Characteristics and Human Skills of Women Who Manage Women: A Community College Case Study

Susan Young Duley
Western Michigan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/dissertations

Part of the Curriculum and Social Inquiry Commons, Educational Assessment, Evaluation, and Research Commons, and the Educational Leadership Commons

Recommended Citation
https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/dissertations/2124

This Dissertation-Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate College at ScholarWorks at WMU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at WMU. For more information, please contact wmu-scholarworks@wmich.edu.
CHARACTERISTICS AND HUMAN SKILLS OF WOMEN WHO MANAGE WOMEN:  
A COMMUNITY COLLEGE CASE STUDY

by

Susan Young Duley

A Dissertation
Submitted to the
Faculty of The Graduate College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Educational Leadership

Western Michigan University
Kalamazoo, Michigan
June 1989
A case study has been used to examine women administrators managing subordinate women managers in an educational organization. This study focused on four women administrators in a community college, including the president, vice-president, two deans, and subordinate women managers who report to the four women administrators.

Participant observations, interviews, and document analysis were supplemented by use of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) to investigate the research question: How do individual characteristics relate to management relationships of four women administrators working with subordinate women managers? Interviews, informal observations, and document analysis were also used to investigate the second research question: How do a subset of skills of management enacted by four women administrators, managing subordinate women managers, differ across individuals? The management skills investigated in this study were human skill behaviors related to motivation as defined by Argyris (1960), Herzberg (1959), and McGregor (1960) and human skill behaviors related to effective leadership as defined by Bennis (1982), Burns (1978), Josefowitz (1980), and Kanter (1987).

All four women administrators lacked a strong father figure during their childhood years. In contrast to the absence of a strong...
father figure was the appearance of a strong mother figure.

Data appeared to support the concept that opposites on the Myers-Briggs tend to have a more positive management relationship than do similar Myers-Briggs types.

The skills of management of the four women administrators who were studied did not appear to differ across individuals.

This study focused on four top level women administrators in one community college and their relationships with women who were their immediate subordinates. Men did exist in the setting of the study as immediate subordinates to the top level women, but were not included in the study. The study did not attend to female-male managerial relationships.

The case study examined the life-world of four women administrators managing subordinate women managers in order to examine the management of women by women and to generate hypotheses for further study. Further study of management of women by women is recommended in order to better understand this manager:subordinate relationship.
INFORMATION TO USERS

The most advanced technology has been used to photograph and reproduce this manuscript from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book. These are also available as one exposure on a standard 35mm slide or as a 17" x 23" black and white photographic print for an additional charge.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
University Microfilms International
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Characteristics and human skills of women who manage women:
A community college case study

Duley, Susan Inge Young, Ed.D.

Western Michigan University, 1989
DEDICATION

For the Women in my Life . . .
My mother, Eileen,
my very best friend . . .

My sister, Sherron,
always there . . .

My daughter, Linda,
my constant supporter . . .

My granddaughter, Kate,
my equal in sun sign . . .

My aunt, Minnie,
on her eightieth year . . .

My niece, Rebecca,
my helper in research . . .

My niece, Cynthia,
my carbon in life . . .

My niece, Michelle,
my resident artist . . .

My neighbor, Charlotte,
my trusted advisor . . .

My sisters in education,
my reason for trying . . .

My sisters in friendship,
my treasures on earth.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many have been helpful to me as I made this often lonely journey—thank you for your vigil and support.

Others made this study possible. To these women who participated in the study and who shall remain nameless, I owe heartfelt gratitude. Their willingness to open their institution and share their world provided me with far more than a setting for my research.

I am also grateful to some very special individuals whose help and encouragement made this journey easier. I wish to thank Gerri Brotherton and Lee Pakko, for typing from my handwriting—a feat in itself. Encouraging me throughout my doctoral program and as my dissertation chair was Dr. James Sanders. Challenging my perspective and helping me direct my study was Dr. J. M. Keenan. Steering me toward my personal goals was Dr. Charles Warfield. Thank you.

And, above all, it is my family to whom I owe my largest debt of gratitude. Lee, my husband, gave up seeing friends, seeing family, and seeing me because I was studying or writing. His courageous battle with cancer, which abruptly halted the editing of this dissertation, gave me the courage to return to its completion. Lee never faltered in his battle or in his encouragement and support of me. My sons, David and Jonathan, gave up their mother—David at one when I returned to school to earn a bachelor's degree and Jonathan throughout his entire life of 10 years. It is to them that I return. I return to their school functions, to their tennis matches, swim
meets, ball games, golf tournaments, and to weekend trips to Blue Lake. Most of all I return to them emotionally. I return to give nourishment, support, caring, and love. I return to the few short years that remain before David is gone, and Jonathan is half way out the door.

Susan Young Duley
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ................................................. ii
LIST OF TABLES ................................................. vii
LIST OF FIGURES ................................................... viii
CHAPTER

I. INTRODUCTION ............................................. 1
   Context of the Problem ................................ 1
   The Research Problem ................................ 2
   Definitions .......................................... 3
   Research Objectives .................................. 5
   Conceptual Framework ................................ 6
   Limitations of the Study ............................ 6
   Overview ............................................. 10

II. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ................................. 11
   An Historical Perspective ............................ 13
   Women in Administration Positions in Higher Education ............................................. 15
   Developing Women Into Managers ..................... 17
      Managerial Potential .............................. 18
      Coaching and Role Modeling ....................... 32
      Observation and Experience ....................... 33
      Managerial Performance: Success or Failure ... 38
      Summary ........................................... 43

III. RESEARCH METHODS ........................................ 46
Table of Contents—Continued

CHAPTER

Subjects (Principal Informants) ..................... 46
Research Design ...................................... 46
Instrumentation ...................................... 49
Data Collection ...................................... 53
Data Analysis ...................................... 57

IV. FINDINGS ................................................. 59

The Setting ........................................ 59
The Time ............................................. 63
The College and Its Values ............................ 65
The Main Subjects .................................... 69

Dr. Kathryn Page, President, Courtney College .. 71
Victoria Hope, Vice-President, Student and
Community Services ................................ 77
Elizabeth Knight: Dean, Occupational Studies .. 79
Mary Scott, Dean, Library and Learning
Resources ............................................. 81
Subordinate Women Managers Who Report to the
Four Women Administrators ........................... 83

Individual Characteristics of the Main Subjects:
Myers-Briggs Type Indicator .......................... 86

Individual Characteristics of the Subordinates:
Myers-Briggs Type Indicator .......................... 93

Individual Characteristics and How They Appear to
Relate to Management Relationships: Myers-
Briggs Type Indicator ................................. 93

Selected Management Skills of the Main Subjects—
Four Women Administrators .......................... 95
Table of Contents--Continued

CHAPTER

The President ........................................ 95
The Vice-President ................................. 107
The Dean, Occupational Studies ................. 109
The Dean, Library and Learning Resources ...... 111

V. CONCLUSIONS ......................................... 113

Findings About Women to Women Management
Relationships at Courtney College ............... 113

The Apparent Relevance of Individual MBTI
Characteristics ................................. 113

Work Experiences: Women to Women .............. 116

Management Skills of Four Women Administrators . 119

Hypotheses ....................................... 121

Implications for Future Research ................ 121

APPENDICES ........................................ 122

A. Interview Guides for Women Administrators .... 123
B. Management Skills--Administrator .............. 126
C. Facts About the Courtney College Millage .... 130
D. Release Form .................................... 135
E. Participants' Scores on the MBTI ............... 137

BIBLIOGRAPHY ....................................... 139
LIST OF TABLES

1. Internal Consistency of Continuous Scores Based on Coefficient Alpha ........................................ 52

2. Student’s Paths to Courtney Community College ............. 60
LIST OF FIGURES

1. Management Skills Necessary at Various Levels of an Organization ............................................... 7

2. The 16 Myers-Briggs Types .................................................. 8

3. Developing Women Into Managers ........................................... 18

4. Communication Content and Style ........................................... 31

5. Brief Descriptions of the 16 Myers-Briggs Types ....................... 50

6. Chronology of Collection Events ........................................... 56

7. Courtney College Campus Map .............................................. 61

8. Research Participants and Reporting Lines ................................ 70

9. Manager and Subordinate Type Relationship ................................ 94

10. Mutual Usefulness of the Opposites Using the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator .............................................. 96

11. Women Administrators to Subordinate Women Managers—Mutual Usefulness of the Opposites Using the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator .............................................. 97
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Context of the Problem

"Since the early 1970's, more and more women have been entering the labor force with definite aspirations of upward mobility toward management or administrative positions" (Donnell & Hall, 1980, p. 1). This trend is a function of federal legislation prohibiting sex discrimination in employment and promotion practices, the affirmative action program advocated by the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, and changing cultural values concerning the role of women in society (White, DeSanctis, & Crino, 1981).

"There does seem to be a tacitly agreed upon assumption that women differ from men in administering the management process" (Donnell & Hall, 1980, p. 1). No one is quite sure how women differ from men but some believe the difference is there and some are pessimistic about women's managerial capabilities (Donnell & Hall, 1980). There have been volumes of past research examining sex differences in leadership and management to provide answers to the question: Do men and women differ in behavior or effectiveness when in a managerial position (Dobbins & Platz, 1986)? The large number of research projects on this topic substantiates the interest in studying whether there are sex differences in managerial performance.
Donnell and Hall (1980) concluded: "Women in general do not differ from men, in general, in the ways in which they administer in the management process" (p. 8). This conclusion was based on a review of five different studies involving almost 2,000 people compared on a total of 43 different scales.

There is reason to believe, however, that gender of subordinates could make a difference in the enactment of management (Hammer, 1978). Hammer reported a few cases concerning women with power over other women and cases of women as managers of female employees. In these studies women managers were able to share the turf or accommodate each other's goals and not act "like the boss." They were able to use their power, not anger, to accomplish tasks.

Qualities thought to be essential to women managers managing females were studied (Williams, 1977). Women managers managing females must be patient, have a strong sense of self-confidence, be a survivor, and be supportive to other females.

The Research Problem

The present study was designed to answer the following questions in one organizational setting: (a) How do individual characteristics relate to the management relationships of four women administrators working with subordinate women managers in a community college setting? (b) How do a subset of skills of management (human skills) enacted by four women administrators, managing subordinate women managers, differ across individuals in a community college setting?
A community college is one of the many settings in which skills of management could be explored. The community college is one type of postsecondary educational institution and is a setting in which women hold management positions. From 1972 to 1981, the percentage of all employed administrators and managers in the United States who are women rose from 17.6% to 27.5%, an increase of 9.9%. Typical of this trend is the gain in the number and percentage of female administrators in K-12 school districts and two year institutions: "over 156,000 women or 36.3 percent in 1981 as compared to 79,000 or 26.0 percent in 1971" (Epstein & Wood, 1984, p. 21). "In spite of this progress the same phenomenon is not true in two year institutions" (Eliason, 1980, p. 2). "Only eight percent of community college CEOs are women and women academic deans represent only 15.9% of community college academic deans in the United States" (Epstein & Wood, 1984, p. 19).

Definitions

The following definitions are used in this research project:

1. Individual characteristics of women administrators were those measured using the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI). These characteristics include the following: extroversion (E) versus introversion (I), sensation (S) versus intuition (N), thinking (T) versus feeling (F), and judgment (J) versus perception (P).

2. Women administrators in this study are limited to women in the positions of dean, vice-president, and president at one community college. Limiting the number of informants and settings facilitated
the in-depth case study. There are four women administrators at the college which include the president, vice-president, and two deans who are the total population of top women administrators at the college.

3. Management is defined as working with and through individuals and groups to accomplish organizational goals using technical, human, and conceptual skills. These skills are described as:

Technical skill—Ability to use knowledge, methods, techniques, and equipment necessary for the performance of specific tasks acquired from experience, education, and training.

Human skill—Ability and judgment in working with and through people, including an understanding of motivation and an application of effective leadership.

Conceptual skill—Ability to understand the complexities of the overall organization and where one's own operation fits into the organization. The knowledge permits one to act according to the objectives of the total organization rather than only on the basis of the goals and needs of one's own immediate group. (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982, p. 5)

For purposes of this study management focused on a subset of human skills, namely, being considerate and supportive, recognizing subordinates' achievements, providing responsibility opportunities, growth and advancement, practicing participative management, management by objectives, setting high performance goals, providing flexible roles, open communication, a reliance on self-direction, and using teams and committees. Other human skills include: an understanding of personal roles and the needs of individuals; using the potential of each individual; recognizing the needs of groups; using good judgment; possessing intellectual efficiency; treating people
fairly; empowering others; being innovative; communicating so uncer
tainties are reduced; being transformational; moving the organiza-
tion toward goals and measuring their attainment; managing attention,
meaning, trust, and self; being a risk taker; and seeing the big picture.

4. Subordinate women managers are defined as women under the au-
thority of and who report to the four women administrators in the com-
community college. It excludes clerical, secretarial, and support staff. These subordinates were identified by the four women adminis-
trators participating in the research study. There are eight sub-
ordinate women managers reporting to the four women administrators.
Two of the women administrators (the vice-president and one dean) are also direct subordinates to the president and vice-president, respec-
tively.

Research Objectives

The purposes of this study are:

1. To describe how individual characteristics relate to man-
agement relationships of four women administrators working with sub-
ordinate women managers in a community college setting.

2. To describe how a subset of skills of management (human skills) enacted by four women administrators, managing subordinate women managers, differ across individuals in a community college setting.

3. To develop hypotheses about characteristics and human skills of women who manage in a community college setting that may be tested
Conceptual Framework

One focus of this study is on a subset of skills of management enacted by certain women administrators managing subordinate women managers in a community college setting. The specific focus on human skills of management is important. According to a report by the American Management Association (cited in Hersey & Blanchard, 1982), an overwhelming majority of the 200 managers who participated in the survey agreed that the most important single skill of an executive is his or her ability to get along with people. In this survey, management rated this ability more vital than intelligence, decisiveness, knowledge, or job skills. Figure 1 illustrates management skills necessary at various levels of an organization.

A second focus of this study is on individual characteristics (as defined by the Myers-Briggs) of managers and subordinates in a particular setting. This helped to study patterns of individual types when women manage women. The individual types are described in Figure 2.

Limitations of the Study

A limitation of this study is that it is concentrated on one case setting, limiting the generalizability of the findings to other women-to-women management situations. This case study does provide information for planning further investigations; the study is limited as to its representativeness.
Management levels

Top management

Middle management

Supervisory management

Figure 1. Management Skills Necessary at Various Levels of an Organization.

The standardized directions of the MBTI were given to the participants. There is some uncertainty about what context they used in completing the instrument. Under different situations the responses may differ.

The MBTI can also be influenced by social desirability of the responses. As with the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI), the extent that responses are unfavorable ones, acquiescence could lead to elevated scores (Thorndike & Hagen, 1977).

The MBTI scores were developed into dichotomous scores even when a clear type was not indicated.
ENTJ
Intuitive, innovative ORGANIZER

ISFP
Observant, loyal HELPER

ESTJ
Fact-minded, practical ORGANIZER

INFP
Imaginative, independent HELPER

INTP
Inquisitive ANALYZER

ESFJ
Practical HARMONIZER and worker-with-people

ISTP
Practical ANALYZER

ENFJ
Imaginative HARMONIZER and worker-with-people

ESTP
REALISTIC ADAPTER in the world of material things

INFJ
People-oriented INNOVATOR of ideas

ESFP
REALISTIC ADAPTER in human relationships

INTJ
Logical, critical, decisive INNOVATOR of ideas

ISTJ
Analytical MANAGER OF FACTS AND DETAILS

ENFP
Warmly enthusiastic PLANNER OF CHANGE

ISFJ
Sympathetic MANAGER OF FACTS AND DETAILS

ENTP
Inventive, analytical PLANNER OF CHANGE

Figure 2. The 16 Myers-Briggs Types.
The MBTI was used for looking at one type of interrelationship out of many that could be studied. This is the "mutual usefulness of opposite types." This was done based on literature that suggests this as an important relationship (Desjardins & Bulpitt, 1987).

Another limitation is that the study focused on the four top level women administrators in one community college and their relationships with women who were their immediate subordinates. Men did exist in the setting of the study as immediate subordinates to the top level women, but the two male deans and male vice-president were not included in the study. The study did not attend to female-male managerial relationships.

The two women deans and the female vice-president were both managers and subordinates. This study looked at their roles as both.

Eight women were subordinates to the women deans and vice-president. They were also managers of others. This study looked at their roles only as subordinates to the women deans and vice-president.

In qualitative research it is impossible to separate the researcher from the research. The researcher is an integral part of observation and interpretation of those observations. Acknowledgment of biases that the researcher may have entering into and throughout this research is important. If a bias existed, it is in sympathy with the belief that there are pressures on women managers to prove themselves that go beyond the normal pressures on all managers. This potential source of bias was addressed through the use of triangulation and confirmation steps in the research process.
Overview

The purpose of this chapter has been to orient the reader to the background, purpose, and importance of this study. Chapter II contains a review of literature available on related topics. Chapter III contains a discussion of the design and methodology used in the study. The findings are described in Chapter IV. The study is concluded with Chapter V where the findings and implications for future research are discussed.
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

The process of literature review employed a search of several sources with key descriptors: management, management characteristics, management styles, management development, manager personalities, administrators, administrator characteristics, administrator personalities, leadership, leadership styles, leadership characteristics, leadership personality traits, effective leadership, and the same descriptors using male and female as limitations. The literature that was identified related to personal characteristics and human skills of managers in general and those unique to women and men.

Secondary and primary resources were located through manual searches of the card catalogue, Psychological Abstract, Women's Studies Abstracts, Resources in Education, Current Index of Journals in Education, the Business Review Index, and numerous bibliography listings concerning women in management.

Computer searches covered the following databases: Educational Research Information Center (ERIC), National Testing Informational Service (NTIS), Data Courier Inc., Information Technologies, Business Resource Services (BRS) Information Systems, Catalyst Resources for Women, American Business Index (ABI) (Business Database), Dissertation Abstracts, Management Contents, and Dialog. A review of related

11
literature was useful in identifying factors to be explored in the study of women managing other women.

The literature on women as managers is organized by the following headings:

I. An historical perspective
II. Women in administration positions in higher education
III. Developing women into managers
   A. Managerial potential
      1. Sex-role stereotyping and socialization
      2. Socialization and leadership
      3. Attitudes concerning women managers
      4. Personal characteristics of effective male and female managers
      5. Behavioral styles of managers
   B. Coaching and role modeling
   C. Observation and experience
   D. Socialization and setting of expectations and aspirations
   E. Managerial performance

The review of the literature covers many issues that have been explored concerning women in positions of management. These subtopics include an historical perspective and many subjects related to the development of effective women managers.
An Historical Perspective

The history of women in business, especially as managers, has remained somewhat hidden (Brown, 1981). Standard primary sources on American business history tended to exclude women from their pages or to define the achievements of women in other economic terms. Interpretations of history have included the stereotypical notion that women were in the home and not actively engaged in business. Interest in the history of women in business has led to books and articles which relied on scarce sources in order to indicate the extent and importance of women's participation in the economic sphere of American society (Brown, 1981). Bird (1976), in Enterprising Women, profiled women who had made important contributions to American business, the women who initiated concepts that created new kinds of work or affected the rules of the economic game.

Schneir's (1980) work identifies the early economic role of the "she merchants" of 17th century New York. This group included such women as Maria van Cortlandt, who owned and managed a Hudson Valley patroonship, an estate of three quarters of a million acres, and Margaret Hardenbrook, who operated a fleet of merchant ships engaged in international commerce. Information gathered from advertisements in colonial newspapers, customs reports, and other sources indicates that by the early 18th century, women played an important and commonly accepted role in the colonies as merchants. Merchants were considered part of the upper classes of that period. Most women merchants were widows who inherited their businesses after the death
of a spouse but there were a number of single women who, without the
disdain of the society in which they lived and worked, successfully
undertook to manage large businesses. Merchants were distinguished
from shopkeepers (who were considered part of the middle class and
contained an even larger percentage of women) in that they imported
and exported goods as well as wholesaling and retailing them
(Schneir, 1980).

Female merchants were active in many colonial cities. In pre­
revolutionary Boston, Dexter (cited in Schneir, 1980) estimated that
9.5% of the traders—that is, merchants and shopkeepers—were women.
In colonial New York City, approximately 2% of the merchants were
women, a percentage equal to that of women holding top-level manage­
ment positions in the United States in the 1970s. Historian Jordan
(cited in Schneir, 1980) commented on this comparison:

To put (these figures) in perspective, it must be remem­
bered that merchants were at the summit of the colonial
economy. In today's vastly larger and more complex econo­
my, positions of comparable power and prestige would be
those of president or chairman of the board of major
business corporations. . . . Women apparently are only now
winning the proportion of high level economic positions
they had in the colonial period. (p. 15)

The increased number of women in the work force in the 20th century
and their changing roles illustrates the importance of their history.
To understand the influence that women may exert, knowledge of their
proven abilities as recorded in history is essential.
Women in Administration Positions in Higher Education

The transition of women to administration positions in higher education emerged at colleges and universities founded for the education of women. Another factor was a result of the period of World War II, when the drain on the manpower pool required women to fill many positions previously reserved exclusively for men (Brown, 1981).

Since 1970 there have been rising pressures from the government and women's rights groups upon higher education institutions to attract more women members of the education profession. Institutions of higher education at large have been urged to attract more women into key decision-making positions and, therefore, to make available more career options for women in higher education. Educational administration is dominated by males, protected by custom, professional organizations, and governmental agencies at all levels (Freeman, 1977). Research conducted by Bayer and Astin (1975) and Howard and Downey (1980) found that women held more teaching positions in higher education than they had earlier, but still held fewer administrative positions.

The two-year college is one of the areas where women higher education administrators are few in number compared to male administrators. For example, in 1982 only 48 women held president's positions in the 1,200 community and junior colleges in the United States ("Women Chief Executive Officers," 1982). In 1984 only 286 women served as presidents of the 3,325 institutions of higher education in the United States (Ottinger, 1987).
In Michigan, women accounted for only 15.2% of top-level administrators at community colleges in 1987 (Treml, 1987). In May 1980, in a speech about issues related to women administrators at two-year colleges, Carol Eliason, Director of the American Association of Community and Junior Colleges' (AACJC) Center for Women's Opportunities, told her audience:

Although women have been joining the nation's labor force in ever increasing numbers, they are not yet well represented in the top management of two year colleges. . . . The characteristic feature of women in the labor force at large still characterizes the female in two year college management--severe occupational segregation. (p. 1)

The lack of women in top management seem to be crucial for two reasons:

1. Since women are not usually hired for top level positions, their absence tends to reinforce either the stereotype that men are more competent or that the positions are not women's jobs (Pulliam, 1984).

2. Another part of the problem is that underrepresentation also tends to persist in a pattern of circular socialization. Many women internalize the stereotypes by not supporting, hiring, or promoting other women (Pulliam, 1984). This means that the socialization of women toward top level positions does not increase.

In a report on women community college presidents, Taylor (1981) provided data concerning the background of expertise of these women, as well as information concerning their attitudes and expectations. Taylor's research suggested five factors as limitations to women's career advancement: (a) marital responsibilities, (b) maternal
responsibilities, (c) disenfranchisement from informal networks, (d) women's views of themselves as helpers and assistants rather than as managers or executives, and (e) men's attitudes which continue to give preference to other men seeking advancement. Women college administrators are typical of professional women in general (Taylor, 1981).

Developing Women Into Managers

A strategic model (Figure 3) presented by Herbert and Yost (1978) highlighted steps toward developing women into managers. The model provides an approach for reviewing the literature concerning women as managers. Identifying and understanding the variables that may effect performance as women managers is an important step in understanding how women managers relate to other women managers.

What follows is a review of considerations in the development of a woman manager that are potentially relevant to the development of women managers in the community college setting. These include a discussion of the elements of managerial potential (sex-role stereotyping and socialization, socialization and leadership, attitudes, personal characteristics, behavioral styles), organizational entry, coaching and role modeling, training and development, observation and experience, socialization and setting of expectations and aspirations, and managerial performance: success or failure. Certain boxes (B-school, organizational entry, and training and development) were not described in this report. The literature related to those boxes is not reviewed herein.
Managerial Potential

Herbert and Yost (1978) offered the following strategy:

The assessment of managerial potential is vital to the overall process, for neither all men nor all women possess the capability nor desire to be effective managers; desire to be a manager may be token effectiveness but is not sufficient. Given the effect on other women's aspirations to management, assessment becomes even more important. With requisite minimum amounts of managerial potential, two routes are available, direct entry into organizations or a side trip to the college of business administration for preparation for organizational entry. (p. 24).
Sex-role Stereotyping and Socialization

In the United States, people are socialized primarily within the nuclear family in a culture that defines sex roles as total roles that define our sense of self and our behavior. The sex role pertains to all aspects of life and takes precedence over situation-specific work roles if they are incompatible. Dominance and independence are associated with the masculine roles; submissiveness, passivity, and nurturance, with feminine. Desirable femininity, culturally defined, emphasizes giving and the avoidance of aggressiveness and domination (Broverman, Broverman, Clarkson, & Rosenkrantz, 1972). Even the exceptions seem to be a consequence of the differences in the nuclear family in which the woman was raised. Women who chose traditional careers historically occupied by men tended to be raised in families in which the mother worked full time (Broverman et al., 1972; Almquist, 1974). Nuclear families may discourage women from choosing nontraditional careers; Goodale and Hall (1976) found that high school students of both sexes had similar aspirations for college and career choice, yet male students perceived more parental interest and pressure to pursue their aspiration.

A sex-role stereotype that came out of a study by Broverman et al. (1972) asked 100 college students to indicate on which characteristics, attitudes, and behaviors men and women differed. A second group then rated the extent to which the items mentioned most frequently by the first group were typical of adult men or women. The researchers concluded that the female role found the women to be less
aggressive, dependent, and emotional. She did not hide her emotions, was subjective, easily influenced, submissive, and enjoyed art and literature but not math and science. She was excitable in minor crises, passive, not competitive, illogical, home-oriented, unskilled in business, sneaky, and unfamiliar with the ways of the world. Her feelings were easily hurt. She was unadventurous, indecisive, cried easily, almost never acted as a leader, and lacked self-confidence. She was uncomfortable about being aggressive, unambitious, unable to separate feelings from ideas, conceited about appearance, talkative, tactful, gentle, aware of other's feelings, religious, interested in her own appearance, neat, quiet, strong in need for security, and easily expressed tender feelings.

Socialization and Leadership

Status and sex-role stereotyping handicap the elevation of women to leadership of management positions. However, socialization as a female itself contributes to reduced motivation to attain higher-level posts (Estler, 1975). On the average, women's self-confidence is lower than that of male counterparts. According to Maccoby and Jacklin (1974), females have less confidence in their abilities across a wide variety of activities such as in achieving good grades, in tasks requiring manual dexterity, in solving puzzles, and in dealing with emergencies. In fact, women's self-confidence is increased with the incorporation of more of the stereotyped masculine traits into their own self-concept. Heinmen, McGlauchin, Legeros, and Freeman (1975) suggested that women managers have particular
difficulty in dealing with interpersonal conflict among subordinates due to their socialization which encourages them to avoid confrontation. In a study by Rosenfeld and Fowler (1976), some differences emerged for self-described ideal leader scores of 89 men and 89 women in the behaviors of democratic men and women, although the results for the autocratic styles were the same for both groups. Democratic women emphasized being helpful, affectionate, nurturing, open-minded, and accepting blame; democratic men emphasized being mature, forceful, competent, moral, utilitarian, analytical, and valuing people.

Larwood and Wood (1977) found that women differ from men in traits of consequence to leadership such as need for achievement, fear of success, assertiveness, self-esteem, need for power, need for dominance, self-reliance, dependence, risk preferences, and competitiveness which may result in women, when placed in leadership roles. Women fail to seek their maximum advantage and reach compromises too quickly when cooperation is required.

Sutton and Moore (1985) compared executive women in 1965 to executive women in 1985. In 1965, 50% of the women surveyed agreed that women want positions of authority compared to 1985, when over 90% of women surveyed agreed that women want positions of authority.

**Attitudes Concerning Women Managers**

Assessment of women managers can take on many approaches. Attitudes concerning women as managers play a significant role.

Attitudes toward women in the business workplace have changed over the past 20 years. Lee (1986) reported the findings of a 1985
survey compared to a 1965 survey:

1. The percentage of male executives who felt either strongly or mildly unfavorable toward women executives dropped from 41% in 1965 to just 5% in 1985. Only 3% of female executives reported unfavorable feelings toward others of their gender in 1985, compared with 7% in 1965.

2. Almost half (47%) of the 1985 male respondents said they would be comfortable working with a female boss, compared with 27% in 1965. The corresponding findings for women increased from 75% to 85%.

3. In 1965, half of the men and one-quarter of the women agreed that women are temperamentally unfit for management. In 1985, 82% of the men and 95% of the women rejected that idea.

4. An overwhelming majority (90% of the men and 88% of the women) in 1965 agreed that "a woman has to be exceptional to succeed in business today." In 1985, 59% of the men and 83% of the women still think so.

5. In 1965, better than 60% of the male and nearly half of the female respondents agreed that "the business community will never wholly accept women." Twenty years later, two in 10 men and four in 10 women still believe it. (p. 27)

Men's attitudes appear to have changed more than women's. Men have faced working with women. Much resistance to female managers is still evident (Lee, 1986). The percentage of executives who think women are uncomfortable working for other women rose by 10% from 1965 to 1985 (Sutton & Moore, 1985).

Wexley and Pulakos (1983) examined the subordinates' perceptual congruence, which is the extent to which subordinates accurately perceive their managers' work related attitudes. They studied the subordinates appraisal of their managers for the four possible manager-subordinate sex combinations (i.e., male-male, male-female, female-male, and female-female). The results of the study indicated
that the more cognizant a subordinate is of his or her manager's work-related attitudes, the more favorably the subordinate appraised the manager's leadership performance. This phenomenon seemed to occur reliably in similar-sex dyads but was not consistent in mixed-sex dyads (Wexley & Pulakos, 1983).

Steckler and Rosenthal (1985) investigated differences in nonverbal and verbal communication with bosses, peers, and subordinates. They reported that men and women differed differentially in the degree of competence they communicated as they talked to their bosses, peers, and subordinates. Women were perceived as more competent when they talked to their bosses and subordinates and less competent when talking to their peers. Men were perceived as less competent when they talked to their bosses and more competent when they talked to their peers and subordinates. Women subordinates may challenge a female boss's authority or not cooperate with her as she would with a male boss (Kanter, 1977) because the female boss may assert her authority particularly strongly in communicating with her subordinate.

Attitudinal barriers toward managerial potential and performance continue to be an important area of research regarding the advancement of American women into managerial and administrative positions (Beutell, 1984). Attitudes toward women as managers by both women and men was summarized by Burrows (1978):

Positive attitudes must begin with an affirmative self-image of the women as manager, must be strengthened by the confidence they and others show in their abilities, must be affirmed through assertiveness and professionalism in their
work, and should find ultimate expression in the assumption of leadership.

It is still necessary for many of us, men and women alike, to change our attitudes about the managerial capabilities of women. The situation won't improve much if we give women the opportunity for managerial experience and then sit back and watch to see how soon or how spectacularly they fail. . . .

Remember, it's far easier for a woman to maintain positive confident concepts about herself if her colleagues reinforce those attitudes. If they don't— if a woman manager's peers have conflicting or negative notions about her being at once female and manager— she will have to be superconfident just to hold her own. (pp. 22-28)

Further understanding of these attitudes requires an approach from three different perspectives: (a) attitudes held by women managers, (b) attitudes held toward women managers by subordinates, and (c) attitudes held toward women managers by female subordinates.

Tokenism has been one explanation offered for the presence of women executives (Kanter, 1977). If women managers at the middle levels are perceived as tokens, the affective relationship between them and their role set members may also be constrained. Peers, especially, may have greater dislike for women managers when they are seen as direct competitors for scarce organizational rewards such as high level management positions. The small number of women executives also may make them more noticeable for attribution of negative feelings (Kanter, 1977). If "similarity attracts," then superiors, the majority of whom are males, may prefer their male over their female subordinates.

Bartol (1977) found if the subordinates' sex is not considered, generally little difference has been found in actual subordinate
satisfaction with female as compared to male supervisors. She reported that subordinate attitudes were a complex interaction of the sex composition of the subordinate groups and the leader's sex. In a laboratory study of 72 teams of male cadets led by males or females, Rice, Bender, and Vitters (1980) found that male subordinates with traditional attitudes toward women were lower in overall team morale when led by women. Traditionalists attributed group success more to luck and less to the leader's hard work when led by a woman. For those subordinates with liberal attitudes, the leader's sex did not matter as much. At the same time, male subordinates believed that women leaders were more important to their own individual performance.

A typology based on systematic research (Kanter, 1976) found four stereotypes of lady bosses as they related to predominantly male cohorts: "mother," the caretaker; "pet," the little sister or mascot of the group; and "sex object," who fails to establish herself as a professional. The "iron maiden" tries too hard to establish herself as a professional and comes to be seen as more tyrannical than she intends to be or really is.

Women who work for women usually fall into two categories. That is, they either adore the manager or abhor the manager (Williams, 1977). Experts believe that the reason women often resent working for other women is because girls more resented being disciplined by their mothers than boys did (Williams, 1977). The intricate dynamics of a mother-daughter relationship are often replayed when one woman works for another (Williams, 1977). Kanter (1982) reported that as
an adult daughter moves into working relationships with other women, she carries unmet needs, fears, and hopes that formed her relationship with her mother.

In 1977, Williams claimed that there are three things that a woman manager must do to gain the support of her women employees. First, the manager must demonstrate that she will use her power to help them. Second is that the women employees must feel that the manager will be helpful to them. Third is that the manager must work to develop the skills of their women employees.

Personal Characteristics of Effective Male and Female Managers

The typical American image of a manager is masculine; however, the individual tasks included in management are not strongly identified with either sex unless they are in the context of the managerial role. The ideal manager is perceived as male in character: competitive, aggressive, dominant, firm, vigorous, and rational. Against this standard, women are perceived as inadequate because they are characterized as not competitive, valuing social skills, person-oriented, emotional, unambitious, and dependent (Brown, 1981). Other studies have shown that both male and female managers have characteristics required for effective performance as managers, such as potential capability, cooperativeness and understanding, and competitive drive and leadership ability (Dubno, 1985).

Personal characteristics of women in management have been investigated. Wood (1978) conducted interviews with 100 women in the Los Angeles area who held management positions. Her primary question was
"What does it take for a woman to make it in management" (p. 26)?

The interview indentified these 10 major characteristics: competence, education, realism, aggressiveness, self-confidence, career-mindedness, femininity, strategy, support of an influential male, and uniqueness.

Massengill and DiMarco (1979) reported that female subjects agreed that women are lacking in the characteristics of successful managers in one area—that of dominant aggressive characteristics. Another area in which only the male subjects perceived significant differences was in ego strength. Thus males appear to perceive women to lack the ability to withstand the high degree of demands and pressures typically found in many managerial positions. On the other hand, the one area in which women are perceived to possess a greater degree of characteristics (but only by female subjects) seems to be peripheral to the qualities of a successful manager—social-humanitarian.

Kanter (1977) examined two principal questions about women who lead in all-female groups: (a) Were there identifiable "female" styles of leadership that confirmed psychological arguments about sex differences or accounted for the absence of women in leadership roles in mixed-sex settings? (b) Was hierarchical domination less important in all-female settings? (c) Was there a highly collectivist-participatory organization structure, where status differences were officially eliminated? In reporting the findings about female styles of leadership, Kanter found that structure shaped behavior. When working on a task there was little that was especially noteworthy.
about the way women did it. There were differences in overall inter-
actional style based on the organizational culture of the groups,
reinforcing the conclusion that tasks and task organization are
important in shaping organizational behavior. In exploring the sec-
ond question it was found that men do not have a monopoly on domi-
nance hierarchies or dominance-signaling behaviors. Through observa-
tions it was conformed that some women dominated other women the way
some men do in rigid organizations and made gestures to each other
like those same men make to women.

In general, Kanter (1977) reported that women who lead were
sometimes very different from each other and sometimes not very
different from men as leaders. Individual differences were more
striking than sex differences. She reported that:

The effectiveness of women leaders, . . . like that of men,
is a response to opportunities for power, to a favorable
position in the power structure. Both men and women can
exercise their authority more productively and with better
response when they have power behind it. This, too, is a
standard organizational cycle: power breeds effectiveness
at getting results, which enhances power. But psychologi-
cal "sex differences" seem to play a limited role, if any,
once women are given a chance and access to power.
(p. 303)

In the literature on managerial image a model under discussion
in the 1980s is that of the androgynous manager. The androgynous
manager is seen as a mixture of male and female attributes in an
individual, as representing a more flexible standard of psychological
health than sex typed behavior (Brown, 1981). Since researchers have
observed an association between androgyny and more effective behavior
in a variety of nonorganizational settings, they began to suggest the
applicability of the concept to the corporate situation: The more successful manager may also be androgynous. Researchers who used this concept have chosen to stress different aspects of the male/female mixture for the androgynous manager. Butler (1976) emphasized the need for women with traditional female traits (e.g., yielding, soft-spoken) to acquire the characteristics of self-assertiveness associated with men. In this way, women could become androgynous and freely express themselves without regard to whether their behavior is masculine or feminine.

These findings help to confirm that effective managers are androgynous managers—people who have learned and value both "masculine" and "feminine" behaviors, fatherly styles and maternal behaviors, competition and maternal behaviors, and competition and cooperation. This androgyny is an archetype that represents the coming together of maleness and femaleness (Sargent, 1978).

Behavioral Styles of Managers

Another focus of the study of management is on "behavioral styles." This concept is central to management, both male and female, in all situations (Baird & Bradley, 1979). Hennig and Jardim (1977) defined behavioral styles as follows: "refers to behavior in a work situation which appeared to contribute to these men's and women's executive success" (p. 72).

Behavioral style is important to male and female executives, who have been shown to spend from 66% to 75% of their time dealing with interpersonal relations in some form (Hennig & Jardim, 1977).
Since the crucial issue for a woman may lie in getting others to accept any women, however superior, in what they consider to be an exclusively male role, behavioral style is a factor even more critically important to women executives than it is to men (Hennig & Jardim, 1977, p. 72).

A thorough understanding of female management in organizations, then, must spring from analyses of female executives' "behavioral styles," or the ways in which they interact with other organizational members (Baird & Bradley, 1979).

In a study by Baird and Bradley (1979), an 18-item questionnaire was developed to measure managerial communication behaviors. The first 15 items were measures of communicative behavior, with the first 5 assessing communication content or the sorts of functions played by managerial communication, and the next 10 exploring communication style, or the manner in which the content was expressed (see Figure 4). Several conclusions emerged from the findings obtained in this investigation. The first was that male and female managers exert leadership in their own distinct fashions. In their review of research examining sex differences in group communication, Baird and Bradley (1979) posed the question of "whether female leaders in fact are enacting the 'male' role, or whether the 'female' role is uniquely suited for leadership in certain situations" (p. 191). In the situations examined, females generally did not enact a male role, but instead communicated in ways markedly different from the behaviors exhibited by male managers. In communication content, women statistically exceeded men in giving information, stressing interpersonal relations, being receptive to ideas, and encouraging effort; in communication style, males generally exceeded females in
dominance, being quick to challenge others, and directing the course of conversations, while females scored higher on showing concern and being attentive to others. All of these findings parallel differences obtained in earlier investigations, which found women to exceed men in monitoring employees; being concerned for employee morale; providing positive reactions; and exhibiting warmth, rewardingness, concern, affiliation, helpfulness, and sensitivity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content variable</th>
<th>Style variable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tells what to do</td>
<td>Dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gives information</td>
<td>Shows concern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotes happy relations</td>
<td>Comfortable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receptive to ideas</td>
<td>Directs conversations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourages effort</td>
<td>Quick to challenge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Attentive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Open</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Friendly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dramatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Approving</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Communication Content and Style.
Coaching and Role Modeling

Demonstration of skills and their refinement and augmentation occur through intraorganizational coaching, role modeling, observation and experience, and training and development. Coaching (Herbert & Yost, 1978) consists of direct contact between mentor and protege, typically superior and subordinate, by which the subordinate is given challenging tasks under the tutelage of an experienced other. Role modeling is a less formal condition in which the novice is exposed to a significant other, who has demonstrated competence; the other becomes a model for aspirations and performance-related behavior (Herbert & Yost, 1978).

Early in a woman's managerial career, a mentor may strive to give a woman legitimacy in their organizations by conferring an implicit stamp of approval. This executive type may try to ensure that a woman receives credit for her work and build her reputation (Fitt & Newton, 1981).

There are risks and tensions in a mentor-protege relationship. The mentor accepts a big risk that the protege's performance may fail to meet expectations. On the other side, the protege risks tying her fortunes to a mentor who is unpopular or who eventually loses at organizational politics (Fitt & Newton, 1981).

A major risk for both a male mentor and female protege is the perception of others that a close association will evolve into sexual entanglement. This possibility is a concern of both persons although the sexual tension and rumors of liaisons are not generally perceived
to be a problem by either party, as long as the relationship is kept strictly professional (Fitt & Newton, 1981).

Executives should foster a climate that supports and rewards the informal development of talented personnel, regardless of gender. Although mentor relationships cannot be created, they can be cultivated. The chief ingredient needed is an awareness of the benefits of such alliances among potential protegés as well as potential mentors. (Fitt & Newton, 1981, p. 60)

Observation and Experience

Observation and experience is the personal learning experience derived from firsthand exposure to real situations, and usually occurs informally and rather unsystematically. These elements have in common their effects on skill- and-ability enhancement. They may be undergone singly or in combination, and will vary greatly in effectiveness as general processes and according to the ways in which they are applied in a specific situation. (Herbert & Yost, 1978, p. 23).

Baron (1978) surveyed 6,300 women in management throughout the 50 states (1,487 responded) in order to determine the latest trends as a result of observations and work experience. A very small percentage of women perceived that management experience problems were sex-related and 83% of the respondents wished to advance in the work force.

Baron (1978) reported comments by women concerning work observations and experience:

"I am excluded from the 'locker' room, the 'lunch bunch.'"

"I am not considered a member of the team."

"I can't tap into the male pipeline."

"It is assumed I do not wish to be included, therefore, I am not asked." (p. 53)
These comments reflect exclusion from the informal management structure for women. The exclusion is a serious problem for women. The informal management structure provides as much, if not more, valuable experience than the formal experience.

Formal management experiences were observed as being less of a problem. Women thought that they were getting the same type of experiences as the male colleagues with whom they worked and believed they could advance (Baron, 1978).

The skill and ability enhancement that is needed for becoming an effective woman manager may be inhibited by many factors. Gold (1983) reported that women need to have skills in building alliances (allies that support you) and developing influence style (the ability to convince others to support you in action and words).

Power is needed and acquiring power is a skill that is most important to women. Their most stubborn barrier to power is their belief that it is bad. Women need to understand that power arises from the dynamic interplay between:

- Desire for power and skill in acquiring and using it.
- How others perceive her capabilities and the value that capabilities represent to others.
- Her position in the formal and informal organization, which in turn determines her access to resources, information, and support.
- The current significance of the organizational problems she is dealing with. (Gold, 1983, p. 21)

The problem of women gaining enough experience to make it to top managerial positions was discussed by Spruell (1985). She cited one reason as the fact that women have not been in the work force long...
enough yet to have gained the experience for top management. Women are impatient and men know more about how long it takes to move ahead in an organization (Spruell, 1985).

Rosen, Templeton, and Kichline (1981) gave the following advice to women seeking managerial experience:

1. Obtain information about company attitudes toward women.
2. Choose your first job carefully.
3. Be sensitive to dual career conflicts.
4. Don't begin your career with a chip on your shoulder.
5. Listen to advice, take responsibility.
7. Observe a successful role model.
8. Get a mentor.
9. Become part of a women's support network.
10. Read Games Mother Never Taught You, Managerial Woman, and The Gamesman. (p. 29)

Socialization and Setting of Expectations and Aspirations

As a result of experience, learning and the skill-enhancement process, expectations, behaviors, and values become internalized. The total organizational experience becomes identified with; the manager tests—and is tested for—basic competencies in many ways, and career aspirations and expectations are created. (Herbert & Yost, 1978, p. 24)

A major barrier facing women in the workplace is socialization. This includes sex role stereotyping, male-female interaction patterns, and societal norms—all of which interact with and enhance each other (Lyles, 1983).
One societal norm has been that women stay home to raise the children while men go to work to earn money (Pearson, 1984). Consequently, the stereotype that women are better at nurturing is accepted in our society. Here stereotypes are used to indicate fixed attitudes that influence how women are perceived—for example, as being soft, loving, attending, and intuitive. They are perceived as being afraid of achievement, poor at quantitative analysis, and unable to make tough decisions. They are perceived as being emotional, irrational, and nonobjective. Although these stereotypes may in fact be false, they subtly influence decision making about women in the workplace, what is considered appropriate work for women, and the proper role for women in an ongoing work group (Lyles, 1983).

Interact patterns are also part of the socialization process, and they develop quite early in the interaction between boys and girls. Girls will frequently defer to or accommodate boys in oral discussions. Nonverbally, the girls will nod their heads, smile, and attend to the conversations of the boys. The literature of sociology and communication leaves no doubt that male/female distinctions in language, interaction, expectations, and body language do exist (Lyles, 1983).

Socialization is thus a barrier to women in the workplace because it creates confusion about proper behavior and roles—and this is true not only for women, but also for men. Both have grown up understanding how to behave toward each other, but many of these shared understandings are not appropriate in the workplace. To overcome the barrier of socialization, new patterns of interactions
are needed. These can be accomplished through social contacts and sharing information about acceptable behaviors (Lyles, 1983).

As more women prepare themselves for managerial careers, business colleges and graduate schools of management have a growing opportunity to influence the anticipatory phase of the socialization process by adequately preparing these individuals for these challenges ahead (Buono & Kamm, 1983). Counseling and placement services should encourage women to assess their own values and needs as they formulate questions about management positions in specific organizations. Professors should emphasize the importance of self-knowledge and sensitivity to organizational expectations and climate prior to entry. By stressing that successful integration depends on a comfortable fit between a newcomer's needs, values, and lifestyle, and the organization's goals and demands, professors can increase the probability that students will be more cognizant of the requirements and requirements and trade-offs necessary for organizational success. As the concept of "androgynous management" gains more acceptance, the gap between the attitudes and values of women newcomers and the male groups they join should be reduced (Powell & Butterfield, 1979).

If women become aware of the implications of juggling family and career, they can begin the decision making and planning required to maintain a satisfactory balance. If this is accomplished during the anticipatory socialization phase, actual organizational encounters should be less difficult. Nonetheless, after entering male-dominated managerial groups, women may have to take more initiative in seeking feedback concerning their job performance from both their bosses and
their peers. If these requests are made in a spirit of self-confident concern for learning, without appearing to be self-deprecatory or threatening overachievement, much of the traditional sex stereotyping may be avoided (Powell & Butterfield, 1979).

Managerial Performance: Success or Failure

Developing an effective female manager culminates in the exhibition of managerial performance. Depending on many factors—basic managerial potential, preparation, learning and ability-enhancement processes, aspirations and expectations—the manager succeeds or fails in discharging the responsibilities of the position. (Herbert & Yost, 1978, p. 24)

Performance appraisal can be accomplished by many means and is one of the measurements used in defining success or failure (Harlan & Weiss, 1981). Effective managerial performance is one measure of success.

The first task in the study of effective management performance is to identify a workable definition of management. Management and leadership are often thought of as one and the same thing but Hersey and Blanchard (1982) suggested that there is an important distinction between the two concepts. Leadership is a broader concept than management. The following definition was suggested:

Management is thought of as a special kind of leadership in which the achievement of organizational goals is paramount. The key difference between the two concepts lies in the word organization. Leadership occurs any time one attempts to influence the behavior of an individual or group, regardless of the reason. It may be for one's own goals or those of others, and they may or may not be congruent with organizational goals. (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982, p. 3)
In discussing effectiveness it is important to distinguish between management and leadership (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982). Within an organizational setting, managers may attempt to engage in leadership rather than management since they are trying to accomplish personal goals, not organizational ones. Thus, in discussing effectiveness one must recognize the differences between individual goals, leadership, and management (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982).

The focus of this study is the management of women by women and the women administrators' enactment of the process of management. Hersey and Blanchard (1982) listed three areas of skill that may be applied in this process of management: technical, human, and conceptual. These are described as:

1. Technical skill--Ability to use knowledge, methods, techniques, and equipment necessary for the performance of specific tasks acquired from experience, education, and training.

2. Human skill--Ability and judgment in working with and through people, including an understanding of motivation and an application of effective leadership.

3. Conceptual skill--Ability to understand the complexities of the overall organization and where one's own operation fits into the organization. The knowledge permits one to act according to the objectives of the total organization rather than only on the basis of the goals and needs of one's own immediate group (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982, p. 5)

The appropriate mix of these skills varies as an individual advances in management from supervisory to top management positions. Less technical skill tends to be needed as one advances from lower to higher levels in the organization, but more conceptual skill is necessary. Supervisors at lower levels need considerable
technical skill because they are often required to train and develop technicians and other employees. Executives in an organization do not need to know how to perform all the specific tasks at the operational level. However, they should be able to see how all these functions are interrelated in accomplishing the goals of the total organization (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982).

While the amount of technical and conceptual skills needed at different levels of management varies, the common denominator that appears to be crucial at all levels is human skill (Hersey & Blanchard, 1982). This common denominator of human skills that demonstrates a manager's ability and judgment in working with and through people, while understanding motivation and applying effective leadership, is the best measure of effective management.

In order to measure the human skills of management, one must recognize the behaviors essential to motivation and effective leadership. Maslow (1943) formulated a need hierarchy theory in explaining motivation. He described five different classes of needs: physiological needs, safety needs, social needs, esteem needs, and need for self-actualization. At any point in time only the lowest unsatisfied need in the hierarchy controls a person's behavior. After this need is mostly satisfied, it declines in importance and the person's behavior is then controlled by the next unsatisfied need in the hierarchy.

According to Herzberg (1959), both job satisfaction and motivation are dependent on the job factors called satisfiers or motivators. Examples of satisfiers or motivators are: achievement,
recognition for achievement, the work itself, responsibility, growth, or advancement. These factors contribute to job satisfaction.

The dissatisfiers or hygiene factors contribute to job dissatisfaction. Examples are: company policy and administration, supervision, interpersonal relationships, working conditions, salary, status, and security. For example: good pay and good working conditions do not make you satisfied. What happens is you stop "gripping" about being dissatisfied. Likewise, an insufficient amount of the satisfiers will prevent the employees from experiencing the positive satisfaction that accompanies psychological growth but will not result in job dissatisfaction (Herzberg, 1959).

Both motivation and motivating environments were recognized by humanistic theorists. From the 1950s and 1960s, these theories reflected concern for the physical and mental health and welfare of all individuals. They also reflected the influence of psychologists and sociologists on group dynamics and human motivation. The best known humanistic theorists are McGregor (1960), Argyris (1960), and Likert (1967).

McGregor's (1960) Theory X and Theory Y classical theories had a negative view of human nature; the emphasis on regulation presumed employees were lazy, unambitious, uncreative, irresponsible, and are motivated only by money and security. This he labeled Theory X. Mcgregor proposed in Theory Y that people are motivated by other needs besides survival; work is a natural activity; and employees are capable of initiative, self-direction, and creativity. Job enrichment, participative management, and management by objectives are all
based on Theory Y assumptions.

Argyris's (1960) personality and organization theory postulated that bureaucratic organizations and human nature are incompatible. There is a normal sequence of human development which is thwarted by a bureaucratic organization. In this maturation process, a person becomes less passive, expands his or her behavior repertoire, broadens his or her interests, moves from a short to a long time perspective, and moves from complete dependence to self-reliance. Bureaucratic organizations force passivity, dependency, and subservience, which lead to frustration for those who want meaningful work, self-reliance, and psychological growth.

In effect, a self-fulfilling prophecy occurs; people are treated in a Theory X manner, they will begin to behave that way. This leads to withdrawal (physical and psychological); aggression and resistance and fixation on tangible rewards. If management tightens controls frustration and individual incompatibility with the organization increases. As a solution, Argyris (1960) proposed flexible roles, open communication, and reliance on self-direction (e.g., job enrichment, sensitivity training, and organizational development).

In researching the difference between effective and ineffective managers, Likert (1967) concluded that classical organization-based management approaches were less effective than approaches based on behavior patterns designed to develop cohesive groups with high performance goals.

Likert (1967) developed a typology with four categories based on different organizational processes. The classifications are known as
System 1 through System 4, with System 4 being the most effective.

System 4 applies three basic principles:

1. Supportive relationships require managers to be considerate and supportive, to keep subordinates informed, to provide recognition and to consult with subordinates before making decisions that affect them.

2. Group decision-making, as opposed to the autocratic, one-to-one bureaucratic model [where] each manager serves as a "linking pin" between subordinates and the authority level above so vertical and intergroup communication can occur. Also stressed are teams and committees so lateral communication can occur.

3. High performance goals, where managers are accountable but group members share in setting goals and making operating decisions. (Wexley & Yukl, 1984, pp. 273-274)

Kanter (1977) found that success or failure as a manager was determined largely by the structure of the organization and the nature of the social circumstances more than with inherent ability or drive. Kanter (1987) found that women still have not penetrated the "glass ceiling" of success in the highest positions.

Bernadnez (1983) found that the effectiveness of female group leaders depends on their ability to contain aggression without retaliation, helplessness, or expression of intense affect in return.

Summary

Although there is a large amount of literature on women managers, their development, and their characteristics, there remains much that is unknown. One small part of this missing knowledge is how top-level women managers relate to their subordinates in a community college setting. Knowledge in this area would inform women who
aspire to move into top administrative positions in a community college. These positions are now occupied primarily by males.

This study describes how individual characteristics as defined by the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator relate to management relationships of four women administrators working with subordinate women managers in a community college setting. The individual characteristics measured by the MBTI cover a broad range of individual characteristics.

This study also describes a subset of skills of management (human skills) enacted by four women administrators, managing subordinate women managers, and how they differ across individuals in a community college setting. Literature reviewed in this chapter (Argyris, 1960; Herzberg, 1959; Likert, 1964; McGregor, 1960) provided indicators of manager behaviors thought by those researchers to be important when relating to subordinates. These indicators include: considerate, supportive, recognizes achievements, provides responsibility opportunities, growth or advancement, participative management, management by objectives, high performance goals, flexible roles, open communication, reliance on self-direction, teams, and committees. Other indicators were provided by Bennis (1982), Burns (1978), Josefowitz (1980), and Kanter (1987). These include: understands her role or position, understands needs of individuals, uses fullest potential of each individual, understands needs of groups, uses good judgment, possesses intellectual efficiency, treats people fairly, empowers others to act and have visions, innovates, communicates so uncertainties are reduced, is transformational, and moves the organization toward goals and
measures their attainment. These indicators were used to develop structural interviews with the subjects in this study.

Finally, this study is to develop working hypotheses concerning women-to-women management in a community college setting. Little is known about the ways in which women relate to each other in the community college management-subordinate relationship. This information is needed in order to prepare for the anticipated growth of women in community college administrative positions.
CHAPTER III

RESEARCH METHODS

Subjects (Principal Informants)

The focus of inquiry is on four women administrators in a community college who manage subordinate women managers. The female community college administrators who were studied are in the positions of dean, vice-president, and president in one community college. The four women were selected for the study because they were at a community college having female top level administrators. This is but one setting where the management and professional subordinate relationship may be studied.

In reporting the findings in Chapter IV, the names of the four female administrators and site are fictionalized. Pseudonyms were used to maintain the anonymity of the participants.

Research Design

A fieldwork method of inquiry was conducted in a natural educational setting employing informal observations and interviewing. The approach was intended to enhance discovery and description in the four cases (Bogdan & Biklen, 1982).

Prior to commencing the actual study, the researcher visited each woman administrator to discuss the nature of the study. Personal data and background information were determined through an...
interview. The intent of the researcher was to gain personal knowledge about the administrator and gain interpersonal rapport. A subject release form was developed and forwarded to each participant of the study for their signature and return to the researcher.

Prior to commencing the on-site observations, taped structured interviews were conducted with all four key women administrators (see Appendix A for questions). The recordings were then transcribed for review and study. These interviews are noted in Chapter IV and Chapter V with the informants pseudonym and date (e.g., Hope, 1987a) and referenced in the bibliography.

Taped structured one-on-one interviews were conducted with subordinate women managers (See Appendix B for questions). Each interviewee gave the researcher explicit permission to tape. These interviews are noted in Chapters IV and V with the informants title and interview date (e.g., Interview, Coordinator of Dental Assisting, 7-15-87).

Informal observations were conducted for women-to-women interactions and fieldnotes taken on site. On each observation day the fieldnotes were expanded and rewritten for review and study. Information and quotes from the observations are noted in Chapters IV and V (e.g., Fieldnotes, 6-2-87).

All interviews referenced in Chapters IV and V were one-on-one interviews with the researcher. Field observations varied from instances where two or more persons were interacting to large meetings.

In-depth interviews and informal observations were used to identify similarities and differences between the administrator-
subordinate relationships that were studied, in order to understand behavior from the subjects' frame of reference in settings where the subjects spend time. A detailed written record of interview responses and informal observations were systematically recorded, supplemented by other data, such as memos and pertinent documents.

The Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) and answer sheet were given to each woman administrator and subordinate during their initial interview. The MBTI is self-administering, all necessary instructions are given on the cover page, and there is no time limit. These features allowed the participants to complete their MBTI at their leisure. All participants returned their answer sheets in a timely manner. After the answer sheets were returned, the researcher used hand scoring stencils to determine the results.

The field research included informal observations of four administrators in the natural setting with avoidance of intentional manipulation of variables (LeCompte & Goetz, 1982). The study was a multimethod approach using informant interviewing, document analysis, and informal observations. The researcher did not begin with a priori standardization of concepts, measures, samples, and data but sought to discover and revise as more was learned during the study (McCall & Simmons, 1969). As the researcher gained knowledge working hypotheses were formulated. As a result of the case study, grounded research hypotheses emerged for future studies (Glasser & Strauss, 1967).
Instrumentation

The researcher was a key instrument for data collection. A list of questions was developed from the literature as described at the end of Chapter II, and used as a beginning interview guide. The list grew as interviews were conducted.

The specific questions were organized into two major categories in order to determine: (a) individual characteristics (see Appendix A, Interview Guide) and (b) selected management skills (human skills) (see Appendix B, Interview Guide).

The Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) was used to define and measure individual characteristics. The MBTI produces four scores: extroversion (E) versus introversion (I), sensation (S) versus intuition (N), thinking (T) versus feeling (F), and judgment (J) versus perception (P). The MBTI represents a major effort to capture the Jungian personality typology in a psychometric instrument (see Figure 5).

The Eighth Mental Measurement Yearbook (Buros, 1978) describes the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator instrument:

The MBTI is the product of much thought and research, and its authors endeavored to take some of these problems into account. They have not fully solved them, but neither has any other test constructor. The test contains 166 items, which are, on the whole, very well-designed. For some reason, about two-fifths of the items are "experimental" items, not used for scoring purposes....

There is now a substantial body of empirical data gathered on the use of the MBTI. Scores have been obtained from a variety of occupational and academic groups, and they have been related to creativity, academic achievement, vocational preferences, aesthetic preferences, values, needs, aptitudes, and work habits. It would be fair to say...
Figure 5. Brief Descriptions of the 16 Myers-Briggs Types.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
that the group differences and correlations are broadly supportive of the construct validity of the scales. They at least indicate that each preference scale is an approximation to the target dimension, but they do not remove the doubts raised by examination of the items.

The **Myers-Briggs Type Indicator** is designed to meet a difficult psychometric challenge—the assessment of Jungian types. It probably approximates this goal to a fair degree, but it is subject to further refinement, particularly with respect to item content. Research has shown the instrument to be useful for many applications. the test manual contains a well written and balanced coverage of theory and pertinent data, but it needs to be brought up to date. On the whole, the test clearly merits further research and use. (pp. 630-631)


**Reliability—Split-Half**

Using reliabilities of continuous scores for a number of groups, the reliabilities are consistent with those of other personality instruments. Reliabilities remain stable up to twenty-five omissions for Form G. (p. 168)

**Internal Consistency Coefficients**

Based on coefficient alpha are roughly the same as those computed from Pearson's R [see Table 1]. (p. 169)

**Test-Retest Reliability Estimates**

For the MBTI, test-retest reliabilities go beyond the typical computations of correlations for the four continuous scores. The practical questions revolve around the likelihood that on retest a person will come out the same MBTI type, that is, a person will choose the same pole of all four dichotomous preferences.

Reliabilities in this section include (a) correlations of continuous scores, (b) the proportion of cases assigned the same letter (direction of preference) on retest, and (c) the proportion of cases reporting on retest all four preferences the same (i.e., the same type), three preferences, two preferences, one preference, or no preference.
Table 1
Internal Consistency of Continuous Scores
Based on Coefficient Alpha

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description of sample</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>El</th>
<th>SN</th>
<th>TF</th>
<th>JP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Massachusetts high schools</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Long Island University</td>
<td>399</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>184</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) MBTI data bank</td>
<td>9,216</td>
<td>M,F</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) IPAR data bank</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. All data based on Form F. Decimals omitted.

the same. As in the earlier discussion, the issue of type development is expected to be a contributor to consistency of preferences. (Briggs, 1985, p. 170)

Validity

Because the MBTI was designed to implement Jung's theory of psychological types, its validity is determined by its ability to demonstrate relationships and outcomes predicted by theory. The theory suggests that persons are, or become, different types. The MBTI attempts to classify persons according to their "true" types. The theory postulates that the basic preferences for sensing or intuitive perception lead to different interests and that basic preferences for thinking or feeling judgment lead to differences in acting on those interests. Motivation, values, and behaviors are seen as surface indicators of the effects of the basic preferences and attitudes. If Jung's theory
describes preferences that do exist, and if the MBTI adequately indicates those preferences, then surface behaviors should be in the directions predicted by the theory, allowing for measurement error, stage of development, and overriding environmental pressures that interfere with expression of type preferences. (Briggs, 1985, p. 175)

Evidence for Validity From Type Distributions

Type distributions are the basic method for presenting MBTI data on groups. A type table is sometimes seen as merely descriptive information before the "real" experiment. . . . Type tables . . . provide evidence for construct validity. . . . If the type table for a given occupation has significantly more of the types predicted by theory to have interest in, and therefore be more likely to be members of, that occupation, then the type table contributes to construct validity. Type distributions presented . . . [in the] Manual provide evidence for the construct validity of the MBTI. (Briggs, 1985, p. 176)

Data Collection

A variety of investigative techniques were used to provide cross-checking of data to assure accuracy in reporting. These techniques included interviews, informal observation, administration of the MBTI, and the collection and analysis of memos and documents. The primary strategy was informal observations.

Observations were used by the researcher to describe interactions of the four female administrators with their subordinate female managers. These interactions were described in fieldnotes. Field observation is an important strategy for several reasons: First, it allows a researcher to gather data that the informants might be unable to give. It is possible that the informants are unaware of certain actions and relationships, or will not communicate facts, or might be motivated to distort them (McCall & Simmons, 1969,
Second, observation enables researchers to gather data "within the mediums, symbols and the experiential worlds which have meaning to respondents" (McCall & Simmons, 1969, p. 79).

The researcher was on the college campus for an extended period of time. The hours were used for interviewing the informants, conducting informal observations, and collecting documents (see Figure 6).

Types of situational observations included:
1. Scheduled administrator-subordinate meetings (49 hours).
2. Informal administrator-subordinate interactions (26 hours).
3. College meetings (11 hours).

Site visitations included:
1. Interviews of administrators using structured interview questions (18.5 hours).
2. Interviews of subordinates using structured interview questions (20 hours).
3. Interviews of administrators for clarification (23.5 hours).

Since the administrators' and subordinates' perceptions were vital to understanding the meaning they give to their experiences, the interview was an important means of gathering data. The researcher cannot understand the meanings of observed actions without communicating with the person involved in the action in order to confirm the observations (McCall & Simmons, 1969). The interview was used to follow up observations for clarification. Interviews were also used for gathering information about private, sensitive
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Data gathering technique</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Event or location</th>
<th>Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3-5-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5-87 O, D</td>
<td>I, O, C</td>
<td>Setting, history</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-1-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Setting</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-1-87 C</td>
<td>Page, Hope, Knight</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-1-87 I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Page, Hope, Knight, Scott</td>
<td>Cabinet mtg.</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-2-87 I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Page, Hope, Knight, Scott</td>
<td>Cabinet mtg.</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-2-87 I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Cabinet members workshop</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-2-87 O</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Evening dinner</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-3-87 O, D</td>
<td>I, O, C</td>
<td>Setting, information</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-3-87 O</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-3-87 O</td>
<td>Cabinet members</td>
<td>Cabinet members</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-4-87 O</td>
<td>Meetings</td>
<td>Meetings</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-5-87 O, D</td>
<td>I, O, C</td>
<td>Meetings, information</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Events</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-11-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Meetings</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-12-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Meetings</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-22-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Bd. of Trust.</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-22-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-23-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-23-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Dir. of Cont. Ed.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-23-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Page, Hope, Knight, Scott</td>
<td>Cabinet mtg.</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-24-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-25-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-25-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-25-87 I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Ext. Ser. Coord.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-29-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-30-87 O</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Hope and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Data gathering technique</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Event or location</th>
<th>Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7-6-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-6-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-7-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Knight and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus mtg.</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-8-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Hope and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus mtg.</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-13-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-13-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-14-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-15-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-15-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Knight</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-15-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-15-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Knight and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-15-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Coord. Food Ser.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-16-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Dir. Cont. Ed.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-16-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Coord. Dent. Asstg.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-17-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Coord. Rad. Tech.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-17-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Chairperson--Health</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-17-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Ref. Librarian</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-27-87</td>
<td>O, D</td>
<td>Scott, information</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-28-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Ext. Ser. Coord.</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-28-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-28-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-29-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Scott and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-30-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Scott and subordinates</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-31-87</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>Scott</td>
<td>Campus office</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-13-87</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Dir. Aux. Services</td>
<td>Tape</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key:  I = interview, O = observation, C = conversation, D = documents.

Figure 6. Chronology of Collection Events.
situations where the researcher cannot be present. The interviews brought the findings of the study closer to the reality of the informants.

A third strategy was the examination and analysis of documents that included memoranda and minutes of meetings for the researcher to identify experiences affecting the interactions between administrators and subordinates.

The Myers-Briggs Type Indicator was given to each participant to complete at her convenience. Appropriate administration and scoring procedures by a trained researcher were followed.

This multimethod data gathering strategy offered the opportunity for triangulation—cross checking data, checking one set of data against another, to assure validity in reporting. The interview, for example, offered the researcher the chance to interpret the meaning or significance the informant had for an incident observed and offered the chance to clarify an assumption.

Data Analysis

The analysis of data was an ongoing process of searching for patterns and linkages. It was necessary to analyze records of interview responses and fieldnotes as the data gathering progressed, both to adjust observational strategies and to exercise control over emerging ideas by simultaneously checking or testing those ideas. The discovery of patterns was necessary for describing the cultural behaviors and the cultural knowledge of the informants (Spradley, 1981).
The research required analysis of fieldnotes in order to derive maximum benefit from the field situation (Wax, 1980). This required reading and rereading of fieldnotes to organize the data into categories. The basic organizer for the data were the two questions found on page 2.

The sorting of data facilitated the analysis of linkages—relationships among responses to questions. While analyzing an incident, the researcher compared it with previous incidents concerning the same question. The comparing led to noting properties related to each question.

The researcher organized the information to form a written report draft. Confirmation was established by sending the descriptive narrative to the informants for their reading in order to identify errors in fact. No substantive changes were made based on these reviews. After reading the report draft, participants were asked to return their signed release forms. Participants were also asked to indicate any errors of fact in the draft form and to notify the researcher of such errors. Corrections of fact which required additional data collection to complete the study report included: the age of one participant and the millage vote results.
CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

The Setting

Courtney Community College\(^1\), a multicampus, comprehensive college in southwest Michigan, formed the site for this study. Established in 1946, 78 students enrolled the first year. In 1987, approximately 3,600 students attend full or part time. Twenty-five percent of the students attend full time and 75% part time. Classes are held during day and evening hours and on Saturday. The college offers classes during the fall, winter, spring, and summer semesters (Courtney College, 1987d).

Students at Courtney range in age from 17 to 81 years old with an average age of 29 years. The student body is 59% female and 41% male. Of these students, 16% are minorities. In-district students come from three surrounding counties. The counties are Berrien, Van Buren, and Cass with populations of 171,276, 66,814, and 49,499, respectively. Sixteen percent of the students come from outside the district. This includes foreign students representing 18 countries from around the world (Courtney College, 1987g).

The student profile at Courtney is reflected in the students' paths to Courtney (see Table 2):

\(^1\)Pseudonym.
Table 2

Students' Paths to Courtney Community College

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student path</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct college path</td>
<td>17-21 years old</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Stop outs&quot;</td>
<td>22-26 years old</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further job training</td>
<td>27-35 years old</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New life training</td>
<td>36-44 years old</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45-52 years old</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>53 and older</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The students are enrolled in curriculums in apprentice training, business, computer and word processing, education, food service, health sciences, secretarial, technologies, and transfer programs.

Courtney College also offers a wide variety of programs for business and industry and to enhance economic development in the surrounding counties.

The college cooperates with area economic development agencies by developing proposed training programs for new business and industry and provides materials for prospective new businesses on a wide range of programs and services that are available (Courtney College, 1987e).

The campus map (see Figure 7) depicts the 259-acre main campus and the $25 million plant built in 1969 (Courtney College, 1987b).
Courtney college has an annual budget of $8.2 million (Courtney College, 1987f).

Figure 7. Courtney College Campus Map.

Upon the first visit to Courtney, certain feelings occurred when entering the campus drive. "There seems to be a sense of peace... and of order and calm" (Fieldnotes, 3-5-87). These feelings were shared during the initial interview with Dr. Kathryn Page,\(^1\) the

\(^1\)Pseudonym.
president of Courtney. Kathryn (Page, 1987a) responded to the comment:

That was the intention of the building. I think that's a good initial observation. You'll discover as you live here, the building, the architectural side also isolates and what you talked about is exactly the architectural desire with this building.... That's exactly what they wanted. They also created some extraordinarily isolated characteristics about it--the length of it--the "bridge over troubled waters," is what they call the offices here.

The walls are dark. I've repainted the offices for the first time in 20 years. This place had not been cared for and this wonderful exterior was falling down. I've spent over a million dollars. It has been a place that has not been cared for.

Kathryn (Page, 1987b) further explained the history of the campus at a later interview.

The building was designed in the 1960s by Harry Weiss, a prominent architect in the Chicago area who has done many major college and community buildings all over the country. There was a lot of controversy over the site of the building. There was speculation that this site was selected because a state senator owned the property, but that's not true. It was a little groundskeeper's family farm. The water table was extremely high; therefore, that moat is not here just esthetically.

The concept was to be purely academic, going back to ancient Greece. The moat suggests removal from the outside world--contrary to the idea of a community college. The concept for the inside rooms was for state-of-the-art kinds of things. But they ran out of money, so it just stopped. The patio was built like a Greek concept where people could sit and have dialogues. There was to be a graffiti wall, but the first student who wrote on the wall was expelled!

As an outsider arriving on campus, further observations were made at the time of a second visit to campus:

Upon arriving to the Courtney College campus, I was greeted by a well done sign reading "Welcome to Courtney College." A large brick wall with red geraniums neatly planted in front also read "Courtney Community College."
The entrance to the college has two long one-way drives that are lined with pine trees. The long drive gives you a sense of entering a large estate. As you continue in, two large parking lots are situated on either side of the driveways and are located a distance from the main entrance.

The buildings and setting remind me of a castle. There are two bridges with chain attachments that provide passage over the moats. A main entrance located in the center of a courtyard provides a stairway going down instead of up to enter. (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87).

The Time

This study of women administrators managing subordinate women managers in a community college setting was conducted during a specific period of time—from March until August of 1987. The individuals' enactment of the management process was observed during this period (see Figure 6).

Courtney College had experienced major changes from May 1985 to August 1987 and was addressing some very hard decisions during the period of this study. President Kathryn Page provided an historical overview of these changes:

When I arrived in 1985, there was a very hostile climate. In 1972, every faculty member had been fired; they attempted to form a union. At that time, a whole new governance thing was written, a very unwieldy piece of work. This faculty has had a tremendous sense of insecurity. For instance, when I was visiting the campus, after being selected as the in-coming president, I made the decision whether to call off school when a transformer blew, and I wasn't even president yet!

The faculty were apprehensive when I came. The administration needed to mend themselves inside. (Page, 1987b)

The major upheaval facing Courtney College presently is the $450,000 deficit. Page (1987b) described the situation:
I just laid it out. The first altercation on the board occurred. I had to back off. It was a tough time because everything I did created a conflict with someone during the last 2 or 3 months. I laid it out and they began to see that we're all in this together.

In response to the deficit and in a "we're all in this together mode," the Board of Trustees on the recommendation of the administration made the decision to seek an increase in its general operating millage for the first time in 24 years.

On June 22, 1987, President Kathryn Page made a presentation to the board and the local community at the 7:00 p.m. monthly meeting.

For the first time in 24 years, [Courtney] College will be seeking an increase in its general operating millage.

Basically, there are three issues that this college and the community must address.

1. Fiscal solvency: First let me start by saying that this millage request is not the only way the college has worked to increase revenue.

   We have worked hard to increase student enrollment.

   We have increased tuition (by $3 per credit hour this year alone).

   We have substantially increased fees.

   We have increased revenue generated through conference services.

   We have vigorously pursued grants and private support.

   The simple fact of the matter is the college can no longer fulfill its mission and role, maintain its physical plant or provide the programs and services it must to meet the needs of this region.

2. Program development and instructional equipment: We estimate that a one-mill increase in the general operating levy of the college will generate approximately 12 million in five years. Of those 12 million dollars, $9.3 million will be devoted to instructional support and personnel.
3. Buildings and facilities: [Courtney College] has a $25 million physical plant. We have a responsibility to maintain it and see that it stays in repair. You only need to tour our campus and see the painting that needs to be done, the patching that is necessary, the carpeting that needs to be replaced and even the ceilings that must be completed. (Page, 1987d)

The decision to seek the millage was accompanied by a well-planned campaign seeking "yes" votes. The college public relations director coordinated the efforts of the campaign that included a "phone calling effort" to identify "yes" votes, an informational breakfast for local community leaders, and a "Fact Sheet" that could be distributed to persons wanting more information and used by college personnel when responding to questions concerning the millage vote (see Appendix C).

The local newspapers carried the announcement to the community: "CC May Seek 1 Mill in September Vote" (1987), "CC to Seek First Tax Hike in 24 Years" (1987), and "CC Board Votes to Seek Tax Hike" (1987).

The vote on the levy was held August 31, after the data collection was complete. The millage was defeated by a small margin but passed in a second attempt for the millage levy in November 1987.

This information is provided as context for the case study because it was the major activity requiring the attention of the women administrators during the time of this study.

The College and Its Values

Understanding the values of Courtney College began with a reading of the "Mission," the first page of the document listing the
goals and objectives for 1986-89 and appearing in the college catalog.

The educational philosophy of . . . [Courtney College] is founded on the belief that education is for all who wish to develop their potential. It is fundamental that a community college assist in meeting the educational, vocational, cultural and recreational needs of the community it serves. This involves a three-fold obligation.

- To provide for the educational aspirations, needs and expectations of the individual student and the community;

- To provide for the vocational needs and desires of the individual student and the community; and

- To provide for the cultural interests and recreational needs of the individual student, and thus contribute to the development of effective citizens. (Courtney College, 1987a, p. 6)

A commitment to the mission of the college is summarized for the year 1987 in the winter Update letter that Kathryn (cited in Courtney College, 1987e) wrote:

As a new year dawns . . . so does a new semester at [Courtney] College. . . . It seems that each semester brings a new set of challenges and opportunities for us. . . . Three of the major issues and tasks facing the College the next several months are:

... developing a mandatory placement program for all students.

... creation and adoption of a college budget for 1987-88 year.

... implementing an aggressive grant-seeking and private fund-raising program.

... student enrollment is up 7.5%.

A major service and instructional program the College has underway is Project Lighthouse.

We have established the Courtney College Educational Fund, Inc....
The CC Small Business Development Center "officially" opened in December.

The contents of her letter were later reflected in the 1986-89 Long-Range Plan Introduction (Courtney College, 1986b):

In the years ahead, [Courtney] College faces numerous challenges: How do we prepare students for the wide range of opportunities offered by a changing work force and society? How do we improve students' preparation for college? ... How do we meet the educational needs of an increasingly diverse student population? ... How do we improve assessment of student and institutional performance? ... How do we continue to serve the broader community of which we are a part? (p. 1)

In an effort to address these questions, the college staff and board of trustees embarked on a planning process that provided specific strategies and at the same time afforded flexibility for change.

The three major areas addressed by the board of trustees in their vision of the college were:

Curriculum Development—The continued emphasis on building a strong curriculum responsive to the communities we serve, including business and industry, special needs markets, community services, and developing on-going program evaluation.

Fiscal Development—The development of a three-year fiscal plan.

Public Image—The continued efforts at developing CC's public image through further development of a marketing program, cooperation with area schools, and a mission that is evidenced in programs as well as in philosophy. (Courtney College, 1986b, p. 2)

Other values of Courtney College are their human resources. The college motto, "We'll Get You There" is reflective of their commitment to students.
The college recognizes and promotes their people through a publication from the Office of College Relations, Dateline. "College Success Stories" is a regular part of the publication and their section on "People" is lengthy. In the summer 1987 edition, 37 people were showcased for their accomplishments, both staff and faculty.

The college also promotes their people in the local newspapers: "Four CC Teachers Awarded Over $6,000 for Class Projects" (Courtney College, 1987f).

Excellence is also a value of Courtney College. The "Message From the President" (Courtney College, 1987a) provides an overview for this value.

There are many kinds of excellence. . . . The kind of excellence we are interested in at [Courtney] College is the kind that deals with individual success . . . individual progress.

Excellence to us means helping each student achieve his or her greatest potential . . . as we have helped tens of thousands since opening in 1946.

Today, nearly 4,000 students are enrolled . . . many will transfer to four-year colleges or universities . . . others will seek personal excellence in the job market immediately following graduation.

A quality, caring faculty . . . small classes . . . comprehensive programs. . . . Our excellence also has to do with our partnership with the community . . . working with business and industry . . . sponsoring cultural events.

A renewed commitment to community service and continuing education is resulting in a wide variety of courses and programs that enhance the personal and professional development of community residents.

[Courtney] College . . . we're proud to be a leader in excellence in [the state's] southwest.

Kathryn Page, President, Courtney College. (p. 1)
The Main Subjects

The main subjects for this study are four women administrators (see Figure 8). President Kathryn Page, Vice-President Victoria Hope, Dean Elizabeth Knight, and Dean Mary Scott1 perform their professional duties at Courtney College. Each also brought into her current work life her particular autobiography.

A personal and professional history of each subject is provided as background for the understanding of meanings each gives to her situation, for an understanding of the personal characteristics of each, and for interpreting the management behaviors of each woman administrator.

The administration at Courtney College changed after Kathryn came. The 1986-87 College Catalog (Courtney College, 1986a, p. 3) named three vice-presidents (all male) and no deans. The 1987-1989 College Catalog (Courtney College, 1987a) names two vice-presidents, one male, one female, and four deans, two male and two female. Only one male vice-president is the same as listed in the 1986-87 catalog. There are now four female administrators and three male administrators. Figure 8 lists the main administrators and subordinates in this study. It should be noted that Dean Knight reports to the male vice-president.

1All pseudonyms.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administrator</th>
<th>President Page</th>
<th>Vice-President Hope</th>
<th>Dean Knight</th>
<th>Dean Scott</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct reporting, women subordinate managers</td>
<td>1. Vice-President Hope</td>
<td>1. Dean Scott</td>
<td>1. Coordinator of Radiologic Technology</td>
<td>1. Reference Librarian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Director of Auxiliary Services</td>
<td>2. Director of Continuing Education</td>
<td>2. Coordinator of Dental Assisting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Extension Service Coordinator</td>
<td>3. Coordinator of Food Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. Division Chairperson, Health Sciences</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"A personality is one who has unrolled the Ribbon, unfolded the petals, exposed all the layers" (Anais Nin, cited in Page, undated, p. 1).

"She is our Crocodile Dundee," said Laurie, the manicurist doing Kathryn's nails at the local beauty salon. "She is a favorite" (Fieldnotes, 6-3-87). But where did this personality originate, and in only two short years as president of Courtney, how and why has she gained such notoriety among her colleagues and in the community?

Kathryn described this personal development herself in a piece of writing entitled "I Am Kathryn" (Page, 1982) written before she became the president of Courtney College. Kathryn had written the self-portrait for partial fulfillment of the requirements of a human science research course she took in 1982 in her doctoral program.

For twenty-five of my forty-seven years, I have worked as a professional educator, as a teacher and as a college administrator. Twenty-two of those years have been spent in one institution. We have grown up together, this college and I. We have lived through four presidents, intellectual highs, financial lows, an occasional scandal, and myriad changes. It is the longest marriage I have known, and for that matter, probably will ever know. There has been great joy and devastating pain. But that's the way it is in a relationship that is growing and constantly changing. And we have grown and changed, this college and I, and for the most part, we still like each other. The walls talk to me, tell me secrets, reveal moods. And I respond. I respect, even defend the tradition they represent; I reach out and touch the lives of countless others who pass through the corridors and stay for awhile; I work hard; I make a difference; and I exist—as a woman who is a professional educational administrator in an institution built, organized, and operated by men.

There are philosophical affirmations I have come to live by. There are voices from my childhood: "You are
valued. You are special. You are unique." I felt that
then. I believe that now. There are other voices coming
out of my early experiences.

"Search for ideas. Read everything. Appreciate those
who are different from you. You'll learn from them," my
father would say.

"Don't be afraid. You can make any place beautiful.
You can do anything you have to do. Don't give up and
always have cab fare home," was and is my mother's message.

"Remember your heritage. Don't forget you are Frank
Page's granddaughter. You're smart enough to be Governor
of Kentucky, and you're the only woman I'd ever vote for.
But you talk too much sometimes, Kathryn." Those were my
grandfather's very last words to me.

"It's easier to be simple. You can find peace in a
chickenyard. And if you watch those chickens you'll learn
about life. Even the cock of the walk flies the coop every
now and then. Sometimes you'll just laugh," my grandmother
would smile.

"I expect the best from you. Don't come to this class
unprepared."

"I expect you to do well in the competitions. You can
win the state speech contest."

"You are a leader. Others look to you. You have a
responsibility to make good decisions."

Those were my teachers speaking.

A few years ago, after I had been named Dean at the
College, I was asked to deliver a speech to several hundred
women educators. I developed what I called an eschatologi-
cal laundry list for women in education. The idea for such
a register had come from my extensive reading of Sheldon
Kopp, a religious man and a psychotherapist, whose writings
had helped me place in perspective my own journey. The
list is neither profound nor perfunctory, nor is it com-
plete, but it is mine. It represents my collective expe-
rience as woman and as professional and serves as the basis
for both my personal and professional life.

1. I accept my uniqueness as an individual and as a
woman; it is my blessing and my burden.
2. I acknowledge the multiple roles I play out in my life and know that the various demands often obscure me from myself and, simultaneously, affirm me as myself.

3. I reject societal prescriptions that say that I, as a woman, can only perform certain roles.

4. I believe I deserve nothing that I am not prepared to sacrifice something for; and, as a result, I take responsibility for myself, believing that only then am I truly free.

5. I am an eternal student who happens to make her living as an educator; and while I am constantly learning and re-learning, I know there are things I will never know.

6. But, I remain open to the possibilities—whatever they are; so I am constantly changing, and my life is fluid and full and, usually, joyous.

7. I believe that negative emotions about myself will diminish me; still, I am sometimes surprised at my own vulnerability.

8. I have a responsibility to others—men, women, children, and I must support them to be all they want to be . . . and then, let them be.

9. I believe in reconciliation, not compromise.

10. I take the time to know others; I trust my colleagues; I cherish and nurture my friends.

11. Sometimes I am disappointed in them and in myself.

12. I can forgive them and myself.

13. I capture and treasure moments in time.

14. I can live alone if I have to.

15. In my professional life, I am a competitor, not a spoiler; I fight, but I fight fairly; I accept power and use it well; I acknowledge conflict as basically creative.

16. I accept all the help I can get, but I never abuse my mentors, for I despise seeing people used.

17. I believe in laughter; it is cathartic and gives me balance.
18. I try to treat no incident as a disaster and disasters as incidents.

19. I believe time heals, guilt passes, and dirt keeps.

20. I still suffer pain at the exclusion of women, but I celebrate our remarkable resiliency and our ability to make a difference in spite of all the odds.

21. I greet each day with love in my heart, and most of all, I love myself.

22. There are dreams I may never achieve, but I still continue to dream.

23. For me, the journey is as important as the destination.

It is more than my sense of self, however, that has given me the ability to survive, even achieve. I accept that I am, because I am a woman, an outsider—even within the institution I have been part of for so long. Nonetheless, I know the institution and all its inhabitants, well. I observe. I listen. I have learned to form coalitions with other outsiders, those who exist in the institution as well as those outside of its framework. I have become politically astute, and I am intuitively aware. I am not afraid to express my view. For me, life has been a process that has allowed me to experience myself, to express myself. Because of this process, I recognize that through my work as an educational administrator, I can contribute my values and attitudes to the organization in such a way that I can affect my life-world. I can make changes where there have been none.

To have a first-hand reflection of a woman president's personal and professional history is unique. During the hours that I interviewed and observed Kathryn I learned even more about her:

My father was a minister and gave me my service orientation, but died when I was 12 years old.

My mother went out to work when I was about 14. She was a highly motivated individual. She felt that her daughters needed education as much as her son.

My undergraduate education was at Transylvania College. It was just mentioned in the Wall Street Journal, so
I'm no longer embarrassed to say the name. . . . I learned a great deal about excellence in education at that school. . . . I was an English major. . . . My graduate degrees are both from the University of Michigan. I received my master's in English in 1967 and my Ph.D. in education in 1983.

My mother and I have had a pretty good relationship. . . . I thought I never lived up to her expectations. . . . She is not a warm woman in demeanor. . . . I am a very warm individual. . . . But Mother, people love her. I think there has always been a sense of competition between the two of us, more in her mind than in mine. . . . We have made peace with each other. . . . I think that's the strongest thing that was probably given to me as a child, a sense of value. . . .

I see the feminine role as being the intuitive, feeling side of universal power, and it happens to be encompassed in me as a woman, in my body, who I am. I see myself as the giver, the caretaker, in many kinds of ways. I see me as having to instill certain values that I suppose emanate from a feminine perspective into my culture, whatever that is, if it is the protector of children and concepts and ideas, then good, that's what it is. And if that's what the institution comes to value, then good. That's what I feel it can. And by the same token, I see me, because I've had to operate in a feminine, as a woman. I see me able, hopefully, to incorporate and never diminish the masculine part of myself, and my male brothers. I see that is essential to my role as well. (Page, 1987a)

In her early 50s, Kathryn is well-known in the Courtney College area as a result of her involvement. Kathryn described her service to the community:

I was approached by the State Arts Council to start a Council here. It is my contention that art brings everything together.

I'm also on the City Chamber of Commerce Executive Committee, campaign chair-elect for United Way for next year, member of the Board of the Community Growth Alliance for Economic Development, and Chair of the Lakeside Center for the Arts.

Kathryn's love for the arts is reflected in her office environment at Courtney:
In order to enter Kathryn's office suite, one must pass through double doors and down a hall with offices on either side. Her suite consists of a front reception room, a secretarial area, a main office with private bath, and two adjacent rooms, the board meeting and dining rooms.

Upon entering the suite, I was greeted with a color scheme of grey and burgundy. "How do you describe your office colors," I asked. "Peace and strength," Kathryn replied. "The school colors are red and grey, and I hate that, that's Ohio State. I just modified that. I thought the boardroom needed to have that, but I wasn't going to make it red. I love grey and burgundy and mauve. Now all the school color things are out in grey and burgundy." (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87)

Kathryn's office suite is open and inviting. The suite consists of three large rooms with her private office and bath centered between the board meeting room and the board dining room. The walls are pale grey in all three rooms and the carpet is deeper grey. The board meeting room is filled with a large round table with burgundy plush roller arm chairs around it for seating (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87). "The round table is great but I don't like having our backs to the audience when we have board meetings," Kathryn stated (Page, 1987b). The board dining room is filled with small tables and arm chairs to serve the members dinner before meetings.

Kathryn's desk fills a corner of her private office. One could never sit across a desk from Kathryn. "I designed a desk that doesn't separate people," she said. All dialogue is done in the gathering area of her office that contains a burgundy couch, two easy grey swivel chairs, and a low table. On the table and walls are pieces of art that Kathryn cherishes.

A piece of unique artwork is the focal point on one large wall. The piece is dedicated to Kathryn and reads "It was a party just
being near you" (Page, 1987b). I asked Kathryn about the picture:

When I left my former "College" they gave me the best going-away party, and those are 300 of my friends who signed it. The art instructor did the collage. That was beautiful. . . . That gives me warm thoughts every time I look at it. (Page, 1987b)

I had a sense that Kathryn was dramatic, warm, and energetic, had a wonderful incredible sense of humor and communicated her warmth to everyone around her. I felt this warmth my first day on campus when I arrived to observe: "I saw Kathryn standing in the courtyard. As I walked up the entry way she spotted me, walked toward me, and grabbed my hand. 'Can this be the queen of hearts?' I thought" (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87).

A female subordinate of Dean Knight's called Kathryn the "Queen." The "Queen," yes. "I feel supported by the college; the 'queen' is very supportive" (Interview, Coordinator of Radiologic Technology, 7-15-87).

Victoria Hope, Vice-President, Student and Community Services

One of Victoria's woman subordinates described the vice-president. "She is a very strong, calm person; I have a high regard for her. She has given me great personal support" (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87).

Victoria Hope's personal and professional history reflect the formation of her character.

My father was a college student at Penn State when married to my mom, but he died at 36 when I was a year and a half. . . . My mother did not remarry and went to beauty school after she was widowed. . . .
I graduated from Wayne State University with a degree in elementary education in 1956 and July of that year had my first baby.... I never worked until I went back to school to get another degree, a master's in guidance and counseling from the University of Michigan....

I had an advantage in my mother being widowed, because she always impressed upon me the necessity of taking care of yourself.... Mother always promoted the idea of college education—knowledge is power.... I owe my ambition and the advantage of knowing I can take care of myself to my mother's early experiences....

When I consider the feminine role, this is a very conservative county, very traditional, very Republican, segregated by race, class, and sex....

I keep my sanity by making jokes, putting things into packages.... I am perceived as a reserved, distant, cool person, which I am.... I'm known as the Iron Duchess here. (Hope, 1987)

Hope appeared to be a confident woman. She is in her early 50s and conservative in dress. On my first day of observations she was dressed in a beige linen suit with gold accessories that accented her tall, thin, regal posture. She has soft red tones to her hair and a lovely "twinkle" smile (Fieldnotes, 6-23-87).

As I entered her office she seemed more relaxed having me there than I had expected. Hope had expressed some reservation in being "studied" but had agreed to participate (Hope, 1987).

Victoria's desk is situated in the usual manner with her chair behind and one chair for visitors in front. Her office is decorated in pale green. "I inherited this," she told me. "The only pieces that are mine are the wall clock and plants" (Fieldnotes, 6-23-87). The office also has a conversation area with couches and chairs that she uses for discussion with staff members. Her office window overlooks the courtyard and a beautiful stained glass light catcher hangs...
on the window beside two carved giraffes on the sill.

As I shadowed Victoria, I came to know the person behind her warm and friendly smile.

Kathryn and Victoria knew each other when they both were employed at other institutions. Both Kathryn and Victoria had worked in student and community services and had met each other on a state level when working on projects. Kathryn had hired Victoria as the director, Human Resources. Victoria became the vice-president when a former vice-president quit and she assumed the position with the responsibility for both areas, Human Resources and Student and Community Services (Hope, 1987a).

A subordinate to Victoria shared her impression:

She is budget conscious. . . . The vice-president has many faces. At different times she has given me a sense of understanding—other times she is cold and difficult to communicate with. . . . She is very emotional. . . . She is a lot nicer person than people think. (Interview, Extension Service Coordinator, 7-15-87)

"I have known Kathryn Page for a long time," Victoria said. "She's been a mentor, friend and role model" (Hope, 1987a).

Elizabeth Knight: Dean, Occupational Studies

Early this spring, a team of consultants for the State Department of Education conducted an audit of our Occupational Studies and Special Needs programs. Dr. Page received a letter from one of the consultants praising the excellent job done by Elizabeth Knight, Dean of Occupational Studies. (Courtney College Board of Trustees, 1987)

"The Special Populations Programs and Services component of the plan is outstanding in its quality" the letter read.
Elizabeth told me about her personal and professional development that resulted in this "quality" work.

I was raised in a farming community. . . . My father was a farmer in the early years of my life. . . . My father had a high school education and he had aspirations for more education. . . .

My mother had a high school education, too. . . . She was not employed until I was away from home. . . . She viewed education for her children as extremely important and made financial sacrifices. . . .

My undergraduate education is a bachelor's in nursing from Indiana University. . . . I received a scholarship that paid all, plus living expenses. . . . I went to Ball State for my master's. . . . It was difficult to travel to Muncie for classes from here, but I did it. . . .

My experiences are varied. After I graduated from nursing I was employed at the university as an instructor. I felt a need for a graduate education but was married, had children, and continued to work in nursing education. . . . I came to Courtney as an adjunct faculty member 11 years ago. When the nursing coordinator position opened up, I applied and got it. I knew I needed a master's then so I went to Ball State. . . . When the position of dean of Occupational Studies was open, I applied and have been dean since last August.

The relationship with Mother is very close and good. . . . Mother is a strong individual, the dominant one in the family. Looking back, I see the family as a matriarchal kind of family. Mother is very bright and intelligent and could have done more than she did. She promoted a can-do philosophy. . . .

I didn't realize that I had a special relationship with my father until I went away to college. I have lots of respect for him, but it is less tangible than my relationship with my mother. . . .

The feminine role. . . . others find me to be a lot stronger than I perceive myself to be. . . . There are only two women deans in occupational studies in the state community colleges. . . . Very few women, an adventure. . . . I am supported as a Dean, not as a woman. . . . My approach is that I'm here to do the job. (Knight, 1987a)
Elizabeth Knight's office is on the first level and at the far end of the building. Her office overlooks the water through a narrow long window. On the window hangs a figure of a nurse done in blue and white stained glass. Her desk is against the wall and I sat beside her when we talked.

Elizabeth is in her mid-40s. She is tall, has dark hair, and dresses in classic suits and outfits. A notice on her bulletin board communicates her demeanor: "Notice: Lack of planning on your part does not constitute an emergency on my part" (Fieldnotes, 7-15-87).

A subordinate woman manager who reports to her, supports Elizabeth:

"I respect her position as the dean and try to let her know whatever is happening..."

"I try to give her an outline of what I am doing, when I am doing it, when I expect to finish it, and ask how does this sound to you? (Interview, Chairperson, Health Sciences, 7-15-87)"

Mary Scott, Dean, Library and Learning Resources

While interviewing Victoria Hope, the vice-president shared her thoughts about the Dean Mary Scott: "Having a strong dean in the library is very helpful. She has turned the place inside out, everything is changed there" (Interview, Vice-President Hope, 3-5-87).

Dr. Mary Scott was not born in America, but in Seoul, Korea. She had a fascinating background that she shared with me in an interview:

"My father had a college education and was a university professor; he died when I was young... My mother had a"
high school education but did not work outside the home.

I received a bachelor's in education, a K-12 teaching certificate in Seoul and received a master's in audiovisual education at the same university. . . . I received my doctorate in 1972 in curriculum and instruction from the University of Wisconsin.

My mother was very, very strict. . . . She had very high expectations of me. . . . I am the stamp of her mold. It is unusual for a Korean mother to do that but she had her practical reasons for doing it; she wanted a career for her daughter. . . .

I always hero-worshipped my father. He was an extraordinary person. He taught in Korea, under the Japanese occupation, passed the bar examination, was appointed judge but didn't want to sentence the Korean people or work for the Japanese, so he taught English at the university. . . . He financially supported many orphanages and nursing homes. . . . He died young. . . .

I really don't feel anything special being a woman. . . . I see myself as an individual. I always worked at jobs I wanted . . . always promoted when I wanted the promotion. . . . I forget my sex and work as an individual. . . . I understand the past practices of women's employment and I am supportive of women. . . . I have achieved what I aspired. (Scott, 1987b)

Mary is a woman in her late 40s with no lines on her face. She is petite with a quick walk and warm smile. Mary's dress reflects her neatness and the soft colors her privateness. "I'm a very private person" (Scott, 1987b).

Mary inherited her office from the former dean at Courtney. The walls are beige and her desk of wood sits in a traditional position with two conversation chairs in front. There is a work table in the room where Mary was working on a board to depict the structural changes needed in the learning research center in order to meet established goals.
The long wall in her office displayed a picture of her niece, whom she raised as a daughter and a wall hanging that reads:

LET ME WALK IN BEAUTY
LET ME LEARN
I SEEK STRENGTH
MAKE ME ALWAYS READY
SO WHEN LIFE FADES, as the fading sunset my spirit may come to you without shame.

Mary Scott worked in higher education in Michigan for 10 years before coming to Courtney College. She worked as the director of Library and Learning Resources at Gogebic Community College from 1972 to 1977. She then moved to Western Michigan University in 1977 to teach in a master's degree program in education. In 1982 she moved to Kansas to a community college and in 1986 applied for and received the position at Courtney College.

Mary's work at other colleges and universities seemed to provide her with the knowledge base needed to reorganize the learning resources at Courtney. "We want to be a full service gas station, not a self-service gas station" (Scott, 1987a)

Subordinate Women Managers Who Report to the Four Women Administrators

Each of the four women administrators has subordinate women managers reporting to them. Reporting to Kathryn Page is the vice-president and the director, auxiliary services. The director holds a bachelor's degree from Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in nutrition and food business management. She oversees supervision of all auxiliary services including contracted services, construction operations, conference services, and physical plant
services. She develops state funding applications, nonsalary contracts, and safety reports. The director is a member of the cabinet of Courtney College (Fieldnotes, 7-15-87).

Reporting to Victoria Hope are Dean Scott, the director of continuing education, and the extension service coordinator.

The director of continuing education has been at Courtney College for almost 10 years. She has a bachelor's degree in business and management from Purdue and is pursuing a MBA at Western Michigan University. She is responsible for the activities associated with all continuing education at Courtney College. The director coordinated the local meeting associated with the American Association of Community and Junior Colleges' teleconference on literacy as part of her college responsibilities. Through continuing education services, many courses, workshops, seminars, lectures, and forums are offered to address a wide variety of community needs and interests (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 7-15-87).

The extension service coordinator has a bachelor's degree in health education from Western Michigan University and a master's degree in administration from Notre Dame. Her position as extension service coordinator is focused on professional development with targeted groups. She goes into the surrounding counties to market college services to small businesses (Interview, Extension Service Coordinator, 7-15-87).

Reporting to Dean Knight are the division chairperson of health sciences, the coordinator of radiologic technology, the coordinator of dental assisting, and the chairperson of food services.
The division chairperson of health sciences has a BSN from Andrews University and a master of science from the Medical College of Georgia. She is responsible for coordination of the nursing program and day-to-day operations of the health science department. The coordinator of radiologic technology holds a degree in radiologic technology and a bachelor's degree from Western Michigan University. She is presently working on a master of science in administration at Notre Dame. The radiologic technician program recently became re-accredited by their accrediting body for licensure and the graduates from Courtney College had a 100% success rate on their board examinations (Fieldnotes, 7-14-87).

The coordinator of the dental assisting program has a bachelor's degree from Albion College and is also enrolled in the master of science degree program at Notre Dame. She coordinates an assisting program that is geared to meet the needs of the surrounding counties (Fieldnotes, 7-14-87).

The chairperson of food services has a bachelor's degree from the University of Wisconsin. She is responsible for all the food management program at Courtney College (Interview, Chairperson of Food Services, 7-15-87).

Dean Scott has one woman subordinate manager, the reference librarian. The librarian holds a bachelor's degree from Central Michigan University and a master's degree in library science from State University of New York-Albany. She has been at Courtney College for less than one year.
Individual Characteristics of the Main Subjects: Myers-Briggs Type Indicator

Two key informants for this study, President Page and Vice-President Hope are each different "types" as indicated by the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator. Dean Knight and Dean Scott are the same "type." The phrases used to describe each type in the Myers-Briggs Interpretation Manual are a good place to begin when trying to understand their personal characteristics.

Kathryn Page is a "planner of change," a description that was no surprise. "We knew right away she was going to be different because of her energy, enthusiasm and stand. She always comes back with suggestions of change" (Interview, Vice-President Hope, 7-15-87).

According to the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator, Kathryn is an ENFP type, the E for extrovert, the N for intuitive, the F for feeling, and the P for perceptive. The "Indicator" results infer that she has a breadth of interest, a grasp of possibilities, is warm and sympathetic, and adaptable. President Page likes variety and action. "Kathryn thinks this institution can do anything and is forever out there getting new projects to do" Victoria said (Hope, 1987a). "I need recognition, authority, something different," Kathryn said (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87).

Interviews and observations of Kathryn confirmed the patterns suggested by the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator. All interviews of subordinates included questions about the woman administrator to whom they reported and questions about Kathryn. The director of continuing education talked about Kathryn's breadth of interest and grasp of
possibilities. "She has this initial charismatic kind of thing, this 'get on the bandwagon' thing for new ideas" (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87).

Observations of Kathryn further confirmed her grasp of possibilities. Courtney College had developed a training program for a large local corporation to place their laid off workers in jobs. Central to the project's purpose is placing people in jobs. One observation was of Kathryn in a meeting with executives from the corporation concerning the continuance of the training program.

Kathryn leaned forward in her chair to talk to Steve. "You know why I am here," she said. "We have received $250,000 from the state." Kathryn continued, "What are we going to do about this? We need to know your commitment and funds that you can provide to continue the project" (Fieldnotes, 6-3-87).

Observations were made of Kathryn in her office in activities not related directly to the college. Kathryn seemed to have a breadth of interest. While in Kathryn's office, phone calls she made and returned were observed. She is greatly involved in the arts. She also made a call concerning the small business development center, an arm of the community growth alliance (Fieldnotes, 6-4-87).

Kathryn's personal resume further reflects her breadth of interest. She has been involved in many activities which include the following:

Lakeside Foundation for the Arts, Chairperson of the Board, 1985-present.

Blossomland United Way, Chairperson of the Major Firms division. Responsible for 60% of the 1986 goal.
Twin Cities Area Chamber of Commerce, Executive board, 1985-present. Member, Community Development Committee.

Grand Rapids Civic Theatre, the Council of Performing Arts for Children, Member of the Board and Officer, 1965-1973.


Arts Council of Greater Grand Rapids. Member of the Board and President, 1970-1980. Developed annual fund drive for major organizations from $80,000 to $250,000. Procured major CETA grant for 14 local artists to work in the community. Director/co-chairperson for Festival '72, annual three-day citywide event attended by over 100,000 persons. Supervised 25 committees and 3,000 volunteers and developed theme, format, scheduling, and public relations.

YWCA, Grand Rapids, Michigan. Member of the Board.

Local Civic Theatre productions, 1974-1980, as an actress.

Grand Rapids Art Museum, Women's Committee.

Delta Delta Delta Alumnae, former local President.

Women's Resource Center, Grand Rapids, MI. Member, Board of Directors and Scholarship Committee. First administrator of $25,000 grant from Phillip Morris, Inc., for scholarships for part-time women students.


Southwestern Michigan Symphony, Women's Committee.

Kathryn seemed warm, sympathetic, and adaptable. "Kathryn's presence makes me feel supported and forgiven. She doesn't pretend to be perfect so I don't feel I have to be either" (Hope, 1987a). Victoria told me of the president's action toward her during the last 2 weeks when she had had a personal tragedy in her family:

When I received the phone call, she sat right there, moved her arms around me ... gave me her black necklace and earrings ... She left the conference, took me to the
airport, made sure I got on the plane, sort of gave me directions. . . . She watched the plane leave and called me when I got to my destination. (Fieldnotes, 6-23-87)

Kathryn and Vice-President Victoria are alike on two dimensions of their MBTI "types," N and P, and different on two, E (Kathryn), I (Victoria) and F (Kathryn), T (Victoria). The vice-president is an analyzer, INTP type, the I for introvert, the N for intuitive, the T for thinking, and P for perceptive. "Kathryn doesn't skirt around an issue," the director of continuing education said, "she hits them head on" (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87). Victoria is a T, the thinking type compared to the president's F, feeling type. According to the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator manual, the feeling type, Kathryn, may tend to be very aware of their people and their feelings. They enjoy pleasing people even in unimportant things. They like harmony. The thinking type, Victoria, may not show emotion readily and are often uncomfortable dealing with people's feelings. They may hurt people's feelings without knowing it.

The extension service coordinator's comments supported Victoria's thinking dimension. Some remarks she makes, due to the apprehensive relationship between faculty and administration, are taken out of context and taken negatively by the faculty as meaning "the administration does not care what we think" (Interview, Extension Service Coordinator, 6-24-87). Victoria had told me in an early interview about herself. "I once could toss out words like creative, bossy, critical. I'm not sure those same words apply every year or to every situation" (Interview, Vice-President Hope, 3-5-87).
The vice-president wants to be treated fairly. She related a story to me concerning unfair treatment at a different institution where she had been employed. "Another woman and I were promoted as assistant deans, and the six male assistant deans averaged $11,000 more per year in salary than the females. This upset me to no end. So I filed a Title IX complaint and got a lawyer" (Hope, 1987).

Victoria's personality seems to complement Kathryn's. How do Kathryn and Victoria work together? I asked. "Real well, they complement each other" Dean Knight said (Knight, 1987b).

Other interviews and observations illustrated Victoria's type, analyzer. She demonstrates her need for analysis and putting things in order.

After the cabinet meeting Victoria asked to meet with Kathryn. Victoria asked, "Please review the mail list and give me who to add so I can get them in order. I believe it would be good to have a few instructors at the millage breakfast... These are good selling strategies. (Fieldnotes, 6-3-87)

The director of continuing education further confirmed Victoria's need for analysis and order.

I give her a lot of credit. It's tough. I've seen her do what needs to be done. She's done a lot. She has worked real hard on the evaluation program. A new orderly system, the grid system. (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87)

Dean Elizabeth Knight is a detail person, an ISTJ "type" when using the Myers-Briggs Indicator, the I for introvert, S for sensing, T for thinking, and J for judging. Her "type" phrase is "manager of facts and details."
"I am organized and responsible," Elizabeth told me. "I am inclined to concentrate on this week. . . . I am not as farseeing as I would like to be. . . . I am a perfectionist" (Knight, 1987).

Dean Knight is like Vice-President Hope in the thinking, "T," dimension of the Myers-Briggs Indicator. "Her standards are incredible," the coordinator of the radiology technician program told me. "No sloppiness. . . . there is no almost with her, it has to be right" (Interview, Coordinator of Radiologic Technology, 7-14-87).

Unlike Kathryn and Victoria, Elizabeth is a "J" type, judging on the Myers-Briggs Indicator. The "T" infers that she may work best when she can plan her work and follow the plan to get things settled and finished. She may not notice new things that need to be done and dislikes interrupting a project she is on for a more urgent one.

Interviews and observations of Elizabeth work to clarify the Myers-Briggs results.

I'm still struggling to learn every aspect of the job, details, what it entails. I have a problem with crises management, I don't like to go from one crisis to another. I like to anticipate things in advance. . . . get one thing settled and finished. (Interview, Dean Knight, 3-5-87)

Observations of Elizabeth at meetings confirmed her methodical ways. During a meeting concerning the retreat for planning the report for North Central Accreditation, Elizabeth worked to organize the group.

It might be good to reconvene the committee including this task force, when we have the updated goals. . . . We are presenting goals as well as reviewing. . . . I don't feel real well organized at this point. . . . We as administrators need to get our act together before we tell others what to do. (Fieldnotes, 6-23-87)
Mary Scott is also an ISTJ type like Elizabeth, the I for introvert, S for sensing, T for thinking, and J for judging. Her role as "manager of facts and details" as described with the Myers-Briggs Indicator may complement her position as dean, library and learning resources.

Dr. Scott's Myers-Briggs Indicator results imply that she is dependable, decisive, painstaking, and systematic. She may be concerned with systems and organizations, stable, and quite conservative.

The "J" dimension of the Myers-Briggs Indicator represents the judging type. A judging type may like to plan her work and finish on schedule. Dean Scott does like a planned, orderly way of life. "They did not use a proactive approach before! We're trying to change from reactive now, to proactive," she said (Scott, 1987a).

Dean Scott has staff meetings with the library personnel. Kathryn had been invited to a meeting by Mary to lend support to the direction that Mary was taking in the learning resource center. The following observations were made after the president spoke.

There are three males and three females in the meeting. The body language of one of the women (arms crossed) spoke of the dissension I felt in the room. Mary Scott is in the difficult position of enacting change, being systematic, and replacing the former library founder "who could do no wrong!" (Fieldnotes, 6-23-87)
Individual Characteristics of the Subordinates:
Myers-Briggs Type Indicator

Each of the four major subjects has subordinate women managers who report to them. Figure 9 illustrates each manager and subordinate Myers-Briggs Indicator "type" relationship. Actual MBTI scores for each subject are provided in Appendix E.

Individual Characteristics and How They Appear to Relate to Management Relationships:
Myers-Briggs Type Indicator

The Myers-Briggs Indicator reports that President Kathryn Page is an extrovert. She is the only extrovert among the four female administrators. The vice-president and deans are introverts. Dr. Page's own words support her enthusiastic innovator dimension. "We are going to have the millage campaign," she said. "I will call each superintendent myself and ask them to identify a person to work with us" (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87).

According to Myers-Briggs interpretations, the clearest vision of the future may come from intuitive types like Kathryn and Victoria. The most practical realism may come from sensing types like Elizabeth and Mary. Incisive analysis may come from thinker types like Victoria, Elizabeth, and Mary; and the most skillful handling of people may come from a feeling type like Kathryn. Success for any enterprise demands a variety of types, each in the right place (Briggs, 1985).

Opposite types may supplement each other in any joint undertaking, but too much opposition may make it hard for people to work
### Myers-Briggs Type Indicator Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administrator</th>
<th>President Page</th>
<th>Vice-President Hope</th>
<th>Dean Knight</th>
<th>Dean Scott</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ENFP</td>
<td>INTP</td>
<td>ISTJ</td>
<td>ISTJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Planner of change</td>
<td>Analyzer</td>
<td>Manager of facts and details</td>
<td>Manager of facts and details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct reporting, women subordinate managers</td>
<td>1. INTP Analyzer (Hope)</td>
<td>1. ISTJ Manager of facts and details (Scott)</td>
<td>1. ESTJ Organizer (Coordinator of Radiologic Technology)</td>
<td>1. ISTP Analyzer (Reference Librarian)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. ENTJ Organizer (Director of Auxiliary Services)</td>
<td>2. ENTJ Organizer (Extension Service Coordinator)</td>
<td>2. ENTJ Organizer (Coordinator of Dental Assisting)</td>
<td>3. ISTJ Organizer (Director of Continuing Education)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. ESTJ Organizer (Director of Continuing Education)</td>
<td>3. ISTJ Manager of facts and details (Coordinator of Food Services)</td>
<td>4. ENTP Planner of change (Division Chairperson, Health Sciences)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9. Manager and Subordinate Type Relationship.
well together. The best teamwork is usually done by people who differ on one or two preferences only (Myers, 1976). Figure 10 illustrates the Myers-Briggs Indicator interpretation—"mutual usefulness of the opposites," women administrators to each other.

The management relationships of the women administrators and their subordinate women managers were also investigated using the results of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator. (See Figure 11.) It is interesting to note that the only "feeling type" is the president.

Selected Management Skills of the Main Subjects—Four Women Administrators

How do you come to understand certain skills of management enacted by women administrators managing subordinate women managers and whether they differ across individuals at Courtney Community College? One method is to ask the administrators and subordinates questions related to indicators found in the research literature; another is to observe behaviors. This research project used both methods of investigation.

The President

I came in May (President Page said), I wasn't supposed to start until July 1, but once I made the commitment here, my heart was here.

One of the first things we did was to take the faculty leadership and the administrators on a two day retreat. We began to meld ourselves as a group and then tried to identify the problem areas of the institution, where we wanted to go, and what we wanted to do. We really worked on specifics and came up with tasks. These people became responsible for translating that out to the other faculty when they came back. (Page, 1987b)
Intuitive (Kathryn, Victoria) may need a sensing type (Elizabeth, Mary):

To bring up pertinent facts
To remember things that weren't relevant at the time they happened
To read over a contract
To check records, read proofs, score tests
To notice what ought to be attended to
To inspect
To keep track of detail
To have patience

Sensing type (Elizabeth, Mary) may need an intuitive (Kathryn, Victoria):

To see the possibilities
To supply ingenuity on problems
To deal with a complexity having too many imponderables
To explain what another intuitive is talking about
To look far ahead
To furnish new ideas
To "spark" things that seem impossible

Thinker (Victoria, Elizabeth, Mary) needs a feeling type (Kathryn):

To persuade
To conciliate
To forecast how others will feel
To arouse enthusiasm
To teach
To sell
To advertise
To appreciate the thinker himself

Feeling type (Kathryn) needs a thinker (Victoria, Elizabeth, Mary):

To analyze
To organize
To find the flaws in advance
To reform what needs reforming
To weigh "the law and the evidence"
To hold consistently to a policy
To stand firm against opposition

Figure 10. Mutual Usefulness of the Opposites Using the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To bring up pertinent facts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To remember things that weren't relevant at the time they happened</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To read over a contract, to check records, read proof, score tests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To notice what ought to be attended to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To inspect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To keep track of detail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To have patience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To see the possibilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To deal with a complexity having too many imponderables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To explain what another intuitive is talking about</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To look far ahead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To furnish new ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To &quot;spark&quot; things that seem impossible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To persuade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To conciliate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To forecast how others will feel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To arouse enthusiasm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To teach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To sell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To advertise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To appreciate the thinker in himself or herself</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To analyze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To organize</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To find the flaws in advance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To reform what needs reforming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To weigh &quot;the law and evidence&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To hold consistently to a policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To stand firm against opposition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administrator</th>
<th>Kathryn (NF)</th>
<th>Victoria (NT)</th>
<th>Elizabeth (ST)</th>
<th>Mary (ST)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subordinates</td>
<td>Victoria (NT)</td>
<td>Mary (ST)</td>
<td>Chairperson (ST)</td>
<td>Ref. Librarian (ST)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 11.** Women Administrators to Subordinate Women Managers—Mutual Usefulness of the Opposites Using the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.

The stage was set to begin the work needed to reach the goals established by the faculty and administrators, but how does the president motivate and lead her followers?

A measure of Kathryn's effective leadership was her understanding of the needs of a group of followers. Indications of this understanding were observed in a meeting with Victoria Hope, vice-president, and the two deans, Elizabeth and Mary. The purpose of the meeting was for information about the Community College Institute to be held at a state university:

The boardroom is large and grey. In the center is a large round glass top table with burgundy plush roller chairs.

"How was your weekend?" Kathryn asked.

"The state university is having scholarships for the institute, a $66 reimbursement is available," she said. "We can use this opportunity for everyone to do something different. You don't have to hear me speak. You hear me speak all the time!" (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87)

Kathryn invited them to all ride together in her college car and share rooms. "We will take a project as a group along and use this as a 'thinktank time' " (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87).

Vice-President Hope asked to discuss the concept of release time. Discussion followed.

Dean Knight asked if the president would have time that day to approve a document. The president paused then to read it. "I don't want to hold up your work," she said (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87). Kathryn understands behaviors essential to motivation; she is considerate of her subordinates.
All the women administrators were relaxed, free, and open with the president. Their body language confirmed the tone of the meeting. Kathryn motivates through this open communication.

Kathryn also supports the growth and advancement of her administrators. Dean Scott discussed the method used to send in the money for the institute. "We will find the money," Dr. Page said and patted the dean on the shoulder. They laughed (Fieldnotes, 6-1-87).

Further observations of Dr. Page confirmed her understanding of behaviors essential to motivation. She recognizes faculty and staff achievements, even as they retire.

Memorandum

December 8, 1986

Re: Service Awards Banquet
Don, thank you very much for your hard work on the evening of the Service Awards Banquet. Without your guidance, I know that much of what occurred would not have occurred so smoothly. You are to be commended for working hard to make it all happen for the rest of us.

I have forwarded a memorandum, as well, on to the persons who worked that evening's activities. I know that they, too, have made a real contribution to Courtney College. Thank you for being a part.

Memorandum

January 7, 1987

Re: Inservice Days

Thank you for a job well done during the 1987 inservice days. Each of you made a fine contribution to the College, and for that I am most grateful. Any preparation requires time and effort above and beyond the call of duty. Your
effort on behalf of all of us was such an undertaking. Thank you.

People like you make this college a special place. I am proud to call you colleague.

Memorandum

June 10, 1987

Re: Work on the Water Main

Thanks, fellow, for a job well done last week with the broken water main. It is always encouraging for me to know that the College physical plant is in such good hands. I do appreciate all that you do for all of us.

Letter

June 5, 1987

Dear Bob:

By now you've had one full day of full retirement from [Courtney College]. You need to know the very first thing I noticed this morning was that the air conditioning was too cool in the Student Center and I had no one to call, or at least I thought I didn't. Your name crossed my mind and I started to pick up the phone and realized you were no longer here. To make a long story short you are already missed at the College.

I do hope that you are going to find that retirement is going to be as full and exciting as the years of work at [Courtney College]. You will be missed here, you have truly made a difference. My warm regards to you and Mary Ann. We know in the years ahead that the both of you are still going to be supporters of this fine institution. Again, Bob, thank you for everything.

Warm personal regards.

The president demonstrated behaviors that are measures of effective leadership with her subordinate women managers. At a cabinet
meeting I observed her with these women:

"Can we do a couple of things before we start the millage meeting," Victoria asked. Kathryn replied, "Of course. . . ."

"Are there any questions or comments for Victoria," Kathryn asked. . . .

"I hear what you are saying," she told Elizabeth. . . .

"Are you comfortable with this," she asked Mary. . . .

"Is there a more effective way of handling this," Kathryn asked Victoria. . . .

"I think the video tape is a good idea," she told Mary. (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87)

Kathryn understands the needs of individuals and the needs of groups. During a workshop held for cabinet members, I observed the climate Kathryn has created among her women administrators:

The atmosphere is informal, relaxed, and comfortable. Each woman participated in the discussion, the task is understood and accepted by others, decisions are reached by consensus, feelings are expressed freely. . . . Kathryn said, "You need to know you are doing great. . . ." It's not a good old boys meeting here. . . . Here in this room are people who have worked extraordinarily hard. They are good folk, steam rollers. (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87)

Kathryn motivates by using committees, by recognizing subordinate achievements, and by participative management.

Dr. Page's enactment of selected management skills did not change from one subordinate female administrator to another. She does not socialize with her staff, although she knows a lot about them personally. When asked how, she said, "I ask them" (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87).

The president motivates and leads her women administrators. Victoria was asked about the president's behaviors essential to
motivation.

I have seen her inspire the staff. She's a warm and caring person, basically they love her.... She is best friends with more people than I even know.... She networks and refers people to others.... She has more energy than six normal people.... It's difficult for her staff to meet her very high expectations. She thinks her staff can do anything. She has as high expectations for others as she has for herself....

She's very supportive of all of our staff. The way that she would shows it in a meeting is by reiterating points you have made.... She will trust you to answer letters for her signature which she changes very little. .... She recognizes her subordinates' achievements every month at the board meeting, at the beginning.... She uses welcome pins. When you're employed you get a little pin with a logo on it.... In meetings Kathryn will say thank you for an idea, and will give you credit for an idea, which a lot of people don't--they just use them. She can afford to give that away, she doesn't have to have it all for herself.... She promotes my growth and advancement by suggesting that I attend various kinds of workshops.... It is very simple for Kathryn to make decisions and decide things ought to be a certain way--difficult for her to have the patience to let things unravel through a committee. Her quickness makes her impatient with others' slowness and she's had to really work on that. (Hope, 1987b)

Dean Elizabeth Knight, although not reporting directly to the president, is a member of the administrative cabinet and has almost daily contact with Kathryn. She discussed Kathryn's understanding of motivation.

"My first contact with Kathryn was during a public interview by the board of trustees," Elizabeth said. "One question was what would her position to the board be. She would run the college and report to the board. This was an excellent move on her part" (Knight, 1987b).
Dean Knight, when asked about Kathryn, said, "She's aware of everyone she works with. She tries ... is very supportive to me ... lets me know she's supportive by sending memos and thank yous" (Knight, 1987b).

Memorandum

June 17, 1987
To: Elizabeth Knight
From: Kathryn Page
Re: Perkins Audit

Elizabeth, I received a call yesterday from Larry Barber at the State Department of Education. He simply wanted me to know that the Perkins Audit, which we filed with MDE, was the finest audit response that he had ever encountered in his years of working with the Department. That compliment is, of course, a credit to you and the superb job you did for us. How fortunate we are to have you at the College.

Thank you.

Memorandum

To: Elizabeth Knight
From: Kathryn Page
Re: Thank you

You were wonderful ambassadors for Courtney College. I cannot thank you enough for your time, for your energy and your commitment for making Expo II such a success. I was so proud for our college's contribution. The success of that contribution is clearly a tribute to you.

Other comments made by Dean Knight during our interview concerning behaviors essential to motivation were as follows:
The president gives me responsibilities, but I'm not as sure of myself so I check.

She supports my growth and advancement by giving me permission to go to conferences and other activities.

Participative management? Kathryn talks about a project, gathers data from people... others move people along to get the decision she wants... which takes time.

[The president provides management by objectives.] At a retreat last year we developed a set of goals and objectives and given to the faculty and staff in August. The goals and objectives helped them develop a budget. Another retreat is planned and new goals and objectives will be written then disseminated to faculty for them to have an opportunity for changes and alterations.

The president has high expectations of herself but she is practical.

We have open communication. I can go inside Kathryn's office, close the door and speak to her about anything. I have even cautioned her about an issue. She followed up on it and responded to my caution.

She uses teams and committees. She will take the teams' suggestions but also interject that they might think in terms of the way she wants them to... then she asks them to make their decision. She'll let them know she stands behind their decision. Several times she has admitted that she didn't have enough information about expense and costs of a project. (Knight, 1987b)

Dean Knight also discussed Kathryn's leadership: "She doesn't take care of herself like she should but she does take out time to be with her family... She is a risk taker and sees the big picture. She believes our college has potential" (Knight, 1987b).

Dr. Kathryn Page discussed her understanding of effective leadership and motivation during an interview:

I do believe in the issue of situational leadership. I am a strong part of the team-building. I can give up my ownership and give up my power. There are times when I realize that I can't wait for that and must move into a more autocratic role. That happens. Sometimes that
happens in the beginning. The task is more important and takes precedence. That can save the situation. I have saved the situation in some instances by using a more autocratic, task form of leadership.

I try to use participative management . . . elicit discussion from all of them, and give them a chance for input and feedback. . . . You have to earn trust . . . . You have to give them the freedom to say negative things to you, if they feel it is called for. (Page, 1987c)

Dean Mary Scott discussed the president's leadership:

The more I know her the more I like her. She is not a woman president. She is the president. She works to get things done . . . . She has a vision . . . . She supports what I need . . . . I think she will eventually turn most of the faculty members around . . . . I never felt I would like working for a woman boss, but Dr. Page makes me feel good. (Fieldnotes, 7-30-87)

"She understands the importance of the media program . . . . Here I believe Dr. Page is my mentor, she helps me out" (Scott, 1987a).

The director of auxiliary services reports directly to the president. The interview with her about Dr. Page provided a descriptive view of the president's leadership.

Dr. Page is full of an intense amount of energy. . . . She is supportive and plays a mentor role . . . . She is aware of where people want to go and takes risks of putting them in positions that in writing may not appear they are prepared for . . . . She gives people the benefit of doubt. (Interview, 9-13-87)

She also discussed Kathryn's behaviors essential to motivation.

She recognizes subordinates' big achievements but cannot be aware of small daily achievements . . . .

In delegating she expects you to go from the beginning to the end, she stretches you . . . .

Enacting participative management is a real conflict . . . . There are times when she wants a great deal of input . . . . There are times she must and does make decisions . . . .
We are trying to use goals and objectives.... The college is moving so fast.... We have 90 day goals and a 3 year plan....

Dr. Page really desires open communication.... She asks for it.... In a real crisis she really wants to know what is going on.... People tend not to give her information until a crisis and that frustrates her.... She allows you to be self-directed and expects you to use it....

She tries to mix people up on teams for a project who normally don't work together. She did this for the millage campaign and is doing it for the North Central accreditation. (Interview, 9-13-87)

She further discussed Kathryn's leadership.

She understands her role and realizes that her job is not to deal with day-to-day operations.... She is a motivator of her people.... I have never met anyone better at rapport with the community....

She understands the needs of the strappers, go-getters. She knows what makes them tick.... When people are not effective she is frustrated....

Dr. Page wants to treat people fairly.... She is a true delegator and gives you authority to do it.... She is a real innovator.... financial resources is the only thing that stops innovation. (Interview, 9-13-87)

Dr. Page's interaction with the director of auxiliary services confirmed her reported enactment of management skills. At a cabinet meeting concerning the budget, the director was given the charge of leading the discussion. During a segment held on a prioritizing method the director was able to discuss her own needs in order to complete her assigned task:

Many mini-discussions are going on at this table, [the director said]. I want to be real up front. I'm frustrated because no one is paying attention. I am sorry, but I am really angry. I can't get you guys to pay attention enough to prioritize 10 items! "That's fair," Dr. Page replied. "Let's go for it!" (Fieldnotes, 6-3-87)
The president provided support to her subordinate to help the
director accomplish her goal.

While interviewing the subordinate women managers who report to
the vice-president and the two deans, they also shared comments about
the president's understanding of motivation.

Dr. Page will send me a short note recognizing an accom­
plishment. . . . She always wants me to go to workshops for
professional development. . . . The president in general
wants to manage by objectives. . . . I like Kathryn Page a
lot. . . . She has done a lot for the college in general.
. . . She's very good. One of her philosophies is manage­
ment by walking around. . . . She's very receptive. . . .
She makes everybody feel comfortable. (Interview, Director
of Continuing Education, 6-24-87)

Her leadership was also discussed, "She has made a lot of people
aware of Courtney. . . . She is dynamic, intelligent, competent, and
resourceful" (Interview, Coordinator of Dental Assisting, 7-15-87)

From people outside, you would see a wonderful view of
Kathryn. . . . I like her personally. . . . I feel that she
won't be here in 5 years which is very understandable. . . .
She is visionary but not as good at the planning and imple­
menting stage. (Interview, Director of Continuing Educa­
tion, 6-3-87)

The "Queen" everyone saw her as a Madonna. . . . She's
real consistent. . . . She's made a difference. . . . Some
of her followers have lost the faith in her but I didn't
have unreasonable thoughts. (Interview, Coordinator of
Radiologic Technology, 7-14-87)

The Vice-President

Victoria Hope has three women reporting to her: Dean Mary
Scott, the director of continuing education, and the coordinator of
extension services.
I interviewed these women about the vice-president's behavior essential to motivation.

She is a good supervisor. . . . I feel I can go to her. . . . She is supportive but doesn't understand the area. . . . She can be defensive about some areas--it is her manner not what she says. . . . I don't know if she recognizes my achievements but I know she approves of what I am doing. . . . She gives me total authority of what goes on here. . . . She encourages me to go to conferences. . . . She asks for input and my opinion. . . . She asks me for my goals and objectives. . . . She is flexible and very supportive. . . . She uses committees and we have monthly meetings. . . . She was very innovative with the faculty salary grid. (Interview, Dean Mary Scott, 7-28-87)

Another subordinate further described Victoria's understanding of motivation.

She has given me great personal support. . . . I don't feel that I have been given the support in dollars and in staff to do the job but she gives me suggestions, ideas on a person-to-person, professional level. I can never complain about that. . . . She does send me a note to recognize my achievements. . . . There's no shortage of projects that I am directly responsible. . . . She tries through staff meetings to have participative management. . . . Credit is given and acknowledged at board meetings, at administrative council, faculty and staff meetings. . . . She wants to manage by objectives. . . . She has high performance goals and makes it very clear that just getting the job done is not quite enough. . . . You are given the latitude to do the job the way you think you should. . . . I have very open communication with her. . . . She has staff meetings but they are not totally successful. She ends up saying that we've got to meet individually. (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87)

The vice-president's leadership was also discussed.

She understands her role and tries to direct us within those guidelines. . . . She tries to get the mechanisms working interdepartmentally and is also very effective one-on-one. . . . She is not effective in front of a group. . . . She tries to be consistent but she might be real understanding with me but not as understanding with someone else. . . . She lets me develop programs in any way I want, I am not restricted--it is usually why not? Why can't we do it? . . . She is futuristic in her planning and sees the
big picture and that gets them in trouble—not doing all the steps in between. . . . She wants written evaluations of goals, what we haven't accomplished and why. . . . This department has lots of problems, although we have done lots of good things. (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87)

Another subordinate woman manager described Ms. Hope's understanding of motivation.

Knowing her on a professional level is different than knowing her on a personal level. . . . In a lot of ways I can relate to Victoria professionally. . . . She is not well liked by the faculty. . . . She has been very good with me. . . . I can go to her office and communicate openly with her about what is going on. . . . I respect her and I know she cares. . . . She is considerate, any request of mine on what to develop or things to do, she's been behind me. I have never received a negative answer from her. She trusts me. . . . I am constantly receiving appreciation. . . . She gives me responsibilities. . . . Participative management, yes. She just doesn't tell you to do this and this, it's give me an idea and I'll give you an idea. . . . She expects her subordinates to do their best with the minimum amount of surveillance. . . . She has a lot of different areas that she is in charge of. Communications might be a weakness. . . . For myself, I feel she is great. . . . She really ties things together and keeps it on the right track. Saying "this is what we are going to do." She always treated me more than fairly. (Interview, Coordinator of Extension Services, 6-23-87)

The Dean, Occupational Studies

Elizabeth Knight has four women managers who report to her.

They each shared their own perceptions of Dean Knight's enactment of behaviors essential to effective leadership.

There are several things she stood up for last year. . . . She says "go for it" and I do. . . . She is creative and innovative—like working on articulation with other colleges. . . . Her communications to me are very clear. . . . She is logical and precise. . . . Just taking the new position was being a risk taker. . . . She probably sees the big picture better than higher administration. (Interview, Coordinator of Food Services, 7-15-87)
Another manager shared her perception about the dean's behavior essential to motivation.

I believe she is real considerate in our relationship. I went into a position I had never held before and she has taken that into consideration in dealing with my frustrations. . . . She is definitely supportive of what we are doing. She is always available for comment and input into what my thoughts and feelings are. . . . She has helped my growth and advancement. . . . She has supplied me with a lot of information of that, opportunities. . . . I think she devotes a lot of time to each department. I think she is well organized and lays out her time well. (Interview, Chairperson, 7-15-87)

Another shared her thoughts on the dean's leadership.

She is very self-directed. . . . The people I associate with have a lot of respect for her. They understand that she is new and take that into consideration. . . . People think she is well-educated, has knowledge of what she is doing, and has a sincere concerned attitude. They believe as I believe that she is doing the best she possibly can. . . . There are things that have happened in the institution, and are happening, that she has some really strong opinions of and I think she stands up well for those. . . . I have never heard anybody say that she has gone against their trust. (Interview, Chairperson, 7-15-87)

A different perspective also emerged concerning the dean's understanding of motivation.

I do not think we are well taken care of. . . . She's not the "at-a-boy" type. . . . She does not provide me with opportunity, responsibility. . . . I went to her and told her I have the capacity and want more and am willing to do more. . . . I have a lot of things to attend to but I still can't feel challenged. She was surprised. . . . There are no staff meetings but division meetings. . . . Being here is like being unsupervised. . . . She doesn't want us to be open. . . . I make a difference, but she won't say that. . . . She's never available, always in meetings. (Interview, Coordinator of Radiologic Technology, 7-15-87)

Another perspective was also shared about Elizabeth's leadership.
She has taken care of me. . . . She tells me when I'm getting myself in trouble. . . . After a board meeting she came to our office and tried to get a sense of our perspective, a defusing—I think that was very considerate. . . . She has come out very strong for me and the program. . . . She recognizes my achievements with the college. She laughs and that tells me that she understands and is supportive. . . . She will tell me, "this is working out well. . . ." She will bring up something someone did well in a group. . . . When I need help I go talk to her. . . . She works on promoting me. . . . We have long discussions at meetings about things. She encourages us to speak up. . . . She expects things to be done well and done right. . . . She says we are doing a good job. . . . She delegates real, real well, better than anyone I have ever seen. . . . I have the sense she is on the side of the faculty; she is careful that we don't take off without the other divisions. . . . I have a great sense of fairness about her. . . . She talks to adjunct faculty; she goes right to them. . . . She has a high sense of trust, no question about that. . . . She is orderly, cheerful, has a wonderful sense of humor; she is careful. . . . She is a risk taker but not fool hearted. . . . She always says, "let's try to make things work. . . ." She has worked to get the separation down between faculty and administration. . . . She takes care of her people. (Interview, Coordinator of Dental Assisting, 7-15-87)

The Dean, Library and Learning Resources

Dean Mary Scott has one woman manager reporting to her. She shared her perspective concerning Dr. Scott's behavior essential to motivation.

The dean has a meeting of our area personnel once a month. . . . She is in and out a lot because she has a lot of meetings. . . . She will always take time to see me. . . . She is willing to make change and is supportive of my ideas. . . . She has her own ideas and a strong will but she takes suggestions. . . . She is quite serious and very detailed, over detailed at times. . . . I would like her to ask me, not lecture me. . . . She recognizes my achievements, I overheard her mention that I had done a good job to another staff member. . . . She doesn't hover over me. . . . We evaluate her anonymously and then we evaluate ourselves. . . . She sent me to a conference on telecommunications. . . . She asks for our input, like on summer hours.
(Interview, Reference Librarian, 7-15-87)

She also discussed the dean's leadership.

I have the feeling that she is in charge.... If there were real problems I could go to her.... She is a little bit hard to talk with.... She thinks BIG, I start small.... She is more on the independent side.... She is business and academic.... She tries to treat people fairly, but there are personality conflicts. (Interview, Reference Librarian, 7-15-87)

Mary Scott was positive in her relationship with the reference librarian. She demonstrated her leadership skills in area meetings that were observed.

Mary sat at the head of the room with all the chairs in a semicircle. She is open and inviting to each person, yet they seem quite reserved in her presence. I sense that she is trying to gain their acceptance in her new position. (Fieldnotes, 7-16-87)
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS

On her last Wednesday on campus, the investigator hosted a luncheon for the administrators and their subordinate women managers. "So what have you found out about us?" Kathryn asked (Fieldnotes, 7-29-87). Caught off guard the investigator responded with a working hypothesis that she had been able to confirm over and over again. "You are not afraid to trust your sisters," she replied (Fieldnotes, 7-29-87).

It was the exploration of the management relationships of women managing women in a community college that had led to this study. Kathryn Page, Victoria Hope, Elizabeth Knight, and Mary Scott each brought their own individual MBTI characteristics and skills of management to Courtney College. How their MBTI characteristics related to management relationships with subordinate women managers and how they enacted the human skills of management with different subordinate women managers is the focus of this study.

Findings About Women to Women Management Relationships at Courtney College

The Apparent Relevance of Individual MBTI Characteristics

Although there were no absolutes, certain patterns did emerge in this study concerning the relationship of MBTI characteristics to
management relationships of women administrators with subordinate women managers. There are likenesses among the four women that emerge from their family backgrounds, life experiences, and from their female being. Their individual characteristics and how they related to their relationships with subordinate women managers were explored through interviews, observations, and the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator.

One striking characteristic across all four women administrators was the absence of a strong father figure during their childhood years. Three of the female administrators' fathers died when they were young. The other administrator, although her father was living, described her relationship with her father as "a lot less tangible" (Knight, 1987a).

In contrast to the absence of a strong father figure is the appearance of a strong mother figure in their lives:

She was motivation, she promoted my education. . . . We have a sense of competition. (Page, 1987a)

Mother promoted the idea of a college education, "knowledge is power." (Hope, 1987a)

She viewed education for her child as extremely important and made financial sacrifices. My mother is strong and dominant. (Knight, 1987a)

My mother was very strict. . . . She had very high expectations of me. She wanted a career for her daughter. (Scott, 1987a)

These findings are not consistent with those of Hennig and Jardim (1977), who reported that women holding positions of power "all had had extremely close relationships with their fathers" (p. 99). However, the pattern appears to be worth testing in a
larger study.

Individual characteristics as determined through the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator and described in Chapter IV tended to support the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposites."

As described in Chapter IV (see Figure 11, page 96), the following patterns emerged:

1. Both Victoria Hope (INTP) and the director of auxiliary services (ENTJ) report to Kathryn and described and enacted a positive management relationship with the president (Kathryn, ENFP). All are different Myers-Briggs types. This is consistent with the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposite types."

2. Mary Scott (ISTJ), the dean of library and learning resources (ENTJ), and the extension service coordinator (ESTJ) report to Victoria and described and enacted a positive management relationship with the vice-president (Victoria, INTP). All are different Myers-Briggs types. This is also consistent with the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposite types."

3. The department chairperson (ESTJ), the coordinator of food management (ENTJ), and the coordinator of dental assisting (ENTP) report to Dean Knight and all described a positive management relationship with the Dean (Elizabeth, ISTJ). All are different Myers-Briggs types and, hence, lend more to support the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposite types." The coordinator of radiologic technology (ISTJ) did not describe the same positive management relationship, yet is an opposite "type."
4. The reference librarian (ISTP) who reports to Dean Scott (ISTJ) did not describe a totally positive management relationship. They are the same "type" in three areas, I, S, and T. This also tends to support the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposite types."

These patterns appear to support the concept that opposite Myers-Briggs type workers have a more positive management relationship than same or similar Myers-Briggs type workers. Subordinates with opposite indicators than their superordinates described a positive relationship. Subordinates with the same Myers-Briggs type indicators as their superordinate described a less compatible management relationship. This hypothesis is worth testing in a larger study.

Work Experiences: Women to Women

Literature on women to women management relationships is limited. The research reviewed for Chapter II provides a means of comparing and contrasting the findings at Courtney to previous research.

Hammer (1978) reported that women managing other women must "share the turf," accommodate each other's goals, not act "like the boss," must have a strong sense of self-confidence, and be supportive to other females. Josefowitz (1985) asserted specific dynamics that exist when women supervise women.

Discounting of your authority (what do you as a female know about being in charge), jealousy (what made you better qualified than they), testing (if you're so good, let's see
if you can take it), gossip (talk about your personal life or allegations made about your sex life with people in the office), attempts made to become your friend (being close to the seat of power), and sexual stereotypes (because you're a woman, you will be more understanding and therefore more lenient, less demanding). (pp. 47-48)

Kanter (1976) found women managers recognized as "the mother" (caretaker), "the pet" (little sister or mascot), "the sex object" (fails to establish herself as a professional), or "the Iron Maiden" (tries too hard to establish herself as a professional and comes to be seen as more tyrannical than she intends to be or really is).

Williams (1977) reported that in women to women relationships the subordinates either "adore or abhor the manager" (p. 56). The dynamics of the mother daughter relationship (girls more resented being disciplined by their mothers than boys did) comes into play in the management relationship also.

Williams (1977) also found that a woman must demonstrate that she will use her power to help them and that she will work to develop the intelligence of her women employees.

Kanter (1982) found that women in working with other women carry unmet needs, fears, and hopes.

Hammer (1978) reported four negative stereotypes of women who wield power over other women. The "earth mother" provides cookies, aspirin, and verbal chicken soup; the "manipulator" uses her feminine wiles to get her way—she has her own ends in mind; "the workaholic" whose weakness is her inability to delegate; and the egalitarian leader who denies the power of her role and claims to relate to all subordinates as her colleagues.
Though there were no absolutes, certain patterns did emerge related to these previous research findings. "We're all in this together," Kathryn had asserted concerning budget problems (Fieldnotes, 6-2-87). The key informants at Courtney did share the turf and worked to accommodate each other's goals. No subordinate reported that their manager acted "like the boss," and generally all reported that their administrators were supportive. Subordinate female managers did not discount the authority of their female administrator and did not test her or make comments about her personal life. Sexual stereotyping did not come into play.

Kathryn was considered the "mother" (Fieldnotes, 7-14-87) by some, and the "Iron Maiden" phenomenon was described by the subordinate of one female administrator (Fieldnotes, 6-24-87).

There was not one female administrator or subordinate woman manager who did not "adore" Kathryn in an overall sense. There were no "earth mothers," "manipulators," or "egalitarian leaders." Each subordinate believed her administrator "understood her role."

The four main administrators in this study were asked about stresses they had experienced when managing other women, were confrontations common, and were they different from ones with men who report to them. "I am so open with all of them," Kathryn replied (Page, 1987a). "I am more formal with men," Victoria said (Hope, 1987a). "There is a job to be done, the fact that you're a woman is not part of the problem," said Elizabeth (Knight, 1987a). "I just forget my sex and work as an individual," Mary said (Scott, 1987a).
All four administrators did not relate management stresses or confrontations to women to women relationships. The majority of subordinate women, six out of eight, did not relate management stresses or confrontations to women to women relationships in administrator-subordinate situations. At Courtney College the women to women relationships were generally very positive.

Management Skills of Four Women Administrators

A subset of management skills were investigated through interviews and observations. In this study the four administrators' skills of management did not appear to differ across individuals. The perceptions of two women subordinates varied but generally the application of management skills did not differ. Each administrator-subordinate woman manager relationship was investigated. The indicators used to investigate their subset of management skills were suggested through research by Bennis (1982), Burns (1978), Josefowitz (1980), and Kanter (1987) (see Appendix B).

President Kathryn Page's enactment of the management skills that were studied were not observed to differ from one woman subordinate manager to another as reported in Chapter IV. She did not appear to vary her skills while off campus at meetings, during board meetings, or on a personal level: "I have seen her inspire the whole room" (Interview, Vice-President Hope, 6-23-87). "I have never met anyone with better PR" (Interview, Dean Knight, 7-13-87).

Vice-President Victoria Hope was not observed to differ in her enactment of skills from one woman subordinate manager to another.
"She is a good supervisor" (Interview, Extension Service Coordinator, 7-28-87). "She has given me great personal support" (Interview, Director of Continuing Education, 6-23-87). "She trusts me" (Interview, Dean Scott, 6-23-87). The vice-president is respected by the three women who report to her.

The dean of occupational studies, Elizabeth Knight, has four women managers reporting to her. Their feedback was that Dean Knight appeared to be consistent across individuals in her enactment of the skills of management, although one subordinate perceived her skills as being different from the other three who provided feedback. The one subordinate related, "I make a difference, but she won't say that" (Interview, Coordinator of Radiologic Technology, 7-15-87). In general, the dean appeared to be consistent across individuals. "Her communications are very clear" (Interview, Coordinator of Dental Assisting, 7-15-87). "She has helped me grow and advance" (Interview, Coordinator of Food Services, 7-15-87). "She has taken care of me" (Interview, Chairperson, Health Sciences, 7-15-87).

Dean Mary Scott was also reported as providing the same skills of management as the president, vice-president, and Dean Knight. "She will always take time to see me" (Interview, Reference Librarian, 7-15-87). Because she has only one female subordinate manager it was not possible to observe whether skills differed with different female subordinate managers.
Hypotheses

During the process of research for this study, working hypotheses emerged during interviews and observation. Triangulation was used in order to get different perspectives from many sources concerning individual characteristics and skills of management, enacted by each of the four women administrators.

Hypotheses that developed concerning women to women management relationships are listed below. All are worthy of testing.

1. Women administrators appear to be absent a strong father figure during their childhood years.

2. Women managers who report to women tend to support the Myers-Briggs concept of "mutual usefulness of opposite types."

3. Women administrators appear to be supportive of subordinate women managers.

4. The subset of management skills of women administrators did not appear to differ across individuals.

Implications for Future Research

The hypotheses described above should be tested in future research.

Whether the findings of this study in one community college occur in other community colleges with a woman president and many women administrators needs to be investigated.

Women to women management relationships should be investigated in many settings before strong conclusions can be drawn about the management of women by other women.
Personal Data, Background Information

Respondent:

Title:

Age range: Under 35 35 to 45 46 to 55 over 55

You report to:

Professional women who report to you:

Mother's education/occupation:

Father's education/occupation:

Mother/daughter relationship:

Father/daughter relationship:

Undergraduate institution(s):

Undergraduate major: Degree: Year:

Graduate institution(s):

Graduate majors: Degree: Year:

Years in current job:

Years at this institution:

Marital status: Married single widowed divorced separated

Feelings about the feminine role?
Work Experiences

Areas and Issues

Work experience before present position?

Work experiences managing other women?

Female mentors/role models?

Male mentors/role models?

Stresses when managing other women?

1. Confrontations?
   A. Context?
   B. Issues?
   C. How resolved?

2. Are confrontations common?
   Common circumstances/areas of confrontation?

Differences between managing women and men?

A. Context?
B. Issues?
C. How resolved?
Appendix B

Management Skills--Administrator
Understanding Motivation

1. Do you believe that your manager is:
   A. Considerate? (Give an example)
   B. Supportive? (Give an example)
   C. Recognizes subordinates' achievements? (Give an example)

2. Does your manager provide:
   A. Responsibility opportunities?
      Example:
   B. Growth or advancement?
      Example:
   C. Participative management?
      Example:
   D. Management by objectives?
      Example:
   E. High performance goals?
      Example:
   F. Flexible roles?
      Example:
   G. Open communication?
      Example:
   H. Reliance on self-direction?
      Example:
   I. Teams?
      Example:
   J. Committees?
      Example:
Effective Leadership

1. Do you believe that your manager:

A. Understands her role/position?
   Example:

B. Understands needs of individuals?
   Example:

C. Uses fullest potential of each individual?
   Example:

D. Understands needs of groups?
   Example:

E. Uses good judgment?
   Example:

F. Possesses intellectual efficiency?
   Example:

2. Are the needs of groups met?
   Example:

3. Do you believe that your manager:

A. Treats people fairly?
   Example:

B. Empowers others to act and have visions?
   Example:

C. Innovates?
   Example:

D. Communicates so uncertainties are reduced?
   Example:

E. Is transformational?
   Example:

F. Moves the organization toward goals?
   Example:

G. Measures attainment of goals?
   Example:
H. Manages attention (details, goals, people, programs)?
   Example:

I. Manages meaning (communication, decision-making, climate)?
   Example:

J. Manages trust (sell, tell, delegates, participate)?
   Example:

K. Manages self (knowing one's skills)?
   Example:

L. Is a risk taker?
   Example:

M. Sees the big picture?
   Example:
Appendix C

Facts About the Courtney College Millage
FACTS about the [Courtney] College Millage.

A history of fiscal responsibility.

- Current operating levy (1 mill) was voted 24 years ago.
- No past requests for a general operating millage increase.
- Average operating millage for [state] community colleges is 1.66 mills.
- One mill level is the lowest voted millage among [the state's] 29 community colleges.

Continued efforts to generate non-tax revenue.

- Increased number of students enrolled.
- Increased student tuition.
- Increased student fees.
- Increased number of revenue-producing conferences, workshops and special events held at [CC].
- Aggressively pursued grants and private support.

Continued high level of performance.

- 100% of practical nursing graduates passed their state board exams for 13 years in a row.
- Graduates of many technology programs have a 100% placement rate.

Programs that reach the entire community.

- Over 5,000 students registered each year.
- Over 70,000 people a year attend meetings, seminars, concerts, trade shows, plays and other events at [CC].
- Over 2,500 employees from 150 area businesses have been served by the Institute for Business & Industry and Small Business Development Center programs.
Improving the economic base and the quality of life.

- Trained, educated people are key to community development.

- Business needs trained employees to stay competitive.

- Technical and professional people need a place to maintain and update their skills.

- Attracting new businesses and keeping those we have now will depend on offering community facilities which enrich the quality of life.

FACTS about the [Courtney] College Millage Request.

Ten improvement goals reach toward the area's future.

1. Make instructional equipment current.

   - North Central Accreditation has strongly advised that science and general study labs be re-equipped.


   - Provide stronger basic foundation and then use today's technology to get better teaching results.

3. Upgrade student assessment, career planning and placement services.

4. Implement new and expand current economic development activities to meet needs throughout the College district.

   - More, active, profitable businesses providing jobs for more skilled employees.

5. Improve the ratio of full-time faculty to part-time faculty.

   - North Central Accreditation cited this as an area needing improvement.

6. Expand programs and facilities in the South County.
- To enhance the level and range of programs and services offered to South County residents and businesses through the South Campus and Small Business Development Center.

7. Create a telecommunications center and develop programs in graphics and communications.
   - Link [CC] with resources across the state and channel those to educational institutions and businesses in . . . [the college area].

8. Develop and expand a fine arts curriculum.
   - For balance and continued quality of life.

9. Increase the number and amount of scholarships and financial aid available to students.
   - To let as many as possible be strong assets to our community.

10. Develop resources to provide curricula and programs to meet the needs of area and business and industry.

Wise use of existing facilities.
- Existing unfinished Community Center will be converted to The Center for Arts & Education and TBI/SBDC.

- 1,500 seat auditorium for plays, concerts and events.

- Classrooms and performance space for [CC] fine arts program.

- Offices and training rooms for Institute for Business & Industry and Small Business Development Center.

- Telecommunications center to provide educational programming for business and industry, [CC] programs and other educational institutions.

Specific uses for the money.

- Return instructional equipment to an approved level.
- Develop a computer-aided instruction program.
- Creation of a Skill Enhancement Center for basic skills.
- Install telecommunications systems to receive programs from other state educational institutions and forward them to communities and business in . . . [the college area].
- Renovate existing space for better usage.
- New facility for South Campus.
- Conversion of the Community Center.
- Improve support for the fine arts.
- Improve library services.
- Expand and improve . . . programs and facilities.
- Development activities for new and existing staff.
- Money for matching grants which [CC] has been able to attract.
- General operations including salaries, supplies, utilities, postage, telephone, etc.

The need is now. The benefits far outweigh the cost.

- If your house has a market value of $100,000 (an assessed value of $50,000), the millage increase will cost you about 97 cents a week.
- It takes an increase of $1 million in taxable property value to get an added $1,000 in operating revenue.
- The increase will produce $2.2 million in general operating funds to help [CC] meet the needs of our area.

[Courtney] College does make a difference--can you help us continue?

After 24 years can you raise our allowance by less than $1 a week? (Courtney College, 1987c)
Appendix D

Release Form
Release Form

I understand that my participation in "A Case Study of Human Skills of Women Administrators Managing Subordinate Women Managers in a Community College" conducted by Susan I. Duley, a doctoral student at Western Michigan University, is totally voluntary and that I may elect to participate in all or part of the study. Moreover, I understand I may withdraw my consent at any time and that any material I have submitted, any observation of me, or any feedback from interviews will be clarified with me before they are used in the final draft of the study.

______________________________
Signature

______________________________
Date

______________________________
Doctoral Student
Appendix E

Participants' Scores on the MBTI
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Participants' Scores on the MBTI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Page</strong></td>
<td><strong>Hope</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> = 22</td>
<td><strong>I</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong> = 2</td>
<td><strong>N</strong> = 25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T</strong> = 9</td>
<td><strong>F</strong> = 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>J</strong> = 13</td>
<td><strong>P</strong> = 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENFP</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENTP</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Director of</strong></td>
<td><strong>Extension Service</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Auxiliary Services</strong></td>
<td><strong>Coordinator</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> = 20</td>
<td><strong>I</strong> = 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong> = 2</td>
<td><strong>N</strong> = 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T</strong> = 12</td>
<td><strong>F</strong> = 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>J</strong> = 13</td>
<td><strong>P</strong> = 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENTJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENTJ</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Director of</strong></td>
<td><strong>Coordinator of</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Continuing Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> = 22</td>
<td><strong>I</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong> = 28</td>
<td><strong>N</strong> = 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T</strong> = 30</td>
<td><strong>F</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>J</strong> = 13</td>
<td><strong>P</strong> = 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESTJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENTJ</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Coordinator of</strong></td>
<td><strong>Food Services</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food Services</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> = 4</td>
<td><strong>I</strong> = 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong> = 15</td>
<td><strong>N</strong> = 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T</strong> = 30</td>
<td><strong>F</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>J</strong> = 14</td>
<td><strong>P</strong> = 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ISTJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>ISTJ</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Division Chairperson,</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health Sciences</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> = 21</td>
<td><strong>I</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong> = 7</td>
<td><strong>N</strong> = 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>T</strong> = 30</td>
<td><strong>F</strong> = 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>J</strong> = 12</td>
<td><strong>P</strong> = 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENTP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Courtney College Board of Trustees. (1987, July 28). [Materials for regular meeting].

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Hope, V. (1987a, March 5). Personal interview.


Knight, E. (1987a, March 5). Personal interview.


Page, K. (1987a, March 5). Personal interview.


Page, K. (1987c, July 5). Personal interview.

Supervisory Management, 29, 29-34.

Academy of Management Journal, 22, 293-296.

Their role enactment and role perception (Doctoral dissertation, 

Rice, R. W., Bender, L. R., & Vitters, A. G. (1980). Leader sex: 
Follower attitudes toward women and leadership effectiveness. 
Organizational Behavior and Human Performance, 25, 1.

Rosen, B., Templeton, M., & Kichline, K. (1981). The first few 
years on the job. Women in Management, 24, 21-25.

Rosenfeld, L. B., & Fowler, G. D. (1976). Personality, sex and 
leadership style. Communications Monographs, 43, 320-324.

Sargent, A. G. (1978). The androgynous blend: Best of both worlds? 
Management Review, 8, 61.

Schneir, M. (1980). She merchants in seventeenth century Holland 
and New Netherlands (Preprint series). New York: Columbia Uni­
versity, Center for the Social Sciences.

Scott, M. (1987a, March 5). Personal interview.


Rinehart and Winston.

and verbal communication with bosses, peers and subordinates. 


Eaton (Ed.), Women in community colleges (pp. 1-13). San Fran­
cisco: Jossey Bass.

in psychology and education. New York: Wiley.


