March 2001

Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare Vol. 28, No. 1 (March 2001)

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw

Part of the Social Work Commons, and the Sociology Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw/vol28/iss1/1

This Complete Issue is brought to you by the Western Michigan University School of Social Work. For more information, please contact wmu-scholarworks@wmich.edu.
The JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND SOCIAL WELFARE is edited and published by the SCHOOL OF SOCIAL WORK, WESTERN MICHIGAN UNIVERSITY, 1201 Oliver Street, Kalamazoo, MI 49008.

JSSW is sponsored jointly by Western Michigan University, the College of Health and Human Services, and School of Social Work. The substantial support of Arizona State University in the publication of the journal is gratefully acknowledged.

Editor: Robert D. Leighninger, Jr.
Managing Editor: Frederick M. Donald
E Mail: frederick.macdonald@wmich.edu
Associate Editor: Steven R. Rose

Editorial Board

Mimi Abramowitz
Paul Adams
Pallassana Balgopal
William Buffum
Iris Carlton-LaNey
Harris Chaskin
Pranab Chatterjee
Mary Jo Deegan
Paula L. Dressel
Robert Fisher
Padmini Galati
Alejandro Garcia
David Gil
Edward Gumz
Lorraine M. Gutiérrez
Charles Guzzetta
John Herrick

John Pardeck
Wilma Poublens-Wilkins
Dennis Peck
Marcia Petchers
Raju Ramakrishnan
Sonja Parker
Redmond
Susan Robbins
Margarita Rosenthal
Eunice Shatz
Arthur Shustak
John Tropman
Katherine Tyson
John Williamson
James Wolk
Gale Goldberg Wood

Administrative Assistant
Judith K. Ortiz

Book Review Editor
James Midgley, Dean, School of Social Welfare
University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA 94720


Copyright © Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare, 2000

JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND SOCIAL WELFARE
Volume XXVIII March, 2001 Number 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEFINING HUMAN SERVICES
Chaim Zins

SOCIAL WORK AND LABOR: A LOOK AT THE NORTH AMERICAN AGREEMENT ON LABOR COOPERATION
Constance Phelps

CRIME RATES AND CONFIDENCE IN THE POLICE: AMERICA'S CHANGING ATTITUDES TOWARD CRIME AND POLICY, 1972–1999
Georgia Ackerman, Bobbie Anderson, Scott Jensen, Randy Ludwig, Darrel Montero, Nicole Plante, and Vince Yanez

THE EFFECTIVENESS AND ENFORCEMENT OF A TEEN CURFEW LAW
Richard D. Stuphen and Janet Ford

THE INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF GRANDMOTHER-GRANDCHILD CO-RESIDENCY
Richard K. Caputo

THE TRANSFORMATION OF RUSSIAN SOCIAL POLICY IN THE TRANSITION TOWARD A MARKET ECONOMY
Isabel Pir Julián

NEIGHBOR'S KNOWLEDGE AND REACTION TO SUSPECTED CHILD ABUSE IN AN URBAN SETTING
Gary Paquin, John Schaefer and Adam Carle

RESIDENTIAL MOBILITY AND YOUTH WELL-BEING: RESEARCH, POLICY AND PRACTICE ISSUES
Edward Stanion and Kevin Devine

THE FINANCIAL VULNERABILITY OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES: ASSESSING POVERTY RISKS
Andrew I. Batters and Richard Bourdierer
TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEFINING HUMAN SERVICES 3
Chaim Zins

SOCIAL WORK AND LABOR: A LOOK AT THE NORTH AMERICAN AGREEMENT ON LABOR COOPERATION 23
Constance Phelps

CRIME RATES AND CONFIDENCE IN THE POLICE: AMERICA'S CHANGING ATTITUDES TOWARD CRIME AND POLICY, 1972–1999 43
Georgia Ackerman, Bobbie Anderson, Scott Jensen, Randy Ludwig, Darrel Montero, Nicole Plante, and Vince Yanez

THE EFFECTIVENESS AND ENFORCEMENT OF A TEEN CURFEW LAW 55
Richard D. Sutphen and Janet Ford

THE INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF GRANDMOTHER-GRANDCHILD CO-RESIDENCY 79
Richard K. Caputo

THE TRANSFORMATION OF RUSSIAN SOCIAL POLICY IN THE TRANSITION TOWARD A MARKET ECONOMY 87
Isabel Pla Julian

NEIGHBOR'S KNOWLEDGE AND REACTION TO SUSPECTED CHILD ABUSE IN AN URBAN SETTING 105
Gary Paquin, John Schafer and Adam Carle

RESIDENTIAL MOBILITY AND YOUTH WELL-BEING: RESEARCH, POLICY AND PRACTICE ISSUES 119
Edward Scanlon and Kevin Devine

THE FINANCIAL VULNERABILITY OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES: ASSESSING POVERTY RISKS 139
Andrew I. Batavia and Richard Beaulaurier
BOOK REVIEWS

Social Security for the Excluded Majority. Wouter van Ginneken (Ed.). Reviewed by Mizanur Miah, Southern Illinois University at Carbondale. 163

Adolescents After Divorce. Christy M. Buchanan, Eleonor E. Maccoby and Sanford M. Dornbusch. Reviewed by Dorinda Noble, Louisiana State University. 165

Independent Practice for the Mental Health Professional: Growing a Private Practice for the 21st Century. Ralph H. Earle and Dorothy J. Barnes. Reviewed by Rafael Herrera, University of California at Berkeley. 168

Addictions and Native Americans. Lawrence Armand French. Reviewed by Michael Gorman, San Jose State University. 170

Medicare Reform: Issues and Answers. Andrew J. Rettenmaier and Thomas R. Saving (Eds.). Reviewed by Deborah Schild Wilkinson, University of Michigan. 172

BOOK NOTES

Changing Politics of Canadian Social Policy. James R. Rice and Michael J. Prince. 177

Poverty and Social Assistance in Transition Countries. Jeanine Braithwaite, Christiaan Grootaert and Branko Milanovic. 178

What's Love Got to Do With it?: A Critical Look at American Charity. David Wagner. 179

This study aims at formulating adequate criteria for designing the field of human services. Based on a conceptual analysis of "human services" the study establishes the theoretical ground of a four-category model for classifying human service organizations, and three alternative definitions of the field. The classificatory principle underlying the model and the definitions reflects the contribution of human services to overall societal wellbeing. I conclude the study by discussing the implications for social welfare policy planning, service design and evaluation, and shaping the nature of the helping professions.

The field of human services is constantly changing and is expected to grow as we enter the new millennium. New populations are joining the circle of recipients and new services are offered within the framework of "human services". The frequent changes and the overwhelming confusion regarding the meaning of this key concept create difficulties for social welfare policy makers. They also determine the design and the evaluation of human service organizations, and shape the nature of the helping professions.

This study aims at formulating adequate criteria for redesigning the field of human services in the societal realm, as well as in the academic. Evidently, in the light of constantly changing social conditions and social norms, we need an adequate definition based on solid theoretical foundations. Formulating such a definition requires a critical analysis of the concept of "human services". As we shall see, the conceptual analysis establishes the theoretical ground for defining a four-category model for
Definitions of Human Services

The literature offers numerous definitions of the concept "human services", but none of them is generally accepted (Schmolling and Youkeles, 1997). The various definitions suggested by scholars and practitioners are used for diverse purposes, such as classifying bibliographic materials, characterizing organizations, and defining the professional uniqueness of human service personnel. Furthermore, the definitions stress different aspects of the concept, among them the provider, the recipient, the needs that the services are designed to meet, and the organizational framework. Yet despite the different contexts, purposes, and perspectives, all the following definitions refer to the same generic term—"human services".

The Provider.—The human factor of service provision seems to inhere in the semantic perspective. "Human services" stresses the human factor, just as "health services" and "information services" indicate that health and information are the factors of those service provisions. Eriksen (1997) presents this perspective: "in its broadest sense, a human service is going on whenever one person is employed to be of service to another (p. 8)".

A definition in the Thesaurus of ERIC (Educational Resources Information Center) Database Descriptors stresses the qualitative contribution of the provider's activity. According to the editors of ERIC human services are "fields of public service in which human interaction is part of the provision of the services (Houston, 1990, P. 120)". Undoubtedly, this complimentary approach pays tribute to the people on the job. But despite the importance of human interaction, it is not the essential factor: this is to satisfy a need. For hungry children, for instance, human sympathy is meaningful, but it cannot substitute food.

The Recipient.—Hasenfeld and English (1983) shift attention from the provider and his or her activities to the service recipient. They identify the human characteristic in the recipient, and define human service organizations as those organizations "whose principal function is to protect, maintain, or enhance the personal well-being of individuals by defining, shaping, or altering their
personal attributes (P. 1)". Accordingly, human service organizations have two key characteristics. First, they work directly with and on people. In fact, they are "distinguished by the fundamental fact that people are their 'raw material' (Hasenfeld, 1992, p. 4)". Second, "they are mandated—and, thus, justify their existence—to protect and to promote the welfare of the people they serve (Hasenfeld and English, 1983, p. 1)". This brings us to the next group of definitions, which add another essential element to the conception.

**The Needs.**—Numerous definitions emphasize the centrality of the needs as the key attribute of human services. The definition used by the Library of Congress (1998) to index bibliographic materials exemplifies this approach. According to the Library of Congress's definition the term "human services" refers to "the various policies, programs, services, and facilities to meet basic human needs relating to the quality of life, such as education, health, welfare (p. 2558)". Still, it is too vague. What are "basic human needs"? Do they include only food, health, and shelter? Or should they include entertainment, leisure, and recreation as well? But the LC definition does stress the goal of meeting basic needs—whatever they are—as an essential attribute of human services. Schmolling et al. (1997) omit the word "basic", stating that all human services share a common feature: they are all designed to meet human needs (p. 2).

The definition presented in a document entitled *The Human Services Worker* narrows the range of the needs by focusing on needs related to social problems. The field of human services, according to the document, is focused on prevention and remediation, of social problems. *The Human Services Worker* (1998) is a joint publication of the National Organization for Human Service Education (NOHSE) and the Council for Standards in Human Service Education (CSHSE). These two major organizations are engaged in the academic education of human service professionals in the United States. Focusing on social problems reflects a major trend in contemporary human service education in American colleges and universities. This approach is also reflected in the occupational profile of the human service personnel in the American milieu, as it is portrayed in the *Occupational Outlook Handbook* (1996–97, p. 128).
Mehr (1986) defines human services as "a field that helps individuals cope with problems of a social welfare, psychological, behavioral, or legal nature (p. 20)". Schmolling et al. (1997, p. 354) specify other fields: health, mental health, criminal justice, recreation, and education. Eriksen (1977) broadens the range to include "the society's many social welfare subsystems—health, education, mental health, welfare, family services, corrections, child care, vocational rehabilitation, housing, community services and the law (p. 8)". Scheurell (1987) adopts this broader approach. He characterizes human services as social services that are primarily aimed at promoting socialization, or solving individual and group problems. Among the fields covered by human services he lists education, employment and manpower, health, housing, income maintenance, information and referral, law, leisure, recreation, and religion.

The Organizational Framework.—Finally, a large group of scholars stress the key role of the organizational framework of the service provision (Hasenfeld and English, 1983, Hasenfeld, 1983, 1992, O'Looney, 1996, Schmolling et al, 1997). Schmolling et al. exclude the help given by family, friends, or other primary supports, and apply the concept of "human services" only to formal organizations (p. 9). O'Looney stresses the systematic nature of the service provision (p. 13).

Ad Hoc Generic Definition

The diversity of meanings is without doubt overwhelming and confusing. Scholars in the field emphasize different characteristics of human services. Furthermore, definitions can be misleading too. From the literature one inevitably reaches the conclusion that different definitions often present the same conception of the key characteristics; and similar definitions present different conceptions of the same characteristics. There is an evident need for a clarified definition, based on a conceptual analysis that comprehensively characterizes the basics of human services.

Despite the above divergences, we are in a position to offer an ad hoc generic definition that provides solid ground for the conceptual analysis and is compatible with the foregoing definitions. "Human services" is defined here as social services designed to
Defining Human Services

meet human needs that are required for maintaining or promoting the overall quality of life of the prospective service populations. A social service is a systematically organized communal response, namely "human services" refers to institutionalized systematic services rather than sporadic help given by family members, friends, or occasional "good Samaritans".

Six Basics of Human Services

By defining "human services" as social services designed to provide human needs, one can identify six key elements common to all human services. These are the provider, the recipient, the environment, the organization, the need, and the method. Every service is an interaction between the provider and the recipient effectuated through four media: the environment, the organizational framework, the needs, and the method. A comprehensive conception of human services should refer to these six basics and to the alternative ways to implement each (Zins, 1999). These relations are shown in Fig. 1.

The six basics constitute criteria for characterizing and classifying human services. For example, based on the organizational framework of the service provision, human services can be classified into two types: services sponsored by non-profit and by for-profit organizations. The non-profit type is subdivided into the governmental sector and the third sector (Zins). Although all the six elements are significant in relevant contexts, two of them emerge as keystones for the conception of human services. These are the needs, addressed by the services, and the prospective recipients. The centrality of these two basics is rooted in the rationale of human services, namely meeting the needs of the service recipients.

Figure 1
Six Basics of Human Services
Human Needs

The concept of "human needs" has been the subject of philosophical, psychological, and sociological studies for centuries. Gaziet (1988) traced philosophical references to related issues back to Greek philosophy, in the writings of the pre-Socratic philosophers, Plato, and Aristotle. Three concepts are relevant to the conception of human services in this context: "needs", "human needs", and "basic human needs". Unquestionably, these three concepts deserve a thorough study, which exceeds beyond the framework of this study. In order to distinguish among different approaches to the field of human services we need distinct definitions of these concepts. Therefore, we have to rely on the following ad hoc definitions and clarifications.

Needs

The Narrow Meaning. The concept of "needs" inherently implies a necessity. In the narrow sense "needs" are uncontrolled necessities or compulsions; these are conditions, objects, activities, or services. People need air to breathe, water to drink, balanced food to eat, and time to sleep. However, the need for balanced food doesn't imply that the food should be tasty. People don't need tasty food for their bare existence; they want to eat tasty food. People need to sleep somewhere from time to time. Yet, they do not need to sleep on a bed under a roof in a closed room; they want it. Still, for many people, eating tasty food and sleeping on a bed under a roof in a closed room are considered as real needs. This leads us to a broader meaning of "needs".

The Broader Meaning. In its broader meaning the concept of "needs" is related to free will. Most needs are, in fact, derived from values and desires. Moral values are the absolute principles that guide the individual's behavior. These are supreme selected ends, such as sanctity of life, liberty, equality, and fraternity. Moral values are justified by their own intrinsic absolute worthiness. Each value constitutes a hierarchical network of goals and sub-goals, required for accomplishing it. For instance, a reliable health care system is a means to improve public health; this, in turn, is a sub-goal of sanctity of life. This idea was implemented in the UASIS II, which is a system for identifying, defining, and classifying social
Defining Human Services 9

services based on their contribution to the fulfillment of social goals (Gibson, 1986).

Desires, like values, are manifestations of volition. They can be rational and based on moral values, but they can also be based on irrational, arbitrary, and sudden passions. Usually, people are either act according to their moral values, or act to satisfy their controlled or uncontrolled desires.

In the broader sense, "needs" are means, namely conditions, objects, activities, or services, required for achieving desirable goals. For religious Jews, who strictly observe Jewish dietary laws, eating kosher food is a need, just like a camera for a photographer or canvas for a painter. However, eating kosher food is a need only for those who choose to observe the Jewish dietary laws. Similarly, possession of a camera is a need only for people who want to take pictures. Moléré sarcastically divided us into two "distinct" groups: those who eat in order to live and those who live in order to eat. In keeping with the playwright's adage we may say that for those who eat in order to live, balanced food is a need in the narrow sense. For the rest of us, tasty food is undoubtedly a need in the broader sense.

Implications. The linkage between needs and desired goals has two relevant implications. First, it prepares the ground to characterize some social conditions and activities, for example, education, housing, and protection, as needs. Consequently, it expands the range of human services beyond the framework of ensuring physical survival or handling compulsive situations. While it is apparent that many human service organizations in the Third World literally provide life-saving relief, most human service agencies in developed countries address needs that are derived from social values and desires.

Second, it binds the needs to an inevitable, ongoing process of evaluation. "Needs" are more than necessary conditions. "Necessary conditions" are independent of the individual's awareness. Antibiotics were necessary to cure infectious diseases even before they were discovered. But once they were discovered, they became an identified need for people with bacteriological diseases. "Needs" implies awareness, at least in the eyes of the beholder, which might be the general public, experts in the field, or the recipients.
Brandshaw (1972) developed a tool to identify and assess social needs. He classified them into 11 categories based on logical conjunctions of four criteria: normative needs, felt needs, expressed needs, and comparative needs. Normative needs are needs which experts, professionals, administrators, or social scientists define as needs in any given situation. Felt needs are equated with wants. Expressed needs or demands are felt needs turned into actions. Comparative needs are alleged needs that services to populations with similar characteristics are supposed to meet. Comparative needs, as opposed to the other criteria, do not necessarily have an element of awareness and do not constitute real needs by themselves.

Needs gain their essential quality of "neediness" only in light of their prospective contribution to the achievement of the relevant goals. Goals are determined by values, norms, and desires, which are highly dependent on social conditions. Since social conditions are constantly changing, needs—hence human services—are subject to a continuing process of evaluation rooted in the relevant social milieu.

Human Needs

Defining "human services" as responses to human needs rather than responses to needs indicates that the "human" attribute of "human needs" is significant; Otherwise, the "human" addendum would be unnecessary. It is likely that the common meaning of "human needs" is needs of humans. Yet if one analyzes the concept of "human needs", as opposed to the concept of "non-human needs", a profounder sense emerges. "Non-human needs" or "animal needs" is similar in meaning to "needs" in the narrow sense, namely uncontrolled necessities and compulsions; whereas "human needs" is similar in meaning to "needs" in the broader sense. In other words, the needs of humans are unique in including necessities arising from individuals' free will as well as uncontrolled physiological necessities and compulsions.

Basic Human Needs

Another key concept often mentioned in conjunction with human services is "basic human needs". Human services—as in the LC definition (1988)—are designed to meet basic human needs.
Defining Human Services

These are the necessary conditions required to allow “decent” human existence. The concept of “basic human needs” inherently implies the existence of basic needs, beside non-basic needs, and a valid way to specify them.

One of the most systematic attempts to specify the basic human needs was made by the American psychologist Abraham Maslow (1970). He identified a five-level hierarchy of basic human needs: physiological needs, needs for safety, needs for love and belongingness, needs for esteem, and needs for self-actualization. The hierarchical relationship of these five groups means that needs at a lower level require satisfaction before needs at a higher level. Maslow’s theory is still most influential for the conception of human services (Meenaghann and Kilty, 1994). This is so despite its deficiencies, incompleteness, scholarly criticism, and empirical findings that question the hierarchical nature of the model and the inclusion of some groups of needs (Gaziet, 1988, Schmolling et al., 1997).

The Basic vs. the Optimal Approaches

According to Brandshaw (1972), the history of the social services is that of the recognition of needs and the organization of society to meet them. Consequently, Maslow’s classification of human needs—despite its deficiencies and incompleteness—establishes a model for classifying human services. Without discussing the validity of Maslow’s classification and the plausibility of formulating valid criteria to specify the basic needs, one can identify two generic approaches to human services: “basic” vs. “optimal”. The rival approaches represent two opposite principal positions on the social role of human services. The “basic” approach is minimalistic. The “optimal” approach is maximalistic.

The basic approach is focused on meeting basic human needs. The optimal approach broadens the range of needs to cover basic and non-basic needs, required for promoting the overall quality of life to its fullest extent. The works of Scheurell (1987) and Georgia Sales (1994) exemplify the optimal approach. Both studies treat “non-basic” needs, such as leisure and recreation, environmental protection, and the like. Furthermore, Sales’s comprehensive Taxonomy of Human Services comprises the provision of (almost) all social services available to citizens in western developed countries.
Service Recipients

As noted, human services can be classified by the needs they meet, but a classification based on the supposed target recipients emerges as a significant alternative. Since human services are primarily aimed at promoting the recipient’s wellbeing, characterization of the service recipient is a keystone for shaping human services. In 1994 Sales identified hundreds of target groups (pp. 279–325). Currently the number is apparently higher.

The Differentiated Population vs. the General Public

Hasenfeld and English (1974, 1983) classify the recipients into two major categories: “normal functioning” and “malfunctioning”. Accordingly, they classify human service organizations as those that serve “normal” recipients (e.g., community centers, public schools, Social Security) and those that serve “malfunctioning” or deviant populations (e.g., hospitals, juvenile courts, nursing homes).

The terminology “normal” and “malfunctioning” carries undesirable connotations. Furthermore, differentiating between populations on the basis of their evaluated functioning can be misleading. Recipients can best be differentiated on the basis of their needs. Therefore, I replace “normal” with “general” and “malfunctioning” with “differentiated”. Accordingly, human services are classified as differentiated services, designed for differentiated groups (e.g., disabled, inmates, the poor), and general services, designed for the general public (e.g., consumers, students, voters).

General services meet needs of the general public in those fields where it sets the norms. Differentiated services meet needs of the differentiated groups in those fields where they are defined as unique and differentiated (e.g., poverty, sickness, sexual preference, etc).

The concepts “general public” and “differentiated groups” are relative and context-dependent. They acquire their practical meaning in specific environments, in light of alleged norms and societal consensus. The milieu determines the “politically correct” terminology, as well as the eligibility of social groups for specific services designed to meet their unique needs. By this reasoning, an individual might be considered poor in one milieu and wealthy
in another (Doron, 1997). Homosexual groups are considered differentiated populations in one milieu and the general public in another. Eligibility for specific services is subject to contextual interpretations even within a single milieu. For instance, a child can attend a “regular” public school and concurrently participate in a special school program for dysletic students.

The Differentiated Approach vs. the Universal Approach

Despite conceptual as well as practical difficulties to identify and define differentiated groups, one can identify two generic approaches to human services: the differentiated and the universal. These two rival approaches represent opposite positions on the social role of human services. The differentiated approach is minimalistic, the universal is maximalistic.

The differentiated approach is focused on meeting the needs of differentiated populations. The universal approach broadens the scope of populations to cover the general public as well. Mehr’s definition of human services exemplifies the differentiated approach. Mehr (1986, p. 103) defines human services as “all those services designed or available to help people who are having difficulty with life and its stress”. While the studies of Hasenfeld and English (1974, 1983), Scheurell (1987), and Sales (1994) exemplify the universal approach.

Four Basic Approaches

The conjunction of the two approaches for specifying human needs (i.e., Basic vs. Optimal) and the two approaches for specifying service recipients (i.e., Differentiated vs. Universal) establishes four alternative approaches to defining the field of human services (see figure 2.). These approaches are entitled Differentiated Basic Welfare (DB), Universal Basic Welfare (UB), Differentiated Optimal Welfare, and Universal Optimal Welfare (UO) approaches.

The Differentiated Basic Welfare approach ascribes a narrow meaning to the concept of “human services”. These services are designed to meet basic human needs of differentiated vulnerable social groups. The approach is exemplified in The Human Service Worker (1998), and the works of Mehr (1986), Schmolling
et al. (1997), Schram and Mandell (1997), and Woodside and McClam (1998).

The Universal Basic Welfare approach broadens the scope of target recipients. Accordingly, human services are designed to address the basic human needs of the entire society. Hasenfeld and English (1974, 1983) exemplify the approach. The difference between these two "basic" approaches mirrors debates on social policies. In particular, it reflects the debate between the residual and the universal rival policies regarding the welfare state: should the state meet basic needs in financial distress situations only, or should this be standard policy regarding all its citizens?

The third approach, Differentiated Optimal Welfare, is somewhat theoretical. Although many service providers in practice apply the differentiated optimal approach with differentiated social groups, namely their clients, no scholarly definition of the concept of "human services" is based on this approach. Moreover, no one designates the generic concept of "human services" as optimal services aimed exclusively at differentiated groups, while excluding the general public as a prospective target recipient. Therefore, I call it the "missing" approach.

Human services according the Universal Optimal Welfare approach are designed at improving the overall wellbeing of society as a whole to the fullest possible extent. This approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Needs</th>
<th>Differentiated</th>
<th>Universal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic</td>
<td>Differentiated Basic Welfare Approach</td>
<td>Universal Basic Welfare Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Differentiated Optimal Welfare Approach</td>
<td>Universal Optimal Welfare Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(&quot;the missing approach&quot;)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2
Four Alternative Approaches to Defining the Field of Human Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approaches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Differentiated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal Basic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welfare Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimal Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal Optimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welfare Approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

("the missing approach")
Defining Human Services

is exemplified in the studies of Scheurrell (1987) and Sales (1994). This conception explains the inclusion of animal services in *A Taxonomy of Human Services* (Sales, 1994). Environmental quality is a part of the quality of life of humans. This same reasoning may explain why the editors of the *Encyclopedia of Associations* (Maurer, & Sheets, 1998) classify animal welfare organizations in the category of "social welfare organizations" (pp. 1171-1383).

The concept of human services is used here as interrelated with the concept of social welfare. According to Chatterjee (1996) the concept of social welfare is popularly understood as cash or in-kind payments to persons who need support because of physical or mental illness, poverty, age, disability and the like (the DB approach). Midgley (1995) pointed out that while the term practically implemented in the United States as assistance to differentiated vulnerable social groups (the DB approach), the original meaning of "social welfare" referred broadly to a state of social well-being, contentment and prosperity (the UO approach).

Classification of Human Service Organizations

The four approaches establish the basis for a classification of human service organizations into four distinct categories: Differentiated Basic (DB), Universal Basic (UB), Differentiated Optimal (DO), and Universal Optimal (UO) welfare organizations.

Differentiated Basic welfare human service organizations are designed to meet basic needs of differentiated groups. These are special education schools, hospitals, and shelters for homeless people. "Doctors Without Borders" exemplifies the Differentiated Basic category. The organization "provides assistance to victims of war, natural and manmade disasters, and epidemics and to others who lack access to health care (Maurer & Sheet, 1998, p. 1319)".

Universal Basic welfare organizations are designed to meet the basic needs of the entire society (e.g., public schools. Note that "UB-type organizations might also include services for differentiated groups in addition to the services for the general public. "National Committee to Prevent Child Abuse" exemplifies this category. This organization "seeks to stimulate greater public awareness of the incidence, nature, and effects of child abuse."
Serves as a national advocate against the neglect and physical, sexual and emotional abuse of children. Facilitates communication about program activities, public policy and research related to the prevention of child abuse (Maurer & Sheet, 1998, p. 1202). The fact that it deals with prevention of the phenomenon of child abuse makes it a UB-type organization. By contrast, an organization that is exclusively focused on providing treatment for abusive parents is a DB-type organization.

Differentiated Optimal welfare human service organizations address basic and non-basic needs of differentiated social groups. They provide services such as social clubs for the disabled, minority cultural support groups, and help for aged pet owners. “Make a Wish Foundation of America” exemplifies the DO category of human service organizations. The organization “grants wishes to children with terminal or life-threatening illness, thereby providing these children and their families with special memories and welcome respite from the daily stress of their situation (Maurer & Sheet, 1998, p. 1208).”

Universal Optimal welfare human service organizations are designed to meet non-basic as well as basic needs of the entire community, for example, community centers and environmental protection agencies. “Boys Scouts of America” and “Girls Scouts of the U.S.A.” organizations (Maurer & Sheet, 1998, p. 1333) exemplify the UO category.

The logical relations among the four categories can best be described as follows. The DB category is the most fundamental. It contains all the services that are included in the other categories. The DB and the DO categories share the Differentiated (D) type organizations as a common denominator, while the DB and the UB categories share the Basic (B) type organizations as a common denominator. The UO category is the most inclusive, being composed of the other categories, namely it includes all the human service organizations.

The four-category classification establishes a model for classifying human service organizations. The suggested model is unique in stressing the service’s overall contribution to promote societal wellbeing, based on the conjunction of the two dimensions, needs and recipients. By contrast, most models are based on one dimension only. Relying on two dimensions improves
Defining Human Services

the evaluation of the service's contribution to the societal overall quality of life. One can rightly argue that Hasenfeld and English's (1974, 1983) model for classifying human services is also based on the conjunction of two dimensions: types of clients (i.e., normal vs. deviant) and transformation technologies (i.e., people processing, people sustaining and people changing). Nevertheless, these two dimensions shift the focus from societal welfare to the service characteristics.

Three Definitions of Human Services

The DB, the UB, and the UO approaches establish the grounds for three alternative definitions of the concept "human services". This is accomplished by adjusting these approaches to the ad hoc generic definition of "human services" given above. As stated in that definition, human services are systematically organized social services designed to meet human needs that are required for maintaining or promoting the overall quality of life of the prospective service populations.

Based on the Differentiated Basic welfare approach, human services are defined as systematically organized social services designed to meet basic human needs that are required for maintaining or promoting the overall quality of life of differentiated social groups.

On the other hand, based on the Universal Basic welfare approach, human services are defined as systematically organized social services designed to meet basic human needs that are required for maintaining or promoting the overall quality of life of the entire society.

By contrast, following the Universal Optimal welfare approach one can define human services as systematically organized social services designed to meet basic and non-basic human needs that are required for maintaining or promoting the overall quality of life of society as a whole to its full possible extent.

Implications

The three alternative definitions of human services and the four-category model for classifying human service organizations have significant implications for social welfare policy planning,
service design and evaluation, the shaping the profiles of the helping professions.

**Social Welfare Policy.** The three definitions of human services set the theoretical framework for three types of social welfare policies, highlighting the differences among three modes of social accountability. Social welfare policies apparently differ by the intensity of social accountability, as this is determined by the number of recipients they aim to serve and the types of needs they meet. In light of the three alternative preferences, social welfare policy planning turns into a two-phase decision-making process. First, selecting the approach, DB, UB, or UO, then, specifying the needs and the recipients.

The debate whether the state should support the purchasing of air conditioners and for whom, which dramatically came to the fore in the United States in the fatal heat of the summer of 1999, is primarily ideological. It primarily depends on the type of social welfare policy. A Differentiated Basic welfare policy will result in supporting the poor, while a Universal Basic welfare policy will result in price reduction through subsidy of the product. Evidently, the decision to sponsor air-conditioning depends on the recognition that air-conditioning is a basic need. By contrast, the supporters of a Universal Optimal welfare policy will advocate the universal state support, regardless of recognition of the "basicness" of air-conditioning.

**Service Design and Evaluation.** Evidently, the four-category model for classifying human service organizations has two major implications for service design and evaluation. First, it establishes criteria for defining organizational objectives and policies, thus affecting the improvement of existing services and the development of new initiatives in the human services industry. Second, it constitutes valid criteria for evaluating services' welfare policies and accomplishments.

**Helping Professions.** The concept of "human services" refers in this paper to a field, rather than a distinct profession. However, in the American milieu the term "human services" refers also to a distinct profession, within the broad category of the helping professions (see, for example, Scheurell, 1987). Human services workers are usually presented as generalists, namely they are trained to perform a variety of tasks within the field of human

The conception of “human services” plays an important role in shaping the professional profile of the generalist human services worker. It determines the scope of services and populations that the worker serves. Consequently, the three alternative conceptions of “human services” establish three alternative professional profiles of the human service generalist worker.

These alternative conceptions play an important role in shaping the professional profiles of the specialized helping professions too. Mainly they affect the recipient-centered professions, such as gerontology, and the need-centered professions, such as social work. Social work is basically a need-centered profession. Social workers primarily work with people who have problems. In recent decades social work has changed by expanding the range of specialization, fields, and problems to include “non-traditional” and non-basic needs. Nowadays social work tends to adopt the Universal Optimal welfare approach, namely social workers attend to as wide a range of new areas as they can, and care for the maximum number of social groups.

Conclusion

Defining the concept of “human services” contributes to the design of the field in the societal realm. Yet some major issues must be tackled. These issues are culminated in two key issues: specifying the needs and characterizing the service recipients. Settling these seminal issues necessitates a choice between two opposing principal positions: minimalism and maximalism. In the process of specifying the human needs the opposite positions are implemented in the basic vs. the optimal approaches, while in the process of characterizing the service recipients they are implemented in the differentiated vs. the universal approaches.

The conjunction of these approaches provides the theoretical basis for a four-category model for classifying human service organizations. This unique model highlights the services’ overall contribution to societal wellbeing, based on the conjunction of
two dimensions, needs and recipients. Yet, only three of the four approaches, the Differentiated Basic, Universal Basic, and Universal Optimal approaches form the basis for an overall definition of "human services".

In a postmodern era characterized by ever-changing ethical norms and professional standards, the supporters of the two Basic welfare approaches are required to explain the rationale for focusing on "basic human needs". Adherence to the mission of meeting "basic needs", in light of constantly changing interpretations of "basic needs", while the meanings of "quality of life", "human rights" and "social welfare" are so flexible, has to be justified on the ground of social theory.

On the other hand, the supporters of the Universal Optimal approach are required to formulate coherent and clarified criteria to frame the concept. Otherwise, they open the way to broadening the meaning of the concept to include all the services offered in the modern state. Such an extension will exceed the definition of human services as social services aimed at meeting human needs, and will result in a new postmodernist definition.

We can conclude that the three definitions provide a solid conceptual ground for redesigning the field of human services based on the contribution to the overall societal welfare, but facing these seminal issues underlies the implementation in the societal realm.

References


Defining Human Services


Social Work and Labor:  
A Look at the North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation  

Constance Phelps  

The North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation (NAALC), a side agreement to NAFTA, provides an instructive example of an attempt to link global trade to labor standards. While this side agreement was created in order to bolster the internationalization of trade, it has brought Labor, human rights groups and governments together to scrutinize and challenge the ways that each NAFTA member country ensures the provision of basic health, safety, and human rights on the job. Effective enforcement of the Agreement will come only with political pressure from a wide variety of groups interested in improving quality of life for workers and their families. However, despite growing recognition of the importance of international social welfare efforts, social work groups have yet to become involved in monitoring the effect of trade on worker quality of life. This lack of involvement is reflective of social work's general estrangement from organized labor, despite many common goals. Increased cooperation between unions and social welfare groups would benefit their respective, and frequently shared, clientele.

Introduction

The North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) took effect in January 1994, despite severe opposition from labor groups. Although negotiations for NAFTA began under the former Bush presidency, the Democratic administration of Bill Clinton saw it through, alienating much of the traditional Labor constituency of the Democratic Party (Rothstein, 1993). But Clinton promised that free trade could be good for the workers of all of North America, that government and labor could cooperate to ensure workers' rights and quality of life. Thus a side agreement was
added to NAFTA called the North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation (NAALC), which was touted as the body that would oversee basic labor standards in Canada, the United States and Mexico. At the time of enactment the efficacy and power of this body was doubted widely (Rothstein, 1994), and it frequently has functioned as a Trojan horse which diverts attempts at reform into a bureaucratic process of complaint, review and bland report. While the NAALC has provided a high-level forum for the internationalization of the discussion of labor standards, it has been unable to improve conditions for many workers who have sought its protection (Cleeland, 1999, Human Rights Watch, 1998).

Under the NAALC, each NAFTA member country has the opportunity to scrutinize the labor regulations of other members, and question, possibly even penalize, lack of enforcement. Thus the sovereignty of individual nations (to say nothing of states and municipalities) is challenged not only by international corporations in their efforts to pay as little in wages and taxes as possible, but also by the body created to facilitate trade. Despite being a legal and administrative document which includes the possibility of official sanctions, this agreement is designed to promote cooperative resolution, using publicity and transparency to pressure each country to enforce its own laws (Garvey, 1999).

The NAALC may have only been created to diminish NAFTA opposition and prevent the kind of labor atrocities that would give opponents of expanding free trade broader recognition and support. However, when it was enacted both pro-labor and pro-business commentaries recognized the side agreement as the "premier attempt to date to provide a modality in international trade law for reconciling trade values with social... values" (Garvey, 1995). The NAALC serves as both a model and a cautionary tale in the fight by labor and other groups for increased public control over international trade, and the linkage of trade to enforceable regulations to protect workers and the environment. The demonstrations in Seattle against the World Trade Organization in November 1999, and against the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank in Washington D.C. in April of 2000, publicized the objections of organized labor, environmentalists, consumers advocates, and a diverse array of other people to unfettered global trade. They also began to shed light
on the socially conscious, egalitarian global development that
the protesters were proposing. Jay Mazur, President of the Union
of Needletrades, Industrial, and Textile Employees (UNITE),
explained:

The future is a contested terrain of very public choices that will
shape the world economy of the 21st century. The forces behind
global economic change—which exalt deregulation, cater to corpo-
rations, undermine social structures and ignore popular concerns—
cannot be sustained. Globalization is leaving perilous instability
in its wake . . . As President Clinton himself has said, if the global
market is to survive, it must work for working families. A first step
toward that goal is building labor rights, environmental protection,
and social standards into trade accords and the protocols of interna-
tional trade institutions—and enforcing them with the same vigor
now reserved for property rights. (2000, p. 79)

In order to make such demands coherent and realistic, those
interested in safeguarding worker rights and quality of life—
including social welfare groups—should learn from both the pos-
itive and negative aspects of the NAALC.

Background

Despite a recent gain in momentum, the labor movement
in the United States continues to struggle to define itself and
to re-establish a foothold in American civic and economic life
that was once unquestioned. As opposed to high levels of union
membership at mid-century (Reich, 1991), presently only 13.9% of
the American workforce is unionized (Greenhouse, 1999). This
has been accompanied by lowering real wages (Economist, 1998b),
the loss of many blue-collar jobs, and a continuously widening
gap between rich and poor (Reich, 1991). Much of this trend has
continued in the United States, even during the economic boom of
the mid- to late 90’s (Economist, 1998b, Bernstein & Michel, 1997).

The globalization of trade was in full swing well before
NAFTA lent itself to a process of de-industrialization of the U.S.
economy, from which blue-collar and low-skilled workers are still
struggling to recover (Rothstein, 1994).

Millions of manufacturing jobs have disappeared in the United
States in the last two decades. Despite much rhetoric from political
and business spokespeople about job creation, most new jobs in the last two decades have been in the service sector. In contrast to the relatively high pay and benefits of the manufacturing jobs that made up the core of the pre-1970's economy, these new jobs—in hotels and motels, bars and restaurants, convenience stores and other shops, hair salons and health clubs—provide low wages, low or no fringe benefits, and generally lack union representation. (Wagner, 1991b, p. 16)

During the recession-ridden years of 1979–83, 5.1 million workers were displaced from their jobs, with 50% of job losses taking place in the manufacturing sector. These workers had only a 60% re-employment rate, and many changed to lower-paying service-sector jobs, or could work only part-time (Herz, 1991). Black and Hispanic men were over-represented among the displaced, and had higher rates of prolonged unemployment. Although overall displacement slowed during the late 1980's, the U.S. manufacturing hemorrhage abated only slightly (Herz, 1991). Many displaced workers, even when able to find other employment, experienced resulting problems such as depression, poverty, social isolation and family breakup (Wagner, 1991a; Donovan, Jaffe & Pirie, 1987).

Into this charged atmosphere NAFTA was born. "A new era of economic integration in the Americas" (Wrobel, 1998, p. 552) began in 1989, with the Canada-United States Free Trade Agreement. President Carlos Salinas of Mexico proposed a free trade agreement with the United States in 1990, which initiated the formation (with Canada) of NAFTA in 1992. After extensive debate, the NAFTA was passed by Congress in 1993 (Wrobel, 1998).

From the point of view of government and business, NAFTA has been an unequivocal success. In 1998, Mexico replaced Japan as America's second-largest trading partner, and NAFTA is credited with cushioning the blow dealt by the Asian economic crisis (Barshefsky, 1999). The U.S.-Mexico Chamber of Commerce (1998) reported that trade between the two countries doubled between 1993 and 1997, shooting from $80 to $160 billion/year. The U.S. Trade Representative (1999) claimed that 350,000 jobs were created in the United States due to NAFTA, and that these jobs paid 13 to 16% more than the somewhat smaller quantity of jobs that were lost due to increased trade with Mexico.
But the global economy has not bestowed its favors equally on all sectors of society. Earnings inequality has risen consistently in the United States since 1979 (Bernstein & Mishel, 1997). The Economist reported in 1998 that "the richest fifth of American households still account for half of aggregate income, and the poorest fifth for less than four percent" (a, p. 25). Between 1995–97, 4.5 million people were displaced from jobs that they had held three years or more. Although not as high as experienced in the 1980's, manufacturing jobs were still lost at a rate "much higher than manufacturing's share of total employment" (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1998). One-fourth of these workers, when re-employed, suffered earnings reductions of 20% or more (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1998). Some estimate that hundreds of thousands of jobs have been lost to Mexico (Rothstein, 1993).

NAFTA also has the potential to cause fundamental changes in Mexican society and culture, by displacing farmers and agricultural workers, whose livelihood will lose the protection previously provided to it by the government (Cornelius & Martin, 1993). Under the agreement, Mexico lowered its average applied tariffs on U.S. imports by 7.1%, "compared with a reduction of 1.4 percentage points in the U.S." (U.S. Trade Representative, 1999)

Whatever its long-term effects may be, America's high-profile embrace of free-market policies was signed by a Democratic president. The Clinton Administration adopted a 'we'll bring everyone along' stance on economic growth and free trade, that denied that labor interests and a free market are inherently antagonistic. Charlene Barshefsky, U.S. Trade Representative, told the House Committee on Ways and Means, Subcommittee on Trade in February 1999: "The President, in his State of the Union address, called for a new consensus on trade. He said we must find the common ground on which business, workers, farmers, environmentalists and government must stand together." Such 'common ground' was central to a Clinton foreign policy in which "trade helps increase world prosperity, advances the rule of law, and helps to strengthen international peace." The administration thus advocated protections for workers' rights, "while clearly separating advocacy of labor rights from protectionist trade policies." Because it addresses all but the most severe infringements on workers' rights with discussion, the NAALC is
emblematic of the labor-business compromise that Clinton sought to establish.

NAALC

The NAALC took effect on January 1, 1994, with the stated mission of improving "working conditions and living standards in the United States, Mexico and Canada as . . . NAFTA promotes more trade and closer economic ties among the three countries" (U.S. National Administrative Office, 1998, p. 1). In joining the NAALC, each NAFTA member country agreed to "ensure that its labor laws and regulations provide for high labor standards" (p. 3). The Agreement calls for effective enforcement of the following eleven labor principles:

1) Freedom of association and protection of the right to organize;
2) The right to bargain collectively;
3) The right to strike;
4) Prohibition of forced labor;
5) Child labor protections for children and young persons;
6) Minimum labor standards, such as minimum wages and overtime pay, covering wage earners, including those not covered by collective agreements;
7) Elimination of employment discrimination on the basis of race, religion, age, sex, or other grounds as determined by each country's domestic laws;
8) Equal pay for men and women;
9) Prevention of occupational injuries and illnesses;
10) Compensation in cases of occupational injuries and illnesses; and

Governments agreed to provide a due process system in which to resolve complaints of violations of domestic labor law, and to ensure publicity of and public access to information regarding worker's rights. If a member country fails to enforce these principles within its own system, a complaint can be filed with the National Administrative Office (NAO) of another country.
The cases are filed with the NAO of one country (frequently the U.S.), alleging that another country (usually Mexico), has failed to enforce its own laws, to uphold labor standards cited in the agreement.

The Agreement has three levels of enforcement. The majority of standards are protected only by low levels of enforcement, which do not involve any penalization for non-compliance. "The preferred approach of the Agreement . . . is through cooperation—exchanges of information, technical assistance, consultations" (U.S. National Administrative Office, 1998, p. 1). The system of complaint review starts with Cooperation/Consultation, when an NAO office accepts a complaint submission. The office that receives the complaint puts together a report, consults with the NAOs of the other two countries, and may recommend that the labor ministers from the two countries consult. These consultations are frequently followed by seminars, public conferences, and more reports (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000). The first three principles, which have to do with the most basic labor rights of organizing, collective bargaining and work stoppage, are limited to the Cooperation/Consultation level of enforcement. As of early-2000, this was the only mechanism that had been utilized in response to the twenty-two complaints filed under the NAALC (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000).

The intermediate level of enforcement is labeled Evaluation Committee of Experts (ECE). This involves convening a panel of non-governmental experts to make a recommendation. Although such a committee has never been convened, hypothetically an equal number of experts would be chosen by the NAOs of each of the three countries. Five labor principles, including prohibition of forced labor, non-discrimination in employment, equal pay for equal work, worker's compensation, and migrant worker protection, are restricted to finding relief in the ECE.

The only NAALC remedy with hypothetical enforcement teeth is Dispute Resolution. The Agreement calls for a panel of "outside experts" to be put together representing each member country. These experts would once again be chosen by the NAOs, and they have the authority to put together an action plan, to levy fines and even invoke a loss of tariff preferences if the plan is not heeded. Only minimum wage, child labor laws and occupational
health and safety are covered under Dispute Resolution. It is important to note that the minimum wage standard does not imply a common minimum wage between countries, but only requires that the minimum wage of each country be enforced.

Anyone can file a complaint with an NAO, which is required to “provide for receipt and review of submissions on labor law matters in the other two countries” (U.S. National Administrative Office, 1998, p. 4). The submission must demonstrate violation of one of the eleven principles discussed above, must show that the country in question is not taking the steps necessary to enforce its own laws regarding the situation, and that the infringement is causing harm to those effected. If the NAO to which the submission is made does not feel that these standards have been met, it can decline review of a submission. There is no real process to appeal such a decision, and thus ultimately the cases that have access to the NAALC process are decided by the NAOs themselves, which are affiliates of the Department of Labor of each country.

Cases under NAALC

As of early-2000, twenty-two cases had been filed with the NAALC since its inception in 1994, ten of which were filed in 1998. The majority of cases involved infringements on the right to organize, and most were lodged against Mexico. They involved the Mexican plants of international companies such as Honeywell, General Electric, Sony and Han Young, a car-parts manufacturer for Hayundai Corp. (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000).

Like many of the complaints, the one regarding Echlin Inc., a car parts manufacturer owned by Dana Corp., included allegations of threats and intimidation during union elections at a Mexican plant. The United Steelworkers filed complaints against Echlin in both the U.S. and Canada, which were joined by a total of forty organizations. Canadian Steelworkers National Director Lawrence McBrearty claimed that:

workers were held captive, beaten and threatened with rape as they were forced to vote for the government controlled union . . . Thugs crowded the polling station as workers were forced to vote by saying the name of the union. (United Steelworkers, 1998)
The alleged intimidation took part in a joint effort by the Mexican government and Echlin, Inc. to shut out a non-government union. Mexico is heavily unionized, but traditionally the unions have been closely tied to the Partido Revolucionario Institucional (PRI), the party that governed Mexico for over seventy years, and only recently lost its hold over the Presidency. Many of the allegations of infringements on the right to organize and hold union elections have involved attempts by alternative unions to enter plants, and replace the state-approved unions, which are seen as simply rubber-stamping government policies. PRI policies tended to be passive in the face of trade-related social issues, in part due to the government's fear that foreign companies that are pressured to comply with labor or environmental standards that they find unfavorable, might choose to relocate to another developing country (Human Rights Watch, 1998).

These cases have brought about studies, public conferences and ministerial meetings. One case involved a complaint against a Sony plant in Mexico where allegedly "workers were intimidated, pressured and eventually dismissed by the company when they attempted to organize a union," and "police used violence to break up a peaceful demonstration by workers" (Commission for Labor Cooperation, 1996). After holding public hearings and conducting a study of Mexican labor-arbitration processes and the police use of force at the demonstration, the U.S. NAO recommended a meeting between the Minister of Labor of Mexico, and the U.S. Secretary of Labor. The Commission for Labor Cooperation reports that:

The ministerial consultations resulted in an agreement to conduct a series of three public seminars on union registration and certification, an internal study on union registration by the Mexican authorities, and a series of meetings between Mexican authorities and the parties involved. (Commission for Labor Cooperation, 1996)

This process exemplifies the gentle pressure for change that the NAALC espouses.

A case filed against the United States in May, 1998, involved the most comprehensive allegations of labor abuses brought under NAALC up to that point. The submission brought up issues of
freedom of association, safety and health, employment discrimination, minimum employment standards, protection of migrant workers, and worker’s compensation (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000). It was filed by Mexican unions, alleging:

failure of U.S. labor law to protect worker’s rights in the Washington State apple industry. The complaint cites the lack of legal protection for farmworker union organizing and bargaining rights, discrimination against migrant workers, widespread health and safety violations, budget cuts in U.S. enforcement agencies like the NLRB and OSHA, and employers’ use of threats and intimidation in recent union representation elections at two major apple picking and shipping plants. (International Labor Rights Fund 1998)

Hearings were held in December, 1998, and in August of 1999 the Mexican NAO issued a report recommending ministerial consultations (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000).

Labor unions are not the only groups to have filed NAALC complaints. Human Rights Watch filed a claim in May, 1997, after finding that many international companies in Mexico, such as General Motors, Zenith Corporation, and Tyco International, were discriminating against women by making them take pregnancy tests before hiring them. Some companies even made women provide proof that they were menstruating. When an employee became pregnant, she was frequently denied her wages while on maternity leave (Human Rights Watch, 1998). The problem lay not in Mexico’s sex-discrimination laws, but in the government’s lack of enforcement.

Rather than condemn such practices, the government has taken every opportunity to interpret and apply labor law in a way that most favors the discriminatory practices of the corporations and affords women the least amount of protection. In fact, the government has gone so far as to excuse publicly this discrimination. (Human Rights Watch, 1998, p. 3)

This complaint wound its way through the process of public hearings, report and ministerial consultations. However, Human Rights Watch (1998) claimed that the report and consultations addressed only post-hire pregnancy discrimination, and thus did not address access to employment. Despite the publicity, some companies continued and even defended these practices as legal.
The NAALC process produced a conference in March 1999 entitled "Protecting Women in the Workplace" (Embassy of Mexico in the United States, 1999), and "as a follow-up to this conference, on August 17–18, 1999, the United States and Mexico held individual outreach sessions in McAllen, Texas and Reynosa, Tamaulipas to educate women workers about their rights in the workplace" (U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000).

Human Rights Watch was joined in the gender discrimination case by the International Labor Rights Fund and the National Association of Democratic Lawyers, a Mexican group. Combinations of these groups have filed other complaints, regarding freedom of association and the right to organize. The American Friends Service Committee also joined the 1994 complaint against Sony (Commission for Labor Cooperation, 1998). Petitions were filed with both the Canadian and Mexican NAOs in late 1998/early 1999 alleging lack of enforcement of minimum wage and overtime pay regulations for immigrant workers in the U.S. The Yale Law School Worker's Rights Project filed the two complaints, together with a number of non-labor advocacy groups. These included the American Civil Liberties Union Foundation's Immigrant's Rights Project, the Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund (AADEF), and the Center for Immigrants Rights. No recognizable social work group was included in the lists of submitters for any of the complaints (Commission for Labor Cooperation, 1999; U.S. National Administrative Office, 2000).

The NAALC is an essentially political document. Although it relies on the willingness of each country to accommodate basic labor rights in order to advance the ultimate goal of expanded free trade, the effect of the Agreement depends entirely on the way that it is utilized and enforced by the departments of labor in each country. If the administration of a country where a complaint has been filed fails to exert pressure for reform upon the political powers of the country against which the complaint was lodged, the NAALC’s linkage of global free trade and labor rights is undermined. NAFTA’s contradictory side agreement is ridden with conflict of interest, as it leaves enforcement to the very governments so hungry for free trade—trade that they understand translates into low wages, minimal social benefits, little
taxation, and in general the best interest of large corporations. The NAALC (and any future trade side-agreements) will not be effective without pressure and attention from the public. Such attention must come not only from labor groups, but also from other groups with a degree of public trust and the willingness to publicize poor working conditions in North America and around the world.

*Improving worker quality of life on an international level: where do social welfare groups fit in?*

In the last decade, as markets have become more internationalized, social work has followed suit. The 1990's produced a body of social work literature that both recognized this trend and sought to encourage and expand it. Much of this literature centers on new roles for social work, in areas such as refugee assistance (Mupedziswa, 1997); conflict resolution (Mehta, 1997); and response to the global AIDS crisis (Mancoske, 1997). Midgley (1995) advocated comparative research regarding need and systems of social welfare in different countries. Many authors charged social workers with the responsibility for promotion of culturally-sensitive social and community development to assist marginalized groups (Estes, 1994; Lusk & Stoesz, 1994; Midgley 1996; Johannesen, 1997). Social work as a profession is catching up with changes in society and the focus on international development as a way of eradicating poverty, and some commentators are responding with general calls for increased education of social workers on international issues (Healy, 1992; Estes, 1994; Garber, 1997).

The integration of this new societal dynamic into the profession seems to evoke high expectations for what social workers stand for and can achieve in the world, and a call for a change of focus away from clinical work with individuals. Lusk and Stoesz (1994, p. 102) asked social workers to “discard the myopia of a predominantly clinical world view,” because in the context of extreme world poverty “social change strategies which stress the pathological aspects of clients in their microenvironments will fall short of contributing to the general social welfare.” Younghusband (1964) based her faith in the success of international social work on the profession’s values, pointing out that it is “in the
dignity and worth of man, that the philosophy of social work rests” (p. 106). She called for her colleagues to “strive for economic and social policies which will progressively remedy that which is remediable in the current state of knowledge” (p. 107). Johanneesen (1997) stated that “social integration is a key goal for social work, which should be moving from an emphasis on adjustment of the individual to society to an emphasis on changing society to meet individual needs, including the goals of eradicating poverty and eliminating unemployment” (p. 151). Wagner (1997), also called the troops to action, by claiming that:

In a global economy, professional social work in general and local empowerment in particular cannot be reduced to designing welfare programs and delivering services at the local level. It is crucial for the future of the profession to become more attentive to the structural-and therefore political-issues involved at the national level and now also at the global level” (p. 52).

International social work literature offers many models of social development, and some authors advocate increased social work involvement in the United Nations (Hokenstad & Midgley, 1997; Johanssen, 1997). However, this movement remains quiet on the issue of unions. Unions have been left out of general planning for social work’s attack on international poverty, social inequality, exclusion from government, and other social problems, despite common goals and professional literature that supports the connection between union involvement and improved quality of life (Scanlon, 1999).

Notwithstanding social work’s present emphasis on work with the individual (Spect & Courtney, 1994), precedent exists within the profession for efforts to improve worker quality of life. Such advocacy has included support of and cooperation with organized labor. In the late 19th Century, the settlement house movement began to recognize societal causes for the problems of the poor, and engage in grass-roots organization to spark change. These reformers often supported labor unions, and lobbied with city governments for improvements of infrastructure and services to the poor. They also worked to increase public awareness of social issues (Addams, 1910; Costin 1983). The Great Depression of the 1930’s also helped to bring social workers to action. The
Rank and File Movement improved the standing of the social work profession by uniting professional social work unions, and adding a voice of support for New Deal reforms and organized labor (Leighninger & Knickermeyer, 1976; Reynolds, 1963, 1951).

The modern social work literature also shows some recognition of Labor's role in both protecting workers and public promotion of an effective social safety net. Wagner (1991a) found in a study of a social work—union partnership in assisting dislocated Maine factory workers, that the alliance was successful in addressing the worker's varying needs.

Social workers and labor union leaders and members should be natural allies. Working people make up the majority of social work's clientele, and despite the numerical decline of union membership, trade unions remain the only vehicle of representation that exists among working people. (p. 477)

In a study of female unskilled workers employed by a university in the deindustrializing Midwest, Morrissey (1995) noted that all of the subjects recognized the advantages that union membership brought in wages and benefits. The study also supported Labor's role in job protection. Korpi (1989) found a relationship between strong union influence in national politics and the extensiveness of the social service system. In a discussion of employee assistance programs, Balgopal (1989) assumes union-social work cooperation in assuring acceptable work conditions and job security for clients.

There are many ways for social welfare professionals to become more involved in improving worker quality of life, both in the U.S. and abroad. Scanlon (1999) recommends that social work academics conduct more research "to examine the relationships among working conditions, union membership, and family well-being" (p. 591), and that social work students be placed in internships at labor sites. Students should also be educated about the growth of international social work, and the way that changing market forces and workers' issues effect clients in any locality.

Pressure from social work groups to make trade side agreements such as the NAALC meaningful vehicles to combat exploitation of workers, would benefit both the causes that social work
Social Work and Labor seeks to espouse and the advocacy-based heart of the profession itself. Such support should also extend to grass-roots attempts to organize and empower workers. Social workers' collective experience in helping individual clients or communities with specific needs, provides an ideal perspective from which to build advocacy momentum with the goal of educating the public, and influencing government and the private sector.

Conclusion

The main function of the NAALC was to protect NAFTA from its critics and push for gradual reform that might prevent only the harshest and most provocative infringements on labor rights and quality of life. The "labor-friendly" Clinton Administration envisioned the front-page photograph of a skinny ten-year-old girl sewing labels into designer clothes, and immediately recognized NAFTA's true Achilles heel. Thus the NAALC not only provides some incentive for member countries to prevent the most flagrant mistreatment of workers, but it also provides a review process that can help divert the public's anger at such mistreatment away from the NAFTA accord itself.

Labor groups in NAFTA countries are left with an enforcement mechanism that is insufficient to meet their needs, but appears to be more than what was available in the rapidly globalizing market that preceded NAFTA. While global production frustrates labor's attempts to win concessions from corporations and improve worker quality of life on a national level, the advent of the NAALC allows workers to call both international corporations and governments to answer to a third authority (the agreement itself), for infringement of labor rights. Thus some key U.S. unions have made the integration of basic labor standards into trade accords and development efforts a centerpiece of their public message and political activism (Lindsey, 2000).

The struggle to improve worker quality of life is not for organized labor alone. All groups interested in this issue should exert pressure on government to link trade to substantive, enforceable labor standards. While corporations relocate in order to exploit inequalities between countries and localities, such agreements provide a small first step towards the creation of a more even labor
arena. Social work should become involved in the struggle for labor rights, in which other progressive groups are already active. It would be entirely appropriate for social welfare groups such as the National Association of Social Workers, or the International Federation of Social Workers, to add their voices of social concern to the public discourse over trade issues by organizing advocacy among members, and putting out strong policy statements. These groups could also initiate or join a submission to the NAALC or any future trade side-agreement, as well as monitor and publicize both the causes that the agreement covers, and the progress of worthwhile complaints.

It may be precisely the chaos of politics and international trade that keeps social work at the sidelines of international social development and worker’s rights issues, tending to the ‘less fortunate’. However, any genuine commitment to influencing the system that creates social problems mandates that we insert ourselves, and our unique world view, into the process. The goals and values that social welfare groups and labor share, call for increased cooperation in the variety of efforts that each group makes to create a more humane and egalitarian world community.

References


Garvey, J. I. (1999). Regional free trade dispute as a means for securing the Middle East peace process. 47 American Journal of Comparative Law 147.


GEORGIA ACKERMAN
BOBBIE ANDERSON
SCOTT JENSEN
RANDY LUDWIG
DARREL MONTERO
NICOLE PLANTE
VINCE YANEZ

Arizona State University
School of Social Work

This paper examines American national public opinion on crime and the American police force. The data were gathered from published opinion polls of national samples of adults taken from 1972–1999. The findings reveal that Americans have contradictory perceptions regarding crime in their area, crime in our nation, confidence in the police, and the honesty of the nation's police officers. A growing number of respondents report that crime seems to be decreasing; however, a majority of Americans still report that there is more crime in their area than there was a year ago. These are only a few examples of the complexity of American public opinion. Adding to this intricate web of American opinion and attitude is the issue of ethnicity. National polls indicate that most Americans are satisfied with police honesty and ethics. However, when we control for ethnicity, minorities rate the honesty and ethical standards of police officers much lower than do White Americans. Nevertheless, despite the widespread media reports of erosion in trust in the police, a solid majority of Americans consistently express confidence in and support of the police. These findings are discussed in light of the apparent contradiction of the actual crime rates and perceived crime rates.

Regardless of the time in American history, crime and the police have been issues of considerable debate. Americans consistently express concerns about the amount of criminal activity in
their communities and what is being done to prevent it. The prevailing attitude toward crime in this country is one of frustration. The news media regularly report that Americans are "fed up with crime" and "profoundly disillusioned" with the criminal justice system (Warr, 1995, p. 296). This frustration is certainly nothing new to the American public. Since the 1970s, the violent crime rate and Americans' fear of crime have remained remarkably stable. The overall national crime rate has declined over the last 20 years, but this does not change Americans' perceptions of an increasing rate of crime (Shaw, Shapiro, Lock, & Jacobs, 1998).

Americans continue to feel the crime rate is increasing. The responsibility for the current crime rate in this country is largely assigned to the criminal justice system (Maguire & Pastore, 1999). Americans feel that the courts are not aggressive enough and far too lenient. This attitude has created an American public that has been far more punitive in recent years (Shaw et al., 1998). Proof of this cannot only be found through the passage of the "three strikes" law, but 1999 Gallup opinion polls also show that Americans overwhelmingly support capital punishment.

Despite America's criticism of the criminal justice system, the police maintain a surprising level of popular support. In fact, in 1993 and 1994 Gallup surveys, Americans likened the honesty and ethical standards of the police with those of medical doctors and college professors (Warr, 1995). This perception of police officers has undoubtedly translated into support for more law enforcement officers and increased funding for police departments across the nation (Blumstein & Rosenfeld, 1998).

It is imperative to note, however, that not all Americans hold the police in such high regard. Ethnicity has always been a very strong predictor of attitudes toward the police, with African Americans and Latinos being far more likely to express concerns about various aspects of law enforcement. Although overall confidence levels in the police have increased in the 1990s, incidents such as the 1991 beating of Rodney King, commonly referred to as the "King incident", and the 1996 beatings of two Mexican immigrants have given minorities very real reasons to remain distrustful (Tuch & Weitzer, 1997).

It is extremely difficult to characterize public opinion on crime in any simple way. There are numerous contradictions within the
opinions of many Americans. What Americans tend to believe about crime in the nation does not necessarily correspond to their perception of crime in their own neighborhoods. Moreover, their apparent contempt for one element of the justice system, the courts, is countered by their respect for another, the police (Warr, 1995).

Method

The findings of this paper are based upon published public opinion polls from the Gallup Organization—Gallup Poll, Gallup Poll Monthly, National Opinion Research Center/General Social Surveys, and the Public Opinion Quarterly. These organizations use similar sampling techniques. For example, the standard Gallup sample consists of 1000 face-to-face and telephone interviews. The sample design for face-to-face surveys is a replicated area-probability sample that selects subjects based on demographics from the block level in urban areas and segments of townships in rural areas. After stratifying the nation geographically and by size of the community, according to information derived from the most recent census, more than 350 different sampling locations are selected on a mathematically random basis from within cities, towns, and counties that have, in turn, been selected on a mathematically random basis. A more detailed discussion of this sampling procedure is found in Gallup Poll Monthly (1996).

Results and Discussion

Crime as the Most Important Problem Facing the Country. From 1985 to 1999, a cross-section of the American public was asked the following question (Table 1): “What do you think is the most important problem facing this country today?” The top five responses included crime, economy/employment, health care, the deficit, and drugs. More specifically, from 1994 to 1997 between two in 10 and five in 10 Americans believe that crime ranks as the most important problem facing the country today.

Interestingly, despite the media’s reporting of widespread discontent, with the criminal justice system and crime in general, Americans did not view crime as the highest ranking social
Table 1

Percentage of Respondents Who Think Crime is the Most Important Problem Facing the Country, 1985–1999

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Crime</th>
<th>Economy/ Employment</th>
<th>Health Care</th>
<th>Deficit</th>
<th>Drugs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Question: "What do you think is the most important problem facing this country today?"

NOTE: Data reported twice in one year indicate the question was asked twice in that year.

NOTE: Figures may not total 100% due to multiple responses.


problem until 1994, when it peaked at 52%. This sharp increase from 16% in 1993 to 52% in 1994 suggests some significant outside influencing event or chain of events. That same year, the U.S. Congress passed the Violent Crime Control and Law Enforcement Act, the most comprehensive crime-control bill in history (Walker, 1997). The highly publicized bombings of the World Trade Center and Oklahoma City Federal Building may have some effect on these findings. Correspondingly, high-profile crimes during the 1990s included the murders of Nicole Brown Simpson, Polly Klaas, the Menendez parents, and other similar crimes, that could be factors in the increase (Alderman, 1994).
Attitudes toward Crime in Own Area. As a social issue, crime is capable of generating both intense public debate and ever-changing public policy. A key component in any shift in public policy toward crime is how Americans perceive crime in their own area. From 1972 through 1998, a cross-section of the American public was asked the following question (Table 2): "Is there more crime in your area than there was a year ago, or less?"

From 1972 to 1998, the number of Americans who believe that there is "less crime" in their area than a year ago has increased, ranging from a low of less than one in 10 respondents to a high of nearly five in 10. Interestingly, these findings of perceived "less crime" in one's own area dovetail nicely with a recent report of the U.S. Bureau of Justice Statistics indicating an overall 20% decrease in crime from 1981 to 1992 (Radelet & Carter, 1994; U.S. Department of Justice, 1994).

Table 2

Attitudes toward Crime in Own Area, 1972–1998a (Numbers are in percentages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>More Crime</th>
<th>Less Crime</th>
<th>Same</th>
<th>No Opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Question: "Is there more crime in your area than there was a year ago, or less?"

NOTE: Data reported twice in one year indicate the question was asked twice in that year.

NOTE: Figures may not total 100% due to rounding.

Despite the general decline in the national crime rates, a near plurality of Americans still believes that crime is worse in their area than a year ago. One possible explanation for this inconsistency between public opinion and the actual crime rate is that the preponderance of police and crime television programs is simply creating what Felson (1994) calls the "dramatic fallacy." Dramatic fallacy refers to the perceptions of crime being much greater than the actual rate of crime. Furthermore, the public also believes that violent crimes predominate when in actuality crimes such as burglary, robbery, and drug-related crimes are far more common.

**Attitudes toward Government Spending on Law Enforcement.** Between 1984 and 1996, a cross-section of the American public was asked the following question (Table 3): "We are faced with many

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Too Little</th>
<th>About Right</th>
<th>Too Much</th>
<th>Don't Know</th>
<th>No Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Question: "We are faced with many problems in this country, none of which can be solved easily or inexpensively. I'm going to name some of these problems, and for each one I'd like you to tell me whether you think we're spending too much money on it, too little money, or about the right amount... Law enforcement."*  

*NOTE: Figures may not total 100% due to rounding.*  

problems in this country, none of which can be solved easily or inexpensively. I am going to name some of these problems, and for each one I'd like you to tell me whether you think we are spending too much money on it, too little, or about the right amount... Law enforcement.” When this general question is examined, we find that a majority of Americans feel that we are currently spending “too little” on law enforcement. Without exception, a majority of the respondents report that spending is not meeting their expectations. Correspondingly, fewer than one in 10 Americans think the government is spending “too much” on law enforcement. The findings have been extremely stable over this two-decade period.

Although the beleaguered American taxpayer is often reluctant to spend additional tax money, here is an area where a substantial majority is willing to allocate tax dollars to fight crime. This is a distinct instance where public opinion polling results can directly affect the formulation of public policy.

Confidence in the American Police Force. From 1993 to 1997, a cross-section of the American public was asked the following question (see Table 4): “I am going to read you a list of institutions in American society. Please tell me how much confidence you, yourself, have in each one... Police.” Respondents were asked to reply with “a great deal,” “quite a lot,” “some,” “very little,” “none at all,” or “no opinion.” From 1993 to 1997, a very consistent finding of between one-quarter and one-third of Americans report a “great deal,” “quite a lot,” or “some” confidence in the police. Conversely, at the other end of the continuum, only 10% of Americans report “very little” confidence in the police. Encouragingly, only one in 100 Americans reports no confidence in the police. This is particularly impressive given that this sample is representative across ethnic groups.

When we combine the top two response choices of “a great deal” and “quite a lot”, we find a consistent majority of Americans indicate confidence in the police throughout the five years of polling. In fact, a notably high nine in 10 Americans have some level of confidence in the police. However, we cannot ignore the fact that one in 10 Americans has very little confidence whatsoever in the police. Although 10% is a small figure, it is a significant minority that should not be ignored.
Table 4

Confidence in the American Police Force, 1993–1997\textsuperscript{a} (Numbers are in percentages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>A Great Deal</th>
<th>Quite a Lot</th>
<th>Some</th>
<th>Very Little</th>
<th>None at All</th>
<th>No Opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{a} Question: "I am going to read you a list of institutions in American society. Please tell me how much confidence you, yourself, have in each one—a great deal, quite a lot, some, or very little? . . . Police."

NOTE: Figures may not add to 100% due to rounding.


Attitudes toward Police Honesty and Ethics. Researchers measuring public opinion of American police honesty and ethics must consider the dynamics of ethnicity. Police brutality and corruption are subjects eagerly reported on by the media. Sensationalized cases such as the "King incident" and the O. J. Simpson trial have brought issues of police integrity to the forefront. Moreover, the popularization of media shows such as "Hard Copy" and "Inside Edition," dubbed "info-tainment" by criminologists, has given Americans greater awareness of police actions across the nation (Radelet & Carter, 1994, p. 476). Additionally, demographic reports on the make-up of the U.S. police force show that four of five police officers are of European-American heritage (white), whereas the persons at highest risk for crime are of African American (black) heritage (Loury, 1996). All of these factors interact to complicate public opinion toward the police.

When overall satisfaction of the police is examined by ethnicity, the contrast is substantial. From 1977 to 1995, a cross-section of white and minority Americans was asked the following question (Table 5): "How would you rate the honesty and ethical standards of people in these different fields (policemen)?" Respondents were asked to reply with "very high", "high", "average", "low", or "very low".
### Table 5

**Attitudes toward Police Honesty and Ethics, 1977–1995**

(Numbers are in percentages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Very High or High</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Low or Very Low</th>
<th>No Opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>Whites 38</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 34</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Whites 46</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 32</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Whites 44</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 28</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Whites 48</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 35</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Whites 49</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 33</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Whites 51</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 41</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Whites 45</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 30</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Whites 61</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 43</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>Whites 53</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 28</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Whites 49</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 21</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Whites 44</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Minorities 25</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Question: “How would you rate the honesty and ethical standards of people in these different fields (policemen)—very high, high, average, low, very low?”*

**NOTE:** Figures may not add to 100% due to rounding.

**SOURCE:** Tuch & Weitzer (1997) based on Gallup.

The results of this survey clearly show that whites, without exception, have rated police higher in the areas of honesty and ethics than have minorities. Although there is a clear difference
in the percentage of white and minority respondents that rated police honesty and ethics as "very high or high," the disparity becomes even more apparent when comparing the data on respondents answering "very low or low."

In 1977, only one in 10 whites rated police as having "very low or low" ethical standards, compared with two in 10 minorities giving that same response. This difference held relatively constant until 1991, the year of the "King incident." In that year, whites' opinions of police remained unchanged, whereas for minority respondents, a dramatic increase occurred, with three in 10 rating the police as having "very low or low" ethical standards.

In summary, when we examine national poll data on the American public's attitudes toward crime rates and confidence in the police, some striking trends emerge. Table I indicates that, for the most part, from 1994 to 1997, over one in four Americans believe crime ranks as the most important problem facing the country today, outstripping the economy/employment, health care, the deficit, and drugs.

In the 1990s, concern for the amount of crime nationwide has been heightened by a series of tragic events. The bombings of the World Trade Center and the federal building in Oklahoma City, combined with a string of high-profile murder trials (O. J. Simpson and the Menendez brothers) have brought crime to the forefront of American consciousness. These events and their subsequent media coverage have resulted in many Americans perceiving that crime in their country is on the rise, regardless of the fact that the crime rate has actually been declining for the past 20 years (U.S. Department of Justice, 1994). Also interestingly as reported in Table 2, from 1990 to 1998, without exception, Americans agree that there is less crime in their area compared to the prior reporting period.

Despite America's frustration with our high crime rate, our findings reveal that most Americans have a high level of confidence in the police (Table 4). Consequently, it is not surprising to find a consistent majority of Americans support increased funding for law enforcement agencies across the nation (Table 3). As indicated in Table 3, Americans' feelings have been extremely stable throughout the 1980s and 1990s regarding their belief that government is spending "too little" on law enforcement. These
findings dovetail neatly with our findings in Table 4. That is, when we combine the first two columns of Americans expressing confidence in the police force, we find that, from 1993 to 1997, a majority of Americans, without exception, have "quite a lot or a great deal" of confidence in the police.

An interesting finding emerges in Table 5. When we examine Americans' attitudes toward police honesty and ethics, controlling for ethnicity, we find markedly different levels of support between whites and minorities. When we examine the "very high or high" response category in Table 5, remarkably consistent findings emerge. That is, for the three-decade period reported, without exception, whites rate the honesty and ethical standards of the police higher than do minorities.

Public opinion on each issue discussed in this study has remained relatively stable. There have been fluctuations in Americans' attitudes perhaps resulting from numerous high-profile events, which may be related to Felson's "dramatic fallacy" (Felson, 1994), but these shifts are usually small and short-lived. This consistent pattern indicates that it is likely that public opinion on crime and the police will remain stable in the years to come.

Finally, as noted throughout this paper, in a very logical fashion, Americans have expressed that crime has remained a major problem facing our country, that they have confidence in their police force, and that they, in turn, are willing to spend more tax dollars on fighting crime. Interestingly, despite the widespread media reports of erosion in trust in the police, a solid majority of Americans consistently express confidence in and support of the police.

References


**Author Notes**

We wish to gratefully acknowledge the valuable comments provided by Robert Rhodes, Jean Bann, Mirjam Bakuelue, and the editor of this journal. Special thanks goes to Terry DiFalco for his significant contributions to this article. We also acknowledge the following organizations for their generosity in sharing their data with us: Gallup Poll, Gallup Poll Monthly, the National Opinion Research Center/General Social Surveys, and the *Public Opinion Quarterly*.

Correspondence concerning this paper should be addressed to Darrel Montero, School of Social Work, Arizona State University, Tempe, Arizona 85287.
The Effectiveness and Enforcement of a Teen Curfew Law

RICHARD D. SUTPHEN
JANET FORD
University of Kentucky
College of Social Work

This article examines the effect of a teen curfew on juvenile arrest rates and reviews the first year of the curfew's implementation in a city of over 200,000 population. Juvenile arrest rates were compared for three years prior to the curfew's enactment and three years of curfew enforcement. Data related to 377 curfew violations and 83 parent citations issued in 22 police beats during the first year of implementation were analyzed to determine whether the curfew was primarily enforced in areas with serious juvenile crime or targeted low income, minority neighborhoods. Results indicate that the curfew had no effect on total juvenile arrests, felonies, misdemeanors, violent (serious) crimes, or property crimes. More curfew violations were issued in areas with higher rates of juvenile arrests, higher levels of police presence, and lower family incomes. Parental citations were highest in areas with lower family income and greater proportions of African American populations.

Introduction

In the period from 1988 to 1993, the rates of violent crimes such as homicides, rapes, assaults, and robberies committed by teens rose more than 60%, and murder-related arrests of teens nearly doubled (Snyder and Sickmund, 1995; Seibert, 1995). Nearly two million juveniles were arrested in the United States in 1992; 84% of them were arrested in urban areas (FBI Uniform Crime Reports, 1993; Marketos, 1995).

In the late 1980's and early 1990's, the citizens of many cities were alarmed by the increasing incidence of serious crime by
juveniles and looked for ways to respond quickly and effectively to this threat. The administrators of many cities reached for an old solution to a current problem: a teen curfew. Teen curfews attained modest popularity in the 1970’s in response to rising rates of juvenile crime during that period. In the 1990’s they enjoyed renewed and increased popularity. In 1990, 93(47%) of the 200 American cities with populations of 100,000 or more had curfews in place. By 1995, 146 (73%) of these cities had enacted and implemented teen curfew laws (LeBoeuf, 1996; Ruefle and Reynolds, 1995). In 1994, there were as many as one thousand American cities of all population sizes with teen curfews (Ruefle and Reynolds, 1995).

This study examines the relationship of a recently enacted teen curfew law in a mid-sized city of more than 200,000 population to juvenile arrest rates, and it analyzes the enforcement of the curfew during its first year of use in regard to factors associated with curfew violations and parental citations. These relationships are examined in relation to the arguments in favor of teen curfews and the concerns expressed by opponents of these curfews.

Background

Teen curfew laws restrict the hours that juveniles may be on the streets or in public places at night. A teen curfew is justified in many cities or municipalities as a simple method to not only reduce opportunities for teens to commit crimes but also to protect them from becoming crime victims. Curfews are promoted as beneficial to law enforcement; they give police additional control over the presence and behavior of juveniles on the street during curfew hours. They are also endorsed as a valuable complement to parental supervision; they provide community support to parents placing limits on the hours that their children may be out at night (Ruefle and Reynolds, 1995; Seibert, 1995).

In many cities, curfews have been introduced by government officials as credible and effective community-based responses to increases in serious juvenile crime. Curfews have been touted as particularly useful in high-crime neighborhoods or communities. In some areas they have been endorsed primarily as a strategy to
Teen Curfew Law

limit the late-night activities of juvenile gangs. Curfew laws have become increasingly important instruments of the crime control or "just deserts" approach to juvenile justice, which emphasizes accountability and more severe sanctioning of juvenile offenders. This approach has largely supplanted the rehabilitative justice model that dominated juvenile justice since the early 20th century (Feld, 1990; Krisberg, Schwartz, Litsky, and Austin, 1986; Ruefle and Reynolds, 1995).

As more communities have adopted teen curfews, many critics have questioned their viability and legitimacy as crime fighting tools. The questions raised most often in regard to the use and implementation of these curfews are: 1) How effective are curfews as crime prevention measures? 2) What is the relationship of juvenile crime, particularly serious juvenile crime, to the use and enforcement of teen curfew laws? 3) Are teen curfew laws fairly implemented and enforced, or do they target low income, minority neighborhoods? 4) Does the enforcement of curfews violate the rights of juveniles? This study explores these questions in relation to one city's enactment of a teen curfew law.

Literature Review

The literature on teen curfews is limited to several articles in law journals, two outcome evaluations, a multitude of newspaper stories, and a recent survey on curfews in the nation's largest cities. This literature has reviewed and evaluated the legal issues associated with various court cases challenging teen curfew laws. These lawsuits have essentially argued that curfews violate the constitutional rights of juveniles and negate the child rearing rights and responsibilities of parents. Constitutional questions concerning violations of the Equal Protection Clause, First Amendment rights, and 14th Amendment guarantees of due process have been raised most often.

Legal challenges have prompted lawmakers to rethink and reshape curfew laws to address and protect essential juvenile rights. Comprehensive and precise language defining the key terms in these laws is intended to provide clear definitions of prohibited behavior (Marketos, 1995, Seibert, 1995). "Exceptions" to the restrictions that the law places upon various juvenile behaviors
have been added to prevent curfews from violating First Amendment rights of free speech, association and assembly, religious expression, and unrestricted travel (Johnson, 1995; Horowitz, 1991; Marketos, 1995). Consistent standards of enforcement, including a mandatory enforcement requirement, have been appended to some curfew laws to forestall claims that they involve arbitrary and discriminatory application (Marketos, 1995, Seibert, 1995).

Courts have generally upheld as constitutional the government's claim of having a compelling interest in passing teen curfew laws in response to rising juvenile crime (Hananel, 1994; Qutb v. Strauss, 11 £ 3d 488 1993). However, cities have not been required to present evidence to the courts indicating that curfews have actually been instituted in response to the juvenile crime problem. There has also been no requirement to provide evidence that curfews have curtailed crime or reduced juvenile victimization in cities where they have been adopted (DeLucia, 1995; Johnson, 1995; Marketos, 1995; Seibert, 1995; Lester, 1996). Indeed, the research literature is nearly bereft of studies examining the effects of curfews on crime, the community, or youth offenders (Ruefl and Reynolds, 1995). The claims in several high profile cities such as Denver, San Antonio, and New Orleans that serious juvenile crime decreased 30 to 60 percent in their areas following the adoption of curfew laws have been based on anecdotal evidence, rather than systematic data collection and analysis (Siebert, 1995). The national rates of violent juvenile crime that had climbed so steeply from the mid-1980's to 1993 and were instrumental in the reemergence of teen curfew laws have declined rather sharply since 1995 (Sickmund et al., 1997). There are only two studies that have examined the link between curfews and changes in rates of juvenile arrests.

A dated curfew outcome study (Hunt and Weiner, 1977) examined the effects of a summertime curfew law in a large Midwestern city. Rates of serious crimes (rape, robbery, burglary, etc.) committed by juveniles during the month of August were calculated for the four years prior to adoption of the summer curfew and compared with rates after the curfew took effect. The findings suggested that crime rates were reduced during curfew hours. However, there was also some evidence of "crime displacement", ...
that is, an observable increase in criminal activities during the afternoon hours when the curfew was not in effect.

A recent study examined whether rates of curfew arrests were associated with rates of juvenile arrests on a year-by-year basis from 1978 to 1996 for the state of California (Males & Macallair, 1999). Categories of youth crimes examined were: all arrests, felonies, violent felonies, homicides, property felonies, and misdemeanors. A statewide analysis revealed that curfew arrests were generally unrelated to juvenile arrest rates, although they were associated with higher rates of misdemeanor arrests for all youth and specifically for whites, Hispanics, and Asians. Curfew enforcement was related to higher rates of violent crime by Asian youth, and higher rates of all types of crime for Asian and white youth.

The twelve most populous counties in California were examined for the 1980-96 period. Again, curfew arrest rates were generally unrelated to youth arrest rates overall, but were positively related to arrests for misdemeanors. In four counties, curfews were associated with higher rates of both violent and property crimes. Most significantly, none of the counties with the highest rates of curfew enforcement showed a significant decrease in juvenile arrests for any kind of crime. The authors concluded that their analysis of teen curfews in California did not support the contention that curfew enforcement is related to reductions in any kind of juvenile crime (Males & Macallair, 1999).

Ruefle and Reynolds (1995) reviewed more than 160 newspaper stories about curfews which appeared during 1993 and part of 1994. They found that the rationale for adoption of curfews in most cities was to reduce juvenile crime and crime victimization. Several cities were reported to have adopted curfews both as a hedge against the geographical displacement of juvenile crime to their cities from other areas and as part of a “domino effect” when surrounding cities and municipalities passed them. At the time of the survey, three major American cities (Denver, Phoenix, Orlando) had adopted city-wide curfews that had specific application to “hot spot” high crime areas.

Ruefle and Reynolds (1995) also conducted a telephone survey of police departments in the 77 cities in the United States with populations of 200,000 or more to determine the extent and
content of their curfews. Fifty nine (77%) of these largest cities had curfew ordinances by mid-1994. Of these cities, 33 (56%) had curfews enacted prior to the 1990's, and 26 (44%) had adopted them for the first time between 1990 and 1994. Many of the cities with longstanding curfews had revised their ordinances during the early 1990's.

Although there are no national crime statistics that specify the number of annual curfew violations, the FBI crime statistics include a category which groups curfew and loitering violations. In 1992, there were 91,100 youths cited for these offenses. This seems to be a high number when compared to the 129,600 youth arrested in the same year for all violent crimes (FBI Uniform Crime Statistics, 1994). By 1995, curfew and loitering violations had risen to 149,800, surpassing the incidence of all violent crimes (147,700) (Sickmund, Snyder, & Poe-Yamagata, 1997). The most recent figures indicate that curfew/loitering violations had reached 183,000 in 1997, more than double the rate from 1992 (Snyder, 1998).

Critics of teen curfews have argued that they have little impact on serious juvenile crimes, citing statistics indicating that most of these offenses occur in the after-school hours before parents return home from work (Seibert, 1995). Approximately 57 percent of all violent juvenile crime occurs on school days; 20 percent of it occurs between 2:00 p.m. and 6:00 p.m. Serious violent crimes by juveniles peaks at 3 p.m. on school days, and it peaks in the evening between 8:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m. on non-school days (Sickmund et al., 1997; Snyder & Sickmund, 1999). The rate of violent crimes committed by juveniles is four times greater in the afterschool hours than in the usual curfew period. The potential for efforts to be successful in reducing a community's juvenile violent crime rate are greater if they target youth in the hours immediately after school as compared to the late-night hours typically covered by juvenile curfews (Snyder & Sickmund, 1999).

Critics of teen curfews have also voiced the suspicion that these laws are enforced in an arbitrary and discriminatory fashion, targeting youth in low income, minority neighborhoods. It is feared that if broad enforcement discretion is granted to police, they will use the curfew as a pretense to detain and question youth, particularly minority youth. Studies examining police decision-making practices suggest that this concern is justified.
Results indicate that numerous extra-legal factors contribute to the increased likelihood of juvenile arrest. These factors include: social class, race, demeanor, and area of residence of the offender; presence of co-perpetrators; and general police department policies and deployment practices (Fisher and Doyle-Martin, 1981, Smith and Visher, 1981; Sutphen, Kurtz, and Giddings 1993). Critics argue that curfews are merely another law enforcement weapon that will be misused by police to cite youth for curfew violations when they are suspected of committing other crimes but there is insufficient evidence for an arrest (Federale, 1995; Ford, 1994; Ruefle and Reynolds, 1995).

Study and Curfew Parameters

This study examines the relationship of a teen curfew to rates of juvenile arrests, and how the curfew law was enforced during a one year period following its implementation in 1995 in a city with a population of 230,000 (1990 Census). The city contains a predominantly Caucasian population (85%), with African Americans making up 13.4% of the total. There are approximately 34,000 youth between the ages of 5 to 17 in the city; approximately 80% of this age group are Caucasian; about 18% are African American.

The curfew law was adopted in response to a reported increase in serious and violent juvenile crime (murder, rape, assault, and burglaries) in the city over the past several years. Its stated purpose was to reduce juvenile crime and violence (Tolliver, 1994).

The curfew law applies to all youth 17 years of age and younger, from 11 p.m. to 5 a.m. week nights, and from 1 a.m. to 5 a.m. on weekend nights. The law contains several exceptions to violations including youths who are: accompanied by a parent or other authorized adult; exercising first amendment rights (religion, speech, assembly); cases of reasonable necessity; standing on the sidewalk in front of their residence; returning home within an hour of a school, religious, or voluntary activity; engaged in employment activity; in a motor vehicle with an authorized driver; operators or passengers of a motor vehicle in direct route to a destination within or out of the city limits; married; or homeless and using a public place as an abode. The
law also contains a provision to cite the parents of youth violators if they permit the youth to violate the curfew or fail to prevent the youth from violating the curfew. Cited parents face a fine of up to $499. Enforcement of this provision is left to the discretion of the police officer.

Methods

Data were collected from police department records of juvenile arrests for the periods 1992–1998. The curfew was implemented in May 1995, so this data provided comparison information regarding juvenile arrests for three years prior to and three years post curfew implementation. Data collected contained total juvenile arrests, felonies, misdemeanors, violent crimes (homicide, assault, robbery, rape), and property crimes (burglary, larceny, auto-theft, arson). Data were also collected from police reports for the first year of the law’s implementation (May 1995–April 1996). Police reports provided information about the date, time, and police beat location of each curfew violation. These reports contained information about each offender’s gender, race, and age, whether the offender had prior curfew violations, if cop-perpetrators were present, and whether weapons or drugs were involved. These reports also noted whether a juvenile’s parents were cited. A “circumstances” section of the report revealed additional information for each citation, including the mobility status of the youth (on foot or in vehicle), presence of adult(s), and the decision by police to make an additional charge against the youth (or accompanying adult) when an offense in addition to the curfew violation was observed or suspected.

The police department provided summary data for each of 24 police beats in the city: 1996 juvenile arrests for all crimes and for serious crimes (homicide, rape, assault, robbery) and police deployment (man-hours) during curfew hours. The police beats, with a few exceptions, coincide with groupings of from two to four of the fifty-five census tracts in the city. Census tract figures from the 1990 Census regarding race, income, and other variables were combined in their respective police beat areas to obtain demographic profiles for each police beat. Data for two police beats were combined because they fell into one census tract, one
police beat could not be reliably matched to census tracts and was not included in the data analysis. Thus, results are reported for 22 police beats.

Results

Pre-and-Post Curfew Juvenile Arrests

As shown in the Figure, implementation of the curfew in 1995 did not appear to have an immediate marked effect on juvenile crime rates in any of the categories. Table 1 presents year by year figures for various types of crimes committed by juveniles. Standard crime rates were calculated by dividing the number of crimes reported in each category by the estimated juvenile population for that year and multiplying the result by 10000.

The crime rates for each category fluctuated year by year, but did not appear to be related to the implementation of the curfew. Mean rates of each category of crime were calculated for the periods of 1992–1994 and 1996–1998. Comparisons of mean pre-and-post curfew crime rates were conducted for each crime category using both independent t-tests and Mann-Whitney tests. Overall, the mean number of arrests per juvenile population decreased by 15 arrests per 10,000 juveniles, but the difference was not statistically significant. Poisson regression analysis comparing 1998 incidents of juvenile arrests per juvenile population to those in 1992, 1993, 1994, 1996, and 1997 found that 1998 had significantly lower overall incidents for every year except pre-curfew 1993.

Comparisons for individual arrest categories indicated that while mean rates of arrests for misdemeanors and crimes against property decreased slightly from pre-curfew to post-curfew, there was a slight increase in mean rates for violent crimes and felonies. None of the differences was statistically significant.

Youth Curfew Violations During the First Year of Implementation

Three hundred and seventy-seven citations for curfew violations were issued in the first year of the curfew law. The offending youths were primarily male and Caucasian. Thirty percent of the offenders were African American compared to 18.3% of the juvenile population in the city (U. S. Census, 1990); African American youths were over-represented in the population of offenders
(chi-square=4.11; df=1; p<.05). Most of the violators were between 14 and 17 years of age; their average age was 16. Only a small number of the cited youth had prior curfew violations when they were apprehended. Citations by month ranged from 54 issued in July to only 13 issued in December. Over half of them occurred in the warm weather months from May to August, during the schools' summer recess.

The circumstances under which the citations were issued varied greatly. The vast majority of the juveniles (84%) were cited
Table 1


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All juvenile arrests</td>
<td>630</td>
<td>541</td>
<td>586</td>
<td>599</td>
<td>594</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felonies</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanors</td>
<td>594</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>549</td>
<td>582</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violent crimes:</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homicide</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assault</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robbery</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rape</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property crimes:</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burglary</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larceny</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auto-theft</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arson</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug related crimes</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol related crimes</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firearms related crimes</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic offenses</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

in groups with one or more co-perpetrators. Nearly one third of the curfew violators were cited in the company of young adults. Most of the violators were on foot (63%) with the remainder in vehicles when they were apprehended.

In two thirds of the cases, other crimes committed by juveniles or adult companions were either observed by the police or suspected to have occurred. Weapons were involved in only 23 of the situations, but drugs or alcohol were involved in over a quarter of them. The most prevalent offenses associated with curfew violations involved either alcohol or drugs, theft or attempted theft, escape attempts, or disorderly conduct. One incident of assault and two of robbery were the only serious violent crimes associated with the enforcement of the curfew.
The most frequent curfew violation scenario encountered by the police involved two or more juveniles walking the streets or "hanging out" in public places. This was the circumstance under which a quarter of the cases were cited: no other crimes, weapons, adults, or previous curfew violations were involved. This type of scenario was reported for 1 in 3 citations of African American youths, and for 1 in 5 citations of Caucasian youths.

**Parental Citations**

Parents of youth curfew violators may also be cited at the discretion of the arresting officer. The city curfew law grants police the option of assessing the extent to which parents of curfew violators either permitted or failed to prevent their child's curfew violation. Parents were cited in 83 (22%) of the 377 curfew violations. The parents of males were cited much more frequently (69) than females (14), but in essentially equal proportions to the distribution of curfew violations by gender. The police issued 60% of the parental citations to parents of Caucasian youth and 39% to parents of African American youth. Again this was a significantly higher proportion of African Americans than the 14% represented in the overall population (chi-square=17.31; df=1; p < .01).

Parents were cited more often when curfew violators had prior curfew violations (34% vs. 14% of the total group; chi-square = 18.83; df=1; p < .01); possessed a weapon (17% vs. 6% of the total group; chi-square=10.66; df=1; p < .01); or when drugs or alcohol were involved (52% vs. 28% of the total group; chi-square=18.35; df=1; p < .01). Parents of curfew violators were cited in one third of the situations when the youth or an associate were charged with other offenses. The most frequent offenses associated with parental citations were: alcohol intoxication, possession of marijuana, and eluding police.

**Analysis by Police Beat**

Initial analysis of the individual curfew violations suggested a differential in the way that the curfew law was applied to Caucasian and African American youth. It appeared that a disproportionate number of African American youths and their parents were cited for curfew violations in the first year of implementation. Further analysis was done to examine enforcement of the
# Table 2

Curfew Violations and Parent Citations During the First Year of Implementation: Offender Characteristics, Situational Factors, and Additional Charge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offender Characteristics</th>
<th>Curfew Violations (N=377)</th>
<th>Parent Citations (N=83)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>80.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>68.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-15</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over 16</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prior Violations</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situational Factors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of Associates</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>84.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of Adults</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mobility Status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On foot</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Vehicle</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Drugs or Alcohol Involved</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>104</td>
<td>27.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Weapon involved</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Additional Charges</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol Intoxication</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eluding police</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possession of Alcohol</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possession of Marijuana</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disorderly conduct</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theft or attempted theft</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possession of Contraband</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Runaway</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
teen curfew law in relation to juvenile arrest rates and to investigate whether its enforcement appeared to target low income, minority neighborhoods.

Data for 22 police beats were analyzed to examine whether curfew violations and parental citations issued in each of the police beat areas appeared to be related to other variables such as juvenile arrest rates, African American population, juvenile population, income, and police presence during curfew hours. Initial examination showed that the 22 police beats varied greatly in size, population, and in regard to each of the other variables. The number of persons residing within a police beat ranged from 2,307 to 20,344. The number of curfew violations per beat ranged from 2 to 40 (mean=17); the number of parental citations ranged from 0 to 14 (mean=4).

In order to make comparisons among the police beats, all raw numbers were converted to rates per population of the police beat. In addition, the numbers of curfew violations and parental citations were recalculated to reflect "incidents" rather than "individuals". Violations which resulted in two or more youths being cited at the same time for the same activity were counted as one violation incident; likewise if the parents of these youths were cited as a result of the same violation incident, only one incident of parental citation was counted (Michener and Tighe, 1992). Table 3 shows rates per population of police beat; there was still enormous variation among police beats on all the variables.

Incidents of youth curfew violations per 10,000 population ranged from 1.18 to 56.35 among the police beats. Incidents of parental citations ranged from 0 to 24.91 per 10,000 population. Figures on juvenile arrest rates included overall juvenile arrests and juvenile arrests for serious crime in 1996. Juvenile arrest rates ranged from 17.88 to 237.07; juvenile arrests for serious crimes (homicide, rape, assault, robbery) ranged from 1.97 to 36.45 per 10,000 population. Police man-hours during curfew per 10,000 population ranged from 12.4 to 226.83. The percentage of the population aged 5 to 17 years of age per police beat area ranged from 1% to 43%. The percentage of African Americans in the population ranged from 2% to 68%. Median family income ranged from $13,848 to $60,987 across the police beats.

Bivariate correlations were run to determine if the variables appeared to be significantly related. The correlation matrix is
shown in Table 4. The correlation coefficients indicate that both violation incidents and parental citation incidents per police beat were positively related to juvenile arrest rates and police man-hours, and negatively related to median family income. Although percentage of African American population was not significantly correlated with either violation or parental citation incidents, it was significantly correlated with the variables of police man-hours, juvenile arrests, and median family income. The results suggest that the curfew law was being applied more stringently in low-income areas, which had more police presence, more arrests of juveniles, and a higher percentage of African American citizens. The relationships among variables were not clear, therefore a loglinear regression model was used to predict rates of curfew violation and parental citation incidents.

The Poisson regression model was used to test whether the dependent variables, curfew violation incidents and parental citation incidents, were predicted by the independent variables of percent of African American population, median family income, police man-hours, and juvenile arrest rates. The Poisson regression model is generally used to estimate a rate or incidence of occurrences of phenomena in a population during an interval of time and to determine the relationship of the rate to a set of explanatory variables (Stokes, Davis, and Koch, 1995; Michener and Tighe, 1992). The Poisson loglinear model can be used to "encompass responses such as counts and proportions" (Stokes et al., 1995, p. 472) The dependent variables in the study model are counts: incidents of curfew violations and parental citations, offset by the log of the population per police beat. The explanatory variables are proportional, and in this case, categorized according to their respective distributions in the police beats in order to more precisely examine the relationships between the dependent and independent variables.

The model used to predict incidents of curfew violations included the variables: juvenile arrests and police man-hours per police beat population, percent of African American population, and median family income. The offset was the log of the population for each police beat. The results indicated a satisfactory fit: Pearson chi-square=15.16; deviance=15.34; df=10. Three of the explanatory variables in the model: juvenile arrests, police man-hours, and median family income were found to
Table 3

First Year of Curfew Implementation: Violations and Parent Citation Incidents, Juvenile Arrest Rates, Police Man Hours, and Demographic Variables by Police Beat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>56.4</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>237.1</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>206.7</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>23.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>192.1</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>226.8</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>35.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>28.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>227.8</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>209.1</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>155.8</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>18.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>196.1</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>173.4</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>24.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>108.3</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>18.0</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>152.6</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>93.8</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>38.4</td>
<td>60.3</td>
<td>31.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>72.9</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>34.4</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>92.9</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>24.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>121.5</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>18.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>37.9</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>43.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>168.7</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>215.7</td>
<td>67.8</td>
<td>26.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>26.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Teen Curfew Law</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>172.1</td>
<td>163.2</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>26.9</td>
<td>27.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$27,366</td>
<td>$29,062</td>
<td>$57,529</td>
<td>$22,687</td>
<td>$35,714</td>
<td>$43,681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>96.4</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>19.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Figure per 10000 population.
Table 4  
First Year of Curfew Implementation: Correlations of Police Beat Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Curfew Violation Incidents</th>
<th>Parent Citation Incidents</th>
<th>Juvenile Arrests</th>
<th>Juvenile Arrests for Serious Crimes</th>
<th>Police Man-hours</th>
<th>Percent African-American Population</th>
<th>Percent Juvenile Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent Citations</td>
<td>.924&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Arrests</td>
<td>.681&quot;</td>
<td>.603&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Arrests for Serious Crimes</td>
<td>.261</td>
<td>.345</td>
<td>.608&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Man-hours</td>
<td>.712&quot;</td>
<td>.670&quot;</td>
<td>.691&quot;</td>
<td>.521*</td>
<td>.691&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% African-American Population</td>
<td>.405</td>
<td>.257</td>
<td>.560&quot;</td>
<td>.354</td>
<td>.691&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Juvenile Population</td>
<td>.196</td>
<td>.242</td>
<td>.330</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>.222</td>
<td>.350</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Family Income</td>
<td>-.598&quot;</td>
<td>-.511*</td>
<td>-.674&quot;</td>
<td>-.581&quot;</td>
<td>-.659&quot;</td>
<td>-.585&quot;</td>
<td>-.246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Curfew violations, parent citations, juvenile arrests, juvenile arrests for serious crimes and police man-hours are per 10,000 population.

* Significant at p=.05.

** Significant at p=.01.
be significantly \((p \leq 0.05)\) related to curfew violations or to have significant effects on the model. Percent of African American population was not a significant variable in predicting incidents of curfew violations, although removing it from the model weakened the overall model slightly. The individual chi-square values and their significance levels are shown in Table 5. The main effects for the variables of median family income and juvenile arrest rates appeared to be in comparing the "high" and "low" categories, with the largest differences being noted between the police beats with the highest and lowest median family incomes and highest and lowest juvenile arrest rates. For the variable of police man-hours, the lowest category of police man-hours (0–25 per 10,000 population) was the reference cell, and significant differences were noted in comparisons with all of the other three categories. These results suggest even more strongly that the curfew law was applied more stringently in low-income areas, which had more police presence and more arrests of juveniles; the percentage of African American citizens did not appear to have a direct effect on curfew violations.

The model used to predict incidents of parental citations included the variables: percent of African American population and median family income. The offset was the log of the population for each police beat. The results indicated a satisfactory fit: Pearson

### Table 5

*Likelihood Ratio Statistics for Poisson Regression Model Predicting Incidents of Curfew Violations*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent Variable</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Chi-Square</th>
<th>Probability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% African-American population</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>0.1875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Family Income</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.68</td>
<td>0.0130*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Man-hours per 10,000 population</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19.59</td>
<td>0.0002*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Arrests per 10,000 population</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20.05</td>
<td>0.0002*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significant at \(p < 0.05\).*
chi-square=20.24; deviance=24.20; df=16. Both of the explanatory variables in the model had significant effects: the individual chi-square for percent of African American population=13.87 (df=3, p=0.0031), and the individual chi-square for median family income=12.43 (df=2, p=0.0020). Adding the other independent variables to the model did not improve the fit. These results suggest that parents were more likely to be cited when violations occurred in low-income areas with the highest percentage of African American population.

Discussion

The primary aim of this study was to examine the relationship of a teen curfew to rates of juvenile arrests and to analyze the first year of the use and enforcement of the curfew in a mid-southern city in relation to variables and concerns identified by proponents and critics of teen curfews. The results indicate that at least some of the concerns voiced by critics of teen curfews appear to be justified.

As in most cities that have adopted curfew laws, the curfew examined in this study was implemented in an effort to counter a reported increase in serious juvenile crime. The findings indicate that the curfew was not associated with significant changes in the juvenile arrest rates for any kind of crime including serious (violent) crimes. There are many apparent trends or peaks in the arrest data that would seem to suggest that arrests for certain kinds of offenses have increased or decreased since the enactment of the curfew, however the overall variance in the arrest patterns were so great that no significant effects were found. For example, total juvenile arrests were at their lowest point in 1998, but were barely less than the rate in pre-curfew 1993. Arrests for misdemeanors were at their lowest point in 1996 and felony arrests peaked in 1997. Likewise, arrests for violent crimes were never higher than in 1998. Results of the study indicate that the curfew did not significantly target or impact serious (violent) juvenile crime. This is consistent with the conclusions reached by the OJJDP that most violent crimes committed by juveniles do not occur during curfew hours (Snyder and Sickmund, 1999). One of the limitations of this study is that it only covers three years of curfew implementation.
However, it seems unlikely that a longer period of evaluation will reveal different results in terms of the curfew's association with arrest rates.

Review of the first year of curfew implementation showed that citations were more likely to be issued in police beats with the highest rates of total juvenile arrests but not consistently in the beats with the most arrests for serious (violent) offenses. As one may observe in Table 3, two beats (14 & 19) were among the highest for serious crimes, but had very low rates of curfew violations. As reported in Table 2, examination of police reports indicated that the additional charges most associated with the curfew did not include assault, rape, or other violent crimes. During the first year of the curfew only two incidences of violent crimes were reported by police when enforcing the curfew.

The relationship between the curfew and juvenile crime does not appear to be a causal one. Both are enforced in the same areas of the city (police beats), but it has not been demonstrated that the curfew has any effect upon rates of juvenile arrests. The beats with the most curfew citations were generally the small, densely populated, inner-city areas with many low-income minority residents and high police presence, as contrasted with much the more expansive suburban beats which had the fewest citations. Higher rates of violations were probably a result of greater police presence in smaller geographical areas where more crime was anticipated. Youth in these areas may not have as many places to "hang out" that are less visible to police, or they are less mobile and therefore more visible than their youthful counterparts who live in suburban areas.

Critics of curfews have claimed that they are nothing but an additional law enforcement device used by police as a pretense to detain, question, and charge youth in low income, minority neighborhoods. The findings of this study suggest that the primary value of the law has been to provide police with an additional charging mechanism. However, without the benefit of a situational study, it would be difficult to know whether or how the curfew was used as a pretext to stop or detain youths suspected of criminal activity. It could be that youths are stopped for curfew violations and then evidence of criminal activity is discovered, leading to arrest on criminal charges. Conversely, it could be that
youths are stopped for reported or suspected criminal activity and are charged with curfew violations when the alleged criminal activity cannot be substantiated by police. A third possibility is that the curfew offers the police an additional charging option when the associates of apprehended youth have been arrested for committing crimes.

The highest rates of curfew citations occurred in areas of the city with the lowest median family incomes and the greatest African American population. The fact that median family income was found to be a stronger predictor of curfew citations than the percentage of African American population was not unexpected in a city with an 80% Caucasian population. While most of the city’s African American citizens reside in the police beats with the highest curfew violations, the majority of the residents in most of these areas are Caucasian. The percentage of African American population, however, was a stronger predictor of parental citations. Although parental citations appeared to be related to the seriousness of the circumstances surrounding curfew violations, the parents of African American youths were more likely to be cited by police than the parents of Caucasian youths with similar circumstances. These findings are suggestive of discriminatory enforcement and are consistent with a substantial body of literature that has documented racial and social class-based disparity in many aspects of the juvenile justice system.

The legal justification for the enactment of this teen curfew law as well as those in other municipalities has been predicated on its potential for crime prevention. At present, this has yet to be demonstrated through research findings in this city or others. Future research must continue to examine this relationship in order to address the underlying question of whether there is a “compelling interest” to criminalize the nocturnal activities of teens. Many local governments and the courts have been all too ready to accept the deterrent value of curfews without the benefit of supporting evidence. The logic implicit in the adoption of curfew laws is suspect; that the appropriate response to an increase in crime is to create a new crime. Curtailing the late-night activities of youth in public places is not likely to reduce arrest rates for serious crimes if the majority of these crimes do not occur during this time period. The extensive embraced of
this policy on the national level has spawned curfew violations and loitering as the fastest growing juvenile offense category in America. It still remains to be shown that there is a concomitant decrease in violent juvenile crime. Ultimately, the question to be answered is whether limited resources are being poorly utilized on enforcing curfew laws that may violate the rights of juveniles and their parents when they could be better used on after-school programs that may have much greater potential to reduce serious juvenile crime.

References


The Intergenerational Transmission of Grandmother-Grandchild Co-Residency

RICHARD K. CAPUTO
Yeshiva University
Wurzweiler School of Social Work

This study examined national data from two women’s cohorts to determine the likelihood that Black grandmothers who resided with grandchildren were more likely than other grandmothers were to have daughters who resided with grandchildren. Of 1098 co-resident grandmothers, 390 (36%) were in the younger of the two cohorts, 603 (55%) were in the older, and 105 (9%) were in both, comprising the sub-sample of grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs. A significantly higher proportion of mothers in the grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs were Black (83%) compared to 37% of the mothers among the non-paired ever co-resident grandmothers. The study also found, by proxy, that the co-resident grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs had lower socioeconomic standing than non-paired ever co-resident grandmothers.

The 1990s witnessed increasing scholarship and research in the area of grandparents raising grandchildren. Much of the related research has been based on small nonrandom samples in particular geographic areas (Fuller-Thompson, Minkler, & Driver, 1997) and an earlier national study of grandparents (Cherlin & Furstenberg, 1992 [1986]) was based on a representative sample of children aged seven to eleven in 1976. More recent national studies (Chalfie, 1994; Fuller-Thompson, et al., 1997; Saluter, 1992) provided initial sociodemographic profiles of grandparents co-residing with grandchildren but had limited time frames and were confined to one cohort. The related research has been summarized and critiqued elsewhere (Caputo, 2000a & c; Caputo, 1999b; Pruchno, 1999). For the most part, the national level studies revealed that most co-resident households occurred across class
lines, but that they disproportionately occurred among Black grandmothers. Most co-residential households comprised three generations (i.e., with at least one of the child's parents also present) rather than skipped or two generations and although a disproportionate percentage of grandparent-grandchild households was poor, most were not.

This study extended recent research in this area, examining the likelihood of grandmother-grandchild co-residency across generations. That is, it sought to determine the extent to which grandmothers who lived with grandchildren in one generation were likely to have daughters who in turn lived with grandchildren in the next generation. In light of previous research, particular attention was given to the effects of race on intergenerational transmission of grandmother-grandchild co-residency. Specifically, this study addressed the following questions:

1. To what extent are grandmothers who live with grandchildren in one generation more likely to have daughters who in turn are more likely to live with grandchildren in the next generation?
2. To what extent are co-resident grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs likely to be Black?

Answers to these questions can shed light on the extent to which the intergenerational family form is a function of culture as well as situation. Given previous research, it was hypothesized that grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs would more likely be found among Black women. In light of the personal and social problems that often result in grandparents caring for grandchildren, at issue, as Rustin (2000) notes, is the extent to which the social welfare function of "the family," particularly in regard to its voluntary intergenerational aspects, can be nurtured and strengthened.

Method

Data

Study data came from the National Longitudinal Surveys of Labor Market Experience (NLS), Young and Mature Women's Cohorts. The Young Women's Cohort was a nationally representative sample of 5159 women who were ages 14–24 in 1968.
when they were first interviewed and the Mature Women's Cohort comprised a comparable sample of 5083 women who were ages 30 to 44 in 1967 when they were first interviewed. In the original population samples of women, there were 1848 mother-daughter pairs, that is, mothers in the Mature Women’s Cohort whose daughters were part of the population sample constituting the Young Women’s Cohort. Respondents were interviewed on a continuing basis between their respective start dates and 1997, the most recent year of data available for this study, and they were asked a range of questions regarding labor market experiences, human capital and other demographic characteristics about themselves and their family circumstances. Documentation about the samples was found in the NLS Handbook 1999 (Center for Human Resource Research, 1999) and the NLS of Young Women's User's Guide 1997 (Center for Human Resource Research, 1997).

Measures & Procedures

Respondents who reported one or more grandchildren when asked about their relationship to other household members at the time of survey were classified as co-resident grandmothers. Those who reported that one or more grandchildren resided with them in at least one survey year in the study period were deemed as ever co-resident grandmothers. Ever co-resident grandmothers in each cohort of women comprised the population sample of co-resident grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs. Race was classified as Black or other. For co-resident grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs, race of mother was used. The highest grade of school completed by respondents’ mothers in 1967 was used as a proxy for socioeconomic status in both cohorts. Mothers’ educational level has been found to be a good predictor of, having a positive relationship with, socioeconomic status (Caputo, 1999a). T-test and Chi-square statistics were used to compare sociodemographic characteristics of grandmother-grandchild ever co-resident mother-daughter pairs with other, non-paired, ever co-resident grandmothers.

Limitations

Use of the NLS, Young and Mature Women’s Cohorts, limited this study to two nationally representative samples of American
women between the ages of 14 and 24 in 1968 and between 30 and 44 in 1967 respectively. Since neither cohort, nor their combination, was representative of all adult women and since the NLS data files contained no information about respondents' grandchildren living outside the household, the study sample is not representative of all women or grandmothers and generalizability is compromised. Despite these limitations, the use of two cohorts of women provides an initial glimpse of intergenerational transmission of grandmother-grandchild co-residency and thereby adds to the growing body of knowledge about grandparents in general and grandmothers in particular co-residing with grandchildren.

Results

There were 1098 ever co-resident grandmothers in the population samples of both cohorts. Of these, 603 (55%) were in the Mature Women's Cohort, 390 (36%) were in the Young Women's Cohort, and 105 (9%) were in both, comprising the grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs. As expected, a significantly higher proportion of mothers in the grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs were Black (83%) compared to 37% of non-paired ever co-resident grandmothers (Chi-square = 80.4, p = .001).

In regard to socioeconomic status, for which the educational level of respondents' mothers served as a proxy, the paired co-resident grandmothers had lower socioeconomic standing than the non-paired ever co-resident grandmothers. Among ever co-resident grandmothers in the Mature Women's Cohort, the paired grandmothers reported that their mothers had completed 7.1 years of education by 1967 compared to 8.1 years for the non-paired grandmothers (T = 3.9, p < .001). These paired grandmothers in the Mature Women's Cohort themselves had completed 8.0 years of education compared to 10.2 years reported by the non-paired grandmothers (T = 7.0, p < .001).

Discussion

The finding regarding Black grandmother-grandchild mother-daughter pairs reflects those about co-resident grandmothers in
Intergenerational Transmission of Grandmother-Grandchild Co-Residency

Intergenerational transmission of grandmother-grandchild co-residency is far more common among Black women than it is among others. This finding suggests that culture may play an important role in a family's ability to adapt to changing circumstances to meet need. Black grandmothers who reside with grandchildren may serve as role models to their children, instilling in them that the right thing to do is to take in grandchildren in times of need. Black culture may nurture and sustain this particular form of intergenerational responsibility, grandmother-grandchild co-residency, more so than is the case for other racial/ethnic groups by passing down the expectation from one generation to the next. The finding highlights in a paradoxical way the contemporary concern for family values. While political pundits decry the demise of the traditional nuclear family, the finding of this study suggests that Black intergenerational families may be more suited to meet contingencies posed by social problems and sociodemographic shifts than are more nuclear families (e.g., see Burnette, 1997; Burton, 1992; Gibson, 1999).

The finding regarding socioeconomic status should be interpreted cautiously, in part because lower economic standing need not imply poverty and in part because the relationship found here may be spurious. Previous research indicates that most grandmother-grandchild co-resident households are affluent, although disproportionately poor, especially among skipped-generation households (e.g., see Caputo, 1999b; Fuller-Thompson, et al., 1997; Sands & Goldberg-Glen, 1998). This study provides indirect evidence that paired co-resident grandmothers were less affluent than the non-paired ever co-resident grandmothers, as determined by the lower level of education of the co-resident grandparents’ mothers. What cannot be determined from the bivariate analysis used here are the effects of other factors like age at the time of mothers’ first births on the intergenerational transmission of grandmother-grandchild co-residency, nor the causal relationship between co-residency and socioeconomic status. Further research is needed to learn if families lose economic standing by virtue of assuming responsibility for a grandchild
and how controlling for age at the time of one's first birth is likely to interact with race and class and thereby affect the likelihood of intergenerational transmission of grandparent-grandchild co-residency.

Grandmother-grandchild co-residency poses many challenges to mothers in general, but it presents more formidable ones to Black mothers to the extent they are more likely to become co-resident grandparents and to have daughters who in turn are likely to do so. One such challenge, though not measured in this study, has to do with work. It is commonplace that Black women have had historically higher labor force participation rates than White women, although the rates have become equalized since the late 1980s when large numbers of White mothers with young children entered the labor force (Caputo, 1997 & 1995). Working Black women, however, do not have access to jobs with the range of traditional and family-friendly benefits that would enable them to manage more easily than is currently the case grandmother-grandchild co-residency (Caputo, in press & 2000b). To the extent employee benefits become less available in general and affirmative action policies are further eroded, Black women will be more adversely affected and less capable than other women are to negotiate time sufficient to meet the demands of grandmother-grandchild co-residency.

Further, the intergenerational family form that has proved responsive in meeting needs arising amidst adverse social and demographic contingencies may be unintentionally eroded, and may be precluded as a more pervasive and acceptable adaptive form for other ethnic/racial groups, especially Whites. Such an outcome should be avoided particularly for younger co-resident grandmothers who are likely to be in the middle of careers. These women need to remain on their jobs to ensure continuation of their career objectives, while, when possible, retaining health benefits that cover their own children and taking advantage of family-friendly benefits such as family and medical leave with minimal loss of promotional opportunities or salary advances (Judiesch & Lyness, 1999). To the extent Black women occupy jobs without employee benefits, advocates should seek to ensure that affirmative action polices are strengthened, not disbanded, to increase the likelihood that Black working women get jobs with
such benefits and can use them without adverse consequences (Greenhouse & Parasuraman, 1999; Konrad & Linnehan, 1999).

Finally, to the extent intergenerational transmission of grandmother-grandchild co-residency disproportionately affects poor ever co-resident households, the effects of the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996 need to be monitored closely. This "welfare reform" law mandates co-residency with a responsible adult, many of whom are likely to be grandmothers, as a requisite for public benefits (CQ 1996 Almanac, 1997). Provisions should be made to ensure that otherwise affluent families are not pushed too close to or below the poverty line. Furthermore, the income and assets of more affluent families should not be counted in determining the amount of temporary assistance awarded to the teen mother and her child. In addition, measures should be sought to ensure access to publicly underwritten health care and insurance. Public policies should support these grandmothers, particularly as noted above, if they are working, to negotiate what for all practical purposes amounts to second-time-around parenthood.

References


The Transformation of Russian Social Policy in the Transition toward a Market Economy

Isabel Pla Julián
University of Valencia, Spain
Department of Applied Economics

The last few years have witnessed truly extraordinary events in the formerly communist societies. These countries were characterized by the great importance attached to social policy as opposed to market economy countries with a similar level of economic growth. However, the transition process toward a market economy has set new conditions for the functioning of governing levels and companies, which has affected social policies altogether. On the one hand, economic liberalization has brought about a reduction of the Russian Government's intervention in the economy, particularly in social policy. On the other hand, the privatization of the state company in a post-communist society would have implied a new way of economic management based on the principal of competition, in direct opposition to the nature of communist companies. Consequently, such a view of the reforms suggests a social policy of a lower magnitude. However, the difficulties of the transitions now underway in the countries that are emerging from communism (which is increasing claims for social protection) together with the deep-rooted nature of the social securities inherited from the communist period, is putting this new approach of a minimal social policy into question.

In this article we intend to examine the transformation of social policy in the transition from communism to a market economy, and we will focus on the Russian case. First of all, we explain social policy in force during the Soviet planning system, which will bring forward elements of reference for analysis. Secondly, we will focus on the social policy which is a consequence of the process of reforms aiming at a market economy. Finally, we will provide an in-depth analysis of the consequences of the divestiture of the social assets of company provided social services.
Social policy in the traditional centrally planned economy was basically characterized by the principles of universality of protection and solidarity among citizens. Throughout the period of the prevalence of the Soviet planning system, two main tools allowed for the development of social policy:

Firstly, price policy was to remain at the service of planning. Thus, prices were of a political nature, that is to say, they had neither an economic role nor reflected the benefit or the shortage of goods. The system of prices was a dual one, as different prices existed for industrial products and consumer goods. Household consumer prices were the principal tool of the incomes policy and did not reflect the costs of production, thus allowing for the consolidation of a norm of consumption of basic products accessible to all Soviet citizens. Such a policy of prices allowed in its turn for the maintenance of a planned salary system with a low salary structure (Chavance, 1987).

Secondly, there was a wide range of non-monetary benefits provided by the state-owned companies. These companies that provided social services were of three types: (1) services provided for current workers in the company during the course of their work and as a benefit of employment (for example, subsidized meals in the on-premise canteens, paid vacations, holiday accommodations in dachas or sanatori, and sports facilities). Such services in kind constituted part of the workers' wage package, and thus the benefit of this provision could be balanced by a lower cash wage; (2) services provided for current workers and their families alike, for example, pre-school education or health clinics; (3) services provided for the local community, whether or not employees were part of the company (e. g. public infrastructure, hospitals, or transport subsidies) (Commander & Jackman, 1997).

The particular nature of the communist company, which was a national unity of production and a provider of social services, conferred a very important role to social policy during centralized planning, in such a way that each company was bound to direct a part of its clear profits to social policy by means of the Socio-Cultural and Housing Funds. By means of these funds and subsi-
dies granted by the Central Planning Organ (Gosplan), companies were not only in charge of building houses for their workers, daycare centers for their children, restaurants and supermarkets, but, moreover, the companies were in charge of administration of the health and cultural affairs of the country, among other services. In general, the importance of providing social services was greater if the company was larger in size and if it belonged to a priority sector for planning. Definitively, it may be noted that a great deal of the non-monetary income of Soviet workers was indirectly distributed through their own companies. These benefits, on the other hand, complemented the lowest Soviet salaries, stated in monetary terms.

Implications of the Transition to a Market Economy on Social Policy

Since 1991, the transition to a market economy has brought about a number of basic changes in the social policy that had been implemented in the traditional centrally planned economy. These reforms have changed the tools used for determining social policy, and this has meant important consequences for the standard of living:

• First of all, the policy of economic liberalization in the area of prices, which started in 1992, has led to the disappearance of subsidized prices for basic necessity products. As we have previously seen, the policy of prices of the planned economic system was one of the main tools of social policy. Nowadays, however, this kind of policy has been set aside and forgotten because it would be non-viable, given the budgetary and financing problems which the Russian Federation is facing at the moment.

• Secondly, in respect to the incomes of the population, the liberalization implies, on the one hand, the disappearance of the planned salaries in such a way that private companies will be capable of determining their salaries more freely. On the other hand, from 1995 on it has been considered necessary for incomes to be based exclusively on individual effort, therefore limiting the importance given to the social policy as a complementary element in the monetary income. The carry-over on the part of the Russian government in the matter of incomes distribution
has been limited to stipulating the necessity of fixing a guaranteed minimum wage, to the establishment of a progressive tax system on incomes which restrains their excessive growth, and to carrying out an indexing policy of the earned revenues compensating for the variation of prices.

- Thirdly, the posture of the state-owned companies as providers of social services has radically changed as a result of their privatization. Privatization has brought about at least three important consequences which affected the living conditions of the Russian population:

  a. Upon the disappearance of the structure of ownership, which had been mainly state-owned, the spread of the public services was no longer guaranteed, thus affecting the greater part of the population. This situation would became worse if, as happened in the Russian case, the distribution of the resulting wealth from this process of privatization had been unfavorable to a great part of the working population. Although the working population certainly did not lose wealth in real terms, since property in the final analysis had previously belonged to the state, this sector of the population did indeed lose wealth in relative terms, as the redistribution of property had occurred from the state to a limited number of private agents: company managers and banks (Panorama Privatizatsiya, 1995a, 1995b, 1996, 1997). The rapid curtailment in the intermediary role of the public sector of the economy, sometimes linked to the need to bring the public finances under control, accelerated the breakdown of long-established Soviet institutions that had performed a vital social safety net role (such as cultural, sports and vacation camps, public libraries, or art centers) but did not result in the emergence of adequate substitutes related to organizations of civil society. Thus, the insufficient level of state support to social policy during transition led to a reduction, for example, in the number of day hospitals that was accompanied by rendering more out-clinic services. At the same time, the average number of visits to doctors per person declined and the number of beds showed a reduction, outstripping development of out-clinics, consulting, diagnosis and special kinds
of medical assistance. Limited budgetary possibility during the transition period explains a reduction in the construction of new social and cultural facilities (such as libraries, clubs and cinemas, whose number has been seen to decline in recent years) and the deterioration of the available facilities (Shishkin & Rozhdestvenskaya, 1998).

b. The privatization of the state-owned companies has made the maintenance of the full employment policy that was in force during the central planning impossible, and the phenomenon of unemployment appeared for the first time. Apparently, the problem of unemployment is not a great problem because of the fact that the unemployment level registered in relation to the working population for the Russian Federation has and continues to be very poor, as it went from 1.1% in 1992 to 3.4% in 1996. However, according to the OECD and the ILO, the estimated unemployment was higher: 5.5% in 1992 and 7.8% in 1996. Moreover, some indicators pointed out that the unemployment levels registered were worse than they appeared to be. For instance, the number of people who involuntarily worked part-time or without remuneration in a company has been on the rise, and reached 5.1% of the total working population in 1995 (Commander & McHale, 1996). Among the explanations for this peculiar transitional period characterized by its lack of serious unemployment problems (given that the slump in production implicitly carried with it a reduction of personnel) we find the fact that the greater part of the process of privatization of the state-owned companies had been carried out through internal privatization. This privatization has left the control of the company in the hands of its internal personnel. On the other hand, the nature of the newly created private sector generated from self-employment or from what was a part of the informal sector of the economy, had also reduced the effect of unemployment in the Russian economy. In the medium term, it is estimated that whereas companies restructured and adapted themselves to the new economic situation, they would be eliminating those people who maintained a formal link with them, but without any
economic trade-off. These people, then, would be added to the lists of unemployment.

c. As a result of liberalization and privatization, the disappearance of the planning management of the economy has been taking place since 1991, and has reduced the companies’ responsibility to assign a substantial part of their benefits (previously directed through the Socio-Cultural and Housing Fund) to provide social services for the improvement of their workers’ welfare. The contribution of the companies to the social policy by means of the Federal Budget (via the Social Consumption Fund) has been changed into payments to Extra-budgetary Funds. A process of divestiture of company provided social services brought about by the companies, which stipulated that the responsibility of privatized companies to provide these services should be transferred to the local governments where these companies were located—but only in the event there was an explicit consent on the part of these governments-. On the other hand, the privatization of the companies has in turn forced the local governments to take on responsibility for the financing of these services, and it is obvious that in a context characterized by serious financial shortages—which was a result of the early and incipient characteristics of the Russian system for financing—, the companies will progressively reduce expenses that are less related to their productive labor.

- Fourthly, a process of decentralization of the implementation of social policy through a substantial reduction of its financing by the Federal Budget and the formation of extra-budgetary financing has been witnessed. On March 7, 1995, the Government of the Russian Federation approved Decree No. 235, “On the transference of Socio-cultural and communal and personal services in Federal ownership into state property of subjects of Russian Federation and municipal property” (Freinkman & Starodrubrovskaya, 1996). However, the result of the transfer of the responsibility of social sphere to the sub-national governments has not been positive, given that an increase in total social spending has not come about. Thus, real spending in social
services in 1996 was 62.4% of what it was in 1991, according to the Consolidated Budget, which included the items of Social Policy in the Republican and Local Budgets, as well as Non-Budgetary Funds (Institute for Economy in Transition, 1997).

- Finally, the economic difficulties associated with the transition have affected both those already living near the poverty line in the pre-transition period—consisting mainly of pensioners subsisting on minimum pensions, single-parent families, and families with several children—and others who, while were not necessarily near the poverty line at that time, saw their real incomes eroded as a result of the particularly harsh effect of the transition on their individual sectors or industries—for example workers living in city-companies ("closed" cities) affiliated with the military-industrial complex in outlying regions of Russia, engineers working in heavy industry, as well as public sector workers employed in education and health centers. As a result of the reforms, it has been estimated that people with income levels below a rather austere minimum subsistence level of some 200,000 roubles a month ($45) went from some 1.2% of the total population (or about 45 million people) in the year 1989 to 21.5% in 1996 (Lopez Claros & Alexashenko, 1998).

Nevertheless, income welfare measures in an economy undergoing profound structural transformations need to be interpreted with care, given the large fluctuations in relative prices, and the shifts in the structure of the economy and in the (formal or informal) sources of activity and income. A more complete picture of social conditions is thus obtained by supplementing income based indicators with others measures that attempt to capture certain aspects of the standard of living. Between 1989 and 1995, some indicators of welfare evolved as follows: (1) 36% drop in the net birth rate; (2) 46% increase in the net death rate; (3) sharp increases in the incidence of certain diseases (diphtheria, measles and tuberculosis); (4) a six and three years decline in the life expectancy for men and women respectively; (5) extremely large increases in violent deaths and the incidence of crime in general (Lopez Claros & Alexashenko, 1998).
The Process of Divestiture of Company Provided Social Services

The transition toward a market economy and privatization encouraged the divestiture of the developed social functions traditionally provided by the communist companies. Legal arrangements for the status of companies' social assets in Russia were determined by two decrees that specified the transfer of the social services to the local and municipal governments and the possibility that the companies could sell or rent their social patrimony to private institutions as well as to individuals. Thus, on December 23, 1993, the Russian Federation Government passed Decree No. 1325, "On the financing of socio-cultural and communal and personal services being transferred into the authority of local bodies of executive power during the privatization of companies". Additionally, the State Committee for Management of State Property (GKI) passed Letter no. 13/648 "On procedure for transferring company housing stock, housing maintenance and housing repair units servicing this stock into Municipal Ownership" (Freinkman & Starodrubrovskaya, 1996). The arguments behind this emphasis on divestiture (externalization) are that Russian firms will not be able to compete effectively in the market if they are at the same time burdened with having to run various social services, and that, at least in some contexts, company closure could lead to a collapse in the provision of essential services if these had previously been provided by the company. In practice, the situation is rather more complex, and the prospects for achieving benefits from divestiture in the absence of parallel reforms of the housing and local government finance systems are much less clear-cut than these simple claims suggest (Commander & Jackman, 1997).

The federal regulations for company provided social services varied across different types of social assets. Thus, a part of social assets, such as health, educational, cultural and sports facilities, was allowed to be included in the charter capital of companies, with an obligation to keep the profile of these assets unchanged. Another group of assets, which includes housing together with attached utilities networks (so long as they are not situated on the land belonging to the company), as well as maintenance units
of companies with all their so-called 'material base', cannot be included in the charter capital and must be divested to municipalities according to the time schedule approved by municipal administrations but within six months after privatization. Before divestiture takes place, these assets are to be kept on the balance sheets of the companies. At the same time, companies were not forced to included any social assets in their property, if their employees did not want to do so and did not intend to include them in the privatization plan. In cases where some assets are located on land belonging to companies but are used for municipal needs, they have been transformed into the common property of the privatization companies but are used for municipal needs, and they have to be transformed into the common property of the privatizing companies and the local authorities' (Freinkman & Starodrubrovskaya, 1996).

**Attitude of Companies toward the Divesture of Company Provided Social Services**

In practice, companies have widely attempted to economize on providing benefits, but the extent of divesture to date is less than might have been expected. Thus, although 33% of the Russian companies reduced their social benefits during the years 1992 and 1996, this reduction was not the result of the transfer of the entirety of the company provided social services, but only of some of the infrastructure. In this way, it appears as though the total social spending by companies in Russia remains at its very high pre-reform level of 20% of gross wage costs (Lefèvre, 1998).

Apart from these general tendencies, however, we must point out some of the variables that condition the particular evolution of each company:

(1) Traditionally, the company that provided social services benefited from taxation privileges, which allowed for the payment of less taxes, provided that a part of them were deductible by way of welfare payments. Since late 1995, however, the Russian Government has abolished a number of tax exemptions that were formerly extended to entrepreneurial activity in this field.

Under current tax laws, companies have the right to deduct their social expenditure from both the tax on profits
(but not to exceed 50% of the amount of tax due) and from the 1.5% local turnover tax, which can be introduced (and in practice has already been introduced almost everywhere) by local governments specifically to finance housing and facilities. However, the local implementation of these federal regulations varies greatly across municipalities, which use different options for regulation of the profit tax and turnover tax deductions. The major differences are of three types: differences in the way costs are credited against corresponding taxes, differences in the way tax credit mechanisms are applied, and differences in the way deductions from the two different taxes are combined (Freinkman & Starodrubrovskaya, 1996).

(2) The formation of a structure of basically private property rights, immediately after the privatization of the national and private companies of new creation, has raised contrary opinions between the shareholders in the companies with regard to the providing of social services. In this sense, three tendencies in the Board of Management can be distinguished, depending on the origin (internal or external action) and the majority generation (age) to which the different representatives belong. On one side, in general, the younger staff is inclined to be in favor of the entire transfer of the social services to the municipality. On the contrary, the older staff is more opposed to the idea of this transfer, and do not consider it appropriate to admit that they are going to leave their workers without at least some form of social support from the company. It is argued that this paternalistic attitude reveals the splendor of a company and it is a mechanism to attract prestigious workers to the company. On the other hand, the external shareholders in the company disagree with this use of profits, and they opt for the disappearance of the provision for company provided social services. In fact, the financing difficulties and the disappearance of the state subsidies make it more difficult to justify the cost of maintaining the subsidies before the external shareholders of the company, who are receiving little in the form of dividends. For example, Uneximbank, the capitalist firm that bought 38% of Norilsk Nickel for $618 million in a controversial auction in 1997, wanted Norilsk
Nickel to free themselves from their social policy activities (The Economist, 1998). Definitively, depending on the correlation of powers in the Board of Management (whether there is a greater or lesser number of external shareholders) and the capacity for influence of the workers (whether they are older or younger) over the decisions made by the entity, the strategy to be followed by the company for the providing of social services tends to vary.

(3) Independent of whatever previous decision has been made, however, there is another variable which greatly influences the evolution of company provided social services immediately after privatization of a company. And this is, precisely, that size (Alm & Sjoquist, 1995), expressed as much in absolute terms (number of workers) as in relative terms (in function of the number of employees or the productive activity concentrated in a given region) determines the following typology in terms of the social policy:

a. The most common case refers to small and medium companies located in big cities, which have been progressively separated from the larger part of their infrastructures and social services transferring them to the local authorities, which are the administrations in charge of managing the social policy at present. Of all existing companies in the Russian Federation in 1995, 10% transferred the responsibility of the social expenditures to the municipality, and 30% of the rights of the existing infrastructures in the company in order to provide social services (Blasi, Kroumova & Kruse, 1997).

b. Companies, as a result of the privatization and the disappearance of the state subsidies (Blasi et al., 1997) had begun to increase cost recovery by raising user fees, generally by applying differential tariffs for non-employee access to services or by making company provided social services independent by commercialising them, either by marketing or renting the infrastructures to other companies and, in some cases, to the workers themselves employed in the company in the social policy. In fact, 5% of the companies transferred their social services to their workers in 1995 (Alm & Sjoquist, 1995).
On the contrary, the services which were not profitable, or that remained in the company, progressively deteriorated given the scarcity of funds available for their maintenance, or they were eliminated. Thus, 18% of all Russian companies eliminated any social expenditure during 1995 (Blasi et al., 1997).

c. Exceptionally, the most profitable companies, which were generally the largest ones, only ceased subsidizing company provided social services while they were having financial problems and, once they had recovered, they took these activities up again. This is the case, for instance, of the steel production company Ore (Kabalina, 1996).

d. Although less habitual, the justification or reasons given by medium or big companies were more problematic when they represented the whole of the greater part of the activity of a sole region. The city-companies which were created in the Soviet regions of difficult access because of bad weather conditions and national security matters, were the towns generally associated to the Atomic Energy Ministry (Lefèvre, 1993). These companies owned a network of infrastructures assigned to the social security benefit for their workers which were extendible to the population of the region concerned. These facilities were developed to such a degree that it was difficult for them to be transferred to the local authorities, given the fact that this would have surpassed the monetary resources or even the materials needed to be able to make them functional. In general, these companies continued with these services, although the maintenance of their quantity and quality depended on their financial situation. One outstanding example is Norilsky Nikel AO, the most important nickel manufacturer in the USSR, located in Norilsk (Krasnoyarsk oblast'). The financial difficulties of this company involved a reduction of the amount of social services in the year 1996, which represented 22% healthcare, 61% education, 18% culture and 2% sports as compared to the year 1992 (Aberkeeba, 1997).

(4) There is a different attitude towards two different groups of social assets: kindergartens, housing and dormitories are
considered to be a major burden by a relatively large group of companies, and the fate of these assets is now the most painful issue; however, sports facilities, cultural centers, hospitals and clinics are considered much easier (Freinkman & Starodrubrovskaya, 1996). There is a link between company profitability and the level of cost recovery in social assets financed by the companies; thus, the more difficult the financial situation of the company is, the greater the pressure for restructuring social assets. However, although the motivation for providing a wide scale of benefits in larger firms was in large part economic, it is important to appreciate the non-economic factors, which have deeper psychological and cultural roots, that are behind the phenomenon that explains the maintenance of the social policy in the companies, because they do not consider it appropriate to admit that they are going to leave their workers without at least some forms of social support from the company. Evidence from the World Bank business survey suggests that a significant proportion of the labor force continues to have entitlements to food subsidy, healthcare, child care, holiday resort, housing and transportation subsidy (Commander & Jackman, 1997), because of the fact that more than half the managers of responding firms continued to provide these social benefits. In addition, it was usual that most of the companies had maintained at least the system of distribution of goods and services with subsidised prices for their workers—which had become institutionalized in the years of economic shortage. Nowadays, the main suppliers of goods which are able to maintain these services are: (1) retail businesses and the great trade organizations that sell their products to the companies, with discounts over the market price which fluctuate between 10% and 30%, (2) the associates from the industries who use this activity to pay their debts to the companies, or have an agreement for exchange of goods at a favorable price, generally at a cost price, (3) farms which are subsidiary to the companies. Previously, these were used for the hiring of workers or to employ inactive ones in the companies. Nowadays, they constitute a good way of supplying food to the workers as an incentive or as a way of payment in kind, and they do not represent a too elevated
cost provided that they belong to the company and that they are producing (Lefèvre, 1993).

(5) Finally, we should point out that companies continue to provide workers with benefits in kind, and that these represent the majority within what can be referred to as social services. On the contrary, the volume of the monetary benefits, the traditional ones (which are subsidized in the prices of certain goods, scholarships, etc.), as well as the new type, which is to say, by means of the contribution to the extra-budgetary funds (adhesion of the company to the benefits of salaried workers, to private funds for pensions or medical insurance), depends on the company’s economic and financial situation, as well as to the degree of monetization used in the exchanges of the company—which is low if we take into consideration that exchanges for barter represented 50% of the GDP in 1996—(Aukutsionek, 1998).

Conclusions

Since 1991, the reforms aimed at the conversion of the Russian society into a market economy have radically changed the idea of social policy inherited from the USSR. In this way, institutional change has progressively come about, thus transforming the organizational structure of social policy as well as the financing mechanisms. The conception of social policy, no longer of a universal nature and based on the principals of solidarity, has become basically a welfare sort of policy. Progressively, the Russian Government has emphasized the need for incomes to derive exclusively from individual effort, thus limiting the importance of social policy as a complementary element to monetary income. Additionally, the economic transition, basically by means of privatization and liberalization of the economy, has brought about a reduction in the social securities and, therefore, a worsening in the living conditions of the Russian population.

Thus, independent of the greater or lesser degree of equity in the process of distribution of ownership, which was mostly state-owned in the past, the most immediate consequences of privatization for the Russian population are obvious. First of all, the reduction of the public assets does not guarantee the
spreading of the public services to the population. Secondly, the Russian companies have stopped being paternalistic institutions which looked after the interests of their workers, and they have progressively stopped supplying the previous social services they provided for. This has happened in such a way that the workers of these companies have witnessed the reduction of a part of their non-monetary compensation, as the services which previously covered the greater part of their daily activity, including their houses, which they would now have to buy, have ceased to exist. This situation has not been accompanied, in general terms, by the rise of their direct salary, expressed in monetary terms. Additionally, the privatization of the companies overrules the strategy of full employment, with the phenomenon of unemployment raising its head for the first time, with its consequent effects upon the standard of living.

On the other hand, the liberalization of prices and incomes has worsened the life conditions of the Russian population, as salaries have in real terms decreased, and the subsidies on prices have disappeared, a situation which affects to a great extent those people with lower incomes.

With regard to the process of decentralization in the social policy, promoted by the Federal Government by means of transfer to the local governments, this has come about gradually, and in some cases the companies continue to finance these services. In reality, financing of the social services still remains considerably centralized, but responsibility for allocation of these funds and their utilization is not strictly defined. The undefined division of power between various state managing bodies results in erosion of responsibility of the state as a whole for provision of public goods to the population. There are no funds for the adequate functioning of the available system of rendering social and cultural services to the population. With the funds that are available, this system is only degrading. But no one is assuming the responsibility to officially revise the conditions and the scale of rendering social and cultural services and goods to the population free of charge or on a preferential basis.

Among the reasons under which companies continue to provide social services we find, first of all, that the companies consider paternalism to be a measure of prosperity and prestige
for them, and not only just an expense. Secondly, up until the year 1995 it was beneficial for companies to keep on providing social services due to the taxation privileges they enjoyed. Finally, local governments do not often accept the transference of social assets because of budgetary problems, given that the responsibility in social policy has hardly been conferred to budgetary considerations.

Neither the process of privatization nor the decentralization of the social policy have managed to solve the problems of social policy. On the one hand, it is generally considered that the role of the companies in social policy matters will continue to be important during some time. Different factors explain that the maintenance of company provided social services is still important for the Russian companies. In the first place, these social services are being used by the companies to negotiate labor issues. In the second place, social policy can become a source of revenues if the price for the use of certain social infrastructures becomes stable. In third place, the goods and services offered by the companies can be used for exchange in trading operations or for any other operations that might be attractive to companies faced with growing financial problems or that are finding a minimum degree of monetization in the exchanges. In fourth place, some company managers consider social policy to be their own responsibility. Although the motivation for providing a broad scale of benefits in larger firms was based on economic considerations, it is important to appreciate the non-economic factors, which have deeper psychological and cultural roots behind the phenomenon. This would tend to explain why companies tend to keep on maintaining social services, because they do not consider it appropriate to admit that they are going to leave their workers without at least some forms of social support from the company. Lastly, the financial difficulties of those who have had to face the leaders of the local governments impedes divesture of the companies from these services that they wish to eliminate.

The problem of the transference of the social services is more complex than what the Russian authorities were able to predict. Furthermore, the budgetary uncertainty accompanying this transference of the social services is negative for the local governments and it lays the foundations of the regional inequality in the living conditions of the Russian population.
As we have confirmed throughout the previous pages, social policy of the Russian Federation is confronting a double set of problems. Firstly, its aim of reducing social protection arises in a context of progressive worsening of the standard of living of the Russian population. Furthermore, the main problem of Russian social policy has been the gap that exists between the broad range of obligations of the state towards the citizens, inherited from the Soviet past, and the real volume of the actual budgetary financing. It will be difficult to close this gap (given the problems of tax collection). The social policy will therefore face an even greater decline in the future. Secondly, the transfer of the responsibility in social matters to the Local Governments is produced in an environment of considerable vagueness. Both of these aspects are creating a great deal of uncertainty in social policy matters.

Different from what occurs in the market economies, the Russian challenge is tantamount to transferring social policy from the area of responsibility of the privately owned companies to the area of public responsibility. However, this nationalization of social policy is occurring with a scarce commitment on the side of the Russian public sector. Furthermore, participation of the private sector in social policy is not at all significant at the present time, either. It remains very much to be seen, over a mid term and long term period, whether the social cost that will be transferred to the local budgets or the population will be able to assume this expenditure, either by means of taxes or by paying the market price. In large part due to problems in collecting tax, it will be very difficult to close this gap.

References


Panorama Privatizatsiya (1995a), 1, p. 16.


Panorama Privatizatsiya (1996), 1, p. 11.

Panorama Privatizatsiya (1997), 1, p. 5.


Neighbor’s Knowledge and Reaction to Suspected Child Abuse in an Urban Setting

GARY PAQUIN
University of Cincinnati
School of Social Work

JOHN SCHAFER
University of Cincinnati
Department of Psychology

ADAM C. CARLE
Arizona State University
Department of Psychology

Neighbors are seen as an important source of child abuse prevention and reporting. This article reports the result of a random telephone survey of a large mid-western city (n = 513) which examined the extent to which respondents suspected their neighbors of physical child abuse. Data was also collected on how respondents learned of such physical abuse, what their response to it was, and whether they noticed a difference in the frequency of the abuse after they did or did not respond. In this urban environment, relatively few knew of their neighbors’ physical abuse, and those who did learned of the abuse by either seeing or hearing it occur. Most reported the abuse, many did nothing, but some intervened in the situation. Parents of minor children reacted differently than adults without children. The impact of neighbors’ reactions on the future physical abuse of the child was mixed. Neighbors responses to abuse when they witness or hear it might be helpful in reducing immediate child injuries, but their longer-term effects are unclear.

Background and Significance
Neighbors can be important resources for early intervention into child abuse (Gambrill & Paquin, 1992). Korbin and Coulton

Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare, March, 2001, Volume XXVIII, Number 1

105
have found that the residents they interviewed were more optimistic that neighbors, rather than the government, were likely to prevent child maltreatment. Further information about the nature of neighbors' knowledge and responses to child maltreatment need to be gathered before this resource can be effectively used in prevention efforts.

Some people have knowledge of their neighbor's child abuse. In a statewide survey of Kentucky, Paquin and Ford (1996) found that 9.4% of the respondents knew of child abuse by their neighbor in the last 3 years. This sample was predominantly rural and it is not known whether an urban population will have a similar level of knowledge of its neighbors' child abuse. Given the higher density of an urban population, it should have greater knowledge of its neighbor's child abuse than a rural one.

How do these individuals learn of their neighbors' child abuse? Does the abuse occur in front of them or do they learn about it after the fact? Paquin and Ford (1996) have found that having children in the home is associated with having knowledge of neighbors' child abuse. Are one's own children, or their peers, the route by which knowledge of the internal affairs of the family are made known in the community? If so, parents of minor children would clearly be the target of prevention involving increased reporting and increased supporting of neighbors.

What do people do with the knowledge of their neighbor's child abuse? Neighbors can report child abuse using formal social control systems such as the police or child protective services. Nationally, neighbors account for 10.4% of all child maltreatment reports (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 1995). A survey of Kentucky found that only 31% of those who had reason to suspect child abuse in the last 2 years (7% of the entire sample) reported it (Dhooper, Royse, & Wolfe, 1991). Qualitative research indicates that people are reluctant to report their neighbors due to fear of revenge and lack of anonymity (Korbin & Coulton, 1996), or simply due to uncertainty of abuse or respect for family privacy and parents' rights to discipline their children (Manning & Cheers, 1995).

Neighbors provide informal services and exercise informal social control mechanisms which could reduce the isolation and stress of abusive families. Neighbors often turn to each other
for help before seeking help from formal helpers (Warren, 1981). Neighbors have several informal options such as talking to the maltreating families in a supportive way, confronting the offending neighbor, volunteering to watch the neighbor’s child, or being vigilant in detecting abuse (Korbin & Coulton, 1996). Neighbors share advice and guidance and in this way convey neighborhood norms with regards to child care (Unger & Wandersman, 1985). They may also be responding to violations of those norms through a variety of informal methods of social control. Paquin and Ford (1996) found that 7.2% of their Kentucky sample had at some time taken in a neighbor’s abused child. However when neighbors do try to help abusive families, this help often caused friction (Ballew, 1985).

There is evidence that neighborhood sanctions are primarily enforced through further isolation of the abusive family. Families engaged in child abuse are described as being isolated from community support (Garbarino, 1976). The sanctions neighbors use are gossip, social exclusion and embarrassment (Skogan, 1990). Polansky and Gaudin (1983) found that in hypothetical situations respondents would distance themselves from families they believed were neglectful. This reaction further isolates the family and such isolation is suspected of being a contributing factor in family violence. Though we know that neighbors play a role in child abuse and neglect, we are only now beginning to understand the mechanisms of neighbor activity in prevention and intervention.

Methodology

The authors’ questions were asked as part of the Cincinnati Area Biennial Survey conducted by the University of Cincinnati’s Institute for Policy Research. A random-digit dialing method was used. A weighted sample produced a standard error of 5%. the refusal/non-response rate was 51%. Of the entire survey sample frame for the City of Cincinnati, 443 out of the 513 cases responded to the question, affirmatively or negatively, as to whether they were aware of their neighbors’ child abuse. Twelve (12) respondents did not know the answer to the question of abuse in the neighborhood and fifty eight (58) refused to answer it.

The following questions were asked as part of the survey:
You see your next door neighbor roughly turn his young boy over his knee and repeatedly spank him. Would you report this to the authorities?

There were then three other scenarios presented which describe a neighbor: 1) hitting a boy on the back with a looped belt, 2) pushing him to the ground with punches to the face and stomach, and 3) punching and kicking until the boy falls unconscious, bleeding. After each scenario, the respondents were asked whether they would report the incident to the authorities. Responses to these questions are included in this paper to examine the difference between those respondents who considered severe spanking a reportable activity from those who did not and to differentiate those individuals requiring more severe forms of violence before they would report.

These hypothetical questions preceded the following.

Let's continue on this topic. Please remember, I will not be asking for anyone's name and your answers are completely anonymous and confidential. I am not connected to a law enforcement or social service agency.

Think about your current neighborhood. In the past three years, have you ever had a strong reason to believe that any of your neighbors who live within a city block from you have physically abused a child?

Think about a child abuse incident involving a neighbor for which you became most concerned. Which of the following best describes how you first became aware of the incident?

1. They were inside their home and you heard them;
2. They were outside their home and you heard or saw them;
3. You were told by a child from the neighbor's household;
4. You were told by an adult for the neighbor's household;
5. You were told by another neighbor;
6. You heard about it through your child, who is 12 years old or younger;
7. You heard about it through your child who is over 12 years old; or
8. You saw the victimized child's appearance
What, if anything, did you do in response to this incident?

After the incident that you have in mind, did your neighbor’s behavior toward the child:

1. get more violent,
2. stay the same,
3. get less violent, or
4. the violence didn’t reoccur at all
5. Don’t know

If you are concerned about the safety of the child in question, you should probably report it to the County Social Services Department for investigation. In Hamilton County that would be 241-KIDS.

With regard to the question in which respondents are asked how they became aware of the incident, the responses were further content-coded into direct or indirect knowledge. If respondents had seen or heard the abuse from inside or outside the neighbor’s home, this was coded as having direct knowledge; if they were told about it, this was considered indirect knowledge.

The open-ended question asking what the respondent did in response to the incident were content-coded into formal or informal social control strategies. If respondents contacted the authorities, this was construed as using formal social control, if they directly intervened, spoke to the parents, or withdrew contact from the family, this was coded as using indirect social control.

Following coding, the data analysis was conducted using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) and COMPAREZ, an epidemiological analysis package developed by Dr. Mark Myatt and his colleagues. Assessing significance in crosstabulations of categorical data is usually done referencing a computed chi-square statistic to a theoretical chi-square probability distribution. However, it is possible to compute the exact probability value of any crosstabulation, even those that contain infrequent or empty cells; these exact methods are based on Fisher’s exact test for $2 \times 2$ tables developed by R.A. Fisher. Exact tests were used in this paper where $X^2$ is not indicated.

1. What percentage of adults in an urban area will have knowledge of their neighbor’s child abuse?
2. How do adults obtain knowledge of their neighbor's physical child abuse?
3. How do adults react to their neighbor's physical child abuse?
4. What changes do neighbors notice in the reoccurrence of physical child abuse after they exercise formal or informal social control?

Findings

What percentage of respondents in an urban area will have knowledge of their neighbor's child abuse?

Only 38 of the 513 (7.4%) respondents stated they had strong reasons to believe their neighbors had abused their children in the last 3 years. This percentage increases to just under 9% when only looking at those 443 cases where respondents clearly responded "yes" or "no" to the question. Despite prior studies, 8% of 275 respondents without children had this suspicion compared to 11% of 164 respondents with children, and this difference was not significant. Gender, race, and whether the respondent had a lower definition of abuse, were not significantly associated with whether a respondent had a strong suspicion as to a neighbor's child abuse.

Only whether a respondent was in poverty, as defined as a 3 or more person household with an income of $15,000 a year or less (the federal poverty guideline), had a significant relationship to knowledge of their neighbor’s child abuse, with nearly a third of those in this category (6 out of 19 respondents) suspecting such abuse ($X^2 = 11.7, df=1, p < .001$).

How do respondents obtain knowledge of their neighbors' physical child abuse?

Of the 34 respondents who described the way they became aware of their neighbor's physical child abuse, most learned through seeing or hearing the violence directly (See Table 1).

Of those respondents who had no minor children but who were aware of such abuse, 12 (71%) learned it from direct knowledge while of those with minor children 11 (73%) did so by direct knowledge. The respondents in poverty were as likely as the other income groups to learn of the abuse through direct means. Of
Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percent*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heard or saw abuse outside the neighbor's home</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heard it in the neighbor's home</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Were told of abuse by a child from the neighbor's household</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Were told of abuse by an adult from the neighbor's household</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Were told of abuse by another neighbor</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heard about it through their own child, who is 12 years or younger</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Percent based on denominator of 34 respondents who described the way they learned of neighbor's physical child abuse (4 respondents reported no method).

those with a lower definition of reportable abuse, 5 out of 12 (41%) saw or heard this abuse directly while 18 of 22 of those not considering severely spanking reportable, did so (82%). This relationship was statistically significant (p = .046). Men were no more likely to witness abuse than women.

How do respondents react to their neighbor's physical child abuse?

Of the 38 respondents who answered the question regarding how they reacted to their neighbor's physical abuse, the responses were varied with the bare majority reporting the family to the authorities (See Table 2.).

Though being a parent made respondents no more likely to know of neighbor's child abuse, it did impact on the way in which they reacted, when strategies are divided into formal, informal, and doing nothing (p = .028). Of those 19 respondents with no minor children, who reported a response to the suspected abuse, 9 (42%) contacted the authorities and 8 (42%) did nothing, while those with minor children 12 out of 18 (66%) contacted the
authorities and only one (5.5%) of those with children reported no action. Parents reacted to the abuse and rarely let it pass, more often intervening directly into the situation.

Broadly, there appears to be very little difference in respondents’ reactions if they learn of the abuse directly through sight or sound or indirectly through word of mouth. (See Table 3). However, of the 15 respondents who witnessed the abuse, 9 (60%) contacted the authorities, 3 (20%) intervened or spoke to the neighbor and 3 (43%) did nothing. Of the 7 who heard the abuse inside the home, 3 (43%) called the authorities, 1 (14%) intervened and 3 (43%) did nothing. As the knowledge of the abuse was less direct, the protection strategies decreased unless the child victim complained of the abuse, in which case, 3 (75%) called the authorities, 1 (25%) intervened, no one stated that they did nothing.

Those who believed harsh spanking to be a reportable event did not differ from those who didn’t, in how they received their knowledge of neighbor’s physical child abuse and how they reacted to it. Only 1 (25%) member of this subgroup, who believed severe spanking reportable, used formal mechanisms of social control, whereas 3 (75%) used such mechanisms based on indirect
Suspected Child Abuse

Table 3

Reactions to Abuse Based Upon Method of Learning of It

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How Knowledge of Abuse was Obtained</th>
<th>Used Formal Methods of Social Control</th>
<th>Used Informal Methods of Social Control</th>
<th>Did Nothing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Percent*</td>
<td>Count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>direct knowledge</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>indirect knowledge</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Percent based on denominator of 23 for those respondents with direct knowledge and 8 for those respondents with indirect knowledge.

knowledge, but this was not a statistically significant difference. Those who did not believe harsh spanking to be reportable were more likely to use formal means for dealing with the situation 10 (91%) formal methods based on direct knowledge versus one (9%) using such methods based on indirect knowledge (p < .001). The low income group were as likely as the other income groups to contact the authorities as result. Six out of ten respondents (60%) who knew of their neighbor’s child abuse and who had incomes below $15,000 a year, contacted the authorities compared to 9 out of 19 (47%) of all higher income groups.

The respondents’ specific reactions to their neighbors’ physical child abuse were captured in an open-ended question and some of the responses were telling of the concern neighbors had for children they believed to be abused. Respondents were creative in their use of strategies to protect their neighbor’s children. One respondent who knew the abuser very well, stated: “I used the key to their home that I had and removed the child out of the back door while another neighbor was distracting the parent.” Another neighbor with fewer ties to the suspected abuser stated: “I visited the home and introduced myself and offered to take the child to church with me, in order to see if the abuse was true.” Or “I called 911 (emergency services telephone number) and no one came so I set up a neighborhood child abuse watch program.”
What changes do neighbors notice in the reoccurrence of physical child abuse after they exercise formal or informal social control?

Given the many factors that impact on child abuse, it is not possible to assess the "effectiveness" of neighbors reactions to child abuse without extensive qualitative data. The perception of whether the neighbor's behavior was in any way changed after someone had reacted or not reacted to an abuse incident would however go to the perception that a respondent's reaction did or didn't have an impact. The neighbor's physical child abuse after a reaction was variable. Ten (10) of the respondents who used formal or informal means in reaction to their neighbor's child abuse believed that despite doing something, the violence stayed the same or got worse (See Table 4).

Respondents in poverty seemed to have greater knowledge of their neighbors' abuse, replicating the results of a prior study (Paquin & Ford, 1996). The perceived effectiveness of these respondents reactions to the abuse were identical to other income levels, with 4 out of 9 (44%) of low income respondents stating the level of violence stayed the same or got worse after their reaction, versus 5 out of 11 (45%) of those with higher incomes. It appears that regardless of whether these respondents used formal

Table 4
Status of Continued Abuse after Respondents' Reactions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods of Social Control Used</th>
<th>Things Got Better or Stopped</th>
<th>Things Stayed the Same or Got Worse</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Percent*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Nothing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Percent based on denominator of 15 for those respondents who used formal means, 5 for those respondents with indirect knowledge and 6 for those respondents who did nothing. Respondents who did not know whether or not there was a reoccurrence of the abuse were excluded (n = 6).
Suspected Child Abuse

or informal social control methods to protect children, they only detected an improvement half of the time.

Discussion

Only 7.4% of the Cincinnati sample admitted strong suspicion of their neighbor's recent physical child abuse, resulting in only 38 cases where reaction to neighbor's child abuse could be explored. Though less than the 9.4% who similarly had such a suspicion in a prior study of a Kentucky sample (Paquin & Ford, 1996), this difference was not significant. The lack of difference was surprising given the greater population concentration in the urban Cincinnati sample versus the more rural Kentucky sample, and therefore the greater opportunity to be exposed to neighbor's physical child abuse. One explanation is that the methods by which respondents learned of their neighbor's child abuse were discovered might have been different between urban and rural populations. In the Kentucky study, being a parent was significantly related to such suspicion, while no such relationship existed in the current sample. The respondents in this study tended to learn about child abuse through directly seeing or hearing the abuse occurring perhaps due to urban crowding. Also the prior presenting of several hypotheticals, in the survey questionnaire, in which the person sees the neighbor abusing the child, may have biased responses, in that respondents may have reported only those incidents which they actually saw, thereby reducing the number reported. If a respondent did not state that they had a strong suspicion of their neighbor's abuse, then the other abuse-related questions were not asked of them. Incidents in which the abuse was seen occurring by the respondents made up half of the events reported.

Those who were poor are more likely to have a strong suspicion of their neighbor's child abuse. Greater levels of child abuse associated with the stresses of poverty have been a consistent finding in physical child abuse studies (Korbin, et al., 1998) and if those respondents who are poor are more likely to be living near others who are poor, then this finding is confirmed.

Any findings from this study, which indicate how neighbors discover abuse, what they do about it, and how effective they are in reducing it, are merely suggestive given the very small
sample size. There were only 38 respondents who suspected their neighbors of abuse who could have responded to each of those questions.

Few respondents learned about their neighbor’s child abuse from children. Therefore, having a child, in this sample, was not the route by which knowledge was more likely to come. Learning about abuse was more likely to take place first hand. Those with a lower threshold in defining abuse were more likely to consider abuse from indirect knowledge, than those who saw abuse requiring beating with a belt or more severe forms of violence. Perhaps those with a lower threshold were more outraged by stories of abuse and were therefore likely to respond on that basis.

When it came to how people reacted to such abuse, most contacted the authorities and parents took a more active stance against child abuse, than non-parents. Neighbors used formal social control mechanisms more frequently than informal, through this finding may also be biased due to the structure of the question. Presumably, neighbors would use informal methods of intervening before more formal methods and the question encouraged them to provide only the most extreme action taken and then only of one family. Those who see abuse are more likely to react. Based on prior research, neighbors are reluctant to intrude on the domain of the family, and usually need strong evidence of abuse before they will do so. Witnessing beatings or hearing screams puts an immediate pressure on the neighbor to react. Those who did not see harsh spanking as reportable were more likely to use formal means for dealing with the situation than those who did. This reaction may well be because the neighbors who did not see harsh spanking as reportable, were responding to more severe kinds of abuse than spanking and were concerned enough to contact the authorities as a result. Unfortunately this study did not collect data on the severity of the event in question.

Dealing with abuse was a frustrating situation for neighbors. It appears that whether these respondents used formal or informal social control methods to protect children, they only detected an improvement in about 50% of the situations. If they did nothing, the situation seemed to improve most of the time, but it might be assumed that where neighbors did nothing, the abuse was not as severe as the situations in which they did react. If this were
not true, there would be little incentive for neighbors to become involved in trying to prevent the child abuse in their immediate neighborhood. A possible solution is represented by the reaction of one person: when no one responded to his/her complaint, he/she formed a child abuse watch program. An organized neighborhood response to child abuse could help neighbors not feel alone in their concern, pressure action from authorities where a dangerous situation is perceived and open up the possibility of neighbors supporting families in crisis by providing positive, not just negative attention.

This study was conducted in one midwestern city and its applicability to other settings must be made with caution. There is a need for continued research in this area using more extensive questionnaires with a larger sample in order to obtain a larger number of those individuals who strongly suspect their neighbors of child abuse so that more powerful statistical analyses could be used. In additional, qualitative studies, as presented by Korbin and Coulton (1996), which track the neighbor’s reactions to a variety of neighborhood child abuse incidences over time, as well as the sequence of coping strategies used in response to each incident (Paquin, 1992). Understanding how neighbors’ perceive these patterns of child abuse incidents and the institutional responses to them, could provide valuable information in developing new community-based interventions in child abuse prevention. If neighbors contact the authorities and nothing appears to happen from their perspective, have they “done their duty” and simply withdraw from the problems or will they continue to stay engaged?

References


Despite an extensive body of sociological work suggesting that residential mobility reduces child well-being, the subject of relocation has been largely overlooked in social work and social welfare literature. Recent social policies threaten to increase the incidence of moving among low-income families in the United States. This paper reviews theoretical and empirical literature in this area and finds evidence that residential mobility reduces children’s academic functioning, and may negatively affect other aspects of child well-being. These effects are especially strong for poor children from single parent families, making this issue of particular relevance for social work. The authors suggest implications for future research, propose policies to increase residential stability, and provide directions for social work practice with mobile children.

Introduction

The United States has been described as a nation of movers, with 15–20% of its population relocating each year (United States Department of Commerce, 1998). The vast majority of these citizens—renters in households earning less than $25,000 per year—are economically disadvantaged both by tenure status and by income (US Department of Commerce, 1998). Social scientific inquiry demonstrates that moving can be a difficult transition for household members due to the loss of familiar spatial environments, social relationships, and social institutions (Pribesh &
Downey, 1999). For children, these moves can be especially problematic. The issue of residential mobility is overlooked in a growing body of social work literature that examines the factors that increase and reduce risk among children (Smith & Carlson, 1997). This paper critically evaluates the literature regarding residential mobility and children, and considers the complexity of issues confronting researchers and policy makers concerned about this issue.

While the US has long been a highly mobile society, recent social policies are exacerbating this trend for low-income families. The passage of the Personal Responsibility Act is predicted to have deleterious effects on the housing budgets of former welfare recipients, and initial research indicates that relocations and evictions are occurring with disturbing frequency among this population (Nichols & Gault, 1999). Housing advocates predict that the HOPE VI Act, which is intended to rebuild distressed public housing, will fail to replace all of the units it demolishes. This will likely result in an overall loss of low-income units, and will certainly require the relocation of at least some low-income tenants (Leavitt, 1998). Further, the current trend of owners opting out of Section 8 contract renewals is reducing the stock of low-income residences, and threatens to result in displacement for many low-income residents (US Department of Housing and Urban Development, 1999). These policies should gravely concern housing advocates and social workers that serve low-income populations.

Household moves are not, of course, inherently problematic. The degree of difficulty in adjustment to a move is dependent on the presence or absence of many factors. For example, the desirability of a move, the reasons for relocating, and the cohesion and support among household members are all part of the context which influence the effects of a move (Coleman, 1988; Hagan, MacMillan & Wheaton, 1996). Moreover, it is arguable that blocked mobility, or the inability to move to take advantage of a better job, house, or school, can be even more stressful than relocation. Indeed, the assumption that it is desirable to move away from poverty conditions is the basis for programs which move low-income families from distressed urban neighborhoods to the suburbs (Rosenbaum, Fishman, Brett & Meaden, 1993). In
Residential Mobility

short, the complexity of factors that motivate relocation complicates the study of residential mobility effects.

Despite the fact that residential mobility may be necessary for upward mobility, it is also true that many relocation decisions are made as an adaptation to inadequate housing conditions, economic displacement, divorce, or other negative circumstances. This is especially the case for low-income and minority populations, who are overrepresented among the population of frequent movers (Newman & Owen, 1982). For example, research conducted in Chicago indicates that 75% of highly mobile students (defined as 4 or more moves over a two year period) were African-American, 78% were eligible for subsidized school lunch, and only 22% lived in two-parent households (Kerbow, 1996). Moreover, moving is a different experience for each member of a household. Although one household member may perceive a move as beneficial, other household residents may find the move distressing. Children and adolescents, the subject of this paper, face unique problems during relocation, such as the loss of a familiar school and friendships. Children are unlikely to initiate moves, and have little input into the conditions of relocation.

Awareness of this issue is growing. A conference devoted to the topic was convened in June 2000 by the Poverty and Race Research Action Council. National policy scholars in the fields of education, housing, and child welfare expressed similar concerns that frequent household moves negatively affect the school performance of children, and discussion of this issue has begun to appear in the news media (Rothstein, 2000). The purpose of this paper is to understand and conceptualize relocation and its effects on youth, and to clarify its implications for theory, research, and social policy formulation.

While numerous sociological and educational studies examine the relationship between residential mobility and youth well-being, a comprehensive, critical review of the theoretical and empirical literature has not appeared in the social welfare literature. This paper begins with a review of theoretical and empirical literature concerning the effects of residential mobility on the well-being of children and adolescents. After drawing conclusions from the empirical literature, an evaluation of the theoretical and methodological issues facing mobility research
is undertaken, and the difficult decisions that confront policy makers are outlined. Finally, we present directions for social work practice.

The Effects of Residential Mobility: Theoretical Literature

Several theoretical models attempt to provide a framework for understanding the psychological and social impacts of household moves. We review five sets of theories: 1) stress and coping theory, 2) mobility experience theory, 3) social capital theory, 4) classroom turnover theory and 5) the moving to opportunity perspective. We describe each theory briefly. After our discussion of the empirical literature we comment on the extent to which empirical studies support these theoretical models, and consider the methodological issues facing researchers.

Stress and coping theory. The earliest residential mobility studies began with theoretical assumptions drawn from the stress and coping literature (Stokols & Shumaker, 1982). In this theory, moves are assumed to be inherently stressful events that tax the coping capacities of individuals. These events, if intense or prolonged, in turn permanently disrupt the psycho-social functioning of individuals. When early empirical work began to demonstrate that many moves are not harmful to coping, and that harm either may not occur or may diminish with time, residential mobility scholars began to think about the contexts of relocation and its effects. While the assumptions of stress and coping theory still underlie much mobility research, it has been modified in response to contrary empirical findings.

Mobility experience theory. Mobility experience theory proposes that the effects of residential mobility on social and psychological well-being can be understood only within a contextual framework of motivations, conditions, and temporality (Hagan, MacMillan & Wheaton 1996). Mobility is not simply an event with specific outcomes, but a set of social and psychological experiences that together result in successful or unsuccessful adjustment to a new environment. These theorists argue that residential mobility effects are moderated by four factors: a) the history of previous migrations, b) the amount of time devoted to the move, c) motivations for the move, and d) distance of the move.
The history of previous migration is hypothesized to have a positive impact on post-move adjustment. Post-move adjustment is thought to be easier for those with previous moving experiences. The previous moves are seen as providing a type of "inoculation" against the stressors of moving. The amount of time devoted to the move is also hypothesized to be positively related to successful post-move adjustment. Those who have a greater amount of time to plan the move, find adequate housing, and adjust to the idea of relocation are hypothesized to adjust more easily to a new residence. Motivations for the move are thought to impact the sense of control and expectancy of the mover, thus moderating the impact of moving on well-being. A move precipitated by factors perceived as negative (eviction, financial reasons, an unwanted job transfer) will make adjustment more difficult, while a move precipitated by factors perceived as positive (moving for a better job or to reside in better housing) will make post move adjustment easier. Finally, distance of the move is thought to be inversely related to adjustment. Longer moves are hypothesized to create a greater sense of displacement and to require a longer period of adjustment.

Social capital theory. Mobility experience theory improves upon stress and coping theory by elaborating the factors that buffer or moderate the experience of moving, but it does not offer insights into the theoretical factors that reduce children's learning and emotional functioning. One approach that does attempt to understand such causal mechanisms is social capital theory (Coleman, 1988). Social capital refers to the "...social relationships, ties, and networks established among people within the context of wider social systems" (Midgley & Livermore, 1998). Links between parents, key individuals, and social institutions within communities are all sources of support for individuals, particularly children. Coleman (1988) suggests that social capital enhances human development, cognitive capacities, and social functioning. He hypothesizes that residential mobility will disrupt an individual's social capital networks, with resulting impairment in social functioning. Social capital is thought to exist within and between families. He suggests that when families move, they tax their internal relationships, disrupting "intra-family" social capital. What is more, moving disrupts
relationships with other families, teachers, administrators, and neighbors, lessening "inter-family" social capital. Thus, it is social relationships and their disruption that are responsible for post-move reductions in child well-being.

**Classroom turnover theory.** Other scholars theorize that classroom based processes explain the impacts of residential mobility on children's learning and emotional functioning (Entwisle, Alexander & Olson, 1997). Kerbow (1996) argues that mobility disrupts the continuity of students' learning processes. Students enter new schools "out of sync" with subject matter, and are not as academically prepared as the rest of their cohort. While a single move may not be problematic, difficulties may accumulate over time for the most highly mobile students. Schools may not have adequate information about new students, which can lead to inappropriate academic placements and a failure to connect them to adequate support services. Moreover, Kerbow posits that residential mobility can affect entire classrooms, creating an unstable milieu. The lack of knowledge about student preparation leads teachers to assume that they need to review previously covered material. This repetition is thought to slow down the process of knowledge acquisition, reducing the overall quality of educational instruction.

**"Moving to opportunity" perspective.** Finally, an alternative perspective is offered by what we might call the "residential mobility as upward mobility" hypothesis. This view suggests that for poor children trapped in distressed, high poverty urban environments, moving might enhance academic performance. This idea underlies the growing number of "moving to opportunity" programs which relocate inner city public housing residents to suburban homes. Proponents of those programs argue that the negative effects of residential instability are outweighed by the positive benefits of escaping poor schools and concentrated poverty (Goering, Kraft, Feins, McInnis, Holin, & Elhassan, 1999). While they acknowledge that students may at first have adjustment problems, they propose that the benefits of more academically gifted peers, better schools, and fewer neighborhood problems eventually result in improved outcomes for relocated youth (Pettit, McLanahan & Hanratty, 1999; Rosenbaum & Popkin, 1991).
The Effects of Residential Mobility on Youth: Empirical Literature

Empirical studies that examine the effects of residential mobility on children focus on post-move educational, psychosocial, and behavioral outcomes. We review findings for empirical outcomes in five related areas: academic performance, grade retention, high school completion, social adjustment, and behavioral or psychological problems. The literature regarding each outcome is examined, and we attempt to assess whether the studies provide support for any of the theories outlined above.

**Academic performance.** A rather extensive body of research finds a significant relationship between residential mobility and decreased academic performance (Frazier, 1970; Sandlin, 1989; Temple & Reynolds, 1995; Tucker, Marx & Long, 1998). Negative effects of mobility are demonstrated for student test scores (Audette, Algozzine & Warden, 1993; Eckenrode, Rowe, Laird & Braitwaite, 1995; Ingersoll, Scamman & Eckerling, 1989; Reynolds & Wolfe, 1999; Shuler, 1990), student grade point average (Eckenrode, Rowe, Laird, & Braitwaite, 1995; Simmons, Burgeson, Carlton-Ford & Blyth, 1987), and use of special education services (Gottlieb & Weinberg, 1999). Multiple school changes also appear to reduce academic performance (Benson, Haycroft, Steyaert & Weigel, 1979; Benson & Weigel, 1980; Tucker, Marx & Long, 1998), and highly mobile students are especially likely to experience reduced academic performance (Felner, Primavera & Cauce, 1980). It is not clear how much of the variance in the academic performance of movers can be attributed to residential as opposed to school change, although Pribesh & Downey (1999) suggest that their effects are equivalent.

Some studies contradict these findings, or suggest that the effects are significant but fairly weak (Alexander, Entwisle & Dauber, 1996; Blane, Pilling & Fogelman, 1985; Goebel, 1978; Heywood, Thomas & White, 1997; Marchant & Medway, 1987; Walls 1995). These scholars suggest that residential mobility studies fail to consider pre-existing differences between movers and non-movers, to differentiate short and long term effects of moving, and to control for significant moderating variables. Blane et al. (1985)
find that the overall effect of mobility on math and reading scores is marginal and likely reflects pre-existing differences between mobile and stable children. Goebel (1978) finds that high rates of mobility in the preschool years of the adolescents in her study do not adversely influence their later academic performance. She reasons that "... it is also possible that moving represents an enrichment of the environment which may, over a period of time, facilitate educational development even though, on a short term basis, there may be both facilitating and debilitating aspects of adjustment to moving, which cancel each other out." (Goebel 1978, p. 14).

Other factors moderate the effects of moves on academic performance. Children at earlier grade levels reportedly experience the most negative and lasting effects of residential mobility (Ingersoll, Scamman & Eckerling, 1989), and such effects are greater for Black and Hispanic students (Felner, Primavera & Cauce, 1981). Residential mobility also is found to have greater negative impacts on the academic performance of boys than girls (Goebels, 1978).

Grade retention. Studies examining residential mobility and educational outcomes consistently find higher levels of grade retention among highly mobile youngsters. This outcome is of importance because of its inverse correlation with high school completion. This finding appears to be especially true for "hyper-mobile" children who move three or more times. Two different analyses of the 1988 National Health Interview Survey of Child Health (NHIS) conclude that children who move three or more times are more likely to repeat a grade than are more residentially stable children (Simpson & Fowler, 1994; Wood, Halfon, Scarlata, Newacheck & Nessim, 1993).

In addition to hypermobility, researchers find that other variables moderate these effects. Tucker, Marx, and Long (1998) identify a statistical interaction between mobility and family structure, finding moderate levels of mobility (less than 8 moves) to have no measurable effects on school performance if children live with both of their biological parents. Further, they surmise that "residential stability may actually buffer the harmful effects of family transitions on school performance . . ." (Tucker et al., 1998, p. 123).
Straits (1987) finds that residential mobility does impede progress in school, but only for children of low SES families.

Other notes of caution are raised in the literature. Wood et al (1993) find that the risk of grade retention increases as risk factors such as poverty, racial minority status, and low parental education accumulate, noting that these factors are often correlated with high levels of residential mobility. Alexander, Entwisle, and Dauber (1996) find that mobile children are more likely to be retained, but when background characteristics and first grade measures of school performance are introduced, effect sizes diminish.

High school completion. High school completion rates of mobile students are also of interest to researchers. Coleman's (1988) study of the dropout rates in 893 public, Catholic, and other private high schools finds that mobile children have nearly double the dropout rates of their stable counterparts. Other studies confirm the finding of an increased risk for dropout among highly mobile children (Astone & McLanahan, 1994; Hagan, MacMillan & Wheaton, 1996; Haveman, Wolfe & Spaulding, 1991). However, these studies note the role of familial factors (e.g. family structure and size, parental availability and support, etc.) in moderating the effects of high rates of mobility. Children from dual parent families and families where parents have greater interpersonal resources are less likely to experience residential mobility as a precursor to dropout. Astone and McLanahan (1994) note that residential mobility explains a large portion of the variance in the educational disadvantage associated with living in a single parent family. However, Rosenbaum, Fishman, Brett, and Meaden (1993) report that participants in the famous Gatreaux housing relocation program who move to suburban homes are more likely to complete high school and attend college.

Social and interpersonal functioning. A small number of residential mobility studies examine difficulties in social functioning associated with moving. Vernberg's (1990) study of middle to upper-middle class students finds recency of move in early adolescence to be predictive of negative outcomes on several dimensions of social adjustment and functioning. These include increased social distress, difficulty making friends, and less overall social contact. Simpson and Fowler (1994) note difficulties in the
social adjustment of highly mobile youth, including increased incidence of peer conflict, greater likelihood of school suspension or expulsion, and anti-social behavior. Pettit, McLanahan, and Hanratty (1999) find that African-American children who relocate to middle class neighborhoods as part of the Moving to Opportunity Program are less likely than control group participants to be involved in after school activities.

Males in these studies appear to encounter more social rejection and other post move difficulties than females. This pattern of gender difference in post move adjustment is consistent with previous literature focused on post-move coping behaviors (Donohue and Gullotta, 1983; Lehr & Hendrickson, 1968). Brett (1982), however, finds female adolescents and younger children to fare worse than adolescent males in her study of families that relocate due to job transfers.

**Psychological functioning and behavior problems.** Inquiry into the relationship between psychological and behavior problems and moving has also been undertaken (Mundy, Robertson, Greenblatt & Robertson, 1989; Simpson & Fowler, 1994; Stacks, 1994; Tooley, 1970; Wood et al, 1993). Extensively mobile children are more likely to be psychiatrically hospitalized (Mundy et al, 1989), more likely to initiate drug and alcohol use (Catalano, Hawkins, White and Pandina, 1985), and more likely engage in premarital sexual behavior (Stacks, 1994).

Increased rates of depression (Hendershott, 1989; Brown & Orthner, 1990; Simpson & Fowler, 1994) and higher rates of suicidal behavior (Beautrais, Joyce & Mulder, 1996) are correlated with high mobility among youth. Hendershott (1989) identifies both recentness and frequency of moves as salient factors in predicting impairments in self-concept and esteem. Kroger’s (1980) frequently cited work provides evidence that mobility and distance of move are predictive of self-concept.

However, other scholars disagree that residential mobility is significantly related to psychological or behavioral difficulty. For example, Buerkle (1997) finds few statistically significant differences in the social functioning of mobile youth. Other studies have also disputed the relationship between mobility and behavioral problems (Barrett & Noble, 1973; Brett, 1982; Marchant & Medway, 1987). These authors argue that residential mobility
Residential Mobility

scholars fail to control for differences in samples of movers and non-movers, such as pre-morbid functioning, SES, and family structure.

**Discussion.** What conclusions can be drawn from this review of empirical literature? On balance, the reviewed studies provide strong evidence that residential mobility negatively affects academic well-being. Residential mobility reduces academic performance, increases the likelihood of grade retention, and reduces high school completion rates. These effects worsen with cumulative moves, with “hyper-mobile” students having the greatest academic impairment. A subset of our reviewed studies suggest that SES, family structure, and pre-move academic functioning moderate, but do not eliminate the effects of residential mobility on academic functioning. While it is true that these studies demonstrate that relocation is not always problematic, the correlation between high rates of mobility and other risk factors such as poverty, life cycle changes, and single-parent family structure suggest a troubling profile of cumulative academic risk. We conclude that the effects of residential mobility are enhanced for at risk families, making this topic even more salient for social work, which is concerned about the well-being of exactly these populations. Since academic performance is a predictor of later life chances, these studies raise the possibility that residential mobility may be an overlooked factor in the replication of social inequality in the US (Astone & McLanahan, 1994).

The effects of residential mobility on other outcomes are far less clear. Relocation may have at least short-term effects on the social adjustment of children, with boys more likely than girls to experience social adjustment difficulties in response to residential mobility. It also appears that these effects are worsened by number of moves. The literature on residential mobility and behavior problems is both too sparse and too dated to draw clear conclusions. Similarly, the literature on psychological functioning is both too limited and too reliant on correlational statistics to draw clear conclusions. The few studies that do exist suggest that psychological problems resulting from relocation lessen with time and are related both to recency and distance of moves. At present, the current literature on non-academic outcomes is sufficient merely to warrant calls for further research in this area.
It is difficult to draw conclusions about theoretical mechanisms that account for these effects. Empirical studies in this area are mostly designed to determine whether the effects of residential mobility hold when controlling for a variety of family and demographic characteristics. While these factors indeed may moderate the relationship between moves and well-being outcomes, they do not explain causal processes. Still unanswered are claims made by social capital and educational process theorists. Does moving disrupt social capital, making it difficult for mobile students to achieve academically? Or, does relocation alter the classroom teaching milieu? Kerbow's (1996) work has suggested that the effects of classroom turnover reduce aggregate school functioning, while other studies provide some evidence that the disruption of social capital and peer relationships reduces academic functioning (Coleman, 1988; Pribesh & Downey, 1999). Still, more work will have to be completed before we can draw clear conclusions about causal mechanisms.

The findings from research on moving to opportunity programs require a final note. This literature is very new, and the effects of moving on child academic well-being and behavior are mixed (Pettit, McLanahan & Hanratty, 1999; Rosenbaum & Popkin, 1991). Despite advocates' claims, it is unclear that such programs have the capacity to improve the well-being of significant numbers of youth, and families often express serious reservations about being relocated away from their communities of choice (Turner, Popkin & Cunningham, 1999). It seems unlikely that moving families to non-poor neighborhoods can be a centerpiece of housing policy given the sheer number of families currently residing in distressed areas, and the likelihood that suburban neighborhoods will respond with some political backlash. What is more, it is difficult to generalize from the experiences of these program participants given that most school moves are not moves of upward mobility, but rather to schools of similar quality and with student populations of comparable SES (Kerbow, 2000).

Implications for Research, Policy, and Practice

Research Needs. The extensive body of work in this area suggests that residential mobility is a significant and overlooked
Residential Mobility

factor in the transmission of well-being in the United States. However, our review of this literature also reveals several major gaps in this work. Further work on relocation should focus on the following: 1) clarification of mobility’s effects on behavior, adjustment and psychological functioning, 2) exploration of the theoretical frameworks explaining residential mobility outcomes, and 3) beginning investigation of programs and policies that can reduce the negative effects of residential mobility.

First, research should focus on increasing our clarity about post-move functioning. Scholars should attempt to clarify which categories of students are at risk, under what sorts of circumstances, and for what set of outcomes. Recent studies indicate that as many as 25% of school moves are actually requested by adolescents. This suggests that we should attempt to distinguish which moves are harmful and which are non-harmful or beneficial (Kerbow, 1996). Policy scholars may wish to study clients of social programs with high levels of mobility, including participants in “moving to opportunity programs”, children in the child welfare system, and children disrupted by federal housing policy. In order to disentangle the effects of confounding factors such as pre-move academic and psycho-social functioning, it will be important to develop research designs that provide a baseline of student functioning and that control for unobserved family characteristics. It will also be essential to utilize longitudinal research designs, because the effects of moving appear to be cumulative. Scholars interested in child risk and protective factors should incorporate residential mobility variables in their survey instruments, and remember to include this literature in theory building. Residential mobility seems to be a promising concept for social work’s “person in environment” perspective which attempts to link macro and micro level processes.

Second, we should elaborate our theories of how residential mobility effects operate. Including measures of classroom stability, student adjustment, peer relationships, social capital, and family cohesion would allow researchers to test those variables as mediators of residential mobility effects. At present, residential mobility operates in a “black box”, and we do not fully understand the pathways to different psycho-social outcomes. It may be, for example, that curricular instability is responsible for
poor academic outcomes, while disrupted peer relationships may account for child behavior problems. Also, because it is unclear whether the effects of mobility are due to changes in residence or school changes, future research should include both variables.

Third, research should focus on understanding the factors that might lessen the negative impacts of relocation. This suggests both identifying "protective" factors, and examining the functioning of school adjustment programs. Many schools do in fact have programs and policies in place designed to ameliorate post-move maladjustment (DiCecco, Rosenblum, Taylor & Adelman, 1995). Peer programs, orientation workshops, and welcoming programs have all been implemented, but rigorous examination of those programs has not been undertaken. Research should be conducted on the efficacy of these programs so that they might be replicated on a larger scale.

**Policy directions.** At present, federal social policy appears to be intentionally and unintentionally displacing low-income citizens. Welfare reform is destabilizing the housing conditions of former welfare recipients, causing many to relocate in search of more affordable housing (Nichols & Gault, 1999). The HOPE VI program will likely displace some low-income residents as new projects that create mixed-income housing communities are developed (Leavitt, 1998). While this is intended to reduce the problem of concentrated poverty in housing projects, it is likely to result in the displacement of some low-income residents. Section 8 housing vouchers and "moving to opportunity" programs emphasize moving the poor closer to labor markets and better schools rather than developing opportunities within communities already inhabited by poor residents (Turner, Popkin & Cunningham, 1999).

This literature review provides a strong rationale for supporting the implementation of place based development policies in order to reduce the mobility of low-income families. First, at the federal level, funding for HUD's public housing and Section 8 project based programs should return to pre-1984 levels. HUD has taken disproportionate hits in budget cuts since that time, and its programs have suffered a great deal (Stanfield, 1985; Morgan, 1995). Funding housing preservation legislation would help to revitalize public housing units and maintain the current project
Residential Mobility

based Section 8 housing stock. Second, federal policy should be considered that would require that the HOPE VI program rebuild as many units as it demolishes, sanctioning local housing authorities who fail to reach an 100% replacement rate. Third, new programs that allow greater stabilization of families should be funded. For example, homeownership programs targeted to low-income families could help to reduce mobility among such families, provide them with financial equity, and help to stabilize transitional neighborhoods (Johnson & Sherraden, 1992; Scanlon, 1998). Alternately, rent control legislation could stabilize poor families by protecting them from abrupt rent increases (Downs, 1988). Finally, local housing policies could focus on the development of aggressive programs to prevent evictions. Such programs have been developed in a variety of US cities, and typically provide outreach, counseling, and emergency financial assistance to residents on the verge of eviction (Schwartz, Derance-Manzini & Fagan, 1991).

Practice implications. Social workers in direct practice with families and youth should consider relocation and high mobility to be risk factors for evaluation and possible intervention. School social workers should make efforts to establish relationships with new students, and help them in the tasks of adjustment and integration into new school and community relationships. This is of particular importance for those students with a history of multiple moves and school changes. Such an intervention has been established at the Los Angeles Unified School District’s Early Assistance for Students and Families Program. This program seeks to welcome new students and their families through a series of social work interventions and tasks. Workers attempt to welcome new students in several ways: by using an initial greeting table at the start of the school year, by extending welcomes through members of student clubs, by establishing formal “welcomers” in each class, and through making formalized connections to parents of new children (DiCecco et al, 1995).

School social workers can also assist at-risk, recently relocated children by identifying whether special services are needed or were utilized in the recent past. Many students have relocated so frequently that school districts have never completed Individual Education Plans for children with serious learning
or behavioral problems. Frequent relocation means that many children fall through the cracks and do not receive the appropriate screening and diagnosis needed to start special services. School social workers should attempt to learn about such history as quickly as possible, and should facilitate the request of previous school records. They should also advocate for rapid completion of testing and evaluation for these students.

Conclusions

This paper has examined theories and empirical data regarding the impact of residential mobility on the well-being of children and adolescents. The evidence suggests that relocation is a structural factor that reduces academic functioning and may negatively influence psycho-social functioning. Recent social policy initiatives are destabilizing housing for low-income populations and social workers should turn their attention to assisting these populations through public policy advocacy and direct practice. In particular, the profession should advocate for programs that have the capacity to develop distressed neighborhoods, and to reduce the mobility of poor families with school age children. Housing stability is within our grasp, and can be realized if we have the will to make the proper policy choices. Social work, a profession with a rich history of housing advocacy, must renew that tradition in the coming years if we are to build a housing policy that fosters stability for low-income residents.

References


The economic self-sufficiency and independence of people with disabilities depend largely on their capacity to maintain financial stability. As a group, such individuals have among the highest poverty rates, lowest educational levels, lowest average incomes, and highest out-of-pocket expenses of all population groups. Any substantial shock to the financial stability of people with disabilities can threaten their access to necessary housing, nutrition, medical care, and other resources, the absence of which may result in further vulnerability and possible poverty. This article offers a theoretical framework for understanding disability poverty risk. Empirical studies are needed to test this model, quantifying the specific risk factors and identifying coping mechanisms used by people with disabilities to reduce vulnerability. The results will have important implications at the individual, service provider, and policy levels.

Introduction

The Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 states that “The Nation’s proper goals regarding individuals with disabilities are to assure equality of opportunity, full participation, independent living, and economic self-sufficiency for such individuals.”

Thus, assisting the 54 million Americans with disabilities (i.e., functional or activity limitations) to be self-sufficient and to live...
independently in their communities are among the most important objectives of U.S. disability policy. To achieve these goals, people with disabilities need to be able to maintain financial stability, balancing their budgets and absorbing threatening shocks to their financial security such as the costs of illnesses and other short-term emergencies.

As a group, people with disabilities appear to be particularly vulnerable financially due to 1) reduced earning capacity often associated with functional limitations, 2) the often-substantial costs of accommodating these limitations, and 3) their high susceptibility to certain financial shocks (LaPlante, 1993; LaPlante et al., 1996a & b). Many people with disabilities live at or near the poverty line (Kaye, 1998). These individuals, who have virtually no financial reserves and extremely limited earning potential, have no financial “cushion” to help absorb short-term shocks, and are at high risk of poverty. Some are at substantial risk of homelessness, particularly individuals with mental illnesses. The capacity of people with disabilities living at a subsistence level to maintain independence can be compromised as a result of a single major adverse event.

However, such vulnerability also has profound implications for people with disabilities who are more financially secure, but whose resources are limited and whose expenses are extraordinary. Challenges to financial stability may threaten their abilities to maintain necessary housing, nutrition, medical care, and other key factors affecting health and survival. The absence of such resources may, in turn, result in further financial vulnerability. Failure to maintain financial stability may, therefore, trigger a downward spiral resulting in bankruptcy, diminished health (both physical and mental), financial dependence on family members and friends, and even homelessness or institutionalization if no family support is available.

Unfortunately, while financial stability is so important to people with disabilities, these individuals also appear to be disproportionately subject to extraordinary costs of living that compromise the ability to maintain stability. These include the high cost of personal assistance services (e.g., attendant care for people with quadriplegia, reader services for blind people, interpreter
services for people who are deaf), assistive technology (e.g., wheelchairs, augmentive communication devices, reading machines, and voice recognition computers), and transportation services for some people with disabilities (Nosek, 1991, 1993).

Exacerbating this situation, the inability of many people with disabilities to pay for extraordinary expenses such as personal assistance and transportation costs may increase their vulnerability to health-related financial shocks (Nosek, 1993). Due to their disabilities, many of these individuals have a thinner margin of health than people without disabilities (DeJong, Batavia and Griss, 1989). Any deprivation of needed resources can compromise their health, causing a major drain of limited financial resources.

Although people who address disability issues understand these factors and relationships in a general manner, such variables have never been studied systematically with the objective of developing insights for reducing financial vulnerability and increasing financial stability. Specifically, no comprehensive model for predicting disability poverty risks has been developed to date. This article constitutes a first effort to develop such a theoretical framework and research agenda for understanding the financial vulnerability of people with disabilities.

The Financial Status of People with Disabilities

As a group, people with disabilities are among the poorest of all Americans (Louis Harris and Associates, 1998, p. 5). Of course, the disabled population is extremely diverse, and there are broad ranges of educational status, employment status, income level, asset level and other economic indicators among people with disabilities (Louis Harris and Associates, 1986, 1998; Baldwin, 1999). Some, by virtue of their family circumstances, individual efforts, legal settlements, or other good fortune, are wealthy or at least secure in the middle class and not financially vulnerable (except perhaps in a relative sense compared with other people in their social class). However, the vast majority of people with disabilities are not so fortunate. The following parameters fairly characterize the financial circumstances
of the average individual with a major disability in the United States.

**Poverty Rates**

Based on data from the 1995 Current Population Survey (CPS), 38.3% of working-age adults with severe work disabilities (i.e., unable to work due to a disability)\(^5\) live in poverty, compared with 30% of those limited in their ability to work and 10.2% of those not limited in work (Kaye, 1998). The 1998 National Organization on Disability (NOD)/Harris survey found that 33% of people with disabilities live in households with incomes of less than $15,000; only 12% of adults without disabilities live in such households (Louis Harris and Associates, 1998). According to these data, depending upon the extent of disability, people with disabilities are three to four times as likely to live in poverty as non-disabled people.

The 1992 National Health Interview Survey (NHIS) similarly suggests a significant discrepancy between the poverty rates of people with and without disabilities, though a somewhat smaller one. According to NHIS data, 17.1% of people limited in any activity live in poverty compared with 11.2% of people not limited in activity. Some 28.4% of children with a limitation in a life activity live in poverty compared with 17.8% of children who are not limited. Among the elderly population, 11.4% of those with disabilities live in poverty compared with 6.5% of those without disabilities (Kaye, 1998).

According to 1992 CPS data, women with severe work disabilities (i.e., conditions that prevent them from working) have the highest rates of poverty of all groups. Some 40.5% of such women live in poverty compared with 31% of men with severe work disabilities, 12.1% of women with no work disability, and 8.1% of men with no work disability (InfoUse, 1999).

Although these estimates of the extent of poverty among the disabled population differ, there is general consensus that a far larger percentage of people with disabilities live in poverty than people without disabilities. This conclusion is particularly disconcerting considering that about half of people who are unable to work due to a chronic disease or illness receive federal cash benefits under the Social Security Disability Insurance (SSDI)
program (32.7%), Supplemental Security Income (SSI) program (19.8%) or both (6%). These individuals also qualify for Medicare and Medicaid respectively. Thus, even though many people with disabilities have a stable source of program income and health insurance, they still remain in poverty at rates significantly higher than people without disabilities.

Education

People with disabilities have relatively low levels of education compared with the population generally. According to the NOD/Harris survey, 20% of people with disabilities do not complete high school, compared with 10% of those without disabilities (Louis Harris and Associates, 1998). Based on NHIS data, people with lower education levels consistently report higher levels of activity limitations, with 16.5% of those with 8 years of education or less unable to do their major life activity compared with 2.3% of those with 16 years or more (InfoUse, 1996). The relationship between disability and education is complex, and causation is likely to run in both directions.

Employment

According to the NOD/Harris survey, only about 30% of working-age adults with disabilities are employed full or part-time, compared with 80% of adults without disabilities (Louis Harris and Associates, 1998). Although 75% of unemployed individuals with disabilities consistently indicate that they would like to have a job, their employment situation has not improved, and may have worsened, in the past decade even with the implementation of legislation designed specifically to improve their economic viability such as the ADA.(Louis Harris and Associates, 1986, 1998; Budetti et al., 2001)

Other national surveys have yielded similar results. CPS data indicate that, of the 16.9 million working-age people with health conditions or impairments that limit their ability to work, 12.1 million people (72.1%) are unemployed (Kaye, 1998). Survey of Income and Program Participation (SIPP) data collected in 1994–95 indicate that 26.1% of people with severe disabilities are employed, compared with 76.9% of people with non-severe disabilities and 82.1% of people with no disabilities (McNeil, 1997).
The following percentages represent the proportion of people with certain disability characteristics who are employed: 22% of working-age wheelchair users; 27.5% of cane, crutch or walker users; 25% of people unable to climb stairs; 30.8% of people who are unable to see words or letters; and 35.1% of people with mental retardation (Kaye, 1998).

The poor levels of education and training of people with disabilities, combined with prejudicial attitudes and a history of dependence, often conspire to give many people with disabilities short or spotty job histories. This may make them less desirable to employers than other employees. Traditionally, disabled people have tended to make the most significant gains in the workforce when there is a shortage of available labor, or when disabled veterans return from a popular war (Berkowitz, 1980; Oberman, 1965; Renz-Beaulaurier, 1996, chap 2.). There is little evidence that the employment provisions of the ADA and other disability laws have changed the employment prospects of people with disabilities very much.

Earnings and Other Income

The major sources of income for people with disabilities are well known. They include a combination of conventional sources of income available to all people (e.g. employment, interest payments, dividends, TANF), as well as income transfer programs specifically targeted at disabled people such as SSI, SSDI and private disability insurance. Moreover, employer or government-subsidized benefits such as employment-based health insurance, Medicaid, Medicare, disability trust programs, and sliding scale service programs may serve as in-kind forms of income, or at least provide a way of limiting expenses (Batavia, 1998).

According to SIPP data, the median earnings of people with severe disabilities is about 60% of that for people without disabilities, and "[t]he presence of a disability is associated with an increased chance of having a low level of income" (McNeil, 1997, p. 3–4). For men between 21–64, median earnings for individuals with severe disabilities was $1,262 per month, compared with $2,190 for individuals with no disabilities. For women in this age range, the median earnings for disabled individuals was $1,000 per month, compared with $1,470 per month for women with
Financial Vulnerability

no disabilities. Some 42.2% of people with severe disabilities have incomes below the median income, compared with 13.3% of people with no disabilities (McNeil, 1997).

Individuals with very low incomes are, of course, particularly vulnerable to high costs of living and exposure to financial shocks. Those who are eligible for federal cash assistance under the federal disability programs, SSI and SSDI, are less vulnerable in part due to the cash payments, but mostly due to their resulting eligibility for Medicaid and Medicare respectively. Contrary to popular misconception, only 37.1% of people with severe disabilities receive means-tested government assistance (McNeil, 1997). Among those on the disability programs, work incentive provisions in these laws have further increased the earning potential of these individuals. However, the vast majority of people with disabilities still do not attempt to work, and remain trapped in a permanent state of subsistence (Batavia and Parker, 1995).

Expenses

The term "expenses" is used in this article to connote financial costs that must be paid out-of-pocket by the individual (as opposed to costs that may be paid by third parties). People with disabilities generally have the same categories of expenses as other people, as well as a few additional categories. These additional expenses may include housing and workplace modifications, special transportation needs, attendant care, interpreter services, reader services, periodic medical procedures or visits with specialists, and in some cases assistance in organizing care and services for their special needs. The need for personal assistance services increases with age (McNeil, 1997). Depending on their specific needs associated with their impairments and functional limitations, people with disabilities often bear financial burdens far beyond those of people without disabilities.

Obviously, if the individual's expenses exceed income for several years consecutively, this could deplete whatever net assets the individual may have accumulated. Even those people with disabilities who are highly educated and have substantial income levels may also be adversely affected by high costs and financial shocks. For example, an individual with an annual income of $100,000 who requires extensive personal assistance services
and who is subject to occasional severe health problems (e.g., decubitus ulcers, severe infections) may be severely impacted in a particularly bad year.

Although it is clear that people with disabilities are subject to high costs of living, little is known about their specific expenses. By virtue of their functional limitations, they tend to be more dependent than other people on costly human assistance and assistive technology. The most expensive component of human assistance for these individuals is services specifically designed to address their disabilities, such as specialized medical services and personal assistance services. However, people with disabilities also tend to have an increased dependence on services also used by non-disabled people such as housekeepers, electricians, plumbers, auto mechanics, and handymen, because many are less able to engage in self-help activities that are physical in nature (e.g., make minor home or car repairs and modifications).

Assistive technology can range from relatively simple devices (e.g., canes, walkers) to highly sophisticated motorized wheelchairs, communication devices and environmental control units. The more expensive devices can cost tens of thousands of dollars, and are virtually unaffordable to those who are not wealthy or who do not have another significant source of payment (e.g., health insurance, workers' compensation, vocational rehabilitation, etc.). Many insurance plans do not cover assistive devices or cover them only upon very limited circumstances.

Stability of Income and Expenses

Almost as important as levels of income and expenses is their stability over time. An occasional dip in income or spike in expenses can have a dramatic effect on an individual's financial situation and risk of poverty. Expense stability may be conceptualized as a continuum, with a range based on stability of impairments, accommodations, housing and social supports. Almost all expenses are subject to fluctuation, and this can have a particularly adverse impact on people with disabilities.

Automobile expenses are a good example. While insurance, licensing and even maintenance costs may remain relatively stable, in some years it will be necessary to replace the car or make major repairs, creating extra financial instability. For a disabled person
driving a wheelchair-accessible conversion van, such "spikes" can be particularly dramatic due to the relatively high cost of the accessible vehicle itself (typically over $35,000), as well as to the high cost of non-standard parts and high labor costs for specialized personnel. Moreover, a person with special transportation needs may not easily be able to find another means of transportation while the van is being repaired. Unlike non-disabled individuals, people with disabilities may not be able to simply rent a car, even if their insurance will pay for them to do so. This can lead to additional expenses or even a loss in employment or employment-related income.

The nature of disability can also influence stability of expenses. Some disabilities change over time and require different adaptations and therefore different expenses over time. Some disabilities are degenerative in nature (e.g., multiple sclerosis, muscular dystrophy), and inherently result in major changes in needs and expenses as the impairment and disability progress. Yet, even people with relatively stable impairments (e.g., spinal cord injury) can have increased expenses over time as they age with their disabilities and develop secondary conditions (e.g., joint deterioration, muscle deterioration, skin breakdown, arthritis, scoliosis).

Like expense stability, income stability may be conceptualized as a continuum, ranging from very stable sources of income to very unstable sources. Some forms of income, such as entitlement program income (e.g., SSI, SSDI) and trust payments are very stable. Most work-related benefits, however are limited roughly to the time one is working, and are therefore of limited duration when a person is unable to work. Because people with disabilities have greater susceptibility to health problems, their risk of losing employment due to health problems is probably also above average. If this is true, income fluctuations are likely to be relatively high for people with disabilities.

Assets and Net Worth

The financial net worth (i.e. assets minus liabilities) of an individual offers an assessment of the individual's financial cushion at any point in time. This cushion can protect the individual during a period of financial shock, such as a severe medical problem.
Personal savings and liquifiable assets remain the chief way in which people of all abilities prepare for the possibility of financial burdens and shocks. Many people with disabilities have almost no financial assets, and even a single year of financial shocks or one substantial shock, can put the individual in poverty.

There are few direct data on the net worth of people with disabilities. However, we know that many have almost no net assets by the significant and growing number of SSI and TANF recipients with disabilities. For the most part, assistance under these programs is not designed to allow these individuals to increase what little reserve they may have. In order to qualify, it is generally necessary to show both low income and minimum assets. Once in poverty, financial recovery is extremely difficult.

Health-Related Financial Consequences

All aspects of a person's finances are affected by a substantial disability. However, financial consequences related to health problems deserve specific attention. Numerous studies demonstrate the high susceptibility of many people with disabilities to major health problems (DeJong, Batavia and Griss, 1989; LaPlante, 1993; Max et al., 1995). Estimates of their health care expenses vary in part based on the definition of disability used. One study found that people with an activity limitation due to a chronic condition spend over four times more than non-disabled people on health care (InfoUse, 1996). The high-risk status of this population has a double impact on the potential for financial stability—an effect on income and on expenses.

First, health problems can substantially affect income in any given year, particularly for the many people with disabilities who have little or no job security (such as individuals who work for wages or on a part-time basis). A major health problem can result in unemployment and/or loss of income even for people with full-time employment.

Second, high susceptibility to health problems has obvious implications for the expenses of people with disabilities. To the extent an individual does not have access to group insurance coverage and is not eligible for government coverage, an individual policy will be extremely expensive and often unaffordable.
Moreover, individual policies typically have inadequate coverage, particularly for the needs of people with disabilities. Even if the individual has a good group policy, out-of-pocket expenses can be extremely burdensome in a year in which the individual has a major health problem. The federal tax system attempts to reduce the burden of some health care costs. However, only those qualified health-related expenses that exceed 7.5% of income may be deducted. Therefore, individuals with disabilities often have to bear the burden of thousands of dollars directly out-of-pocket without any tax relief.

The consequences of increased susceptibility to health problems are major sources of financial shock for people with disabilities. One study found that persons with both musculoskeletal conditions and comorbidity report 18% lower family earnings, 15% lower family income, and 35% fewer assets than the average among all persons their ages, while those with such conditions and no comorbidity have earnings, incomes, and assets closer to the average among their peers (Yelin, 1997).

Another study indicates that 89% of an inception cohort of 186 people with rheumatoid arthritis (mean disease duration 3 years) was affected in at least one socioeconomic area (work capability, income, rest during the daytime, leisure time activity, transport mobility, housing and social support), and 58% were impacted in at least three of these areas simultaneously. Overall, work disability was 4–15 times higher among these individuals than the general population, with 42% registered as work disabled after 3 years (Albers et al., 1999). However, we must also recognize that there are enormous differences among people with different impairments, and even among people with the same impairment, with respect to health problems that increase poverty risks (Baldwin, 1999).

It is apparent that health, income and expenses are very closely related for people with disabilities—even more so than for people without disabilities—and any comprehensive policy addressed at reducing poverty among the disabled population must address their health as well. Conversely, health care policy generally must be concerned about providing adequate access to quality care at a reasonable cost for people with disabilities and ensuring that the burden of health care expenses does not
render such individuals disproportionately financially vulnerable (Batavia, 1993b).

Theoretical Framework

A rough assessment of the financial situation of people with disabilities may be depicted through income statements and statements of net worth. However, such a purely financial analysis by itself will not be sufficient to predict an individual’s long-term financial security. In order to make such predictions, we must understand those factors that affect income, expenses, assets and liabilities over time. The risk of poverty, and consequent loss of financial security, is best depicted as the complex interaction of several personal, social and environmental factors. As illustrated in figure 1, each of these factors may be expected to have a weak, moderate or strong effect (characterized by the narrow, medium and broad lines respectively) on income and expenses, and consequently assets and liabilities.

Personal Factors

Among the personal factors that could potentially affect the individual’s financial condition are impairment, disability, personality, values, intellectual ability, education, skills, adaptability and motivation. Some of these are innate in the individual, such as impairment and intelligence. Others are more subject to modification, such as education and motivation. All of these personal factors interact in affecting individuals’ abilities to manage their disabilities in a manner that allows them to function in the economy—whether that means attempting to balance their budgets based on program income or attaining optimal productivity to succeed in a competitive environment.

Managing a disability is not an easy task. Effective management typically involves the highly-complex financing and coordination of many resources which must work in concert to compensate for the individual’s functional limitations and/or to adapt the individual’s environment to his or her needs. In most cases, people with disabilities, or their agents, will need to spend considerable time at these management necessities. Moreover, since the best laid plans often go awry due to extrinsic factors,
the individual or agent will also spend considerable time troubleshooting when one or more parts of their accommodation strategy develops problems.

People who experience financial crises typically adapt by making contingency plans. If you cannot drive to work, you take the bus. If you cannot afford to eat out, you eat in. However, for many people with disabilities, there is a limited array of viable substitute options. If your personal assistant doesn’t show up, or your customized wheelchair breaks, or your guide dog dies, what do you do? Even the best managed contingency systems break down on occasion, resulting in particular frustration when
contingency options are limited. This suggests that many people with disabilities may not only be close to the margin financially, but also emotionally, in their capacity to maintain independence. Several factors appear important, including the ability to plan in a flexible manner, the ability to deal with stress and frustration, the ability to invest by delaying gratification, and the ability to follow through in ensuring a successful long-term outcome.

The following are our hypotheses concerning how various factors inherent in the individual will affect the individual's income and expenses:

1. Disability (i.e., functional deficit) is a moderate negative predictor of income.

Advocates of disability rights and independent living like to claim that the functional limitations of people with disabilities do not cause reduced employment and income, but rather the interaction between the disability and the environment causes such problems. Although environmental factors appear to impose the most significant barriers to inclusion in all aspects of life for people with disabilities, including employment, the impairments and related disabilities of individuals can inherently preclude employment, either entirely or with respect to certain occupations, or can simply reduce productivity.

A perceptive commentator once observed, "Disability steals time." This insight has substantial implications for both the income-earning potential and spending requirements of people with disabilities. To the extent that the limitations associated with disability require an individual to spend more time on a given task than the task would require in the absence of the limitations, disability reduces the individual's productivity and earning potential. Of course, depending on relative aptitude, skills, attitude, motivation and a variety of other factors, the individual could still be significantly more productive than his or her peers. The point is that, relative to the individual's potential without the disability, productivity may be reduced to some extent.

Thus, disability deprives the individual with the disability of needed income associated with the lost time, or alternatively deprives the individual of spare time and energy necessary to compensate for the lost time. The type and extent of disability,
and the availability of assistive technology to compensate for functional losses, will determine the extent of the lost income.

2. *Age is a moderate positive predictor of income.*

   Age is among the most important demographic factors affecting poverty risk. All other factors held constant, increased age and related life experience are probably associated with increased income.

3. *Motivation is a strong positive predictor of income.*

   Perhaps the personal factor that is most difficult to understand or measure is motivation. Some people with disabilities who have every financial advantage completely lack the motivation to become self-sufficient. Others who have no advantages have succeeded admirably. In other words, people with disabilities are not basically different from non-disabled people in this important regard, except that the consequences of their motivation or lack thereof may be greater for people with disabilities. Motivation is certainly affected by values and upbringing, but it also has a strong unpredictable element. It is not unusual to hear successful people with disabilities say that they succeeded to prove their ability to all those who doubted it.

   Motivation in people with disabilities is likely to be affected by several factors, including perceptions about stability of their income and expenses, and about the prospects that the future will be as good or better than the present. For example, if individuals believe their hard work will be “rewarded” by a reduction in government benefits, motivation is likely to be diminished. This is probably the strongest reason that very few people ever leave the Social Security disability rolls (Batavia and Parker, 1995). The individual’s degree of commitment to the independent living philosophy is also likely to affect his or her motivation to become financially self-sufficient.

4. *Education is a strong positive predictor of income.*

   It is practically a truism that a good education is the road to opportunity and economic success. This appears to be particularly true for people with significant disabilities, because the skills and knowledge gained through education can compensate
for lost functional capacity or can otherwise offer employment opportunities that would not have been available to the individual. For example, obviously a person who is legally blind cannot be employed as a taxi driver (except possibly in Miami). However, such an individual, with the appropriate education, can be employed as an attorney or a banker. Therefore, education is not only the most promising strategy for employment for many people with disabilities; it is also the strategy with the highest return in terms of income. Unfortunately, as indicated above, people with disabilities do not achieve levels of education comparable to people without disabilities. Clearly, education is a key variable in any model for predicting financial vulnerability of people with disabilities.

5. Functional deficit is a strong positive predictor of expenses.

In addition to adversely affecting income, disability is likely to increase expenses. This may result from increased costs of rehabilitative care, personal assistance services and assistive devices. Also, to the extent individuals have limited time available to meet those needs they are capable of addressing independently, they must live with needs unattended or must pay for them. For example, a person with a disability who is capable of doing housework may still need to hire a housekeeper if all his time and energy are consumed managing his disability.

6. Age is strong positive predictor of expenses.

All other factors constant, increasing age is likely to exacerbate the costs associated with a disability. A growing literature on aging with a disability indicates that, as people with disabilities age, their functional and health problems tend to increase (DeJong, Batavia, & Griss, 1989). These problems often require expensive medical attention or personal assistance.

7. Motivation is a weak negative predictor of expenses.

Motivated individuals may find ways in which to fulfill their responsibilities without incurring additional expenses.

8. Education is a weak negative predictor of expenses.

Educated individuals may have skills or access to informational resources that can assist them in containing their expenses.
Financial Vulnerability

Social factors

When most people with disabilities experience fiscal shocks and other sorts of crises, there are a variety of social resources that they are able to access. These constitute our society's formal and informal safety net. They include informal support from family and friends, and formal support through federal, state, local and not-for-profit programs (DeJong, Batavia & McKnew, 1989). Informal support, which is uncompensated, is often inadequate to assist people with disabilities to achieve economic security and the capacity for independent living. The high costs of many special accommodations are beyond the financial capacity of most families. The direct provision of personal assistance services by family members may reduce their capacity to earn income that would benefit the household, including the disabled individual.

There are considerable differences among families with regard to how they cope with crises (McCubbin & Patterson, 1983). By the same token, naturally-occurring community supports (as defined by Pinderhughes, 1994), such as churches and social organizations, frequently are not be able to accommodate the often-extensive needs of people with disabilities. Therefore, although informal supports are an essential component of the mix of resources needed by people with disabilities to survive economically, they will never be adequate for the vast majority of people with significant disabilities.

Like all Americans, those with disabilities are potentially eligible for all the government poverty-reduction programs, assuming that they satisfy the programs' non-disability-related eligibility criteria. In addition, there are some programs such as SSI for which disability itself is a primary eligibility criterion. Often, however, use of these programs comes at the cost of increased dependence, or limitations on independence. For example, in order to receive SSI, it is necessary to prove that the individual is basically unemployable. Other programs may have other restrictions as well. For example, subsidized attendant care may be available in some areas only if the individual is willing to accept highly restrictive conditions (DeJong, Batavia & McKnew, 1992; Doty, Kasper & Litvak, 1996; Egley, 1994).
The following are our hypotheses concerning how various factors associated with the individual's social relationships and support networks will affect the individual's income and expenses:

1. **Informal social support is a strong positive predictor of income.**
   Support provided by family members and friends is probably one of the most important factors in assisting a person with a disability to be able to seek gainful employment, and to work at a higher level of productivity than without such support. For example, an individual without informal support may not have adequate personal assistance services or transportation to allow the individual to get to work.

2. **Formal social support is a weak positive predictor of income.**
   Obviously, formal support from social programs provides direct income or the equivalent in in-kind benefits (e.g., Medicare, Medicaid) for those who are eligible. However, this factor is somewhat ambiguous in its effect because such formal support can create a disincentive to seek gainful employment. On balance, formal support is probably a weak predictor of income.

3. **Informal social support is a moderate negative predictor of expenses.**
   Informal support from friends and family can directly decrease the expenses of an individual with a disability by providing services that the individual would otherwise have to pay out-of-pocket (e.g., personal assistance and transportation).

4. **Formal social support is a weak negative predictor of expenses.**
   Formal support from government programs may increase the individual's ability to care for himself or herself, and thereby contain health care costs.

**Environmental Factors**

Disability rights advocates often argue that the problems of disabled people have more to do with environmental factors, including discrimination and negative attitudes, than with their physical impairments (Fine & Asch, 1990; Meyerson, 1990). According to this perspective, their problems may be ameliorated or
eliminated entirely through environmental modifications, including the use of assistive technology. Unfortunately, many people with disabilities who are working or wish to work do not have access to optimal assistive devices, and work in environments that have not been adapted to their needs. Consequently, many such individuals are performing at a level that is below their optimal potential. In a competitive economy, in which incomes reflect productivity, it is likely that these workers are being paid less than what they would earn if accommodated more appropriately.\(^7\)

To some extent, environmental factors and social factors overlap, particularly when we consider how formal and informal supports often affect the environments of people with disabilities. For example, some government programs provide some funding specifically for assistive devices and environmental accommodations. Other programs provide general funds that may be used by individuals or businesses for such purposes. Still, for purposes of conceptualizing financial vulnerability factors, it is valuable to consider the environment as a separate but overlapping category.

The following are our hypotheses concerning how various factors inherent in the individual’s environment will affect the individual’s income and expenses:

1. **Policy accessibility is a moderate positive predictor of income.**
   
   An environment of laws and policies supporting the aspirations of people with disabilities is likely to enhance the individual’s ability to attain and maintain gainful employment. To the extent that some states, such as California and Wisconsin, have supportive policy environments, we would predict that people with disabilities in such states will have advantages in seeking employment relative to people with disabilities in less supportive states.

2. **Physical accessibility is a moderate positive predictor of income.**
   
   An optimally accessible environment is likely to enhance the individual’s ability to attain and maintain gainful employment. Conversely, an inaccessible environment can impose an insurmountable barrier to employment. As the ADA has enhanced the accessibility of our country, physical accessibility is less of a barrier now than it has ever been.
3. *Discrimination is a moderate negative predictor of income.*

Employment discrimination may prevent the individual from being hired or advancing to a higher level of employment. However, it is not deemed a strong factor, in that many individuals have been able to overcome discrimination to become successful in employment.

4. *Policy accessibility is a weak negative predictor of expenses.*

A policy environment amenable to the needs of people with disabilities may reduce their burden of managing their disabilities, and could therefore reduce avoidable expenses.

5. *Physical accessibility is a moderate negative predictor of expenses.*

An accessible environment is likely to reduce the individual's need for costly assistance. For example, an environment with a highly accessible public transportation system, such as Washington, DC, will significantly reduce the individual's transportation expenses.

**Conclusions**

People with disabilities appear to be among the most financially vulnerable Americans due to their low levels of education, employment, income, and assets. They are also among the people most in need of financial security due to often extraordinary and unstable expenses. There has been no systematic effort to research the relationships among personal, social and environmental factors and financial vulnerability of people with disabilities. A variety of factors, including social support, environmental modifications, and attitudes about community living, may serve to moderate the effects of impairments and disabilities even in the face of financial crisis.

Significant empirical research is needed to determine factors that affect the financial vulnerability of people with disabilities and implications for economic self-sufficiency and independent living. Specifically what is called for initially is exploratory and descriptive research that can chart in detail how people with disabilities view their financial circumstances. These studies should identify the relevant vulnerability factors, including those that
impose extraordinary costs on people with disabilities. Discerning this information is probably best achieved through qualitative research methods using focus groups of people with different disabilities (e.g., quadriplegia, paraplegia, deafness, blindness, mental illness, etc.), including an adequate representation of individuals who are living in or near poverty. Subsequently, once specific factors are identified, they must be operationalized as key variables and tested on the broader disability population to determine whether they are generalizable.

The findings of such studies will have important implications at several different levels. At the individual level, they can provide valuable insight for people with disabilities and their families to recognize sources of financial vulnerability and how to avoid them, including coping strategies of successful people with disabilities. At the clinical level, this research can also provide similar information to professionals such as social workers and rehabilitation professionals to assist them in empowering their clients with disabilities to gain financial security and avoid poverty. At the broader policy level, such studies will have implications for income maintenance policy, employment policy, health care policy, tax policy, and civil litigation. By reducing the financial vulnerability of people with disabilities, we can help them to improve their lives and enhance their independence and self-sufficiency.

NOTES

1. Section 2 (a) (8) of the ADA (42 U.S.C. 12101(a) (8)).

2. The estimate of 54 million Americans with disabilities, representing 20.6% of the population, is based on a broad definition of disability including an array of functional and activity limitations. It is estimated that approximately 26 million, or 9.9% of the population, have a severe disability. Approximately 6 million use wheelchairs, 5.2 million use other mobility aides (e.g., cane, crutches, walker), 1.6 million are unable to see, and 1 million are unable to hear (McNeil, 1997).

3. The term disability is used differently by different people and in different contexts. Some people use the term to connote the relationship between the individual's environment and any impairment (e.g., severed spinal cord) or functional limitation (e.g., paraplegia) the individual has—the extent to which the individual is disadvantaged socially (i.e., "handicapped"). For purposes of this paper, we use the Nagi terminology in which disability
is synonymous with functional limitation, and does not necessarily imply a social disadvantage (Batavia, 1993a).

4. The philosophy of independent living, which has served as the ideological foundation of the independent living movement of the 1970s, includes strong emphasis on consumer control, peer support, self-help, self-determination, equal access, and individual and system advocacy (DeJong, 1979). See section 701 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 (29 U.S.C. 796).

5. Specifically, the CPS classifies people as having a “severe work disability” if (1) they did not work in the survey week because of a long-term physical or mental illness that prevents the performance of any kind of work, (2) they did not work at all in the previous year because of illness or disability, (3) they are under 65 years of age and covered by Medicare, or (4) they are either 65 years of age and a recipient of SSI.

6. The SIPP regards a person who is unable to perform, or needs the help of another person to perform, one or more of the following list of physical functional activities as having a severe functional limitation: 1) seeing ordinary newspaper print (with glasses or contacts if normally used); (2) hearing normal conversation (using hearing aid if normally used); (3) having speech understood; (4) lifting or carrying 10 pounds; (5) walking a quarter of a mile without resting; (6) climbing a flight of stairs without resting; (7) getting around outside; (8) getting around inside; and (9) getting in and out of bed.

7. This is also true of other workers without disabilities who are not accommodated adequately to meet their individual needs. However, due to the functional limitations of people with disabilities, the potential productivity gain of adequate accommodations is likely to be greater for them.

References


Book Reviews


This book addresses a timely and significant issue relating to the lack of social security coverage for a vast majority of the working population of the world especially, in the developing countries. The problem testifies to the miserable failure of the fulfillment of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (see, Article 9, in particular) that asserts the "rights of everyone to social security, including social insurance". It also undermines the role of ILO in fulfilling its "solemn obligation" for the extension of social security measures in the nations of the world as contained in the Philadelphia Declaration of 1944. In these backdrops, Wouter Van Ginneken explores some new and innovative ways, and documents a number of pioneering efforts from five selected developing countries to help understand the ways in which the informal sector workers may be accorded social security coverages to a significant degree. Ginneken argues that in possible cases, existing family and community support systems should be tied up with statutory social security programs. Also, in addition to tax-financed social assistance schemes, special schemes for the self-employed, casual labour and homeworkers with government earmarked taxes should produce highly desirable results. Drawing upon the case studies from India, China, El Salvador, Benin and the United Republic of Tanzania, Ginneken asserts that the positive lessons learned from these countries in the informal sectors be used as pilot experiments preferably, with government involvement. It is suggested that these pilot projects should be area-based with full coverage in one area first and, if successful, they can be easily replicated in other areas with a very low administrative cost. These projects call for an implementation of the "bottom-up" participatory approach rather than the "top-down" policy that many international donor agencies including the ILO previously preferred.

The book consists of eight chapters. The first chapter written by the editor, W. V. Ginneken, offers an introduction to various
concepts related to social security and the case study countries. It also provides a brief overview of issues relating to the extension and reform of statutory social insurance, the promotion of contributory schemes, the cost-effective social assistance and the need for experimentation. Chapter 2 documents a case study from India that touches on the statutory social security, social assistance and self-financed social insurance. Contributed by Shashi Jain, this chapter is entitled as “Basic social security in India”. Chapter 3 titled as “Extending the coverage of social security protection in China” has been contributed by Xiaoyi Hu, Renhua Cai and Xu Zhai. Chapter 4 has been contributed by Peter Kamuzora and is titled: “Extension of formal social security schemes in the United Republic of Tanzania”. Chapter 5, contributed by Angwara Denis Kiwara, is also a case study on Tanzania. It, however, exemplifies the nation’s health insurance policy and is titled as “Health insurance for the informal sector in the United Republic of Tanzania”. Chapter 6 underscores the “Basic social security in El Salvador” and has been contributed by Ruth de Solórzano and Víctor Ramírez. Chapter 7 depicts a case study on Benin. Written by Bernardin Gauthè, the chapter includes a discussion on “Social security for the informal sector in Benin”. Chapter 8, the concluding chapter, highlights some salient policy recommendations by the editor. These include: (a) promoting contributory schemes, (b) fostering cost-effective social assistance and, (c) extending and reforming statutory social insurance schemes. This chapter also underscores clear roles for various social security partners that include the government, the social partners, insurance companies and social security agencies and, non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The chapter concludes with a delineation of the role of the ILO in terms of research and experimentation, technical assistance and standard setting.

This book is a timely and significant contribution to the field of social work as well as social policy and social development. The list of tables (see Pp. xii & xiii) provides a very useful factual information for the readers on demographic, social, economic, health and employment statistics, among others, for all five case study countries. The experiences drawn from the five case study countries have been analyzed by Ginneken very systematically providing clear connection to the issue of social security coverages
in the informal sectors of the developing countries. The reader, whether a researcher, an educator, a policy maker or an international agency administrator, will find this book very informative and useful in terms of understanding some effective and innovative ways to extend social security benefits to a large number of disadvantaged population of the world especially, those who are not covered under any formal sector.

Finally, even though these case studies represent only a fraction of the problem and offers positive results in a limited way, I consider this edition by W. V. Ginneken as a significant contribution to addressing the needs of the millions of suffering humanity. In that broader sense, the book definitely makes an immense contribution to the understanding of human rights and social development today.

Mizanur R. Miah
Southern Illinois University at Carbondale


The fate of children whose parents have divorced has been the fodder of many religious sermons, political speeches, scholarly investigations, and coffee-shop chats. Much of what the public hears about children of divorce is shot through with passion, rhetoric, and assumptions—but not necessarily with clear thinking. Adolescents after Divorce, however, offers a refreshing avenue of insight and clarity about children of divorce.

Adolescents after Divorce begins with a disclaimer that it does not push a philosophical or political agenda regarding divorce or children’s living situations, and by the conclusion of the book, the reader agrees that the material is presented in an even-handed manner. The writing style of the work is excellent: it is clear, accurate, scholarly, and yet quite interesting. The authors have achieved an objective but engaging tone. The material presented in the book acknowledges the passion inherent in the subject of children and divorce, but does not allow that passion to swamp rational thinking.
in the informal sectors of the developing countries. The reader, whether a researcher, an educator, a policy maker or an international agency administrator, will find this book very informative and useful in terms of understanding some effective and innovative ways to extend social security benefits to a large number of disadvantaged population of the world especially, those who are not covered under any formal sector.

Finally, even though these case studies represent only a fraction of the problem and offers positive results in a limited way, I consider this edition by W. V. Ginneken as a significant contribution to addressing the needs of the millions of suffering humanity. In that broader sense, the book definitely makes an immense contribution to the understanding of human rights and social development today.

Mizanur R. Miah
Southern Illinois University at Carbondale


The fate of children whose parents have divorced has been the fodder of many religious sermons, political speeches, scholarly investigations, and coffee-shop chats. Much of what the public hears about children of divorce is shot through with passion, rhetoric, and assumptions—but not necessarily with clear thinking. Adolescents after Divorce, however, offers a refreshing avenue of insight and clarity about children of divorce.

Adolescents after Divorce begins with a disclaimer that it does not push a philosophical or political agenda regarding divorce or children’s living situations, and by the conclusion of the book, the reader agrees that the material is presented in an even-handed manner. The writing style of the work is excellent: it is clear, accurate, scholarly, and yet quite interesting. The authors have achieved an objective but engaging tone. The material presented in the book acknowledges the passion inherent in the subject of children and divorce, but does not allow that passion to swamp rational thinking.
The authors cite many scholarly investigations which have attempted to determine how well children function after divorce, but wisely, the authors do not argue and fuss with the results of other studies, though results and conclusions of different investigations vary widely. *Adolescents and Divorce* also skims some of the policy decisions about custody arrangements which different states have crafted, but the book is not about policy; it is children. The results presented in *Adolescents after Divorce* are offered as yet another piece in a complex puzzle, alerting social scientists and policy makers to the need for much more in-depth study of how children adjust in different residential arrangements after divorce.

The investigation reported in *Adolescents after Divorce* is an offshoot of the Stanford Custody Project, which followed over 1100 families in northern California. Over 500 adolescents (aged 10–18) from 365 families were interviewed for this book; the parents of these children had separated approximately 5 years prior to the interviews reported. Consequently, these youngsters had already weathered the initial upheaval of divorce and had developed some coping styles. An aim of this research was to determine how well those coping styles worked: were these young people making acceptable school marks; were they involved in illegal activities; were they depressed? Another principle aim of the study was to link the children’s adjustment to their residential arrangement (living with mother, living with father, or living in a dual-custody arrangement) and its stability. Did the living arrangement and its stability affect how well youngsters adjusted to parenting styles, such as rule-making and emotional support; did it affect the way children handled conflict between their parents; did it affect the way young people accepted a new partner for the parent? Telephone interviews provided the primary source of data to answer these questions. The reader was not given much information about the exact structure of these interviews, nor how interviewers were trained. Data were analyzed using a variety of statistical tests, but the book does not center on methodology or statistics; rather it reviews the results and conclusions of those results.

The most compelling result is one that celebrates the resilience and individuality of children: despite the dire warnings one hears
about negative effects of divorce, in fact, the children in this study were, on the whole, adjusting satisfactorily. The fact that the study results demonstrated a great deal of variability only highlights the fact that children are individuals who respond differently to family upheaval. Children defy easy characterizations; they confound the experts by responding in unexpected ways which often show unusual emotional agility and profound survival skills.

The majority of youngsters in this study lived with their mothers. Adjustment seemed to be somewhat better (lower depression scores, better school functioning, and less deviant activities) for adolescents who lived with their mothers or in dual residences. Children living with fathers seemed to have the most adjustment problems, perhaps because the adolescents often moved in with daddy after experiencing some life problem. Fathers also had more money, in general, and perhaps their professional pursuits interfered with their ability to monitor and stay involved with children. Suffice it to say, children (particularly females) living with fathers appeared to have more problems.

Children in dual residences seemed to function fairly well, with some variability in the sample. And children in general seemed to adjust well to a new partner in the parent's life, particularly if the parent and his/her partner married. Remarriage seemed to raise family functioning (the management of children) to a new level. Interestingly, how often children visited the nonresidential parent seemed to matter little to the closeness they felt toward that nonresidential parent, as long as they had at least some visitation. A continuing relationship with the nonresidential parent seemed to contribute positively to adolescent adjustment, and this was particularly true with father-residence children. Many children—particularly girls—in the study reported feeling "caught" in loyalty struggles between parents, particularly if parents were in conflict. The closer adolescents were to their parents, both residential or nonresidential, the less likely they were to report feeling caught.

*Adolescents after Divorce* provokes much thought about what kinds of living arrangements foster healthy adjustment in children after their parents split up. It also leads the reader to the intuitive conclusion that children need, above all, the warmth
and support of their parents, regardless of where those parents live, to give youngsters a sense of well-being and competence in life.

Dorinda N. Noble
Louisiana State University


Directed at newly minted clinicians and at seasoned agency clinicians new to private practice, *Independent Practice for the Mental Health Professional* presents essential information and material to those planning to start a private practice in the current mental health environment. While acknowledging the significant (and mostly negative) changes managed care has brought to the delivery of private practice mental health services, the authors are decidedly optimistic about the future of private practice in the 21st century. While many other works cover the nuts and bolts of setting up a private practice and the design of marketing strategies, the current effort by Earle and Barnes is unique in stressing the importance of the role of the personality and lifestyle of the clinician in meeting the expectations of clients and ensuring the success of private practice in mental health.

The book begins with a chapter that poses questions designed to assist clinicians reflect and begin to define the type of private practice they envision. It also helps them decide if they are suited for private practice at all. This is followed by a chapter devoted to providing readers with a brief description of the practices of several clinicians, which serve to illustrate the differences and similarities among private practice practitioners. One of the chapters addresses head on the apparent incompatibility between the image of a warm, trusting, and caring professional helper with that of the profit-driven, materialistic, unscrupulous, aggressive entrepreneur, and it shows how belief in these stereotypes can negatively affect the marketing strategy of the private practitioner. Also included in the book are chapters covering
and support of their parents, regardless of where those parents live, to give youngsters a sense of well-being and competence in life.

Dorinda N. Noble
Louisiana State University


Directed at newly minted clinicians and at seasoned agency clinicians new to private practice, *Independent Practice for the Mental Health Professional* presents essential information and material to those planning to start a private practice in the current mental health environment. While acknowledging the significant (and mostly negative) changes managed care has brought to the delivery of private practice mental health services, the authors are decidedly optimistic about the future of private practice in the 21st century. While many other works cover the nuts and bolts of setting up a private practice and the design of marketing strategies, the current effort by Earle and Barnes is unique in stressing the importance of the role of the personality and lifestyle of the clinician in meeting the expectations of clients and ensuring the success of private practice in mental health.

The book begins with a chapter that poses questions designed to assist clinicians reflect and begin to define the type of private practice they envision. It also helps them decide if they are suited for private practice at all. This is followed by a chapter devoted to providing readers with a brief description of the practices of several clinicians, which serve to illustrate the differences and similarities among private practice practitioners. One of the chapters addresses head on the apparent incompatibility between the image of a warm, trusting, and caring professional helper with that of the profit-driven, materialistic, unscrupulous, aggressive entrepreneur, and it shows how belief in these stereotypes can negatively affect the marketing strategy of the private practitioner. Also included in the book are chapters covering
the benefits of maintaining affiliations with such institutions as hospitals, insurance companies, physician groups and law firms as well as other strategies to keep private practice 'public.'

A chapter on managed care provides useful definitions and descriptions of the many mental health delivery systems in existence today and discusses the marketing of private practice in the current managed care environment. Coverage is also given to the question of what type of practice to pursue, solo or group? What kind of business structure to establish, sole proprietorship or partnership? Should incorporation be considered? The last two chapters cover a number of practical issues. These include office design, staffing, office procedures, billing, the setting and collection of fee and the legal ramifications of private practice, including legal mandates and malpractice insurance.

Despite providing information on these aspects of private practice, Independent Practice for the Mental Health Professional is not, as the authors point out, a 'how to do it' book. One of the book's strengths is that it does a very good job at leading the reader to ask important questions regarding the kind private practice they envision and provide examples of how some private practitioners responded to the same questions. Another strength of this work is that it is brief and straightforward. Divided into ten short chapters, the book quickly covers the essentials of private practice without treating, as other works do, this activity as a holy ritual reserved only for a chosen few. The authors should also be commended for refusing to take sides and favoring any particular theoretical orientation in psychotherapy.

The book's most obvious weakness is to be found in the chapter on legal concerns. The authors should recognize that those entering private practice are already licensed in their state and that they are already familiar with the basic tenets of mental health law. They will also be acquainted with various practice and ethical requirements such as confidentiality, duty to warn, dual relationships and legal reporting requirements. Although knowledge of these topics is essential for private practice, detailed instruction on these topics are not needed in the book. Nevertheless, the book contains a great deal of useful information and will be of benefit to those who are considering entering practice practice. It will
also be useful to those who are already engaged in the private practice field.

Rafael Herrera  
University of California at Berkeley


In this recently published work, Lawrence Armand French, Professor and Chair in the Department of Social Sciences at Western New Mexico University, offers an intriguing social and historical perspective with respect to the subject of Native Americans and addictions, and especially with regard to alcohol abuse in those populations. The book is chocked full of history and facts, both with respect to addictions and especially alcohol abuse in the US as well as in terms of the social history of Native Americans per se and their treatment in the broader by the US government over the past two centuries. French is clearly empathetic to the plight of Native peoples and in that light he provides a sympathetic view of the general issues at hand. In the context of the present interest in social work regarding issues of cultural competence with respect to substance abuse treatment and more generally in terms of social work practice, the book addresses topics of some currency. The book is divided into four sections: (1) Historical Perspectives on Native American Addictions, (2) The Nature of Substance Abuse among Native Americans; (3) Prevention, Intervention and Cultural Treatment; and (4) Indian Gaming—which is termed the new addiction.

The author, a clinical psychologist, possesses an unusual knowledge of both historical as well as epidemiological, treatment and prevention facts with respect to research and substance abuse treatment and prevention issues among Native peoples. He has authored two previous books: *Psychocultural Change and the American Indian* (1987), and *The Winds of Injustice* (1994). The current book is replete with numerous footnotes which convey a not inconsiderable familiarity, again, with both specific historical, political and economic constructs of the past approximately two hundred years of interface of Native vs European cultures. In addition, a strength of the book is the author’s awareness of
also be useful to those who are already engaged in the private practice field.

Rafael Herrera
University of California at Berkeley


In this recently published work, Lawrence Armand French, Professor and Chair in the Department of Social Sciences at Western New Mexico University, offers an intriguing social and historical perspective with respect to the subject of Native Americans and addictions, and especially with regard to alcohol abuse in those populations. The book is chocked full of history and facts, both with respect to addictions and especially alcohol abuse in the US as well as in terms of the social history of Native Americans per se and their treatment in the broader by the US government over the past two centuries. French is clearly empathetic to the plight of Native peoples and in that light he provides a sympathetic view of the general issues at hand. In the context of the present interest in social work regarding issues of cultural competence with respect to substance abuse treatment and more generally in terms of social work practice, the book addresses topics of some currency. The book is divided into four sections: (1) Historical Perspectives on Native American Addictions, (2) The Nature of Substance Abuse among Native Americans; (3) Prevention, Intervention and Cultural Treatment; and (4) Indian Gaming—which is termed the new addiction.

The author, a clinical psychologist, possesses an unusual knowledge of both historical as well as epidemiological, treatment and prevention facts with respect to research and substance abuse treatment and prevention issues among Native peoples. He has authored two previous books: *Psychocultural Change and the American Indian* (1987), and *The Winds of Injustice* (1994). The current book is replete with numerous footnotes which convey a not inconsiderable familiarity, again, with both specific historical, political and economic constructs of the past approximately two hundred years of interface of Native vs European cultures. In addition, a strength of the book is the author’s awareness of
culture itself as a dynamic entity and variable in the course of
time and with respect to the very understanding or meaning a
specific substance might have for a specific population in a given
context (e.g. peyote). He is likewise conscious in thoughtful ways
of political and economic nuance and arguments, such as in his
discussion of gambling, and attempts to synthesize what is really
a vast array of facts and detail into a one volume compendium
which addresses a very wide range of topics. These range from
the author’s explorations of pre-Columbian worldview of Native
Americans, to considerations of (Max Weber’s) The Protestant
Ethic and how this might have influenced the cultural interface
between Europeans and Native peoples, to considerations of
nineteenth century U.S. frontier social, political and legal history.
Other topics include a discussion of the history of the Diagnostic
and Statistical Manual (DSM), a brief discourse on the neurophysi-
ology of addictions, clinical and epidemiological perspectives on
fetal alcohol syndrome (FAS), to mention only a few of the diverse
topics covered in the book. Other issues the author articulates
include sociological/ecological perspectives on the ‘drunk town’
phenomenon, anthropological awareness of the complexity of is-
suces regarding both biological changes as a result of intermarriage
among tribal groups as well as corresponding transformations in
tribal cultural dynamics. In one of his summations the author
notes “Clearly, a combination of sudden cultural disruption (cul-
tural genocide) and dramatic lifestyle changes (diet, disease, level
of activity) contributed to the array of health problems plaguing
American Indians and Alaska Natives today.”

One of the most appealing aspects of the book is the au-
thor’s obvious interest in, concern about and respect for Na-
tive American peoples and their historical traditions and values
and about the social injustices these peoples have suffered. That
said, in this reviewer’s opinion, the book also suffers from some
limitations, not the least of which is that the author seems to
be attempting to do too much in one single volume. There is
such an incredible array of information that at times one feels
overwhelmed by the facts. In that regard, one has the sense that
despite the author’s obvious empathy for Native peoples, and
considerable knowledge, he loses sight of the forest for the trees
in the midst of so much documentation. There would likewise
appear to be instances of over-generalization, particularly when discussing 'Native' categories. At times one has the sense that all Native cultural domains become welded together and that true cultural diversity of North American Native cultures gets lost. This may be an inadvertent and unintended result of attempting to explain salient differences between core European and Native worldviews, but one comes away with a less than clear understanding of the considerable cultural and other diversity that exists among the various North American Native tribal and ethnic groups. Along these same lines there would appear to be an oversimplification when comparing other aspects of American Indian and 'Euro-American' approaches or cultural differences such as the discussion of American Indian Vs Traditional AA in Chapter 7.

In sum, there is much material in the book that social workers and others might find informative, albeit with certain caveats. The author's commitment to American Indians and his attempts to understand what he views as the disease of addiction, especially addiction to alcohol, in these peoples are noteworthy. By the same token, one comes away with the sense that there is more than one book here, and that a more narrow focus, with fewer digressions on various topics may have better served the objective of the book. The author is to be commended in his attempt to address this important social issue and have the book serve as a catalyst for critical thinking about the complexity of the issue's many and varied dynamics.

Michael Gorman
San Jose State University


Medicare reform has been on the national agenda for the last several years as evidenced by the inclusion of the creation of the National Bipartisan Commission on the Future of Medicare as part of the Balanced Budget Act of 1997. The Commission was charged with examining the Medicare program and making
appear to be instances of over-generalization, particularly when discussing 'Native' categories. At times one has the sense that all Native cultural domains become welded together and that true cultural diversity of North American Native cultures gets lost. This may be an inadvertent and unintended result of attempting to explain salient differences between core European and Native worldviews, but one comes away with a less than clear understanding of the considerable cultural and other diversity that exists among the various North American Native tribal and ethnic groups. Along these same lines there would appear to be an oversimplification when comparing other aspects of American Indian and 'Euro-American' approaches or cultural differences such as the discussion of American Indian Vs Traditional AA in Chapter 7.

In sum, there is much material in the book that social workers and others might find informative, albeit with certain caveats. The author's commitment to American Indians and his attempts to understand what he views as the disease of addiction, especially addiction to alcohol, in these peoples are noteworthy. By the same token, one comes away with the sense that there is more than one book here, and that a more narrow focus, with fewer digressions on various topics may have better served the objective of the book. The author is to be commended in his attempt to address this important social issue and have the book serve as a catalyst for critical thinking about the complexity of the issue's many and varied dynamics.

Michael Gorman
San Jose State University


Medicare reform has been on the national agenda for the last several years as evidenced by the inclusion of the creation of the National Bipartisan Commission on the Future of Medicare as part of the Balanced Budget Act of 1997. The Commission was charged with examining the Medicare program and making
recommendations to strengthen and improve it in time the retirement of the “Baby Boomers.” In November 1999, Senate Bill 1895, the Medicare Preservation and Improvement Act was introduced to the Senate by its co-authors, John Breaux, Thomas Frist and Robert Kerry. This bill which would create major changes in the benefits and administration of Medicare addresses the major economics issues discussed in Medicare Reform: Issues and Answers.

This book is comprised of the presentations of an April 1998 forum sponsored by the Private Enterprise Research Center and the Bush School of Government and Public Service, and held in conjunction with the Department of Economics at Texas A&M University. It is not surprising to find, therefore, that the issues and answers are all focused on the economics of Medicare. For the novice in economics, this is a difficult book to read.

The primary issue identified by participants in this forum is the projected bankruptcy of the Medicare Trust Fund in 2008. The reasons for that impending financial disaster are two: the shift in demographics such that the retired population of the 2020s will be supported by far fewer workers than now, and the incentives of a third party payer, fee for service system for greater utilization of services. A result of the shift of demographics means that in a pay-as-you-go system such as Medicare, the increasing costs of a burgeoning, longer-lived population of retirees must be borne by a younger generation. This intergenerational dependence is viewed as a major inequality that will be met with growing resistance as the tax burdens of youth expand to unbearable size.

This book is apparently organized based on the actual presentations at the forum. The first three present analyses of economic incentives that might be used to reform Medicare and are followed by commentary on those presentations. In the first chapter, Victor Fuchs suggests that there need to be policies to provide incentives to increase savings by workers and to reduce incentives to retirement. In the second chapter, Henry Aaron discusses the effects of expanded choices provided by the changes to Medicare in the Balanced Budget Act of 1997, and concludes that a universal plan of broader benefits would be preferable. Mark Pauly proposes a means tested approach to charges for Medicare services. In her commentary, Marilyn Moon notes that though necessary, economic analysis is not sufficient to provide
all the necessary data to develop a policy to reform Medicare. Specifically, one must also consider issues of intergenerational equity, institutional factors and desires of consumers for certain inefficiencies.

Some of these concerns are discussed in the next section of the book. Frank Sloan and Donald Taylor present their research on how the types of hospital ownership affect the costs of Medicare. David Cutler provided a cost benefit analysis of Medicare and concludes that though Medicare wastes resources it is in total worth its costs. In the next chapter, Jagadeesh Gokhale and Laurence Kotlikoff provide a dense explanation of intergenerational accounting. Though difficult to grasp by the economically ignorant, the authors make their point that the demographic shift spells costly tax burdens in the future. They offer no resolution to the impending disaster, once more providing support for the description of economics as the dismal science.

Kevin Murphy's commentary focuses on the need to ask the right questions of Medicare reform. He notes that Medicare and medical care are not the same thing. He sums the discussions of the previous articles, identifying the problems noted above, that is: excess utilization and intergenerational equity. He suggests that solutions need to focus not on what medical care one should have, but on methods of payment for that care. His approach to social contracts covering the medical costs of retirees is further developed in the final chapter of the book by the editors.

Rettenmaier and Saving offer a detailed proposal for resolving the Medicare crisis. Not surprisingly, their plan uses private insurance plans and relies on competition. They remove the pay-as-you-go system and supplant it with cohort based fixed insurance funds. Their plan attempts to meet the concerns presented throughout the book.

Though the presentation of the issues and answers to Medicare reform are discussed rather thoroughly from the economic viewpoint, this book is limited by that single fact. As Moon so clearly points out, economic analysis is not sufficient for development of public policy. We must think outside of the cash box when we consider Medicare reform. What needs fixing? Should we consider Medicare alone when we consider its reform? Medicare exists because in the United States health insurance and thus
access to care are related to attachment to the workforce. If we were to change that policy, if we were to develop a universal system of access to care, we could resolve much of the problems that exist in Medicare—especially the one related to intergenerational equity. To do so, however, would take a political will that seems to have evaded us, and which was certainly not a focus of the book, Medicare Reform: Issues and Answers.

Deborah Schild Wilkinson
University of Michigan
Book Notes


Over the last twenty years, the social policies of the Western industrial nations have been faced with enormous fiscal, political and other challenges. Changing demographic realities, new attitudes, globalization and ideological opposition to government intervention in social welfare have all created pressures which have undermined established patterns of social welfare provision.

Canada has long been viewed as an advanced welfare state, and its extensive social services have often been contrasted favorably with the less generous social programs of the United States. However, the nation's social welfare system has also been negatively affected by the forces of change. As Rice and Prince reveal, Canadian social welfare is now under great pressure from the global economy, ideological opposition and greater cultural pluralism. Traditional social policy approaches will need to take account of these changes.

The authors believe that the established welfare system cannot be preserved without some form of adaptation. They do not, however, lament the need for change. Unlike much normative writing on welfare states today, Rice and Prince recognize that established approaches were lacking. For example, drawing on the critical work of feminist social policy writers, they stress the gender biases in traditional social policy. They also emphasize the role of cultural pluralization in shaping new social policies. Indeed, they suggest that diversity is as important as globalization in creating new pressures on social welfare. However, these pressures are to be welcomed because they create opportunities for community based social movements to transcend the traditional male-dominated class politics that shaped the welfare state.

Although this book contains some descriptive content and can, therefore, be viewed as a 'country case study' of Canadian social policy, it offers a sophisticated analysis of the changes facing social policy in Canada and, indeed, other industrial countries.
today. It makes extensive use of theory, and offers interesting normative directions for future development. The book not only informs readers about trends in Canada but offers interesting insights into the dilemmas of social welfare in many other countries facing similar challenges.


The dramatic political changes which took place in Eastern Europe in the early 1990s have been accompanied by equally dramatic economic changes. Although the collapse of the communist regimes of Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union was a direct result of the refusal of ordinary people to accept totalitarianism, economic stagnation and the failures of centralized planning also fueled popular discontent. However, as is widely recognized, the advent of so-called free market economic reforms have not brought prosperity. Indeed, poverty in the region is higher than before and income inequality has become far more marked. Also, as the authors reveal, attempts to deal with the problem through social assistance have not been very successful.

This book is the result of a major study of poverty and social assistance programs in three former communist Eastern European nations and three former Soviet Republics undertaken by World Bank staff. In addition to assessing the incidence of poverty in the region, the study sought to examine the role of social assistance in addressing the problem. Noting that the World Bank has become increasingly interested in ‘targeting’ income benefits, the authors sought to determine whether targeting is an effective anti-poverty strategy.

The authors report that poverty rates increased dramatically in the Eastern European and former Soviet regions in the early 1990s. Poverty had already begun to rise as a result of economic difficulties but after the closure of state owned enterprises, increased administrative disorganization and the advent of rapid inflation, poverty rates accelerated. In the Eastern European countries, poverty was primarily a function of unemployment resulting from the closure of public enterprises, but in the former Soviet Union, and particularly in Russia, it was more widespread.
today. It makes extensive use of theory, and offers interesting normative directions for future development. The book not only informs readers about trends in Canada but offers interesting insights into the dilemmas of social welfare in many other countries facing similar challenges.


The dramatic political changes which took place in Eastern Europe in the early 1990s have been accompanied by equally dramatic economic changes. Although the collapse of the communist regimes of Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union was a direct result of the refusal of ordinary people to accept totalitarianism, economic stagnation and the failures of centralized planning also fueled popular discontent. However, as is widely recognized, the advent of so-called free market economic reforms have not brought prosperity. Indeed, poverty in the region is higher than before and income inequality has become far more marked. Also, as the authors reveal, attempts to deal with the problem through social assistance have not been very successful.

This book is the result of a major study of poverty and social assistance programs in three former communist Eastern European nations and three former Soviet Republics undertaken by World Bank staff. In addition to assessing the incidence of poverty in the region, the study sought to examine the role of social assistance in addressing the problem. Noting that the World Bank has become increasingly interested in ‘targeting’ income benefits, the authors sought to determine whether targeting is an effective anti-poverty strategy.

The authors report that poverty rates increased dramatically in the Eastern European and former Soviet regions in the early 1990s. Poverty had already begun to rise as a result of economic difficulties but after the closure of state owned enterprises, increased administrative disorganization and the advent of rapid inflation, poverty rates accelerated. In the Eastern European countries, poverty was primarily a function of unemployment resulting from the closure of public enterprises, but in the former Soviet Union, and particularly in Russia, it was more widespread.
Although the situation has improved, poverty rates in the region remain high.

The study found that social assistance did play a role in poverty alleviation but that it was costly and wasteful. The authors found a high incidence of ‘leakage’ in which families who were not in poverty received social assistance. They also found many cases of discrimination against poor people and the denial of benefits to those living in particular regions. It is unfortunate that while the authors found that social assistance was not the most effective way of responding to the crisis, they did not discuss the potential role of alternative social policy instruments in reducing poverty. Nevertheless, this book provides valuable information about poverty and social policy in Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union, and it offers useful lessons for other parts of the world facing economic difficulties.


Americans have long emphasized the role of philanthropy in meeting social needs. Political and business notables, church leaders and ordinary citizens all agree that charitable giving is a noble endeavor that helps the less fortunate, fosters desirable moral values, and creates a more caring society. The non-profit sector is widely believed to be preferable to public provisions, and its expansion has been systematically promoted. Through public subsidies, contracts with government agencies and generous tax incentives, it has grown enormously, and is today a major provider of social services. Many Americans believe, with justification, that their country has the best developed and most vibrant system of philanthropy in the world.

Given its importance and the widespread support it enjoys, it is perhaps surprising that a social work educator should subject American charities to such vigorous criticism. But David Wagner’s account of the ‘dark side’ of philanthropy merits serious consideration. From colonial times to the present, he contends, organized philanthropy has projected a symbolic but fallacious image of institutionalized altruism which fails to deal with the nation’s most pressing social problems, promotes self-serving
Although the situation has improved, poverty rates in the region remain high.

The study found that social assistance did play a role in poverty alleviation but that it was costly and wasteful. The authors found a high incidence of 'leakage' in which families who were not in poverty received social assistance. They also found many cases of discrimination against poor people and the denial of benefits to those living in particular regions. It is unfortunate that while the authors found that social assistance was not the most effective way of responding to the crisis, they did not discuss the potential role of alternative social policy instruments in reducing poverty. Nevertheless, this book provides valuable information about poverty and social policy in Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union, and it offers useful lessons for other parts of the world facing economic difficulties.


Americans have long emphasized the role of philanthropy in meeting social needs. Political and business notables, church leaders and ordinary citizens all agree that charitable giving is a noble endeavor that helps the less fortunate, fosters desirable moral values, and creates a more caring society. The non-profit sector is widely believed to be preferable to public provisions, and its expansion has been systematically promoted. Through public subsidies, contracts with government agencies and generous tax incentives, it has grown enormously, and is today a major provider of social services. Many Americans believe, with justification, that their country has the best developed and most vibrant system of philanthropy in the world.

Given its importance and the widespread support it enjoys, it is perhaps surprising that a social work educator should subject American charities to such vigorous criticism. But David Wagner's account of the 'dark side' of philanthropy merits serious consideration. From colonial times to the present, he contends, organized philanthropy has projected a symbolic but fallacious image of institutionalized altruism which fails to deal with the nation's most pressing social problems, promotes self-serving
behavior among the proponents of charity, stifles effective government intervention and co-opts radical groups that seek to promote progressive social change.

Wagner is polemical but appropriately hard-hitting. Focusing first on the historical development of philanthropy, he exposes the way Christian 'altruism' forced Native Americans to convert to Christianity, and then proceeded to enslave, dispossess and even kill them. He also shows how the industrial barons of the late 19th century used philanthropy for their own, self-serving purposes. These practices continue today on a vast scale but are heavily subsidized by tax payers, limiting alternative and potentially more effective public social service programs.

This book is to be commended for facilitating critical thinking about a topic severely lacking in critical analysis. It challenges the complacency which characterizes much of the literature on philanthropy today. Although it will outrage some, it is well written and engaging, and deserves extensive discussion. It should be prescribed reading for all social work students and and those in non-profit management programs.


Although religious organizations have historically catered to the needy, the expansion of government social programs during the middle decades of this century gradually diminished their importance. It was widely accepted in social policy circles in the 1950s and 1960s that both secular and religious charitable effort would dwindle as government social programs expanded. This attitude was reinforced by the emergence of social work which promoted the professionalization of charitable activity. Help to those in need would not be provided by well-meaning individuals but by professionally qualified social workers, trained in scientific methods and skilled in solving human problems.

These beliefs were seriously challenged during the 1980s when politicians on the political right began systematically to attack both state social service provision and social welfare professionalization. Since President Reagan first appealed to the
behavior among the proponents of charity, stifles effective government intervention and co-opts radical groups that seek to promote progressive social change.

Wagner is polemical but appropriately hard-hitting. Focusing first on the historical development of philanthropy, he exposes the way Christian ‘altruism’ forced Native Americans to convert to Christianity, and then proceeded to enslave, dispossess and even kill them. He also shows how the industrial barons of the late 19th century used philanthropy for their own, self-serving purposes. These practices continue today on a vast scale but are heavily subsidized by tax payers, limiting alternative and potentially more effective public social service programs.

This book is to be commended for facilitating critical thinking about a topic severely lacking in critical analysis. It challenges the complacency which characterizes much of the literature on philanthropy today. Although it will outrage some, it is well written and engaging, and deserves extensive discussion. It should be prescribed reading for all social work students and those in non-profit management programs.


Although religious organizations have historically catered to the needy, the expansion of government social programs during the middle decades of this century gradually diminished their importance. It was widely accepted in social policy circles in the 1950s and 1960s that both secular and religious charitable effort would dwindle as government social programs expanded. This attitude was reinforced by the emergence of social work which promoted the professionalization of charitable activity. Help to those in need would not be provided by well-meaning individuals but by professionally qualified social workers, trained in scientific methods and skilled in solving human problems.

These beliefs were seriously challenged during the 1980s when politicians on the political right began systematically to attack both state social service provision and social welfare professionalization. Since President Reagan first appealed to the
religious community to assume a greater responsibility for social welfare, many conservative politicians have reiterated this idea. During the 2000 presidential campaign, candidate George W. Bush promised that, if elected, he would expand religious involvement in social welfare. Many conservative social policy thinkers have also criticized the role of social workers in the provision of social services. Social workers and bureaucrats, they claim, have failed miserably to solve the problem of social need. It is time, they contend, for the churches and temples once again to assume their historic responsibility for social welfare.

In view of these developments, Ram Cnaan and his colleagues have produced a timely book. It is also an important book. The authors show how the role of religious organizations in social welfare has been neglected and even slighted by advocates of state welfare and professional social work. However, the authors are optimistic, arguing that there is scope for a new partnership between professional social work and religious organizations. It is possible, they suggest, to forge a newer deal in which government, professional social workers and the religious community combine efforts to address the nation's pressing social needs. In addition to its hopeful outlook, the book is extremely well documented and comprehensive containing a wealth of detailed information on the complex relationship between social work and religion. It should not be viewed as a book for specialists interested in religious issues but as required reading for all social workers and those concerned with the future of social welfare.
CORRESPONDING AUTHORS

Chaim Zins, Ph.D.
Department of Human Services
Faculty of Social Welfare & Health Studies
University of Haifa
Mount Carmel, Haifa, 31905 Israel
email: chaimz@research.haifa.ac.il

Constance Phelps, MSW
127 W 106 Street
Apt. 4A
New York, NY 10023
email: phalker@aol.com

Daniel Montero, Ph.D.
Arizona State University
School of Social Work
Tempe, AZ 85287

Richard D. Sutphen, Ph.D.
Janet Ford, Ph.D.
University of Kentucky
College of Social Work
467 Patterson Office Tower
Lexington, KY 40506-0027
email: Sutphen@Pop.uky.edu

Richard K. Caputo
Yeshiva University
Wurzweiler School of Social Work
Belier Hall
2499 Amsterdam Ave.
New York, NY 10033-3299
email: caputo@yu.edu

José Paual Julian
Department of Applied Economics
University of Valencia
Spain

John Schafer, Ph.D.
Department of Psychology
University of Cincinnati
PO Box 210276
Cincinnati, OH 45221-0376
email: John.Schafer@uc.edu

Adam C. Carle, M.A.
Department of Psychology
Arizona State University
PO Box 187110
Tempe, AZ 85287-1104
email: Adam.Carle@asu.edu

Edward Scanlon, MSW, Ph.D.
University of Washington
School of Social Work
4101 15th Ave. NE
Seattle, WA 98105
email: escanlon@uw.washington.edu

Kevin Devine, MSW
Addictions Treatment Center
Veterans Administration Medical Center
1660 S. Columbian Way
Seattle, WA 98128

Andrew Batavia and
Richard Desaulnier
Florida International University
College of Health & Urban Affairs
2845 Prairie Ave.
Miami Beach, FL 33140
email: batavia1957@hotmail.com

Gary Paquin J.D., Ph.D.
School of Social Work
University of Cincinnati
PO Box 210108
Cincinnati, OH 45221-0108
email: Gary.Paquin@uc.edu
### JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND SOCIAL WELFARE
#### 2001 PUBLICATION INFORMATION & SUBSCRIPTION RATES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Volume:</th>
<th>XXVIII</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volume Year:</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Period:</td>
<td>1/01 to 12/01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of Publication:</td>
<td>QUARTERLY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Dates:</td>
<td>MARCH, JUNE, SEPTEMBER, DECEMBER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subscription Rates:</td>
<td>1. INDIVIDUAL IN U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. INDIVIDUAL OUTSIDE U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. INSTITUTION IN U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. INSTITUTION OUTSIDE U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postage:</td>
<td>INCLUDED IN PRICE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currency:</td>
<td>U.S. DOLLARS (Firm Exchange Rate Not Available)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payment:</td>
<td>PREPAYMENT (Must accompany order)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Year Sub. Rate:</td>
<td>NOT AVAILABLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cancellation Policy:</td>
<td>NONCANCELLABLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claim Policy:</td>
<td>FREE REPLACEMENT WITHIN SIX (6) MONTHS OF PUBLICATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Back Issues:</td>
<td>$15.00 PER ISSUE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSN:</td>
<td>0191-5096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax-Exempt Registry No.:</td>
<td>A-15961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Tax I.D. No.:</td>
<td>38-607327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index:</td>
<td>INCLUDED IN ISSUE NUMBER 4 AT NO EXTRA COST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact Person:</td>
<td>Frederick (Fritz) McDonal, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Editor:</td>
<td>Journal of Sociology &amp; Social Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Social Work:</td>
<td>1201 Oliver Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo, MI 49006-5034 USA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEL: 616-387-5205</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAX: 616-387-3217</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INSTRUCTIONS FOR AUTHORS
(Revised June, 2000)

JSJW welcomes a broad range of articles which analyze social welfare institutions, policies, or problems from a social scientific, perspective or otherwise attempt to bridge the gap between social science theory and social work practice.

Visit our website at: http://www.wmich.edu/hbs/NewslettersJournals/jssrv/index.htm

Submission Process. Submit manuscripts to Robert Leighninger, School of Social Work, Arizona State University, P.O. Box 871802, Tempe, AZ 85287-1802. Send three copies together with an abstract of approximately 100 words. Since manuscripts are not returned by reviewers to the editorial office, the editorial office cannot return them to the authors. Submission certifies that it is an original article and that it has not been published nor is being considered for publication elsewhere.

Reviewing normally takes 120 days.

Preparation. Articles should be typed, doublespaced (including the abstract, indented material, footnotes, references, and tables) on 8½ x 11 inch white bond paper with one inch margins on all sides.

Anonymous Review. To facilitate anonymous review, please keep identifying information out of the manuscript. Only the title should appear on the first page. Attach cover pages that contain the title, authors, affiliations, date of submission, mailing address, telephone number and any statements of credit or research support.

Style. Overall style should conform to that found in the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association, Fourth Edition, 1994. Use in-text citations (Reich, 1983), (Reich, 1983, p. 5). The use of footnotes in the text is discouraged. If footnotes are essential, include them on a separate sheet after the last page of the references. The use of italics or quotation marks for emphasis is discouraged. Words should be underlined only when it is intended that they be typeset in italics.

Gender and Disability Stereotypes. Please use gender neutral phrasing. Use plural pronouns and truly generic nouns ("labor force" instead of "manpower"). When dealing with disabilities, avoid making people synonymous with the disability they have ("employees with visual impairments" rather than "the blind"). Don't magnify the disabling condition ("wheelchair user" rather than "confined to a wheelchair"). For further suggestions see the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association or Guide to Non-Sexist Language and Visuals, University of Wisconsin-Extension.

BOOK REVIEWS

Books for review should be sent to James Midgley, School of Social Welfare University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720.

Founding Editors
Norman Goroff and Ralph Segalman