The Relationship of Declining Enrollment, Community Involvement, Tax Support, and Assessed Evaluation to Labor Peace in Some Selected Michigan School Districts

William Right Kirby

Western Michigan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/dissertations

Part of the Educational Administration and Supervision Commons

Recommended Citation


https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/dissertations/2362

This Dissertation-Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate College at ScholarWorks at WMU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at WMU. For more information, please contact maira.bundza@wmich.edu.
THE RELATIONSHIP OF DECLINING ENROLLMENT, COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT, TAX SUPPORT, AND ASSESSED EVALUATION TO LABOR PEACE IN SOME SELECTED MICHIGAN SCHOOL DISTRICTS

by

William Right Kirby

A Dissertation
Submitted to the
Faculty of The Graduate College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Education
Department of Educational Leadership

Western Michigan University
Kalamazoo, Michigan
April 1984
THE RELATIONSHIP OF DECLINING ENROLLMENT, COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT, TAX SUPPORT, AND ASSESSED EVALUATION TO LABOR PEACE IN SOME SELECTED MICHIGAN SCHOOL DISTRICTS

William Right Kirby, Ed.D.
Western Michigan University

Golden first investigated labor peace to determine if the causes of labor peace could be identified. It was his premise that organizations should work toward peace to allow the organizational goals to be accomplished more efficiently. Given Golden's premise, this study was undertaken to investigate the relationship between the quality of labor peace in school districts and the external factors of community involvement, declining enrollment, tax support and assessed evaluation. These factors were selected as they are the external factors most influential on the operation of a school district. A total of 22 districts in Southwestern Lower Michigan, 16 identified as having labor peace and 6 as having no labor peace, were used as the sample. These districts were identified as belonging to one of the labor peace categories by using Engle's (1981) method of identifying districts into these categories. A questionnaire on community involvement was created by utilizing a content validity process to determine which items were appropriate for the questionnaire. The items selected by this process were used on the final community involvement questionnaire. Data were then collected on this topic by having the superintendent, board president, and association president of each district complete a questionnaire. Bulletins 1012 and 1014, issued by the State Department of Education, were used.
to collect data on enrollment trends, tax support, and assessed evaluation in each district. A one-way ANOVA was used to analyze the data collected on each district. The results of the data analysis provided no evidence that a relationship existed between the quality of labor peace and the factors of community involvement, tax support, and assessed evaluation in the direction predicted in the hypotheses. Declining enrollment was found to be related with the quality of labor peace in a school district. Districts identified as belonging to the no labor peace category had a larger average decline in enrollment than did the labor peace districts.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This reproduction was made from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technology has been used to photograph and reproduce this document, the quality of the reproduction is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help clarify markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or "target" for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is "Missing Page(s)." If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark, it is an indication of either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, duplicate copy, or copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed. For blurred pages, a good image of the page can be found in the adjacent frame. If copyrighted materials were deleted, a target note will appear listing the pages in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed, a definite method of "sectioning" the material has been followed. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For illustrations that cannot be satisfactorily reproduced by xerographic means, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and inserted into your xerographic copy. These prints are available upon request from the Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases the best available copy has been filmed.
Kirby, William Right

THE RELATIONSHIP OF DECLINING ENROLLMENT, COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT, TAX SUPPORT, AND ASSESSED EVALUATION TO LABOR PEACE IN SOME SELECTED MICHIGAN SCHOOL DISTRICTS

Western Michigan University Ed.D. 1984

University Microfilms International 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are a number of people who have provided me the love, support and encouragement I have needed at various stages of my life. As I find this special goal realized, I feel it is appropriate to express to them my heartfelt gratitude: my parents, Clifford R. Kirby, Sr. and Elois Kirby, who believe that education is a special privilege and a necessity; my wife, Melodie, and my children, Brett and Megan, who tried hard to be patient, my undergraduate advisor, Dr. James Craigmile, who led me when I needed direction; and my many good friends whom I've somewhat neglected.

I wish to thank those people who aided me with this study: my committee members, Dr. Richard Munsterman (Chairperson), Dr. Uldis Smidchens, and Dr. John Copps, each of whom was willing to commit time and expertise on my behalf. These men are teaching professionals in the truest sense. There were many who participated in this study by responding with needed facts and information - to them I am grateful.

William Right Kirby
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................. ii
LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................... vi

Chapter

I. THE PROBLEM AND ITS BACKGROUND ................................. 1
   Introduction ............................................................................ 1
   Rationale for the Study .......................................................... 3
   Significance of the Study ......................................................... 4
   Overview of the Study ............................................................. 5

II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE ........................................ 7
   Overview ................................................................................ 7
   Labor Peace ........................................................................... 7
   Community Involvement ......................................................... 10
   Economic and Tax Support ....................................................... 12
   Ability to Pay ......................................................................... 15
   Enrollment Decline ................................................................. 17
   Summary ................................................................................ 19

III. METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 20
   Introduction ............................................................................ 20
   Review of the Purpose ............................................................ 20
   Population and Sample ........................................................... 20
   Identification of Districts ......................................................... 21
   Review of the Hypotheses ......................................................... 22
   Declining Enrollment .............................................................. 23
   Community Involvement ........................................................... 26

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Chapter

III. METHODOLOGY (Continued)

- Tax Support ................................................................. 29
- Ability to Pay ................................................................. 32
- Data Analysis ................................................................. 34
- Summary ................................................................. 35

IV. FINDINGS ................................................................. 36

- Introduction ................................................................. 36
- Sample Identification .......................................................... 36
- Hypotheses ................................................................. 38
- Analysis of the Data ........................................................ 38
- Summary ................................................................. 45

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................. 46

- Summary of the Study ........................................................ 46
- Limitations of the Study ......................................................... 47
- Conclusions and Implications ............................................... 48
- Recommendations .......................................................... 52

APPENDICES .................................................................. 54

- A. Designation Survey for Labor Peace ............................... 55
- B. Criteria for Designation of Labor Peace ............................ 57
- C. Community Involvement Questionnaire .......................... 59
- D. Credentials of the Judges for the Community Involvement Questionnaire .......................................................... 62
- E. Results of Questionnaire Validation ................................. 64
- F. Community Involvement Questionnaire, Cover Letter, and Instructions .......................................................... 66
- G. Follow-up Letter to Non-respondents ............................... 70

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
LIST OF TABLES

Table

1. Results of One-Way ANOVA: Enrollment Change by Type of Labor Peace ........................................... 39

2. Results of One-Way ANOVA: Community Involvement by Type of Labor Peace ........................................... 42

3. Results of One-Way ANOVA: Tax Support by Type of Labor Peace ......................................................... 43

4. Results of One-Way ANOVA: Assessed Evaluation by Type of Labor Peace ............................................. 44
CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM AND ITS BACKGROUND

Introduction

In my opinion, the time has come when, instead of looking into the causes of conflict that we know and hear so much about, we ought to try to discover how much peace there is and what makes peace. (Golden & Parker, 1955, p. ix)

This statement by Golden, during a 1946 National Planning Association meeting, could easily have been made about our school districts today. The newspapers and newsbroadcasts are filled with reports about school districts that are unsuccessful in handling conflict between labor and management. Rarely do we hear about those districts which are able to resolve the conflict between labor and management by peaceful means. These districts make news which is typically boring and noncontroversial as they have experienced labor peace through the concerted efforts put forth by members of both labor and management groups. Each group has recognized the legitimacy of the other's position, earned the other's trust, concentrated on solving everyday problems at the local level.

Settlement of labor conflicts in school districts, by peaceful means, provides a benefit to all those concerned. In particular, the students being served benefit as the delivery of services to the students is not disrupted nor delayed as they are in a stressful labor situation. In addition, the division of the educational staff and the citizens of the community into separate warring camps, one for the teachers and one
for the board, is avoided. Schisms caused by teacher strikes are not quickly healed; thus having long-lasting detrimental effects on the student's education.

Many forces influence the quality of the labor peace in a school district. These forces originate from inside and outside the organization, and can have either a positive or negative effect on the quality of labor relations in a school district.

Externally, the forces influencing labor peace in a school district are created by the citizens of the community and the characteristics of that community. Potentially, these influences can be manifested in a number of different ways.

The influence of the citizens can be observed through their willingness to support the school district and its policies. Several authors (Abramowitz and Rosenfield, 1978; Bakalis, 1981a; Fowler, 1980; Mitchell, 1981; Piele, 1981; and Raskas, 1979) have expressed the belief that involvement by the community with the schools will exert a great influence on the attainment of some contractual goals for teachers. According to these authors, the success or failure of tax issues and the involvement of community members in such things as boosters' clubs, PTO, and board committees will shape the direction for their school districts.

Authors such as Hess (1979), Kirst (1980), McDonnell and Pascal (1979), Poltrock (1981), and Shane (1979) have established that the demographics of a community can influence decisions made in a school district. Declining enrollment, the attitudes of the community toward the school or education in general and a community's apparent wealth are just a few of these demographics.
If indeed the quality of labor peace can be effected by the characteristics of a community, and the support provided to the school district by the citizens of that community, then it would seem appropriate to pursue the following research questions.

1. What is the relationship between the degree of declining enrollment and the quality of labor peace in a school district?

2. What is the relationship between the level of financial support provided by a community and the quality of labor peace in a school district?

3. What is the relationship between the level of community involvement in a school district and the quality of labor peace in that school district?

Rationale for the Study

Public school administrators have been trained to provide educational leadership to the employees of the school system. It is the responsibility of these administrators to ensure a steady delivery of educational services to the children of the community in which they serve.

Obviously, disruptions in the orderly functioning of a district will result in a decrease in the efficiency and often the quality of the delivery of the educational services in that district. These disruptions may take many forms and be of varying degrees of severity; but for the purposes of this investigation, only the disruptions caused by the lack of labor peace shall be considered. Among the many responsibilities of a public school administrator is that of developing and maintaining relative labor peace in the school district.
The training of an administrator concentrates on developing the ability of the administrator to work with the various school employees to achieve a state of labor peace. Courses such as Administering the School Personnel, Collective Bargaining, Organizational Development and Supervision, and Principles of Administration all are aimed at training the administrator in the ways of working with school employees to successfully deliver educational services to the community.

It would be easier if an administrator had to deal with only those forces which come from within the school system. However, forces from outside the school system exert pressure on the system and its employees; and, at times, these forces may in fact be of greater importance than the internal factors. It is the purpose of this study to examine these forces to determine what, if any, relationship they may have with a district enjoying labor peace or experiencing a disruption to that peace.

Significance of the Study

The results of this study could have a great deal of significance to the practicing administrator if the external forces of declining enrollment, lack of financial support from the community, low state equalized evaluation, and other community characteristics have a direct relationship with labor peace.

Engle (1981) discovered that it was possible to identify districts as having labor peace or not having labor peace by using criteria developed from the Golden Studies (p. 76). However, Engle cautioned that it was difficult to indicate why labor peace does or does not exist in school districts (p. 9).
If the factors under investigation prove to have some influence on the quality of labor peace, the managers of a school district may well need to develop some creative and educationally sound alternatives in dealing with declining enrollment other than lay-offs, closing of buildings, and other such traditional methods. Additionally, the political battle for the available financial resources might need some alterations to motivate the community members to provide the money needed to operate a school district during a time of scarcity.

Finally, an effective method of reconciling the conflicts created by sharing the decision-making power in a district between teachers, administrators, board members, and community members might well be needed to create labor peace in a school district. Assuming that this research produces valid results, the concept of "Equal Partners in Education" being promoted by the Michigan Department of Education may be a forerunner to the type of cooperation needed between schools and the community to help districts solve some of their most basic problems: money, quality of education, and employee militancy.

Overview of the Study

The first chapter of this study dealt with the significance, rationale and purpose of the study. The second chapter contains a review of literature related to the topic of the study. The third chapter details the methodology to be used to pursue the information and the research questions in this study. Results of the data collection are covered in the fourth chapter, while conclusions and recommendations based on those
those conclusions are presented in the fifth and final chapter of the study.
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Overview

Chapter Two is a review of literature related to the discussion of how external factors such as successful millage elections or declining enrollment effect labor peace in school districts across Michigan. This section focuses on providing an understanding of the problems investigated, and a basis on which to complete this investigation.

An On Line Automated Reference Service (OARS) search which included an Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) search was conducted to locate information relative to the topics under investigation in this study. The services of the Western Michigan University Library system including the dissertation abstracts, and the education and business indexes to periodicals were examined to gather information on the topics in this study.

Labor Peace

Teachers, as a group, have become more militant over the past fifteen years. Perry and Wildman (1970) pointed out that teachers became more aggressive toward organizing for collective bargaining during the 1960's. That movement is continuing today. Tye (1977) reports that legislatures, boards of education, administrators, organized employee unions, parents, and community members are all trying to gain power to
influence or participate in decisions about schools. He further states that usually people don't give up power willingly, which leads to conflict between those groups mentioned above (p. 7).

It was the desire to resolve this type of conflict in peaceful ways that lead Golden and Parker (1955) to state that the time has come when we ought to try to discover what makes labor peace. To this end, Golden was named as chairman of a committee to investigate the causes of industrial peace. Golden et al. (1955) and his committee were able to define industrial peace as the product of the relationship between two organized groups--industrial management and organized labor--in which both coexist, with each retaining its institutional sovereignty, working together in reasonable harmony in a climate of mutual respect and confidence (p. 8).

Walton and McKersie (1965) built upon Golden's theme to create what they termed social negotiations. Walton and McKersie defined social negotiations as, "the deliberate interaction of two or more complex social units which are attempting to define or redefine the terms of their interdependence" (p. 3). It is their belief that, by using this definition, attitudinal and organizational aspects of negotiations would be stressed. Walton and McKersie further believe that an important function of negotiations is to influence the relationships between parties, in the areas of their attitudes of friendliness-hostility, trust, respect, and the motivational orientation of competitiveness-cooperativeness (p. 5).

Engle (1981) utilized Walton and McKersie's work and Golden's findings to investigate whether it was possible to identify districts as having labor peace, no labor peace, or neither labor peace nor no
labor peace. Engle developed nine criteria to use in this identifica-
tion process. Engle's criteria are:

1. There is a full acceptance by the school board and
administration of the collective bargaining process
and of unionism as an institution. The school board
and administration consider a strong union an asset
to management.

2. The union fully accepts management's operation of the
schools; it recognizes that the welfare of its members
depends upon the successful operation of the schools.

3. The union is strong, responsible and democratic.

4. The school board and administration stay out of the
union's internal affairs; they do not seek to alienate
the worker's allegiance to the union.

5. Mutual trust and confidence exist between the parties.
There have been no serious idealical incompatibilities.

6. Neither party to bargaining has adopted a legalistic
approach to the solution of problems in the relationship.

7. Negotiations are problem centered - more time is spent on
day-to-day problems than on defining abstract principles.

8. There is widespread union-management consultation and
highly developed information sharing.

9. Grievances are settled promptly, at the local level when-
ever possible. There is flexibility and informality within
the procedure. (pp. 85-86)

To identify a district as belonging to one of the three labor peace
groups Engle had intermediate school superintendents, and MEA uni-serve
directors place the districts into one of the three categories accord-
ing to how well they fit the criteria. A district that was described
by all or most of the criteria was placed into the labor peace group,
while those districts that were described by few, if any, of the criteria
were placed in the no labor peace group, and those that met some of the

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
criteria were in the neither labor peace nor no labor peace group. A district had to be identified by both the intermediate school superintendent and MEA uni-serve director as a labor peace or a no labor peace district to be placed into one of those groups. Engle then administered the Crandall Attitude Scale Test to three board members, three administrators, and three teachers in each of the districts identified as belonging to the labor peace or no labor peace groups to test whether they belonged to that particular group. The results of this research indicated that the method utilized by Engle is a reliable method to use to identify districts as having or not having labor peace.

Community Involvement

Hamer (1977) states that there are many problems facing public education today. Concerns about accountability, escalating costs, and declining enrollments are significantly undermined by the pervasive fractionalism that plagues public education. Parents, students, teachers, administrators are all at one another and not with one another (p. 4).

Bakalis (1981a) adds to these concerns by telling us that parents face confusion and conflict in their attitudes toward the schools. They find declining enrollments and higher costs hard to understand and even harder to support (p. 12.).

Terrell (1977) emphasizes the point that citizens are becoming more involved in the affairs of the schools due to teacher militancy, equalization of financial expenditures, apparent declining test scores, drugs, alcohol, vandalism, and the problem of desegregation. Parents and community members believe these items to be school-community problems.
Further pointing up the problems of conflict between the schools and community, Thomas (1977) tells us that when parents are hostile toward the schools the achievement rate of the students goes down. Hostilities expressed in public meetings are carried into school by the children and affect the way they approach their school work.

According to Salisbury (1980), there are three strands in the argument for or about citizen participation. They are:

1. Citizen involvement is an instrument of power by which to effect change in the schools.

2. Full citizen participation would result in mutual accommodation policy consensus.

3. Participation comes as a result of full citizenship, leading to growth in personal competence and an inclination to serve further. (p. 3)

Salisbury goes on to say that a real tension exists between citizens and the desires of teachers and administrators to operate the schools according to professional criteria.

Salz (1969) expressed the concerns of citizen participation and teacher professionalism in the following way:

When teachers act professionally i.e., with the necessary autonomy to define the conditions within which they will provide their services, they come into direct conflict with those traditionally in control of education; the public. (p. 333)

As this applies to schools, the school employees must work to merge their desires and the desires of the public. Davies (1980) states that schools are going to have to bring parents and the community into a new and genuine kind of partnership (p. 3). However, Fisher (1979) cautions educational authorities to take great care not to raise false expectations which, if unfilled, could further alienate the public (p. 255).
Addressing the problems of education and the process of seeking the solution to those problems will cause conflict between those involved in that process. Tye (1977) points out that usually people don't give up power willingly. Consequently, what results is conflict. And herein lies the new reality of public education and of the principal leaders. Legislators, organized employee unions, parents, and community members, are vying for power in order to be able to at least participate in making decisions about schools (p. 7).

Involvement of the public in the decision-making process does not occur in isolation to the desires of the other factions involved. Each group, board of education, administrators, and teachers, will have to relinquish a portion of their power to bring the community into a meaningful relationship with the schools. This process, as indicated by the preceding statements, will not be a peaceful process. Therefore, the following hypothesis can be stated:

There is a greater amount of community involvement in a no labor peace district than there is in a labor peace district.

Economic and Tax Support

School districts are experiencing a reduction in the dollars available to them for a variety of reasons. According to Kirst and Garss (1980), shifting social and demographic patterns will place education in a weakened political bargaining position for funding increases. They detail four main threats to educational funds. They are:
1. Voter support of local school finance elections will continue to decline or remain at the current depressed level. This is due to a decrease of the number of people with a direct stake in education.

2. Number of people with no direct interest in education is increasing.

3. Inflation psychology will decrease willingness to increase local taxes.

4. Competition for federal funds will increase as the total pot of dollars decreases. (pp. 2-3)

Often the lack of tax support has been accompanied by reductions in money for education by various units of governments. Jackson (1981) states that education deserves a central place in the complex relationship involving public spending, the nation's economic performance, and the supply of a qualified and educated work force. Education is facing its greatest crisis since the war. It is the deliberate ending of the political consensus concerning the relationship between education and the economy by the current government making, and proposing to continue to make, huge and arbitrary cuts in educational spending as an essential element in its monetarist strategy for economic recovery (p. 60).

Johnson (1982) supports this position by stating that as the public is clamoring for better education, they are not making additional resources available to effectively respond to the complaints. Instead, people are considering the alternative of abandoning the public school system as there is a growing doubt that schools can do the job (p. 19). Johnson further points out that educators are concerned because the American society may be on the verge of sacrificing the future because of its refusal to make the necessary investment now (p. 21). Palaich (1980b) noted that during the most recent tax limitation efforts in
Michigan, Michigan voters, in general, held negative views toward their schools.

Collective bargaining plays its part in these problems; the manner in which schools handle contract negotiations can and does effect the support the school enjoys from the public. Mitchell and Kerchner (1982) forecast serious erosion of public support if educators do not move from conflict containment strategies and do move toward using educational criteria to judge contract proposals (p. 17).

The dual pressure of reductions in available financial support for education and decreasing public support for education causes teachers a great deal of concern. According to Ryor (1978) if Proposition 13 were applied equally to all public employees, 40% of all educational jobs would be eliminated. Ryor adds that teachers do not wish to bleed the taxpayers but that they will not subsidize the increased cost of education by absorbing the effects of inflation in already inadequate salaries (p. 16).

Shane (1979) supports these concerns by stating that teacher militancy will increase if inflation continues to threaten the profession's economic security (p. 65). Clark (1981) summarizes the situation very well when he states:

The overriding issue, however, may turn out to be whether the parties can successfully accommodate collective bargaining to the economic realities of the 1980's and, in turn, regain the public's confidence in their ability to deliver services in an efficient and productive manner. (p. 372)

Sava (1981) underscores the necessity of gaining community support to help maintain the quality and level of education necessary to fulfill its mission. Sava stated that, "In a time of dwindling resources, it
is more crucial than ever that education be a shared endeavor. For we have learned that we will not markedly improve the quality of education in our schools until we make that goal a community wide project (p. 21)."

By evaluating the positions and beliefs of these authors the following hypothesis can be presented:

There is a greater amount of tax support in a labor peace district than there is in a no labor peace district.

Ability to Pay

Michigan's state school aid formula is written in the following terms in the 1982-83 State School Aid Act:

"There is allocated to each district an amount per membership pupil sufficient to guarantee the district for 1982-83 a combined state-local yield or gross allowance of $328 plus $54 for each mill of operating tax levied, for purposes included in the operation cost of the district as prescribed in Section 7 shall be considered operating tax. The net allocation for each district shall be an amount per membership pupil computed by subtracting, from the gross allowance guaranteed the district, the product of the district's state equalized valuation behind each membership pupil and the millage utilized for computing the gross allowance." (State of Michigan, 1982)

This state school aid formula is determined on a yearly basis by the state legislature. The first portion of the formula constitutes the guaranteed amount of state aid per student for each school district. The second portion constitutes the amount of money generated per student by local taxes. When the second portion of the formula becomes greater than the first portion of the formula, a district will receive no general operating fund monies from the state; these districts are termed to be "out of formula districts".
As Bedell (1981) points out, there are some real financial advantages for a district that is out-of-formula. Out-of-formula districts reap all of the economic benefits from millage and assessed evaluation increases. On the other hand, in-formula districts will not realize the benefits from increased assessed evaluations, as the product of the assessed evaluation and millage must be used as an offset against the amount of money guaranteed by the state for each student. This formula allows the out-of-formula districts to outstrip in-formula districts in all areas of revenue and expenditure levels. Bedell (1981) cites a situation where two neighboring districts each had a 20% increase in their state equalized evaluation. One district was out-of-formula and could contemplate reducing the millage it levied; while the other district was in-formula and had to trim 20% from its budget, try to increase taxes, and had a teacher strike (p. 28).

McDonnell and Pascal (1979) found that the affluence of a county in which a school district is located has the most consistent and positive effect on obtaining key contract features (p. 137). By evaluating this information with that generated by Bedell it would seem that property values and whether a district is in-formula or out-of-formula will have some influence on the negotiation process in those districts. Therefore it is possible to state the following hypothesis:

The assessed evaluation per student is higher in labor peace districts than it is in no labor peace districts.
Enrollment Decline

Hess (1979) tells us that we are in the midst of an enrollment decline and an inflationary economy. He says, "Declining enrollments, economic factors, and other constraints dictate that education must streamline rather than enlarge, and retrench rather than elaborate (p. 1)". Crossland (1980) warns that we will have to learn to live with a downward slope to our enrollment trends. His predictions, based on enrollment trends, show that college enrollments will drop 2% per year until the mid 1990's. Further, his figures show that high school graduations will decrease by 36% in Michigan between 1979 and the mid-1990's. Bakalis (1981a) agreed with Crossland as Bakalis made his prediction that we would have a 14% reduction in secondary school classroom staff between 1979 and 1988. This decline will be paralleled by a 10% enrollment drop between 1975 and the mid-1980's (p. 10).

Cleveland and Gibbons (1980) point out that the decline in enrollments have resulted in school closings and teacher layoffs, which create strong emotional reactions on the part of the teachers. These reactions come from fear of layoffs, actual layoffs, or the stress of moving to a new building and possibly an entirely different grade or subject assignment.

Bakalis (1981b) in discussing the coming scarcity of money and students, raises questions about educational policy during these times. He states:

The New Austerity will require us to ask again an old question: What is the purpose of education? (p. 103)
He believes that the economic problems will heighten the negative feelings the public already holds about public education and will lead them to seek alternative education sources.

Tyach (cited in Bakalis 1981b) believes that educators need to create a consensus about education and rally the public in support of that consensus. Tyach thinks that a social contract needs to be executed between the school and society (p. 104).

Thomas (1977) stated in an address on problems related to declining enrollment that the public expects costs to go down as enrollment decreases; but in this period of rising costs, it is impossible to keep them from going up. Bakalis (1981a) amplifies this issue by stating that teacher unions will have more difficult times as public support for education wavers. It is doubtful that an economically battered public will tolerate union demands for economic gains, no matter how justified they might be, while enrollments decline and costs continue to escalate (p. 11). Bakalis continues on to say that this decline in enrollment and, therefore, a decline in teachers and programs will affect educators, parents, and students, and force education into new partnerships in order to accomplish their mission (p. 12).

Declining enrollments and impending layoffs due to this decline will create an uncertainty or uneasiness on the part of the teachers. An additional outgrowth of declining enrollment is concurrent loss of revenue for Michigan school districts due to the way in which the state aid formula is written. As these forces continue to boil, teachers will negotiate for job security and protection from reductions in the
work force. Therefore, the following hypothesis can be stated with some amount of confidence:

There is a greater amount of enrollment decline in a no labor peace district than in a labor peace district.

Summary

Chapter II contains a review of literature necessary to provide an understanding of the topics of this investigation. A discussion of labor peace, declining enrollments, community involvement, tax support, and a community's ability to pay taxes was presented to develop an understanding for the issues and to provide a basis for the investigation to be conducted.

The next chapter, Chapter III, contains a review statement as to the purpose of the investigation, a description of the population and sample, data collection procedures, and a statement of the hypotheses tested.
CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

Introduction

This study was designed to examine the relationship of some selected external forces on the perceived labor peace in the public schools. Engle's (1981) list of criteria were utilized to identify districts as having labor peace or not having labor peace. The remainder of this chapter deals with the purpose of the investigation, identification of the population and sample, validation of the instrumentation used, data collection procedures, and a statement of the hypotheses tested.

Review of the Purpose

The purpose of this investigation was to generate evidence that the forces of declining enrollment, community support, financial support, and the community's ability to pay taxes are related to the quality of labor peace in a school district.

Population and Sample

The public school districts having enrollments smaller than 10,000 students in Southwest Lower Michigan were selected as the population for this investigation. These districts were identified as belonging to one of three labor peace groups; labor peace, neither labor peace nor no labor peace, or no labor peace. Districts were assigned to the labor peace category if the majority of Engle's criteria described the
district, to the no labor peace category if they were not described by the majority of Engle's criteria, and to the neither labor peace nor no labor peace category if the district did not seem to belong to either end of the continuum. For the purposes of this investigation, only those districts which were identified as belonging to the labor peace or no labor peace groups were used in the sample. School districts were identified as belonging to one of the three labor groups by using the procedures described in the following section of this chapter. This procedure is the one established by Engle (1981) in his study on labor peace.

Identification of Districts

Engle (1981) established that districts could reliably be identified as belonging to one of the three labor peace groups. His methodology calls for superintendents of intermediate school districts and MEA uni-serve directors to respond to a questionnaire (Appendix A) about each of the districts in their area.

The questionnaire procedures required that each individual contacted place each district into one of the three labor peace groups, according to the criteria (Appendix B) established by the Engle study. For a district to have been placed in the labor peace or no labor peace groups both the intermediate school superintendent and MEA uni-serve director had to place an individual district into that group. If the intermediate school superintendent and MEA uni-serve director disagreed as to which group an individual district belonged, then the district was placed into
the neither labor peace nor no labor peace group and was excluded from the sample for this investigation.

Review of the Hypotheses

In this investigation it was assumed that school districts were subject to forces generated from inside and outside the school district. It was assumed that those forces generated from outside the school district were somewhat beyond the direct control of the school board and school employees. These forces are represented by such things as declining enrollment, assessed evaluation, tax support, and community involvement.

Forces from within the district were assumed to be those things under the direct control of the school board and school employees. These things are represented by the organizational climate, budget, contractual issues, and level of staffing.

The decision was made to investigate those forces generated from outside the school district for the following reasons:

1. Data was easily and more readily obtained.

2. Investigating both sets of forces was impractical for the scope of this investigation.

Based on these assumptions and the review of related literature the following hypotheses were developed and stated in the previous chapter:

1. There is a greater amount of enrollment decline in a no labor peace district than in a labor peace district.

2. There is a greater amount of community involvement in a no labor peace district than there is in a labor peace district.
3. There is a greater amount of tax support in a labor peace district than there is in a no labor peace district.

4. The assessed evaluation per student is higher in labor peace districts than it is in no labor peace districts.

Declining Enrollment

Enrollment trends must be examined over a number of years to eliminate the possibility of an atypical year, or years, skewing the data in any direction. For example; the opening or closing of a factory could cause a large change in one year's enrollment in a school district that typically has little or no change in its enrollment from one year to the next.

Additionally, the effects of enrollment trends are cumulative and could well take years to have a noticeable effect on the level of staffing required by a school district. The gain or loss of 100 students in any one school year will not necessarily result in the need to increase or decrease the number of teaching staff. This gain or loss could well be spread among the various grades so that little or no change would occur in the number of students per classroom. However, after four or five years of such enrollment change, the increase or decrease in any one grade level's enrollment could well be great enough to warrant a positive or negative change in the number of teachers for that grade.

Therefore, the enrollment trends for the past five school years (1978-79 to 1982-83) were used for this study. Given the cautions and concerns in the preceding paragraphs, five years should be an adequate length of time to establish an enrollment trend and for cumulative
effects to have had an impact on the level of staffing in any one school
district.

Details of how the data were collected, the source of that data,
and the statistical analysis procedures were reviewed in the following
paragraphs.

Data Collection

The data on enrollment trends were collected from the Michigan De­
partment of Education Bulletin 1012 (1979) for the 1978-79 school year,
and Bulletin 1014 (1983) for the 1982-83 school year, and were recorded
as a percentage change in enrollment from the 1978-79 school year to the
1982-83 school year. Recording the change by percentages was selected
as this gave a truer picture of the magnitude of an enrollment change
than an absolute number would. For example, an enrollment shift of 100
students would impact a district of 1000 students differently than it
would a district of 5000 students, whereas an enrollment shift of 5%
would have a similar impact on both districts.

Statistical Analysis

The percentage change in enrollment from the 1978-79 school year
to the 1982-83 school year was calculated for each of the school dis­
tricts in the labor peace and no labor peace groups by using the follow­
ing formulas respectively:

\[ EC_p = \frac{E_5 - E_1}{E_1} \times 100 \]
\[ EC_{np} = \frac{E_5 - E_1}{E_1} \times 100 \]

where:

- \( EC_p \) = percentage change of enrollment in any one labor peace district
- \( EC_{np} \) = percentage change of enrollment in any one no labor peace district
- \( E_1 \) = enrollment in any one district in the 1978-79 school year
- \( E_5 \) = enrollment in any one district in the 1982-83 school year

The hypothesis related to declining enrollment is a directional hypothesis that is stated in operational terms as follows:

There will be a greater percentage enrollment decline in no labor peace districts than in labor peace districts.

Algebraically this hypothesis and the null hypothesis were written in the following manner (Hinkle, Wiersma & Jurs, 1979):

\[ H_a: EM_p < EM_{np} \]
\[ H_0: EM_p = EM_{np} \]

where:

- \( EM_p \) = mean of the percentage of enrollment change in labor peace districts
- \( EM_{np} \) = mean of the percentage of enrollment change in no labor peace districts

The null hypothesis was tested by utilizing a one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA). The probability of committing a type I error was set at the \(.10\) level.
Community Involvement

Community involvement is defined by Terrell (1977) as a process whereby community members are allowed to have an influence on policy formation and program development (p. 15). Terrell states that this involvement can be limited by the district to being one of advice giving, solution offering, or irrevocable decision-making. This definition of community involvement was used for the purposes of this investigation.

A questionnaire (Appendix C) was developed to measure the level of community involvement in a school district. This questionnaire was submitted to the following validation process to ensure that it, in fact, measures community involvement.

Questionnaire Validation

The questionnaire was submitted to a content validation process. This process was selected, recognizing the limitations that content validity has from the scientific research point of view, as it was believed that content validity was adequate for the purposes of this study.

Content validity, as pointed out by Kerlinger (1973), consists essentially in judgment with the validation being guided by the question; Is the substance or content of this measure representative of the content or the universe of content of the property being measured? (p. 458).

This process consisted of submitting the questionnaire to a panel of three judges who are experts in the areas of questionnaire development, polling techniques, and public relations, for their reaction to
each item on the questionnaire. Each judge was given a set of instructions that asked them to judge whether the individual items addressed the issue of the involvement of the community and its members in the decision-making process of a school district.

The judges were asked to place a + (plus) next to those items they believed met the stated criteria, or a - (minus) next to those items they believe did not meet the stated criteria. For any one item to have been included on the final questionnaire, two of the three judges must have determined that it was relevant to the property being measured. All three judges returned the questionnaire but only two had followed the directions as requested. The third judge failed to respond to any of the items as requested in the instructions. The two judges who followed the directions indicated that all eleven of the items on the original questionnaire were appropriate measures of community involvement. As a result of the judges' decisions and suggestions, one item was eliminated as being redundant and four other items were rewritten to improve their clarity. The credentials of the judges and the results of their efforts were included in Appendices D and E respectively.

Data Collection

Questionnaires were sent to three individuals in each school district in the selected sample. The individuals were the president of the board of education, the superintendent, and the president of the local education association. Polling these individuals provided each group, active in contract negotiations in that district, the opportunity to express its opinion about community involvement in the school district.
**Statistical Analysis**

Upon the return of the completed questionnaires, a mean response score was calculated for each respondent by using the following formulas:

\[ S = \frac{R}{n} \quad B = \frac{R}{n} \quad A = \frac{R}{n} \]

where:

- \( S \) = mean of the responses on the questionnaire by the superintendent of any one district
- \( B \) = mean of the responses on the questionnaire by the president of the board of education of any one district
- \( A \) = mean of the responses on the questionnaire by the association president of any one district
- \( R \) = sum of the responses on the questionnaire by any one individual
- \( n \) = number of responses on the questionnaire by any one individual

A community involvement score was computed for each school district by using the following method:

\[ CI = \frac{S + B + A}{3} \]

where:

- \( CI \) = community involvement score for any one school district

The hypothesis related to community involvement is a directional hypothesis that is stated in operational terms as follows:

There will be a larger mean score of community involvement in no labor peace districts than in labor peace districts.

Algebraically this hypothesis and the null hypothesis were written in the following manner (Hinkle, Wiersma & Jurs, 1979):

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
\[ H_a: \text{C}_p < \text{C}_{np} \]
\[ H_0: \text{C}_p = \text{C}_{np} \]

where:

\[ \text{C}_p = \text{mean of community involvement scores for labor peace districts} \]
\[ \text{C}_{np} = \text{mean of community involvement scores for no labor peace districts} \]

The null hypothesis was tested by utilizing a one-way analysis of variance. The probability of committing a type I error was set at the .10 level.

**Tax Support**

Tax support for a school district by the community is indicated by the amount of taxes the community is willing to levy against itself for the purposes of the general operation of the district, debt retirement service, and various special fund accounts. For the purposes of this investigation, tax support was defined as the number of mills that have been approved by the community to be added to the base of fifteen mills allocated for the operation of county and township governments and school districts as provided for in the Michigan State Constitution. In the State of Michigan a one mill tax levy produces $1 per $1000 of evaluation assessed against the real property owned by the taxpayer.

As the revenue generated by this tax support is generally the source of the money used to satisfy contractual demands, tax support then would be closely related to the negotiations process. Clark (1981), Mitchell and Kerchner (1982), Ryor (1978), and Shane (1979) collectively make the point that when the community is reluctant to provide financial...
support for the schools, the teachers' economic security and job security are threatened, which leads to an increase in the level of teacher militancy. Therefore, investigating labor peace in terms of tax support is appropriate.

The following sections detail the data collection procedures and the statistical analysis procedures used to test the hypothesis related to tax support.

Data Collection

As tax support was defined as being the voluntarily added taxes, data were collected as to the total change in the tax rate in each school district included in the sample from the 1978-79 school year to the 1982-83 school year. These data were collected using the Michigan Department of Education Bulletin 1012 (1979) for the 1978-79 school year, and Bulletin 1014 (1983) for the 1982-83 school year.

Statistical Analysis

The percentage of the tax rate changes from the 1978-79 school year to the 1982-83 school year was calculated for the labor peace and no labor peace districts. The following formulas were used respectively:

\[
TC_p = \frac{\text{Mil}_5 - \text{Mil}_1}{\text{Mil}_1} \times 100
\]

\[
TC_{np} = \frac{\text{Mil}_5 - \text{Mil}_1}{\text{Mil}_1} \times 100
\]
where:

\[ T_C p = \text{percentage of tax rate change for any one labor peace district} \]

\[ T_C np = \text{percentage of tax rate change for any one no labor peace district} \]

\[ M1 = \text{millage rate during the 1978-79 school year} \]

\[ M15 = \text{millage rate during the 1982-83 school year} \]

The mean of the percentage of tax rate change for the labor peace districts and the no labor peace districts was calculated by using the following formulas respectively:

\[
R_p = \frac{\sum T_C p}{n} \\
R_{np} = \frac{\sum T_C np}{n}
\]

where:

\[ R_p = \text{mean of tax rate change in labor peace districts} \]

\[ R_{np} = \text{mean of tax rate change in no labor peace districts} \]

\[ n = \text{number of districts included in any one group} \]

The hypothesis related to tax support is a directional hypothesis that is stated in operational terms as follows:

The mean of percentage tax changes will be greater in labor peace districts than in no labor peace districts.

Algebraically this hypothesis and the null hypothesis will be written as follows (Hinkle, Wiersma & Jurs, 1979):

\[ H_a: R_p > R_{np} \]

\[ H_0: R_p = R_{np} \]
The null hypothesis was tested by utilizing a one-way analysis of variance. The probability of committing a type I error was set at the .10 level.

Ability to Pay

The ability of the citizens of a school district to pay taxes can be measured by the assessed evaluation of that district and the socio-economic level of the citizens. For the purposes of this investigation the ability of the citizens of a school district to pay taxes was defined as the amount of assessed evaluation in that school district. Assessed evaluation was chosen for the definition as it is possible to obtain numerical data on it, while it is impractical, if not impossible, to obtain numerical data on the socio-economic level of the citizens.

Bedell (1981) and McDonnell and Pascall (1979) state that the level of affluence of a district will encourage the attainment of some contractual items, while Fowler (1980) and Yang and Chandhari (cited in Fowler, 1980) have discovered that there is a relationship between property values and tax rates. Also, there is a positive relationship between property values and the expenditure levels in a school district. Therefore, it is appropriate to investigate the assessed evaluation of a district, particularly in light of the indications of the impact tax support may have upon labor peace.

The following sections detail the data collection methods and statistical procedures used to test the hypothesis related to the ability to pay taxes.
Data Collection

The 1982-83 school year's assessed evaluation and total K-12 enrollment for each school district included in the sample were obtained from the Michigan Department of Education Bulletin 1014 (1983) for the 1982-83 school year.

Statistical Analysis

The assessed evaluation and the total K-12 enrollment for each school district were used to calculate the assessed evaluation per student for each labor peace and no labor peace district by using the following formulas respectively:

\[ ES_p = \frac{EV}{TE} \]
\[ ES_{np} = \frac{EV}{TE} \]

where:

- \( ES_p \) = assessed evaluation per student in any one labor peace district for the 1982-83 school year
- \( ES_{np} \) = assessed evaluation per student in any one no labor peace district for the 1982-83 school year
- \( EV \) = assessed evaluation in any one district for the 1982-83 school year
- \( TE \) = total enrollment in any one district for the 1982-83 school year

The mean of the assessed evaluation per student for the labor peace districts and the no labor peace districts was calculated by using the following formulas respectively:
The hypothesis related to the community's ability to pay is a directional hypothesis that is stated in operational terms as follows:

The mean of the assessed evaluation per student will be higher in labor peace districts than in no labor peace districts.

Algebraically this hypothesis and the null hypothesis were written as follows (Hinkle, Wiersma & Jurs, 1979):

\[ H_a: E_p > E_{np} \]
\[ H_0: E_p = E_{np} \]

The null hypothesis was tested by utilizing a one-way analysis of variance. The probability of committing a type I error was set at the .10 level.

Data Analysis

The Statistical Package for the Social Sciences available through the Western Michigan University Computer Center was used to analyze the data collected. The designation for a district belonging to either the labor peace group or no labor peace group was included in the data. The
responses of the community involvement questionnaire, levels of enrollment, tax rates, and assessed evaluation were also present.

Summary

Chapter III contains a review of the purpose of the investigation, a description of the population and sample, identification procedure for the sample, a listing of the hypotheses, the method of collecting the data, and the procedures for validating the community involvement questionnaire. Chapter IV contains the results of the investigation and the results of the statistical analysis of the null hypotheses.
CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

Introduction

The purpose of this investigation was to provide evidence that external forces have some relationship to the quality of labor peace in a school district. The external forces under investigation were the level of community involvement, enrollment trends, millage support, and assessed evaluation present in each district.

Chapter I provided an introduction to the problem, including the purpose and significance of the study, and a rationale for the study. Chapter II contained a review of pertinent literature for each hypothesis to provide an understanding of and a basis for those hypotheses. Chapter III described the methodology of collecting the data and the analysis of that data as it relates to the hypotheses of this investigation.

Chapter IV contains the process used to identify districts as having labor peace or not, and the results of the data analyses relating to the four hypotheses of the investigation.

Sample Identification

Following the procedure described in the preceding chapter, 17 intermediate school district superintendents and 24 MEA uni-serve directors, representing 147 local school districts, were asked to designate
the districts in their service area as belonging to one of the three labor peace categories.

Initially, only seven intermediate school district superintendents and 12 uni-serve directors responded to the questionnaire. A follow-up letter and phone calls to each nonrespondent brought the total number of responses to 11 superintendents and 17 uni-serve directors. The reasons given for not responding were:

1. Area too sensitive to honor request
2. Personal policy not to respond to any research questionnaire
3. Belief that local superintendents and union people could make better judgments
4. Too busy, don't have time

Of the 147 districts in the population, 101 districts were represented by responses from the intermediate superintendent and uni-serve director, 18 by a response from just the uni-serve director, and 24 by no responses. Of the districts offering only a single response, 14 had been placed in the neither labor peace nor no labor peace category, which would have eliminated them from the sample even if they had shown two responses.

Of the 101 districts which were represented by a response from an intermediate superintendent and a uni-serve director, 16 were identified as belonging to the labor peace category and six were identified as belonging to the no labor peace category. Therefore, these 22 districts were used as the sample districts for this investigation.
Hypotheses

There were four research hypotheses and their resultant null hypotheses stated in Chapter III. The research hypotheses are restated as follows:

1. The percentage of enrollment change in labor peace districts is less than the percentage of enrollment change in no labor peace districts.

2. The amount of community involvement in labor peace districts is less than the amount of community involvement in no labor peace districts.

3. The percentage of tax rate change in labor peace districts is greater than the percentage of tax rate change in no labor peace districts.

4. The amount of assessed evaluation per student in labor peace districts is greater than the amount of assessed evaluation per student in no labor peace districts.

Each of the null hypotheses was tested by using a one-way analysis of variance. The results of those statistical tests are presented in the following sections of this chapter. It should be noted that each of the research hypotheses is directional, which had an effect on how the results of the data analyses were interpreted.

Analysis of the Data

Hypothesis: Enrollment Trend

The results of the one-way analysis of variance for the null hypothesis related to enrollment change and the descriptive statistics for the labor peace and no labor peace groups are presented in Table 1.
### TABLE 1

Results of One-Way ANOVA: Enrollment Change by Type of Labor Peace

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Variation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Degrees of Freedom</th>
<th>Mean of Squares</th>
<th>F-Ratio</th>
<th>F-Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.010</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.010</td>
<td>5.803</td>
<td>.013*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>.034</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labor Peace</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>-0.079%</td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Peace</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-0.119%</td>
<td>0.026</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at the .10 level

P < .10

F-Prob. is for a directional hypothesis
The results support that a relationship exists between labor peace and enrollment trends. However, the research hypothesis is a directional hypothesis so the descriptive data in Table 1 must be used to determine if the results are in the desired direction. Since the mean for the percentage of enrollment change is -7.9% for the labor peace districts, which is less than the -11.9% enrollment change for the no labor peace districts, the indication is that the results are in the direction predicted in the research hypothesis. Therefore, the evidence supports rejecting the null hypothesis and accepting the research hypothesis with a probability of .10 of committing a type I error.

Hypothesis: Community Involvement

A cover letter, the revised community involvement questionnaire, and instructions (Appendix F) were sent to the superintendent of schools, board of education president, and teacher association president in each district included in the sample. Sixteen superintendents, nine board presidents, and 17 association presidents responded to the initial mailing. A follow-up letter (Appendix G), questionnaire, and instructions were sent to each non-respondent, resulting in an additional four superintendents, nine board presidents, and one association president responding to the questionnaire. Additionally, one superintendent returned an uncompleted questionnaire with a note attached stating the items were too general to which to respond. One board president returned his questionnaire after the data had been analyzed, and the remaining individuals failed to give any reason for their lack of response. The labor peace districts had 15 superintendents, 13 board presidents, and 13 association
presidents respond to the questionnaire for a total of 41 respondents out of a possible 48 responses. The no labor peace districts had five superintendents, five board presidents, and five association presidents to respond to the questionnaire for a total of 15 respondents out of a possible 18.

The results of the one-way analysis of variance for the null hypothesis related to community involvement and the descriptive statistics are displayed in Table 2.

The results fail to provide any support that a relationship exists between community involvement and labor peace. Therefore, the evidence is insufficient to support rejection of the null hypothesis at a probability of .10.

**Hypothesis: Tax Support**

The results of the one-way analysis of variance of the null hypothesis related to tax support and the descriptive statistics are displayed in Table 3.

The results fail to provide any support that a relationship exists between tax support and labor peace. Therefore, the evidence is insufficient to support the rejection of the null hypothesis at a probability of .10.

**Hypothesis: Assessed Evaluation**

The results of the one-way analysis of variance of the null hypothesis related to assessed evaluation and the descriptive statistics are displayed in Table 4.
### TABLE 2
Results of One-Way ANOVA: Community Involvement by Type of Labor Peace

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Variation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Degrees of Freedom</th>
<th>Mean of Squares</th>
<th>F-Ratio</th>
<th>F-Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>2.714</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.714</td>
<td>4.469</td>
<td>.98 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>32.803</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>0.607</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labor Peace</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>3.423</td>
<td>0.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Peace</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2.926</td>
<td>0.799</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Not significant at the .10 level

P > .10

F-Prob. is for a directional hypothesis
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Variation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Degrees of Freedom</th>
<th>Mean of Squares</th>
<th>F-Ratio</th>
<th>F-Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>1.463</td>
<td>.120 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>0.120</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labor Peace</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.073</td>
<td>0.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Peace</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.118</td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) Not significant at the .10 level
\(P > .10\)

F-Prob. is for a directional hypothesis
### TABLE 4
Results of One-Way ANOVA: Assessed Evaluation by Type of Labor Peace

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Variation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Degrees of Freedom</th>
<th>Mean of Squares</th>
<th>F-Ratio</th>
<th>F-Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>$250,086,887</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$250,086,890</td>
<td>3.048</td>
<td>.952a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>$1,640,808,661</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>$82,040,433</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labor Peace</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>$46,633</td>
<td>$10,034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Peace</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>$54,203</td>
<td>$5,110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Not significant at the .10 level
P > .10
F-Prob. is for a directional hypothesis
The results fail to provide any support that a relationship exists between assessed evaluation and labor peace. Therefore, the evidence is insufficient to support the rejection of the null hypothesis at a probability of .10.

Summary

Chapter IV contains the results of the data collection and analysis of that data. Included in the chapter are the determination of the sample and the results of the data analysis.

The evidence did not provide sufficient support for rejecting the null hypotheses related to community involvement, tax support, and assessed evaluation. There was support for the research hypothesis related to declining enrollment; therefore, the null hypothesis was rejected and the research hypothesis accepted.

Chapter V contains the summary of the study, limitations of the study, conclusions based on the data analysis, and implications of the study. Recommendations for future research and study have been made in this chapter.
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary of the Study

Golden et al. (1955) proposed the idea of exploring the causes of labor peace instead of investigating the causes of conflict. Engle (1981) took this concept and applied it to school districts, establishing a method by which districts could be identified as belonging to one of three labor peace groups. The basic assumption made by Abramowitz and Rosenfield (1978), Engle (1981), Fowler (1980), and Poltrock (1981) is that there are forces which influence the effectiveness of an organization in a positive or negative manner. Therefore, it seemed appropriate to investigate some of these forces and to discover if they had any relationship to the quality of labor peace found in any one school district.

The purpose of this investigation was to provide evidence that a relationship existed between some selected external forces and the quality of labor peace in any one district. The following research questions were developed to guide this investigation:

1. What is the relationship between declining enrollment and the quality of labor peace in a school district?

2. What is the relationship between the level of financial support provided by a community and the quality of labor peace in a school district?

3. What is the relationship between the level of community involvement in a school district and the quality of labor peace in that school district?
Walton and McKersie (1965) used Golden's ideas to create a concept of social negotiations aimed at improving the negotiating parties' feelings of friendliness, trust, and respect. Engle (1981) used Walton and McKersie's work to develop a procedure by which districts could be identified as belonging to one of three labor peace groups.

By using Engle's method of determining whether a district belonged in one of three labor peace categories, a sample of sixteen labor peace districts and six no labor peace districts was drawn from 147 school districts in Southwestern Lower Michigan.

Four research hypotheses were presented in this investigation, each of the null hypotheses were tested by a one-way ANOVA. The evidence was insufficient to reject the null hypotheses relating to community involvement, tax support, and assessed evaluation. The evidence supported rejecting the null hypothesis and accepting the research hypothesis related to declining enrollment.

Limitations of the Study

The size of the sample could well have had an effect on the results of the investigation, particularly in the case of the no labor peace districts where only six districts fell into that category. Any time there is a small number in a group it increases the possibility of the data being skewed in one direction or another.

The sample is not a random sample as all districts identified as belonging to the labor peace or no labor peace groups were included as part of the sample used in the investigation. The districts from which the sample was drawn were all smaller than 10,000 in student population.
Therefore, the results of this study could not be generalized to larger urban districts.

Conclusions and Implications

Districts included in the sample for this study were a reasonable cross section of the districts from which the sample was drawn. The sample included districts from rural, suburban, and urban types of settings. However, districts having student populations of 10,000 or more were excluded from this study as it was believed that their metropolitan settings were too dissimilar to be comparable to other smaller districts. Therefore, the results of this study would seem to have some relevance for similar districts outside of the geographical area from which the sample was drawn.

Research Hypothesis 1

Declining enrollment was found to have a relationship to the quality of labor peace in a district as the evidence supported the research hypothesis related to declining enrollment. These results indicated that in districts identified as belonging to the no labor peace category a greater decline in enrollment will have occurred in that district than in a district identified as a labor peace district.

Throughout the literature there was a recurring theme; public support for education would weaken as the enrollment declined and costs continued to rise. Coupled with this was an emotional reaction on the part of teachers due to the threat of job change or job loss. These reactions help build feelings of suspicion by teachers that lay-offs
will be arranged by administrators and board members to eliminate selected individuals who have fallen into disfavor with the administration. Both factors tend to create an atmosphere of negative actions and reactions between teachers, administrators, and board members, which adversely affects the quality of labor peace in a school district.

Declining enrollment will result in the loss of teaching positions and changes in teaching assignment, which, as pointed out by Cleveland and Gibbons (1980), will cause a strong emotional reaction on the part of teachers. Also, the dilemma of decreasing enrollments but increasing costs described by Bakalis (1981a) and Thomas (1977) will encourage teacher militancy as demands for higher wages are denied due to economic reasons.

Accepting that labor peace is a desirable goal for which school districts should strive, then devising methods of resolving the employee reactions toward declining enrollment would seem appropriate. Administrators forced to deal with these problems will have to be creative in their solutions since a quick fix of more money will not likely occur.

Creative employment patterns should be considered to lessen the effect of layoffs. Job sharing, permanent substitute teachers, encouraging more leaves of absences, and allowing leaves for alternative career exploration could well reduce the number of employees who would be laid off. Districts could complement these activities by providing early retirement incentives which would provide the bonus of eliminating the payment of unemployment benefits as well as replacing a higher-priced employee with a younger and less costly employee.
Research Hypothesis 2

The results of the statistical analysis of the data collected on the hypothesis related to community involvement provided no evidence that increased community involvement had a negative effect on the quality of labor peace in a school district. These results might provide some encouragement for districts to involve the members of their community in the decision-making process. Therefore, the new partnerships in education between parents and educators, predicted by Bakalis (1981b), and discussed by Davies (1980), Fisher (1979), and Salisbury (1980), may not be as traumatic as feared.

The research and literature available on this topic may well be based on inadequate or changing information. Economic forces and declining enrollments causing educational retrenchments such as layoffs, closing of buildings, and austerity budgets, which encourage more community involvement, have been operative for just a few years. Immediately the effect of increased community involvement may have caused a disruption to the labor peace in a district; however, once the power was redistributed and the parties learned how to work with each other, labor peace may be restored. More research or more experience in this area may alter the perception of community involvement in the decision-making process and lead toward a closer working relationship between schools and the community.

Research Hypothesis 3

No support could be found for a greater amount of tax support to exist in labor peace districts as compared to no labor peace districts.
No definitive statements can be made about how tax support affects labor peace in a district; however, there is some evidence that it might take more than money to have labor peace.

While a contract settlement could possibly be bought, the attitudes necessary for labor peace might only be developed by the quality of interaction between teachers, administrators, and board members. Leadership theories such as Herzburg's (1966) Motivation-Hygiene Theory, McGregor's (1960) Theory Y, and Sergiovanni's (1979) Human Resource Theory may well describe the framework in which administrators should work to encourage labor peace. Leadership exercised in this manner could well create an organizational climate conducive to the development of mutual respect between teachers and administrators, and a trust and openness in their everyday work. People who respond in a positive fashion to these leadership styles are individuals who are motivated by things other than money; perhaps teachers are such individuals.

Research Hypothesis 4

In the case of the hypothesis relating to assessed evaluation, no support could be found for assessed evaluation being higher in labor peace districts than in no labor peace districts. As the subject of this hypothesis is related to tax support, the results are complementary to those on the hypothesis related to tax support. The results indicate that an increased supply of money will not result in a district enjoying labor peace. Possibly leadership styles and the humanistic characteristics of a district are important to the development of labor peace.
Recommendations

Many areas of further research present themselves due to the findings of this study coupled with Engle's (1981) findings, and the current trend of leadership theory, particularly that of Sergiovanni and Starratt (1979).

Immediately, a more scientific approach to the question of community involvement would seem to be appropriate. If the literature really supports the research hypothesis, was there something wrong with the research methodology, or was the literature search inadequate, or has the reaction to community involvement undergone a change? Is community involvement acceptable and agreeable to the parties involved and therefore conducive to labor peace? More research needs to be done in this area to answer these questions.

This study and Engle's study both focused on the teachers in relationship to labor peace, ignoring the other employee groups in the district. Are other employee groups affected in the same manner as teachers by the forces in labor peace? Is it possible for the district to be perceived as experiencing labor peace in relationship with one employee group and not another? If so, what effect does this have on the district, the students, and each employee group?

An area of research not addressed as of yet is the effect of internal factors on labor peace. How does the leadership style of the superintendent, board of education, and employee organizations affect one another? Is there a relationship between organizational climate and the quality of labor peace?
A longitudinal case study of districts from all three labor peace categories could be illuminating on the dynamics of the underlying causes of labor peace. Are there key positions in districts that affect the quality of labor peace in that district or is it a function of the total group? Can a district flow from the labor peace category to the no labor peace category and back again? If so, are there differences in the descriptors for that district from one time to the other?

The quality of labor peace in a school district has been investigated in isolation from other businesses and industries in the community. What effects does the quality of labor peace in other organizations have on the quality of labor peace in a school district? Do the members of a school district enter the organization pre-disposed toward a particular quality of labor peace?

Ultimately, the issue of labor peace will have to come down to the following set of questions. Is there one set of descriptors, style of leadership, attitudes, and methods of operation for labor peace districts? If so, does labor peace make a difference in how well the students learn, the attitudes they hold, and the success they experience in life? If so, is there a way to develop the attitudes, organizational climate, and effect the necessary changes in a no labor peace district so that it becomes a labor peace district?
APPENDICES
Appendix A

Designation Survey for Labor Peace
Designation Survey for Labor Peace

Please designate the following school districts as having labor peace (+), no labor peace (-), and somewhere in between labor peace and no labor peace (0). The criteria to be used for identification is on the attached sheet. It is likely most districts which exhibit labor peace will not meet all of the criteria but will meet a majority of the items.

(Districts will be listed according to the intermediate district or area served)
Appendix B

Criteria for Designation of Labor Peace
Criteria for Designation of Labor Peace

1. There is full acceptance by the school board and administration of the collective bargaining process and of unionism as an institution. The school board and administration consider a strong union an asset to management.

2. The union fully accepts management's operation of the schools; it recognizes that the welfare of its members depends upon the successful operation of the schools.

3. The union is strong, responsible, and democratic.

4. The school board and administration stay out of the union's internal affairs; they do not seek to alienate the worker's allegiance to the union.

5. Mutual trust and confidence exist between the parties. There have been no serious ideological incompatibilities.

6. Neither party to bargaining has adopted a legalistic approach to the solution of problems in the relationship.

7. Negotiations are problem centered--more time is spent on day-to-day problems than on defining abstract principles.

8. There is widespread union-management consultation and highly developed information sharing.

9. Grievances are settled promptly, at the local level whenever possible. There is flexibility and informality within the procedure.
Appendix C

Community Involvement Questionnaire
This is a questionnaire dealing with community involvement in school districts. A number of statements are listed which are related to the involvement of community members in school districts. Beside each statement there is a five-point scale with these words and numbers being related to one another: 1, Rarely; 2, Infrequently; 3, Sometimes; 4, Frequently; 5, Generally. You are asked to respond to each item by circling the number associated with the word that best describes your school district.
1. The desires of the community are considered when the board of education makes a policy decision.  

2. Members of the community are consulted when curriculum changes are being made.  

3. Members of the community are consulted when policy decisions are being considered.  

4. Members of the community serve on curriculum committees.  

5. Members of the community serve on ad hoc board committees.  

6. Members of our community have a great deal of influence on decisions made by the board of education.  

7. The teachers in our school district are willing to have members of the community involved in curriculum decisions.  

8. The board of education seeks the involvement of community members of the community involved in curriculum decisions.  

9. The administrators welcome the involvement of community members in decisions about the curriculum.  

10. Decisions about the curriculum are shared between the teachers, administrators, board of education, and the community.  

11. The wishes of the community are considered on most decisions and not sought just at the time of millage elections.
Appendix D

Credentials of the Judges for 
the Community Involvement Questionnaire
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Judges</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years served in the area of public relations.</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years involved in developing questionnaires to use with school-related groups.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15+</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years served in positions related to education and school districts.</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E

Results of Questionnaire Validation
## Results of Questionnaire Validation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Judges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: + = item appropriate  
      - = item inappropriate  
      NR = no response
Appendix F

Community Involvement Questionnaire, Cover Letter, and Instructions
Dear

As part of my doctoral studies at Western Michigan University, I am doing a research project dealing with the quality of labor peace in Michigan school districts as it relates to specific external factors. One of these factors is the involvement of the community in the decision-making process of a school district.

On the next two pages, you will find a questionnaire dealing with community involvement in a school district. This questionnaire has been sent to the superintendent, board president, and teacher association president in your school district and many others in the state. I would appreciate it if you could complete this questionnaire and return it to me in the enclosed envelope.

Please be assured that the results of this study shall not be reported by district name, and that responses from individual districts shall be held confidential. The coding on the questionnaire is to allow me a method of placing responses in their proper category and to keep track of who has responded.

Thank you in advance for completing this questionnaire and your assistance with my study. It is extremely important that I receive this information as quickly as possible.

Sincerely,

William R. Kirby
This is a questionnaire dealing with community involvement in school districts. A number of statements are listed which are related to the involvement of community members in school districts. Beside each statement there is a five-point scale with these words and numbers being related to one another: 1, Rarely; 2, Infrequently; 3, Sometimes; 4, Frequently; 5, Generally. You are asked to respond to each item by circling the number associated with the word that best describes your school district.
1. The desires of the community are considered when the board of education makes a policy decision.

2. Members of the community are consulted when curriculum changes are being made.

3. Members of the community serve on ad hoc board advisory committees.

4. Members of the community serve on curriculum committees.

5. Members of the community have a great deal of influence on decisions made by the board of education.

6. The teachers in our school district are willing to have members of the community involved in curriculum decisions.

7. The board of education seeks the involvement of the community members when policy decisions are to be made.

8. The central administrators welcome the involvement of community members in decisions about the curriculum.

9. The teachers, administrators and community members work together to develop curriculum recommendations for the board of education.

10. The wishes of the community are considered on most decisions and not sought just at the time of millage elections.
Appendix G

Follow-up Letter to Non-respondents
Dear

Recently you received a copy of the enclosed questionnaire dealing with community involvement in your school district. At that time I requested that you complete that questionnaire and return it to me. According to my records you have not returned the completed questionnaire to me. I have enclosed another questionnaire with the same request made of you for its completion. If for some reason you are unable to complete the questionnaire please so indicate on the questionnaire and return it to me so that I might complete my records.

Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions. My number at work is 616-897-9257, and my number at home is 616-868-6453. Thank you in advance for your help and cooperation.

Sincerely,

William R. Kirby
BIBLIOGRAPHY


72

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Terrell, R. Community participation: Dilemma or process. Thrust, October 1977, 7(1), 15-17.


Tye, K. A. The times they are a changin' for school principals. Thrust. October 1977, 7(1), 4-7.