) and the Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA). This study examined the relationship of social support to program outcomes related to reduced welfare dependency for long term recipients of Aid to Families of Dependent Children (AFDC), defined as receiving continuous cash assistance for two years or more.

Women and Poverty. The “feminization of poverty” (Okagaki, 1989; Abramovitz, 1988) is no myth. The number and percentage
of women and children in poverty has increased (Evanson, 1988), with single female parents becoming the largest poverty group in America with over 40% of all female-headed households with children living in poverty (Evanson, 1988; Okagaki, 1989). By the time of follow-up, 46% were in poverty (U.S. Department of Commerce, 1995), with over 50% of families headed by black and Hispanic women subsisting below the poverty line compared to 27% for white female heads of households (Okagaki, 1989). Children were an increasing proportion of those in poverty (Evanson, 1988; Catanzarite & Ortiz, 1996). For the most part, those in poverty are women who have become single parents and poor as a consequence of separation, divorce, and/or children born out of wedlock (National Commission on Children, 1991). As single parents they often lack the resources to overcome their deficits and barriers to employment and require supportive services and special efforts of assistance (Boruch, R. F., Dennis, M., & Carter-Greer, K., 1988).

The U.S. Department of Labor (Johnston & Packer, 1987) estimated by the year 2000 more than 80% of new labor force entrants will be women and minorities, with 50% of jobs requiring education and/or technical training beyond high school. Concerns about government budget deficits, the American family's economic well-being, and the changing views of society about women's role influenced the shift in the expectation that even mothers with young children should be employed. This shift placed additional pressure on the welfare system for able-bodied mothers to be employed. The welfare reforms of the Family Support Act's JOBS Program emphasized providing education and job training with supportive services of child care and transportation for recipients able to work.

**Local Context.** At the time of passage of the Family Support Act of 1988 and the implementation of this state demonstration, an economic recession was beginning with the number of people receiving AFDC continuing to grow along with state budget deficit concerns. AFDC provided assistance for about 140,000 persons of 56,500 families in the state at a cost of $15 million a month. An average assistance unit included one parent and two children who received $291 a month in cash, $260 in Food Stamps,
Social support, welfare and work. Persons in poverty who seek social services bring with them a host of characteristics representing past failures and/or negative memberships (Falck, 1988). Those in poverty experience difficulty and stress (Belle, 1983; Falck, 1988) in seeking relief through income maintenance and related social services. An employment and training program and the opportunities offered to welfare mothers also introduced stress and change. Participants brought to the program characteristics internal to themselves, dispositional factors, and those external to themselves, environmental or ecological factors (Maguire, 1983;
Sansone, 1993). These factors may be considerable and consist of perceived as well as real barriers to successful program participation and completion (Sansone, 1993).

The emphasis of job training and welfare reform programs has not been the provision of social support but removal of barriers to participation (Boruch et al., 1988; Cottingham, 1991; Gueron, 1997; Riccio & Orenstein, 1996) by providing tangible aid via the supportive services of transportation and child care. However, social support has been extensively studied (Shumaker & Brownell, 1984) with associations having been drawn between social support and numerous health and mental health outcomes (Cohen & Syme, 1985; Cohen & Wills, 1985; Gottlieb, 1983), particularly stress. Social support (Cohen & Wills, 1985) has been conceptualized as having a buffering or direct effect on stress and physical and psychological outcomes.

Caplan (as cited in Gottlieb, 1983) suggested social support systems contain supportive others who provide individuals with information and cognitive guidance, tangible resources and aid, and emotional sustenance. Cobb (as cited in Shumaker & Brownell, 1984) added the importance of the person believing she is cared for and loved, esteemed and valued. Building on those definitions, Thoits (1982) viewed social support as interactions which meet basic social needs either through socioemotional or instrumental aid. Cohen and Syme (1985) defined social support as psychological or material resources provided by others. Fiore, Becker, and Coppel (1983) suggested the perceived availability, adequacy and quality of social support is more important than the actual quantity of social support, and may explain more about effective coping than the actual frequency of support. Important to the exchange is the social support should match or fit the need of the person, also known as the stressor-support-specificity model (Cohen & Wills, 1985; Gottlieb, 1983; Vaux, 1985; Kahn, 1978). Generally, social support is assumed to function in a stressor-specific way (Cohen & Wills, 1985; Sarason & Sarason, 1985), being effective in reducing negative influences of stressors when there is congruence between stressors and support resources.

Social support is viewed in subjective or objective terms. Subjective or perceived social support is interpreted as a cognitive appraisal process, and objective social support as pertaining to
actual interpersonal transactions, while some see social support as both (Gottleib, 1983). Social ties (Granovetter, 1973; Specht, 1986; Thoits, 1982) may not only improve a person's well-being, but may enhance people's immunity to physical and psychological illness, help in problem-solving, coping, and moving through a transition, and improve chances for positive outcomes. Few studies have explicitly measured the relationship of social support with non-health related outcomes, such as jobs and education and training (Hilbert & Allen, 1985; Sansone, 1993).

This study's question emerged out of interviews of program staff and participants conducted for an evaluation report to the legislature at program end (Shomaker & Sansone, 1990). Those interviews suggested a special relationship between participants and staff and the influence of social support, not explicitly addressed in the evaluation, and the need for further study. The current study's question was addressed as part of the follow-up evaluation two years later in 1992. Does a participant's perceived social support contribute to program success and reduced welfare dependency for long term welfare recipients?

Method

Sample. There were 104 long term welfare recipients who participated in the program, with 91 (87.5%) successfully contacted at follow-up two years after the program ended. The purposive sample was made up of long term welfare recipients, defined as receiving continuous cash assistance for two years or more before intake. For the sample, the length of time receiving AFDC (Table 1) ranged from 2 to 20 years (M = 9.59, Mdn = 6). AFDC grant amounts ranged from $131 to $435 per month (M = $289) and 95% received food stamps (M = $186). Participants ranged in age from 18 to 59 years (M = 30.82; Mdn = 30), 59% were African-American and 41% white, had 1 to 6 dependent children (M = 2.33; Mdn = 2.0), and 38% of the parents had a child under 6 years. Of the sample, 21% had completed high school, 79% were school dropouts, grades completed ranged from 4 to 14 (M = 9.92), and 29% were assessed as reading below seventh grade, and 65% reported one or more jobs prior to the program, and two barriers (M = 1.97). The means of the characteristics of study
participants and nonrespondents were compared and did not differ significantly.

Procedure. This study employed a multiple methods research design (Miller, 1991). Data were collected through agency pre and post program forms at intake (1988) and at program end two years later (1990), with a standard social support measurement scale and structured interviews administered at follow-up four years after intake (1992). Respondents completed the interview and an informed consent form in about 20–30 minutes, and were offered a gift for participating.

The General Population form of the Interpersonal Support Evaluation List (ISEL; Cohen, Mermelstein, Kamarck, & Hoberman, 1985) was used to measure social support, the independent variable. The ISEL consists of 40 statements on an individual's overall social support, defined as the perceived availability of social resources, with 10 items for each subscale representing the four support functions: appraisal support (perceived availability of someone to talk to about problems); belonging support (availability of others to do things with); self esteem support (availability of a positive comparison of self to others); and tangible support or instrumental aid. Cohen et al. (1985) report adequate validity and reliability of the ISEL.

Two hierarchical multiple regression models were developed to analyze the relationship of the indicator variables with success. Success was defined as reduced welfare dependency outcomes, such as a job, education and job training completions, a GED, and no AFDC or a reduced amount. Indicator variables were entered into each model based on theoretical considerations and a logical chronology (Tabachnick & Fidell, 1983) from pre through post program as follows: first, participant characteristics, such as age, race, and highest school grade completed; second, the number of jobs held prior to the program, the length of time receiving AFDC, and the number of barriers to participation; and third, overall social support in Model 1 and the four types of social support in Model 2.

According to Tabachnick and Fidell (1983), the goal of research using regression is to enhance the knowledge about the relationship of an outcome variable (success) with a set of independent or
indicator variables. The advantages of multiple regression are in its ability to treat continuous and dichotomous variables alike and allow more than one indicator variable to be analyzed, whether correlated or uncorrelated (Pedhazur, 1982). A limited number of characteristics should be entered into a regression model (Craft, 1990; Tabachnick & Fidell, 1983; Pedhazur, 1982), because the size of $R^2$ has been shown to be most influenced by sample size and the number of indicator variables. A ratio of 10 subjects or more for each indicator is advised (Craft, 1990).

Findings

Participant outcomes representing program success and reduced welfare dependency were reported at follow-up two years after program end (Sansone, 1993; Shomaker & Sansone, 1990), as follows: 31% (28) had received a GED, with 8 still attending, and 50% had a high school degree or more; 34% (31) were working at follow-up, with 75% (68) having worked sometime between program end and follow-up; 50% of the sample were not receiving AFDC, with the mean amount of cash assistance reduced from $289 to $138 a month; and 22% were not receiving food stamps.

At intake the total AFDC amount received by the sample was $26,276 a month or $315,312 annually; however, by follow-up the total amount was 52% less at $12,597 monthly and $151,164 annually, a reduction of $164,148 a year. Program services were provided at a cost of $365,000, at an average cost of $3510 a participant (Shomaker & Sansone, 1990). Data reflected participants continued to work on goals. A woman employed as a nurses aide (CNA) said, "I was tired of AFDC but thank God for it, but... want to be independent; ... I plan to get a nurse's license; though I did not pass the GED test... , I plan to reach that goal." A woman who received AFDC for 6 years and got her GED was working at an ad agency, but planned to continue the computer training she got in the program.

Pearson correlations were computed for variables believed to influence program outcomes. From the bivariate relationships, a limited number of variables were selected for the model. Four outcome measures of program completions through the time of follow-up were analyzed, including: education and job training
(certificates, GEDs, or degrees), working, and AFDC status; and
found to be intercorrelated and measuring similarly. A com-
posite variable success was constructed for participant completions
scored from 0–3 to represent program outcomes leading to re-
duced welfare dependency. The composite variable success was
analyzed in relation to the four derived outcomes and yielded
significant correlations (r = .62, .70, .47, and .79, p = .01).

Table 1 presents the means, standard deviations, and variable
definitions. Success was defined as program outcomes leading
to reduced welfare dependency. Table 2 presents the correlation
matrix of variables in the analysis and used in the hierarchical
regression models.

**Correlations with social support and success.** The analysis (Table 2)
indicates participants who perceived a higher level of overall
social support resources were associated with having more suc-
cess outcomes or reduced welfare dependency, holding more
jobs prior to the program, and having less participant barriers
at intake. The length of time receiving AFDC had a significant
negative correlation with success, indicating those who received
AFDC for less time had more success outcomes and less welfare
dependency. A participant who got her Nurses Aide certificate
(CNA) said “I passed CNA training with flying colors, but I didn’t
get the GED; that was the main thing I wanted; I had to quit my job
because I couldn’t find someone to care for my (disabled) son.”

Of the four support functions (Table 2), those who perceived
more available belonging support and self esteem support had
more successful outcomes that contributed to reduced welfare
dependency. Participants having jobs prior to the program re-
ported more belonging support, self esteem support, and tangible
support or aid, suggesting those who had pre program work
experience perceived more available support resources. As with
overall support, those reporting less appraisal support, belonging
support, self esteem support, and tangible support have more
barriers to participation and program success. Race or being black
had a significant correlation with less appraisal support (someone
to talk to about problems), and those participants with more com-
pleted school grades at intake reported more appraisal support.
One participant revealed, “my computer teacher was someone
Table 1

Regression Model: Means, Standard Deviations, and Definitions of Indicator Variables, Social Support, and Success Outcome

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Label Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Success</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>.99</td>
<td>Reduced Welfare Dependency—outcomes of education, training, a job and no/or less AFDC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>30.82</td>
<td>8.12</td>
<td>Participant Age @ Intake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>Race (W = 0, B = 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>9.92</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>Highest school grade completed @ Intake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior job</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>Number of jobs held prior to program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time AFDC</td>
<td>9.59</td>
<td>4.92</td>
<td>Length of time participant received AFDC assistance in years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barriers</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>Number of Barriers to participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Support\textsuperscript{a}</td>
<td>30.58</td>
<td>6.86</td>
<td>Overall Social Support from ISEL, perceives support resources available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal Support\textsuperscript{b}</td>
<td>7.43</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>Someone to talk to about problems, measured by ISEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belonging Support\textsuperscript{b}</td>
<td>7.55</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>Having someone to do things with, measured by ISEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Esteem Support\textsuperscript{b}</td>
<td>7.57</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td>Availability of a positive comparison of self to others, measured by ISEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangible Support\textsuperscript{b}</td>
<td>8.011</td>
<td>2.345</td>
<td>Instrumental aid perceived as available, measured by ISEL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: \textsuperscript{a} Regression Model 1 includes overall social support and preceding variables (Table 3)
\textsuperscript{b} Regression Model 2 includes 4 types of social support and preceding variables except overall social support (Table 4)
N = 91 except for prior job (N = 85)
Table 2

Correlation Matrix of Variables Used in Hierarchical Regression Analysis Models 1 and 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SUCC</td>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>RACE</td>
<td>GRADE</td>
<td>PRIOR</td>
<td>BARR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. SUCCESS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.046</td>
<td>.112</td>
<td>.178</td>
<td>-.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. AGE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.118</td>
<td>-.036</td>
<td>-.161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. RACE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.076</td>
<td>.052</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. GRADE LEVEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. PRIOR JOBS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. BARRIERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. TIME RECEIVED AFDC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. OVERALL SOCIAL SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. APPRAISAL SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. BELONGING SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. SELF ESTEEM SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. TANGIBLE SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: *The significance level is not provided for the correlation coefficients.
Table 2
Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TIME</td>
<td>SUPP</td>
<td>APPRAIS</td>
<td>BELONG</td>
<td>ESTEEM</td>
<td>TANG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. SUCCESS</td>
<td>-.229*</td>
<td>.266**</td>
<td>.173</td>
<td>.240*</td>
<td>.318***</td>
<td>.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. AGE</td>
<td>.384***</td>
<td>-.100</td>
<td>-.086</td>
<td>-.060</td>
<td>-.162</td>
<td>-.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. RACE</td>
<td>.223*</td>
<td>-.097</td>
<td>-.185*</td>
<td>-.134</td>
<td>.073</td>
<td>-.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. GRADE LEVEL</td>
<td>-.259**</td>
<td>.146</td>
<td>.191*</td>
<td>-.142</td>
<td>.108</td>
<td>.061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. PRIOR JOBS</td>
<td>-.296**</td>
<td>.261**</td>
<td>.160</td>
<td>.194*</td>
<td>.227*</td>
<td>.268**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. BARRIERS</td>
<td>-.033</td>
<td>-.323***</td>
<td>-.231*</td>
<td>-.334***</td>
<td>-.238*</td>
<td>-.257**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. TIME RECEIVED AFDC</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>-.133</td>
<td>-.162</td>
<td>-.142</td>
<td>-.144</td>
<td>-.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. OVERALL SOCIAL SUPPORT</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>.793***</td>
<td>.857***</td>
<td>.811***</td>
<td>.807***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. APPRAISAL SUPPORT</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>.588***</td>
<td>.545***</td>
<td>.532***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. BELONGING SUPPORT</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>.660***</td>
<td>.544***</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. SELF ESTEEM SUPPORT</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>.502***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. TANGIBLE SUPPORT</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: N = 91 for variables in analysis except PRIOR JOBS (N = 85)
*p < .05, **p < .01, ***p < .001 (one tailed)
who encouraged me, saw the positives in me, and I could talk to her about my problems." Another participant said, "I still think of my nursing teacher who counseled me; she respected students as adults and helped, not like some other teachers who didn't seem to care."

Correlations of participant characteristics. Age had a significant negative correlation with race and a positive correlation with length of time receiving AFDC, indicating for this sample black women were younger, and older women had received AFDC assistance longer. In addition, those who received AFDC longer were more likely to be black, have less formal education, less employment experience, and considered to be harder to serve, and less prepared for employment or "job ready." A participant still attending computer classes at the community college, reported circumstances similar to others. "Before (program and this apartment) I lived in a house with no indoor plumbing and a wood cookstove, no car and 15 miles from town, no money and very little food in the house, and very little self esteem, ... I felt hopeless. My case manager always kept in touch ...; staff were willing to stand by me, without them I'd dropped out of the program; ... not a lot of friends ... family was little support; my math teacher encouraged me and helped a lot." Many noted the GED program needed to be longer for them.

By program end, there was a recession which severely limited job opportunities, even for women with new skills. Although the goal of the program was to train for and get better paying non-traditional jobs for women, few achieved that goal. Of the 34% who were employed, most jobs reported were considered traditional for women, including: hotel/motel housekeepers, school and hospital custodians, certified nurses aides, child care workers, and clerks. A woman employed as a hospital custodial worker and who had received her GED and was trained and briefly employed as a milling machine operator, expressed with dismay, "no woman is going to get a decent job in this area while men are being laid off."

Hierarchical regression analysis of success, participant characteristics, and social support. Two blockwise or hierarchical regression models were developed to further examine the relationship of
social support and participant characteristics with the success outcome, as follows: Model 1 with participant characteristics and the overall social support score (Table 3), and Model 2 with the same participant characteristics and the four types of social support (Table 4). The results of the block entries for participant characteristics for Models 1 and 2 were as follows: age, race, grade completed (Block 1), prior jobs, barriers to success, and length of time receiving welfare (Block 2), and the four types of social support (Model 2, Table 4, Blocks 3 and 4), were all found not significant.

Model 1: Overall Social Support. An analysis of the Beta weights in the block summary indicated overall social support made a significant and meaningful contribution to attaining program success and reduced welfare dependency, Beta = .27, t(85) = 2.25, p = .027. The length of time receiving welfare being less (b = -.24) was relatively important and approached significance in relation to program success, with other indicators not significant. Model 1 explained 13.2% of the variance in participant success or reduced welfare dependency, with social support explaining 5.7%.

Table 3

Model 1: Hierarchical Regression of Indicator Variables, Overall Social Support, and Success Outcome

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>R² Chg.</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Block 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>GRADE ATTAINED</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.344</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>RACE</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.534</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>PRIOR JOBS</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.381</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>BARRIERS</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.804</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>TIME REC'D AFDC</td>
<td>.075</td>
<td>.061</td>
<td>-.24</td>
<td>-1.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>SOCIAL SUPPORT</td>
<td>.132</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>2.25*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: *p < .05
Table 4

*Model 2: Hierarchical Regression of Indicator Variables, Four Social Support Types, and Success Outcome*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$R^2$ Chg.</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>$t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Block 1</td>
<td>1 GRADE ATTAINED</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.458</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 RACE</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.097</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 AGE</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 2</td>
<td>4 PRIOR JOBS</td>
<td>.035</td>
<td>.298</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 BARRIERS</td>
<td>.099</td>
<td>.843</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 TIME REC'D AFDC</td>
<td>.075</td>
<td>.061</td>
<td>-.22</td>
<td>-1.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 3</td>
<td>7 TANGIBLE</td>
<td>.099</td>
<td>.024</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 4</td>
<td>8 SELF ESTEEM</td>
<td>.29</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9 APPRAISAL</td>
<td>-.05</td>
<td>-.364</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 BELONGING</td>
<td>.163</td>
<td>.065</td>
<td>.056</td>
<td>.348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SUPPORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a meaningful contribution. As noted by Pedhazur (1982), for the purposes of policy and practice, the criterion for the increment of $R^2$ should be meaningfulness not solely statistical significance.

The relative importance of any two indicator variables to a criterion variable can be determined by analyzing the betas and calculating the ratio of the squares of the respective betas (Craft, 1990). In Model 1, the ratio for the significant beta of overall social support indicated social support was most important and accounted for 1.27 times the variance in reduced dependency or success in comparison to the next important indicator, less time receiving welfare. The relative importance of social support compared with a participant’s age accounted for 3.72 times the variance in success. Time receiving AFDC was compared with
age and yielded a ratio almost three times (2.94) the variance attributed to age. This analysis also indicates overall social support was most important, followed by length of time receiving welfare, and less closely by age.

Model 2, four types of social support. Table 4 presents results for the entries of participant characteristics, tangible support, and the three socioemotional supports, appraisal, belonging, and self esteem, all not significant. An analysis of the Beta weights in the block summary revealed self esteem support approached significance.

An assessment of the relative importance of the standardized beta coefficients in accounting for the variance in success or reduced dependency indicated self esteem support \( (b = .29) \) was almost twice as important (1.91) as less time receiving welfare \( (b = -.24) \), which in turn accounted for almost twice the variance (1.82) explained by age. The analysis was used to assess the relative importance of self esteem support in comparison to the three other support functions. The results of the ratio analysis indicated self esteem support was 26.8 times more important than belonging support \( (b = .056) \), 33.6 times more important than appraisal support \( (b = -.05) \), and 52.6 times more important than tangible support \( (b = .04) \) in accounting for the variance in success or reduced dependency. Although a necessary precondition, tangible support and time on welfare have been the focus of welfare reform not providing the socioemotional support which accounted for more reduced dependency.

Model 2 with the four social support types was considered an improvement over the first model with an \( R^2 \) increment of .024 for tangible and .065 for the socioemotional support functions. Model 2 increased the variance explained by the four support functions to 8.9% and the total \( R^2 \) to 16.3%, compared to Model 1 with 5.7% explained by overall social support and a total \( R^2 \) of 13.2%. Model 2 also illuminated the important role of the socioemotional function of self esteem support compared to tangible support. Social support, especially the socio-emotional function of self esteem, made a meaningful contribution to reduced welfare dependency. Further research is needed of social support and factors influencing success for long term welfare recipients.
Limitations. The purposive sample of long term welfare recipients were selected by workers from their caseloads. Random selection and withholding services in order to randomly assign were not political or ethically feasible options with state and local administrators, and are design threats (Campbell & Stanley, 1963). Findings are limited to this long term welfare sample. More successful outcomes may have resulted if not for start up delays limiting program services to 15–18 months.

Despite limitations, the research was important to do because, first, social support had not been studied with participants of job training and welfare reform. Although mentioned and implied as a factor in discussion sections of welfare to work studies, social support was neither part of the program design and evaluation nor explicitly measured in relation to outcomes. Second, welfare reform's emphasis has been on the supportive services of transportation and child care, with case managers as brokers of limited services to large caseloads, not as a social support source. Third, social support theory and research needed to be expanded to program outcomes other than health. Fourth, this researcher felt compelled to follow-up on earlier interviews of long term welfare women who revealed to me their stories and the importance of their special relationships with program staff in providing the social support they needed to go on. And last, the potential to contribute to policy and program designs for long term welfare women with minimal resources and little social support. Hard to serve recipients will soon reach time limits under the latest reforms.

Discussion

This research has introduced a different application of social support theory by examining its contribution to program outcomes indicative of reduced welfare dependency. Social support theory and research has emphasized health and psychological outcomes, such as reduced mortality and depression. This study's findings suggest a participant's social support resources made a significant and meaningful contribution to the attainment of reduced welfare dependency outcomes. The four social support functions, appraisal support (someone to talk to about problems), belonging support (others to do something with), self esteem
support (availability of a positive comparison of self to others), and tangible support (someone to help, e.g., with rides) explained more of the variance in reduced welfare dependency. Self esteem support made a meaningful contribution to explaining program success and was relatively much more important than other support functions and participant characteristics in explaining reduced welfare dependency. Participants often commented during follow-up interviews the importance of case managers, staff, and teachers being encouraging and helpful in building motivation and confidence.

Research on social support (Cohen & Syme, 1985; Cohen & Wills, 1985) has focused on its main or buffering effects on stress, and in relation to physical and psychological health outcomes rather than program outcomes for welfare recipients. As noted by Belle (1983), women heads of households in transition from welfare to work and living in poverty were presumed to be dealing with more stress and extensive barriers. Findings reported here indicate tangible support or the necessary supportive resources were perceived as available by participants. Participants generally noted they were helped with transportation and child care; however, some had difficulties. One mother said “I had to quit my job because I couldn’t find someone to be there with the kids after school.” With the necessary condition of providing tangible supportive services (child care and transportation), the socioemotional functions of social support, especially self esteem support (having a positive comparison of self to others), became the critical difference in helping this sample of long term welfare recipients attain program outcomes leading to reduced welfare dependency and greater self-sufficiency.

Current welfare policy at the state and national levels limits welfare assistance to two years to prevent welfare from ‘causing’ dependency. Although the human investment model has been shown to be effective, the debate continues on whether education and job training should be provided, how much, and how long should recipients take to become self sufficient. This study revealed social support resources were more important than the length of time receiving welfare in accounting for reduced dependency. Although results also indicated participants who received AFDC assistance for less time were more likely to attain program
success outcomes when accompanied by social support resources. Participants also indicated: “I needed more time to get my GED; I enrolled to get off welfare. . . . I want a job that pays more and keeps me off.” Data also indicated that after the program ended participants continued to make gains and had goals to continue to seek the GED and other improvements. “My goal is to get my GED; . . . I want to show my kids; if I can do it they can too.”

Policies limiting time to two years which emphasize labor force attachment over human capital investment services are unrealistic for the “hard to serve” participant with more barriers and less education, job skills, and work experience. Programs need to take into account that persons previously unsuccessful with education and employment and not job ready are harder to serve. Hard to serve participants of welfare to work programs will require job training be bridged by relationships with staff and case managers which provide social support resources leading to increased self sufficiency. The emphasis on time limits undermines the goals of reducing dependency and adequate preparation for employment for long term welfare recipients.

Typically, evaluation studies of welfare to work and job training programs (Boruch et al., 1988; Gueron, 1995, 1997; Riccio & Orenstein, 1996) have examined many of the factors included here, with larger samples and random assignment, but without an explicit measure of social support in relation to outcomes. Prior research (Gueron, 1995, 1997; Riccio & Orenstein, 1996) has reported the long term benefits of the human capital investment model with education and job training, over the labor force attachment model with quick placement in low paying jobs that keep women in poverty. This study suggests social support theory was one of the missing ingredients in “the black box” of welfare to work program theory and designs (Riccio & Orenstein, 1996). Social support needs to become an integral part of job training and welfare to work programs and their evaluations.

Social support implies a relationship. Fundamental to social work practice is the very relationship we establish with another (Falck, 1988) whom we may call “client” within the context of need that influences what happens next. It is in being human in the practice of social work we assist an individual to traverse the barriers to personal and community resources and self-sufficiency.
Within the context of the conflicting policies of welfare programs and services, staff must meet and make contact with persons in need of assistance and aid them in attaining program outcomes (Sansone, 1993).

Findings suggest it is important for case managers and program staff to deliver services within relationships perceived by long term welfare recipients as socially supportive. Although some view the case manager’s role and function as a way to coordinate, manage, and limit services and costs, research (Maguire, 1983; Moxley, 1989; Specht, 1986; Weaver & Hasenfeld, 1997) indicates the need for emphasis on the participant relationship within the traditional comprehensive social work role of case management. Staff must facilitate the development and maintenance of clients' social support networks as potential resources. This includes becoming a member of a participant’s social support network and a resource (Falck, 1988; Moxley, 1989; Specht, 1986).

Although this study’s purpose was not to determine whether the sources of social support were informal or formal, participant interviews revealed some had special supportive relationships with program staff. Participants declared their job skills teacher, GED teacher, and, more often, case manager “was the only one who believed in me”, “encouraged me to get my GED”, “was someone I could talk to about my problems”, or “was my best friend.” Other studies (Brownell & Shumaker, 1984; Cohen & Wills, 1985; Fiore et al., 1983; Vaux, 1985) have reported the importance of having a confidant or intimate for support. Further research is needed to address the sources of social support and the support networks of women who are long term recipients of welfare in transition to work. What are the roles and contributions of providers of formal support (paid staff and professionals) and informal support (family and friends) in regard to participation and success in welfare reform programs of long term recipients?

This study’s examination of social support theory and its contribution to “the black box” of a welfare reform program will hopefully broaden the research on social support beyond psychological and health outcomes. Policy makers, program planners, administrators, and staff of welfare to work and job training programs need to be aware of the importance of formally including...
the provision of social support resources with the other support-
itive services intended to reduce barriers to successful program
participation and reduced dependency.

Welfare reform and job training programs, through their case
managers, social workers, job trainers, and teachers, first need
to engage the participant in a relationship which allows for the
exchange and provision of social support in order to improve the
attainment of "bottom line" program results and reduced welfare
dependency. For program staff to be able to provide social sup-
port to participants, the following recommendations are offered:
caseloads need to be of reasonable size, social support training
needs to be provided and be integral part of case management
training, and administrators need to set formal expectations for all
staff to attitudinally and behaviorally integrate social support into
their role responsibilities and their relationships with participants
in the delivery of program services.

References

Abramovitz, M. (1988). Regulating the lives of women: Social welfare policy from
colonial times to present. Boston: South End Press.
L. Lein & M. B. Sussman (Eds.), The ties that bind (pp. 89–111). New York:
Haworth Press.
Foundation's experiments on minority female single parent program. Eval-
women of color and white women. In D. Dujon & A. Withorn (Eds.), For
crying out loud: Women's poverty in the United States (pp.121–140). Boston:
South End Press.
functional components of social support. In I. Sarason & B. Sarason (Eds.),
Social support: Theory, research, and applications, (pp. 21–37). Dordrecht, the
Netherlands: Martinus Nijhoff.
Press.
Cohen, S., & Wills, T. A. (1985). Stress, social support, and the buffering hypo-
Social Support and Welfare Outcomes


Institutional Ethnography: 
Studying Institutions from the Margins

BRIAN J. O'NEILL 
University of British Columbia 
School of Social Work

As new approaches to the development of knowledge emerge in the social sciences, there is a need to judge their appropriateness for use in social work research. Using criteria for assessing the goodness of fit between theories and social work values, this article evaluates institutional ethnography, a strategy for studying institutions which is based on feminist standpoint theory. The author holds that the use of institutional ethnography in social work research is congruent with social work principles and effective in producing knowledge which can inform practice. Discussion of a study of Canadian social work education from the standpoint of gay men illustrates this argument. Implications for social work research and education are discussed.

Social work ethics require that professional practice be based on an accurate understanding of the problems it addresses and on methods which are effective. For more than a decade there has been a spirited debate among social work scholars regarding the approach to research which is most appropriate in the development of knowledge for the profession (Allen-Meares, 1995; Atherton, 1993). Given the strength of arguments on all sides of this debate, there is a need for a framework for evaluating theories for use in social work research.

Stanley Witkin and Shimon Gottschalk (1988) have proposed such a framework, arguing that social work research should be informed by theories which are consistent with the profession's values and have the potential to produce knowledge useful in practice. They suggest that the appropriateness of theories for use in social work research be judged in relation to their “... explicit criticalness, recognition that humans are active agents, grounding in the life experiences of the client, and the promotion of social justice” (Witkin & Gottschalk, 1988, p. 222).
One of the newer approaches to the development of knowledge is feminist standpoint theory, which Mary Swigonski (1994) recommends for use in social work research, particularly in understanding the needs of marginalized populations. This article presents an evaluation of institutional ethnography (Smith, 1987), a strategy for the study of social institutions which is based on standpoint theory, in relation to the criteria proposed by Witkin and Gottschalk. The suitability of institutional ethnography for use in social work research is demonstrated through discussion of an investigation of social work education from the standpoint of gay men (O’Neill, 1994).

The examination of these issues is presented in five sections. The first section briefly outlines the paradigms that inform the development of knowledge in the social sciences and highlights the debate as to the most appropriate approach for use in social work. The second section introduces standpoint theory and outlines institutional ethnography. The third section summarizes a study of social work education from the standpoint of gay men. The fourth section evaluates this use of institutional ethnography in relation to the criteria proposed by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988). The final section addresses implications of this analysis for social work research and education.

Diverse Approaches to Knowledge Development

Egon Guba and Yvonna Lincoln (1994) identify four distinct paradigms which shape social science research: positivism, postpositivism, critical theory, and constructivism. Positivism and postpositivism are both characterized by the assumption that an objective reality exists. Within the positivist framework, it is believed that reality can be accurately perceived by eliminating the biases of the investigator, distorting influences from the environment, and errors in data gathering. In contrast, within the postpositivist paradigm, it is recognized that due to the complexity of events and the limitations of science, extraneous factors cannot be completely controlled and therefore, the veracity of findings cannot be definitively established. While both positivist and postpositivist studies usually involve quantitative data collection, postpositivist inquiries may also include qualitative data gathering.
In common with positivism and postpositivism, critical theory is rooted in the belief that there is a knowable world (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). However, critical theorists argue that reality is shaped by ideologies which reflect the values and interests of dominant elites. Critical studies examine how largely hidden social processes disadvantage people on the basis of class, gender, ethnicity, and other differences, and aim to identify strategies for emancipatory change. Inquiries conducted within the critical paradigm incorporate the values of both investigators and research participants as key components of the research process. Both quantitative and qualitative data gathering methods may be used in critical studies.

In contrast to the positivist, postpositivist, and critical paradigms, constructivism is based on the assumption that reality is socially constructed, depending on an individual's social location and experiences (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Identifying and understanding the values of both researchers and participants are central to the production of findings within the constructivist paradigm. Generally, qualitative methods are used in constructivist studies to understand human experience in relation to its context.

The debate within social work. Since the 1950s, studies based on positivist and postpositivist assumptions have been predominant in social work research (Fraser, Taylor, Jackson, & O’Jack, 1991; Irving, 1992). More recently, arguments have arisen that inquiry conducted within these paradigms is too narrow to meet the needs of social work, a profession which deals with the diverse needs of human beings in complex and ever changing social contexts (Heineman, 1981; Imre, 1984; Pieper, 1985, 1989, 1994; Rodwell, 1987; Tyson, 1992, 1994). Further, Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) contend that these approaches may result in research designs which treat participants as objects and threaten their self-determination. These authors advocate the use of constructivist approaches which recognize and illuminate the complexity of human behavior, take account of values inherent in research theories and methods, and recognize the influence of the investigator on the research process.

Feminist and postmodern social work scholars challenge the faith in rationalism upon which social work has traditionally been
based (Brown, 1994; Leonard, 1994; Rossiter, 1995). They hold that positivist and postpositivist approaches may at best, be irrelevant, and at worst, support oppression by ignoring gender, race, sexual orientation and other differences which are used to disadvantage people in our society. Swigonski (1994) contends that goals of objectivity, freedom from contamination by interactions between investigators and research participants, and universal generalizability conflict with social work commitments to respecting human diversity and advancing social justice.

Critics of research carried out within the critical and constructivist paradigms contend that such studies fail to produce knowledge which can be confidently used in social work practice (Bloom, 1995; Thyer, 1989; Wakefield, 1995). They point out that because non-positivist studies utilize samples which are not representative of a specified population, their findings are not generalizable and therefore cannot reliably inform social work practice with members of that population. These scholars also question the validity of the findings of critical and constructivist studies because of the lack of control of variables and the possible influence of investigators' values on data collection and interpretation.

Pragmatists assert that investigators should use the approach most appropriate to the state of knowledge in the area of inquiry and the type of data needed to answer the research question (Allen-Meares, 1995; Gambrill, 1995; Hartman, 1994; Reid, 1994). Some scholars, such as W. David Harrison (1994), advocate integrating principles and methods from each of the paradigms. However, Guba & Lincoln (1994) argue that there is a contradiction inherent in this position given the incompatible assumptions which underpin the various frameworks. The next section outlines standpoint theory and institutional ethnography, approaches which draw on both the constructivist and critical paradigms (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994).

Standpoint Theory and Institutional Ethnography

**Standpoint theory.** Standpoint theory is a critical epistemology developed by feminist scholars (Collins, 1991; Haraway, 1988; Harding, 1986, 1991; Harstock, 1983; Smith, 1987, 1990a, 1990b, 1992) which posits that a better understanding of reality can
be achieved by conducting research from the social locations of marginalized groups than from the positions of dominant groups. According to this theory, objectivity in the development of knowledge is impossible to achieve because all inquiry is conducted from a particular social location, which is determined by gender, ethnicity, class, and other differences. Standpoint theorists hold that knowledge developed from the positions of dominant social groups may be particularly flawed by the omission of information which could threaten the privileges of the powerful. Concomitantly, they contend that knowledge developed from the positions of subordinated groups may be more comprehensive because it can include insights about the disempowerment of women, racial minorities, gay men and lesbians, and other disadvantaged groups (Swigonski, 1994). Furthermore, because members of marginalized groups live within the dominant culture as well as their minority culture, they may have knowledge which is not available to members of the powerful groups in society (Riger, 1992). Thus, standpoint research can add to understanding not only of a specific minority group, but of the larger society as well.

The major criticism of standpoint theory from a positivist perspective is that research conducted from a particular social location is not objective. Sandra Harding (1991) and Donna Haraway (1988) counter that such knowledge is more accurate than that developed according to conventional criteria for objectivity because the social position and values of the researcher are made explicit. A criticism from a postmodern perspective is that standpoint theory is flawed by essentialism in that it implies that all members of a group share the same values and experiences (Brown, 1994; Riger, 1992). Furthermore, Charles Lemert (1992) argues that while standpoint theory rejects the possibility of knowing objectively from the position of dominant groups, it simply substitutes another location, that of marginalized groups. However, given the proposition that all knowledge is partial, standpoint theorists maintain only that it is possible to obtain a clearer understanding of society from a marginal standpoint than is possible from a dominant position.

Institutional ethnography. A unique contribution to standpoint theory has been made by Canadian sociologist Dorothy Smith (1987) in her development of institutional ethnography, a strategy
for investigating institutions from the locations of disempowered groups. Smith contends that the provision of education, health care, and social services is influenced by the values of dominant social groups, systematically disadvantaging members of marginalized groups. Furthermore, she argues that because the policies and practices of these institutions are presented as objective and universal, the links between social and material privileges and the factors upon which social stratification is based, are rendered invisible. For instance, Smith maintains that although mainstream institutions claim to ignore gender differences, in fact, they implement a patriarchal ideology which handicaps women. While Smith focuses on institutions from the standpoint of women, she recognizes that other groups such as aboriginal peoples, ethnic and racial minorities, as well as gay men, lesbians, and bisexuals are also disadvantaged.

Smith (1987) ascribes particular importance to the role of organizational and professional texts in ignoring and invalidating differences. By texts, she means not only documents such as legislation, organizational policies, and procedures, but also the social relations which flow from such documents. Smith uses the concept social relations, to refer to the processes by which people's lives are shaped to conform to dominant ideologies. She argues that texts shape social relations, including the delivery of services, to be consistent with dominant ideologies, thereby excluding issues related to race, economic status, gender, sexual orientation and other differences from discourse (Griffith & Smith, 1991). This lack of recognition of diversity forces individuals to conform to abstract definitions of reality contained in institutional texts. The result is that members of marginalized groups experience contradictions between their own lives and the version of reality upon which service delivery is predicated. Drawing on ethnomethodology (Garfinkel, 1967), Smith holds that traces of oppressive organizational practices are reflected in how people talk about their experiences in relation to the institution being studied. Studies regarding a wide variety of institutions and from the standpoints of various marginalized groups have been conducted using this approach (e.g., Campbell & Manicom, 1995).

The first step in the process of institutional ethnography is an examination of the experiences of members of the group from
Institutional Ethnography whose standpoint the inquiry is being conducted, in relation to the institution under study. The focus is on identifying discrepancies between allegedly neutral and nondiscriminatory institutional practices and individuals' experiences of marginalization. Subsequent steps entail identifying the social relations, particularly those emanating from institutional texts, which determine the contradictions identified. By exploring the links between respondents' experiences and the social relations which shape them, institutional ethnography can reveal how oppression is created and maintained through the functioning of social institutions. In order to illustrate the implementation of institutional ethnography in social work research, the next section describes a study of social work education from the standpoint of a marginalized group, gay men.

Canadian Social Work Education from the Standpoint of Gay Men

Although it has been recognized that gay people may have special social service needs, needs particularly related to discrimination (Shernoff, 1995; Woodman, 1995), there is evidence that the effectiveness of social services is limited by social workers' lack of awareness regarding same-sex sexual orientation (DeCrescenzo, 1984; Peterson, 1992; Rabin, Keefe, & Burton, 1986; Wisniewski & Toomey, 1987). This deficiency is significant because at least 10 percent of the population has some degree of sexual attraction to members of their own sex (Binson, Michaels, Stall, Coates, Gagnon, & Catania, 1995; Harry, 1990; Kinsey, Pomeroy & Martin, 1948; Sell, Wells & Wypij, 1995). Furthermore, in Canada discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation is prohibited by federal and most provincial human rights codes, as well as by professional ethics (Canadian Association of Social Workers [CASSW], 1994). In part, social workers' lack of knowledge, negative attitudes, and inadequate skills for serving gay, lesbian and bisexual clients may be due to gaps in social work education, given that social work students apparently receive little training regarding same-sex sexual orientation, despite previous identification of the need for curriculum content on the topic (Cain, 1996; Newman, 1989; Weiner, 1989). In order to better understand the factors which contribute to this shortcoming, O'Neill
Methodology. The design of this study was based on institutional ethnography. Data were gathered through interviews of gay men and examination of public documents related to Canadian social work education. Because the goal was to understand issues in social work education rather than to generalize about gay men, a purposive sample was used; respondents were selected on the basis of having had experience relevant to social work education. Lesbians were excluded from the study because their gender places them in a different social location than that of gay men (D’Augelli & Rose, 1990; O’Brien, 1994). The respondents were 37 gay men, including students, graduates, and faculty members from 11 schools of social work in 6 Canadian provinces, as well as clients of professional social workers. Most respondents were white, Anglophone, and middle-aged.

A committee of four gay men who had experience relevant to social work education provided consultation regarding the development and implementation of the study. The investigation entailed two phases. During 1992 and 1993, in semi-structured individual interviews, respondents were asked to recount their experiences related to social work education and to make any recommendations they felt important. These data were then analyzed to identify problematic issues for further investigation. Subsequently, national accreditation standards (CASSW, 1992), and policies, programs, and curricula of schools were examined to identify the determinants of these features of social work education.

Findings. O’Neill (1994) found that issues associated with same-sex sexual orientation were silenced, ignored, or marginalized within social work education. The men interviewed perceived the climate within their schools of social work to be unsafe for open discussion of same-sex sexual orientation and the curricula to lack appropriate content on the topic. Respondents reported occasional overt discrimination related to sexual orientation within schools. More frequently, these men experienced subtle and
indirect pressures to conceal their sexual orientation and to avoid discussion of gay-related issues. Specifically, respondents encountered covert threats to their careers, limited tolerance of openly gay men, resistance to discussion of same-sex sexual orientation, and denial of the seriousness of anti-gay discrimination. The respondents encountered few members of schools of social work who were open about their same-sex sexual orientation and a lack of course content on gay and lesbian issues.

The examination of organizational documents revealed a similar pattern of omission of gay related issues. Although discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation was prohibited by the accrediting body (CASSW, 1992), inclusion of gay related issues in the policies, programs, and curricula of schools of social work was not specified. This omission was reflected in official descriptions of schools of social work, which included only three references to sexual orientation. In contrast, both the accreditation standards and the descriptions of most schools specified policies and curriculum content regarding other differences, such as those related to ethnicity and gender.

Implications. O’Neill (1994) provides empirical evidence of the discrepancy identified by Dorothy Van Soest (1996) between official policies, which proscribe discrimination based on sexual orientation, and actual practices, which either ignore gay and lesbian issues or inhibit their discussion within schools of social work. Furthermore, the findings augment James Martin’s (1995) call for social work education policies and programs that create a safe climate for open discussion of same-sex sexual orientation by identifying objectives for change. Specific implications are that policies should affirm acceptance of same-sex sexual orientation as a valid expression of human sexuality and require effective measures to counter anti-gay discrimination and harassment; sexual orientation should be explicitly addressed in faculty recruitment and development, and in student selection and support; and content related to same-sex sexual orientation should be integrated into the core curriculum. In the next section, this use of institutional ethnography is assessed in relation to the criteria identified by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988).
Evaluation of Institutional Ethnography

How well does institutional ethnography meet the standards identified by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) for choosing theory to be used in social work research? Below, each of these criteria is discussed in relation to O'Neill's (1994) study of social work education from the standpoint of gay men.

Explicit criticalness. The first criterion proposed by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) is that the theory be expressly critical. According to these authors, critical theories challenge beliefs about the objectivity of social processes by pointing out that accepted explanations reflect the values of dominant groups. They argue that critical theories are particularly useful in revealing the functioning of oppressive ideologies such as those based on class, gender and race. Institutional ethnography is explicitly critical. Smith (1987) advocates investigating social institutions from the standpoint of marginalized groups specifically for the purpose of revealing how hidden subtexts, or ideologies influence organizational processes, disadvantaging those who differ from dominant groups.

Both the research design and findings of O'Neill (1994) demonstrate that inquiry based on institutional ethnography can meet the criterion for criticalness. The research design was critical in that the focus of the study was on social work education rather than the problems of gay men. The findings were critical in that they contradict beliefs that social work education is neutral with respect to differences of sexual orientation. For instance, a gay faculty member reported:

...I get students all the time... coming to me about... homophobic remarks... made by professors... and the refusal to allow gay and lesbian issues to come up, or the invalidation of those issues, ... teaching that it was an illness to be gay... (O'Neill, 1994, p. 86)

O'Neill (1994) provides evidence that a subtext with respect to sexual orientation functions within this institution, allowing the social relations of heterosexism, the systemic promotion of heterosexuality and suppression of same-sex sexual orientation (Neisen, 1990), to be examined.
Recognition that humans are active agents. The second criterion identified by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) for judging the consistency of theory with social work values is whether the theory takes into account that human beings can reflect on their lives, make choices, and influence events, rather than being simply reactive. Such theories promote individual and social change. Institutional ethnography implicitly meets this criterion in that its purpose is to provide information which can be used for institutional change. According to George Smith (1995), institutional ethnographies provide "... the scientific ground for political action" (p. 32).

The data gathering process, findings, and recommendations of O'Neill (1994) illustrate that research based on institutional ethnography can recognize that humans are active subjects rather than passive objects. In the interviews, respondents were asked to reflect on their experiences and to make recommendations regarding social work education. In their responses, the men interviewed consistently expressed the conviction that gay people can and must be active in bringing about changes. For example, a student asserted:

I don't know who's going to bring these things to the agenda of social work schools... if it's not gays and lesbians themselves. (O'Neill, 1994, p. 137)

The study provides an empirically based understanding of the social relations within social work education which can be used to advocate for change. For instance, the findings reveal that the relative silence experienced by gay men within schools of social work regarding same-sex sexual orientation echoes the absence of policies requiring schools to actively address issues of same-sex sexual orientation. O'Neill (1994) provides data which can be used to advocate for specific amendments to the CASSW accreditation standards and points to gay faculty and students, as well as supportive heterosexuals, as key participants in the change process.

Grounding in life experiences. The third criterion specified by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) is the extent to which theories accommodate the meaning which people ascribe to their experiences. They contend that it is particularly important that social
work studies incorporate the values, language, traditions, and perceptions of members of marginalized groups. This principle is central in institutional ethnography, which aims to "... explain the actual social processes and practices organizing people's everyday experience from a standpoint in the everyday world" (Smith, 1987, p. 151).

O'Neill (1994) shows how research based on institutional ethnography is grounded in the lives of the respondents. The data were gathered exclusively from gay men, documenting their experiences regarding social work education and the significance of these experiences to them. Furthermore, the data were interpreted in collaboration with an advisory committee of gay men, which contributed to an understanding of the data informed by their experience.

For instance, traces of oppressive organizational practices were identified in respondents' repeated use of words such as "scared," "invalidation," and "unsafe" in describing their everyday experiences in schools of social work. A respondent commented that he knew gay students at his school:

... who were scared about coming out, and scared about revealing who they were... this should be a safe environment... it wasn't... (O'Neill, 1994, p. 84)

The advisory committee recognized the significance of the language used by respondents and suggested that the way that issues of same-sex sexual orientation are excluded from discourse is through the maintenance of a social climate which is perceived to be dangerous for open discussion of gay-related issues. Subsequent analysis of social work education policies and procedures was shaped by this understanding, resulting in recommendations to make the climate safer for discussion of same-sex sexual orientation in schools of social work. The value of research grounded in the experiences of marginalized groups is demonstrated by the identification of this issue, which had not previously been reported.

*Promotion of social justice.* The fourth criterion defined by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) is the potential contribution the use of a theory can make to increasing respect for diversity and lessening
the exclusion of groups and individuals from full participation in society. This goal is the ultimate purpose of institutional ethnography. Smith (1987) asserts that for research to be emancipatory, it must be conducted from the standpoint of marginalized groups in order to expose the actual processes by which members of these groups are disadvantaged.

O’Neill (1994) exemplifies how knowledge gained through the use of institutional ethnography in social work research can promote social justice. In examining social work education from the standpoint of gay men, the study exposed evidence that oppression based on sexual orientation was of less concern in social work education than oppression based on other differences. As a professor commented:

... I don’t think that we’ve taken a stand in terms of social work education that heterosexism is on the same level as racism and patriarchy and all these kinds of things that are much more clearly defined as being something social work has to confront. (O’Neill, 1994, p. 122)

Thus the study contributes to the promotion of social justice by identifying the need for greater attention within social work education to heterosexism and homophobia. By providing detailed information about the systemic barriers which impede gay men’s full participation in social work education, the study also reveals how members of minority groups may be marginalized despite official prohibition of discrimination. These findings point out the need for policies which do more than simply proscribe overt expression of intolerance. Because the study explicates concretely how heterosexism subtly shapes social work education, it provides an empirical basis for developing strategies to effectively counter oppressive social relations and to enhance inclusion of issues of same-sex sexual orientation in schools of social work.

Conclusions

Evaluation of institutional ethnography in relation to criteria proposed by Witkin and Gottschalk (1988) suggests that this research theory is consistent with social work values and can contribute to the production of knowledge useful in practice.
Institutional ethnography involves the formulation of new questions about institutions based on the experiences of marginalized people. The findings of such studies can provide insight into how oppressive ideologies shape social relations within social services and social work education, disadvantaging certain groups. This understanding can be used to promote social justice through the development of more inclusive and emancipatory organizational policies and practices.

Institutional ethnography can be an effective approach to investigating various social institutions from the standpoint of diverse groups. For instance, it could be fruitful to investigate child welfare from the standpoint of aboriginal peoples, health care from the standpoint of ethnic minority groups, and rehabilitation services from the standpoint of persons with physical disabilities. Studies of social services from the standpoint of marginalized groups could enhance program evaluation, identifying unmet needs and unintended effects on members of these groups.

This review also suggests that institutional ethnography should be included in the research curricula of schools of social work, particularly in providing a link between research and practice at the organizational level. It could be used in identifying and addressing questions related to social policy, as well as program development, management, and evaluation. To gain a deeper understanding of the strengths and limitations of this research strategy, it would also be useful to compare a study of an institution done using a positivist or postpositivist research theory with a study of the same institution using institutional ethnography.

References


Brian Joseph O'Neill, DSW, is an assistant professor at the University of British Columbia School of Social Work, in Vancouver, Canada. The author would like to thank Dr. Betty Carter and Dr. Deborah O'Connor of the UBC School of Social Work for their comments regarding earlier drafts of the manuscript. Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Brian O'Neill, University of British Columbia, School of Social Work, 2080 West Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z2. Telephone: (604) 822-2460. E-mail: bneill@socialwork.ubc.ca
A Few Contributions of Economic Theory to Social Welfare Policy Analysis

MICHAEL A. LEWIS
State University of New York
School of Social Welfare

The National Association of Social Workers’ (NASW) code of ethics states that social workers have a professional obligation to advocate for social policies that promote the general welfare (NASW, 1996). Presumably, in an effort to provide social workers with the analytical tools that would allow them to do so, schools of social work typically require students to do course work in the area of social welfare policy. Although these courses provide students with valuable information, it is my view that they tend to be limited in one important respect. They usually do not contain a great deal of content on how technical economic theory can be utilized in the examination of many of the social welfare policy issues that are of interest to social workers. This is unfortunate because, despite having limitations of its own, economics provides a powerful set of conceptual tools that are extremely useful in the analysis of social welfare policy issues. The rest of this paper is an attempt to demonstrate the usefulness of economics in this respect.

Competing Ends, Allocation, and Opportunity Cost

Economics is usually defined as the study of the allocation of scarce resources among competing ends. Four terms in this definition need to be explained: resources, scarcity, competing ends, and allocation. Let’s first take a look at resources.

Machines, skills, knowledge, abilities, etc. that are used to produce/provide goods/services are what economists mean by resources. For example, the skills/knowledge of a social worker who provides family counseling are resources.

Scarcity has to do with the relationship between resources and the wants or desires of actors. Economists assume that resources are limited (e.g., there is not an infinite supply of social work skills/knowledge). The wants of actors, however, are assumed
to be unlimited (e.g., our desires for services provided by social workers are infinite). This situation of finite resources and infinite wants is what economists mean by scarcity.

Although scarcity is a core concept in economics (Lewis, 1957) it is my view that it is also one of the discipline's most problematic. To the extent it appears that scarcity exists, it is unclear whether this is due to a situation of finite resources and infinite wants. For example, there are about 40 million individuals in the U.S. who currently are without health insurance (Weiss and Lonnquist, 1997). Presumably, many of these individuals want health insurance but are unable to afford it. It is questionable whether this state of affairs is a result of the U.S. not possessing enough doctors, nurses, hospitals, etc. to meet these wants. Arguably, this state of affairs is more a consequence of political decisions than scarcity of resources. There are a number of public financial mechanisms (e.g., income tax increases, corporate tax increases, transfer of federal funds from the defense budget, etc.) that could be used to finance health insurance for these individuals if we had the political will to do so.

*Competing ends* and *allocation* are other economic terms that need to be explained. As economists see it, actors possess desires, ends, or wants. Some examples of actors are individual persons, families, social service organizations, and the federal government. Let's imagine that there is a single woman who has a two-year old son. She wants to stay home from work so she can raise her son, yet she also wants the goods/services she'd be able to purchase with the money she'd make from working. If this woman decides to stay home, her desire for these goods/services cannot be met. When desires “conflict” as do this woman's, economists think of such desires as competing with one another; hence the concept of *competing ends*. These types of situations require actors to make difficult choices. Our imaginary woman would have to decide whether she wants to indulge her preference for staying home with her son or the one for going to work to make some money. In the language of economics, this woman would have to decide how she is going to *allocate* her time between working and staying at home.

The hypothetical example about the woman is related to another important economic concept. In order to be able to stay
home with her son, the woman would have to forgo the goods/services she’d be able to purchase with the income she’d receive from working. This notion of the need to forgo some things in order to attain others is captured by the concept of opportunity cost. In economic terms, the opportunity cost of the woman’s indulging her desire to stay home with her son would be the goods/services given up as a consequence of her choice not to work.

From a social welfare policy point of view, a program could be enacted that would provide this woman with an income she did not have to work outside the home to receive. Such a policy could be based on the recognition that raising children is valuable work. If such a program existed, this woman would be able to raise her son and obtain some of the goods/services she desires. My intention here is not to argue the merits of such a policy. It is merely to illustrate how the concepts of opportunity cost, allocation, and competing ends are relevant to the social welfare policy concerns of social workers.

Market Failures

In economic theory, the term market refers to a set of sellers and buyers who exchange goods and services. Markets serve as the means by which many of the goods/services produced in our economy are distributed. Those willing and able to purchase specific products at specific prices at specific points in time are allowed to receive those products. Those unwilling and/or unable to do so are not allowed to receive them. One of the primary concerns of policy oriented economists is the following question: under what conditions is government justified in “interfering” with market distribution of goods/services (Stevens, 1993 and Stiglitz, 1988)? This is obviously a question social workers are interested in too, and economists’ answers to it constitute some of the most important contributions of economic theory to the examination of social welfare policy issues.

According to economic theory, markets ought to be the sole mechanisms of distribution unless at least one of the following three conditions are met: 1) the good/service in question is a public good 2) the good/service generates externalities in production or consumption or 3) the market in which the good/service is distributed is characterized by imperfect information. Public goods,
externalities, and imperfect information are examples of what economists call market failures. When such failures exist, economic theory tells us that governmental actors can justifiably intervene into markets and effect the distribution of goods/services (Stevens, 1993). Let's first take a look at why public goods are thought to justify governmental intervention.

In order to make clear what economists mean by public goods and why they think government can justifiably provide them, it is necessary to first discuss the concept of private goods. Private goods are goods/services that possess one crucial characteristic: the characteristic of excludability. If one individual consumes a private good, others can be excluded from simultaneously doing so. The excludability characteristic that is associated with private goods means that markets can be relied upon to distribute them. This is because those who value private goods can be excluded from enjoying the benefits of such goods if they are not willing to pay for them (Johansson, 1994).

Let's consider an example. Suppose Jack is wearing a shirt. While he is doing so, no one else can simultaneously wear this shirt. In other words, others can be excluded from the benefits of wearing the shirt while Jack is wearing it. The only ways others could enjoy these benefits would be to buy shirts for themselves or receive shirts as gifts. Thus, those in the business of selling shirts (and other private goods/services) stand a good chance of profiting from doing so because they don't have to worry about the problem of people being able to benefit from wearing shirts without someone having to pay for them.

Public goods are goods/services that are not characterized by excludability (Johansson, 1994). The classic example of a public good is a lighthouse. If the crew of one ship consumes the light provided by a lighthouse, other ships' crewmembers cannot be excluded from simultaneously doing so. The crewmembers of ships probably regard the light derived from lighthouses as beneficial to them. Suppose a firm tried to provide lighthouse service through the market, that is to say suppose it tried to charge a fee for this service. Would this firm be likely to profit from this provision? Economic theory predicts that the answer to this question is no.
Because the lighthouse is a public good, all ships' crewmembers would be able to simultaneously utilize its service whether or not they paid for it. If crewmembers could receive lighthouse service without paying for it, there would be little incentive for them to pay for this service. Consequently, most, if not all crewmembers would choose not to pay the lighthouse firm. But if the lighthouse firm were not paid or paid very little, it would be impossible or difficult for it to make a profit. And if the firm faced difficulty making a profit, it would most likely leave the lighthouse business. Thus, if we left lighthouse provision to the market, the result would probably be that a service that would provide clear social benefit would not be produced. This analysis of lighthouse provision applies to all public goods. If we tried to distribute them by way of the market, even though they would provide clear social benefit, they would probably not be produced. This is because no firm would have an incentive to produce them because no consumer would have an incentive to pay for them.

According to economic theory, the way to increase the likelihood that public goods will be produced is to create a mechanism by which people are "forced" to pay for them. Taxation is such a mechanism. By requiring people to pay taxes or face negative sanctions, governmental authorities put themselves in a position to assure that most people will "back up" their preferences for public goods with the resources required for their production/provision. Because people do benefit from public goods and governmental actors are in a position to force people to pay for the provision of them, governmental production/provision of public goods can be justified (Stiglitz, 1988). Let's take a look at another public good that might be more of interest to social workers.

Imagine there is a large firm that manufactures cars. Imagine further that this firm chronically dumps chemical waste into a city's water supply. Medical experts have found that ingesting this chemical is strongly correlated with the development of a certain type of cancer. Suppose that a private sector firm is created to clean up the city's water supply and that it is not technically possible for the firm to prevent the city's residents from obtaining the cleaner water from their faucets. This technical impossibility results in the cleaner water being a public good because the inability to
prevent them from drinking it means that city residents could not be excluded from doing so. Would the firm be able to profit from cleaning up the city's water supply? Economic theory predicts that the answer to this question is no.

If the firm were able to successfully clean up the water supply, this, other things being equal, would reduce the chances that city residents would develop the type of cancer associated with the chemical that was found in the water. But since the firm would have no way to prevent those who did not pay for its service from drinking the clean water, most, if not all, city residents would be unwilling to pay the firm for the privilege of doing so. And if the firm were not paid by most of those benefiting from its service, it would not be able to profit from providing it. From an economic point of view, since removal of the chemical from residents' drinking water would result in the production of a public good, the city government would be justified if it taxed its residents to finance a public sector firm to conduct this removal.

Market generated externalities are other conditions that justify governmental interventions. In order to understand the concept of externality, one needs to reflect a little about why people voluntarily choose to consume, produce, and exchange specific goods/services. They do so because they expect that the positive consequences or benefits from doing so will outweigh the negative consequences or costs of doing so. For example, a person voluntarily chooses to buy a car because he or she believes the benefit from owning the car will outweigh the cost of owning it.

In many cases, only those who have voluntarily agreed to participate in consumption and production enjoy the benefits or incur the costs associated with these activities. When benefits are enjoyed by or costs incurred by those who have not voluntarily agreed to the enjoyment of these benefits or the payment of these costs, externalities are said to exist. Externalities can be positive or negative. A negative externality is one that is costly, while a positive externality is one that is beneficial (Stevens, 1993). I have already discussed an example of a negative externality although this term was not used in the discussion.

The automobile manufacturer that dumps waste into the city's water supply imposes a negative externality onto the city's residents. These residents have not voluntarily agreed to drink water
with a dangerous chemical in it. The consequences of drinking this water are costly in terms of premature deaths, increased health expenses, etc. The firm doesn’t appear to have a clear economic incentive to develop a production process that doesn’t endanger the city’s water supply. In fact, if the development of a “cleaner” production process would significantly increase the firm’s cost of doing business, it would have an economic incentive not to adopt this cleaner process.

According to economic theory, since markets don’t necessarily provide firms with incentives to curb negative externalities, governments can justifiably enact policies that require firms to do so or that require them to pay taxes that provide governments with the resources necessary to do so (Stiglitz, 1988). To return to the example about the chemical waste, the city government would be justified if it passed a law that required the firm to develop a cleaner production process. It would also be justified if it required the firm to pay a special tax that helped to finance the work of a public sector company that specialized in removing the chemical from the city’s water supply.

The example of chemical waste is an example of a negative externality that results from the production of a good. Sometimes consumption leads to negative externalities as well. Suppose Enrico enjoys smoking and decides to “light up” in a crowded office. Enrico’s co-workers, however, hate being around smokers because they have learned that “second hand” smoking is carcinogenic. In this case, Enrico’s choice to smoke results in a negative externality imposed onto his co-workers. From the point of view of economic theory, the government would be justified if it enacted a law that proscribed smoking in offices and other public establishments or required owners of such establishments to construct separate smoking and non-smoking sections.

The examples about chemical waste and smoking should make it clear that social workers concerned about the negative effects of pollution on the welfare of clients could draw upon economic theory to justify policies intended to prevent or curtail these effects. Given the role economics often plays in social welfare policy debates, this would be a most useful rhetorical strategy.

Now let’s take a look at a positive externality. Imagine there is a man who suffers from tuberculosis (TB). As most social workers
are probably aware, TB is a highly contagious disease. Imagine further that the man is aware that he has this problem and goes to see his physician to obtain treatment. Obtaining treatment for his condition is of obvious benefit to the man. But since TB is such a contagious disease, by receiving treatment, the man benefits others through decreasing the probability that they will contract it. Yet others who benefit from the man's receiving treatment did not voluntarily take part in an exchange in order to do so. Thus, the benefit others derive from the man's receiving treatment is an example of a positive externality.

Now suppose there is an indigent homeless man who suffers from TB. Because of his impoverished status, the man is unable to purchase treatment for his disease in the health care market. From the point of view of economic theory, governmental actors could justifiably enact a policy that subsidized the man's purchase of treatment or paid for it entirely. This could be justified because the benefit of the treatment would not simply be enjoyed by the homeless man but by members of the public in general.

Not only could the positive externality concept ground justification of public sector financing of TB treatment but it could justify public sector financing of immunization against a host of other highly contagious diseases.

The astute reader has probably realized that positive externalities are actually examples of public goods. Even though this is the case, economists often discuss public goods and externalities separately. This is because positive externalities are considered distinct from "normal" public goods in the sense that positive externalities are public goods that result as by products from the production and consumption of private goods/services (Weimer and Vining, 1992). For example, in the case of the man who went to see his physician to get treated for TB, the benefits received by the public result as by products from the man's purchasing the private services of his physician. In the cases of the lighthouse and cleaner water, these services are not by products of consumption or production of private goods.

A third type of market failure that is relevant to the social welfare policy concerns of social workers is imperfect information. When it comes to many goods/services, consumers usually have a pretty good idea about what constitutes quality. One can
tell if a book she is considering buying has all its pages or if a table she is thinking about buying has all its legs. When it comes to goods/services where individuals are knowledgeable about their quality and other relevant matters, economic theory states that governmental actors should allow markets to distribute such goods/services with little or no interference. Markets that distribute goods/services of this nature are characterized by perfect information. Markets that distribute goods/services where individuals lack information about quality or other significant matters are characterized by imperfect information (Stevens, 1993). Let's take a look at a market characterized by imperfect information.

Currently in the U.S., some people pay “out of pocket” for medical services. Consumers of such services are typically uninformed about their quality. Most of those who are not physicians are not in a position to know if they are getting a high quality breast exam, a high quality x-ray, high quality out patient surgery, etc. Thus, they are vulnerable to being harmed by incompetent physicians; that is to say they might end up paying for substandard care. By the time consumers realize their care has been substandard it might be too late; they may have developed a grave condition.

One way the public sector has attempted to address the problem of imperfect information in the health care market is through licensing. That is physicians are required to pass licensing examinations in order to practice. It is believed that physicians who pass these examinations are more likely to be competent clinicians than those who do not do so are.

The Efficiency/Equity Distinction

Social workers tend to examine social welfare policy issues from the perspectives of fairness and need. They ask do particular policies generate fair distributions of goods/services or do specific policies meet people’s basic needs? Economists refer to such concerns as equity concerns and although they too are interested in these types of questions, they readily admit that their economics training provides them with no special competence in addressing them. Those economists who address such questions tend to draw heavily upon the sub-discipline of moral philosophy.
Discussions of the work of Harvard philosopher John Rawls are frequently found in economists' musings on questions of equity (Rawls, 1971; Stiglitz, 1988; and Stevens, 1993).

Economists feel that another important policy related concept is their "stock and trade": the concept of efficiency. Economists use this notion in a number of different contexts. It has to do with attainment of the largest possible outcome given available resources. It is relevant to the decision making of all social actors. Individual persons are concerned with utilizing their budgets to attain as many of the things they prefer as possible. Those who occupy positions of authority in social service organizations are concerned with utilizing organizational resources to attain as many organizational objectives as possible. Elected officials are concerned about utilizing public resources to attain as many public objectives as possible. Let's further explore an example from the political arena.

Suppose it were the case that the U.S. electorate and U.S. elected officials were committed to curtailing poverty. Assume that this commitment has emerged from a sense that such curtailment would make our income distribution more equitable. Economists qua economists would have no unique contribution to make to the question of whether poverty ought to be curtailed. They could make an important contribution, though, by helping us figure out which poverty reduction policy would be likely to be the most efficient or cost-effective.

A guaranteed income and a public jobs program are two different approaches to curtailing poverty. A guaranteed income is an income maintenance policy that assures that no citizen's income falls below a certain level. People are not required to work to receive the income guarantee. If the guarantee were set high enough, this policy could curtail poverty.

A public jobs program is an income maintenance policy that assures that no citizen employed in a public job would see her/his income fall below a certain level. If the public employment wage were set high enough, this policy could also curtail poverty.

Both of these policies would cost public dollars. Their cost would depend, in part, on their effects on labor markets, their effects on investment levels, their effects on the price level, their effects on aggregate economic output, etc. Although, it should
not be assumed that non-economists have nothing of significance to say about these matters, it is the case that such questions fall squarely within the domain of economics.

This is not the place to conduct the labor market, investment level, price level, etc., analyses that would be required to formulate a well-grounded prediction of which of the two poverty reduction policies would cost the least. For the sake of illustration let's assume that such analyses have been conducted, and it has been found that the guaranteed income approach would probably cost the federal government about $200 billion/year, while the public jobs approach would probably cost it about $300 billion/year. If it also appeared that both policies would reduce poverty by the same level, the economist would recommend the guaranteed income approach on efficiency, not equity grounds. This is because by utilizing the least costly method, we would be freeing up public resources that could be allocated for the attainment of other public objectives.

Conclusion

This paper has attempted to illustrate the relevance of economics to the social welfare policy concerns of social workers. It has placed great emphasis on the relevance of the economists' notion of market failures. It has also considered how other basic economic concepts, such as opportunity cost and efficiency, are pertinent to the policy concerns of social workers. It is my hope that this attempt has convinced readers of the utility of drawing upon economic theory in our analyses of social welfare issues.

References


A Qualitative cum Quantitative Approach to Construct Definition in a Minority Population: Reasons for Divorce among Israeli Arab Women

RIVKA SAVAYA
ORNA COHEN
Tel Aviv University
Bob Shapell School of Social Work

The paper describes the combined use of qualitative and quantitative methods to provide a preliminary definition of the construct, the reasons for divorce among Israeli Arab women. The qualitative methods consisted of personal interviews and a focus group, the quantitative method of Trochim's concept mapping. The combined approach was adopted in the wake of skepticism about the ability of research instruments developed in the West to study Western populations to provide valid and reliable assessments of non-Western groups. A culturally sensitive definition of the construct was sought as a first step in the design of a culturally sensitive research instrument for a study of divorce among Israeli Arabs to be carried out by a number of Arab and Jewish scholars in Israel.

The findings support the authors' initial intuition that the reasons that lead Israeli Arab women to divorce are different from those that motivate middle class Western women. While the latter tend to be motivated by emotional reasons, from poor communication and desire for self-fulfillment, the Muslim Arab women who divorce are moved by really extreme marital misery brought on by a high degree of physical violence, sexual torment, emotional abuse, and/or the mental illness or addiction of their partners, as well as by the active intervention of their in-laws to break up their marriage.

Introduction

In recent years, there has been increasing recognition of the need to anchor social and psychological research of minority or ethnic populations in the culture of the group under investigation (Hughes et al., 1993; Hui & Triandis, 1989; Sasao & Sue, 1993; Seidman, 1993; Sue, 1991). Noting that culture affects every stage of
the research process, from the formation of the research questions through the interpretation of the data, researchers have called for the development of culturally sensitive research methods, which take into account the values, belief systems, and behaviors of the population under study, as well as its place in and relationship with the dominant culture in whose midst it lives (Hines, 1993; Hughes & DuMont, 1993; Maton, 1993; Tran, 1992). Researchers who have dealt with issues involved in minority or ethnic oriented research have proposed a variety of general approaches (Hughes & DuMont, 1993; Hines, 1993; Sue et al., 1982; Zane & Sue, 1986) and struggled valiantly to design studies tailored to the culture of particular groups (Milburn et al., 1991; Zane & Sue, 1986).

This paper belongs with those that offer concrete suggestions for the design of a culturally anchored research study. It focuses on one aspect of such a study: the formulation and definition of constructs, which is one of the critical phases in the development of measures. As Hughes and DuMont (1993) note, "Cultural norms, values, and experiences influence the relevance of a set of constructs to respondents, the range of behaviors and ideas that are valid indicators of the constructs, and how respondents interpret items employed to assess them" (Hughes & DuMont, 1993; p. 776).

The constructs were required in order to design a research instrument for a study of divorce among Israeli Arabs to be carried out by a number of Arab and Jewish scholars in Israel. The study, which is still in process, aims to investigate the reasons for, patterns of coping with, and adjustment to divorce in this community. It focuses on the Arabs of Jaffa, which is a low income, mixed Jewish-Arab area of Tel Aviv and home to about 15,000 Arabs and 35,000 Jews. For practical reasons, both the study and the development of the study instrument began with Arab women, and men will be incorporated at a later stage. But the principles are the same.

The constructs in question were the causes of, coping with, and adjustment to divorce. They were defined using a mixture of qualitative and quantitative approaches. The qualitative tools consisted of personal interviews and a focus group, aimed at learning inductively from the study population how it itself
defined these constructs. The collection of information from the target group served as the first step in Trochim’s concept mapping (Trochim, 1989a). Using Trochim’s approach, the data were then subjected to quantitative analyses: cluster analysis and multi-dimensional analysis. Since the purpose of the paper is not to explore the constructs themselves but rather to illustrate the application of the method, the description here is confined to the reasons for divorce so as to avoid repetition.

The paper begins with a brief discussion of divorce among Israeli Arabs, including the state of the literature, and of aspects of Israeli-Arab culture that might affect Arab women’s motives for divorce. It then discusses the problem of studying divorce in this community, the need to first define the key constructs, and the choice of Trochim’s concept mapping, a combined qualitative—quantitative method, to do so. The paper focuses on the description and findings of the mapping, and ends with a discussion of their implications and limitations.

Background Issues

Divorce Among Israeli Arabs

The last few decades have seen a rise in divorce rates in traditional societies, including that of Israeli Arabs. Data published by Israel’s Central Bureau of Statistics indicates that between the 1960’s and mid-1990’s, the divorce rate almost doubled among Israel’s Arab families, from 0.5% to 0.9%. This trend is confirmed in personal conversations between the authors of this paper and several Arab informants: the President of the Muslim High Court of Appeals (the Kadi, Ahmed Natur), which hears appeals of divorce cases that had been settled by lower level Muslim religious courts (the shar‘ia courts); directors of social services departments in three Arab municipalities; and several Arab social workers in the social services department of the Tel Aviv municipality.

The study in question was prompted, first and foremost, by the recognition that it is important to provide social services for the increasing number of Arab men and women who divorce. Since divorce on any scale is a relatively new phenomenon in this population, there are virtually no social services specifically
aimed at helping those who undertake it. To design such services, though, it is obviously necessary first to know more about why the couples in this community divorce and how they cope with and adjust to the break-up of their marriages.

**Literature on Divorce**

The existing literature is of little use. Most of the literature on divorce deals with the multidimensional changes divorce wrecks on the family unit, focusing on its implications for both the adults (e.g., Arendell, 1987; Burns, 1992; Holden & Smock, 1991) and children (e.g., Arditi, 1992; Wallerstein, 1991) involved. Studies in Israel follow a similar pattern (e.g., Cohen, 1991; Dattner, 1987; Luxembourg, 1987; Pasternak, 1989; Smilansky, 1990). Virtually all of the studies, including those in Israel, were conducted mainly on middle class families from western cultures and utilized research tools that were developed specifically for western men and women.

The studies suggest a range of reasons for divorce in the western world, including the growing acceptance of divorce and liberalization of divorce laws; unresolved interpersonal conflicts, manifested in such things as emotional rejection, poor communication, and problems in role division; the husband and wife developing in different and non-complementary directions; negative feelings and defensive, obstinate, and non-interactive behavior (Ahrons & Rodgers, 1987; Cherlin, 1981; Easterlin, 1980; Gottman, 1994). When women’s reasons were queried separately, these tended to be related to the desire for greater personal fulfillment, lack of effective communication with their husbands, conflicts over the division of roles in the family, and unsatisfying sex with their husbands.

Whether the same or similar reasons motivated Israel Arabs in general and Israeli Arab women in particular to get divorced could not be known. Despite the rising incidence of divorce among Israeli Arabs, no research has as yet been conducted on divorce in this community. Nor has much, if any, research been done on divorce in other traditional communities, from which we might have extrapolated. A computerized search carried out by the authors failed to produce any large scale, empirical study of divorce in traditional societies.
There are a number of small studies of divorce in several developing countries (Russia, Moskoff, 1983; Poland, Lobodzinska. 1983; India, Amato, 1994). These highlight the specific impact of each country's particular legal, social, cultural, and economic realities on the divorce experience, including the reasons that prompt divorce.

The literature on divorce in the United States in different periods and among different socio-economic and ethnic groups similarly points to the impact of environmental factors on the divorce experience. This literature shows that American women in the 1940's (when divorce rates were lower than they are today) were more likely to cite non-support or their husband's alcoholism, while women in the 1970's were more likely to cite factors like communications problems and differences in values (Kitson & Sussman, 1982); that women of lower socio-economic status give more material reasons for divorce, such as physical abuse, their husband's drinking, and financial problems, while middle-class women are more likely to give emotional reasons such as their husband's lack of love and infidelity (Levinger, 1966; Burns, 1982; Kitson & Sussman, 1982, Cleek & Pearson, 1985), and that women born of Mexican parents, whether in America or Mexico, were more likely to cite infidelity as a cause of divorce than women born in America of American parents (Parra et al., 1995).

The message of these studies is that the divorce experience is anchored in the society in which it occurs, and knowledge about divorce in one society is not necessarily generalizable to another, even where the societies are may have many features in common.

Aspects of Israeli Arab Culture that Might Affect the Women's Motives for Divorce

It was reasonable to suspect that Israeli Arab women's motives for divorce, affected by the culture in which they lived, might not necessarily be the same as those of their western counterparts. The literature on this population generally agrees that Israeli Arab society has been in the throes of a transition from a traditional, patriarchal society, with the extended family at the center, to a modern, more liberal society, where the individual is less dependent on the family for self-identification and economic
survival (Al-Haj, 1987, 1989; Haj-Yahia, 1995; Rosenfeld, 1981). In recent years Israeli Arab women have become increasingly well educated and have joined the workforce in increasing numbers (Al-Haj, 1987, 1989). Like women elsewhere, some earn better than their husbands and are the family’s major breadwinners. At the same time, Arab society in Israel, as elsewhere, is still patriarchal, and women are low in the family hierarchy (Avitzur, 1987; Haj Yahia, 1994; Shokeid, 1993). The gap between women’s importance in the family economy and the respect and satisfaction they may attain at work, on the one hand, and their inferior status at home, on the other hand, could be expected to be a source of dissatisfaction and marital tension. At the same time, their newly acquired education and earning power apparently enable these women to contemplate breaking loose of their husbands and setting up on their own, which was not possible in the past. (The role of women’s increased education and economic independence in the rising divorce rate in Israeli Arab society seems to be quite similar to that in Europe and the United States). On the other hand, Arab women are still defined by their families and community largely as wives and mothers and respected or not for their functioning in these roles. Divorce is still not considered legitimate. An Arab woman who undertakes divorce can expect considerable social criticism and even sanctions, including by her parents and relatives. In effect, she loses her place in society. Together, these various factors can be expected to create their own particular blend of inducements and deterrents to divorce, and, thereby effect the motives that lead Arab women to take the step.

The Problem for Research

The lack of information made it very difficult to embark on a study. Namely, we could not know whether the existing research tools, which had proved reliable and valid with western populations, would provide valid findings and whether their constructs would be relevant and meaningful to the target population. Other than the relatively few studies based on personal interviews (i.e., Ponzetti Zvonkovic, Cate & Huston, 1992), most of the studies reported in the literature employ checklists, with each item pointing to a possible reason for the respondent’s separation or divorce. These checklists are somewhat problematic in themselves, in that
the number and content of the items vary from checklist to checklist. Moreover, a glance at the findings suggests a disconcerting lack of correspondence between the weight given to certain types of reasons in the checklists and the degree of their endorsement. But their main problem for our purposes was their transferability across cultures. The items in the checklists tended to stem from a certain prior familiarity with the population from which the respondents came. The familiarity may have been obtained by prior study of the population (i.e., Gigy & Kelly, 1992), previous checklists designed for a similar population (i.e., Burns, 1984), or a combination of previous checklists and information provided in the literature (Davis & Aron, 1988). We could only suspect that the outcomes of such measures would be as dubious as those of other studies of ethnic groups based on tools designed for and by mainstream western cultural groups (Hines, 1993; Hughes & DuMont, 1993).

Nor did we have any published theory or empirical findings which we could use to construct a research instrument. We needed to gain enough knowledge about the population to design a study instrument that would include the relevant variables and in weights that accorded with their importance or marginality for the population.

Method

Qualitative and Quantitative Research Methods

Following the advice of various authors who urge that the best way of obtaining reliable knowledge of a different population group is to combine qualitative and quantitative methods (Hines, 1993; Jick, 1979; Maton, 1993; Sells et al., 1995; Wiener et al., 1994), we decided to adopt a multi-method approach. Qualitative methods, it has been noted, provide information that can be used to improve the formulation of survey questions and to structure questionnaire formats to fit the way particular groups organize concepts (Hines, 1993). According to Hughes, Seidman, Williams, (1993), qualitative methods provide broad description and deeper understanding of phenomena from participants' own perspectives, while quantitative methods temper researchers' biases and emphasize reliability, validity, and the search for parsimonious
solutions. The combination, they indicate, enables researchers to learn about the non-mainstream cultural groups they are studying and at the same time to utilize the rigorous methodologies that are necessary for hypotheses testing and replication of findings.

Concept Mapping

The major procedure used to define the concepts in question was concept mapping (Trochim, 1989a). This is a multi-method procedure, in which data are gathered qualitatively and analyzed quantitatively. It has applications in organizations, in business, in planning services and in many other areas (Caracelli & Riggs, 1994; Knox, 1995; Trochim, 1989b; Trochim et al., 1994; Savaya & Waysman, 1995; Wiener et al., 1994). In the social sciences, concept mapping can be used to help articulate a theory, provide the basis for measurement, or serve as a basis for analyzing research results (Trochim, 1989a). To give some examples of its scope, Trochim (1989b) reports on the use of concept mapping to set the goals of a multi-cultural summer camp, to plan university health and employment services, to design training programs for professional community workers and volunteer mental health workers, to identify issues for a student assembly to address, to design a graduate course in measurement, to restructure a company's personnel utilization, and others. Here we show how concept mapping was used to identify and group the relevant variables in the causes for divorce among Arab women.

Concept mapping involves five steps: 1) a two-part preparatory stage to determine the focus of the mapping and select the participants in the process; 2) generation of statements relevant to the focus; 3) sorting of statements into groups and rating each statement's importance; 4) creation of a visual concept map based on the sorting and analysis of the ratings; and 5) interpretation of the concept map. Since these steps are described in detail by Trochim (1989a), we will focus here on their application to our purposes.

1. Preparation:
   a. Focus: The mapping focused on the reasons for, coping with, and adjustment to divorce. We confine our discussion here to the reasons.
b. Selection of Participants: Participants for generating the statements were drawn from a list of Arab women who had divorced in the Moslem religious court in the mixed Arab-Jewish town of Jaffa in 1993–94. A social worker employed in this court extracted names from the list on the basis of the following criteria: the woman's willingness to reveal her personal story, her articulateness, and, in particular, the social worker's assessment that participation in the study would not harm the woman in any way. After compiling a list of 15 names, the social worker contacted the women and asked them whether they would be willing to be interviewed for a study on divorce in the Moslem community. Nine agreed, four to individual interviews and five to a group interview, which formed a focus group.

The small size and unrepresentativeness of the sample are common features of qualitative studies. Additional reasons for them in this context include the Arab cultural interdiction against disclosing family problems to outsiders and the extremely sensitive nature of the subject for these women because of the lack of legitimacy for divorce in their culture despite its increasing occurrence.

2. Generation of statements:

The statements were generated in individual interviews and a focus group. The interviews were carried out in the women's homes and lasted about two-and-a-half hours on average. An Arab social worker was present at all the interviews and took an active part in them. The women were asked three main questions: What were your reasons for divorcing? From where did you draw the strength to go through the divorce? What does adjusting to divorce mean in Arab society and how did you adjust? The interviews were tape recorded, after permission was obtained from the interviewees, and transcribed by a research assistant.

Focus groups have been proposed as an effective way of anchoring scientific knowledge about social and psychological processes in the norms, values, and experience of the population under study (Hughes & Dumont, 1993). Among other things, focus groups can identify constructs that have been completely omitted from a conceptual framework but that are important to a group's experiences, as well as the identify items used to measure each construct. Focus groups emphasize participants' perspectives and allow the researcher to explore the nuances and
complexities of participants' attitudes and experience (Morgan, 1993; Race et al., 1994; Stewart & Shamdasani, 1990).

The focus group for this study was made up of the five divorced women who preferred to participate in a group interview. The focus group session was held in a marriage and family counseling center in Jaffa and lasted about two hours. It was led in Arabic by an Arab professional with training and experience in working with groups. She made use of a set of semi-structured guidelines based on the points that had arisen in the interviews. The discussion was separately recorded on tape recorder and taken down by an Arab woman, who later translated it into Hebrew. The transcript was checked by the focus group leader, who confirmed its accuracy.

The two sets of transcriptions were both read separately by each of the authors, as well as by seven professionals who served as sorters (see below). Each reader separately culled all the statements that indicated a reason or motive for divorce. Only the statements that were considered reasons by eight out the nine readers were included in the study.

By the end of the qualitative stage, 36 statements of reasons for divorce were generated.

3. Sorting the statements into piles:
Ordinarily the sorting is done by the same people who provide the information (Trochim, 1989a). In this instance, we were reluctant to ask the already overburdened women to invest the necessary time and energy to do it. Moreover, not all of the women were sufficiently literate in either Arabic or Hebrew to do the sorting. We thus approached seven Arab social workers who agreed to perform this task. All of the statements regarding the reasons for divorce were written down on cards by the researchers, one statement per card. Each of the sorters was given a complete set of cards and instructed to arrange them in piles in whatever way made sense to them, so long as there was more than one pile and fewer than 36.

Ordinarily, too, the sorters rate the importance of each item. But since the sorters were not the target population, this could obviously not be done.

4. Analysis of the sortings to create a visual concept map or maps: The sortings were entered into the Concept System
Construct Definition

computer program developed by Trochim (Trochim, 1993b) for the purpose of statistical analysis. Two analyses were carried out: a multidimensional scaling and a cluster analysis.

Multi dimensional scaling is used to organize the statements that are piled together into distinct constructs. It begins with the construction of an $N \times N$ binary symmetric matrix of similarities for each sorter, where $N$ is the total number of statements. Each cell is given a value of 1 or 0: 1 where the two statements represented by the cell are in the same pile, 0 where they are not. To illustrate: in our case, there were 36 statements, so each matrix was $36 \times 36$. If the sorter in question had placed statements 5 and 17 in the same pile, the two relevant cells (cells $5 \times 17$ and $17 \times 5$) would bear the integer 1; if he or she had placed them in different piles, the cells would bear the integer 0.

The next step is to create a total similarity matrix, which shows the number of sorters placing each cross-pair of statements in the same pile. Any cell in this matrix can thus bear an integer value of 0 to the total number of sorters. In our instance, this would mean 0 to 7. To continue our example, if 4 sorters placed statements 5 and 17 in the same pile, the relevant cells in the total similarity matrix would take the number 4.

The total similarity matrix is then subjected to non-metric multidimensional scaling analysis (Davison, 1983; Kruskal & Wish, 1978) with two-dimensional solution (which is easier to work with and more useful than solutions involving three or more dimensions; Kruskal & Wish, 1978). The analysis yields a two dimensional configuration of the statements by placing statements piled together most often more proximately in two dimensional space and those piled together less frequently further apart.

This two dimensional configuration is the input for the hierarchical cluster analysis (which utilizes Ward’s algorithm as the basis for defining a cluster; Andeberg, 1973; Everitt, 1980). The cluster analysis partitions the multidimensional configuration into nonoverlapping clusters in two dimensional space, such that each cluster represents a single construct consisting of the statements that were piled together. Its purpose is to group separate statements into clusters which reflect similar concepts.

The main end products are two visual maps of the statements: a dot map representing the distribution of the statements on
the multidimensional scaling and a border map representing the clusters.

Findings

Dot Map: Figure 1 shows the relative placement of each statement in relation to all the others. Dots that are close together on the map represent items that were often sorted into the same category by the sorters, while dots that are far apart were mostly sorted into separate piles. Statements that all sorters put in the same cluster appear as dots one on top of the other. Thus, not all the statements can be seen in a two-dimensional map. Here statement 6 is hidden by statement 21 and statement 17 is hidden by statement 18.

Border map. This map presents the results of the cluster analysis. In essence, it is a dot map with a closed multi-sided figure drawn around groups of dots to create clusters in such a way that the statements within a cluster are those that were more often sorted in the same pile than the statements in the other clusters. Furthermore, clusters that are closer to each other are usually more similar in content than clusters which are further apart on the map. Since the analysis is hierarchical, the subdivision of clusters changes neither the location of existing clusters nor the placements of statements within them. The final decision as to the number of clusters to be retained for interpretation is made by the researcher based on conceptual and practical considerations.

This process resulted in the following list of seven main causes for divorce. The final concept map is presented in Figure 2.

Interpretation of the dimensionality: Since the map is based on a multidimensional scaling, the location of each cluster on the map has meaning in relation to two axes: north/south and east/west. In this map, the northern section consists largely of statements relating to violence—sexual and physical violence by the husband and physical violence by a member of the extended family. The southern section features non-violent causes: addiction, mental illness and interference by the extended family. The east/west dimension traces a movement from causes related to the extended family, through causes involving both the partners, to causes stemming from the husband's behavior. Problems in
Figure 2

Concept Map

- Sexual Torment
- Husband's Physical Violence
- Violence by Extended Family
- Communication Problems
- Husband's Addiction
- Husband's Bizarre Behavior
- Interference of Extended Family
construct definition

communication are located at the center of the east-west axis and span the north-south route from violence to social and psychological causes.

As can be seen, the causes were identified as: 1) sexual torment, manifested in either physical violence or total cessation of the sexual relationship, 2) physical violence by the husband, 3) physical violence by a member of the extended family, 4) interference by the extended family, 5) communication problems, 6) husband's addiction, and 7) husband's mental illness, as manifested in bizarre behavior. Table 1 presents the items within each cluster. One item (number 9, "There was no food or drink in the house") did not enter into any cluster and is thus not included in the table.

Discussion

This paper illustrates the use of Trochim's concept mapping to define a construct—the reasons for divorce among Israeli Arab women living in an urban, multi-ethnic community in a culturally sensitive manner. The findings support the initial assumption that the reasons for divorce in this society, which is in the throes of transition from a traditional culture in which women are subordinate and divorce is considered unacceptable, are different from the reasons proposed in the professional literature based on populations in a liberal, western culture, where women are more independent and divorce is accepted.

It is quite apparent from the statements generated in the personal interviews and focus group that the emotional friction or incompatibility that is behind much of the divorce in western society plays a relatively small role in the breakup of Israeli Arab families. It is also evident that these women do not leave their husbands out of a desire for greater personal fulfillment or dissatisfaction with the traditional division of roles. Similarly, while problems in communication, which are considered a major factor in divorce in the west, do figure in these women's reasons, they are not frequently cited.

Indeed, the findings show that these women divorce mainly in the wake of really extreme marital misery brought on by a high degree of physical violence, sexual torment, emotional abuse, and/or the mental illness or addiction of their partners. They also
Table 1

*Seven Main Reasons for Divorce*

**Cluster 1: Sexual torment**

6. It’s shameful to say, I haven’t slept with my husband in ten years.
11. He would ask me to do things that God and religion forbid.
17. He wanted to sleep with me with blows and force.
18. He wanted to sleep with me every day, three times a day, by force and beat me. He made scars around my vagina.
20. When a couple doesn’t get along in bed, problems arise. He wanted to sleep with me every day, brutally. People knew—it was shameful.
21. He hasn’t slept with me in ten years.
22. I didn’t want [sex] every day, so he didn’t give me money [for the house].

**Cluster 2: Husband’s Physical Violence**

7. It’s shameful to say, my husband beat me with scissors and made scars on my stomach.
12. My house was full of food, money, drink, that wasn’t what I was missing. But everything I bought for the house would break.... He would pull me by the hair from one end of the house to the other, drag me by the hair. He burnt my clothes, tore them.
15. My neighbors in the building didn’t sleep, he would break [things], kick. I decided to run before I died.
16. My aunt saw him beat me.
25. He drank, beat, humiliated me. I went to his family, they sent me back.
27. Curse, beat.... How did he beat? Knives, a pot, cups, I would cry and go to sleep.
31. I would be asleep, he would choke me, burn me with cigarettes, here and here...
36. When my husband hit me with scissors and tore my stomach, they took me to the hospital and gave me ten stitches.

**Cluster 3: Violence by a Member of the Extended Family**

19. He said “your parents told me I have to beat you.”
34. From the moment he took me back to his home after the wedding, I told him that I didn’t want him and would divorce him in another twenty years. My brother came, because my husband told him, and beat me on my wedding night.

**Cluster 4: Interference of Extended Family**

13. His father told him “if you don’t divorce her, you’re not my son and I’m not your father.”

*continued*
Construct Definition

Table 1

Continued

23. He decided to divorce me because of his father's decision.
24. My father and his father had an argument and decided to break the bundle.
26. My father-in-law would tell him, "treat her like a servant".
35. I decided when he attacked me—him and his father.

Cluster 5: Communication Problems
3. Lack of trust between the couple leads to divorce.
4. No understanding.
5. I worked outside the house and in the house and I never heard even a word of thanks. And not only that, but he called me a cheating whore, you have a boyfriend. When it reached that point, I couldn't anymore. I said, up to here...
10. He made my life miserable.

Cluster 6: Husband's Addiction
1. I had a very hard time, he drank a lot, didn't eat at home, so I got divorced.
2. He used drugs. There was no food in the house, or drink. I want to dress, there's no money.
8. Alcoholic. The children saw their father drinking all the time. He would walk along the street drunk, the children would call them "the drunkard's kids", and me they called "the drunkard's wife".
28. He's like a woman in the house. Doesn't work. Shoots up. So I suffer all the time.

Cluster 7: Husband's Bizarre Behavior
29. Where is he? Sleeping in the garbage. So I suffered. And he goes and picks up all the garbage and brings it home. And I had a beautiful house, beautiful.
30. He'd leave the house dressed and come back wearing something else. Let's say once a red shoe, and once disheveled. Once he wore a dog's collar.... Like a madman.
32. He sold the furniture, the children's clothes. From that day, I wanted to get divorced.
33. I was ashamed to go out with him. I'd go only with the children and my friends, not with him.
reveal, in some of the cases, the role of the extended family, which brought on the divorce either directly by ordering it or indirectly by provoking or perpetrating the violence that drove the women to take the step.

To be sure, these reasons bear somewhat greater resemblance to the reasons for divorce given by American women half a century ago, when divorce was less legitimate in the US, and by American women of lower socio-economic status today. This resemblance is yet further evidence of the role of cultural factors in shaping the divorce experience. Nonetheless, the pictures are far from identical. Sexual torment and the active role of the extended family in separating the couple are not cited as reasons for divorce among these American groups, and have not been noted in the divorce literature.

Clearly, a standard measure developed and validated among western women would provide a most biased picture of the reasons for divorce in the Israeli Arab population. It would probably over-emphasize irrelevant issues and under-estimate or ignore relevant ones.

The concept mapping procedure developed by Trochim enabled us to obtain a more reliable picture of the situation of these women than a purely qualitative approach. While the qualitative method of information gathering provided us with rich, contextual material, the Trochim procedure enabled a degree of objectivity not available in purely qualitative studies. The information was obtained from separate sorters, each classifying the statements of all the subjects. The findings obtained by statistical analyses represent their collective judgments, each of which is equally weighted, rather than the interpretation of a single researcher or small team, as is the case of qualitative studies.

To be sure, the fact that the statements were sorted by professionals rather than be the population under investigation, as is required by Trochim’s procedure, is a drawback. Potentially, the women might have conceptualized and grouped the reasons for divorce differently. Given the limited education of this sample (some could not read and most had not completed elementary school), however, it is questionable whether they could have done the sorting. Nonetheless, the statements the women
generated in their own words provide important culture-specific information that would not otherwise have been available to the researchers.

The use of an inductive approach based on qualitative methods which by definition look at very small and non-probability samples raises questions concerning the representativeness of the findings. We cannot know whether the reasons given by our nine subjects constitute a complete rendition, or whether other reasons would have emerged had other women been queried. Nor can we know how generalizable the reasons found here are to other Moslem divorcees in Jaffa or to the Moslem women living in the many Arab towns and villages of Israel, where the process of modernization may not be as fully underway.

But two facts point to the trustworthiness of the findings. One is that a review by the authors of the reasons given for divorce in the personal interviews and those given by the women in the focus group revealed no discernible difference between them. The other is that Arab professionals who were asked to give their views of the reasons for divorce among Israeli Arabs cited much the same causes (Cohen & Savaya, 1997).

Because of its limitations, however, we regard our concept mapping as only a first step which enables us to generate hypotheses for testing. We can now go on to prepare a research instrument to be administered to a large sample of divorced Arabs in a range of locations (i.e., urban versus rural, all-Arab versus mixed Arab-Jewish) in Israel. Each reason revealed in the concept map can be turned into one or more questions or phrased as a statement for a Likert/type response. An open question asking the respondents to state in their own words any additional reasons for their divorce can be used to reveal reasons that may not have come up in the small sample. Socio-demographic questions can be added both for a fuller picture and to enable comparison of the divorce experiences of Arab women in different social and economic strata and living in different types of communities. Following analogous qualitative studies, a similar approach can be adopted to study the divorce experiences of Arab men and of Christian Arabs in Israel. Moreover, to obtain a comparative picture to divorce in the west, we can integrate questions based on the recurrent statements made by the women in this sample
with questions based on the literature and questions drawn from standard divorce questionnaires.

References

Construct Definition


Construct Definition

Book Reviews


This book is a status report on a movement. This movement, the attempt to define social work as a science-based field in which concepts derived from the social sciences are integrated with practice, helped energize the expansion of social work education in the Universities beginning in the 1950s. As social workers fifty years earlier migrated from the church seeking a "scientific charity," educators of the 50s and 60s sought to break the dominance of psychoanalysis and build a foundation in the emerging disciplines of sociology, psychology, social psychology and, to a lesser extent, political science, economics and anthropology.

The University of Michigan School of Social Work was, arguably, the Jerusalem of this movement. From this base a new breed of scientist social workers sought to place the profession on a sound empirical footing and, incidentally, secure their own foothold in a skeptical University. Nearly fifty years later we are offered, in this volume based on a conference held in Ann Arbor in 1992, a collection of papers that demonstrate the fruits and evaluates the progress of this effort. The papers are diverse and valuable on their own terms, but also collectively raise significant questions about the faith that underlies modern academic social work.

The book begins with a historical review of the relationship of social work and social science. While this piece acknowledges a period of "conflicted differentiation" from 1900 to 1950, it views the period since 1950 as one of "integration and development," an optimistic view that may better fit the academic context than it does the agency world.

The following chapter is the heart of the book, a group of papers debating core concepts of integration. Gambrill cogently asserts the basic tenet of the faith, that science is an essential corrective to professional prejudice, guesswork and muddled thinking, which we owe our clients. "We should care enough to
Price argues that the scientific method cannot bring about change in social policy which is made in the context of political conflict and cultural symbolism.

Laws and Rein attack from another direction, suggesting that disciplinary approaches to science lead to abandonment of the relevant practice questions. Looking for empirical grounding, Boettcher turns to a sample of social work doctoral dissertations and sadly concludes that the majority of the studies fail to address the knowledge base of the profession. If government funds research, Jamrozik asks, will not government's priorities determine what knowledge there is to integrate?

This debate is fascinating but illusive because there is no agreement on basic terms. What is to the knowledge to be integrated—theory, findings, methodology, ideology, all of the above? What level(s) of practice are to be informed—clinical, policy, education? Where is the integration to occur and who will formulate it—the practitioner in the field, the teacher in the classroom, the researcher in the journal?

The next two sections are exemplary pieces of integrative writing. Part II explores social science for concepts useful to practice. The papers include pieces by Brower and Nurius on social cognition, Fisher and Kling on new social movement theories, Sheinfeld-Gorin and Viswanathan on theories of organizational decision making, Lambert on employment policy, Bernstein, Goodman and Epstein on grounded theory, a research tool especially suited for practitioner-scholars, and Mace applying chaos and complexity ideas from the natural sciences.

Part III identifies concepts and issues from the world of practice that have implications for social science. The papers include Guiterrez on an empowerment approach to macro practice, Mak and Nai-ming on collaboration between practitioners and researchers in Hong Kong social work education, Ramon on Mental Health practice in Europe, Vinokur-Kaplan on human services teamwork, Lauffer on linking organizational research and action, Abromovitz on a feminist critique of social science, Jamrozik on international human resource, and Longres on social stratification and psychological debilitation.

These chapters are each noteworthy as cutting edge summaries of significant intellectual material, yet few offer extensive implications for social work practice. The types of knowledge
span a broad territory including research findings, methods, theory, values and metaphor, although, in keeping with current usage, almost anything may be referred to as a theory.

Having offered so many trees the editors call upon Edwin Thomas to assess the state of the forest. Thomas meticulously delineates eight models of linkage between social science and social work. He notes that the majority of papers reflect substantive, methodological and organizational contributions of social science to social work. Only a few identify possible contributions of social work to social science. There is very little mention of social work practice methods whether familiar or unconventional. While there is strong emphasis on the impact of the social context on social work and social science, reference to any impact of social science or social work on the environment is scanty.

Finally, the reader is offered the story of the Social Work and Social Science doctoral program at the University of Michigan told by two of the programs guiding spirits, Robert Vinter and Rosemary Sarri. The program is celebrated as a unique model of the integration of social work and social science. The praise is not unmitigated, however, as the authors lament the current focus of research on, "measurement and assessment of social problems," rather than on prevention and intervention.

The book thus suggests a mixed assessment of the integration movement. It provides some excellent applications of critical knowledge from social science and social work, yet illustrates Law and Rein's view that within the academy, disciplinary research tends to crowd out practice concerns. While acquiring much that is of use in practice, research and education the reader may conclude that true integration of social work and social science remains an illusive commodity.

Bart Grossman
University of California at Berkeley, School of Social Welfare


The book, Issues in International Social Work is a timely, topical and innovative contribution to the international field of Human Services. While there are many renditions of country
span a broad territory including research findings, methods, theory, values and metaphor, although, in keeping with current usage, almost anything may be referred to as a theory.

Having offered so many trees the editors call upon Edwin Thomas to assess the state of the forest. Thomas meticulously delineates eight models of linkage between social science and social work. He notes that the majority of papers reflect substantive, methodological and organizational contributions of social science to social work. Only a few identify possible contributions of social work to social science. There is very little mention of social work practice methods whether familiar or unconventional. While there is strong emphasis on the impact of the social context on social work and social science, reference to any impact of social science or social work on the environment is scanty.

Finally, the reader is offered the story of the Social Work and Social Science doctoral program at the University of Michigan told by two of the programs guiding spirits, Robert Vinter and Rosemary Sarri. The program is celebrated as a unique model of the integration of social work and social science. The praise is not unmitigated, however, as the authors lament the current focus of research on, “measurement and assessment of social problems,” rather than on prevention and intervention.

The book thus suggests a mixed assessment of the integration movement. It provides some excellent applications of critical knowledge from social science and social work, yet illustrates Law and Rein’s view that within the academy, disciplinary research tends to crowd out practice concerns. While acquiring much that is of use in practice, research and education the reader may conclude that true integration of social work and social science remains an illusive commodity.

Bart Grossman
University of California at Berkeley, School of Social Welfare


The book, Issues in International Social Work is a timely, topical and innovative contribution to the international field of Human Services. While there are many renditions of country
specific responses to international problems, very little exists in the literature that extrapolates global issues of international interest. This volume is unique in that it moves the focus from a descriptive country-based study of social problems to the international concern for common global problems that affect the human race. A major focus is the interdependency of economic, political, socio-cultural and environmental factors.

Hokenstad and Midgley in their introduction provide an excellent overview and rationale for the necessity to understand the growing movement towards global sharing and inter-country understanding. They outline the expected role of social work at the turn of the twentieth century and open up new horizons for social work to become a more encompassing profession, responsive to the awareness of economic, political and socio-cultural issues which interactively affect human welfare.

Midgley in his chapter, "Social Work and Social Development" highlights this interdependency through the sustainable union of economic growth and social welfare. He points out that economic growth is only viable when it has a positive impact on the well being of all citizens of a country. He terms economic prosperity of the elite in many African, Asian and Middle Eastern countries as "distorted development", where there is a tunnel vision of wealth and development for select groups. This, he aptly argues, leads to the country's failure to achieve an integrated development, and results in the social demoralization of the masses, while boosting a handful of the wealthy.

Midgley further outlines strategies of a social development approach and points out how social work's international origins, values and goals are consistent with these strategies, hence it can easily integrate the developmental model of intervention into the practice expertise of social workers.

Other chapters focus on issues such as the environmental crisis and its effect on human well-being; demographic changes; consequences of population explosion; the expanding gap between the rich and the poor; the general pre-occupation with human longevity without much thought to the quality of this extended lease; the growing recognition for the necessity for gender equality; and finally, the need for acceptance of ethnic, and other forms of human diversity. The book makes an excellent contribution
to the cumulative and interactive effect of these issues, coupled with changing world conditions, and how these affect the role of service professions.

Within this context, the various authors advocate how social work needs to adopt a more integrative and comprehensive model of intervention, such as that of Social Development, which conceptualizes human development as a sustainable gain only if it is achieved within the context of an economic development model that benefits all citizens. The book proposes a professional education focus, which covers an international spectrum of issues and selects multiple and simultaneous interventions to address these concerns.

This book is truly international in its approach and provides direction to the inevitable changes facing the profession as a result of the revolutionary world changes. Each chapter is written in depth and with great clarity, outlining issues at the global level and tracing their trickle down effect to a local level. Furthermore, all chapters discuss the changing role of social work in the context of the respective issues and provide principles and strategies for analysis and intervention.

The most outstanding feature of this book is in its persuasive arguments urging all practitioners to abandon their parochial outlook in favor of practice from a global perspective. These foci place the importance of human rights and social justice at the core of the social work profession and extol its legacy of internationalism.

Nazneen S. Mayadas
University of Texas at Arlington

Susan P. Kemp, James K. Whittaker and Elizabeth Tracy, Person-Environment Practice. Hawthorne, NY, 1997. $49.95 hardcover, $23.95 papercover.

Social workers traditionally distinguish themselves from other human service providers because of their allegiance to a person-in-environment focus when interacting with client systems. The primacy of this focus was pioneered by caseworkers during the early part of this century, and later expounded by contemporary theoreticians such as Alex Gitterman, Carel Germain,
to the cumulative and interactive effect of these issues, coupled with changing world conditions, and how these affect the role of service professions.

Within this context, the various authors advocate how social work needs to adopt a more integrative and comprehensive model of intervention, such as that of Social Development, which conceptualizes human development as a sustainable gain only if it is achieved within the context of an economic development model that benefits all citizens. The book proposes a professional education focus, which covers an international spectrum of issues and selects multiple and simultaneous interventions to address these concerns.

This book is truly international in its approach and provides direction to the inevitable changes facing the profession as a result of the revolutionary world changes. Each chapter is written in depth and with great clarity, outlining issues at the global level and tracing their trickle down effect to a local level. Furthermore, all chapters discuss the changing role of social work in the context of the respective issues and provide principles and strategies for analysis and intervention.

The most outstanding feature of this book is in its persuasive arguments urging all practitioners to abandon their parochial outlook in favor of practice from a global perspective. These foci place the importance of human rights and social justice at the core of the social work profession and extol its legacy of internationalism.

Nazneen S. Mayadas
University of Texas at Arlington

Susan P. Kemp, James K. Whittaker and Elizabeth Tracy, Person-Environment Practice. Hawthorne, NY, 1997. $49.95 hardcover, $23.95 papercover.

Social workers traditionally distinguish themselves from other human service providers because of their allegiance to a person-in-environment focus when interacting with client systems. The primacy of this focus was pioneered by caseworkers during the early part of this century, and later expounded by contemporary theoreticians such as Alex Gitterman, Carel Germain,
Carol Meyer, and Anthony Maluccio. Indeed, this trademark of the profession is so distinctive that the reader, at first glance, may wonder what could possibly be "new" in this area. Seasoned academicians may initially broach person-environment practice with skepticism; the acronym, PEP, after all, does sound suspiciously faddish and susceptible to rhetoric. Upon finishing the introduction, however, the reader will be convinced of the timeliness of this richly-referenced endeavor. Person-environment practice dislodges direct practice from the familiar, myopic, and often more lucrative clutches of individual pathology. It is presented not as a panacea, but rather as an approach that is both rooted in social work's legacy and consistent with emergent areas of practice.

According to the authors the purpose of this initial volume is to present and systematize interpersonal helping through an environment lens, and describe strategies for environmental assessment and intervention. Person-environment practice seeks to bolster the client's sense of mastery in three areas: managing stressful situations, resolving environmental challenges, and maximizing environmental resources. The conceptual underpinnings and value base of PEP comprise the first chapter, with emphasis on the primacy of partnership. Multidimensionality, flexibility, reflectiveness, and a commitment to empowerment are presented as key features of PEP. Chapter Two overviews historical and contemporary conceptualizations of environmentally-oriented practice and suggests that this approach has been marginalized by an elusive theory of environment and the concomitant abandonment of the poor and all that is symbolized by poverty. Chapter Three elucidates the interdisciplinary platform of PEP which consists of critical and constructivist views of the environment; empowerment and strengths perspectives; and current knowledge about social networks, social support, resilience, and protective factors. The client's environment includes perceived, physical, social, institutional and organizational, and cultural and sociopolitical dimensions. Chapter Four describes the nuts and bolts of environmental assessment, the overall goal of which is to empower the client to act in the environment. The instructions and diagrams essential to social network mapping are provided, along with a useful summary table of over
30 assessment tools appropriate to the different environmental dimensions. In Chapter Five the authors argue that enhancing social networks is at the core of environmental intervention, and is accomplished via the worker’s allegiance to a strengths-based and collaborative posture. Natural helper interventions, network facilitation, mutual aid groups, and network skills training are described. Although peppered throughout the text, issues related to diversity comprise the bulk of Chapter Six. The authors argue that environmental experiences and interpretations pivot around a person’s race, class, gender, sexuality, developmental level, and presence of a physical or mental challenge. Chapter Seven shores up concluding thoughts about the implications of environmentally-situated practice: the challenge of developing and disseminating knowledge, the role of participatory-action research, and practical and ethical implications.

Person-environment practice will resonate with educators who struggle to infuse macro concepts into micropractice while they prepare practitioners to serve clients with multiple challenges in unpredictable service environments. The utility of this text for foundation practice courses, however, is somewhat compromised by the (intentional) omission of core micropractice skills. On the other hand, educators will find the explication of assessment and intervention strategies to be indispensable reference material: It provides a concrete means of presenting both the inter- and intrapersonal aspects of helping on an equal footing. Veteran practitioners and academicians will revel in the succinct and pithy manner in which empirical and theoretical contributions underscoring PEP are presented, while those who are insufficiently embroiled in the literature may be intimidated by the breadth and depth of this material. Nevertheless, readers grounded in both academic and practice arenas will be duly rewarded for their efforts, the manner in which theoretical constructs are woven with implications for interpersonal helping has both intellectual and practical appeal.

The authors successfully meet their goals in this initial volume: They simultaneously normalize and stimulate reflection and dialogue about the environment as the proper locus and focus of interpersonal helping. They lay the groundwork for ongoing empirical investigation of environmentally-situated practice process
and outcomes. One unresolved nagging concern, for example, revolves around the attractiveness of PEP in an era of fiscal strangulation. Environmentally-situated practice is both time intensive and time consuming, and although a worker’s immersion in the community makes good practice sense, the legitimization and validation of PEP strategies will ultimately stem from a radical reconstruction of current reimbursement strategies that capitalize on individual pathology. The claim that PEP requires workers to “practice with an attitude” (p. 18), appropriately foretells of the challenges ahead for transformers who recognize that the boundaries separating workers from clients are merely illusory, albeit comforting demarcations. A person-environment practice orientation can infuse hope, creativity, and energy into tired service-delivery systems that appear distracted by the need to justify their own existence. To extend a popular metaphor, the distillations in this book promise a means by which social workers may earn back their wings, not because we repent our unfaithfulness, but because we at last have a blueprint for an environmentally-responsive practice orientation.

Catherine M. Lemieux
Louisiana State University


The fascination, perhaps even obsession, among mental health professionals of all disciplines with what the law is and says about a particular subject seems unending. Many good albeit general law and mental health texts have appeared on the market and have been useful to students to the extent that an overview of legal thinking and reasoning can be garnered from them. Some of these texts provide broad general sweeps of information interesting from a socio-legal and procedural standpoint as opposed to a substantive policy-practice decision-making framework. Now, in a succinct, focused, and fascinating exception to the norm, Professor Donald Dickson provides a bounty of substantive information in his latest text: Confidentiality and Privacy in Social Work: A Guide to the Law for Practitioners and Students.
and outcomes. One unresolved nagging concern, for example, revolves around the attractiveness of PEP in an era of fiscal strangulation. Environmentally-situated practice is both time intensive and time consuming, and although a worker's immersion in the community makes good practice sense, the legitimization and validation of PEP strategies will ultimately stem from a radical reconstruction of current reimbursement strategies that capitalize on individual pathology. The claim that PEP requires workers to "practice with an attitude" (p. 18), appropriately foretells of the challenges ahead for transformers who recognize that the boundaries separating workers from clients are merely illusory, albeit comforting demarcations. A person-environment practice orientation can infuse hope, creativity, and energy into tired service-delivery systems that appear distracted by the need to justify their own existence. To extend a popular metaphor, the distillations in this book promise a means by which social workers may earn back their wings, not because we repent our unfaithfulness, but because we at last have a blueprint for an environmentally-responsive practice orientation.

Catherine M. Lemieux
Louisiana State University


The fascination, perhaps even obsession, among mental health professionals of all disciplines with what the law is and says about a particular subject seems unending. Many good albeit general law and mental health texts have appeared on the market and have been useful to students to the extent that an overview of legal thinking and reasoning can be garnered from them. Some of these texts provide broad general sweeps of information interesting from a socio-legal and procedural standpoint as opposed to a substantive policy-practice decision-making framework. Now, in a succinct, focused, and fascinating exception to the norm, Professor Donald Dickson provides a bounty of substantive information in his latest text: Confidentiality and Privacy in Social Work: A Guide to the Law for Practitioners and Students.
Without doubt, confidentiality is a hot topic in today's society—and not just for presidents and special prosecutors! With computerization of medical records, mega-systems of health care delivery networks, a populace fearful of exposure to everything from AIDS to Ebola, and social workers concerned about ending up as defendants in malpractice litigation, what one can reasonably expect to be kept private and/or confidential is the question of the day. Author Dickson attempts to give us a few answers while building a case for why we should all be asking more questions before providing information about others or ourselves to a third party. By the end of this text, the one certain conclusion readers reach is that the principles of privacy and confidentiality can only be truly understood when studied in the contexts in which they arise. Even then, how the practitioner responds when concerns about privacy and confidentiality are raised depends on her ability to think through the dynamic features of these very elusive principles.

*Confidentiality and Privacy in Social Work: A Guide to the Law for Practitioners and Students* is divided into two major sections. Part one presents what Dickson calls *Basic Principles for the Professional*. Here, confidentiality, privacy, and ethical responsibilities of social workers are described and defined. In the second major section, *Law and Practice*, Dickson explores specific practice-related legal issues and illustrates how the principles of confidentiality and privacy apply to each.

In chapter one, Dickson opens with a good, general overview of the law re confidentiality and privacy in social work. He is careful to frame this overview in the context of change, warning the reader that law is dynamic and evolutionary and that it varies from state to state, professional code to professional code. This first chapter sets the tone for the complexity of the rest of the text, and in the following chapter, Dickson delves right into the difficult issues of confidentiality and privileged communications. Here the reader is confronted with the reality that there is no rulebook on which s/he can rely when a decision must be made about disclosing client information.

Chapter three introduces and explores certain individual rights of privacy that have been found by the courts to be constitutionally protected. This overview of privacy rights presents a
contextual view of privacy as it applies to right-to-die disputes, sexual matters, searches of person and property, and eavesdropping and methods of electronic surveillance. A few of these topics receive expanded coverage in later chapters of the text.

Professor Dickson sums up the section on professional principles by comparing, in chapter four, the number of content of the provisions related to privacy and confidentiality contained in the NASW’s Code of Ethics in 1960, 1979, and 1996. The dramatic increase in relevant ethical standards promulgated over this 36-year period is a reflection of the profession’s corresponding awareness and concern about client and worker privacy rights.

Part two of the text, Law and Practice, gets down to the nitty gritty of privacy and confidentiality and its six chapters should both pique and satisfy the interests of practitioners and students alike. After all, the privacy interests implicated in the topics Dickson covers are not simply events that affect clients; they affect everyone, readers included. Who hasn’t wondered whether their email is being read and what recourse there might be to address this intrusion? What does constitute sexual harassment and what is a hostile environment? Is there such a thing as having a reasonable expectation of privacy in one’s health/mental health records? What instructor hasn’t been faced with a class of students demanding to know if a certain alleged child abuse scenario constitutes a legally reportable event? Professor Dickson wisely details a series of special privacy issues that are of universal concern.

This test is a critical thinker’s dream in that it is challenging, disconcerting, and fascinating all at the same time. Admirably, rather than writing a rulebook for decision making, Dickson instead addresses, within the dynamic confluence of case law, statutory law, and professional ethics, timely and often misunderstood substantive topics such as the social worker’s duty to warn and protect, the rights of minors, and privacy of health care records. There are chapters, such as chapter five which focuses on workplace privacy, that leave the reader appropriately frustrated, not knowing for sure what is private and what is not, mirroring the real ambiguity of the still evolving law in this area. It becomes clear in various discussions in this text, for example, that regarding privacy in health care records and files, that clients
and consumers and ordinary citizens cannot have both advanced technology and complete personal privacy; that one will yield to the other at least to some extent and for some uncomfortable period of time.

In this text, Professor Dickson succeeds not only in illustrating how dynamic the concepts of confidentiality and privacy are, but also in explaining why they are dynamic. In an odd way, this dynamism is comforting; serving as a reminder that good, responsible, and responsive social work is in the details—details practitioners and policymakers must continually explore. Students and practitioners alike will benefit from a thorough reading of this text and from continued exploration of these issues. The only complaint that can be made of this book is that Professor Dickson didn’t write on and on. Then again, from an academic point of view, isn’t that just what is hoped for—a text so compelling it leaves the reader with a yearning for more. Make room on your bookshelf for D.T. Dickson’s Confidentiality and Privacy in Social Work: A Guide to the Law for Practitioners and Students.

Margaret Severson
University of Kansas


Imagine that you were asked to select the criteria which would characterize the ‘perfect’ foundation social work textbook dealing with interpersonal practice. What would you look for? Perhaps high on your list would be that the book present a ‘generalist’ perspective, begin with an overview of the humanistic underpinnings of our field, examine our profession’s value base, the ethics of practice, and something of the history of direct social work services. You would also like to see a book which deals skillfully with the complexities of multicultural practice, and covers family and group work as well as individually provided services. Including thought-provoking study questions and issues for discussion at the end of each chapter would be decided plus, if you were an instructor, as would a glossary of professional terminology. Imagine that you would particularly appreciate a book which covers critical thinking skills in some depth, and which is committed
and consumers and ordinary citizens cannot have both advanced technology and complete personal privacy; that one will yield to the other at least to some extent and for some uncomfortable period of time.

In this text, Professor Dickson succeeds not only in illustrating how dynamic the concepts of confidentiality and privacy are, but also in explaining why they are dynamic. In an odd way, this dynamism is comforting; serving as a reminder that good, responsible, and responsive social work is in the details—details practitioners and policymakers must continually explore. Students and practitioners alike will benefit from a thorough reading of this text and from continued exploration of these issues. The only complaint that can be made of this book is that Professor Dickson didn’t write on and on. Then again, from an academic point of view, isn’t that just what is hoped for—a text so compelling it leaves the reader with a yearning for more. Make room on your bookshelf for D.T. Dickson’s *Confidentiality and Privacy in Social Work: A Guide to the Law for Practitioners and Students*.

Margaret Severson
University of Kansas


Imagine that you were asked to select the criteria which would characterize the ‘perfect’ foundation social work textbook dealing with interpersonal practice. What would you look for? Perhaps high on your list would that the book present a ‘generalist’ perspective, begin with an overview of the humanistic underpinnings of our field, examine our profession’s value base, the ethics of practice, and something of the history of direct social work services. You would also like to see a book which deals skillfully with the complexities of multicultural practice, and covers family and group work as well as individually provided services. Including thought-provoking study questions and issues for discussion at the end of each chapter would be decided plus, if you were an instructor, as would a glossary of professional terminology. I imagine that you would particularly appreciate a book which covers critical thinking skills in some depth, and which is committed
to a broadly-based empirical orientation. You would not wish yet another text which merely provides a superficial and uncritical review of an increasingly large number of practice theories and methods, most of which have never been shown through credible outcome studies that they actually are capable of meaningfully helping social work clients.

If the above considerations are some of the issues which are important to you, then I mostly highly recommend Eileen Gambrill’s *Social Work Practice: A Critical Thinker’s Guide*, which in my opinion is quite simply the most comprehensive and well presented practice textbook currently available. Written with considerable clinical acumen, Gambrill covers a vast array of pertinent literature in an extremely readable style. No mind-numbing recitation of dry facts, nor reliance on seductive anecdote, this book represents the best mixture of practice skills interwoven with the principles of empirically-based treatments which I am aware of.

All the topics usually addressed in a foundation practice class are covered—relationship skills, assessment, engagement, selecting intervention plans, overcoming obstacles, evaluating treatment, termination, and avoiding professional burnout. Plus this is a handsomely constructed volume, laden with easy to understand and insightful diagrams, tables, and lists. The publisher deserves some credit for a top-quality job in typesetting and binding. A bit unusual is a chapter devoted to clearly explaining some elementary principles of human behavior derived from the long-venerated person-in-environment perspective which has always characterized social work, but supported through a compelling linkage with contemporary learning theories. If the book presents a consistent conceptual framework it is this attractive integration which operationalizes the ethereal generalizations of the person-in-environment perspective through the specific principles of respondent, operant, and observational learning.

Interwoven throughout the text are guidelines for developing critical thinking skills, the hallmarks of responsible critical thinking, of scientific reasoning, of the characteristics of fallacious reasoning, and how to separate the facts from the fantasies of social work ‘knowledge’. Gambrill capably reviews the features of ‘antiscientific’ practices, of straw-man arguments against basing
practice on empirical evidence, where such knowledge has been developed. 'Evaluation' is another consistent theme—evaluating practice theories, evaluating our assessment methods, our practice alternatives, and the actual outcomes of social work interventions, threatening though this may be. As she accurately notes “... the sincerity of our interest in helping clients is reflected in the efforts we make to find out whether we do help them. Compassion for the troubles of others requires finding out if we did help” (p. 15).

As I enter my third decade of teaching social work practice, I came away from reading Gambrill's text considerably humbled by how much of value I learned from her scholarship. This is a refreshing read for the most jaded practitioner, and an inspiring presentation of the best which social work practice has to offer for the foundation student. Social Work Practice: A Critical Thinker's Guide is well positioned to take the profession into the third millennium. Thank you, Professor Gambrill!

Bruce A. Thyer
University of Georgia, U.S.A. &
University of Huddersfield, U.K.
Book Notes


Despite hopes that progressive political leaders will reverse the retrenchments which have taken place in the public social services over the last 20 years, it is now generally accepted that the welfare state has undergone a profound transformation. The belief that governments should provide a comprehensive system of care for their citizens has been undermined, if not abandoned. Today, many governments are encouraging the purchase of private health care, retirement and other forms of social protection. As public welfare services are being focused increasingly on the poor, residualism is emerging as the dominant modality in social policy.

This book examines the expansion of private social provision with specific reference to pensions policy in nine industrial nations including Austria, France, Germany, Japan, Sweden and the United States. As the editor's comprehensive introduction points out, the governments of these nations now recognize that the public system cannot adequately meet the needs of their aging populations, and that a multi-pillared system will be required if the contingency of retirement is to be adequately addressed. The nine case studies contained in this book examine the nature of the public-private welfare mix in each country in detail, and this permits the editors to draw some general conclusions about current pension policy trends in the industrial world.

The analysis is both informative and important. The editors suggest that the contrary to current thinking, the situation is extremely fluid and that the notion of static pillars of provision do not provide an adequate conceptual framework for analysis. In addition, those who receive pensions are not a homogenous group who respond to the challenges of retirement in the same way. Elderly people in many of the countries included in the book continue to engage in productive employment and many proactively manage their own retirement incomes. While many
elderly people are dependent on state pensions, others effectively manage the different sources of income that accrue to them. There are also significant differences in the way governments seek to formulate pension policies. Despite its misleading title, which suggests a much broader analysis of enterprise and social policy, this account of changing pension policies in the industrial nations is a significant addition to the literature.


Numerous explanations for the emergence of the so-called welfare state in the industrial nations in the middle decades of this century have been offered by social scientists. Generally these explanations have emphasized the role of class in the evolution of state welfare. While Marxists view welfare statism as little more than a conspiratorial attempt on the part of capitalists to subdue the revolutionary potential of the working class, social democrats regard the creation of comprehensive government welfare programs as a triumph of working class struggle. Although functionalist explanations emphasize the important of industrialization in the genesis of state social programs, they too regard class as an important factor in welfare development.

In recent years, scholars such as Theda Skocpol have offered a radically different interpretation of the emergence of government social welfare. Skocpol's historical analysis contends that the American welfare state did not emerge out of class struggle but rather from campaigns for the introduction of pensions for widows and civil war veterans in the 19th century. The initial impetus for the welfare state was not rooted in European style class politics but in populist attempts to provide for needy mothers and soldiers.

In his engaging book on the factors that gave rise to a network of residential institutions for the disabled veterans of the American civil war, Patrick Kelly extends Skocpol's work. His impressively detailed account of the way disabled war veterans were initially supported by philanthropic organizations and later by the federal government shows that populist sentiment and organized interest group politics were vitally important for the
elderly people are dependent on state pensions, others effectively manage the different sources of income that accrue to them. There are also significant differences in the way governments seek to formulate pension policies. Despite its misleading title, which suggests a much broader analysis of enterprise and social policy, this account of changing pension policies in the industrial nations is a significant addition to the literature.


Numerous explanations for the emergence of the so-called welfare state in the industrial nations in the middle decades of this century have been offered by social scientists. Generally these explanations have emphasized the role of class in the evolution of state welfare. While Marxists view welfare statism as little more than a conspiratorial attempt on the part of capitalists to subdue the revolutionary potential of the working class, social democrats regard the creation of comprehensive government welfare programs as a triumph of working class struggle. Although functionalist explanations emphasize the important of industrialization in the genesis of state social programs, they too regard class as an important factor in welfare development.

In recent years, scholars such as Theda Skocpol have offered a radically different interpretation of the emergence of government social welfare. Skocpol's historical analysis contends that the American welfare state did not emerge out of class struggle but rather from campaigns for the introduction of pensions for widows and civil war veterans in the 19th century. The initial impetus for the welfare state was not rooted in European style class politics but in populist attempts to provide for needy mothers and soldiers.

In his engaging book on the factors that gave rise to a network of residential institutions for the disabled veterans of the American civil war, Patrick Kelly extends Skocpol's work. His impressively detailed account of the way disabled war veterans were initially supported by philanthropic organizations and later by the federal government shows that populist sentiment and organized interest group politics were vitally important for the
emergence of statutory social welfare in the United States. Although the federal government initially insisted that the needs of disabled veterans should be met by charitable enterprises, persistent pressure from organized groups of veterans and their advocates resulted in the creation of what was known as the National Home. Today, its successor, the Veteran’s Administration, manages the largest network of hospitals and related health care services in the country.

Kelly’s book is easy to read, highly informative and scholarly. It builds on Skocpol’s pioneering work and will be an essential reference for anyone concerned with the historical evolution of social policy in the United States.


Although social welfare policies originate in political processes, government policy making has long been informed by the ideas of social scientists. At the turn of the century, Social Darwinism and an obsession with ‘feeblemindedness’ in social science circles fostered the emergence of social programs that favored institutionalization and the sterilization of many needy people. During the 1930s, Keynesianism and related interventionist ideas provided an intellectual basis for the social policies of the New Deal. Communitarian populism exerted a similar influence on the formulation of President Johnson’s War on Poverty Programs in the 1960s. In more recent times, the theories of Charles Murray, Lawrence Mead and Marvin Olasky have shaped the Republican Party’s approach to social welfare, and contributed substantially to what many experts today regard as the demise of the welfare state.

In this useful book, William Epstein examines the contribution of contemporary social science thinking to American social policy formulation. The book is both a compendium and a critique. While documenting the ideas of a host of thinkers who currently inform social welfare policy, Epstein also berates the lack of rigorous efforts to test the veracity and usefulness of these ideas in policy implementation. While social science knowledge continues to inform the policy making process, he argues that
emergence of statutory social welfare in the United States. Although the federal government initially insisted that the needs of disabled veterans should be met by charitable enterprises, persistent pressure from organized groups of veterans and their advocates resulted in the creation of what was known as the National Home. Today, its successor, the Veteran's Administration, manages the largest network of hospitals and related health care services in the country.

Kelly's book is easy to read, highly informative and scholarly. It builds on Skocpol's pioneering work and will be an essential reference for anyone concerned with the historical evolution of social policy in the United States.


Although social welfare policies originate in political processes, government policy making has long been informed by the ideas of social scientists. At the turn of the century, Social Darwinism and an obsession with 'feeblemindedness' in social science circles fostered the emergence of social programs that favored institutionalization and the sterilization of many needy people. During the 1930s, Keynesianism and related interventionist ideas provided an intellectual basis for the social policies of the New Deal. Communitarian populism exerted a similar influence on the formulation of President Johnson's War on Poverty Programs in the 1960s. In more recent times, the theories of Charles Murray, Lawrence Mead and Marvin Olasky have shaped the Republican Party's approach to social welfare, and contributed substantially to what many experts today regard as the demise of the welfare state.

In this useful book, William Epstein examines the contribution of contemporary social science thinking to American social policy formulation. The book is both a compendium and a critique. While documenting the ideas of a host of thinkers who currently inform social welfare policy, Epstein also berates the lack of rigorous efforts to test the veracity and usefulness of these ideas in policy implementation. While social science knowledge continues to inform the policy making process, he argues that
its application in major social programs seldom results in careful performance assessments. Where assessment are made, their claims of effectiveness are seldom dependable. Inaccurate data, inappropriate methodologies and weak scientific designs negate assumptions about the efficacy of policy approaches based on social science theories. The depressing result is that social science knowledge does not drive the policy making process but tends rather to support the ideological preconceptions of the proponents of particular approaches. The result is a failure to formulate policy interventions that will effectively address the needs of the poor.

While some readers may view Epstein's critique as unduly pessimistic, this should not detract from the major contribution he has made to documenting, in an encyclopedic way, the vast body of social science literature that has accumulated in recent years to illuminate many complex aspects of social welfare policy. His summaries of social science contributions to welfare reform, employment, family disintegration and other issues are comprehensive, informative and incisive. This excellent book will undoubtedly be widely consulted.


As reports of civil strife and government oppression in different parts of the world continue to dominate the popular media, the issue of human rights remains at the forefront of public consciousness. But, as Joseph Wronka points out in this revised edition to his informative book, the notion of human rights has social as well as civil and political dimensions. The emphasis placed on social rights in the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights and similar international instruments is seldom mentioned, and yet it is as important as the civil and political freedoms which are more frequently referred to. This has created a double standard which focuses attention on civil rights abuses in many poor nations but ignores the way industrial countries such as the United States have avoided their obligation to ensure social rights for all. The fact that the United States has still not ratified the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of the Child suggests that much more
its application in major social programs seldom results in careful performance assessments. Where assessment are made, their claims of effectiveness are seldom dependable. Inaccurate data, inappropriate methodologies and weak scientific designs negate assumptions about the efficacy of policy approaches based on social science theories. The depressing result is that social science knowledge does not drive the policy making process but tends rather to support the ideological preconceptions of the proponents of particular approaches. The result is a failure to formulate policy interventions that will effectively address the needs of the poor.

While some readers may view Epstein's critique as unduly pessimistic, this should not detract from the major contribution he has made to documenting, in an encyclopedic way, the vast body of social science literature that has accumulated in recent years to illuminate many complex aspects of social welfare policy. His summaries of social science contributions to welfare reform, employment, family disintegration and other issues are comprehensive, informative and incisive. This excellent book will undoubtedly be widely consulted.


As reports of civil strife and government oppression in different parts of the world continue to dominate the popular media, the issue of human rights remains at the forefront of public consciousness. But, as Joseph Wronka points out in this revised edition to his informative book, the notion of human rights has social as well as civil and political dimensions. The emphasis placed on social rights in the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights and similar international instruments is seldom mentioned, and yet it is as important as the civil and political freedoms which are more frequently referred to. This has created a double standard which focuses attention on civil rights abuses in many poor nations but ignores the way industrial countries such as the United States have avoided their obligation to ensure social rights for all. The fact that the United States has still not ratified the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of the Child suggests that much more
needs to be done before the social aspects of human rights are properly respected by a nation that leads the world in advocating for human rights.

Wronka's book begins with a detailed analysis of the United Nations Declaration, describing its contents and tracing its historical evolution. He compares its key provisions with the Constitution of the United States and with those of several other American states as well. He highlights key similarities and differences and points out that it is in the field of social policy that the notion of human rights is least well developed. The book contains an interesting historical review emphasizing the emergence of civil and political rights. It is in this regard that the book could have benefited from a more extensive discussion of the work of T. H. Marshall and other social citizenship writers whose ideas have been challenged in recent times. While these writers sought to provide a normative basis for government social provision, they have been undermined by critics such as Lawrence Mead who have stressed the obligations rather than rights of citizenship. Nevertheless, Wronka's book covers a substantive field and should be widely used in social policy teaching. His ability to integrate international material with the more localized interests of many students is particularly commendable.
CORRESPONDING AUTHORS

Amnon Boehm
School of Social Work
University of Haifa
Mount Carmel
Haifa 31905, Israel
email: aboehm@research.haifa.ac.il

Orna Cohen
Bob Shapell School of Social Work
Tel Aviv University
Ramat Aviv
Tel Aviv 69978, Israel

David P. Fauri
Professor
School of Social Work
Virginia Commonwealth University
1001 W. Franklin Street
Richmond, VA 23284-2027
(804) 828-0408 (phone)
email: dfauri@saturn.vcu.edu

Jennifer Hamer
Department of Sociology
Southern Illinois University
Edwardsville, IL 62026-1455
(618) 650-5694 (phone)
email: jhamerc@siue.edu

Marcia P. Harrigan
Associate Professor
School of Social Work
Virginia Commonwealth University
1001 W. Franklin Street
Richmond, VA 23284-2027
(804) 828-0408 (phone)
email: mharrig@SATURN.VCU.EDU

Michael A. Lewis
Assistant Professor of Social Welfare
School of Social Welfare
State University of New York
at Stony Brook
(516) 444-3155
email: michael@ssw.hsc.sunysb.edu

F. Ellen Netting
Professor
School of Social Work
Virginia Commonwealth University
1001 W. Franklin Street
Richmond, VA 23284-2027
(804) 828-0408 (phone)
email: enetting@saturn.vcu.edu

Brian J. O’Neill
School of Social Work
University of British Columbia
Vancouver, British Columbia

Colin Peile
Department of Social Work and Social Policy
The University of Queensland
St. Lucia QLD 4072
Australia
(07) 3365 3343 (phone)
(07) 3365 1788 (fax)
email: peilec@social.uq.edu.au

Frank A. Sansone
Assistant Professor
Department of Social Work
University of West Florida
11000 University Parkway
Pensacola, FL 32514-5751
(850) 474-2709 (phone)
(850) 474-2381 (fax)
email: fsansone@uwf.edu

Moshe Sherer
Bob Shapell School of Social Work
Tel Aviv University
Ramat Aviv
Tel Aviv 69978, Israel
email: shererl@post.tau.ac.il

Rivka Savaya
Bob Shapell School of Social Work
Tel Aviv University
Ramat Aviv
Tel Aviv 69978, Israel
email: savaya@post.tau.ac.il
### JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND SOCIAL WELFARE
#### 1998 PUBLICATION INFORMATION & SUBSCRIPTION RATES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Volume:</th>
<th>XXV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volume Year:</td>
<td>1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Period:</td>
<td>1/98 to 12/98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of Publication:</td>
<td>QUARTERLY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Dates:</td>
<td>MARCH, JUNE, SEPTEMBER, DECEMBER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subscription Rates:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INDIVIDUAL IN U.S.</td>
<td>$35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. INDIVIDUAL OUTSIDE U.S.</td>
<td>$40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. INSTITUTION IN U.S.</td>
<td>$75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. INSTITUTION OUTSIDE U.S.</td>
<td>$85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postage:</td>
<td>INCLUDED IN PRICE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currency:</td>
<td>U.S. DOLLARS (Firm exchange rate not available)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payment:</td>
<td>PREPAYMENT (must accompany order)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective Price Start Date:</td>
<td>June 1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Year Sub. Rate:</td>
<td>NOT AVAILABLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cancellation Policy:</td>
<td>NONCANCELLABLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claim Policy:</td>
<td>FREE REPLACEMENT WITHIN SIX (6) MONTHS OF PUBLICATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Back Issues:</td>
<td>$15.00 PER ISSUE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSN:</td>
<td>0199-5096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax-Free Registry No.:</td>
<td>0-154961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Tax I.D. No.:</td>
<td>360007327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index:</td>
<td>INCLUDED IN ISSUE NUMBER 4 AT NO EXTRA COST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact Person:</td>
<td>Frederick F. McDonald, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Editor</td>
<td>Journal of Sociology &amp; Social Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Michigan University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Social Work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5034  U.S.A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tel. – (616) 387-3191</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax – (616) 387-3117</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INSTRUCTIONS FOR AUTHORS
(Revised June, 1995)

JSSW welcomes a broad range of articles which analyze social welfare Institutions, policies, or problems from a social scientific perspective or otherwise attempt to bridge the gap between social science theory and social work practice.

Submission Process. Submit manuscripts to Robert Leightninger, School of Social Work, Louisiana State University, 311 Huey P. Long Fieldhouse, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70803. Send three copies together with an abstract of approximately 100 words. Since manuscripts are not returned by reviewers to the editorial office, the editorial office cannot return them to the authors. Submission certifies that it is an original article and that it has not been published nor is being considered for publication elsewhere.

Reviewing normally takes 120 days.

Preparation. Articles should be typed, doublespaced (including the abstract, indented material, footnotes, references, and tables) on 8½ × 11 inch white bond paper with one inch margins on all sides.

Anonymous Review. To facilitate anonymous review, please keep identifying information out of the manuscript. Only the title should appear on the first page. Attach cover pages that contain the title, authors, affiliations, date of submission, mailing address, telephone number and any statements of credit or research support.

Style. Overall style should conform to that found in the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association, Fourth Edition, 1994. Use in-text citations (Reich, 1983), (Reich, 1983, p. 5). The use of footnotes in the text is discouraged. If footnotes are essential, include them on a separate sheet after the last page of the references. The use of italics or quotation marks for emphasis is discouraged. Words should be underlined only when it is intended that they be typeset in italics.

Gender and Disability Stereotypes. Please use gender neutral phrasing. Use plural pronouns and truly generic nouns ("labor force" instead of "manpower"). When dealing with disabilities, avoid making people synonymous with the disability they have ("employees with visual impairments" rather than "the blind"). Don’t magnify the disabling condition ("wheelchair user" rather than "confined to a wheelchair"). For further suggestions see the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association or Guide to Non-Sexist Language and Visuals, University of Wisconsin-Extension.

BOOK REVIEWS
Books for review should be sent to James Midgley, Office of Research and Economic Development, Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, LA 70803.

Founding Editors
Norman Goroff and Ralph Segalman